

# Held of crimineel?

## *Mediaframing rondom Edward Snowden*

Stefani Romani (s1601725)

Masterthesis Journalistiek en Nieuwe Media

Eerste lezer: Peter Burger

Tweede lezer: Jaap de Jong

Universiteit Leiden: 13 juli 2015

## Voorwoord

Om mijn studietijd succesvol af te sluiten moest er nog één ding gebeuren: het schrijven van een masterthesis. Een zware opgave naast fulltime stage lopen en nog andere vakken afronden, maar het is onder andere door de goede en snelle begeleiding van Peter Burger gelukt. Het onderzoek naar *mediaframing* rondom klokkenluider Edward Snowden is succesvol voltooid en vraagt nu alweer om vervolgonderzoek. Mijn studietijd zit erop en ik ben trots op dit eindresultaat. Een masterthesis die goed past binnen de studie Journalistiek & Nieuwe Media en hopelijk met veel nieuwsgierigheid en plezier wordt gelezen.

Stefani Romani

Delft, 13 juli 2015

# Inhoudsopgave

<b>Voorwoord</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>Samenvatting</b> .....	<b>5</b>
<b>1. Inleiding</b> .....	<b>6</b>
<b>2. Theoretisch kader</b> .....	<b>8</b>
2.1 Edward Snowden.....	8
2.2 Framing van nieuwsberichten.....	8
2.3 Klokkenluiders in het nieuws.....	9
2.4 Het Robin Hood Principe.....	12
2.5 Samenvatting.....	14
<b>3. Methodologie</b> .....	<b>15</b>
3.1 Kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse.....	15
3.1.1 Narratieve analyse.....	15
3.1.2 Framinganalyse.....	16
3.2 Corpus.....	18
3.2.1 Medialandschap kranten Nederland.....	18
3.2.2 Medialandschap kranten Amerika.....	19
3.2.3 Overzicht corpus.....	20
<b>4. Resultaten Nederlandse nieuwsmedia</b> .....	<b>22</b>
4.1 Narratieve analyse.....	22
4.2 Conclusie narratieve analyse.....	30
4.3 Framinganalyse.....	31
<b>5. Resultaten Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia</b> .....	<b>36</b>
5.1 Narratieve analyse.....	36
5.2 Conclusie narratieve analyse.....	43
5.3 Framinganalyse.....	44
<b>6. Vergelijking Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia</b> .....	<b>49</b>
<b>7. Conclusie</b> .....	<b>50</b>
<b>Bibliografie</b> .....	<b>52</b>
<b>Bijlagen</b> .....	<b>54</b>
Bijlage 1. Krantenartikelen de Volkskrant.....	55
Bijlage 2. Krantenartikelen De Telegraaf.....	93

Bijlage 3. Krantenartikelen The Washington Post .....	115
Bijlage 4. Krantenartikelen The Voice of America News .....	210

## Samenvatting

Masterthesis waarin de hoofdvraag: ‘In hoeverre wordt de klokkenluider Snowden door middel van *framing* in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia anders weergegeven dan in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia?’ wordt beantwoord aan de hand van een narratieve en *framinganalyse* van Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsartikelen. Het onderzoek bouwt voort op de theorie van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) over de representatie van klokkenluiders in de media.

Binnen de narratieve analyse staat de theorie van Seal (2009) over criminele helden centraal. Hieruit blijkt dat de eigenschappen van criminele helden sterker aanwezig zijn in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia dan in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia.

Vervolgens worden er met de *framinganalyse* dominante *frames* in de *framematrix* van Van Gorp (2009) geplaatst om te onderzoeken op welke manier bepaalde elementen in interpretatiekaders worden uitgelicht. Resultaat hiervan is dat klokkenluider Snowden door middel van *framing* positiever wordt weergegeven in de onderzochte Nederlandse nieuwsartikelen dan in de onderzochte Amerikaanse nieuwsartikelen. In de Nederlandse nieuwsartikelen komt het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ dominantier voor dan het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’. In de Amerikaanse nieuwsartikelen komt het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’ sterker voor dan in de Nederlandse nieuwsartikelen.

*Edward Snowden, narratief, Robin Hood Principe, framematrix frames, framing devices, reasoning devices, de Volkskrant, De Telegraaf, The Washington Post, The Voice of America news.*

# 1. Inleiding

We leven in een wereld waarin we worden omgeven door mediabeelden. We gebruiken deze mediabeelden om een mening te vormen over onder andere politieke en sociale kwesties. De manier waarop deze mediabeelden en informatie wordt gepresenteerd, is echter niet neutraal. We worden beïnvloed door onder andere de keuze van de politieke en economische elite voor een bepaalde invalshoek. Opvallend aan dit proces is dat het lijkt alsof mediabeelden en informatie wél neutraal worden overgebracht. De sociale constructie van media lijkt onzichtbaar (Gamson et al., 1991, p. 374). Dit proces kan het beste uiteen worden gezet in combinatie met het concept *mediaframes*. Deze *frames* organiseren de wereld voor journalisten die de nieuwsitems maken en voor de lezers die de nieuwsitems vertrouwen en hun meningen erop baseren (Gamson et al., 1991, p. 384). Van Gorp (2004) vindt een *frame* een standvastige, metacommunicatieve boodschap. Deze boodschap geeft het structurele denkbeeld weer dat een nieuwsbericht samenhang en betekenis verleent.

Opvallend is dat er weinig onderzoek is gedaan naar *mediaframes* rondom klokkenluiders. Dit is opvallend omdat klokkenluiders – melders van misstanden bij een bedrijf of organisatie – een belangrijke bron zijn voor journalisten. Er is vooral veel wetenschappelijk onderzoek gedaan naar de beweegredenen van klokkenluiders om een misstand publiekelijk via de media te melden en naar de beschermingsprocedures voor klokkenluiders.

Het onderzoek van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) is een van de weinige dat gaat over de representatie van klokkenluiders in de media. Een nieuwsitem over een klokkenluider is volgens Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) voornamelijk positief en er wordt gebruik gemaakt van een narratieve structuur waarbij de held centraal staat. Een klokkenluider past binnen het concept van een held, omdat hij wordt gezien als één van ons (de ‘gewone’ mens) en gedreven is om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 403).

Seal (2009) beschrijft aan de hand van de verouderde theorie van Hobsbawm (1973) aan welke eigenschappen verhalen over criminele helden veelal voldoen. Hij omschrijft, met het zogeheten Robin Hood Principe, twaalf eigenschappen van nieuwsberichten over criminele helden.

Een klokkenluider die gedreven was om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen en gezien kan worden als een criminele held is Edward Snowden. Hij werkte bij de National Security Agency (NSA) in Amerika en bracht op illegale wijze verkregen documenten naar buiten over af luisterpraktijken van de Amerikaanse overheid. Hierdoor wordt hij in Amerika nu als crimineel gezocht en door een deel van de burgers gezien als een held. Opvallend is dat Snowden dus gezien kan worden als zowel een held als een crimineel. Een onderwerp van discussie op vele forums, internetpolls en opiniepeilingen is deze verdeeldheid over Snowden.

Interessant is in hoeverre de twaalf eigenschappen van nieuwsberichten over criminele helden zijn terug te vinden in de nieuwsberichten over Snowden in Nederlandse en Amerikaanse

nieuwsmedia. Dit is te onderzoeken aan de hand van een narratieve analyse. Binnen de narratieve analyse staat de theorie van Seal (2009) over criminele helden centraal en wordt er onderzocht in hoeverre verhaalstructuren uit die theorie voorkomen in de nieuwsartikelen.

Om vervolgens te onderzoeken op welke manier bepaalde elementen in interpretatiekaders worden uitgelicht, wordt gebruik gemaakt van een *framinganalyse*. Hiermee is het mogelijk de dominante *frames* uit de nieuwsartikelen te herleiden. De eventueel aanwezige eigenschappen van het stereotype 'criminele held' zullen één van de dominante *frames* kunnen vormen. De narratieve analyse focust zich op de verhaalelementen en het verloop, terwijl de *framinganalyse* dominante *frames* in de *framematrix* van Van Gorp en van der Groot (2009) plaatst om te onderzoeken op welke manier bepaalde elementen in interpretatiekaders worden uitgelicht.

Op deze manier kunnen de eventuele verschillen in de berichtgeving over Snowden in Nederland en Amerika bloot worden gelegd. Snowden is een Amerikaan en heeft documenten van de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten NSA gelekt, dit kan aannemelijk leiden tot een negatievere berichtgeving over de daden van Snowden in Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia, dan bijvoorbeeld in Nederlandse nieuwsmedia. Andere landen dan Amerika, zullen aannemelijk de eerlijkheid van Snowden meer waarderen, doordat nu inzichtelijk is in hoeverre door de Amerikaanse overheid wordt afgeluisterd.

Aan de hand van deze theorieën over *framing*, klokkenluiders en criminele helden is het mogelijk om voort te borduren op het wetenschappelijke onderzoek van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) en meer inzicht te krijgen in de representatie van klokkenluiders voor de toekomst. Aan de hand van een casus over Snowden zal dan ook de volgende hoofdvraag worden beantwoord:

*In hoeverre wordt de klokkenluider Snowden door middel van framing in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia anders weergegeven dan in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia?*

In hoofdstuk 2 wordt eerst de casus rondom Snowden toegelicht. Daarna wordt de algemene theorie over *framing* uiteengezet, om vervolgens in te gaan op de rol van klokkenluiders in de media en af te sluiten met theorie over criminele helden. Hierna is het theoretische kader duidelijk afgebakend en wordt in hoofdstuk 3 de gekozen methode en corpus voor dit onderzoek toegelicht. In hoofdstuk 4 worden de resultaten per analysemethode uiteengezet om vervolgens af te sluiten met een vergelijking van deze resultaten en conclusie.

## 2. Theoretisch kader

In dit hoofdstuk wordt het theoretische kader afgebakend. Dit zal gebeuren door eerst de casus rondom Snowden uiteen te zetten. Er wordt toegelicht waarom hij als klokkenluider gezien kan worden en het geeft meer inzicht in zijn daden en motieven. Vervolgens zal de algemene theorie over *framing* van nieuwsberichten worden beschreven en wordt er ingegaan op de theorie rondom klokkenluiders in de media. Tot slot wordt de theorie rondom criminele helden toegelicht aan de hand van het Robin Hood Principe. Door het theoretisch kader op deze manier te ordenen, werk ik na de casus over Snowden van een brede algemene theorie naar een steeds gedetailleerdere theorie toe.

### 2.1 Edward Snowden

Op 5 juni 2013 publiceert de Engelse krant *The Guardian* gelekte documenten van de NSA. In deze documenten is te lezen hoe Amerika spionageactiviteiten uitvoert aan de hand van afluisterpraktijken door de NSA. Snowden is voormalig werknemer van de CIA en werkte daarna als systeembeheerder voor de NSA. Hij heeft op illegale wijze toegang gekregen tot de documenten van de NSA en ze publiekelijk gemaakt via de Engelse krant *The Guardian* en daaropvolgend de Amerikaanse krant *The Washington Post*. Snowden zegt te hebben gehandeld 'uit afschuw' over het vermogen van de overheid om binnen te dringen in de persoonlijke levenssfeer van burgers.

Snowden heeft medewerkers van het NSA-kantoor overtuigd om hun wachtwoorden met hem te delen. Hierdoor had hij toegang tot tienduizenden documenten over Amerikaanse spionageactiviteiten. Nadat hij naar Hong Kong was gevlucht, lekte hij enkele documenten aan de media. Op deze manier werden ze over de hele wereld verspreid. Al snel volgde vanuit de FBI een arrestatiebevel voor de voortvluchtige Snowden. Zodra hij opgepakt dreigde te worden in Hong Kong vluchtte Snowden naar Moskou en vroeg bij landen zonder uitleveringsverdrag met Amerika asiel aan. Uiteindelijk heeft Rusland tijdelijk politiek asiel aan Snowden verleend.

Snowden is aan de hand van deze gebeurtenissen genomineerd voor de Nobelprijs voor de Vrede en won de Internationale Klokkenluidersprijs 2013, Fritz-Bauer-prijs 2013, Sam Adams Award 2013 en de alternatieve Nobelprijs, de Right Livelihood Award 2014 (Wikipedia).

### 2.2 Framing van nieuwsberichten

Het op een bepaalde manier *framen* van media-uitingen is een invloedrijke methode die media gebruiken om publieke opinies te creëren (De Vreese, 2005, p. 51). *Frames* kunnen worden omschreven als interpretatiekaders waarin een bepaald element van een gebeurtenis, beleid of persoon wordt uitgelicht. Hierdoor wordt de focus gelegd op een specifieke invulling van de werkelijkheid, waardoor die verpakking er een speciale betekenis aan geeft. Brants (2008) omschrijft het als een



methode om de complexe werkelijkheid te begrijpen en verschijnselen te categoriseren in herkenbare en bekende rubrieken (Brants, 2008, p. 50-51).

Van Gorp (2004) maakt onderscheid tussen twee aspecten in het communicatieproces. Hij verwijst enerzijds naar de manier waarop journalisten nieuws vormgeven en aan de andere kant naar de manier waarop het publiek deze *frames* overneemt. Van Gorp vindt een *frame* een standvastige, metacommunicatieve boodschap. De boodschap geeft het structurele denkbeeld weer dat een nieuwsbericht samenhang en betekenis verleent. Een *frame* bestaat volgens Van Gorp en van der Groot (2009) uit *framing devices* en *reasoning devices*. Met *framing devices* bedoelt hij specifieke aspecten uit een nieuwsartikel die functioneren als indicatoren van het *frame*. Hierbij gaat het om aanwijsbare elementen zoals vocabulaire, metaforen, beschrijvingen, voorbeelden en visuele beelden. Met *reasoning devices* wordt de eventueel aanwezige, logische keten van redeneringen bedoeld. Deze geven aan wat het probleem inhoudt, hoezo het een probleem is en wat voor oplossing noodzakelijk is. De *framing devices* en de *reasoning devices* vormen samen een *frame package* en zullen worden gebruikt in de *framinganalyse* (Van Gorp & van der Groot, 2009, p. 305).

### **2.3 Klokkenuiders in het nieuws**

Aan de hand van de theorie over *framing* kunnen nieuwsartikelen worden geanalyseerd, maar om de analyse te kaderen is meer kennis nodig over klokkenluider in het nieuws. Deze theorie wordt in deze paragraaf uiteengezet.

In een democratische samenleving heeft de journalist een rol als ‘*watchdog*’. Journalisten houden machthebbers zoals publieke en private instellingen in de gaten en publiceren over nieuwswaardige gebeurtenissen zoals misstanden (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 400). Ettema en Glasser (1998) vinden dat journalisten door deze activiteiten ‘bewakers van het geweten’ zijn geworden:

*“Their stories call attention to the breakdown of social systems and the disorder within public institutions that cause injury and injustice; in turn, their stories implicitly demand the response of public officials – and the public itself – to that breakdown and disorder. Thus the work of these reporters calls us, as a society, to decide what is, and what is not, an outrage to our sense of moral order, and to consider our expectations for our officials, our institutions, and ultimately ourselves.”*  
(Ettema & Glasser, 1998, p. 3)

Journalisten nemen dus een actieve rol in bij het aan de kaak stellen van misstanden (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 402-403). Klokkenuiders worden gezien als melders van misstanden binnen bedrijven en organisaties en zijn daardoor een belangrijke bron voor journalisten. Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) onderzoeken, aan de hand van een content analyse van nieuwsmedia uit

Groot-Brittannië uit de periode van 1997 tot 2009, hoe klokkenluiders worden behandeld in de media en hoe dit past binnen het ‘*watchdog*’-principe.

Een klokkenluider kan iemand van binnen of van buiten de organisatie of het bedrijf zijn (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 401). De media kunnen een sleutelrol innemen bij het naar buiten brengen van misstanden die door de verantwoordelijke personen van het desbetreffende bedrijf of organisatie worden genegeerd. Ook kunnen de media een cruciale rol spelen wanneer een klokkenluider uit is op vergelding. Negatieve publiciteit voor een bedrijf of organisatie bevordert het oplossen van misstanden, omdat het negatieve effecten kan hebben op bijvoorbeeld de verkoopcijfers, de reputatie van het bedrijf en het aantrekken van investeerders (Callahan & Dworkin, 2007, p. 151).

Over het algemeen zijn nieuwsitems over ‘gewone’ mensen, in plaats van ‘elite’ mensen, niet populair bij lezers. De lezer denkt dat ‘gewone’ personen in een nieuwsitem weinig kennis te bieden hebben buiten hun eigen persoonlijke ervaringen. Ze worden niet gezien als legitieme, gezaghebbende bronnen binnen een nieuwsitem. In contrast hiermee staat een klokkenluider. Een klokkenluider meldt namelijk niet alleen een misstand van een organisatie, maar beschikt ook over de kennis en deskundigheid van de desbetreffende organisatie door zijn professionele werkervaring (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 403). Door deze unieke status worden klokkenluiders serieus genomen en wordt het nieuwsitem vaak gepubliceerd (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 400). Voor een klokkenluider heeft het publiekelijk aan de kaak stellen van misstanden ook gevolgen. Hij ondergaat vaak een eenzame ervaring waarbij hijzelf en de misstand erg veel media-aandacht krijgen (Flynn, 2007, p. 257).

Opvallend is dat berichten over klokkenluiders voornamelijk in kwaliteitskranten worden gepubliceerd in plaats van tabloidkranten. Dit veronderstelt dat klokkenluiders serieuze problemen aan de kaak stellen die beter passen binnen de kwaliteitsjournalistiek (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 405). Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) beweren dat een verhaal over een klokkenluider eerder gepubliceerd wordt als deze past binnen de politieke oriëntatie van de krant, het een exclusief verhaal is en aansluit bij actuele gebeurtenissen. De journalist heeft de macht om te bepalen of een misstand wel of niet via de media wordt gepubliceerd. De mediaomvang van een nieuwsitem over een klokkenluider hangt sterk af van de actuele politieke, sociale, culturele en wettelijke context en de al lopende discussies rondom het onderwerp (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 410).

Van Es en Smit (2003) noemen ook de ‘media logic’ waarbinnen het nieuwsitem moet passen. Hiermee bedoelen ze dat de vragen wie, wat, hoe, waar en wanneer moeten kunnen worden beantwoord bij het naar buiten brengen van het nieuwsbericht. Het verhaal moet niet te gecompliceerd zijn en passen binnen het *framework* van een krant (Van Es & Smit, 2003, p. 149). Wanneer het nieuwsitem hieraan voldoet en wordt gepubliceerd, volgt er vaak een mediahype. Er komt een golf van mediapubliciteit op gang rondom het onderwerp, waarbij iedere nieuwsproducent het onderwerp vanuit een nieuw perspectief probeert te belichten. Volgens Van Es en Smit (2003) komt deze grote hoeveelheid publiciteit op gang door de dynamische interactie tussen de media en de samenleving.

Nieuwsmedia publiceren namelijk ook graag wat het publiek interessant vindt (Van Es & Smit, 2003, p. 149).

Volgens Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) worden verhalen over klokkenluiders in plaats van rationeel en objectief beschreven, gecreëerd en gepresenteerd als een product dat is ontstaan door specifieke, historische omstandigheden en voldoen ze daardoor vaak aan de volgende eigenschappen:

1. De verhalen zijn gepersonaliseerd. Dit gebeurt op een dusdanige manier dat het geven van structurele kritiek moeilijker wordt.
2. De verhalen veranderen gedurende het tijdsverloop door grotere, culturele dynamieken.

Echter brengt een consequente nadruk op de klokkenluiders uit de publieke sector, in plaats van op klokkenluiders uit de privésector, de grenzen van dit soort ‘*watchdog*’ journalistiek in beeld (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 407).

Een nieuwsitem over een klokkenluider is volgens Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) voornamelijk positief en bevat een narratieve structuur. De Amerikaanse hoogleraar journalistiek Lule (2001) beweert dat verhaalstructuren in het nieuws gekoppeld kunnen worden aan zeven verschillende mythen.

*"News media can be seen as powerful mythmakers who tell us, daily, stories at the heart of human life"* (Lule, 2001, p. 187)

Het concept mythe is afkomstig van de Franse filosoof Barthes. In zijn boek *Mythologies* (1957) borduurt hij voort op het werk van de grondlegger van de semiologie, namelijk Ferdinand de Saussure (Pisters, 2007, p.103). Met deze theorie wil Barthes laten zien dat wat consumenten als gewoon en natuurlijk ervaren in feite het resultaat is van onzichtbare en vaak ook onbewuste betekenisvorming die niet natuurlijk is, maar een ideologische constructie is van de dominante klasse in de maatschappij (Pisters, 2007, p. 102).

Hoewel het vaak lastig is nieuws binnen het beperkt aantal mythes van Lule (2001) te plaatsen, zijn de functionele gelijkenissen tussen nieuws en mythen beter te koppelen. Nieuws kan worden beschouwd als één groot verhaal met een symbolische functie, namelijk het bevestigen van de maatschappelijke orde (Burger, 2014, p. 90).

Binnen het narratief van een nieuwsitem over een klokkenluider staat volgens Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) de held centraal. Lule (2001) omschrijft hoe een heroïsch narratief wordt gecreëerd:

*"...we must find the story of a humble birth, a background of normalcy. The Hero must be one of us. Yet from this humble background, the Hero must emerge marked by and driven by a quest. This quest must have social value and significance. It must be fraught with adversity and struggle."* (Lule, 2001, p. 102)

Een klokkenluider past binnen het concept van een held, omdat hij een van ons is (de ‘gewone’ mens) en gedreven is om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen. Zijn rol in het narratief is niet enkel om de misstand naar buiten te brengen, maar ook het bewijs hiervan bloot te leggen. Hem doen voorkomen als legitieme bron en als onbaatzuchtige held is dan ook van cruciaal belang. Dit wordt versterkt doordat klokkenluiders in de nieuwsitems vaak zelf aan het woord mogen komen. Hierdoor komt het verhaal daadwerkelijk tot leven via de woorden van de klokkenluider (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 409-410). Ook de woordkeuze van journalisten speelt een belangrijke rol bij de positieve of neutrale beschrijving van nieuws van klokkenluiders. Uit het onderzoek van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) blijkt dat de neutrale woorden ‘*said*’, ‘*claimed*’ of ‘*blew the whistle*’ of de positieve woorden ‘*revealed*’ en ‘*exposed*’ vaker voorkomen dan bijvoorbeeld de negatieve woorden ‘*leaked*’, ‘*snitched*’ of ‘*grassed*’.

Volgens Hobsbawm (1973) en Seal (2009) zijn verhalen over criminelen echter niet altijd negatief, maar speelt de held in het narratief van deze nieuwsberichten ook een cruciale rol. Dit wordt verder toegelicht in de volgende paragraaf.

## **2.4 Het Robin Hood Principe**

Een criminele held komt regelmatig voor in verhalen, kunst, literatuur, romans, media en andere culturele uitingen. Criminaliteit is een veel voorkomend onderwerp in het nieuws en heeft een grote amusementswaarde. Volgens Brants (2008) komt dit doordat nieuws over criminaliteit past binnen de definitie van nieuws als afwijkend, negatief, nieuw en actueel, dramatisch en makkelijk te personaliseren. In de nieuwsitems over criminaliteit is vaak een duidelijke narratieve structuur te bekennen (Brants, 2008, p. 50).

Hobsbawm (1973) heeft onderzocht hoe criminelen aan een heldenstatus kunnen komen via verhalen. Hij beweert dat heldhaftige criminelen kunnen worden verklaard door te kijken naar de structurele, sociale omstandigheden waarin de crimineel opereert. Vaak gaat het om een sociale groep die zich onderdrukt of onjuist behandeld voelt door een machtigere andere sociale groep. De criminele held komt op voor de onderdrukte sociale groep en keert zich tegen de machtigere sociale groep. Hierdoor wordt diegene als een held gezien door de onderdrukte sociale groep (Lanjouw, 2010, p. 9). Het verhaal van Robin Hood is hiervan het ideale voorbeeld. Het verhaal gaat over een Engelse volksheld, Robin Hood genaamd, die steelt van de rijken en de buit deelt met de armen.

Hobsbawm (1973) ontdekte dat verhalen over zulke criminele helden herkenbaar zijn aan dezelfde narratieve structuur. Hij beweert dat er in verhalen over criminele helden negen standaardverhaalelementen te herkennen zijn. Hobsbawm (1973) creëerde met deze theorie een nieuwe blik op criminele helden, maar ontving ook kritiek op deze theorie. Ten eerste vervullen in de praktijk maar weinig criminelen de sociale rol. Hierdoor passen maar weinig criminele helden precies binnen het model van de sociale held. Ten tweede maakte Hobsbawm geen goed onderscheid tussen

nieuwsberichten en fictieve verhalen over criminelen. Ten slotte heeft Seal (2009) kritiek op Hobsbawm, omdat hij vindt dat dit soort narratieve structuren nog steeds bestaan in de moderne maatschappij, in tegenstelling tot wat Hobsbawm (1972) beweerde (Lanjouw & Burger, 2013, p. 292).

Aan de hand van de verouderde theorie van Hobsbawm heeft Seal (2009) een lijst met modernere eigenschappen van verhalen over criminele helden opgesteld. Het narratief rondom de criminele held bestaat volgens Seal (2009) uit een aantal herkenbare elementen die in verschillende combinaties kunnen voorkomen:

1. De criminele held wordt door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten (meestal regeringen en/of lokale machthebbers) gedwongen de wet - of wat er voor door gaat - te overtreden.
2. Een criminele held heeft de sympathie en steun van één of meer weerstand biedende sociale groepen.
3. De criminele held lost misstanden op en helpt conflicten op te lossen.
4. De criminele held moordt alleen uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Hij moordt niet moedwillig of grillig en bovendien valt hij geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aan.
5. De criminele held is aardig en hoffelijk tegenover zijn slachtoffers.
6. De criminele held verspreidt de buit onder de armen en diegenen die het verdienen en/of sympathiseert met hun behoeften en biedt hulp bij hun omstandigheden.
7. De criminele held misleidt en ontsnapt aan de autoriteiten en is hen regelmatig te slim af. Meestal met veel uitstraling, vaak in een vermomming.
8. De criminele held beschikt meestal over een vorm van magie die bijdraagt aan zijn onkwetsbaarheid, onzichtbaarheid en/of snelheid of hij heeft andere hulpvolle eigenschappen.
9. De criminele held is dapper en sterk. Als hij niet sterk is, dan beschikt de criminele held over een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.
10. De criminele held wordt uiteindelijk verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt.
11. De criminele held gaat dapper en uitdagend dood door een touw, bijl, zwaard of kogel.
12. De criminele held kan gezegd hebben de uiteindelijke confrontatie, executie of ander soort dood te hebben overleefd en ergens in veilige anonimiteit verder te hebben geleefd.

(Seal, 2009, p. 74)

Een aantal van deze elementen (1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9 en 11) hebben sterk te maken met een moraal. Criminele helden zijn onderdeel van de culturele tradities van de sociale groep waarin ze leven, hierdoor zijn ze zich bewust van de normen en waarden. Hoewel ze zich er niet altijd aan zullen houden, is het wel belangrijk dat ze de steun en sympathie van het volk vasthouden (Seal, 2009, p. 78). Een criminele held hoeft niet aan alle twaalf de kenmerken te voldoen om als criminele held te worden

beschouwd. Vaak roepen enkele kenmerken al bepaalde *frames* op bij de lezers. (Lanjouw & Burger, 2013, p. 295).

## 2.5 Samenvatting

*Frames* kunnen worden omschreven als interpretatiekaders waarin een bepaald element van een gebeurtenis, beleid of persoon wordt uitgelicht. Een *frame* bestaat volgens van Gorp en van der Groot (2009) uit *framing devices* en *reasoning devices*. Hierbij gaat het om specifieke aspecten uit een nieuwsartikel die functioneren als indicatoren van het *frame* en de eventueel aanwezige, logische keten van redeneringen. De *framing devices* en de *reasoning devices* vormen samen een *frame package* en zullen worden gebruikt binnen de *framinganalyse* van klokkenluider Snowden (Van Gorp & van der Groot, 2009, p.305).

Klokkenluiders zijn een belangrijke bron voor journalisten, omdat ze worden gezien als melders van misstanden binnen bedrijven en organisaties. Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) beweren dat een nieuwsitem over een klokkenluider voornamelijk positief is en er gebruik wordt gemaakt van een narratieve structuur waarbij de held centraal staat. Een klokkenluider past binnen het concept van een held, omdat hij een van ons is (de ‘gewone’ mens) en gedreven is om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen. Seal (2009) omschrijft een aantal herkenbare elementen die kunnen voorkomen in het narratief rondom een criminele held. Doordat Snowden niet alleen als klokkenluider maar ook als crimineel gezien kan worden, is de theorie van Seal (2009) bruikbaar voor een analyse van criminele helden.

In het volgende hoofdstuk wordt de methode toegelicht die aan de hand van de theorieën over *framing*, klokkenluiders en criminele helden voor dit onderzoek gekozen is.

### 3. Methodologie

In hoofdstuk 2 is het theoretisch kader afgebakend. Aan de hand van deze theorie is het mogelijk om te onderzoeken in hoeverre de klokkenluider Snowden door middel van *framing* in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia anders weergegeven wordt dan in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia. De methodes en het corpus die hiervoor geschikt zijn, worden in dit hoofdstuk toegelicht. Eerst wordt de algemene theorie over kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyses uitgelegd om vervolgens dieper in te gaan op de twee gekozen onderzoeksstrategieën. Hier zal een theoretische uitleg over de theorieën worden opgevolgd door de praktische werkwijze voor dit onderzoek. In hoofdstuk 3.2 wordt het medialandschap van Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia uiteengezet en ten slotte het gekozen corpus toegelicht.

#### 3.1 Kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse

Een analyse van journalistieke content vraagt om een inhoudsanalyse. Er kunnen twee soorten inhoudsanalyses worden onderscheiden, namelijk kwalitatieve en kwantitatieve. Een kwantitatieve inhoudsanalyse is gericht op aantallen, op numerieke verhoudingen en ‘hoeveel’ vragen, terwijl de kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse gericht is op bepaalde patronen blootleggen, mogelijke oorzaken in kaart brengen en categorieën (*frames*) onderscheiden. De kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse is het meest geschikt voor dit onderzoek door het interpreterende karakter en de mogelijkheid om ‘hoe’ vragen te kunnen beantwoorden en betekenissen toe te kennen aan bepaalde patronen (Koetsenruijter & Van Hout, 2014). Het gaat in dit onderzoek om de verborgen betekenissen in de journalistieke content die vragen om interpretatie.

Bij een kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse is er geen sprake van een gestandaardiseerde werkwijze, maar vaak wordt een verzameling van onderzoeksstrategieën samen gebruikt. Deze onderzoeksstrategieën houden zich elk vanuit een ander perspectief bezig met de analyse van teksten en documenten (Pleijter, 2006, p. 16). Volgens Hijmans (1996) kunnen er vijf verschillende typen worden onderscheiden: retorische, interpretatieve, narratieve, structuralistisch-semiotische en discoursanalyse (Pleijter, 2006, p. 20). Van deze vijf typen zal voor dit onderzoek de narratieve analyse worden gebruikt en een *framinganalyse* met *framematrix*. Deze twee analysemethodes overlappen elkaar. De narratieve analyse focust zich op de verhaalstructuren die passen bij het Robin Hood Principe. Vervolgens is het mogelijk om onder andere het eventueel aanwezige stereotype ‘criminele held’ binnen de *framematrix* te plaatsen en te onderzoeken op welke manier bepaalde elementen in interpretatiekaders worden uitgelicht. Hieronder wordt de werkwijze van zowel de narratieve analyse als de *framinganalyse* verder toegelicht.

##### 3.1.1 Narratieve analyse

In narratieve analyses worden mediaboodschappen gezien als vertellingen of verhalen. Bij deze analysemethode gaat het voornamelijk om de verwickelingen rond personages en de gebeurtenissen

die zich afspelen. De focus ligt op een reconstructie van het verloop van het verhaal. Hierbij wordt het plot en de typering van de tekst als genre geanalyseerd. De narratieve structuur wordt uit elkaar gerafeld en als een patroon beschreven (Pleijter, 2006, p. 21). De in het vorige hoofdstuk beschreven theorie van Seal (2009) over het Robin Hood Principe beschrijft een aantal herkenbare elementen in het narratief over criminele helden die in verschillende combinaties kunnen voorkomen. Door deze theorie te gebruiken binnen een narratieve analyse is het mogelijk te analyseren in hoeverre het narratief in de berichtgeving over Snowden dezelfde verhaalstructuren bevat zoals benoemd in het Robin Hood Principe. Praktisch betekent dit dat er een analyse zal plaatsvinden waarbij wordt gekeken waar en hoe de Robin Hood Principes terug te vinden zijn in de nieuwsberichten over Snowden. Elke eigenschap krijgt een eigen kleur toegekend. In de nieuwsartikelen worden de eigenschappen van het Robin Hood Principe met de bijbehorende kleur gearceerd. Vervolgens wordt er per eigenschap aan de hand van citaten een conclusie getrokken over de manier waarop die eigenschap terug te vinden is in zowel de Nederlandse als de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia.

### **3.1.2 Framinganalyse**

Voor de *framinganalyse* zal er gewerkt worden met een *framematrix* (zie tabel 1.). Deze matrix komt voort uit de theorie van Van Gorp en van der Groot (2009) zoals beschreven in hoofdstuk 2.2. Met deze inductieve *framinganalyse* kunnen de verschillende patronen binnen de *framing devices* en *reasoning devices* worden geplaatst in een *framematrix*.

Aan de hand van de narratieve analyse zal blijken of het stereotype ‘criminele held’ aanwezig is en dus één van de *frame packages* zal vormen voor de *framinganalyse*. De meest dominante *frames* worden toegelicht aan de hand van de bevindingen die in de *framematrix* worden geplaatst. In de toelichting van de *frames* zullen vragen worden beantwoord zoals, wie gebruikt welk *frame*, wanneer en waarom (niet).

Aan de hand van deze analyse zal blijken welke dominante *frames* er voorkomen in de Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsartikelen en kunnen beide analyse met elkaar worden vergeleken. Met de resultaten uit de *framematrix* kan er met enige bescheidenheid gesteld worden welke *frames* dominanter aanwezig zullen zijn dan de andere. Echter staat het toekennen van betekenissen aan bepaalde patronen binnen dit kwalitatieve onderzoek centraal.



	<i>Reasoning devices</i>						<i>Framing devices</i>			
<i>Frame</i>	Probleem- definiëring	Causale verantwoordelijkheid	Oplossing/ handelingsperspectief	Verantwoordelijkheid voor oplossing	Morele basis	Emotionele basis	Kernbegrippen	Visuele devices	Verbale devices	Voorbeelden

*Tabel 1. Framematrix (Van Gorp & van der Groot, 2009)*

## 3.2 Corpus

Om het corpus te bepalen, wordt in dit hoofdstuk eerst een overzicht gegeven van het medialandschap omtrent de belangrijkste, geschreven nieuwsbronnen in Nederland en Amerika. Naar aanleiding van deze bevindingen wordt het corpus gekozen en toegelicht. Ten slotte wordt het kwantitatieve overzicht van het te onderzoeken corpus weergegeven.

### 3.2.1 Medialandschap kranten Nederland

Met een 'media bias' wordt een verdeeldheid bedoeld in de manier waarop nieuws door de media naar buiten wordt gebracht. In Nederland komen de verschillende kranten voort uit de verzuiling, maar tegenwoordig hebben de meeste Nederlandse kranten de politieke en religieuze invalshoek losgelaten en zit het verschil tussen kranten voornamelijk in de signatuur (Asscher et al., 2006).

Er kan in Nederland onderscheid worden gemaakt tussen populaire kranten (ook wel tabloidkranten of sensatiekrant genoemd) en kwaliteitskranten. Het onderscheid tussen deze twee is niet altijd even duidelijk, maar over het algemeen kan worden gesteld dat kwaliteitskranten relatief veel aandacht schenken aan binnen- en buitenlands nieuws en sociaaleconomisch nieuws. Populaire kranten proberen op hun beurt zo veel mogelijk nieuws te vergaren en trachten dit in makkelijk verteerbare porties te presenteren (Jansen, 1987). Tegenwoordig bepalen de uitgeverij en de redacties de (commerciële) doelstellingen, een zeker signatuur, de identiteit en de positionering van de krant. Kranten strijden onderling om lezers en moeten zich daarom van elkaar onderscheiden (Asscher et al., 2006).

Hieronder een overzicht van de landelijke, betaalde kranten met de grootste oplages in Nederland. Al deze kranten onderhouden ook op een actieve manier een nieuwswebsite.

- **De Telegraaf**  
Oplage print: 528.044 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)  
Tabloidkrant, sensatiekrant
- **Algemeen Dagblad**  
Oplage print: 408.0463 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)  
Tabloidkrant, sensatiekrant
- **De Volkskrant**  
Oplage print: 261.089 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)  
Kwaliteitskrant
- **NRC Handelsblad**  
Oplage print: 191.617 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)  
Kwaliteitskrant
- **Trouw**  
Oplage print: 102.827 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)  
Kwaliteitskrant

- **Het Financiële Dagblad**

Oplage print: 53.835 (Oplagen Dagbladen, 2013)

Kwaliteitskrant

### 3.2.2 Medialandschap kranten Amerika

Volgens Kiener (2013) kan veel van het nieuws in Amerika gezien worden als bevooroordeeld en niet betrouwbaar. Uit polls blijkt dat 80 procent van de Amerikanen beseft dat nieuws wordt beïnvloed door bepaalde machtige groepen uit de samenleving en zij het nieuws alleen vanuit een bepaalde invalshoek willen belichten. Veel Amerikanen zijn bang dat objectief nieuws plaats aan het maken is voor nieuws met een mening en bepaalde invalshoek (Kiener, 2013, p. 401). Volgens Kiener (2013) is het een probleem dat de media partijdigheid steeds groter wordt in de mainstream nieuwsmedia van Amerika. Hij is van mening dat de meeste nieuwsmedia progressief of in het midden georiënteerd zijn en de objectiviteit steeds meer verdwijnt (Kiener, 2013, p. 403). Hierdoor groeit de afgelopen jaren het aantal Amerikanen die sceptisch tegen de betrouwbaarheid van nieuwsmedia aankijken. Een aantal onderzoekers is van mening dat de opkomst van onder andere blogs, televisie, radioshow's en internet eraan hebben bijgedragen dat de lijn tussen objectief nieuws en meningen vager is geworden en vaak lastig te onderscheiden is voor het publiek (Kiener, 2013, p. 405).

Er zijn veel geprinte kranten in Amerika. Hieronder staat een lijst van de kranten met de grootste dagelijkse verspreiding en erachter de politieke invalshoek die deze kranten volgens onderzoek voornamelijk gebruiken. Hieruit blijkt inderdaad dat de grootste kranten voornamelijk progressief georiënteerd zijn.

- **USA Today**

Oplage print: 1.424.406 (Beaujon, 2013)

Politieke invalshoek: centraal (Groseclose en Milyo, 2005)

- **The Wall Street Journal**

Oplage print: 1.480.725 (Beaujon, 2013)

Politieke invalshoek: progressief (Groseclose en Milyo, 2005)

- **The New York Times**

Oplage print: 731.395 (Beaujon, 2013)

Politieke invalshoek: progressief (Groseclose en Milyo, 2005)

- **The Washington Post**

Oplage print: 484.385 (Mitchell, Jurkowitz & Guskin, 2013)

Politieke invalshoek: centraal (Groseclose en Milyo, 2005) / progressief (Kuypers, 2002)

- **Los Angeles Times**

Oplage print: 432.873 (Beaujon, 2013)

Politieke invalshoek: progressief (Kuypers, 2002)

Deze kranten onderhouden allemaal ook actief een eigen website. Een van de Amerikaanse nieuwskanalen dat alleen een online platform heeft, is The Voice of America News (VOA). Dit is een multimediale omroep gefinancierd door de Amerikaanse regering. Het verspreidt naar eigen zeggen nauwkeurig, evenwichtig en uitgebreid nieuws en heeft een internationaal publiek (VOA).

### 3.2.3 Overzicht corpus

Voor het onderzoek naar *mediaframing* rondom Snowden is een afgebakend corpus samengesteld van Amerikaanse en Nederlandse nieuwsberichten. In de voorgaande paragrafen is een lijst genoemd van Amerikaanse en Nederlandse betaalde kranten met de grootste oplagen. Deze lijst vormt een afspiegeling van de variatie van de Nederlandse en Amerikaanse kranten.

Wat betreft de Nederlandse kranten is *de Volkskrant* de populairste kwaliteitskrant en *De Telegraaf* de populairste sensatiekrant. Deze twee kranten vormen elkaars uiterste in de Nederlandse media en zijn daarom geschikt als onderdeel van het corpus om de Nederlandse krantenartikelen over Snowden te representeren.

Voor de Amerikaanse kranten worden in dit onderzoek de nieuwsartikelen over Snowden uit *The Washinton Post* en *The Voice of Amerika News* gebruikt. De onafhankelijke, voornamelijk liberale krant *The Washington Post* stond vooraan bij de verspreiding van het nieuws over Snowden. *The Voice of America News* en was niet direct betrokken bij de verspreiding van de documenten van Snowden. Deze nieuwsbronnen zijn elkaars uiterste en om die reden gekozen voor dit onderzoek.

Voor *de Volkskrant*, *De Telegraaf* en *The Washington Post* geldt dat er alleen wordt gekeken naar de artikelen uit de kranten en niet naar de online artikelen. Wat betreft *The Voice of America News* wordt er alleen naar de artikelen gekeken die online zijn gepubliceerd, omdat zij geen krant uitgeven. De multimediale uitingen van *The Voice of America News* worden achterwegen gelaten, omdat dit onderzoek zich focust op geschreven nieuwsbronnen. Van *de Volkskrant* worden in dit onderzoek alleen de artikelen meegenomen die gepubliceerd zijn in de rubrieken Ten Eerste, Binnenland, Buitenland of Opinie & Debat. Van *The Washington Post* worden alleen de artikelen uit de *A-section* van de krant meegenomen in het onderzoek. Dit heeft praktische overwegingen, omdat het corpus anders te groot wordt. Daarbij worden op deze manier ook alleen de meest relevante artikelen meegenomen in het onderzoek.

Voor alle vier de nieuwsbronnen geldt dat ze vanaf juni 2013 nieuwsberichten over Snowden hebben gepubliceerd. Door het hoge aantal artikelen van deze nieuwsbronnen is er bij dit onderzoek voor gekozen om van de artikelen uit juni 2013 alleen diegene te onderzoeken die gaan over de belangrijkste ontwikkelingen. Hierbij gaat het om nieuwsartikelen die geheel over Snowden gaan. Nieuwsartikelen waarin slechts naar Snowden gerefereerd wordt, zijn uitgesloten voor dit onderzoek. De nieuwsartikelen over de gelekte documenten, voordat Snowden zich publiekelijk bekendmaakte als klokkenluider, zijn daarom eveneens uitgesloten voor dit onderzoek. Er is gekozen voor de artikelen

van juni 2013, omdat toen de documenten van Snowden naar buiten zijn gebracht en Snowden zichzelf bekendmaakte. Het nieuws rondom Snowden bereikte in deze periode zijn hoogtepunt.

In tabel 2 wordt het corpus uiteengezet. In de eerste kolom staan alle artikelen waar de naam Snowden in vernoemd wordt uit de periode 1 juni 2013 – 31 juni 2013. In de tweede kolom staat de selectie die wordt gebruikt voor het onderzoek. Dit zijn de artikelen die geheel over Snowden gaan en langer zijn dan 200 woorden. In dit materiaal wordt net zo lang doorgezocht tot er geen nieuwe informatie meer naar voren komt voor dit onderzoek.

	<b>Nieuwsartikelen totaal tussen 1 juni 2013 – 31 juni 2013</b>	<b>Nieuwsartikelen meest relevant tussen 1 juni 2013 – 31 juni 2013</b>
<b>Nederlandse nieuwsmedia</b>		
de Volkskrant	49	32
De Telegraaf	31	22
Totaal	<b>80</b>	<b>54</b>
<b>Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia</b>		
The Washington Post	106	49
The Voice of America News	65	55
Totaal	<b>171</b>	<b>104</b>
<b>Totaal</b>	<b>251</b>	<b>158</b>

*Tabel 2. Overzicht corpus*

## 4. Resultaten Nederlandse nieuwsmedia

In dit hoofdstuk wordt uiteengezet in hoeverre de twaalf eigenschappen van Seal (2009) over criminele helden terugkomen in het narratief rondom Snowden in de krantenartikelen van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf*. De twaalf eigenschappen zullen één voor één worden doorgenomen en daarna volgt er een conclusie van de narratieve analyse. Vervolgens kan er met behulp van de methode van Van Gorp en van der Groot (2009) een *framinganalyse* plaatsvinden. Aan de hand van onder andere deze resultaten kan uiteindelijk de hoofdvraag, in hoeverre de klokkenluider Snowden door middel van *framing* in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia anders wordt weergegeven dan in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia, worden beantwoord.

### 4.1 Narratieve analyse

Het narratief rondom Snowden wordt in zowel *de Volkskrant* als in *De Telegraaf* in meerdere krantenartikelen uiteengezet. *De Volkskrant*-artikelen binnen dit corpus zijn in de krant gepubliceerd binnen de rubriek Ten Eerste, Binnenland, Buitenland of Opinie & Debat. De artikelen van *De Telegraaf* zijn in de krant gepubliceerd binnen de rubriek section 1.

Het corpus is geanalyseerd (zie bijlage 1 en 2) en vormt samen het narratief voor dit onderzoek. In hoeverre de twaalf eigenschappen van Seal (2009) over criminele helden in deze artikelen terugkomen, blijkt uit onderstaande resultaten.

#### **1. De criminele held wordt door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten (meestal regeringen en/of lokale machthebbers) gedwongen de wet - of wat er voor door gaat - te overtreden.**

Snowden heeft de wet overtreden, doordat hij op illegale wijze wachtwoorden eigen heeft gemaakt en geheime documenten van de NSA publiekelijk heeft gemaakt. Zijn motief om dit te doen, was volgens zowel *de Volkskrant* als *De Telegraaf* 'de afschuw' van Snowden over het vermogen van de overheid om via de NSA binnen te dringen in de persoonlijke levenssfeer van burgers.

*Edward Snowden, een 29-jarige oud-medewerker van de CIA, handelde uit 'afschuw'.* - De Volkskrant. (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

Uit de krantenartikelen van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf* blijkt niet letterlijk dat Snowden door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten werd gedwongen om de wet te overtreden. Wel kun je stellen dat Snowden het niet eens was met de werkwijze van de overheid en zich daardoor gedwongen voelde om de wet te overtreden.

## **2. Een criminele held heeft de sympathie en steun van één of meer weerstand biedende sociale groepen.**

In de krantenartikelen van beide kranten staat regelmatig beschreven welke personen of partijen de daden van Snowden steunen en goedkeuren. In de meeste gevallen gaat het om het naar buiten brengen van de informatie door Snowden, zoals hier beschreven staat:

*Maar tienduizenden Amerikanen hebben al een petitie getekend op de site van het Witte Huis. 'Edward Snowden is een nationale held', valt daar te lezen, 'en moet onmiddellijk volledige en absolute vrijspraak krijgen'. – De Volkskrant (2013, 12 juni). Discussie barst los: held of landverrader.*

*Maar John Cassidy, eveneens van The New Yorker, is een van de vele journalisten die Snowden prijzen om zijn moed. – De Volkskrant (2013, 12 juni). Discussie barst los: held of landverrader.*

*Voor bijna 50.000 Amerikanen, die een online petitie hebben ondertekend waarin het Witte Huis om gratie voor de 29-jarige wordt gevraagd, is hij echter een held. – De Telegraaf (2013, 12 juni). Edward Snowden: held of verrader? Klokkenluider nam duizenden zeer geheime documenten mee.*

In het narratief komen ook personen of partijen naar voren die het eens zijn met Snowden wat betreft het idee dat de af luisterpraktijken van Amerika niet door de beugel kunnen. Of ze ook de daden van Snowden steunen, blijft echter onduidelijk.

*Zijn liberale collega Guy Verhofstadt, oud-premier van België, noemde het onacceptabel als de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA 'zonder toestemming' Europese data zou hebben verzameld. – De Volkskrant (2013, 12 juni). EU neemt schenden privacy door VS hoog op.*

Daarnaast krijgt Snowden steun van zijn vrouw, familie en voormalig klokkenluider Julian Assange. Ook wordt er onder de lezers van *De Telegraaf* een opiniepeiling opgesteld met de vraag of de lezer Snowden als een held of als een crimineel beschouwt. Hieruit blijkt dat het grootste deel van de ondervraagden Snowden als een held ziet.

*Het grootste deel van de Telegraaflezers vindt dat voormalig NSA-werknemer Snowden een held is en geen verrader. – De Telegraaf (2013, 26 juni). Respect voor klokkenluider.*

### **3. De criminele held lost misstanden op en helpt conflicten op te lossen.**

Volgens *De Telegraaf* en *de Volkskrant* is het Snowdens doel om misstanden aan het licht te brengen, zodat burgers meer inzicht krijgen over de manier waarop ze in de gaten worden gehouden door de Amerikaanse overheid.

*Hij wil de stad en het juridische systeem daar gebruiken om meer uitleg te geven over het in zijn ogen schandalige afluisteren van het internationale telefoonverkeer en het bespioneren van internetdata door de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA.* – *De Telegraaf* (2013, 13 juni). Snowden en vriendin lichten sluiters op.

*'Ik hoop dat dit een debat losmaakt over de vraag in welke wereld we willen leven. Mijn enige motief is de mensen te informeren over wat er in hun naam gebeurt en wat er tegen hen gebeurt', aldus Snowden in The Guardian.* – *De Volkskrant* (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

*Als motief gaf Snowden, die als technisch medewerker vier jaar bij de NSA werkte, op dat hij het publiek wil informeren wat er voor hen gedaan wordt en wat er tegen hen gedaan wordt.* – *De Telegraaf* (2013, 10 juni). NSA geheimzinnige terreurbestrijder.

Snowden vindt de werkwijze van de overheid momenteel verkeerd, omdat het volgens hem in strijd is met de burgerrechten.

*Snowden verdedigde zijn handelwijze steevast met een verwijzing naar de bescherming van burgerrechten.* – *De Telegraaf* (2013, 25 juni). Afbreuk.

Door de volgende quote, suggereert *de Volkskrant* dat het Snowdens doel was om de afluisterpraktijken te veranderen.

*Zijn grootste zorg is dat er ondanks de onthullingen 'niets zal veranderen'.* – *De Volkskrant* (2013, 11 juni). Met tegenzin in de spotlights voor het recht op privacy.

Onduidelijk blijft op welke manier Snowden de misstanden op wil lossen. *De Telegraaf* suggereert regelmatig dat de discussie over internetprivacy door Snowden is opgekomen. *De Telegraaf* wekt de indruk dat Snowden op die manier misstanden probeert op te lossen.

*De onthullingen van klokkenluider Edward Snowden hebben de discussie over internetprivacy doen oplaaien.* – *De Telegraaf* (2013, 29 juni). Wapen jezelf; Big Brother.



Op welke manier Snowden de misstanden wil oplossen blijkt ook niet uit het narratief van *de Volkskrant*. Wel worden de (eventuele) resultaten van zijn daden regelmatig beschreven in de artikelen.

*De onthullingen van Edward Snowden veroorzaken overal opschudding. Europa maakt zich zorgen over de privacy van haar burgers en eist opheldering van de VS.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 12 juni). EU neemt schenden privacy door VS hoog op.

*Volgens de Britse zakenkrant Financial Times kunnen de onthullingen leiden tot spanningen tussen de VS en de EU bij de op handen zijnde onderhandelingen over een handelsakkoord. De Europeanen staan op strengere privacyregels dan de Amerikanen, is al gebleken.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 12 juni). EU neemt schenden privacy door VS hoog op.

*Dankzij het lekken van Edward Snowden gaan zij die aan de macht zijn zich wellicht afvragen of ze wel kunnen doorgaan met ongestraft liegen.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 14 juni). Klokkenluiden is luidruchtig, het schuurt, maar het is nodig.

Daarnaast creëert Snowden volgens het narratief van *de Volkskrant* vooral conflicten tussen Amerika en landen die hem asiel willen aanbieden.

*Sommige Amerikaanse politici reageerden geërgerd op de rol die China, Hongkong en vooral Rusland spelen. 'Poetin lijkt er altijd op uit Amerika een vinger in het oog te steken - of het nu om Syrië gaat of Iran of met Snowden', zei de Democratische senator Schumer. 'Dit krijgt serieuze gevolgen voor de Amerikaans-Russische relaties.'* – De Volkskrant (2013, 24 juni). Snowden vraagt in Moskou asiel aan Ecuador.

#### **4. De criminele held moordt alleen uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Hij moordt niet moedwillig of grillig en bovendien valt hij geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aan.**

In het narratief vermoordt Snowden niemand, ook niet uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Wat dat betreft kun je stellen dat deze eigenschap niet bij Snowden past. Echter past het aspect dat een criminele held niet moedwillig of grillig vermoordt en geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aanvalt wel bij het narratief van Snowden.

### **5. De criminele held is aardig en hoffelijk tegenover zijn slachtoffers.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held komt niet voor in het narratief van Snowden. Zijn slachtoffers zijn de Amerikaanse overheid en de daarbij behorende NSA. Echter wordt er in het narratief van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf* niets over het contact met hen beschreven.

### **6. De criminele held verspreidt de buit onder de armen en diegenen die het verdienen en/of sympathiseert met hun behoeften en biedt hulp bij hun omstandigheden.**

Dit is een eigenschap van een criminele held die veel voorkomt in het narratief over Snowden in de krantenartikelen van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf*. Binnen beide narratieven kunnen de documenten over de af luisterpraktijken worden beschouwd als een buit die wordt verspreid onder diegene die het volgens Snowden verdienen om te weten, oftewel de burgers.

*'Ik hoop dat dit een debat losmaakt over de vraag in welke wereld we willen leven. Mijn enige motief is de mensen te informeren over wat er in hun naam gebeurt en wat er tegen hen gebeurt', aldus Snowden in The Guardian.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

*De man die de wereld vertelde dat de VS op grote schaal op internet spioneert.* – De Telegraaf (2013, 24 juni). Snowden blijft VS tarten; Klokkenluider reist halve wereld over uit angst voor arrestatie.

*Als motief gaf Snowden, die als technisch medewerker vier jaar bij de NSA werkte, op dat hij het publiek wil informeren wat er voor hen gedaan wordt en wat er tegen hen gedaan wordt.* – De Telegraaf (2013, 10 juni). NSA geheimzinnige terreurbestrijder.

Wat dat betreft kun je stellen dat Snowden aan deze eigenschap voldoet. Hij deelt 'de buit' die hij gestolen heeft met diegenen die het volgens hem verdienen om te weten. Op deze manier sympathiseert hij met hun behoeften, maar biedt geen hulp.

### **7. De criminele held misleidt en ontsnapt aan de autoriteiten en is hen regelmatig te slim af. Meestal met veel uitstraling, vaak in een vermomming.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held komt in de krantenartikelen van *De Telegraaf* het vaakst voor. Er wordt veel geschreven over de misleiding en ontsnapping van Snowden van de Amerikaanse overheid. Dit gaat vaak gepaard met een spannende narratieve vorm, zoals hier:

*Het lijkt erop dat Snowden iedereen voor de gek heeft gehouden, meldde het Russische tv-journaal Vremja gisteravond met amper verholen leedvermaak, doelend op een Aeroflot-vlucht eerder op de dag naar Havana. Ruim dertig journalisten hadden voor de vlucht naar Cuba reeds in het vliegtuig*

*plaatsgenomen, toen stoel 17 A die bestemd zou zijn geweest voor Snowden leeg bleek te blijven. – De Telegraaf (2013, 25 juni). Peking en Moskou lachen in hun vuistje om Snowden.*

Bijna in elk krantenbericht staat iets over de verdwijning of onderduiking van Snowden. Er wordt zelfs een vergelijking getrokken met Robin Hood:

*In de zaak van Edward Snowden omschrijft de Nederlandse hoogleraar en strafpleiter Geert-Jan Knoops de man als een Robin Hood in de schimmige inlichtingenwereld. Ondertussen is duidelijk dat de Amerikanen met alle middelen op Snowden jagen. – De Telegraaf (2013, 26 juni). Staatsgeheim blijf gevoelige kwestie; Ook in Nederland celstraffen voor spionage.*

Ook wordt er door *De Telegraaf* aandacht besteed aan de leefomstandigheden van Snowden terwijl hij op de vlucht is voor de Amerikaanse overheid:

*De man die de wereld vertelde over de grootschalige registratie van het telefoonverkeer en het internet door de Amerikaanse National Security Agency (NSA) at uitsluitend op zijn kamer, was slechts drie keer buiten, legde kussens voor de deur om afluisteren te voorkomen en dook onder een grote deken als hij zijn computer bekeek uit angst dat verborgen camera's zijn wachtwoord zouden oppikken. – De Telegraaf (2013, 11 juni). 'Ik begrijp dat dit mijn einde betekent'.*

Regelmatig schrijft ook *de Volkskrant* over de wijze waarop Snowden de Amerikaanse overheid te slim af was. Hierbij wordt vooral geschreven over de pogingen van Snowden om de Amerikaanse overheid te misleiden en om aan vervolging te ontsnappen. Minder vaak wordt geschreven over zijn uitstraling en vermommingen.

*Klokkenluider Edward Snowden lijkt de Amerikaanse autoriteiten te snel af te zijn in een juridische klopjacht over drie continenten. Zondag landde hij in Moskou met een directe vlucht uit Hongkong. Einddoel is Ecuador, waar Snowden politiek asiel heeft aangevraagd. – De Volkskrant (2013, 24 juni). Snowden vraagt in Moskou asiel aan Ecuador.*

*De klokkenluidersorganisatie hult zich in zwijgen over route en tijdstip van zijn reis. – De Volkskrant (2013, 26 juni). Ook Poetin zal Snowden niet uitleveren.*

*Tot ergernis van de Amerikanen is maandag de verwarring over Edward Snowden alleen maar verder toegenomen. De man die door hen is aangeklaagd voor spionage en diefstal vloog niet zoals verwacht van Moskou naar Cuba. Hij is niet meer in het openbaar gezien sinds hij dit weekeinde vanuit*

*Hongkong in Rusland aankwam.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 25 juni). VS hopen op uitlevering Snowden door Rusland.

*Dat het niet opschiet met de jacht op Snowden, frustreert de Amerikaanse regering en het Congres.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 25 juni). VS hopen op uitlevering Snowden door Rusland.

*Volgens Glenn Greenwald, de journalist van de Britse krant The Guardian die als eerste over de kwestie berichtte, heeft Snowden aan 'diverse personen' digitale kopieën doorgespeeld. Die moeten direct na zijn arrestatie wereldkundig worden gemaakt, luidt Snowdens instructie.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 27 juni). Verblijf op vliegveld Moskou wordt een langdurige affaire.

### **8. De criminele held beschikt meestal over een vorm van magie die bijdraagt aan zijn onkwetsbaarheid, onzichtbaarheid en/of snelheid of hij heeft andere hulpvolle eigenschappen.**

In het narratief over Snowden wordt in zowel *de Volkskrant* als *De Telegraaf* niet direct verwezen naar een vorm van magie waarover hij beschikt. Wel wordt er regelmatig geschreven over zijn ontsnappingen aan de Amerikaanse overheid. Dit wordt in *De Telegraaf* vaak als een geheimzinnige en snelle actie omschreven. *De Telegraaf* gebruikt bijvoorbeeld de volgende aanduidingen voor Snowden:

*NSA geheimzinnige terreurbestrijder.* – De Telegraaf (2013, 10 juni). NSA geheimzinnige terreurbestrijder.

*De wereldberoemde klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die spoorloos is verdwenen.* – De Telegraaf (2013, 15 juni). SP wil Snowden horen.

De goede computervaardigheden van Snowden kunnen in zowel het narratief van *de Volkskrant* als *De Telegraaf* worden gezien als een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.

*Hij nam tal van maatregelen om te voorkomen dat hij zou worden afgeluisterd, afgetapt of gefilmd. Als technicus die jaren in de wereld van spionage heeft gewerkt wist hij dat het niet moeilijk moest zijn hem op te sporen.* – De Volkskrant (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

### **9. De criminele held is dapper en sterk. Als hij niet sterk is, dan beschikt de criminele held over een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.**

In de krantenartikelen over Snowden uit *de Volkskrant* wordt regelmatig benadrukt hoe dapper Snowden is geweest om de documenten te openbaren. Opvallend is dat dit in het begin van de maand juni regelmatig gebeurde dan later in de maand.

*Snowden zegt dat hij een comfortabel leven leidde met een jaarsalaris van 200 duizend dollar, een vriendin, een goede carrière en geliefde familieleden. 'Ik ben bereid dat allemaal op te offeren omdat ik het niet kan hebben dat de Amerikaanse regering privacy, de vrijheid van het internet en fundamentele vrijheden van de mensen vernietigt met dit enorme controleapparaat dat ze in het geheim bouwen.'* – De Volkskrant (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

*In een briefje dat hij bij de documenten voegde, schreef Snowden: 'Ik begrijp dat ik zal moeten lijden voor wat ik doe.'* – De Volkskrant (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

*Hij zegt te vrezen dat de autoriteiten zijn familieleden, vrienden en vriendin zullen achtervolgen. 'Daar zal ik mee moeten leven. Ik zal geen contact meer met hen kunnen opnemen. De autoriteiten zullen zich agressief gedragen tegenover iedereen die mij kent. Daar ligt ik wakker van.'* – De Volkskrant (2013, 10 juni). NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend.

*Glenn Greenwald, de Guardian-columnist die de NSA-verhalen bracht, schreef: 'Wie verantwoordelijk is voor deze onthullingen moet een enorme hoeveelheid moed en een eindeloze bereidheid tot zelfopoffering hebben om deze misstanden aan het licht te brengen.'* – De Volkskrant (2013, 11 juni). Ander commentaar.

Snowden wordt in de nieuwsartikelen van *De Telegraaf* niet direct dapper en sterk genoemd. Wel wordt er een podium gegeven aan voormalig klokkenluider Daniel Ellsberg die de daden van Snowden indirect dapper noemt:

*Ellsberg neemt het voor Snowden op en stelt dat het klimaat nu veel guurder is voor klokkenluiders dan in zijn tijd.* – De Telegraaf, (2013, 11 juni). Obama in vuurlinie; Kritiek op antiterreurbeleid neemt toe door NSA-affaire.

Snowden wordt niet gequoteerd in *De Telegraaf*, wel wordt er omschreven hoe hij zich zou voelen:

*Overtuigd van zijn eigen gelijk, maar doodsbang voor de wraak van de overheid. Dat is de gemoedstoestand van de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden (29) die zich drie weken lang schuilhield in een hotelkamer in Hongkong. Hij durfde er de deur niet uit en vreest voor zijn leven.* – De Telegraaf, (2013, 11 juni). 'Ik begrijp dat dit mijn einde betekent'.

Of dit direct een verwijzing is naar de dapperheid van Snowden valt te betwisten, wel geeft *De Telegraaf* aan dat Snowden er iets voor over heeft gehad om de documenten openbaar te maken.

**10. De criminele held wordt uiteindelijk verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt.**

In het narratief over Snowden in *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf* wordt hij niet verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt. Deze eigenschap is niet van toepassing op Snowden.

**11. De criminele held gaat dapper en uitdagend dood door een touw, bijl, zwaard of kogel.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held is niet van toepassing op Snowden. In het narratief gaat hij niet dood. Wel is hij bang om vermoord te worden als gevolg van zijn daden, maar dit gebeurt niet.

**12. De criminele held kan gezegd hebben de uiteindelijke confrontatie, executie of ander soort dood te hebben overleefd en ergens in veilige anonimiteit verder te hebben geleefd.**

In het narratief van Snowden gaat hij niet dood, deze eigenschap is dan ook niet van toepassing op hem.

Wel is het zo dat Snowden in zowel het narratief van *De Telegraaf* als *de Volkskrant* op zoek is naar een plek waar hij in veilige anonimiteit verder kan leven (zie eigenschap 7). Snowden ontwijkt de confrontatie met de Amerikaanse overheid. In het narratief van *De Telegraaf* wordt beschreven dat Snowden op een gegeven moment op een veilige plek is.

*Het enige dat Julian Assange, oprichter van WikiLeaks, kwijt wilde is dat Snowden op een veilige plek was en werd bijgestaan door een medewerker van zijn organisatie.* – *De Telegraaf* (2013, 25 juni). Peking en Moskou lachen in hun vuistje om Snowden.

## **4.2 Conclusie narratieve analyse**

Tien van de twaalf moderne eigenschappen van verhalen over criminele helden zoals Seal (2009) ze heeft beschreven, komen geheel of gedeeltelijk voor in het narratief van Snowden in zowel *de Volkskrant* als *De Telegraaf*. Aan de hand van deze resultaten kun je stellen dat Snowden past binnen het stereotype ‘criminele held’. Het is een klokkenluider die past binnen het concept van een held, omdat hij een van ons is (de ‘gewone’ mens) en wordt gedreven om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen. Zijn rol in het narratief is niet enkel om de misstanden naar buiten te brengen, maar ook het bewijs hiervan bloot te leggen.

In de artikelen van *de Volkskrant* komt Snowden vaak zelf aan het woord. Hierdoor komt het verhaal daadwerkelijk tot leven via zijn woorden. Dit bevestigt de theorie van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt

(2012). Echter worden volgens hun theorie berichten over klokkenluiders voornamelijk in kwaliteitskranten gepubliceerd, omdat het past binnen de kwaliteitsjournalistiek. Hoewel *De Telegraaf* er minder artikelen aan heeft gewijd, heeft deze niet-kwaliteitskrant het narratief van Snowden wel opgepakt.

Wel zijn er verschillen tussen het narratief van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf*. Opvallend is bijvoorbeeld dat *De Telegraaf* sensationeler berichtgeeft over de ontsnappingspogingen van Snowden aan de autoriteiten en ook de lezers met een opiniepeiling meer betreft bij de beoordeling van Snowden. Binnen het narratief van *de Volkskrant* is het opvallend dat Snowden in het begin vaak wordt geciteerd en de ‘dapper-eigenschap’ vaak terug te vinden is. Beide aspecten nemen gedurende de maand sterk af. Binnen het narratief van *De Telegraaf* komt de ‘dapper-eigenschap’ in het geheel beperkt voor en wordt Snowden niet gequoteerd. Beide narratieven besteden veruit de meeste aandacht aan het kat-en-muisspel tussen Snowden en de Amerikaanse overheid.

De verhaalstructuren van beide narratieven zijn vergelijkbaar met het Robin Hood Principe. Het gaat namelijk om een persoon die zich gedwongen voelde om de wet te overtreden, om misstanden op te lossen. Hierbij krijgt hij steun van verschillende sociale groepen en verspreidt hij de buit onder diegenen die het verdienen. Hij heeft een handige eigenschap, namelijk zijn computervaardigheden, en hij ontsnapt regelmatig aan de autoriteiten. Snowden kan gezien worden als een dapper persoon, omdat hij zijn eigen leven in Amerika heeft moeten opofferen. Echter is het Robin Hood Principe niet compleet toepasbaar op Snowden, omdat hij niet wordt verraden, niemand vermoord en zelf niet sterft.

Globaal genomen vertellen beide Nederlandse nieuwsmedia hetzelfde narratief. Waarbij *de Volkskrant* Snowden meer persoonlijk aan het woord laat en *De Telegraaf* sensationeler berichtgeeft. Aan de hand van de *framinganalyse* zal nu kunnen worden geanalyseerd in hoeverre onder andere dit stereotype gecreëerd wordt door bepaalde manieren van *framing*.

### **4.3 Framinganalyse**

Het stereotype ‘criminele held’ wordt een van de *frame packages* die in deze analyse wordt uitgewerkt. Daarnaast wordt er gezocht naar andere aanwezige dominante *frames* in de krantenartikelen van *de Volkskrant* en *De Telegraaf*. De dominante *frames* worden toegelicht qua inhoud en gebruik. Aan de hand van een *framematrix* worden de verschillende gevonden *frame packages* overzichtelijk weergegeven.

#### **Dominante frames**

In het corpus van de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia zijn drie *frames* gevonden. Dit zijn niet de enige *frames* die voorkomen in de artikelen, maar wel de meest dominante. Hieronder volgt een beschrijving van de verschillende *frames*.

Aan de hand van de resultaten van de narratieve analyse kan ingeschat worden hoe dominant het ‘criminele held-frame’ aanwezig is. Met behulp van deze resultaten is het mogelijk de drie gevonden *frames* te rangschikken op waarschijnlijke dominantie. Echter staat het toekennen van betekenissen aan bepaalde patronen binnen dit kwalitatieve onderzoek centraal.

In tabel 3 en tabel 4 worden de *frame packages* beschreven. De volgorde van de *frames* op waarschijnlijke dominantie geldt zowel voor de artikelen van *de Volkskrant* als de artikelen van *De Telegraaf*. De *visuele devices* zijn buiten beschouwing gebleven, omdat er bijna nergens gebruik werd gemaakt van afbeeldingen. Als er wel een afbeelding bij stond, was het altijd dezelfde portretfoto van Snowden.

### **Frame 1: de criminele held**

Het eerste *frame* komt voort uit de narratieve analyse. Het ‘criminele held-frame’ wordt gekenmerkt door de aanwezige eigenschappen van het Robin Hood Principe, zoals beschreven door Seal (2009). Het gaat hierbij om Snowden die wordt beschreven als een persoon die zich gedwongen voelt om misstanden op te lossen en de buit te delen onder de personen die het verdienen. Hij vindt het een schending van de privacy dat de Amerikaanse overheid burgers afluistert. Door het bewijsmateriaal hiervoor te openbaren, hoopt Snowden een discussie over de afluisterpraktijken aan te wakkeren die tot verandering kan leiden. Snowden handelt binnen dit *frame* uit afschuw. Hij is bezorgd over de burgerrechten.

Dit *frame* wordt gecreëerd door onder andere woorden te gebruiken zoals 'held', 'afluisterpraktijken', 'klokkenluider', 'steunen' en 'moed'. De gestolen documenten worden binnen dit *frame* 'onthulde documenten' genoemd en het PRISM-programma wordt aangeduid als 'controleapparaat'. Zowel *de Volkskrant* als *De Telegraaf* gebruikt dit *frame*. Opvallend is dat beide kranten dit *frame* dominanter neerzetten aan het begin van de maand juni dan later in de maand. Verklaring hiervoor kan het narratief zijn. Gedurende de maand juni gaat de berichtgeving steeds vaker over het kat-en-muisspel tussen de Amerikaanse overheid en Snowden en minder over de beweegredenen van Snowden om de documenten te openbaren. Hierdoor komen minder eigenschappen van de theorie van Seal (2009) aan bod.

### **Frame 2: de crimineel**

Binnen het ‘crimineel-frame’ gaat het om de criminele aspecten. Snowden wordt beschouwd als een crimineel die de wet overtreden heeft door geheime documenten te lekken en op de vlucht te gaan voor de Amerikaanse overheid. Binnen dit *frame* komt Snowden niet aan het woord en wordt er weinig vanuit zijn beschouwing geschreven. Wel wordt er geschreven vanuit het oogpunt van de Amerikaanse overheid. De focus ligt met name op de achtervolging op Snowden, die vaak als een klopjacht wordt beschreven.

Binnen dit *frame* worden de documenten voornamelijk aangeduid als 'gelekte' documenten.



Het woord 'gelekte' creëert een interpretatie dat Snowden iets naar buiten heeft gebracht, dat niet openbaar gemaakt mocht worden. Daarnaast wordt er binnen dit *frame* veel aandacht besteed aan de positie die Snowden had binnen NSA en hoe het mogelijk was dat hij daar zijn werk kon verrichten. Woorden die onder andere veel voorkomen binnen dit *frame* zijn 'asiel', 'vluchten', 'boeten', 'gevaarlijk' en 'uitlevering'. Het *frame* wordt door beide Nederlandse kranten gebruikt. Het crimineel-*frame* komt gedurende de berichtgeving steeds dominanter voor. Dit kan worden verklaard met dezelfde reden als de afname van het 'criminele held-*frame*'. De nadruk komt te liggen op het vluchten van Snowden voor de Amerikaanse overheid. Hierdoor nemen de eigenschappen voor een criminele held af en die van een voortvluchtige crimineel toe.

### ***Frame 3: de verrader***

Het *frame* 'verrader' wordt gekenmerkt door Snowden als een persoon die Amerika heeft verraden. Door de wet te overtreden en geheimen documenten naar buiten te brengen heeft hij de veiligheid van de Amerikaanse burgers in gevaar gebracht en zijn eigen land verraden. Hierbij gaat het om het idee dat Amerika nu minder goed terroristen kan bestrijden en de Amerikaanse burgers daardoor meer risico lopen. Woorden die veel worden gebruikt binnen dit *frame* zijn 'landverrader', 'ondermijnt', 'veiligheid' en 'terrorisme'. Het PRISM-programma wordt als een 'anti-terreurbeleid' aangeduid en de documenten worden, net zoals binnen het 'crimineel-*frame*', 'gelekte documenten' genoemd. Dit *frame* komt ook in zowel *de Volkskrant*-artikelen als *De Telegraaf*-artikelen voor. Wel is het in beide kranten aannemelijk het minst dominante *frame* van de drie omschreven *frames*.

<b><i>Frame</i></b>	<b><i>Reasoning devices</i></b>					
	<b>Probleem-definiëring</b>	<b>Causale verantwoordelijkheid</b>	<b>Oplossing/handelingperspectief</b>	<b>Verantwoordelijkheid voor oplossing</b>	<b>Morele basis</b>	<b>Emotionele basis</b>
<b>1. de criminele held</b>	De Amerikaanse overheid luistert burgers af.	De Amerikaanse overheid	Bewijsmateriaal stelen en publiceren: discussie afluisterpraktijken aanwakkeren.	Edward Snowden	Privacy, weten wat de Amerikaanse overheid doet.	Bezorgdheid, ongerustheid, afschuw.
<b>2. de crimineel</b>	Snowden heeft de wet overtreden.	Edward Snowden	Uitzoeken hoe hij zijn werkpositie heeft gekregen + gerecht stellen.	De Amerikaanse overheid.	Je moet je aan de wet houden.	Onbegrip, onderwaardering.
<b>3. de verrader</b>	Snowden heeft Amerika verraden.	Edward Snowden	Uitzoeken hoe hij zijn werkpositie heeft gekregen + gerecht stellen.	De Amerikaanse overheid.	Je verraad je eigen land niet.	Afschuw, onbegrip.

Tabel 3. Reasoning devices

<i><u>Frame</u></i>	<i><u>Framing devices</u></i>		
	<b>Kernbegrippen</b>	<i>Verbale devices</i>	<b>Voorbeelden</b>
<b>1. de criminele held</b>	Onthullingen, held, afschuw, spionage, af luisterpraktijktijken, technicus, klokkenluider, steunen, moed, klokkenluider, technicus	“onthulde documenten”, “controleapparaat”, “wake-up call”, “Big Brother”, “zeldzame inkijk”, “kat-en-muisspel”	“Als motief gaf Snowden, die als technisch medewerker vier jaar bij de NSA werkte, op dat hij het publiek wil informeren wat er voor hen gedaan wordt en wat er tegen hen gedaan wordt.”
<b>2. de crimineel</b>	Crimineel, voortvluchtig, illegaal, berechten, asiel, documenten gelekt, vluchten, boeten, jacht, vervolgen, gevaarlijk, uitlevering, staatsgeheimen, celstraf	“geheimen documenten gelekt”, “juridische klopjacht”, “FBI-onderzoek”	“Vooraanstaande Republikeinse politici hebben aangedrongen op uitlevering van klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die omvangrijke af luister- en mee leesprogramma's van de Amerikaanse inlichtingendiensten onthulde en naar Hongkong vluchtte.”
<b>3. de verrader</b>	Landverrader, ondermijnt, Amerikaanse veiligheid, hoogverraad, terrorisme, burgers, hoogverraad, gevaarlijk	“geheimen documenten gelekt”, “anti-terreurbeleid”, “levens op het spel gezet”	‘Ik denk dat het een daad van hoogverraad is', aldus Dianne Feinstein, een invloedrijke senator uit de Democratische Partij van president Obama. Het bieden van hulp aan staatsvijanden (treason, verraad) is een van de ernstigste misdaden in het Amerikaanse strafrecht.

Tabel 4. Framing devices

## 5. Resultaten Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia

In dit hoofdstuk worden de resultaten van de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia op dezelfde wijze uiteengezet als de resultaten van de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia. Hierna is het mogelijk beide resultaten met elkaar te vergelijken.

### 5.1 Narratieve analyse

Het narratief rondom Snowden wordt in meerdere krantenartikelen uiteengezet. De artikelen binnen dit corpus zijn in *The Washington Post* gepubliceerd binnen de rubriek *A-section*. De artikelen van *The Voice of America News* komen uit de categorieën USA, World News, Europe, Asia en/of Mobile Top news.

Het corpus is geanalyseerd (zie bijlage 3 en 4) en vormt samen het narratief voor dit onderzoek. In hoeverre de twaalf eigenschappen van Seal (2009) over criminele helden in de artikelen terugkomen blijkt uit onderstaande resultaten.

#### **1. De criminele held wordt door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten (meestal regeringen en/of lokale machthebbers) gedwongen de wet - of wat er voor door gaat - te overtreden.**

Snowden heeft de wet overtreden, doordat hij op illegale wijze wachtwoorden eigen heeft gemaakt en geheime documenten publiekelijk heeft gemaakt. Zijn motief om dit te doen was volgens beide nieuwsmedia het op de hoogte brengen van de burgers over de afluisterpraktijken van de Amerikaanse overheid. Uit de krantenartikelen van *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News* blijkt niet dat Snowden door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten werd gedwongen de wet te overtreden. Wel kun je stellen dat Snowden het niet eens was met de werkwijze van de overheid en daardoor gedwongen werd de wet te overtreden.

*Snowden last week said that his "sole motive is to inform the public as to that which was done in their name and that which is done against them."* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden.

*An ex-CIA employee working as a contractor at the U.S. National Security Agency said he was the source who leaked details of a top secret U.S. surveillance program, acting out of conscience to protect "basic liberties for people around the world."* – The Voice of America News (2013, 10 juni). Ex-CIA Employee Reveals His Motive for Leaks.

## **2. Een criminele held heeft de sympathie en steun van één of meer weerstand biedende sociale groepen.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held komt terug in de artikelen van *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News*. Snowden krijgt sympathie en steun van Wikileaks en landen die hem eventueel asiel willen aanbieden.

*"This was an obvious thing for us to do, to support him in any way we can," said Kristinn Hrafnsson, an Icelandic journalist and WikiLeaks spokesman. "His revelations have been explosive and extremely important, and we've offered our full help and assistance."* – The Washington Post (2013, 24 juni). WikiLeaks pledges its 'full help and assistance'.

*The three Latin American countries said to be helping Edward Snowden flee from American authorities are united in their opposition to the Obama administration and pursue foreign policy objectives designed to counter U.S. influence.* – The Washington Post (2013, 24 juni). Snowden could find friendly soil in Latin America.

*Assange and Wikileaks have been assisting Snowden in avoiding extradition to the U.S. on charges of espionage.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni). Ecuador, Unusual Destination for Free Press Asylum Seeker.

Ook van Amerikaanse burgers klinkt er steun en sympathie voor Snowden:

*Since Snowden revealed his identity as the source of the leak, a petition supporting him and calling him a "national hero" and asking President Obama to pardon him was posted on a petition forum on the White House website.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 10 juni). White House Declines Comment on NSA Whistleblower.

## **3. De criminele held lost misstanden op en helpt conflicten op te lossen.**

In de krantenartikelen van *The Washington Post* wordt uitgelegd wat de beweegredenen van Snowden waren om de documenten openbaar te maken. Uit die beweegredenen blijkt dat Snowden de intentie had om misstanden op te lossen.

*Former NSA contractor Edward Snowden, 29, who unmasked himself as the source behind the PRISM and Verizon revelations, said he hoped for a systematic debate about the "danger to our freedom and way of life" posed by a surveillance apparatus "kept in check by nothing more than policy."* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). On March 12, 2004, acting atto.

*"I have no intention of hiding who I am because I know I have done nothing wrong," Snowden told Britain's Guardian newspaper in a report that was published June 9 and revealed that he was in Hong Kong. – The Washington Post (2013, 27 juni). In 2009, Snowden denounced leakers.*

*Snowden, in an interview with The Post, argued that the legal landscape has changed. "The government can't reasonably assert the state-secrets privilege for a program it has acknowledged," he said. – The Washington Post (2013, 11 juni). Will disclosures put programs in legal jeopardy? Some experts have doubts.*

Over de manier waarop Snowden de problemen wil oplossen, wordt in het narratief van *The Voice of America News* echter niets gezegd.

*He told the newspaper, "I am not here to hide from justice; I am here to reveal criminality." – The Voice of America News (2013, 12 juni). Snowden Vows to Stay in Hong Kong.*

*Snowden supporters say he is standing up for the right to privacy and exposing government misconduct in the collection of phone and Internet records. – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni). Kerry: Lives May be Lost Due to Snowden's Betrayal.*

*This man just took real information and put it out there because he happens to believe something that is not in fact justified by the facts," he said. – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni). Kerry: Lives May be Lost Due to Snowden's Betrayal.*

#### **4. De criminele held moordt alleen uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Hij moordt niet moedwillig of grillig en bovendien valt hij geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aan.**

In het narratief vermoord Snowden niemand, ook niet uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Wat dat betreft kun je stellen dat deze eigenschap niet bij Snowden past. Echter past het aspect dat een criminele held niet moedwillig of grillig vermoord en geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aanvalt wel bij het narratief van Snowden.

#### **5. De criminele held is aardig en hoffelijk tegenover zijn slachtoffers.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held komt niet voor in het narratief van Snowden. Zijn slachtoffers zijn de Amerikaanse overheid en de daarbij behorende NSA. Echter wordt er in het narratief van *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News* niets over het contact met hen beschreven.

In het narratief worden ook de burgers als slachtoffers van zijn daden neergezet. Doordat Snowden de documenten publiekelijk heeft gemaakt, kan het veiligheidssysteem volgens de

Amerikaanse overheid niet meer optimaal werken en is er een grotere kans op terroristische aanslagen. In het narratief komt echter ook niet voor dat Snowden aardig en hoffelijk tegen de burgers doet.

*A second senior intelligence official said there were concerns that disclosure of U.S. surveillance methods would make it easier for terrorist groups to avoid detection. "The more material that gets made public the more capability we lose," the official said. – The Washington Post (2013, 25 juni). U.S. is worried about security of documents Snowden has.*

*Already, several terrorist groups in various regions of the world have begun to change their method of communication based on disclosures of surveillance programs in the media, the official said. He would not elaborate on the communication modes. – The Washington Post (2013, 25 juni). U.S. is worried about security of documents Snowden has.*

*"It's frustrating," he said. "Because if they find some other method to communicate, we go dark. And we miss dots. That's not something we're particularly excited about." – The Washington Post (2013, 25 juni). U.S. is worried about security of documents Snowden has.*

*The head of the National Security Agency told a U.S. congressional panel on Wednesday that dozens of terrorist attacks have been prevented thanks to a recently revealed surveillance program that has raised concerns about privacy. – The Voice of America News (2013, 13 juni). Dozens of attacks foiled, NSA says.*

*Mueller defended the surveillance programs, saying they are a legal and crucial tool in preventing terrorist attacks. He said their disclosure could prompt potential terrorists to change their behavior and become more difficult to track. – The Voice of America News (2013, 14 juni). FBI: Criminal Investigation Launched into NSA Leaks.*

## **6. De criminele held verspreidt de buit onder de armen en diegenen die het verdienen en/of sympathiseert met hun behoeften en biedt hulp bij hun omstandigheden.**

De gestolen NSA-documenten zijn de buit binnen dit narratief. Snowden verspreidt de buit onder de burgers, zij verdienen het volgens hem om over de buit te beschikken. Wat dat betreft past deze eigenschap van een criminele held goed bij Snowden, echter biedt hij geen hulp bij de omstandigheden. Hij sympathiseert met de burgers door ze in te laten zien hoe hun privacy geschonden wordt door de overheid, maar helpt ze niet verder met het oplossen van het probleem.

*Snowden last week said that his "sole motive is to inform the public as to that which was done in their*

*name and that which is done against them."* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden.

*He has said he revealed the information because he feared that the programs were violating the rights of private citizens. He has been charged with leaking classified documents.* – The Washington Post (2013, 29 juni). Snowden didn't betray Americans, his father says.

*Snowden says it is important to reveal what he says is the government's massive surveillance program on private citizens.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 12 juni). NSA Chief to Testify on Surveillance Program.

*Snowden says he leaked the details of the classified U.S. surveillance to expose abusive and illegal programs that trampled on citizens' privacy rights.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 22 juni). US Seeks Snowden's Extradition, Urges Hong Kong to Act Quickly.

## **7. De criminele held misleidt en ontsnapt aan de autoriteiten en is hen regelmatig te slim af. Meestal met veel uitstraling, vaak in een vermomming.**

In het narratief besteed *The Washington Post* veel aandacht aan de vlucht van Snowden voor de Amerikaanse overheid. Deze eigenschap van een criminele held is van toepassing op Snowdens narratief. In de krantenartikelen wordt beschreven waar Snowden naar toe vlucht, hoe hij aan de autoriteiten ontsnapt en hoe hij zich vermomt.

*Ho said he first met Snowden late Tuesday night, getting into a car at a prearranged spot. Inside the car was Snowden, wearing a hat and sunglasses.* – The Washington Post (2013, 25 juni). Hong Kong: Shadowy envoy encouraged fugitive to leave.

*Snowden could not be reached for comment; he has not been seen since Monday, when he left the Hong Kong hotel from which he revealed himself to the world.* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden.

*For years, Snowden has sought to keep his online activities hidden, posting under pseudonyms even as a teenager and hanging out on anime, gaming and technology sites, chatting with fellow webheads about how to be on the Internet without being traced. "I wouldn't want God himself to know where I've been, you know?" he wrote in 2003 on a bulletin board for the technically inclined.* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden.



Ook komt deze eigenschap vaak voor in het narratief rondom Snowden in de artikelen van *The Voice of America News*. Snowden is op de vlucht voor de Amerikaanse autoriteiten. Er worden regelmatig gehele artikelen gewijd aan het kat-en-muisspel tussen Snowden en de Amerikaanse overheid.

*In his secretive hide-and-seeK run for asylum, Edward Snowden had been booked on a Monday flight from Moscow to Havana, with his possible eventual destination Ecuador, where he is seeking asylum. But the flight to the Cuban capital left with no sign of him on board.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 23 juni). US Presses Russia to Turn Snowden Over.

*Sources say Snowden, who has been hiding in Hong Kong, has sought legal representation from human rights lawyers as he prepares to fight attempts to force him back to the United States to face trial.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 22 juni). US Seeks Snowden's Extradition, Urges Hong Kong to Act Quickly.

#### **8. De criminele held beschikt meestal over een vorm van magie die bijdraagt aan zijn onkwetsbaarheid, onzichtbaarheid en/of snelheid of hij heeft andere hulpvolle eigenschappen.**

In het narratief over Snowden wordt in *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News* niet direct verwezen naar een vorm van magie waarover hij beschikt. Wel kunnen de goede computervaardigheden van Snowden in het narratief van beide nieuwsmedia worden gezien als een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.

*Fugitive intelligence contractor Edward Snowden.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni). Obama: US Using All Legal Channels to Capture Snowden.

*Snowden was "very smart" and analytical, said his lawyer, although he didn't seem to have anticipated just how complicated his situation in Hong Kong would become.* – The Washington Post (2013, 25 juni). Hong Kong: Shadowy envoy encouraged fugitive to leave.

#### **9. De criminele held is dapper en sterk. Als hij niet sterk is, dan beschikt de criminele held over een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.**

In het narratief van *The Washington Post* wordt Snowden niet als een dapper en sterk persoon beschreven. Wel zijn er enkele zinnen waaruit blijkt dat de daden van Snowden als dapper kunnen worden gezien. Een andere hulpvolle eigenschap van Snowden zijn z'n vaardigheden met computers. Hierdoor was het mogelijk de documenten te bemachtigen.

*In a different way, each of the controversies stirs misgivings - sometimes dismissed as paranoia - that the most ardent liberals and conservatives have long held about Washington's power and reach. That*

*explains why the newly revealed leaker of classified information about government surveillance, 29-year-old tech specialist Edward Snowden, has been hailed as a "hero" by figures as diverse as conservative commentator Glenn Beck, liberal filmmaker Michael Moore and Daniel Ellsberg of Pentagon Papers fame.* – The Washington Post (2013, 11 juni). Reaction to news of government actions blurs party lines.

*Political pressure is growing here for the Hong Kong government to protect Edward Snowden, who has said he will remain in the city and allow the people here to "decide his fate." Yet Snowden is depending on a place that isn't in control of even its own destiny.* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). In Hong Kong, pressure mounts to avoid extraditing Snowden.

In het narratief van *The Voice of America News* wordt er beschreven wat Snowden heeft opgeofferd om de burgers op te hoogte te brengen van de afluisterpraktijken van de Amerikaanse overheid.

*Fugitive intelligence contractor Edward Snowden.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni). Obama: US Using All Legal Channels to Capture Snowden.

*In a video interview with The Guardian, he acknowledged he could face prosecution, but he said he felt compelled to take the actions he did.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 10 juni). White House Declines Comment on NSA Whistleblower.

*Snowden, who fled the United States for Hong Kong last month, says he knows he will be made to suffer for his actions. But he said he is willing to sacrifice a "very comfortable life" to reveal the truth about what he calls a massive surveillance machine the United States is building.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 9 juni). British, US Papers Identify NSA Whistleblower.

*Snowden, who said he had left his girlfriend in Hawaii without telling her where he was going, said he knew the risk he was taking, but thought the publicity his revelations had garnered in the past few days had made it worth it.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 10 juni). Ex-CIA Employee Reveals His Motive for Leaks.

*"My primary fear is that they will come after my family, my friends, my partner. Anyone I have a relationship with," he said. "I will have to live with that for the rest of my life. I am not going to be able to communicate with them. They [the authorities] will act aggressively against anyone who has known me. That keeps me up at night."* – The Voice of America News (2013, 10 juni.) Ex-CIA Employee Reveals His Motive for Leaks.

"All governments, most governments do it, and China does it, the U.S. is doing it. So I think what he did was actually a very brave thing. He was willing to give up everything for that," said John Wakefield. – The Voice of America News (2013, 24 juni.) Kerry: Lives May be Lost Due to Snowden's Betrayal.

**10. De criminele held wordt uiteindelijk verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt.**

In het narratief over Snowden in *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News* wordt hij niet verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt. Deze eigenschap is niet van toepassing op Snowden.

**11. De criminele held gaat dapper en uitdagend dood door een touw, bijl, zwaard of kogel.**

Deze eigenschap van een criminele held is niet van toepassing op Snowden. In het narratief gaat hij niet dood. Wel is hij bang om vermoord te worden als gevolg van zijn daden, maar dit gebeurt niet.

**12. De criminele held kan gezegd hebben de uiteindelijke confrontatie, executie of ander soort dood te hebben overleefd en ergens in veilige anonimiteit verder te hebben geleefd.**

In het narratief van Snowden gaat hij niet dood, deze eigenschap is dan ook niet van toepassing op hem.

Wel is het zo dat Snowden in zowel het narratief van *The Washington Post* als van *The Voice of America News* op zoek is naar een plek waar hij in veilige anonimiteit verder kan leven (zie eigenschap 7). Snowden ontwijkt de confrontatie met de Amerikaanse overheid.

## **5.2 Conclusie narratieve analyse**

Ook bij de narratieve analyse van de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News* komen tien van de twaalf moderne eigenschappen van criminele helden van Seal (2009) geheel of gedeeltelijk voor. Aan de hand van deze resultaten kun je stellen dat Snowden in deze narratieven past binnen het stereotype 'criminele held'. Echter zijn het veel en regelmatig lange nieuwsartikelen en komen de eigenschappen niet in elk bericht met grote regelmaat voor. De nadruk ligt niet op het idee dat hij een van ons is (de 'gewone' mens) en wordt gedreven om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen, maar voornamelijk op de dingen die Snowden fout heeft gedaan en de problemen die daardoor zijn ontstaan voor Amerika. Ook worden er veel artikelen gewijd aan het kat-en-muisspel tussen Snowden en de Amerikaanse overheid.

Hoewel de eigenschappen van criminele helden van Seal (2009) in de narratieven van beide kranten voorkomen, verschilt de manier waarop ze worden beschreven. *The Voice of America News* schrijft veel van Snowdens woorden tussen aanhalingstekens, zoals "*basic liberties for people around*

*the world*" en *"national hero"*. De quotes van Snowden worden in de artikelen van *The Voice of America News* niet geheel tussen aanhalingstekens geplaatst, maar er worden alleen enkele aspecten uitgelicht. Onderstaande quote laat dit duidelijk zien:

*Snowden, who fled the United States for Hong Kong last month, says he knows he will be made to suffer for his actions. But he said he is willing to sacrifice a "very comfortable life" to reveal the truth about what he calls a massive surveillance machine the United States is building.* – The Voice of America News (2013, 9 juni). British, US Papers Identify NSA Whistleblower.

Dit creëert een afstand tussen de tekst van Snowden en de berichtgeving van de krant. In de artikelen van *The Washington Post* wordt Snowden vaker letterlijk gequoteerd. Hierdoor komt Snowden zelf aan het woord en wordt er in mindere mate afstand gecreëerd tussen Snowden en *The Washington Post*.

*Snowden last week said that his "sole motive is to inform the public as to that which was done in their name and that which is done against them."* – The Washington Post (2013, 16 juni). Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden.

Concluderend kun je stellen dat de eigenschappen van het Robin Hood Principe aanwezig zijn in de nieuwsartikelen van beide kranten, maar minder sterk in de artikelen van *The Voice of America News* door de manier van schrijven. In beide nieuwsbronnen vormen de eigenschappen van het Robin Hood Principe niet de rode draad binnen de narratieven. Aan de hand van de *framinganalyse* kan nu worden onderzocht welke dominante *frames* er aanwezig zijn in deze nieuwsartikelen.

### **5.3 Framinganalyse**

Ondanks het resultaat van de narratieve analyse is het stereotype ‘criminele held’ wel één van de dominante *frames* in de artikelen van beide Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen. Het stereotype ‘criminele held’ vormt een van de *frame packages* die in deze analyse wordt uitgewerkt. Daarnaast wordt er gezocht naar andere meer aanwezige dominante *frames* in de krantenartikelen van *The Washington Post* en *The Voice of America News*. De gevonden *frames* zullen worden toegelicht qua inhoud en gebruik. Aan de hand van een *framematrix* worden de verschillende gevonden *frame packages* overzichtelijk weergegeven.

#### **Dominante frames**

In het corpus van de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia zijn dezelfde drie *frames* gevonden als in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia, maar ze verschillen qua dominantie. Dit zijn niet de enige *frames* die voorkomen in de artikelen, maar wel de meest voorkomende. Hieronder volgt een beschrijving van de verschillende *frames*. Ze zijn wel genummerd, maar niet geordend op dominantie, zoals bij de

resultaten van de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia. Er zijn namelijk verschillen tussen de waarschijnlijke dominantie van de verschillende *frames* tussen de Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen.

Aan de hand van de narratieve analyse kan gesteld worden dat het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ dominant aanwezig is in de berichtgeving van *The Washington Post* dan in *The Voice of America News*. Het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’ komen daarentegen sterker naar voren in de berichtgeving van *The Voice of America News* dan in de *Washington Post*.

In tabel 5 en tabel 6 worden de *frame packages* weergegeven in een *framematrix*.

### **Frame 1: de crimineel**

Dit *frame* is aannemelijk het meest dominant aanwezig in de berichtgeving over Snowden in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia. Het gaat binnen dit *frame* om Snowden als een crimineel persoon. Het op illegale verkrijgen van geheimen documenten, die publiceren en het vluchten van de Amerikaanse overheid wordt gezien als een criminele daad. De Amerikaanse overheid is een jacht begonnen op Snowden en wil hem gerechtstellen omdat hij de Amerikaanse wet niet in acht heeft genomen. Binnen dit *frame* gaat het regelmatig over de klopjacht op hem, maar ook over de manier waarop hij zijn werkpositie heeft gekregen. Er heerst onbegrip over zijn werkzaamheden binnen de NSA en verontwaardiging over het idee dat hij zonder een diploma is aangenomen bij de NSA. Kernwoorden binnen dit *frame* zijn onder andere 'criminal', 'leaks', 'hiding' en 'law'. De documenten die naar buiten zijn gebracht door Snowden worden aangeduid als 'leaks of classified information'. Snowden wordt geregeld aangeduid als 'law-breaking' en 'high school dropout'. Dit *frame* komt in beide Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia veel voor gedurende de hele maand juni.

### **Frame 2: de verrader**

Het tweede *frame* komt ook in beide nieuwsmedia voor. Het gaat hierbij om Snowden als een landverrader die de veiligheid van de Amerikaanse burgers in gevaar heeft gebracht. Binnen dit *frame* wordt er ook veel aandacht besteed aan de manier waarop Snowden zijn positie binnen de NSA heeft gekregen. Er heerst afschuw en onbegrip voor Snowden. Hij heeft het terrorisme makkelijker gemaakt om Amerika aan te vallen, door het openbaar maken van de documenten over de afluisterpraktijken van de Amerikaanse overheid. Kernwoorden binnen dit *frame* zijn onder andere 'traitor', 'dangerous' en 'terrorism'. Daarnaast wordt Snowden aangeduid als een 'National Security Agency leaker' en het naar buiten brengen van de documenten wordt 'leaks of top-secret documents' genoemd. Opvallend aan dit *frame* is dat het in enkele artikelen heel sterk naar voren komt. Dit is in tegenstelling tot het ‘crimineel-*frame*’, dat zich meer over het gehele corpus verspreidt. Dit valt te verklaren door het feit dat er artikelen geheel gewijd zijn aan de gevolgen met betrekking tot terrorisme aan de hand van de daden van Snowden. Het onderwerp wordt minder vaak als bijzaak behandeld in andere artikelen.

### ***Frame 3: de criminele held***

Dit *frame* komt voort uit de resultaten van de narratieve analyse. Snowden wordt gezien als een persoon die een maatschappelijk probleem aan de kaak wil stellen. Hij steelt de buit en deelt het met diegenen die er volgens hem behoefte aan hebben, de burgers. Binnen dit *frame* wordt Snowden neergezet als een held die de privacy van de burgers wil beschermen. Kernwoorden die worden gebruikt zijn onder andere 'hero', 'whistleblower', 'privacy' and 'free speech'. Hij wordt aangeduid als een 'whistleblower' en het PRISM-programma wordt een 'massive surveillance machine' genoemd. Er heerst een vorm van afschuw, bezorgdheid en ongerustheid binnen dit *frame* die vanuit Snowden wordt geuit met behulp van quotes. Dit is het minst dominante *frame* van de drie omschreven *frames*, daarnaast is het sterker aanwezig binnen de artikelen van *The Washington Post* dan binnen de artikelen van *The Voice of America News*.

<u>Frame</u>	<u>Reasoning devices</u>					
	<b>Probleem-definiëring</b>	<b>Causale verantwoordelijkheid</b>	<b>Oplossing/handelperspectief</b>	<b>Verantwoordelijkheid voor oplossing</b>	<b>Morele basis</b>	<b>Emotionele basis</b>
<b>1. de crimineel</b>	Snowden heeft de wet overtreden.	De Amerikaanse overheid	Uitzoeken hoe hij zijn werkpositie heeft gekregen + gerecht stellen.	Edward Snowden	Je moet je aan de wet houden.	Onbegrip, onderwaardering.
<b>2. de verrader</b>	Snowden heeft Amerika verraden.	Edward Snowden	Uitzoeken hoe hij zijn werkpositie heeft gekregen + gerecht stellen.	De Amerikaanse overheid.	Je verraadt je eigen land niet.	Afschuw, onbegrip.
<b>3. de criminele held</b>	De Amerikaanse overheid luistert burgers af.	Edward Snowden	Bewijsmateriaal stelen en publiceren: discussie afluisterpraktijken aanwakkeren.	De Amerikaanse overheid.	Privacy, weten wat de Amerikaanse overheid doet.	Bezorgdheid, ongerustheid, afschuw.

Frame 5. Reasoning devices

<u>Frame</u>	<u>Framing devices</u>		
	<b>Kernbegrippen</b>	<i>Verbale devices</i>	<b>Voorbeelden</b>
<b>1. de crimineel</b>	Criminal, criminal charges, leaks, hiding, escape, law, criminal probe, on the run, crimes, law-breaking	“leaker of classified information”, “security clearance”, “high school dropout”, “on the run”	“Federal prosecutors have filed a sealed criminal complaint against Edward Snowden, the former National Security Agency contractor who leaked a trove of documents about top-secret surveillance programs, and the United States has asked Hong Kong to detain him on a provisional arrest warrant, according to U.S. officials.”
<b>2. de verrader</b>	Traitor, risk, dangerous, terrorism, national security, terrorist attacks, confessed leaker, 11 september, fight	“the National Security Agency leaker”, “unprecedented leak of top-secret documents”, “fight against terrorists”, “damage done by the recent leaks”	“He is a traitor. The disclosure of this information puts Americans at risk. It shows our adversaries what our capabilities are and it is a giant violation of the law,” said Boehner.
<b>3. de criminele held</b>	Hero, blew the whistle, whistleblower, tech specialist, privacy, abuses, spy programs, free speech, asylum, whistleblower	“Former contractor”, “massive surveillance machine”, “protect basic liberties for people around the world”	Former NSA contractor Edward Snowden, 29, who unmasked himself as the source behind the PRISM and Verizon revelations, said he hoped for a systematic debate about the "danger to our freedom and way of life" posed by a surveillance apparatus "kept in check by nothing more than policy."

Frame 6. Framing devices



## 6. Vergelijking Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia

Zowel de Nederlandse als de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia uit dit onderzoek geven aandacht aan de klokkenluider Snowden. De manier waarop er over Snowden wordt geschreven in de Nederlandse en de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia verschilt. Aan de hand van de narratieve analyse blijkt dat de berichtgeving over Snowden in Amerika minder voldoet aan de narratieve eigenschappen die horen bij een criminele held dan de berichtgeving door Nederlandse nieuwsmedia. Hieruit volgt dat in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ minder dominant aanwezig is. Dit in tegenstelling tot de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia, daar is dat wel duidelijk het meest dominante *frame*. Dit *frame* wordt opgevolgd door het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’. In de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia komen het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’ sterker naar voren dan in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia.

De verschillen tussen de nieuwsmedia van beide landen zitten met name in woordkeuzes, onderwerpkeuzes en manier van schrijven. In de onderzochte Nederlandse nieuwsartikelen wordt Snowden voornamelijk aangeduid als ‘klokkenluider’, ‘held’, of ‘technicus’. Terwijl er in de onderzochte Amerikaanse nieuwsartikelen regelmatig gekozen wordt voor een negatievere aanduiding voor Snowden, zoals ‘leaker’ en ‘law-breaking’. Een opvallend verschil is dat er in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia wordt gezegd dat Snowden handelde uit afschuw en in de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia wordt gezegd dat Snowden de burgers wil informeren over de afluisterpraktijken. Dit kan bij de lezer van de Nederlandse artikelen een negatiever gevoel opwekken over de Amerikaanse afluisterpraktijken.

Wat betreft de onderwerpkeuzes schrijft de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia meer over de achtergrond van Snowden en de manier waarop hij zijn functie heeft gekregen bij de NSA. Ook besteden zij meer aandacht aan de schade die Snowden zou kunnen hebben aangericht met betrekking tot het bestrijden van terrorisme. De Nederlandse nieuwsmedia berichten veel over het kat-en-muisspel tussen Snowden en de Amerikaanse overheid. Dit doen de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia ook, maar zij berichten meer over de verstandhoudingen tussen Amerika en de landen die eventueel asiel aan Snowden willen verlenen.

Zowel *De Telegraaf* als *The Voice of America News* quoten Snowden niet of beperkt. Dit creëert een afstand tussen Snowden en het nieuwsmedium. *The Washington Post* heeft de documenten van Snowden verspreid en hem hierdoor letterlijk een podium gegeven. Dit kan een verklaring zijn waarom hij daar wel regelmatig wordt gequoteerd. Het zorgt er onder andere voor dat het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ in dit nieuwsmedium sterker naar voren komt dan in de berichtgeving van *The Voice of America News*.

Een ander verschil is de hoeveelheid artikelen die geschreven zijn over Snowden. De Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen hebben er meer aandacht aan geschonken dan de Nederlandse

nieuwsbronnen. De artikelen zijn ook langer en er komen meer mensen aan het woord.

## 7. Conclusie

De theorie van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) is een van de weinige theorieën over de representatie van klokkenluiders in de media. Klokkenluiders zijn een belangrijke bron voor journalisten. Daarom is het van belang dat er meer onderzoek wordt gedaan naar de representatie van klokkenluiders in de media.

Dit onderzoek, over de manier waarop de klokkenluider Snowden door middel van *framing* anders wordt weergegeven in de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia dan in de Amerikaanse, laat zien dat er verschillen zijn. Daarmee wordt de theorie van Gamson et al. (1991), dat de manier waarop informatie wordt gepresenteerd niet neutraal is, bevestigd. Daarnaast wordt de theorie van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) op veel punten bevestigd en biedt het onderzoek meer inzicht in de representatie van klokkenluiders in de media.

Zo blijkt uit dit onderzoek dat klokkenluider Snowden inderdaad gezien kan worden als één van ons (de ‘gewone’ mens) en gedreven is om een maatschappelijk probleem op te lossen (Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt, 2012, p. 403). Daarnaast beschikt Snowden ook over de kennis en deskundigheid van de desbetreffende organisatie door zijn professionele werkervaring. Door deze unieke status worden klokkenluiders volgens Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) serieus genomen. Echter is het niet zo dat de berichtgeving rondom Snowden alleen voorkomt in kwaliteitskranten. De tabloidkrant *De Telegraaf* pakt namelijk ook het nieuws rondom Snowden op, maar wel met een lagere frequentie.

De theorie van Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) klopt niet op het punt dat het nieuws rondom een klokkenluider gepersonaliseerd wordt. Zo hebben *De Telegraaf* en *The Voice of America News* Snowden niet of amper gequoot. Daarnaast is het verhaal ook niet in alle onderzochte nieuwsbronnen voornamelijk positief. *The Voice of America News* bericht namelijk op een overwegend negatieve manier over een klokkenluider. Wel bevat het verhaal over Snowden een narratieve structuur.

De narratieve structuur is aan de hand van het Robin Hood Principe geanalyseerd. Hieruit blijkt dat de eigenschappen van een criminele held, zoals Seal (2009) ze heeft omschreven, sterker voorkomen in het narratief van de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia dan in het narratief van de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia. De theorie van Seal (2009) is gebaseerd op de verouderde theorie van Hobsbawm (1973). Dit onderzoek laat zien dat er nog altijd eigenschappen over criminele helden in verhalen zitten en de theorie van Seal uit 2009 (nog) niet is verouderd.

Een klokkenluider zoals Snowden past binnen het concept van een held, zoals Wahl-Jorgensen & Hunt (2012) het hebben beschreven, maar dit concept is niet binnen elk narratief even sterk aanwezig. De levensverloop van Snowden is niet bepalend voor zijn heldenstatus. De manier waarop er over hem geschreven wordt wel. Met de *framinganalyse* is het gelukt om bepaalde patronen open te

leggen en *frames* waaruit dit blijkt te onderscheiden. In zowel de onderzochte Nederlandse als de onderzochte Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen zijn drie dominante *frames* te onderscheiden.

In de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia komt het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ het meest dominant naar voren, opgevolgd door het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’. Uit de Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen komen niet dezelfde resultaten. Het ‘criminele held-*frame*’ komt sterker naar voren in de nieuwsartikelen van *The Washington Post*, dan in de nieuwsartikelen van *The Voice of America News*. Het ‘crimineel-*frame*’ en het ‘verrader-*frame*’ komen daarentegen sterker naar voren in de berichtgeving van *The Voice of America News* dan in de berichtgeving van *The Washington Post*. Een verklaring hiervoor kan zijn dat *The Washington Post* betrokken is geweest bij het naar buiten brengen van de documenten van Snowden. Ze hebben hem een platform geboden en hem regelmatig gequoteerd. Dit levert een positievere beeldvorming op dan de berichtgeving van *The Voice of America News*. Zij quoten hem beperkt en creëren afstand tussen de woorden van Snowden en hun eigen teksten. Over het geheel kun je stellen dat er positiever over Snowden wordt geschreven door de Nederlandse nieuwsmedia, dan door de Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia. Dit valt wellicht te verklaren doordat *The Voice of America News* gesubsidieerd wordt door de Amerikaanse overheid. Daarnaast kunnen Nederlanders zich de dupe voelen van de afluisterpraktijken van Amerika, terwijl de Amerikanen zich verraden voelen door een landgenoot.

Voor het onderzoek zijn de nieuwsartikelen over Snowden van twee Nederlandse nieuwsbronnen vergeleken met de nieuwsartikelen uit twee Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen. Voor beide landen is gekozen voor twee nieuwsbronnen die elkaars uiterste zijn. De resultaten bevestigen de partijdigheid van de Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen op het punt dat de progressieve krant, *The Washington Post*, meer waarde hecht aan de vrijheid van burgers. Daarnaast beweert *The Voice of America News* evenwichtig nieuws te verspreiden, maar uit dit onderzoek blijkt dat ze overwegend negatief over Snowden berichtgeven. Wat betreft het Nederlandse medialandschap zijn er geen opmerkelijke resultaten naar voren gekomen. *De Telegraaf* bericht sensationeler en *de Volkskrant* meer en diepgaander. Dit past binnen het geschetste Nederlandse medialandschap.

Uit het onderzoek blijkt dat de manier waarop informatie wordt gepresenteerd niet neutraal is. Het grootste deel van het narratief rondom Snowden is in elk medium hetzelfde. Toch wordt het verhaal niet op dezelfde manier weergegeven en kunnen lezers de informatie op verschillende wijzen interpreteren. Wel is er kwantitatief vervolgonderzoek nodig om te kunnen stellen dat de artikelen uit de verschillende nieuwsbronnen inderdaad anders worden geïnterpreteerd. Daarnaast kan kwantitatief vervolgonderzoek verder uitsluitsel geven over de precieze verhoudingen tussen de dominante *frames*. Ook is het in een vervolgonderzoek mogelijk meer Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsmedia te onderzoeken. Dit kan het beeld over de representatie van klokkenluider Snowden in die landen completer maken. De hoeveelheid behandelde nieuwsbronnen was in dit onderzoek namelijk een beperking. Het resultaat geeft niet direct uitsluitsel over alle Nederlandse en Amerikaanse nieuwsbronnen, maar wel een indicatie.

## Bibliografie

- Asscher, L.F., Dommering, E.J., van Eijk N.A.N.M. & Franken van Bloemendaal, A. (2006). *Het redactie statuut bij dagbladen*. Apeldoorn: Het Spinhuis.
- Barthes, R. (1957). *Mythologies*. Parijs: Les Lettres Nouvelles.
- Beajon, A. (2013, 30 april). New York Times passes USA Today in daily circulation. Geraadpleegd van <http://www.poynter.org/news/mediawire/211994/new-york-times-passes-usa-today-in-daily-circulation/>.
- Brants, K. (2008). Risico's, schandalen en publiciteit. De nieuwswaardigheid van een falende overheid. *Proces, Tijdschrift voor Strafrechtspleging*, 87.2, 47-54.
- Burger, P. (2014). *Monsterlijke verhalen: misdaadsagen in het nieuws en op webforums*. Amsterdam: Boom Lemma.
- Callahan, E.S. & Dworkin, T.M. (2007). Who blows the whistle to the media, and why: organizational characteristics of media whistleblowers. *American Business Law Journal*, 32(2), 151-184.
- De Vreese, C.H. (2005). News framing: Theory and typology. *Information Design Journal + Document Design*, 13(1), 51-61.
- Ettema, J. & Glasser, T.L. (1998). *Custodians of Conscience*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Flynn, K. (2007). Covert disclosures. Unauthorized leaking, public officials and the public sphere. *Journalism studies*, 7, 256-273.
- Gamson, W.A. & Croteau, D. & Hoynes, W. & Sasson, T. (1991). Media images and the social construction of reality. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 18, 373-393.
- Groseclose, T. & Milyo, J. (2005). A Measure of Media Bias. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 120(4), 1191-1237.
- Hijmans, E. (1996). The logic of qualitative media content analysis: A typology. *Communications*, 21, 93-108.
- Hobsbawm, E.J. (1973). *Bandieten*. Amsterdam: Wetenschappelijke Uitgeverij.
- Jansen, C.H. (1987). *Politiek en dagblad/journalistiek*. Muiderberg: Coutinho.
- Kiener, R. (2013). Media Bias. *CQ Researcher*, 23(17), 401-424.
- Koetsenruijter, W., & Van Hout, T. (2014). *Methoden voor Journalism Studies*. Den Haag: Boom Lemma.
- Kuypers, J.A. (2002). *Press Bias and Politics: how the Media Frame Controversial Issues*. Westport: Praeger Publishers.
- Lanjouw, J. (2010). *Hoe 'Zware jongens' 'Vrije jongens' werden. De ontvoeders van Alfred Heineken in de pers verbeeld als criminele helden*. Masterscriptie Journalistiek en Nieuwe Media, Leiden.
- Lanjouw J. & Burger P. (2013). Criminals as Heroes: News Media Rhetoric in the Heineken Kidnap Case. In: Van Belle H., Gillaerts P., Van Gorp B., Van de Mierop D., Rutten K. (Eds.),

- Verbal and visual rhetorica in a media world*. Leiden: Leiden University Press. 285-303.
- Lule J. (2001). *Daily News, Eternal Stories: The Mythological Role of Journalism*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Mitchell, A., Jurkowitz, M., & Guskin, E. (2013, 07 augustus). The Washington Post: By The Numbers. Geraadpleegd van <http://www.journalism.org/2013/08/07/the-washington-post-by-the-numbers/>.
- Oplagen Dagbladen. (2013). Oplagen Dagbladen. Geraadpleegd van <http://www.oplagen-dagbladen.nl/>.
- Pleijter, A. (2006). *Typen en logica van kwalitatieve inhoudsanalyse in de communicatiewetenschap*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen, Nijmegen.
- Pisters, P. (2007). *Lessen van Hitchcock, Een inleiding in Mediatheorie*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.
- Seal, G. (2009). The Robin Hood principle: folklore, history, and the social bandit. *Journal of Folklore Research*, 46(1), 67-89.
- Van Es, R & Smit, G. (2003). Whistleblowing and media logic: A case study. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 12(2), 144–150.
- Van Gorp, B. & van der Goot, M. (2009). Van Frankenstein tot de Goede Moeder: de inzet van frames in de strategische communicatie over duurzaamheid. *Tijdschrift voor Communicatiewetenschap*, 37 (4), 303-316.
- Van Gorp, B. (2004). Framing en het interpreteren van nieuws. Antwerpen, Universiteit Antwerpen, Faculteit Politieke en Sociale Wetenschappen.
- VOA. (z.j.). Voice of America News. Geraadpleegd van <http://www.voanews.com/>.
- Wahl-Jorgensen, K. & Hunt, T. (2012). Journalism, accountability and the possibilities for structural critique: A case study of coverage of whistleblowing. *Journalism Journal*, 13(4), 399-416.
- Wikipedia. (2015, 16 februari). Edward Snowden. Geraadpleegd op 21 juni, 2015, van [https://nl.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edward\\_Snowden](https://nl.wikipedia.org/wiki/Edward_Snowden).

## Bijlagen

In de bijlage zijn delen gearceerd voor de narratieve analyse. Elke kleur verwijst naar een van de twaalf eigenschappen van Seal (2009) over criminele helden. Hieronder de index van de gebruikte kleuren in de artikelen:

- De criminele held wordt door onderdrukkende en onrechtvaardige machten (meestal regeringen en/of lokale machthebbers) gedwongen de wet - of wat er voor door gaat - te overtreden.
- Een criminele held heeft de sympathie en steun van één of meer weerstand biedende sociale groepen.
- De criminele held lost misstanden op en helpt conflicten op te lossen.
- De criminele held moordt alleen uit zelfverdediging of gerechtvaardigde wraak. Hij moordt niet moedwillig of grillig en bovendien valt hij geen vrouwen of andere kwetsbare personen aan.
- De criminele held is aardig en hoffelijk tegenover zijn slachtoffers.
- De criminele held verspreidt de buit onder de armen en diegenen die het verdienen en/of sympathiseert met hun behoeften en biedt hulp bij hun omstandigheden.
- De criminele held misleidt en ontsnapt aan de autoriteiten en is hen regelmatig te slim af. Meestal met veel uitstraling, vaak in een vermomming.
- De criminele held beschikt meestal over een vorm van magie die bijdraagt aan zijn onkwetsbaarheid, onzichtbaarheid en/of snelheid of hij heeft andere hulpvolle eigenschappen.
- De criminele held is dapper en sterk. Als hij niet sterk is, dan beschikt de criminele held over een andere hulpvolle eigenschap.
- De criminele held wordt uiteindelijk verraden door een groepsgenoot of door iemand uit een andere sociale groep die hem steunt.
- De criminele held gaat dapper en uitdagend dood door een touw, bijl, zwaard of kogel.
- De criminele held kan gezegd hebben de uiteindelijke confrontatie, executie of ander soort dood te hebben overleefd en ergens in veilige anonimiteit verder te hebben geleefd.

## Bijlage 1. Krantenartikelen de Volkskrant

# de Volkskrant

10 juni 2013 maandag

**NSA-lek maakt zichzelf bekend**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 692 woorden

De klokkenluider van de grootschalige af luisterpraktijken in de VS is uit de anonimiteit getreden. Edward Snowden, een 29-jarige oud-medewerker van de CIA, **handelde uit 'afschuw'**.

De klokkenluider die verantwoordelijk is voor het uitlekken van geheime programma's van de Amerikaanse spionagedienst NSA heeft zichzelf bekendgemaakt. Zijn identiteit werd gisteren op zijn verzoek onthuld door The Guardian, de Britse krant die de zaak aan het rollen bracht. Hij is een voormalig medewerker van de CIA, die nu in dienst is bij een technisch adviesbureau.

**De 29-jarige Edward Snowden liet weten dat hij niet van plan is zich achter anonimiteit te verschuilen omdat hij ervan overtuigd is dat hij niets verkeerd heeft gedaan.** Snowden speelde geheime documenten door waaruit blijkt dat de National Security Agency (NSA) in het geheim gegevens over telefoongesprekken verzamelt en bij internetbedrijven e-mails, chatgesprekken, foto's, bestanden, video's en zoekopdrachten checkt.

**Snowden zegt te hebben gehandeld uit 'afschuw' over het vermogen van de overheid om binnen te dringen in de persoonlijke levenssfeer van burgers.** De NSA verzocht dit weekeinde een strafrechtelijk onderzoek in te stellen naar het lekken van de geheime programma's. De Amerikaanse regering zegt dat de geheime programma's nodig zijn om het land te beveiligen tegen terrorisme.

In een briefje dat hij bij de documenten voegde, schreef Snowden: **'Ik begrijp dat ik zal moeten lijden voor wat ik doe.'** Hij zegt dat hij niet in de schijnwerpers terecht wil komen. **'Ik wil niet dat het verhaal over mij gaat. Ik wil dat het gaat over wat de Amerikaanse regering doet.'**

**'Ik hoop dat dit een debat losmaakt over de vraag in welke wereld we willen leven. Mijn enige motief is de mensen te informeren over wat er in hun naam gebeurt en wat er tegen hen gebeurt', aldus Snowden in The Guardian.** Snowden zegt dat hij een comfortabel leven leidde met een jaarsalaris van 200 duizend dollar, een vriendin, een goede carrière en geliefde familieleden. **'Ik ben bereid dat allemaal op te offeren omdat ik het niet kan hebben dat de Amerikaanse regering privacy, de vrijheid van het internet en fundamentele vrijheden van de mensen vernietigt met dit enorme controleapparaat dat ze in het geheim bouwen.'**

Drie weken geleden kopieerde hij de laatste documenten die hij openbaar wilde maken. Hij was toen op Hawaii, waar hij op contractbasis werkte bij het plaatselijke NSA-kantoor. Tegen zijn meerdere bij de NSA zei hij dat hij een paar weken weg moest voor een medische behandeling. Hij lijdt aan epilepsie. Tegen zijn vriendin bleef hij vaag over zijn vertrek.

**Hij vloog naar Hongkong, waar hij zijn intrek nam in een hotel. Vanuit zijn hotelkamer verstuurde hij zijn informatie. Hij nam tal van maatregelen om te voorkomen dat hij zou worden afgeluisterd,**

afgetapt of gefilmd. Als technicus die jaren in de wereld van spionage heeft gewerkt wist hij dat het niet moeilijk moest zijn hem op te sporen.

Hij zegt te vrezen dat de autoriteiten zijn familieleden, vrienden en vriendin zullen achtervolgen. 'Daar zal ik mee moeten leven. Ik zal geen contact meer met hen kunnen opnemen. De autoriteiten zullen zich agressief gedragen tegenover iedereen die mij kent. Daar ligt ik wakker van.'

Snowden werd gisteren in blogs op het internet meteen al gebombardeerd tot held en vergeleken met zijn landgenoten Bradley Manning (WikiLeaks) en Daniel Ellsberg (Pentagon Papers). Zelf voorziet hij geen rooskleurige toekomst. 'Al mijn opties zijn slecht', zei hij tegen The Guardian. Hij verblijft nu in Hongkong. De Verenigde Staten zouden zijn uitlevering kunnen vragen. Ook is het volgens hem mogelijk dat de Chinese overheid hem wil horen over zijn ervaring bij de NSA en CIA. En hij sluit niet uit dat hij door de CIA wordt ontvoerd. 'Iets verderop staat een CIA-kantoor - het Amerikaanse consulaat. Ik weet zeker dat ze het daar de komende week druk krijgen. En met die zorg zal ik voortaan moeten leven, hoe lang dat ook moge zijn'. Snowden hoopt ergens asiel te krijgen, bijvoorbeeld in IJsland.

# de Volkskrant

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

## Snowdenleaks

**BYLINE:** BERT WAGENDORP

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste; Blz. 2

**LENGTH:** 575 woorden

### Column

De kans dat Edward Snowden (29) een miserabel bestaan wacht, opgejaagd en ver van land en geliefden, is niet denkbeeldig. Snowden lekte de informatie die leidde tot het NSA-schandaal - en daarvoor gaat hij zwaar boeten.

Er is nog geen catchy naam bedacht voor de affaire, zoals dat ooit gebeurde met 'Watergate' en 'WikiLeaks'. Misschien moeten we er 'SnowdenLeaks' van maken, als eerbewijs.

Niet de terroristen, maar wijzelf zagen aan de poten van onze open, vrije samenleving. Het NSA-lek laat zien waar de War on Terror na de aanslagen van 11 september 2001 ons heeft gebracht. De 'securocrats' hebben zichzelf het recht toegekend op een nooit eerder vertoonde schaal onze privacy te schenden, ons te bekluren en af te luisteren - en dat paradoxaal genoeg uit naam van de vrijheid. En die van de veiligheid. Daarvoor, beweren veiligheidsdiensten en politici graag, moeten we de schending van onze privacy en vrijheid maar op de koop toenemen.

Na Snowdenleaks is de vraag urgenter dan ooit: zijn we niet bezig een wereld te creëren waarin Big Brother elk woord dat we spreken of schrijven controleert, elke stap die we zetten vastlegt en onze gedachten documenteert aan de hand van onze zoekwoorden op Google? Zonder adequate controle van de controleurs - want die zijn geheim.

De Duitse filosoof Peter Sloterdijk waarschuwde na de aanslagen van 2001 voor de repercussies voor vrijheid en privacy die er het gevolg van zouden zijn. Die waarschuwing, blijkt nu, was terecht. Met



een beroep op de gevaren van terreur, én door die gevaren enorm uit te vergroten, verschaften geheime diensten zich een motief voor een ongebreidelde invasie van de privésfeer van de burger.

Die laatste gaat zelf niet vrijuit. De snelkookpanaanval van Boston, een criminele actie van twee idioten, werd door media, politiek én publiek uitvergroot tot een gebeurtenis die zo ongeveer de wereldvrede bedreigde. Onmiddellijk volgde het verwijt aan president Obama dat hij de gevaren van terrorisme ernstig onderschatte en werd hem de vraag gesteld hoe hij herhaling dacht te voorkomen.

Zo houden burgers, media, politiek én geheime diensten elkaar in een ijzeren greep en gaan ze een gezamenlijke route die maar tot één antwoord lijkt te leiden: nóg meer angst, wantrouwen en paranoia, nóg meer controle. Dat hij die verstikkende dynamiek in gang heeft gezet, moet Osama bin Laden, tussen het bedrijven van de liefde met zeventig gewillige maagden door, wel veel vreugde verschaffen.

Daniel Ellsberg (82), de klokkenluider die in 1971 de 'Pentagon Papers' naar buiten bracht waaruit bleek dat de Amerikaanse regering de burgers jarenlang had voorgelogen over de oorlog in Vietnam, schreef maandag dat de veiligheidsdiensten de VS hadden veranderd in de 'United Stasi of America': de vervloekers van de decadente westerse vrijheden wrijven zich in de handen.

'Ik hoop dat dit een debat losmaakt over de vraag in welke wereld we willen leven', zei Snowden gisteren in de Volkskrant. 'Mijn enige motief is de mensen te informeren over wat er in hun naam gebeurt en wat er tegen hen gebeurt.'

Wij, de burgers, moeten hem dankbaar zijn. Snowden drukt ons met de neus op de feiten: we zijn al veel verder op weg naar de volledig gecontroleerde samenleving dan we vermoedden. Dankzij zijn wake up call zijn we wakker en kunnen we proberen de weg naar een echt liberale samenleving terug te vinden - misschien is het nog niet te laat.

Die dynamiek verschaft Osama veel vreugde.

# de Volkskrant

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Hoe NSA zich 'big data' eigen maakte**

**BYLINE:** THE NEW YORK TIMES

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste; Blz. 5

**LENGTH:** 710 woorden

Spionagedienst verwerkt dagelijks enorme informatiestromen

Toen Amerikaanse spionage-onderzoekers tijdens hun jacht op terroristen nieuwe manieren zochten om door enorme hoeveelheden telefoongegevens en e-mails te spitten, benaderden ze Silicon Valley. Digitale communicatie was de afgelopen jaren explosief toegenomen en de informatie stapelde zich op. In Silicon Valley hadden computerexperts ingewikkelde vergelijkingen bedacht om Russische benedeleden te dwarsbomen die creditcardfraude wilden plegen.

Het is slechts een van de vele methoden van de National Security Agency (NSA) en andere diensten om de geheimen van 'Big Data' te ontrafelen. De revolutie in softwaretechnologie heeft de NSA,

Amerika's grootste en meest geheimzinnige spionagedienst, volledig getransformeerd. De dienst waarvan zowel het budget als het aantal werknemers geheim is, is de virtuele huisbaas geworden van de digitale bezittingen van Amerikanen en buitenlanders. Bergen digitale informatie worden nu door de NSA snel geanalyseerd.

De nieuwe technologie heeft Amerika's spionnen voor het eerst de mogelijkheid gegeven om de activiteiten van personen overal ter wereld na te gaan. Zonder ze in de gaten te houden of hun gesprekken af te luisteren. De onthullingen van klokkenluider Edward Snowden bieden een zeldzame inkijk in het groeiende bereik van de NSA.

De spionagedienst heeft de laatste jaren een snelle uitbreiding ondergaan om de enorme hoeveelheid informatie die dagelijks wordt gecreëerd, te verwerken. Miljarden dollars zijn door de regering sinds '9/11' in de dienst gepompt. In de bergen van Utah wordt een 92 duizend vierkante meter grote vesting gebouwd, zo te zien om enorme hoeveelheden gegevens voor eeuwig op te slaan. Overal in de VS zijn onderscheppingsstations gebouwd, evenals een van 's werelds snelste computers.

De mogelijkheden van de NSA zijn nu veel groter dan de meeste buitenstaanders dachten. 'Vijf jaar geleden zou ik gezegd hebben dat ze niet in staat zijn om een behoorlijke hoeveelheid internetverkeer te volgen', zegt Herbert Lin, een telecommunicatie-deskundige van de National Research Council. 'Maar het lijkt er nu op dat ze dichtbij dat doel komen.'

Een deel van het geld dat zowel de Bush- als de Obama-regering spendeerde aan hightech-inlichtingenvergaring, ging naar externe dienstverleners zoals Booz Allen Hamilton. Snowden werkte de afgelopen drie maanden voor dit bedrijf. De flinke groei van Booz sinds '9/11' is voor een groot deel te danken aan de verkoop van deskundigheid, technologie en mankracht aan de NSA en andere spionagediensten.

'Hier heeft het publiek grotendeels geen weet van', zegt Danielle Brian van POGO, een onderzoeksorganisatie die de uitbesteding van overheidswork in kaart brengt. 'Ruim een miljoen externen hebben toestemming om met bijzonder vertrouwelijke informatie om te gaan.'

Hoe hecht de relatie met de overheid is, blijkt uit het feit dat Obama's hoogste spionagebaas, James Clapper, een voormalig Booz-bestuurslid is. Zijn voorganger onder Bush, John McConnell, werkt nu voor Booz, dat zo'n 25 duizend werknemers telt.

Het vermogen van de NSA om op efficiënte wijze metadata, gegevens over wie belt of e-mailt, te doorgronden, heeft aftappen en afluisteren minder urgent gemaakt. Amerikaanse wetten beperken het aftappen en afluisteren van de communicatie van Amerikaanse burgers. Maar ze bieden weinig bescherming voor de stroom digitale gegevens die beschikbaar komen zodra met een telefoon wordt gebeld.

In 2003 zag Bush zich nog gedwongen in te binden toen een plan van het Pentagon uitlekte om datacommunicatie 'binnen te halen'. Facebook en Twitter bestonden toen nog niet. Sindsdien zijn dit soort operaties van de spionagediensten flink toegenomen.

Maar niets wijst erop dat de afluisteraars van de NSA de wet hebben overtreden door gewone Amerikanen te onderzoeken. 'Niemand heeft de inhoud van telefoongesprekken van mensen afgeluisterd', verdedigde president Obama vrijdag de NSA.

Directeur Marc Rotenberg van het Electronic Privacy Information Center in Washington is echter sceptisch. Rotenberg: 'Het is een illusie om te denken dat de overheid zo veel gegevens kan verzamelen zonder dat de belangen van Amerikaanse burgers, vastgelegd in het Vierde Amendement, in het gedrang komen.'

# de Volkskrant

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Met tegenzin in de spotlights voor het recht op privacy**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste; Blz. 4

**LENGTH:** 637 woorden

Profiel - Edward Snowden

Edward Snowden lijkt een man die het beste met de wereld voor heeft. Zijn grootste angst is dat zijn onthullingen niets zullen veranderen.

'Ik zie mezelf niet als een held.' De 29-jarige Edward Snowden, die wereldwijd opzien baarde met onthullingen over de praktijken van de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA, had er naar eigen zeggen ook zelf belang bij: hij wil niet leven in 'een wereld zonder privacy.' Maar de klokkenluider heeft het in zich om de held te worden van iedereen die bang is voor Big Brother en om een schurk te worden, zelfs landverrader, in de ogen van diegenen die menen dat de strijd tegen het terrorisme aantasting van de persoonlijke levenssfeer rechtvaardigt.

Vanuit een hotelkamer in Hongkong maakte Snowden vorige week via Amerikaanse en Britse kranten bekend op welke enorme schaal de Amerikaanse overheid burgers in de gaten houdt. Als man uit de spionagewereld - hij werkte zelf voor de NSA - ging hij daarbij uiterst voorzichtig te werk. Tikte hij zijn wachtwoord in op een laptop, dan onttrok hij zich met een rode doek aan het zicht van eventuele camera's. Om af te luisteren aan de kamerdeur te voorkomen gebruikte hij kussens.

Bij zijn eerste contacten met The Washington Post en The Guardian bediende hij zich van de codenaam Verax, 'drager van de waarheid' in het Latijn. Hij koos er niettemin zelf voor uit de anonimiteit te treden. Met alle risico's van dien. Snowden houdt er zelfs rekening mee ontvoerd te worden door de CIA, een 'zusterdienst' van de NSA. Hij bracht zijn voormalige werkgever ernstig in verlegenheid, en bovenal president Barack Obama.

De ironie wil dat Snowden al jaren geleden overwoog naar buiten te treden, maar daarvan afzag omdat hij de hoop koesterde dat president Obama de spionageactiviteiten van de VS zou inperken. Hij kwam bedrogen uit; Obama bleek volgens Snowden geen haar beter dan diens voorganger George W. Bush. Zijn grootste zorg is dat er ondanks de onthullingen 'niets zal veranderen.'

Maar zijn zorgen gelden ook familieleden van wie een deel bij de Amerikaanse overheid werkt. En over zijn eigen lot tast hij in het duister. Het is hoogst ongewis of hij in Hongkong kan blijven. De VS en Hongkong hebben een uitleveringsverdrag. De Amerikaan zou zich volgens sommige juristen kunnen beroepen op een passage waarin staat dat uitlevering aan de VS niet om politieke redenen mag plaatsvinden. Maar het Amerikaanse ministerie van Justitie liet al weten dat het een onderzoek is begonnen naar wetsovertreding.

Snowden koos onder meer voor Hongkong omdat hij daar 'vrijheid van meningsuiting' meende te vinden. Maar als de échte machthebbers in Peking, die niet veel op hebben met die vrijheid, hem willen uitleveren aan de VS staat hij machteloos.

De Amerikaan zou de Chinezen voor zich kunnen winnen door zijn geheimen met hen te delen. Hij heeft er slechts een deel van prijsgegeven. Om geld is het niet begonnen, zegt hij. Uit het interview in

The Guardian van maandag rijst het beeld op van een man die het beste met de wereld voor heeft, en zichzelf het liefst zou wegcijferen. Hij wilde als militair in Irak dienen 'om mensen te bevrijden van onderdrukking', maar merkte dat zijn maten bij de opleiding voor een elite-eenheid spraken over het doden van Arabieren. Om gezondheidsredenen voltooide hij de opleiding niet, en Snowden kwam als computerspecialist terecht in de wereld van de inlichtingen- en veiligheidsdiensten. Ook die bleek rauwer dan hij dacht: het bespieden van burgers via internet en telecommunicatie had een enorme vlucht genomen.

De afgelopen maanden werkte hij voor een onderaannemer van de NSA op Hawaii. Stilletje verliet hij in mei de eilandengroep, met een leugentje jegens zijn werkgever en een vage verklaring voor zijn vriendin, om kort daarop met een grote klap 'de waarheid' wereldkundig te maken.

# de Volkskrant

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Republikeinen: lever klokkenluider uit**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 586 woorden

Vooraanstaande Republikeinse politici hebben aangedrongen op uitlevering van klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die omvangrijke afluister- en meeleesprogramma's van de Amerikaanse inlichtingendiensten onthulde en naar Hongkong vluchtte. Het Amerikaanse ministerie van Justitie heeft een gerechtelijk onderzoek ingesteld naar het lekken van de geheimen.

'Als Snowden inderdaad de informatie van de National Security Agency lekte, dan moeten de Verenigde Staten hem vervolgen (...) en zo snel mogelijk beginnen met de procedures voor uitlevering', zei Peter King, voorzitter van de commissie voor binnenlandse veiligheid in het Huis van Afgevaardigden. 'De VS moeten duidelijk maken dat geen enkel land deze persoon asiel zou moeten verlenen.'

Voorzitter van de inlichtingencommissie Mike Rogers zei dat Snowden genoeg informatie heeft verspreid om 'gevaarlijk' te zijn. Het hoofd van de inlichtingendiensten, James Clapper, liet weten dat de zaak is overgedragen aan het ministerie van Justitie en dat er een gerechtelijk onderzoek komt.

Volgens juristen kan Snowden in de VS tot een langdurige celstraf worden veroordeeld. De voormalige CIA-medewerker vluchtte naar Hongkong omdat hij vreesde dat hij in eigen land geen eerlijk proces zou krijgen. Hij vindt dat Hongkong een 'sterke traditie van burgerlijke vrijheden' heeft.

Hongkong tekende in 1997 een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS, maar er geldt een uitzondering voor politiek asiel. Bovendien kan Peking uitlevering blokkeren als het meent dat de nationale veiligheid in het geding is. Maar volgens waarnemers zal China niet geneigd zijn de betrekkingen met Amerika op het spel te zetten voor een klokkenluider. Bovendien heeft Snowden de Chinezen geen nuttige informatie te bieden, meent China-specialist David Zweig in Hongkong. Uitlevering zou zelfs een gemakkelijk cadeau zijn om de Washington gunstig te stemmen.

Snowden hoopt naar IJsland te gaan, maar de nieuwe conservatieve regering in Reykjavik heeft een nauwe band met Washington en is minder gastvrij voor politieke ballingen dan eerdere regeringen. Ook IJsland heeft een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS.

Of Snowden nog in Hongkong verblijft is onduidelijk. Het hotel waar hij zou hebben verbleven, liet weten dat hij daar heeft uitgecheckt. Het bestuur van Hongkong doet er het zwijgen toe.

In Groot-Brittannië verklaarde minister van Buitenlandse Zaken William Hague dat zijn inlichtingendiensten de Amerikaanse praktijken niet hebben gebruikt om privacywetten te omzeilen. Britten die zich aan de wet houden hebben niets te vrezen van de trans-Atlantische samenwerking, zei hij.

The Guardian had onthuld dat de luistervinken van de Britse inlichtingendienst GCHQ profiteren van informatie van het Prism-programma. Hague weigerde te verklappen sinds wanneer hij en zijn collega van Binnenlandse Zaken op de hoogte waren van deze praktijken. De Conservatief garandeerde dat de opgevraagde informatie voldoet aan Britse en Europese privacyrichtlijnen.

Uit het debat bleek eens te meer dat de Britse volksvertegenwoordigers verdeeld is in zij die veiligheid voorop stellen en zij die zich zorgen maken om privacy, een onderscheid dat dwars door de partijen loopt. Hague kreeg bijval van zijn Labour-voorganger Jack Straw, die zei dat andere landen 'versteld staan' van de omzichtige manier waarop de Britten omgaan met geheime informatie. Het Conservatieve kamerlid Rory Stewart daarentegen, zei dat de inlichtingendiensten meer openheid moeten betrachten.

Britse regering zegt privacywetten niet te hebben omzeild

# de Volkskrant

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**SECTION:** Opinie en Debat; Blz. 25

**LENGTH:** 320 woorden

Ander commentaar

SLATE.COM

Laten we stilstaan bij wat Snowden niet is: hij is geen doorgewinterde FBI- of CIA-onderzoeker, analist van Buitenlandse Zaken of advocaat gespecialiseerd in de nationale veiligheid en privacywet. Integendeel, hij is een niet zo ervaren en getalenteerde ict-man.

Snowdens lek is dus dubbel zo schadelijk. Het is niet alleen een schandaal dat de overheid ons bespioneert. Het is ook schandalig dat die jongens als Snowden laat sleutelen aan het spionageprogramma. Het suggereert de slechtst denkbare combinatie van te slim willen zijn en amateurisme, waar macht teniet wordt gedaan door incompetentie. (Farhad Manjoo)

THE GUARDIAN,

Het heeft ongetwijfeld geen zin om te betogen dat de Amerikaanse regering Edward Snowden met rust moet laten. De juridische en diplomatieke machines zijn waarschijnlijk niet te stoppen. Wel zullen de autoriteiten kijken naar de vervolging van een andere highprofile-klokkenluider: Daniel Ellsberg, die 40 jaar geleden de Pentagon Papers lekte. Zijn zaak werd niet ontvankelijk verklaard wegens wangedrag van de overheid. Vanzelfsprekend is Snowden geen ordinaire dief. Veel eerder is hij een gewetensbezwaarde. Het is van cruciaal belang dat het Congres zelf controleert wat Snowden zegt en zijn verhoor niet uitbesteedt aan de FBI.

WASHINGTON POST

Glenn Greenwald, de Guardian-columnist die de NSA-verhalen bracht, schreef: 'Wie verantwoordelijk is voor deze onthullingen moet een enorme hoeveelheid moed en een eindeloze bereidheid tot zelfopoffering hebben om deze misstanden aan het licht te brengen. Als democratie zouden we zulke bovenmenselijke handelingen niet nodig moeten hebben om transparantie te krijgen. We mogen van geluk spreken dat dit is gebeurd, maar dat betekent niet dat de vrees voor vervolging van klokkenluiders niet reëel is.' Die is zeer reëel. Hoeveel potentiële bronnen zullen bereid zijn topgeheime documenten te lekken? (Erik Wemple)

# de Volkskrant

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**EU neemt schenden privacy door VS hoog op**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 556 woorden

Digitale spionage - VS houden wereld in de gaten

De onthullingen van Edward Snowden veroorzaken overal opschudding. Europa maakt zich zorgen over de privacy van haar burgers en eist opheldering van de VS. En minister Opstelten doet er het zwijgen toe.

De Europese Commissie en het Europees Parlement vrezen dat Europeanen op grote schaal het slachtoffer zijn geworden van Amerikaanse spionageactiviteiten. De VS moeten zo snel mogelijk opheldering verschaffen over de onthullingen van klokkenluider Edward Snowden.

Tijdens een spoeddebat van het Europees Parlement, dinsdag in Brussel, klonk harde kritiek. 'Amerika doet wat het wil, het schendt de geest van alle overeenkomsten die we hebben gesloten', zei de leider van de sociaal-democratische fractie Hannes Swoboda. Zijn liberale collega Guy Verhofstadt, oud-premier van België, noemde het onacceptabel als de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA 'zonder toestemming' Europese data zou hebben verzameld. Het Witte Huis verklaarde naar aanleiding van de onthullingen dat de vergaarde informatie wordt gebruikt voor 'overzeese' naspeuringen in de strijd tegen terrorisme. De spionage via internet en telecommunicatie zou zich niet richten op inwoners van de VS.

De Europese Commissie zal de Amerikanen eind deze week tijdens een topconferentie in Dublin aanspreken op hun **gewraakte activiteiten**. De Commissie eist dan bij monde van vicevoorzitter Vivian Reding de verzekering van de VS dat zij 'de fundamentele rechten van alle Europeanen respecteren en hun persoonlijke gegevens beschermen'. De VS en de EU lagen jarenlang overhoop over de uitwisseling van passagiersgegevens via luchtvaartmaatschappijen. Dat leidde vorig jaar tot een compromis, waarin volgens critici de privacy van reizigers onvoldoende gewaarborgd is.

Het Witte Huis zei open te staan voor discussie met de bondgenoten, maar maakte via woordvoerder Jay Carney in één adem duidelijk dat het omstreden spionageprogramma Prism niet zal worden gestaakt. Met behulp daarvan zouden ten minste twee grote terroristische acties zijn verijdeld.

Volgens de Britse zakenkrant Financial Times kunnen de onthullingen leiden tot spanningen tussen de VS en de EU bij de op handen zijnde onderhandelingen over een handelsakkoord. De Europeanen staan op strengere privacyregels dan de Amerikanen, is al gebleken.

President Obama zal eind deze week, tijdens een bezoek aan Berlijn, ook een kritische bondskanselier Merkel tegenover zich vinden. Leden van de Duitse regering hebben al eerder hun bezorgdheid geuit over de praktijken die door Snowden werden blootgelegd.

Het is onduidelijk waar Snowden verblijft. Tegen The Guardian zei hij het liefst asiel aan te vragen in IJsland.

Google wil na de ophef over Prism bekendmaken hoe vaak de overheid gegevens van gebruikers opvraagt in het kader van de nationale veiligheid. In Amsterdam maakte het hoofd juridische zaken, David Drummond, bekend dat het internetbedrijf daarvoor een brief aan de regering-Obama heeft geschreven.

Drummond ontkende dat Google zonder gerechtelijk bevel grote bestanden aan de overheid verstrekt of dat het via een 'achterdeur' toegang verschaft tot zijn systemen. Google brengt sinds 2011 rapporten uit waarin staat hoe vaak justitie en de veiligheidsdiensten gegevens opeisen. Hoe vaak het gaat om kwesties van nationale veiligheid, mag Google niet onthullen.

# de Volkskrant

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**Edward Snowden is een immorele einzelganger**

**BYLINE:** DAVID BROOKS

**SECTION:** Opinie en Debat; Blz. 30

**LENGTH:** 951 woorden

NSA-lek

Door de werkwijze van de NSA aan de kaak te stellen, heeft Edward Snowden de e-recodes geschonden van allen die hem ooit hebben geholpen.

Voor zover we nu weten, is Edward Snowden de ultieme eenling. Hoewel hij duidelijk ontzettend intelligent is, is hij er niet in geslaagd de middelbare school af te maken. Ook in het beroepsonderwijs raakte hij de weg kwijt. Volgens The Washington Post is hij al jaren nauwelijks bij zijn moeder op bezoek geweest. Een buurman in Hawaï die zichzelf wilde voorstellen, werd door Snowden in de rede gevallen met de mededeling dat hij niet geïnteresseerd was in relaties met burens. Hij is gaan werken voor Booz Allen Hamilton en de CIA, maar ook van hen heeft hij afscheid genomen.

Hoewel hij bedachtzaam is, moreel betrokken en zeer standvastig in zijn overtuigingen, lijkt hij toch het product van een van die onfortuinlijke trends van deze tijd: de fragmentering van de samenleving, het lossen van sociale banden, het groeiend aantal mannen van in de twintig die een technologisch bestaan leiden in het vage gebied tussen de instituties van hun jeugd en volwassen gezinsverantwoordelijkheden.

Wanneer je een leven leidt dat niet wordt gevormd door de ordenende werking van de instituties van de burgermaatschappij, is het misschien niet zo gek dat je de wereld op een bepaalde manier bekijkt.

Dan is het leven niet ingebed in een reeks geleidelijk in elkaar overgaande, steeds breder wordende gezagsstructuren als gezin, buurt, religieuze groepering, de staat, het land en de wereld. In plaats daarvan is er slechts het eenzame, naakte individu tegenover de gigantische, bedreigende staat.

Wanneer je door zo'n bril kijkt, heb je meer kans je thuis te voelen bij ideeën uit het libertaire gedachtengoed die het zo goed doen in dit gefragmenteerde tijdsgewricht: het diepe wantrouwen tegen autoriteiten, de sterke overtuiging dat hiërarchieën en organisaties verdacht zijn, de vurige toewijding aan transparantie en de veronderstelling dat je eigen opvatting voor alles gaat. Dan geef je ook eerder geld aan de verkiezingscampagne van presidentskandidaat Ron Paul, wat Snowden deed.

Tegen deze achtergrond en met zo'n manier van denken is het dan ook logisch dat Snowden zijn loopbaan heeft opgeofferd om de manier waarop de National Security Agency informatie vergaart en doorspits aan de kaak te stellen. Ook al heeft hij geen enkel specifiek misbruik kunnen aantonen, hij moet de vertrouwelijkheid die eigen is aan militaire operaties en activiteiten van inlichtingendiensten wel afschuwelijk hebben gevonden. En uiteraard heeft hij gelijk dat de procedures die hij heeft onthuld in de toekomst misbruikt zouden kunnen worden.

Big Brother is echter niet het enige gevaar dat de VS bedreigt. Er is ook het groeiende wantrouwen en cynisme, de aantasting van het maatschappelijk weefsel en de opkomst van mensen die zo'n individualistisch wereldbeeld hebben dat ze niet begrijpen hoe ze zich met anderen kunnen verbinden en het algemeen nut kunnen dienen. Maar dat is niet het gevaar waarop Snowden zich richt. In feite maakt hij alles alleen maar erger.

Wil de samenleving kunnen functioneren, dan moet er een zeker vertrouwen zijn, en samenwerking, respect voor instituties en acceptatie van procedures. Door in zijn eentje te besluiten geheime NSA-documenten te lekken, heeft Snowden dat alles verraden. Hij heeft de eerlijkheid en integriteit verraden, die de basis vormen van elke samenwerking. Hij heeft expliciet en impliciet gezworen de hem toevertrouwde informatie geheim te houden. Die eed heeft hij gebroken.

Hij heeft zijn vrienden verraden. Iedereen die met hem heeft gewerkt, is nu verdacht. Jonge mensen op soortgelijke posities zullen geen verantwoordelijke taken meer krijgen, uit angst dat ze hetzelfde zullen doen als Snowden. Hij heeft zijn werkgevers verraden. Booz Allen en later de CIA hebben een gesjeesde student een baan gegeven met een vorstelijk salaris. Hij schendt de eercodes van allen die hem in staat hebben gesteld hogerop te komen.

Hij heeft de zaak van de open overheid verraden. Telkens als er iets wordt gelekt, zullen de machthebbers de kring van vertrouwen verder inkrimpen en het debat verder inperken. Hij heeft de privacy van ons allen verraden. Als de federale veiligheidsdiensten geen grote hoeveelheden data meer kunnen scannen, zullen ze terugvallen op oudere, meer inbreuk makende afluistermethoden. Hij heeft de Constitutie verraden. De VS zijn niet gesticht om een 29-jarige in zijn eentje te laten beslissen over wat openbaar moet worden gemaakt. Snowden heeft egocentrisch kortsluiting veroorzaakt in de democratische verantwoordingsstructuren en zijn eigen opvatting boven alles gesteld.

Snowden stond voor een moreel dilemma. Enerzijds had hij informatie over een programma dat hij werkelijk als een bedreiging zag. Anderzijds had hij verantwoordelijkheden aanvaard als ambtenaar, als lid van een organisatie en als burger van een land. Soms is lekken onvermijdelijk, als klokkenluiders over informatie beschikken die zo ernstig is dat ze hun eed wel moeten breken. Maar je hoopt toch dat ze vóór ze dat doen goed bij zichzelf te rade gaan en zich afvragen of er wellicht goede redenen zijn het niet te doen. Is de informatie zo ernstig dat die het rechtvaardigt een eed te breken, de gevestigde besluitvormingsprocessen te omzeilen en op eigen gezag geheimen te onthullen die nooit meer opnieuw geheim kunnen worden?

Snowden was geobsedeerd door het gevaar van het opslaan van gegevens, maar hij is zich totaal niet bewust van zijn verraad en de schade die hij aanricht aan sociale afspraken en de onzichtbare banden die ze bijeenhouden.



Snowden maakt het groeiende wantrouwen en cynisme alleen maar groter

# de Volkskrant

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**Discussie barst los: held of landverrader**

**BYLINE:** DIEDERIK VAN HOOGSTRAATEN

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 694 woorden

Is Edward Snowden een held die de losgeslagen overheid ter verantwoording roept, of een landverrader die de Amerikaanse veiligheid ondermijnt? Over die vraag is een debat losgebarsten in de media en in politiek Washington.

'Ik denk dat het een daad van hoogverraad is', aldus Dianne Feinstein, een invloedrijke senator uit de Democratische Partij van president Obama. Het bieden van hulp aan staatsvijanden (treason, verraad) is een van de ernstigste misdaden in het Amerikaanse strafrecht.

Maar tienduizenden Amerikanen hebben al een petitie getekend op de site van het Witte Huis. 'Edward Snowden is een nationale held', valt daar te lezen, 'en moet onmiddellijk volledige en absolute vrij spraak krijgen'.

Als werknemer van de private overheidscontractant Booz Allen stal Snowden (29) een grote hoeveelheid geheime informatie over afluisterpraktijken door de veiligheidsdiensten. Hij speelde die gegevens door aan de Britse Guardian en The Washington Post, omdat hij niet in een 'Big Brother-surveillancestaat' wil leven. Uit de berichtgeving van de twee kranten blijkt in meer detail dan voorheen wat al jaren bekend is: ook onder Obama controleert de overheid de eigen bevolking en het wereldwijde internetverkeer, dat voor een belangrijk deel via de VS loopt.

De controle valt binnen de grenzen van de wet. Ze staat onder strikt toezicht van het Congres en de rechterlijke macht. En volgens Obama is het aftappen van telefoonverkeer en internetactiviteiten een bewezen methode om terreurdreiging te bespeuren. Zijn raadgevers wijzen op concrete voorbeelden, zoals de arrestatie van Najibullah Zazi. Hij was in 2009 van plan een bom tot ontploffing te brengen in de metro van New York, een plan dat werd onderschept dankzij de surveillance die nu onder vuur ligt.

Een prangende vraag is hoe Snowden als jonge analist überhaupt aan de informatie kon komen. Maar vooral de discussie over zijn motivatie en zijn daad zelf is fel. In de VS zijn onverwachte coalities ontstaan van opinieleiders die de klokkenluider steunen of bekritisieren. Veel Bush-conservatieven én Obama-Democraten staan achter de president en zijn antiterreurbeleid. Zolang het onder toezicht gebeurt, achten zij de praktijken van de geheime dienst NSA aanvaardbaar. In hun ogen is Snowden een gewetenloze crimineel die levens in gevaar brengt. Conservatieve libertarische zoals senator Rand Paul staan aan dezelfde kant als veel media en linkse burgerrechtengroepen. Zij wantrouwen de overheidssurveillance en dragen Snowden op handen.

De columnist David Brooks van The New York Times bekritiseert Snowden als een typische, hoogmoedige twintiger, zonder enig benul van integriteit. Jeffrey Toobin, de juridische specialist van weekblad The New Yorker omschrijft hem als een 'grandioze narcist' die in de gevangenis hoort. 'Met

een daad die meer zegt over zijn ego dan zijn geweten gooid hij de geheimen de lucht in - erop vertrouwend dat dit tot iets goed zou leiden.'

Andere kenners wijzen erop dat klokkenluiders allerlei manieren tot hun beschikking hebben. De spectaculaire openbaarmaking van gevoelige gegevens over nationale veiligheid kan de radicaal-islamitische vijand bijstaan en levens in gevaar brengen, betogen zij; dan verdient de roekeloze klokkenluider vervolging.

Maar John Cassidy, eveneens van The New Yorker, is een van de vele journalisten die Snowden prijzen om zijn moed. Hij riskeerde zijn veiligheid en toekomst om een 'grootse publieke dienst' te verlenen en ongrondwettige activiteiten bloot te leggen, aldus Cassidy. Anders dan de oud-militair Bradley Manning en WikiLeaks dumpte Snowden niet zomaar bergen informatie op het internet; hij bereidde zijn openbaarmaking secuur voor, in overleg met deskundige journalisten. Anders dan WikiLeaks bracht Snowden bovendien niet de levens van personen in gevaar.

De progressieve senator Al Franken verdedigt juist de surveillance. Hij betoogt dat burgers niets te vrezen hebben. De spionage 'beschermt ons en boekt succes in het voorkomen van terrorisme'. De meerderheid van de Amerikaanse bevolking, die niet wakker ligt van de onthullingen over de NSA, schijnt die redenering te aanvaarden.

# de Volkskrant

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**'Zwijgen Opstelten zegt alles'**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEEFSTER MAARTJE BAKKER

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste; Blz. 10

**LENGTH:** 453 woorden

De Nederlandse veiligheidsdienst gebruikt informatie die wordt verkregen door internetverkeer op grote schaal te doorzoeken. Tot die conclusie komt de oppositie in de Tweede Kamer, nu minister Opstelten (Veiligheid) het niet ontkent.

Met het computerprogramma Prism krijgt de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdienst inzage in telefoongesprekken en mailwisselingen van over de hele wereld. De dienst verschaft zichzelf toegang tot privégegevens van gebruikers van bedrijven als Microsoft, Google, Facebook en YouTube. De Telegraaf berichtte dinsdag dat de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdienst die informatie deelt met de Nederlandse.

In de Tweede Kamer zweeg minister Opstelten daarover. 'Het is gebruikelijk om niets te zeggen over de samenwerking tussen veiligheidsdiensten, gewoon niet.' Ook geen geruststelling voor Nederlandse internetgebruikers die zich bespioneerd voelen? 'Jawel, ik heb vertrouwen in het functioneren van de veiligheidsdiensten.' Maar was het dan proportioneel om gegevens van willekeurige internetgebruikers uit te pluizen? 'Ik herhaal dat het proportioneel is in Nederland en over de contacten met buitenlandse diensten doe ik geen mededelingen, ook nu niet.'

De oppositie wist genoeg. 'Opstelten heeft geen enkele poging gedaan om duidelijk te maken: dit gebeurt niet', zei D66-Kamerlid Gerard Schouw nijdig. 'Als het niet waar is, moet de minister het tegenspreken.' Ook SP-Kamerlid Ronald van Raak was stellig. 'Natuurlijk wist Nederland hiervan. Ik weet dat Nederland zelf ook bezig is zo'n programma aan te schaffen.'

Spook

De houding van Opstelten toont voor de oppositie aan dat de geheime dienst, ook in Nederland, brutaal te werk gaat. Het onzichtbare en geheimzinnige spook van de veiligheidsdienst is hier geprobeerd te vangen in de wet, waarin precies staat wat er mag: het middel moet in verhouding staan tot het doel, er mag geen lichter middel beschikbaar zijn, alles met het oog op privacy van onschuldige burgers. Maar Kamerleden die willen weten of die wet wordt nageleefd, vangen bot.

In Nederland ligt dat nog gevoeliger dan in de Verenigde Staten, waar veel geoorloofd is als het om de veiligheid gaat. 'Veiligheid is natuurlijk belangrijk', zegt Schouw, 'maar privacywetgeving mag geen wassen neus zijn. Privacy is persoonlijke veiligheid. Ik wil kunnen controleren of de wet wordt nageleefd. De minister geloven op zijn blauwe ogen, dat doe ik niet.'

Om nog eens aan te tonen hoe serieus ze het menen met de privacy, stelde de oppositie voor om Edward Snowden, de klokkenluider in deze zaak, een veilig heenkomen te bieden in Nederland. 'Snowden heeft gedaan wat de Nederlandse regering heeft nagelaten', stelde SP'er Van Raak. 'Hij heeft gewaarschuwd voor een bedreiging van onze privacy.'

# de Volkskrant

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**Geachte redactie**

**BYLINE:** ARIE VAN BOXEL,

**SECTION:** Opinie en Debat; Blz. 31

**LENGTH:** 326 woorden

Edward Snowden

Hoe zou het Westen gereageerd hebben wanneer Edward Snowden een medewerker van een Russische of Chinese geheime dienst zou zijn geweest? Hoe zou Amerika in dat geval reageren?

We accepteren het blijkbaar dat de Amerikanen in onze persoonlijke gegevens snuffelen. Ik hoor althans niemand van onze regering protesteren.

De beschaafde wereld zou deze klokkenluider dankbaar moeten zijn in plaats van lijdzaam toe te zien hoe de de conservatieve Amerikanen jacht op hem gaan maken.

Arie van Boxtel, Margou

Ultrageheim

Een hoop opwinding over onthullingen dat de ultrageheime NSA burgers in de VS steeds meer in de gaten houdt. Ik kijk om me heen en zie deze week zestien gloednieuwe politiecamera's verschijnen in mijn doorgaans gemoedelijke buurt de Pijp. Stadsdeelvoorzitter Paul Sletten (VVD) heeft burgemeester Eberhard van der Laan daarom gevraagd. Om het gevoel van veiligheid bij de burgers te vergroten. De burgemeester vond het goed.

Nu kijken die twee mee als ik mijn dochter naar school breng, naar de sportschool fiets, boodschappen doe, uit de kroeg kom. Van de Ceintuurbaan tot de Van Woustraat, van de Ferdinand Bol tot de Stadshouderskade. De Pijp is een kijkdoos voor de politie.

Ik vertel een buurvrouw dat er overal camera's zijn geplaatst. Haar spontane reactie: 'Wat goed, zeg.' Laatst waren er weer ventielen uit haar fiets gehaald. Haar auto was ook al eens bekrast. Misschien dat er nu niet meer tegen de pui met al die graffiti wordt geplast. Ze kijkt me hoopvol aan. 'O, maar jij bent zeker tegen?' Dan, half-verontschuldigend. 'Ik stem GroenLinks, maar toch ben ik voor.' We wensen elkaar een fijne avond.

In het beleidskader van de gemeente staat dat een cameraproject kan worden gestopt, maar 'dat burgers en ondernemers dienen te worden geïnformeerd'. Bij het starten van een project staat niets over burgers informeren. **Columnist Wagendorp hoopt dat de Snowdenleaks ons wakker schudden** (Ten eerste, 11 juni). Het is te laat. De staat is wakker, wij slapen gewoon door. Frans Hempen, Amsterdam

# de Volkskrant

13 juni 2013 donderdag

**Baas NSA: tientallen complotten vrijdeld**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 339 woorden

Het verzamelen van telefoon- en internetgegevens door de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA heeft geholpen om tientallen potentiële terroristische complotten te vrijdelden. Dat heeft de directeur van de organisatie, generaal Keith Alexander, woensdag gezegd tijdens een hoorzitting in het Congres.

Het was de eerste keer dat Alexander zich hierover uitsprak sinds de onthulling van het Prism-programma door de voormalige CIA-medewerker Edward Snowden. **Ik wil dat het Amerikaanse volk weet dat wij proberen transparant te zijn, dat we burgerlijke vrijheden en privacy, maar ook de veiligheid van het land beschermen. Ik heb liever dat de mensen denken dat ik wat te verbergen heb dan dat ik de veiligheid van het land in gevaar breng.** Volgens Alexander is de Amerikaanse infrastructuur, van telecombedrijven tot energieleveranciers, niet goed uitgerust om gevaarlijke cyberaanvallen af te slaan.

**De naar Hongkong gevluchte klokkenluider Snowden heeft laten weten dat hij zich zal verzetten tegen elke poging hem uit te leveren. Dat zei hij tegen de South China Morning Post. Het was zijn eerste interview nadat hij maandag was verdwenen uit de hotelkamer, van waaruit hij de geheime informatie had doorgespeeld naar de media.**

Snowden zei dat hij niet in Hongkong is om zich te verschuilen voor justitie. Hij zou verscheidene kansen hebben gehad om de Chinese autonome regio te ontvluchten. Maar hij zei 'liever te blijven en in de rechtbank de strijd aan te binden met de regering van de VS'. Snowden zei het rechtssysteem van Hongkong te vertrouwen. **Het is mijn bedoeling om de rechtbanken en de bevolking van Hongkong te vragen over mijn lot te beslissen.**

Op de vraag waarom hij voor Hongkong gekozen heeft om het bestaan van het Prism-programma te onthullen, antwoordde hij dat sommigen vinden dat het een slechte keus is. Die mensen hebben het volgens Snowden bij het verkeerde eind. 'Mensen die denken dat ik een fout maak door voor Hongkong te kiezen, begrijpen mijn bedoelingen niet. Ik ben hier om criminaliteit openbaar te maken'.

# de Volkskrant

14 juni 2013 vrijdag

## **Klokkenluider Snowden had zelf alarmbel nodig**

**BYLINE:** THOMAS FRIEDMAN

**SECTION:** Opinie en Debat; Blz. 25

**LENGTH:** 740 woorden

NSA

De burgerrechten lijden meer onder nog een 9/11 dan onder de dataverzamelingen van de NSA.

Ik ben blij dat ik in een land woon waar de mensen alert zijn in het opkomen voor burgerrechten. Als ik echter de discussie volg over de onthulling van twee overheidsprogramma's gericht op het volgen van verdachte telefoongesprekken en e-mails van terroristen, vraag ik me wel af of zij die deze onthulling zo ondubbelzinnig verdedigen wel beseffen dat 9/11 echt gebeurd is - alsof overheidsinmenging in ons leven het enige is wat we te vrezen hebben en niet het binnendringen van mensen die in Jemen, Afghanistan en Pakistan complotten smeden om onze hoogste gebouwen te laten instorten of Amerikaanse verkeersvliegtuigen te laten neerstorten met bommen in ondergoed, tennisschoenen of printers.

Natuurlijk maak ik me wat privacy betreft zorgen over het misbruik dat de overheid kan maken van een programma dat is ontworpen om een tweede 9/11 te voorkomen; een misbruik dat tot dusver niet lijkt te hebben plaatsgevonden. Ik maak me echter meer zorgen over een tweede 9/11.

Dat ik me daarover meer zorgen maak, is niet omdat burgerrechten me niets kunnen schelen, maar omdat onze open samenleving mij van alles in Amerika het dierbaarst is en omdat ik denk dat als er nog één keer een 9/11 gebeurt - of, erger nog, een aanslag met nucleair materiaal - dat het einde zou kunnen betekenen van die open samenleving. Nog een 9/11, en ik vrees dat 99 procent van de Amerikanen tegen hun Congresleden zou zeggen: 'Doe alles wat nodig is, privacy kan doodvallen, maar zorg ervoor dat dit niet nog eens gebeurt.' Dat vrees ik nog het meest.

Daarom, zij het met zeer grote tegenzin, ben ik bereid de overheid te laten spitten in data op zoek naar verdachte patronen in telefoon- en e-mailverkeer - waarna een rechter nog toestemming moet geven om daadwerkelijk de inhoud ervan te bekijken, onder door het Congres vastgestelde richtlijnen - om te voorkomen dat er een dag komt waarop we, door angst gedreven, de overheid een vrijbrief geven om iedereen, elke e-mail, elk telefoongesprek, waar en wanneer dan ook te bekijken.

Ik geloof dus niet dat Edward Snowden, die al dit geheime materiaal heeft gelekt, een heldhaftige klokkenluider is. Ik denk dat Snowden zelf een klokkenluider nodig had: iemand die hem zou confronteren met het argument dat we niet meer in een wereld leven waarin de overheid haar burgers kan beschermen tegen echte, niet denkbeeldige dreigingen zonder gebruik te maken van enorme dataverzamelingen onder voortdurend rechterlijk toezicht. Ideaal is het niet, maar als er nog één aanslag op de schaal van 9/11 plaatsvindt, lijden de burgerrechten daar veel meer onder.

Compliment aan Andrew Sullivan die in zijn blog een link plaatste naar een essay van David Simon, de man achter *The Wire* van HBO. Simon slaat de spijker op zijn kop. Hij schrijft: 'Afgaand op de zwaar overdreven reacties, zou je denken dat de overheid meeluistert naar de geheimen van 200 miljoen Amerikanen. En je zou denken dat in plaats van een wettig gerechtelijk bevel, dat de onvermijdelijke consequentie is van wetgeving die we hebben aangenomen, er iets illegaals is ontdekt

waarvoor de overheid zich moet schamen. Welnee... Vanuit de wet bekeken, is het enige nieuwe element de schaal waarop de FBI en de NSA blijkbaar proberen uit die informatie aanwijzingen te destilleren voor terrorismebestrijding... Ik besef dat het heel wat is, en ook eng, dat de overheid een database wil van alle telefoongesprekken. Het is ook eng dat overheden hun aandacht richten op internet. En het is ook eng dat uw mobieltje gps heeft... De vraag is niet of de daaruit voortkomende informatie bestaat. Dat is gewoon zo... Het gaat om een fundamentele vraag: gebruikt de overheid die data voor de rechtmatige bescherming van de openbare veiligheid of op manieren die inbreuk maken op individuele vrijheden en de persoonlijke privacy, en dan ook nog eens zonder toezicht daarop. Daarover blijven The Guardian en zij die steen en been klagen rond deze quasi-onthulling van het Amerikaanse dataverzamelen opvallend stil. Er is niets bekend over daadwerkelijk misbruik.'

Ik moet er niet aan denken hoeveel echte inperkingen van onze prachtige open samenleving we zouden tolereren als er weer een aanslag van de omvang van 9/11 zou plaatsvinden. Die klok wil ik toch ook even luiden.

THOMAS FRIEDMAN is columnist van The New York Times.  
Vertaling: Leo Reijnen  
© The New York Times

# de Volkskrant

14 juni 2013 vrijdag

**Snowden: NSA hackte computers in China en Hongkong**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 296 woorden

De Amerikaanse inlichtingendienst NSA heeft sinds 2009 computers in China en Hongkong gehackt. Dat zegt klokkenluider Edward Snowden in een interview met de South China Morning Post.

Doelwit waren volgens Snowden functionarissen van Chinese universiteiten en overheden, studenten en bedrijven. De NSA zou volgens Snowden wereldwijd 61 duizend doelwitten hebben, waarvan enkele honderden in China en Hongkong. De Verenigde Staten hebben eerder hun bezorgdheid uitgesproken over Chinese cyberaanvallen op Amerikaanse militaire netwerken.

Snowden, voormalig medewerker van de CIA, onthulde dat de NSA op grote schaal telefoon- en internetgegevens verzamelt, onder meer met het Prism-programma. **Dat deed hij vanuit Hongkong, waar hij nog steeds verblijft. Het interview met de South China Morning Post is afgenomen op een geheime locatie.**

Volgens Snowden hebben de VS geprobeerd Hongkong te dwingen hem uit te leveren. 'Ze willen voorkomen dat ik nog meer informatie onthul.' De autoriteiten in Hongkong zwijgen over Snowden. Ook het ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken in Peking weigert iets over hem te zeggen.

In Chinese media verschijnen artikelen waarin wordt gesteld dat de onthullingen van Snowden de relatie tussen Peking en Washington kunnen schaden. 'Het omvangrijke inlichtingenprogramma zal zeker een smet werpen op het imago van Washington en de betrekkingen tussen de VS en China beproeven', schreef de staatskrant China Daily.

Uit een peiling blijkt dat 59 procent van de Amerikanen het terecht vindt dat de Washington Post en The Guardian het verhaal van Snowden hebben gepubliceerd. Volgens 44 procent van de ondervraagden heeft Snowden met zijn onthulling een juiste beslissing genomen, 42 procent vindt dat niet.

Spionagedienst zou wereldwijd 61.000 doelwitten hebben

# de Volkskrant

14 juni 2013 vrijdag

**Klokkenluiden is luidruchtig, het schuurt, maar het is nodig**

**BYLINE:** AMY DAVIDSON

**SECTION:** Opinie en Debat; Blz. 26

**LENGTH:** 1092 woorden

NSA

Dankzij het lekken van Edward Snowden gaan zij die aan de macht zijn zich wellicht afvragen of ze wel kunnen doorgaan met ongestraft liegen.

In een column over wat volgens hem het innerlijk leven van NSA-klokkenluider Edward Snowden is, somt David Brooks een hele waslijst op van mensen die Snowden zou hebben verraden (O&D, 12 juni). Daaronder ook 'zijn werkgevers' Booz Allen en de CIA, die 'een gesjeesde student een baan hebben gegeven met een vorstelijk salaris. Hij schendt de erecodes van al diegenen die hem in staat hebben gesteld hogerop te komen'. Hij heeft ook 'de Constitutie verraden. De VS zijn niet gesticht om een 29-jarige in zijn eentje te laten beslissen over wat openbaar moet worden gemaakt'.

Wat een merkwaardige kijk op de zaak. De stichters van de VS hebben de Constitutie óók opgesteld opdat de stem van een individu kon worden gehoord, ongeacht de beperkingen die hem door de macht zijn opgelegd. Sterker nog, die stichters zouden niet willen dat een 29-jarige zo overweldigd zou zijn door dankbaarheid jegens zijn superieuren dat hij zou zwijgen. De 'erecode' die volgens Brooks is geschonden, is misschien slechts neerbuigendheid verzacht door plichtsbesef. Afgestudeerde mensen zien het als bewijs van hun fatsoen om iemand die niet tot hun kringen behoort een kans te geven. Door vuile handen te maken, heeft Snowden niet alleen zijn geheimhoudingsbelofte geschonden, maar ook hun gevoel van eigen goedheid met voeten getreden. Volgens de logica van Brooks is het eigenlijk de schuld van Snowden als straks het cv van iemand die het hbo niet heeft afgemaakt bij een sollicitatie terzijde wordt geschoven.

Snowden heeft volgens Brooks 'de privacy van ons allen verraden. Als de federale veiligheidsdiensten geen grote hoeveelheden data meer kunnen scannen, zullen ze terugvallen op oudere, meer inbreuk makende af luistermethodes.' Zou voor die oudere methodes misschien een dwangbevel nodig zijn? Het idee dat we ons niet druk moeten maken over programma's zoals die waarover Snowden nu heeft gelekt, omdat we anders de overheid misschien boos maken en ze ons nog meer gaat bespioneren, is ook niet bepaald wat de stichters van de VS voor ogen hadden.

Brooks geeft toe dat Snowden 'gelijk heeft dat de procedures die hij heeft onthuld in de toekomst misbruikt zouden kunnen worden'. We moeten van Brooks vertrouwen op goedheid: ooit zou iemand misschien deze procedures kunnen misbruiken, maar nu is er niets aan de hand. Brooks vergist zich

over het heden, maar dat toekomstig risico zou al genoeg moeten zijn: het feit dat een dergelijke structuur bestaat, dat archieven worden gevuld met wat wij terecht als privé-informatie beschouwen, is op zichzelf al misbruik.

'Soms is lekken onvermijdelijk', zegt Brooks, maar hij is er niet van overtuigd dat dat voor Snowden geldt, zelfs al 'stond hij voor een moreel dilemma'. Misschien viel er wel iets te melden, maar dan had hij toch een mentor kunnen aanspreken? Maar nee, Snowden heeft het helemaal verkeerd gedaan. Hij was 'zich totaal niet bewust van zijn verraad en de schade die hij aanricht aan sociale afspraken en de onzichtbare banden die ze bijeenhouden'.

Heeft Snowden 'sociale afspraken' geschaad? Misschien privé, bijvoorbeeld tegenover zijn vriendin. Als Brooks echter doelt op het soort afspraken waardoor Congresleden, die worden geacht toezicht te houden, niet doorvragen op de geheime informatie die ze krijgen, of die ertoe leiden dat de president ons zegt dat de instemming van alle drie machten - zelfs als één daarvan een geheime instantie is die alles goedkeurt - al onze twijfels over een bepaald beleid zou moeten wegnemen, dan is een beetje schade misschien wel nuttig.

Dat geldt ook voor de afspraken tussen overheidsinstellingen en privé-ondernemingen als Booz Allen - dat wordt geleid door een voormalige inlichtingenambtenaar - die ertoe hebben bijgedragen dat ons systeem van nationale veiligheid bol staat van de geheimen. Brooks lijkt een grotere afschuw te hebben van onbeleefdheid dan van ongerechtigheid.

Dat komt naar voren bij een ander punt op de lijst wandaden van Snowden: 'Hij heeft de zaak van de open overheid verraden. Telkens als er iets wordt geleast, zullen de machthebbers de kring van vertrouwen verder inkrimpen en het debat verder inperken.' Het zou natuurlijk ook kunnen zijn dat ze gaan inzien dat ze niet ongestraft kunnen liegen. En dat de volgende keer dat James Clapper, het Hoofd van de Nationale Inlichtingendiensten, een rechtstreekse vraag krijgt tijdens een hoorzitting van de Senaat, hij zich zal afvragen of hij er op gepakt kan worden als hij antwoordt met een pertinente onwaarheid. Clapper zei 'nee' toen senator Ron Wyden hem vroeg of de NSA enigerlei gegevens verzamelde van Amerikanen. Toen Andrea Mitchell van nieuwszender NBC hem na de lekken aan de tand voelde over dit antwoord, zei Clapper dat hij het een vraag had gevonden van het genre 'Wanneer stopt u met het slaan van uw vrouw?' Maar als je inderdaad je vrouw slaat, is zo'n vraag volkomen terecht.

Brooks vraagt zich af of wat Snowden wist werkelijk zo ernstig was dat hij moest bijdragen aan de 'ondermijnende verbreiding van cynisme'. Zijn keuzen zouden slechts verklaard kunnen worden 'wanneer je een leven leidt dat niet gevormd is door de ordenende werking van de instituties van de burgermaatschappij'.

Brooks noemt niet de pers als een van de elementen van die burgermaatschappij en toch is dat juist het instituut waartoe Snowden zich heeft gewend. Hij heeft zijn documenten niet uit een helikopter gestrooid en ook de journalisten hebben dat niet gedaan. Journalisten die vaak in actie komen wanneer - wat Brooks wellicht beschouwt als minder botte waarborgen - falen. Klokkenluiden en onderzoeksjournalistiek kunnen luidruchtig zijn, schuren, en noodzakelijk zijn.

Toen ik de klaagzang van Brooks over Snowden en 'de fragmentering van de samenleving' las, moest ik denken aan Norman Rockwell, maar niet met hetzelfde gevoel als Brooks. (In 2008 schreef Brooks, na een volgens hem door Sarah Palin gewonnen debat: 'Ergens in de hemel lacht Norman Rockwell'.)

Het beeld dat bij mij opkwam, was dat van een van de panelen van Rockwells 'Four Freedoms': dat over de vrijheid van meningsuiting, waarop we een man zien die opstaat tijdens een soort gemeenteraadsvergadering. Hij zou 29 kunnen zijn. Hij draagt werkkleding, dus misschien heeft hij de middelbare school niet afgemaakt. Er zijn beter geklede mensen in de zaal. Die luisteren naar hem.

AMY DAVIDSON is senior editor bij The New Yorker.



# de Volkskrant

15 juni 2013 zaterdag

## Obama's dilemma laat Edward Snowden koud

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 790 woorden

De week van Paul Brill

In januari 2009, een paar dagen voordat hij zou vertrekken uit het Witte Huis, organiseerde George W. Bush een lunch die qua exclusiviteit zijn weerga niet had. Te gast waren zijn opvolger Barack Obama en de drie nog levende oud-presidenten: Jimmy Carter, George Bush senior en Bill Clinton. Plaats van handeling: de kleine eetkamer naast het Oval Office. Volgens Time-redacteuren Nancy Gibbs en Michael Duffy, die een lezenswaardig boek schreven over de verhouding tussen presidenten en hun opvolgers en voorgangers (The President's Club), nam Bush aan het begin van de lunch het woord en zei, terwijl de anderen instemmend knikten, het volgende tegen Obama: 'Wij willen graag dat je slaagt. Of we nu Democraat of Republikein zijn, ieder van ons geeft intens om dit land. (...) En allemaal weten we dat het ambt groter is dan het individu dat het bekleedt.'

Er werden een paar internationale kwesties aangeroerd, maar de conversatie ging vooral over het leven in het Witte Huis en over de obstakels die elke president op zijn weg vindt. Er werden ervaringen uitgewisseld en de sfeer was bijna kameraadschappelijk.

Ook als ex-president zou Bush junior zijn hoffelijke houding tegenover Obama volhouden: tot op de dag van vandaag heeft hij in het openbaar geen woord van kritiek geuit op zijn opvolger.

Ik memoreer die unieke lunch van januari 2009 omdat het tafereel van de broederlijk verenigde presidenten zo zeer in tegenspraak lijkt met het sterk gepolariseerde politieke klimaat in Washington. En ook met het beeld dat de vaak vinnige verkiezingscampagnes oproepen, namelijk het beeld van forse ideologische tegenstellingen. Maar uit wat Bush zei tegen Obama kan worden afgeleid dat in elk geval bij de (ex-)bewoners van het Witte Huis het besef leeft dat er een grens is aan de partijpolitieke strijd en dat het land niet is gediend met een zwak presidentschap. Wat ook maakt dat presidenten weliswaar de koers kunnen verleggen en nieuwe initiatieven kunnen nemen, maar dat er toch ook een onderstroom van continuïteit is.

Die continuïteit openbaarde zich afgelopen week op brisante wijze met de onthullingen van Edward Snowden over de grootscheepse surveillance van het internet- en telefoonverkeer door de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdienst NSA. Deze praktijk, gestart onder de hoede van de regering-Bush, is de laatste vier jaar alleen maar intensiever geworden. En om dat te rechtvaardigen hanteert Obama een argument dat ook uit de mond van Bush had kunnen komen: maximale bescherming tegen terrorisme valt niet te verenigen met maximale eerbied voor de privacy van de burger. Ik wil er twee dingen over zeggen.

1. Gelet op de reacties lijkt het wel of Snowden niets anders kan zijn dan ofwel een gewetensvolle held ofwel een getroebleerde landverrader. Een onsje nuance zou geen kwaad kunnen - en het is sowieso verstandig om stellige oordelen nog even op te schorten en af te wachten hoe de hele affaire

zich verder ontwikkelt. Voorlopig is er het meest te zeggen voor het oordeel van historicus Walter Russell Mead, die vorige week een lezing gaf in Den Haag en zei dat Snowden zich wel een buitensporige verantwoordelijkheid heeft aangemeten voor een 29-jarige die een bijrol vervulde in de hele afluisteroperatie.

2. Wat Obama zegt over de spanning tussen veiligheid en privacy, snijdt zeker hout. Laten we niet vergeten dat het terrorisme een reëel en vooral diffuus gevaar vormt, anders van aard dan de aanwijsbare dreiging die tijdens de Koude Oorlog uitging van de Sovjet-Unie. Waar is ook dat de surveillance een wettelijke basis heeft - althans in Amerika zelf - en door het Congres is gesanctioneerd.

Maar daarmee is de kous niet af. Het rechterlijk toezicht onttrekt zich bijna geheel aan publieke waarneming. Wat geheim is, is eigenlijk ook geheim. Blijkens peilingen is een meerderheid van de Amerikanen vooralsnog bereid dat te accepteren. Maar vanwege de ondoorzichtigheid van de hele operatie ligt misbruik permanent op de loer en bij een ernstige ontsporing kan de stemming snel omslaan in een land met een traditie van wantrouwen jegens de overheid.

Snowdens actie is in zekere zin zo'n ontsporing. Wat mij het meest verontrust is het grote aandeel van particuliere bedrijven in geheime staatszaken. Van de 1,3 miljoen (!) mensen die 'top secret clearance' hebben, is een derde niet in overheidsdienst. Het betekent dat op dit delicate vlak ook nog eens het profijtbeginsel een rol kan spelen.

Nog steeds geldt: liever een spiedende Amerikaan dan een Chinees of Iraniër. Maar er is alle reden om te streven naar meer transparantie, hoe lastig dat ook is in de wereld van de spionage. Wat placht Ronald Reagan ook alweer te zeggen? Trust but verify.

Klok luidt voor beter toezicht op luistervinken.

# de Volkskrant

15 juni 2013 zaterdag

**'Snowden graaft zijn eigen graf, met een grote schop'**

**BYLINE:** THE NEW YORK TIMES / KEITH BRADSHER

**SECTION:** Buitenland; Blz. 15

**LENGTH:** 420 woorden

Klokkenluider Edward Snowden heeft zijn juridische positie verzwakt door geheime informatie te lekken over het hacken van computers in China en Hongkong door de Amerikaanse inlichtingendienst NSA. Dat zeggen juristen en veiligheidsdeskundigen.

Zijn optreden kan er ook toe leiden dat China het interessant vindt om hem in Hongkong te laten blijven.

De voormalige CIA-medewerker heeft de South China Morning Post inzage gegeven in IP-adressen van computers in China en Hongkong waarop de NSA de afgelopen vier jaar heeft ingebroken. Uit de gelekte informatie blijkt ook of de spionagedienst nog steeds inbreekt.

Volgens Snowden gaat het om computers in de particuliere sector, maar de scheiding tussen de particuliere sector en het overheidsapparaat is vaag in China. Staatsbedrijven spelen een grote rol in de economie en worden vrijwel allemaal geleid door partijfunctionarissen.

Kevin Egan, een jurist die personen heeft vertegenwoordigd die zich verzetten tegen uitlevering aan de VS, zei dat de laatste onthullingen van Snowden het voor hem moeilijker zullen maken om zich te verzetten tegen een Amerikaans uitleveringsverzoek. 'Hij is bezig zijn eigen graf te graven met een grote schop.'

Een bron met banden bij de Chinese inlichtingendiensten zei dat de onthullingen van Snowden laten zien dat de documenten die hij verzamelde waardevol kunnen zijn voor China. Vooral als Snowden bereid is mee te werken met de Chinese autoriteiten. 'Het idee is verleidelijk. Maar de vraag is hoe je dat aanpakt. Tenzij hij overloopt', aldus de Chinese zegsman die anoniem wenst te blijven. 'Het hangt af van zijn opstelling.'

Hij wilde geen antwoord geven op de vraag of Chinese inlichtingendiensten kopieën zullen maken van Snowdens documenten, als hij - op verzoek van de VS - door de politie van Hongkong wordt gearresteerd. De Amerikaanse justitie onderzoekt welke aanklachten tegen hem kunnen worden ingebracht.

De politie van Hongkong heeft al duidelijk gemaakt dat een eventuele arrestatie van Snowden niet door buitenlandse agenten mag worden verricht. Het korps moet informatie met China delen als dat van belang is voor de Chinese inlichtingendienst.

Als China wil dat Snowden voorlopig in Hongkong blijft, kan het de autoriteiten in de speciale regio eenvoudigweg voorhouden dat ze rustig moeten aandoen met het afhandelen van een uitleveringsverzoek.

De Britse regering waarschuwde luchtvaartmaatschappijen Snowden niet naar Groot-Brittannië te vervoeren. Hem zal 'zeer waarschijnlijk' toegang tot het land worden ontzegd.

# de Volkskrant

17 juni 2013 maandag

**Britse spionage bondgenoten op G20-top**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE BUITENLANDREDACTIE

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste; Blz. 2

**LENGTH:** 233 woorden

Buitenlandse politici die in 2009 deelnamen aan twee G20-bijeenkomsten in Londen zijn op aanwijzing van de Britse regering bespioneerd. Hun telefoons werden afgeluisterd en hun computers werden gehackt. Dat meldt het Britse dagblad The Guardian op basis van documenten die de krant heeft ingezien.

Volgens de documenten, die aan het licht zijn gebracht door de NSA-klokkenluider Edward Snowden, werden afgevaardigden verleid nagebouwde internetcafés te bezoeken die door de Brits inlichtingendienst speciaal voor het doel waren opgezet. Doel van de spionage, die onder meer gericht

was op afgevaardigden van landen als Zuid-Afrika en Turkije, was voorsprong te verwerven in de onderhandelingen.

De onthulling, die komt aan de vooravond van de G8-bijeenkomst in Noord-Ierland die vandaag begint, roept nieuwe vragen op over de wijze waarop de Government Communications Headquarters (GCHQ), de Britse spionagedienst, en haar Amerikaanse tegenhanger NSA (National Security Agency) hun informatie inwinnen.

De NSA is afgelopen week onder vuur komen te liggen vanwege de grootschalige manier waarop zij via bedrijven als Facebook, Google en Microsoft internetgegevens van burgers in de Verenigde Staten en daarbuiten kan inzien. De toegang van de NSA tot internet- en telefoongegevens is door de Amerikaanse autoriteiten verdedigd met een beroep op de nationale veiligheid en de strijd tegen terrorisme.

# de Volkskrant

17 juni 2013 maandag

**Senaat: nog geen driehonderd telefoongesprekken afgetapt**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE CORRESPONDENTARIE ELSHOUT

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 440 woorden

De Amerikaanse overheid heeft vorig jaar minder dan driehonderd telefoongesprekken aan een nader onderzoek onderworpen. Dat blijkt uit een regeringsdocument dat zondag door de inlichtingencommissie van de Senaat is vrijgegeven.

Met de publicatie van dit cijfer lijkt de Senaatscommissie duidelijk te willen maken dat de National Security Agency (NSA) minder diep in het persoonlijk leven van burgers wroette dan de recente onthullingen over geheime spionageprogramma's doen vermoeden. De spionagedienst vergaarde weliswaar miljoenen gegevens van telefoon- en internetgebruikers, maar in een betrekkelijk klein aantal gevallen zag de spionagedienst aanleiding voor verder onderzoek, is de boodschap. President Obama had al eerder gezegd dat de meeste telefoongesprekken niet werden afgeluisterd.

In het regeringsdocument wordt bovendien herhaald dat de geheime dataprogramma's hielpen 'tientallen potentiële terreurcomplotten te verijdelen tegen het (Amerikaanse) vasteland en tegen meer dan twintig landen verspreid over de wereld'.

De geheime spionageprogramma's werden onthuld door de Britse krant The Guardian en The Washington Post. Hun bron was Edward Snowden, een voormalige contractant van de NSA, die is ondergedoken in Hongkong.

Facebook werd in de tweede helft van vorig jaar negen- tot tienduizend keer gevraagd gegevens over zijn gebruikers af te staan. Sommige verzoeken betroffen meerdere accounts, zodat het in totaal om informatie over achttien- tot negentienduizend gebruikers ging. De sociale-netwerksite honoreerde, zo maakte het bekend, 79 procent van de aanvragen. De verzoeken waren afkomstig van federale en

lokale overheidsdiensten en hadden volgens het bedrijf niet alleen betrekking op terreurdreigingen. Het betrof ook zoekacties naar vermiste kinderen en voortvluchtige personen.

Microsoft kreeg in de tweede helft van 2012 tussen de zes- en zeventuizend verzoeken om informatie. Daarbij ging het om 31 duizend tot 32 duizend gebruikers.

President Obama vertrok zondag vanuit Washington naar Noord-Ierland voor een top van de G8, de groep van rijkste en machtigste landen. Op deze bijeenkomst zal hij naar verwachting aan de tand worden gevoeld over de spionageaffaire, die geleid heeft tot onrust in Europa, dat zeer beducht is voor aantasting van de privacy. De Duitse bondskanselier, Angela Merkel, heeft gezegd de kwestie te zullen aankaarten. Viviane Reding, vicevoorzitter van de Europese Commissie, heeft de Amerikaanse minister van Justitie gevraagd of burgers van de Europese Unie doelwit waren van de NSA-programma's.

Spionagedienst NSA is terughoudend met het wroeten in privégegevens, lijkt de boodschap.

# de Volkskrant

18 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Snowden, voor China een pion die je kunt offeren**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER, FOKKE OBBEMA

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 605 woorden

Met zijn vlucht naar Hongkong heeft klokkenluider Edward Snowden (29) zijn lot deels in handen gelegd van de machthebbers in Peking. De onthullingen van de Amerikaan over spionage van zijn land in China zijn voor hen een godsgeschenk, maar de affaire plaatst Peking voor een dilemma: uitleveren of asiel verlenen?

Voor de nationalistische krant Global Times is het antwoord helder. Uitlevering van Snowden aan de VS, schrijft de krant in een commentaar, zou 'verraad aan diens vertrouwen' in het rechtssysteem van Hongkong betekenen en 'een teleurstelling van de verwachtingen in de hele wereld'. Snowden heeft geen vlieg kwaad gedaan door de wereld te attenderen op 'de schending van burgerrechten door de Amerikaanse regering'. Dus zou uitlevering neerkomen op gezichtsverlies 'voor zowel de regering in Hongkong als de centrale regering in Peking', aldus de Global Times.

Bijval komt van liberale intelligentsia in Hongkong. Dit weekeinde demonstreerden inwoners ten gunste van Snowden. Behalve om de verdediging van een held van burgerlijke vrijheden ging het hun om de onafhankelijkheid van Hongkong ten opzichte van China. De kwestie-Snowden wordt gezien als een testcase daarvoor.

Tegenover deze sentimenten in de publieke opinie staat voor Peking het hogere belang van betere Amerikaans-Chinese betrekkingen. Wil Peking schade daaraan riskeren door Snowden in Hongkong te houden als de Amerikanen zijn uitlevering vragen?

Tegen Snowden loopt een FBI-onderzoek, maar hij kan zich nog vrij door Hongkong bewegen. Nu is Snowden afgelopen week verder gegaan dan privacyschendingen van Amerikanen aan de kaak stellen. In een interview met de South China Morning Post verschaft hij details over Amerikaanse spionage in zowel Hongkong als op het Chinese vasteland. Daarmee heeft hij zich kwetsbaar gemaakt voor het verwijt van landverraad. Een Amerikaans uitleveringsverzoek is daardoor aanzienlijk waarschijnlijker geworden.

Juridisch is het aan Hongkong daarover te beslissen; Peking mag een veto uitspreken als het buitenlands beleid in het geding is. De eerste vraag is dus of Hongkong, al dan niet gesouffleerd door Peking, tot de conclusie komt dat uitlevering mogelijk is. Zo ja, dan staat het de Chinese leiders vrij daartegenin te gaan. Waarschijnlijk is dat niet.

De Chinese leiders kunnen redeneren dat Snowden zijn nut al heeft bewezen. De onthullingen over Amerikaanse spionage volgden pal na de tweedaagse top van de presidenten Obama en Xi, ruim een week geleden. Die was bedoeld om de betrekkingen aan te halen, en was in dat opzicht ook geslaagd, maar de Amerikaanse president durfde het aan cyberspionage door China op de agenda te plaatsen.

Er waren onthullingen over Chinese cyberaanvallen op Amerikaanse media-organisaties, zoals The New York Times, en indicaties over de omvang van Chinese bedrijfsspionage. Het verweer van China dat de Amerikanen hen net zo hard bespioneerden, ontbeerde feitelijke onderbouwing. Die is nu door Snowden alsnog geleverd.

Een regeringswoordvoerder in Peking vroeg maandag de VS wel om 'de noodzakelijke uitleg' - maar Duitsland wil diezelfde opheldering. Bovendien deed de woordvoerder suggesties als zou Snowden op enigerlei wijze samenwerken met Peking af als onzin.

Voorlopig lijkt voor Peking afstand bewaren het devies. De autoriteiten in Hongkong mogen de kolen uit het vuur halen. Als Peking later een knoop moet doorhakken, ligt uitlevering meer voor de hand dan asiolverlening. De 29-jarige pion wordt dan door Peking op het geopolitieke schaakbord geofferd ten gunste van betere Amerikaans-Chinese betrekkingen.

Voorlopig lijkt het devies in Peking: afstand bewaren.

# de Volkskrant

22 juni 2013 zaterdag

**Vliegtuig staat klaar om klokkenluider Snowden naar IJsland te brengen**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER FOKKE OBBEMA

**SECTION:** Buitenland; Blz. 14

**LENGTH:** 366 woorden

Gaat klokkenluider Edward Snowden naar IJsland of blijft hij toch liever in HongKong? Die vraag dringt zich op nu een IJslandse zakenman die bij klokkenluidersorganisatie WikiLeaks betrokken is, verklaart een vliegtuig klaar te hebben staan om de Amerikaan onmiddellijk naar IJsland over te brengen.

Het gaat om een Chinees toestel dat WikiLeaks dankzij crowdfunding voor 181 duizend euro huurt. 'Het vliegtuig kan vertrekken, we wachten alleen nog op groen licht van de IJslandse regering', aldus Olafur Sigurvinsson.

Ook Julian Assange, de oprichter van WikiLeaks, zegt zijn advocaten opdracht te hebben gegeven om voor elkaar te krijgen dat collega-klokkenluider Snowden voor politiek asiel naar IJsland kan. Zelf houdt Assange zich al meer dan een jaar schuil in de Ecuadoraanse ambassade in Londen uit vrees

voor uitlevering naar de VS. Dat dreigt ook voor oud-CIA-medewerker Snowden, die via het Britse dagblad The Guardian omvangrijke, Amerikaanse afluisterpraktijken **onthulde**.

Maar onduidelijk is of de IJslandse regering een eventueel uitleveringsverzoek van de Amerikanen zal negeren. Net als HongKong kent ook IJsland een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS. De regering schuift het innemen van een standpunt voor zich uit. Snowden moet eerst maar eens op IJslandse bodem arriveren, pas dan kan er over zijn asiel worden gesproken, luidt het standpunt.

Snowden durft het vermoedelijk niet aan naar IJsland te gaan, wanneer de autoriteiten zich zo afhoudend opstellen. Mogelijk wordt er achter de schermen over zijn lot onderhandeld; geen van de betrokken partijen geeft daarover uitsluitel.

Daarvan zal afhangen of Snowden echt de voorkeur aan IJsland gaat geven. Vanwege het belang dat het eiland hecht aan een vrij internet met zo min mogelijk staatsbemoeyenis was het zijn aanvankelijke keus. Toch gaf hij de voorkeur aan naar HongKong te vliegen. In een interview met de South China Morning Post tien dagen geleden liet hij weten vertrouwen te stellen in het rechtssysteem van HongKong, daarmee suggererend dat de IJsland-route voor hem van de baan was. Maar in kringen rond WikiLeaks wordt gesteld dat het Snowden zelf is geweest die eerder deze week toch weer IJsland heeft voorgesteld.

# de Volkskrant

22 juni 2013 zaterdag

## VS vragen Hongkong om arrestatie van klokkenluider

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 348 woorden

Amerikaanse aanklagers willen klokkenluider Edward Snowden aanklagen voor onder meer spionage en diefstal. Dat berichtte de Washington Post zaterdag. De VS zouden Hongkong hebben gevraagd de klokkenluider aan te houden.

Federale aanklagers zouden een niet openbare lijst met beschuldigingen hebben ingediend tegen Snowden, zeggen anonieme functionarissen tegen de krant. De Amerikanen konden pas om de aanhouding van de klokkenluider vragen, toen de klacht was ingediend.

Het Amerikaanse ministerie van Justitie weigerde commentaar te geven op het verhaal. Maar volgens het persbureau Reuters is het zeker de bedoeling om de uitlevering van Snowden te vragen. Hij onthulde het bestaan van omvangrijke Amerikaanse afluisterpraktijken.

**Een bij Wikileaks aangesloten IJslandse zakenman wil de VS voor zijn. Hij zou een vliegtuig hebben klaarstaan om Snowden naar IJsland te halen. Het gaat om een Chinees toestel dat WikiLeaks dankzij crowdfunding voor 181 duizend euro huurt.**

'Het vliegtuig kan vertrekken, we wachten alleen nog op groen licht van de IJslandse regering', aldus Olafur Sigurvinsson.

Ook Julian Assange, de oprichter van WikiLeaks, zegt zijn advocaten opdracht te hebben gegeven om voor elkaar te krijgen dat collega-klokkenluider Snowden voor politiek asiel naar IJsland kan. Zelf houdt Assange zich al meer dan een jaar schuil in de Ecuadoraanse ambassade in Londen uit vrees voor uitlevering naar de VS.

Maar onduidelijk is of de IJslandse regering een uitleveringsverzoek van de Amerikanen zal negeren. Net als HongKong kent ook IJsland een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS. De regering schuift het innemen van een standpunt voor zich uit. Snowden moet eerst maar eens op IJslandse bodem arriveren, pas dan kan er over zijn asiel worden gesproken, luidt het standpunt.

Snowden durft het vermoedelijk niet aan naar IJsland te gaan, wanneer de autoriteiten zich zo afhoudend opstellen. Mogelijk wordt er achter de schermen over zijn lot onderhandeld; geen van de betrokken partijen geeft daarover uitsluitsel. Daarvan zal afhangen of Snowden echt de voorkeur aan IJsland gaat geven.

# de Volkskrant

24 juni 2013 maandag

## Snowden vraagt in Moskou asiel aan Ecuador

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE CORRESPONDENTEN ARNOUW BROUWERS, ANNE MEYDAM

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 489 woorden

Dataspionage Autoriteiten VS grijpen mis in jacht op klokkenluider

Klokkenluider Edward Snowden lijkt de Amerikaanse autoriteiten te snel af te zijn in een juridische klopjacht over drie continenten. Zondag landde hij in Moskou met een directe vlucht uit Hongkong. Einddoel is Ecuador, waar Snowden politiek asiel heeft aangevraagd.

Gisteravond verbleef Snowden (die niet over een Russisch visum zou beschikken) waarschijnlijk in een 'capsulehotel' in de transitzone van een Moskous vliegveld. Hij ontmoette er de Ecuadoraanse ambassadeur te Moskou, bij wie hij asiel aanvraagde. De Russische autoriteiten, die eerder al hadden gezegd een verzoek van Snowden welwillend te zullen bekijken, maakten geen aanstalten de Amerikaanse gast op te pakken. Zolang Snowden in de transitzone verblijft, is hij officieel niet in Rusland (dat trouwens geen uitleveringsverdrag met de VS heeft).

Volgens Russische bronnen staat Snowden voor vandaag geboekt op een vlucht naar Cuba. De klokkenluiders van WikiLeaks maakten zondag bekend dat zij Snowden bijstaan om hem 'via een veilige route' Ecuador te laten bereiken. Eerder verleende dat land asiel aan WikiLeaks-voorman Julian Assange, die nog steeds in de Ecuadoraanse ambassade in Londen verblijft. Ecuador heeft wel een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS, maar politieke vluchtelingen vallen daar niet onder.

Washington wil Snowden aanklagen voor onder meer spionage en diefstal en diende vrijdag een uitleveringsverzoek in bij Hongkong, waar hij sinds 20 mei verbleef. De oud-medewerker van de geheime dienst NSA onthulde de afgelopen weken omvangrijke afluister- en 'meelees'-programma's van de Amerikaanse inlichtingendiensten. Supporters zien in hem een held die strijdt voor de publieke zaak. Tegenstanders noemen hem crimineel en verrader.



Hongkong claimde zondag dat het Amerikaanse uitleveringsverzoek 'niet geheel voldeed aan de juridische eisen' - iets wat later door de VS werd bestreden. Snowdens vertrek uit Hongkong ging gepaard met nieuwe onthullingen in een interview met de South China Morning Post over Amerikaanse penetratie van China's nationale mobiele telecombedrijven en van twee universiteiten die als 'ruggengraat' van het Chinese internet functioneren. NSA zou alles doen 'zoals het hacken van Chinese telecombedrijven, om jullie sms-data te stelen'.

Zondag werd duidelijk dat een dag eerder Snowdens Amerikaanse nationaliteit is ingetrokken, waarschijnlijk om internationaal reizen te bemoeilijken. Maar in Hongkong werd officieel bekendgemaakt dat Snowden het territorium 'op eigen initiatief' had verlaten 'op een legale en normale manier'.

Sommige Amerikaanse politici reageerden geërgerd op de rol die China, Hongkong en vooral Rusland spelen. 'Poetin lijkt er altijd op uit Amerika een vinger in het oog te steken - of het nu om Syrië gaat of Iran of met Snowden', zei de Democratische senator Schumer. 'Dit krijgt serieuze gevolgen voor de Amerikaans-Russische relaties.'

# de Volkskrant

24 juni 2013 maandag

**Engeland zoekt nog fanatieker naar data dan VS**

**BYLINE:** PATRICK VAN IJZENDOORN

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 534 woorden

Profiel Britse inlichtingendienst GCHQ

Minder romantisch dan James Bond, maar GCHQ haalt wel veel data binnen.

'U bevindt zich in een benijdenswaardige positie. Heb plezier en haal er zo veel mogelijk uit.' Met deze woorden pleegde de Britse inlichtingendienst GCHQ nieuwe medewerkers te begroeten. Dat was niet aan dovemansoren gericht. In dataverzameling blijken de Britten nog fanatieker dan de Amerikanen. Uit documenten van klokkenluider Edward Snowden blijkt dat GCHQ in 2012 per dag 600 miljoen telefoontjes afluisterde en toegang had tot ruim 200 glasvezelkabels. Een van hun programma's was Mastering the Internet.

De Britten hebben een naam in het onderscheppen van boodschappen. Tijdens de Tweede Wereldoorlog ontcijferden de knapste koppen van het land, onder wie de 'vader van de computer' Alan Turing, op grote schaal het communicatieverkeer van de Duitsers. Waar de Britten met trots en weemoed terugdenken aan de mathematische heldendaden in de hutten van Bletchley Park, kijken ze met wantrouwen naar The Doughnut, de bijnaam van het hoofdkwartier van Government Communications Head-quarters (GCHQ) bij Cheltenham.

Als backoffice van de spionagewereld spreekt het ultramysterieuze GCHQ minder tot de verbeelding dan de geheime diensten MI5 en MI6. De luistervinken kwamen pas in 1982 voor het eerst in het nieuws toen een van hen bleek te spioneren voor de Russen. Voor de staatsveiligheid werd GCHQ altijd belangrijker geacht dan de geheime diensten. Op deze overheidsdienst is misschien daarom nooit bezuinigd. Hij vormt, zo schreef Richard Aldrich in zijn boek over GCHQ, de sterkste Britse kaart bij het goed houden van de band met de VS.

De Amerikanen waren indertijd vooral geïnteresseerd in de laatste restjes tropisch Engeland. Her en der hadden de Britten nog koloniale uitkijkposten, van Cyprus tot Hongkong. Begin jaren zeventig verwijderden de Britten zelfs de eilandbewoners van Diego Garcia, zodat de Amerikaanse luistervinken en militairen er ongehinderd konden werken.

Maar hoe effectief GCHQ is, blijft gissen. Zo was het merkwaardig dat niemand de Falkland-invasie door de Argentijnen zag aankomen. Wel wist men het brein achter de 'misdad van de eeuw', een roof ter waarde van 26 miljoen pond, in Spanje te traceren.

Dat laatste tekent het uitgebreide werkterrein. 'Vroeger, tijdens de Koude Oorlog, hoefden we maar een kant op te kijken. Nu luisteren we echt naar iedereen!' zo parafraseert Aldrich een GCHQ-topman. De oud-MI6-baas Richard Dearlove zei een jaar geleden nog dat de Britten niet moeten terugdeinzen om, in het belang van de economie, eurolanden te bespioneren. De technologische mogelijkheden zijn enorm.

Het is allemaal mogelijk door een afluisterwet die het Lagerhuis in 2000 aannam. Inmiddels worden zo veel gegevens verzameld dat de kans groeit dat iets cruciaals over het hoofd wordt gezien. Britse politici beginnen zich zorgen te maken over de privacy. Om zich te verdedigen wijst de dienst op zijn triomfen. Tegenover The Guardian meldde een anonieme bron dat er geregeld terreurcellen worden opgerold. Ook wisten de verspieters een handleiding voor het maken van een bom, gevonden op een Al-Qaida-site, te veranderen in een recept voor een cupcake.

# de Volkskrant

25 juni 2013 dinsdag

## VS hopen op uitlevering Snowden door Rusland

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE CORRESPONDENT ARIE ELSHOUT

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 623 woorden

Klokkenluider Verwarring over verblijfplaats

Tot ergernis van de Amerikanen is maandag de verwarring over Edward Snowden alleen maar verder toegenomen. De man die door hen is aangeklaagd voor spionage en diefstal vloog niet zoals verwacht van Moskou naar Cuba. Hij is niet meer in het openbaar gezien sinds hij dit weekeinde vanuit Hongkong in Rusland aankwam. Wat de Russen met hem van plan zijn, was niet duidelijk.

Het is mogelijk dat zij hem in hechtenis hebben genomen hetzij om hem uit te leveren aan Amerika hetzij om hem te ondervragen. Snowden werkte voor de National Security Agency (NSA), een van de belangrijkste spionagediensten in de VS. Dat maakt hem interessant voor de Russische contraspionage.

De VS gingen er maandag van uit dat Snowden nog steeds in Rusland was. Ze hopen Moskou ertoe te kunnen bewegen hem uit te leveren, zei Witte Huiswoordvoerder Jay Carney.

De oprichter van de klokkenluidersorganisatie WikiLeaks, Julian Assange verklaarde dat Snowden veilig was. Maar waar de voortvluchtige verbleef, wilde hij niet zeggen. Volgens WikiLeaks heeft Snowden asiel aangevraagd in Ecuador en IJsland. Hij probeert zo uitlevering aan de VS te voorkomen. Daar dreigt voor hem een gevangenisstraf van maximaal dertig jaar wegens het onthullen

van geheime spionageprogramma's, waarbij het telefoonverkeer en internetgebruik van burgers werd gecontroleerd.

De Amerikanen willen Snowden zo snel mogelijk in handen krijgen, niet alleen om hem te berechten maar ook om te voorkomen dat hij nog meer geheimen prijsgeeft. Dianne Feinstein, de Democratische voorzitter van de inlichtingencommissie van de Senaat, zei bezorgd te zijn. 'We moeten precies weten wat hij heeft. Hij kan veel, veel meer hebben. Mensen kunnen daardoor echt in gevaar komen.'

**Dat het niet opschiet met de jacht op Snowden, frustreert de Amerikaanse regering en het Congres.**

Het gevoel van relatieve onmacht wordt bestreden met een steeds fellere retoriek. Minister van Buitenlandse Zaken John Kerry sprak maandag tijdens een bezoek aan India dreigende taal tegenover Rusland en China. Als blijkt dat die twee landen actief proberen of geprobeerd hebben Snowden uit Amerikaanse handen te houden, zal dat 'gevolgen' hebben, aldus Kerry. Hij riep de Russen op 'de regels van de wet te volgen' en herinnerde eraan dat de VS op verzoek van Moskou zeven gevangenen hebben overgedragen.

Hongkong heeft het zwaar verbruid bij de Amerikanen, omdat het Snowden ondanks een uitleveringsverzoek heeft laten vertrekken. De autoriteiten in Hongkong zeggen dat de papieren niet in orde waren, maar volgens het ministerie van Justitie in Washington zijn dat smoesjes. Hoewel Hong Kong nominaal autonoom is in deze kwestie, houdt Washington China verantwoordelijk. 'Het zal ongetwijfeld een negatieve invloed hebben op de Amerikaans-Chinese betrekkingen', zei Witte Huiswoordvoerder Carney.

In het Congres kan Snowden op steeds minder krediet rekenen. Dat hij naar Rusland vloog, wordt hem zeer kwalijk genomen. 'Ik geloof niet dat hij een klokkenluider is', zei Feinstein. 'Hij had kunnen blijven en de consequenties kunnen aanvaarden. Ik denk niet dat weglopen zo'n nobele gedachte is.'

Dat Snowden eerst zijn toevlucht zocht in Hongkong, China, en nu in Rusland en mogelijk verder wil naar Cuba, Venezuela of Ecuador spreekt niet in zijn voordeel, zei Mike Rogers, de Republikeinse voorzitter van de inlichtingencommissie van het Huis van Afgevaardigden. 'Die landen hebben allemaal stekelige relaties met de VS. Nu nog Noord-Korea en Iran en dan is de rondreis compleet.'

**Waar is Edward Snowden? De VS gaan ervan uit dat hij nog in Moskou is, maar dat is niet zeker. Ecuador wil hem maar wat graag asiel verlenen.**

VS willen voorkomen dat hij nog meer geheimen prijsgeeft

# de Volkskrant

25 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Asielverlening kans voor Ecuador VS dwars te zitten**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE CORRESPONDENTE MARJOLEIN VAN DE WATER

**SECTION:** Ten Eerste

**LENGTH:** 570 woorden

## President Correa noemt Amerikanen 'imperialistische vijand'

Alles wijst erop dat Ecuador politiek asiel zal verlenen aan de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden. Het is een uitgelezen mogelijkheid voor de linkse president Rafael Correa om de door hem gehate Verenigde Staten opnieuw dwars te zitten.

'Het gaat op de eerste plaats om mensenrechten', aldus de Ecuadoraanse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken Ricardo Patiño gisteren tijdens een persconferentie in Vietnam, waar hij op staatsbezoek is. Hij zei dat Ecuador de asielaanvraag van Snowden overweegt en uit zijn woorden bleek een grote sympathie voor 'de man die licht en transparantie probeert te brengen'. Tegelijkertijd liet de minister zijn afkeer van de VS duidelijk doorschemeren.

Het kleine Zuid-Amerikaanse land toonde zich al vaker een luis in de pels van de Amerikanen. Sinds zijn aantreden in 2007 pleit Correa voor het inperken van de invloed van de VS in Latijns-Amerika. Hij hekelt de steun van de VS aan rechtse dictatoriale regimes die de geschiedenis van het continent kenmerkt. Net als regionale bondgenoten Venezuela, Cuba en Bolivia noemt Correa de VS de 'imperialistische vijand'.

In 2009 sloot Correa een luchtmachtbasis in zijn land van waaruit de VS met satellieten de regio bespioneerden. In 2011 gooide hij de Amerikaanse ambassadrice het land uit nadat uit een door WikiLeaks onthuld telegram was gebleken dat zij Correa had bekritiseerd. Een jaar later herstelden beide landen hun diplomatieke relaties, maar de verhoudingen blijven gespannen.

Vorig jaar verleende Correa politiek asiel aan WikiLeaks-oprichter Julian Assange, die sindsdien in de Ecuadoraanse ambassade in Londen verblijft. Hiermee negeert Ecuador het uitleveringsverzoek van Zweden, dat Assange wil berechten voor een verkrachtingszaak. Dit tot grote ergernis van de VS, die achter Assange aanzitten wegens het publiceren van staatsgeheimen.

Asiel verlenen aan Snowden gaat echter nog een stapje verder. De 30-jarige Amerikaan wordt gezocht wegens landverraad, terwijl tegen Assange nooit een officieel uitleveringsverzoek is ingediend door de VS. De relatie tussen de VS en Ecuador zal behoorlijk op scherp komen te staan als Ecuador de klokkenluider besluit te beschermen.

Het verzoek van Snowden komt op een moment dat Correa zwaar onder vuur ligt vanwege een mediawet die maandag van kracht is geworden. De wet maakt een vergaande regeringscontrole op journalistieke publicaties mogelijk. Media kunnen administratieve straffen en boetes verwachten als zij bijvoorbeeld de president bekritisieren.

De Interamerikaanse Vereniging voor de Pers noemde het 'de ernstigste verslechtering van persvrijheid en vrijheid van meningsuiting in de recente geschiedenis van Latijns-Amerika'. De president verdedigt de wet door te wijzen op de noodzaak de media te 'democratiseren'. Het medialandschap van Ecuador wordt gekenmerkt door monopolieposities van mediaconglomeraten die op handen zijn van de rechtse oppositie.

Door op het verzoek van Snowden in te gaan, hoopt Correa zijn imago op te poetsen en zich te profileren als iemand die de vrijheid van meningsuiting beschermt. Door openlijk in te gaan tegen de wensen van de VS, wil Correa bovendien zijn machtspositie in de regio versterken. Na de dood van Hugo Chávez, oud president van Venezuela, probeert Correa diens rol van regionale linkse leider over te nemen.

Vorig jaar kreeg ook WikiLeaks-oprichter Julian Assange asiel.

# de Volkskrant

26 juni 2013 woensdag

**Ook Poetin zal Snowden niet uitleveren**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER FOKKE OBBEMA

**SECTION:** Binnenland; Blz. 10

**LENGTH:** 663 woorden

## Vlucht klokkenluider leidt tot spanningen tussen VS, China en Rusland

De Russische president Poetin wil dat Edward Snowden zo snel mogelijk vertrekt uit zijn land. De Amerikaanse klokkenluider blijkt zich nog in het transitgedeelte van een Moskous vliegveld te bevinden. Poetin gaf aan dat hij niet van plan is Snowden uit te leveren aan de Amerikanen, omdat er geen uitleveringsverdrag tussen beide landen bestaat **en Snowden in zijn ogen niets heeft misdaan.**

Maar Poetin wil de betrekkingen met de VS ook niet verder belasten. Snowdens aankomst was een verrassing voor Rusland, stelt hij. Amerikaanse beschuldigingen dat het land de VS expres zou tegenwerken deed hij af als 'onzin'. Volgens WikiLeaks is Ecuador de eindbestemming van Snowden, maar **de klokkenluidersorganisatie hult zich in zwijgen over route en tijdstip van zijn reis.**

De vorige etappe daarvan leidde tot een felle polemiek tussen China en de VS. China wijst alle verantwoordelijkheid voor de vlucht van Snowden uit Hongkong van de hand. Maar volgens de VS is China verantwoordelijk voor de 'welooverwogen keuze om een voortvluchtige vrij te laten ondanks een geldig arrestatiebevel'. Een woordvoerder van de Chinese regering noemt die bewering 'ongegrond en onacceptabel'.

Officieel waren de autoriteiten in Hongkong verantwoordelijk voor het besluit Snowden te laten gaan. Maar voor Peking kwam diens vertrek bepaald goed uit. **Zijn onthullingen over Amerikaanse af luisterpraktijken hadden hem in de Chinese publieke opinie tot een held gemaakt.** Uitlevering aan de Amerikanen was derhalve geen optie, asielverlening evenmin, want dat zou een te groot affront voor de VS zijn geweest. Het besluit Snowden geen strobreed in de weg te leggen bij zijn gang naar Moskou was voor de Chinese autoriteiten dan ook de perfecte tussenweg.

The New York Times stelde dinsdag dat de hoogste leiders in Peking bij dat besluit betrokken waren. De krant citeerde een anonieme Chinese journalist met toegang tot autoriteiten in zowel Hongkong als Peking, die stelt dat president Xi Jinping persoonlijk op de hoogte werd gehouden. Een projectgroep onder leiding van oud-minister van Buitenlandse Zaken Yang Jiechi was verantwoording aan hem schuldig.

Direct contact met Snowden werd aan Hongkong overgelaten. Peking wilde niet dat Snowden, mocht hij weer in Amerikaanse handen vallen, zou kunnen verklappen wat de Chinezen van hem hadden willen weten. Door te kiezen voor een vrijwillig vertrek werd een langdurig juridisch gevecht over uitlevering in Hongkong voorkomen.

De woedende reactie van de VS, die bij monde van minister Kerry waarschuwde voor niet nader genoemde 'gevolgen', wordt door China met een korrel zout genomen. Die waarschuwing is 'ongefundeerd', aldus het Chinese ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken, onder verwijzing naar de officiële versie, waarin uitsluitend Hongkong een rol speelt. China gaat ervan uit dat een topbijeenkomst tussen beide landen, een dialoog over veiligheid en economie, volgende maand gewoon doorgaat.

Amerikaanse inlichtingendiensten zijn ondertussen druk met het minimaliseren van de schade van Snowdens optreden. Van alle informatie waar hij toegang toe zou kunnen hebben gehad, is inmiddels de beveiligingscode gewijzigd. De Amerikanen gaan uit van het voor hen slechtst denkbare scenario, namelijk dat hij zowel met de Chinezen als met de Russen zijn informatie heeft gedeeld.

Verder onderzoeken de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten of Snowden al voor zijn vlucht naar Hongkong contacten met China onderhield. Zij sluiten niet uit dat hij door Chinese geheime agenten werd 'gerund'. Dinsdag publiceerde een krant in Hongkong nog een gedeelte van een eerder afgenomen interview. Daarin geeft Snowden aan dat hij van meet af aan gericht was op het verzamelen van gevoelige informatie. 'Mijn baan gaf me toegang tot lijsten van computers wereldwijd die de NSA hackte. Daarom heb ik de baan drie maanden geleden genomen.'

'Hoogste leiders China betrokken bij vertrek Snowden uit Hongkong'

# de Volkskrant

27 juni 2013 donderdag

**Als Snowden mijn advies had gevraagd, had ik hem gezegd: doe het niet**

**BYLINE:** THEO KOEL...

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 621 woorden

Interview Kathleen Clark

Een zekere sympathie heeft ze wel voor hem, maar is hij wel een echte klokkenluider?

In haar jonge jaren werkte de Amerikaanse hoogleraar Kathleen Clark zonder het te weten voor een 'onderaannemer' van de Amerikaanse CIA. Daarin onderscheidt ze zich van haar landgenoot Edward Snowden, die bewust ging werken voor een bedrijf dat zaken deed met een andere geheime dienst, NSA. Hij wilde de wereldwijde spionagepraktijken van deze organisatie blootleggen en deed dat.

Clark (51) koestert 'een zekere sympathie' voor de klokkenluider die de afgelopen weken voor internationale ophef zorgde. Hij heeft zich, voor zover bekend, niet laten verleiden tot het 'dumpen van data' zoals de Amerikaanse militair Bradley Manning via WikiLeaks.

Clark, verbonden aan de Washington University, is een expert op het gebied van juridische ethiek. Ze is in Nederland om in academische kring haar licht te laten schijnen over onder meer het Huis voor Klokkenluiders, een initiatief van SP-Kamerlid Ronald van Raak. Hij wil personen bescherming bieden die misstanden bij de overheid of in het bedrijfsleven aan de kaak stellen. Clark sprak gisteren met Van Raak over het initiatief-wetsvoorstel dat vandaag in de Tweede Kamer aan de orde komt.

'In de VS hebben we honderden wetten ter bescherming van klokkenluiders, de eerste is al 150 jaar oud,' zegt topjuriste Clark. Ze denkt echter niet dat Snowden, die de VS ontvluchtte, zich daarop kan beroepen. 'Hem wordt diefstal van staatseigendom ten laste gelegd en spionage omdat hij geheime informatie doorspeeld heeft aan niet-bevoegden (Britse en Amerikaanse kranten, red.). Hij had getekend voor geheimhouding. Medewerkers van geheime diensten vallen niet onder wetgeving die klokkenluiders bescherming biedt.'

De invloedrijke Senator Dianne Feinstein noemde Snowden een landverrader. Denken de meeste Amerikanen zo over hem?

'Mevrouw Feinstein is een ervaren politicus. Als ze zo'n opmerking maakt, wil ze daarmee politiek voordeel behalen. Ze denkt de gevoelens onder de bevolking te vertolken. Daarbij komt dat de Patriot Act, een wet die na de aanslagen van '9/11' tot stand gekomen is, volgens de regering het recht geeft op grote schaal informatie te vergaren. Veel mensen kijken naar de affaire vanuit dat oogpunt.'

Kunt u zich verplaatsen in een andere optiek, die van Snowden?

'Ik probeer dat wel, omwille van de discussie. Als hij mijn advies gevraagd had, zou ik zeggen: doe het niet. Ik weet niet of Snowden bij iemand te rade is gegaan. In mijn lessen - sinds deze week geef ik die ook aan de Universiteit Utrecht - zeg ik altijd dat een klokkenluider iemand in vertrouwen moet nemen. Een echtgenote, een buurman, een dominee. Niet alleen om impulsief handelen te voorkomen maar ook om de gevolgen van een riskante stap onder ogen te zien.

**Sommige klokkenluiders worden bejubeld om hun moed en zelfopoffering in het belang van de 'publieke zaak',** maar de gevolgen in de persoonlijke sfeer kunnen enorm zijn. Verlies van werk, inkomsten, sociale contacten. Bovendien: een klokkenluider kan het ook bij het verkeerde eind hebben. Hij ziet bijvoorbeeld gevaren die er niet zijn. Anderen kunnen hem of haar daarop wijzen.'

Was u, als Amerikaans staatsburger, geschokt door de onthullingen van Snowden?

(na lang aarzelen): 'Ik maak me wel zorgen. Moet ik nu, als ik een discreet gesprek wil voeren, een wegwerptelefoon aanschaffen zoals drugsdealers doen? Maar ik ben bij lange na niet zo geschokt als toen ik hoorde over marteling zoals waterboarding (schijnverdrinkingen, red.) van gevangenen door de CIA.'

In de VS hebben we honderden wetten ter bescherming van klokkenluiders

Moet ik nu voor een discreet gesprek een wegwerptelefoon kopen, net als een drugsdealer?

# de Volkskrant

27 juni 2013 donderdag

**Verblijf op vliegveld Moskou wordt een langdurige affaire**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER FOKKE OBBEMA

**SECTION:** Buitenland

**LENGTH:** 423 woorden

De parallel met Tom Hanks in de film *The Terminal* begint zich op te dringen, nu de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden vier dagen vast zit in een transitruimte op een vliegveld in Moskou. Zijn hoop om dit niemandsland te kunnen verlaten kreeg woensdag een knauw, toen de Ecuadoriaanse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken, Ricardo Patino, aangaf dat het maanden kan duren voordat zijn land een besluit heeft kunnen nemen over Snowdens asielaanvraag.

In het geval van WikiLeaks-oprichter Julian Assange deed zijn land daar ook twee maanden over en alle risico's moeten worden meegewogen, betoogde Patino, onder verwijzing naar mogelijke tegenmaatregelen van de VS. Een lichtpuntje voor Snowden was dat Venezuela zich woensdag als

kandidaat-asieland meldde. Maar of dat sneller gaat, is de vraag - de klokkenluider heeft daar vooralsnog geen aanvraag ingediend.

De impasse waarin hij verzeild is geraakt, tekende zich eerder deze week af toen de VS zijn paspoort ongeldig verklaarden. Daardoor kan hij niet verder reizen. Van de Russische autoriteiten heeft hij geen gevaar te duchten, nu president Poetin heeft gezegd hem niet te zullen uitleveren. Maar hoe eerder hij weg is, des te beter, heeft Poetin duidelijk gemaakt. Officieel mag Snowden zich niet langer dan 24 uur in de transitruimte bevinden, maar het Sheremetyevo-vliegveld maakt een uitzondering.

Op juridisch vlak kreeg Snowden nog een knauw. Hij had de voormalige Spaanse onderzoeksrechter Baltasar Garzón gevraagd hem bij te staan, maar die liet woensdag zonder opgave van redenen weten dat niet te doen. Eerder hielp Garzón wel Assange. Diens organisatie WikiLeaks meldde dat Snowden 'veilig en gezond' is, maar bleef vaag over zijn nabije toekomst.

Temidden van de Sovjet-architectuur van Terminal F gaan Snowdens gedachten wellicht uit naar Tom Hanks, wiens hoofdrol in The Terminal gebaseerd was op het lot van de Iraniër Mehran Karimi Nasseri. Die verbleef maar liefst achttien jaar, van 1988 tot 2006, in een terminal van het vliegveld Charles de Gaulle. Ook hem ontbrak het aan een geldig reisdocument.

Mocht Snowden uiteindelijk in de handen van de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdienst vallen, dan leidt dat vermoedelijk tot de verdere verspreiding van de staatsgeheimen die hij in zijn bezit heeft. Volgens Glenn Greenwald, de journalist van de Britse krant The Guardian die als eerste over de kwestie berichtte, heeft Snowden aan 'diverse personen' digitale kopieën doorgespeeld. Die moeten direct na zijn arrestatie wereldkundig worden gemaakt, luidt Snowdens instructie.

# de Volkskrant

27 juni 2013 donderdag

**Amerikaanse regering is Assange niet vergeten**

**BYLINE:** THE NEW YORK TIMES

**SECTION:** Buitenland; Blz. 15

**LENGTH:** 792 woorden

De zaak-Snowden brengt ook WikiLeaks-oprichter Julian Assange terug in het nieuws. Stilletjes snuffelt de FBI overal naar zijn club. Tot in IJsland.

Twee jaar geleden kreeg de toenmalige IJslandse minister van Binnenlandse Zaken Ogmundur Jonasson een dringend bericht van de Amerikaanse autoriteiten. Daarin waarschuwden ze dat 'er een aanval op de databestanden van de IJslandse overheid' door hackers dreigde en dat de FBI enkele agenten zou sturen om te helpen bij het onderzoek.

Toen de 'acht of negen' FBI-agenten arriveerden, bleek dat zij niet waren gekomen om een hackeraanval tegen te gaan, maar om materiaal te verzamelen over WikiLeaks, zegt Jonasson. De organisatie die de afgelopen jaren miljoenen vertrouwelijke Amerikaanse documenten heeft gepubliceerd, heeft veel medewerkers in IJsland. Jonasson vroeg de FBI-agenten te vertrekken, omdat ze niet eerlijk het doel van hun bezoek hadden opgegeven.



De IJslandse operatie maakte deel uit van een uitgebreid onderzoek naar WikiLeaks en haar oprichter Julian Assange naar aanleiding van de publicatie van honderdduizenden militaire en diplomatieke documenten in 2010. Sinds de arrestatie van Bradley Manning, de militair die ervan wordt verdacht dat hij de documenten heeft laten uitlekken, is de FBI stilletjes bezig materiaal over de zaak te verzamelen.

Het leek erop dat iedereen Assange zo'n beetje was vergeten, totdat hij afgelopen week opdook als bondgenoot van Edward Snowden, die de activiteiten van de inlichtingendienst NSA aan de kaak stelde. WikiLeaks had al een tijd geen grote onthullingen meer gedaan, de fondsen begonnen op te drogen en verscheidene kopstukken van de organisatie waren opgestapt na interne ruzies. Assange zelf zit al ruim een jaar in de ambassade van Ecuador in Londen om uitlevering aan Zweden te ontlopen. Daar wordt hij gezocht op beschuldiging van seksuele vergripen.

Maar de VS zijn Assange niet vergeten. Uit gerechtelijke documenten blijkt dat verscheidene overheidsdiensten betrokken zijn bij het onderzoek naar WikiLeaks en Assange. Een grand jury (die moet bepalen of er voldoende aanleiding is voor een proces) heeft al dagvaardingen voor getuigen uitgevaardigd. Een woordvoerder van het ministerie van Justitie bevestigt dat het onderzoek nog steeds loopt, maar weigerde verdere details te geven.

#### Juridisch mijnenveld

Met een strafrechtelijke vervolging van Assange zou de regering-Obama zich in een juridisch mijnenveld begeven. WikiLeaks is een internationale organisatie en anders dan Manning en Snowden werkten Assange en de andere medewerkers van WikiLeaks niet voor de Amerikaanse overheid.

WikiLeaks zegt dat het als een persbureau fungeerde door in het belang van het publiek informatie te publiceren samen met gevestigde nieuwsorganisaties zoals de The New York Times en The Guardian. Als de Amerikaanse regering WikiLeaks en Assange zou aanklagen als mede-samenzweerders, zou zij moeten aantonen dat WikiLeaks en Assange, anders dan hun partners, niet tot de media behoren.

'Gezien de agressie van de regering in de kwestie Snowden, ga ik ervan uit dat ze zullen doorgaan met de Assange-zaak op basis van de samenzweringstheorie', zegt James Goodale, een burgerrechtenadvocaat. 'Ook al lijkt het dat WikiLeaks in aanmerking komt voor bescherming op basis van het Eerste Amendement van de grondwet.'

Goodale is auteur van het boek *Fighting for the Press*. Hij werkte eerder voor The New York Times. Hij onderstreept dat nog nooit een journalist in de VS met succes is aangeklaagd op basis van een samenzweringsaanklacht. The New York Times zegt dat het niet is benaderd in het kader van het WikiLeaks-onderzoek.

Assange zegt in een verklaring tegenover de krant dat het ministerie van Justitie en de FBI 'verblind zijn door hun ijver om zich te ontdoen van publicisten die de waarheid spreken tegenover de macht'.

Het justitieel onderzoek wordt grotendeels in het geheim uitgevoerd. Maar een paar elementen zijn boven water gekomen. Zo verzocht een federale aanklager in Virginia Twitter in december 2010 om informatie over de inschrijvingen van onder anderen Manning, Assange en de vroegere WikiLeaks-activist Birgitta Jonsdottir, nu lid van het IJslandse parlement.

Vorige week meldde Herbert Snorrason, een oud-lid van WikiLeaks die ooit goed bevriend was met Assange, dat Google op last van justitie alle informatie over hem, zoals zijn Gmail, moest afgeven. Hoewel er geen reden werd gegeven, denkt Snorrason dat het is 'omdat ik een paar gesprekken heb gehad met een Australiër met wit haar'. Aanhangers van WikiLeaks in IJsland zijn aangeslagen door het FBI-gewroet. Jonsdottir. 'We gaan allemaal ten onder door de paranoia.'

Birgitta Jonsdottir ex-WikiLeaks, nu parlementariër in IJsland

We gaan allemaal ten onder door de paranoia

# de Volkskrant

28 juni 2013 vrijdag

**Ecuador heeft voor Snowden geen ruzie met VS over**

**BYLINE:** VAN ONZE VERSLAGGEVER

**SECTION:** Buitenland; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 499 woorden

Ecuador lijkt niet meer van plan klokkenluider Edward Snowden de helpende hand toe te steken. Een woordvoerder van de regering ontkende donderdag dat de Amerikaan een verzoek tot politiek asiel had ingediend.

Ook zou Snowden niet door Ecuador geholpen zijn bij zijn vlucht van Hong Kong naar Moskou, zoals veelvuldig is beweerd - Ecuadoraanse diplomaten hebben hem niet aan tijdelijke reispapieren geholpen. Nu Ecuador afstand van de klokkenluider neemt, lijkt Venezuela nog de enige optie voor hem.

Het aanvankelijke enthousiasme van Ecuador om Snowden op te vangen, verdween toen de VS eerder deze week economische druk gingen inzetten. Eind juli lopen twee handelsovereenkomsten tussen beide landen af, die het Zuid-Amerikaanse land veel handelsvoordelen opleveren. Met name de Ecuadoraanse bloemensector, waarin 100 duizend vrouwen werken, zou een harde klap krijgen bij niet-verlenging.

'Onze regering zal landen niet belonen voor slecht gedrag', zo waarschuwde Robert Menendez, voorzitter van de Amerikaanse Senaatscommissie voor Buitenlandse Zaken. De Ecuadoraanse regering ontkende te zijn bezweken: 'Ecuador accepteert van niemand bedreigingen en marchandeert niet met zijn waarden.'

Snowden bevindt zich nog altijd in de transitruimte van een luchthaven in Moskou, wetend dat president Poetin heeft gezegd hem liever kwijt dan rijk te zijn. Venezuela lijkt nu zijn beste kans, aangezien president Nicolas Maduro heeft gezegd dat de Amerikaan in zijn land 'vrijwel zeker' politiek asiel tegemoet kan zien.

Bij verlening daarvan zouden de VS het nakijken hebben, aldus advocaat Geert-Jan Knoops, gespecialiseerd in uitleveringsrecht. 'Als een land aan Snowden politiek asiel verleent, zal uitlevering juridisch niet meer mogelijk zijn.' Tegen een Amerikaans uitleveringsverzoek heeft Snowden dan 'een goede verdediging', zo meent Knoops. 'Hij kan dan aanvoeren dat zijn vervolging in de VS politiek geëngageerd is, namelijk op grond van zijn politieke overtuiging. Dat zal hij aannemelijk moeten maken. Lukt dat, dan staat de rechtspraak in uitleveringszaken geen uitlevering toe.'

Die juridische achtergrond verklaart de verwoede pogingen van de VS om te voorkomen dat Snowden waar dan ook asiel verkrijgt. Door zijn paspoort in te trekken hebben de Amerikanen al zijn vlucht gestuit - het opvoeren van de druk op allerlei landen perkt zijn bewegingsruimte nog verder in.

President Obama, die op bezoek in Senegal is, deed het voorkomen alsof de zaak niet zo belangrijk is. 'Ik ga geen vliegtuigen inzetten om een 29-jarige hacker te pakken te krijgen', zei hij, als antwoord op suggesties dat hij een volgend vliegtuig van Snowden met militaire macht naar de grond zou moeten

dwingen. Ook gaf de president aan geen contact over Snowden met zijn Chinese of Russische ambtsgeenoot te hebben gehad. Obama: 'Dat is ook niet nodig.' De uitlevering van een enkele verdachte 'ga ik niet verheffen tot iets waarbij ik koehandel met landen moet gaan bedrijven over een groot aantal andere kwesties'.

# de Volkskrant

29 juni 2013 zaterdag

## Van klokkenluider tot schaakstuk

**SECTION:** Buitenland; Blz. 14

**LENGTH:** 849 woorden

De week van Paul Brill

Wat bezielt de regering-Obama toch om zoveel misbaar te maken over het feit dat eerst China en vervolgens Rusland geen gehoor heeft gegeven aan het Amerikaanse verzoek om uitlevering van Edward Snowden? Zou de Chinese regering hem willens en wetens uit Hongkong hebben laten vertrekken, dan zou dat 'zeer verontrustend' zijn, zei minister van Buitenlandse Zaken John Kerry. En hij waarschuwde voor ernstige schade aan de Amerikaans-Russische betrekkingen als Moskou een zelfde gedragslijn zou volgen.

Los van de vraag of je Snowdens klokkenspel prachtig, nuttig of vals vindt, kan het natuurlijk niet verbazen dat de Amerikaanse autoriteiten zinnen op justitiële vervolging van de man die zo pontificaal zijn geheimhoudingsbelofte heeft verbroken en het land fikse schade heeft berokkend. Maar zeker gezien wat hij heeft onthuld over de internationale activiteiten van de geheime kijk- en luisterdienst NSA, is het tamelijk naïef of anders wel aanmatigend om te verwachten dat Peking en Moskou de Amerikanen prompt ter wille zijn in deze zaak. Door het ongenoegen daarover zo breed te etaleren, maakt Washington de hele affaire alleen nog maar groter en dus ook het onvermogen om Snowden te pakken te krijgen pijnlijker.

Voor de wereld van de spionage gaat bij uitstek het spreekwoord op: wie kaatst, kan de bal verwachten. Laten we voor de aardigheid de zaak even omdraaien. Wat zou Washington doen als een Chinese of Russische Snowden met evenveel tamtam een heenkomen zou zoeken naar de Verenigde Staten? Toegegeven: de kans daarop is gering, want een autocratisch regime weet gevoelige informatie altijd beter te vergrendelen dan een democratie en deinst er ook niet voor terug om een uitgeweken geheim agent op gruwelijke wijze te liquideren, zoals gebeurde met Alexander Litvinenko in Londen. Maar ondenkbaar is de komst van zo'n Chinese of Russische klokkenluider niet, en dan zou de Amerikaanse regering hem toch ook niet linea recta op het vliegtuig naar Peking of Moskou zetten - zo niet uit bezorgdheid over wat hem daar boven het hoofd hangt, dan toch in elk geval vanwege de interessante informatie die hij allicht te bieden heeft.

Ik maak me geen illusies over de beweegredenen van de Chinezen en de Russen om Snowden op vrije voeten te laten. Of hij het wil of niet, de man is natuurlijk geweldig anti-Amerikaans propagandamateriaal. Vooral voor het Rusland van Vladimir Poetin, die als oud-KGB-man hierbij zijn vingers zal aflikken. Aan dissidenten in eigen land heeft hij een broertje dood, maar deze Amerikaan met al zijn belastende onthullingen is een geschenk uit de hemel.

Hier openbaart zich ook de tragiek van Snowden. Laten we aannemen dat hij met de beste intenties de rol van klokkenluider op zich heeft genomen. Dan begrijp ik toch niet goed waarom hij niet meteen

zijn toevlucht heeft genomen tot het land waar hij mogelijk asiel wil vragen (Ecuador, IJsland), om pas daarna in de openbaarheid te treden. Overmacht of naïviteit? Door eerst naar Hongkong te gaan en vervolgens af te reizen naar Moskou is hij tegen wil en dank een pion in het schaakspel tussen rivaliserende mogendheden geworden.

Met name Moskou is geen oord waar je als Amerikaanse klokkenluider graag verblijft. Je laadt onwillekeurig de verdenking op je dat er niet louter nobele motieven in het spel zijn. En met Poetin moet je permanent je knopen tellen. Nu komt Snowden nog goed in zijn kraam te pas. Maar van heuse affiniteit is natuurlijk geen sprake. Mocht hij om een of andere reden niet spoedig kunnen doorreizen, dan valt zelfs niet geheel uit te sluiten dat hij op een gegeven moment ook interessant wordt als ruilobject, in het geval dat Poetin dringend verlegen zit om een Amerikaanse concessie.

Een Koude Oorlogsscenario? Jazeker, en we kunnen maar beter onder ogen zien dat, ook al is de Oost-Westverhouding over het geheel genomen drastisch gewijzigd, sommige Koude Oorlogsreflexen een taai leven leiden in Moskou. Of misschien kunnen we beter van een ideologisch reveil spreken. Bij voortdurend kiest Rusland positie tegenover het Westen (Syrië, Iran) en niet zelden wordt een antiwesterse retoriek gebezigd die herinneringen aan oude communistische tijden oproept. Soms spelen binnenlandse motieven een rol - zoals de vrees voor verbreiding van het moslim-fundamentalisme in het geval van Syrië - maar die komen toch op de tweede plaats. 'We hebben wederom te maken met een Russische regering die de wereld vanuit een zwart-witperspectief ziet: wat slecht is voor ons, is goed voor hen, en vice versa', schreef columniste Anne Applebaum deze week in The Washington Post.

Terecht laat het Westen zich daarin niet meesleuren en wordt er alles aan gedaan om de dialoog met Moskou gaande te houden - bijvoorbeeld bij de NAVO in Brussel, waar met een bijna aandoenlijke devotie wordt gesproken over het belang en de constructieve inslag van het vaste overleg met de Russen in de NAVO-Rusland Raad. Maar het heeft ook geen zin om de werkelijkheid te ontkennen: Moskou is veeleer tegenpartij dan bondgenoot.

Oud-KGB'er Poetin likt zijn vingers af bij affaire-Snowden

## Bijlage 2. Krantenartikelen De Telegraaf

# De Telegraaf

10 juni 2013 maandag

**NSA geheimzinnige terreurbestrijder**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 456 woorden

NEW YORK, maandag

De regering-Obama heeft een gerechtelijk onderzoek ingelast naar de lekken waaruit blijkt dat de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten op grote schaal meekijken en meeluisteren op het internet en het telefoonverkeer.

Volgens het Britse blad The Guardian en The Washington Post is een ex-CIA agent (29) verantwoordelijk voor het lek. De agent, Edward Snowden, zou hebben gevraagd zijn identiteit prijs te geven. **Als motief gaf Snowden, die als technisch medewerker vier jaar bij de NSA werkte, op dat hij het publiek wil informeren wat er voor hen gedaan wordt en wat er tegen hen gedaan wordt.**

De Amerikaanse overheid probeert nu na de publicatie ook de angst voor de enorme spionageoperatie wat weg te nemen door wat meer openheid te geven over het werk van the National Security Agency (NSA). Dat zal niet meevallen, want de geheime dienst werd lang in de schaduw gehouden. Die heeft niet voor niets de bijnamen No Such Agency of Never Say Anything.

We kunnen niet meer tellen hoe vaak we geschiedenis hebben geschreven, zonder dat de geschiedenis wist dat we erbij betrokken waren, schrijft de huidige directeur van de NSA, generaal Keith Alexander, trots op de website van de spionnendienst.

Via het project met de naam Prism kan de NSA meekijken in bijna alles wat een internetgebruiker op zijn computer uitvoert. De inhoud van e-mails, een gesprek via Skype, de meest bezochte websites, welke video's worden bekeken en wat voor foto's er zijn bestudeerd: niets blijft geheim.

Ook de Britse afliusterspecialisten kijken door een samenwerkingsverband met de Amerikanen mee op het internet. De Britse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken, William Hague, volgt de koers van de Amerikanen. Hij stelde dit weekeinde dat een zich aan de wet houdende burger niets te vrezen heeft van het programma.

Om de kritiek van de ongekende 'Big Brother'-activiteiten nog wat meer weg te nemen, komen er steeds meer berichten naar buiten van de via de 'meekijkoperatie' voorkomen terreurdaden. Het zou onder meer gaan om een plan voor aanslagen in de ondergrondse van New York.

Daarbij werd de Afghaanse Amerikaan Najibullah Zazi opgepakt nadat hij via internet contact had gezocht met een Yahoo e-mailadres waarvan bekend was dat het tot een Al-Qaeda-leider in Pakistan behoorde.

Hoe de in 1952 opgerichte NSA precies werkt, is niet duidelijk, al sijpelt er steeds meer nieuws uit. Experts zijn er verbaasd over hoe Prism, met een budget van slechts 20 miljoen dollar, draaiende wordt gehouden.

Dat komt vooral doordat het merendeel van de informatie door supercomputers wordt geanalyseerd.

De informatie komt niet alleen via de negen grote internetbedrijven, waaronder Google en Facebook, maar kan ook direct van een glasvezelkabel worden geplukt.

# De Telegraaf

10 juni 2013 maandag

## Oud-CIA agent bekent spionage

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 419 woorden

LONDEN, maandag

Een oud-CIA-medewerker blijkt de klokkenluider die informatie heeft gelekt over surveillanceprogramma's door de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA. Het gaat om de 29-jarige Amerikaan Edward Snowden.

De Britse krant The Guardian en de Amerikaanse krant The Washington Post hebben zijn naam zondag onthuld. Zijn identiteit is op zijn eigen verzoek bekendgemaakt. Snowden is een voormalig technisch medewerker van de CIA die als ingehuurde kracht ook bij de NSA heeft gewerkt. .

The Guardian en The Washington Post hebben de afgelopen dagen meerdere onthullingen gedaan over spionagepraktijken door Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten. Snowden heeft naar eigen zeggen naar de kranten gelekt omdat hij vindt dat de Verenigde Staten aan een geheim spionagesysteem bouwt dat iedere Amerikaan in de gaten houdt, maar zelf geen verantwoording af hoeft te leggen.

Zo blijkt de NSA (National Security Agency) gebruikers van internetdiensten als Google, Facebook en Yahoo op grote schaal in de gaten te gehouden. Dat gebeurt met een geheim computerprogramma, PRISM. Ook verzamelt de NSA telefoongegevens.

Snowden kopieerde drie weken geleden de geheime documenten in het NSA-kantoor op Hawaï. Daarna vloog hij naar Hongkong, waar hij nog verblijft. Snowden vreest dat de CIA hem komt halen en hoopt dat hij asiel kan krijgen in IJsland. Dat land staat bekend als voorvechter van openheid en internetvrijheid.

The Guardian noemt Snowden al in één adem met klokkenluider Bradley Manning. Die Amerikaanse militair staat sinds afgelopen week terecht omdat hij tienduizenden geheime Defensie-documenten naar de website WikiLeaks heeft gelekt.

De Amerikaanse overheid probeert nu na de publicatie ook de angst voor de enorme spionageoperatie wat weg te nemen door wat meer openheid te geven over het werk van the National Security Agency (NSA). Dat zal niet meevallen, want de geheime dienst werd lang in de schaduw gehouden. Die heeft niet voor niets de bijnamen No Such Agency of Never Say Anything .

We kunnen niet meer tellen hoe vaak we geschiedenis hebben geschreven, zonder dat de geschiedenis wist dat we erbij betrokken waren , schrijft de huidige directeur van de NSA, generaal Keith Alexander, trots op de website van de spionnedienst.

Via het project met de naam Prism kan de NSA meekijken in bijna alles wat een internetgebruiker op zijn computer uitvoert. De inhoud van e-mails, een gesprek via Skype, de meest bezochte websites, welke video's worden bekeken en wat voor foto's er zijn bestudeerd: niets blijft geheim.

# De Telegraaf

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Obama in vuurlinie;  
Kritiek op antiterrorbeleid neemt toe door NSA-affaire**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 521 woorden

door Frank van Vliet NEW YORK, dinsdag

De hele veiligheidspolitiek van Barack Obama ligt onder vuur. Van zowel de linker- als de rechterkant krijgt de Amerikaanse president nu kritiek om de geheimzinnigheid waarmee zijn droneprogramma en het bespioneren van het telefoon- en internetverkeer door de National Security Agency (NSA) is omgeven.

De verontwaardigde roep om meer openheid zal waarschijnlijk maar mondjesmaat worden beloond. Obama heeft al aangegeven alle ophef om de NSA-klokkenluider Edward Snowden 'een hype' te vinden. Hij weet zich ook gesteund door een groot aantal Republikeinse en Democratische medestanders die niet mee gaan met al het schandegeroep.

Desondanks kan zelfs een verdediging pijn doen. Laten we niet vergeten dat we nog steeds tegen terroristen vechten. Het is niet toevallig dat het Prism-programma door twee presidenten van verschillende signatuur is voortgezet, zegt de Republikeinse senator Kelly Ayotte over het grootschalige project om internetverkeer van burgers en bedrijven te registreren.

Senator De goede verstaander snapt waar Ayotte heen wil: Obama voert het zelfde antiterrorbeleid als George W. Bush, waar hij als senator nog zo tegen was.

Wat ook pijnlijk is: een Amerikaan die de vrijheid van meningsuiting aanhaalt om te vluchten naar een metropool die als een speciale administratieve regio van het communistische China wordt bestuurd. Het lijkt de wereld op zijn kop. De VS zijn gewend politieke vluchtelingen op te vangen. Dat mensen uit 'the Land of the free' vluchten is ongekend.

Dat Washington er alles aan zal doen om de 29-jarige computerexpert in Hongkong te pakken te krijgen staat wel vast. Dat Washington weinig clementie heeft met klokkenluiders is bekend. Onder president Barack Obama is dat beleid nog verscherpt.

Het levert de president veel kritiek op, onder meer van Daniel Ellsberg, een militaire analist die in 1971 ontdekte dat de Amerikaanse bevolking was voorgelogen over de oorlog in Vietnam en de geheime documenten, the Pentagon Papers, doorspeelde aan The New York Times. Ellsberg ontliet een eis van 115 jaar cel, doordat de rechter meende dat justitie gebruikmaakte van onrechtmatig verkregen bewijs.

Ellsberg neemt het voor Snowden op en stelt dat het klimaat nu veel guurder is voor klokkenluiders dan in zijn tijd. Hij wijst daarbij op het lot van de man achter de Wikileaks, Bradley Manning. Die militair staat nu terecht, maar werd drie jaar onder volgens de VN 'wreed en onmenselijk beleid' vastgehouden.

Dat zijn allemaal zaken waar de liberale aanhang van Obama niet blij mee is. De rechterkant van het politieke spectrum kan dit beleid nog wel door de vingers zien, maar ziet in de enorme spionage maar ook in het schandaal rond de belastingdienst die het op de Tea Party had voorzien, een bewijs voor het door hen gehate 'Big Government.'

Het tumult over zijn veiligheidsbeleid verhindert Obama aan zijn werkelijke politieke agenda, de nieuwe immigratiewetgeving, wapenbeheersing en vermindering van inkomensongelijkheid, te werken. Reden voor het blad The Economist om te schrijven dat 'de oorlog tegen de terreur het Vietnam van Obama is'.

# De Telegraaf

11 juni 2013 dinsdag

**'Ik begrijp dat dit mijn einde betekent'**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 312 woorden

Van onze correspondent NEW YORK, dinsdag

Overtuigd van zijn eigen gelijk, maar doodsbang voor de wraak van de overheid. Dat is de gemoedstoestand van de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden (29) die zich drie weken lang schuilhield in een hotelkamer in Hongkong.

Hij durfde er de deur niet uit en vreest voor zijn leven. Of hij er ook nu nog zit, is onduidelijk. Volgens sommige berichten heeft hij het hotel verlaten.

De man die de wereld vertelde over de grootschalige registratie van het telefoonverkeer en het internet door de Amerikaanse National Security Agency (NSA) at uitsluitend op zijn kamer, was slechts drie keer buiten, legde kussens voor de deur om afluisteren te voorkomen en dook onder een grote deken als hij zijn computer bekeek uit angst dat verborgen camera's zijn wachtwoord zouden oppikken.

Als oud-CIA-medewerker weet hij dat er tal van CIA-agenten werken op het nabijgelegen Amerikaanse consulaat in Hongkong. Zijn e-mail verstuurt hij versleuteld. Hij is ervan overtuigd dat de almachtige computers van de NSA, die het wereldwijde net in de gaten houden, hem zouden kunnen opsporen aan de hand van een analyse van zijn schrijfstijl. Hij vreest de Triades, de lokale maffia, die volgens hem wel eens gelokt kan worden als de Amerikaanse geheime dienst een prijs op zijn hoofd zet en hij is bang voor de Chinese machthebbers. Die zouden hem wel eens kunnen ontvoeren om meer te weten te komen over de werkwijze van de CIA en de NSA.

Identiteit Snowden was dat alles bekend, maar de 29-jarige heeft geen moment getwijfeld om zijn identiteit prijs te geven. In lijn met zijn schuilnaam die hij bij zijn contacten met journalisten van The Washington Post en The Guardian gebruikte Verox, waarheidsverteller in het Latijn wil hij openheid. Ik begrijp dat ik zal boeten voor mijn daden en dat het vrijgeven van deze informatie mijn einde betekent.



# De Telegraaf

12 juni 2013 woensdag

**Edward Snowden: held of verrader?;  
Klokkenluider nam duizenden zeer geheime documenten mee**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 8

**LENGTH:** 505 woorden

door Frank van Vliet NEW YORK, woensdag

Een verrader die Amerikaanse levens op het spel heeft gezet. De Republikeinse voorman John Boehner heeft een keihard oordeel over klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die bekendmaakte dat de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdienst NSA op grote schaal meekijkt op het internet. Voor bijna 50.000 Amerikanen, die een online petitie hebben ondertekend waarin het Witte Huis om gratie voor de 29-jarige wordt gevraagd, is hij echter een held.

De affaire is trouwens nog lang niet ten einde. Wat nu naar boven is gekomen is slechts het topje van de ijsberg. De komende weken en maanden komen er nog meer onthullingen uit het materiaal dat Snowden naar de pers heeft doorgespeeld.

Dat beloofde Glenn Greenwald, de journalist van the Guardian die de zaak aan het rollen bracht. Volgens Greenwald heeft Snowden the Guardian en the Washington Post duizenden documenten toegespeeld. En van de 41 'Topsecret'-bestanden zijn tot nu slechts vier gepubliceerd, zei Greenwald in een interview.

Van de man die dit publieke debat heeft veroorzaakt was gistermiddag geen spoor te vinden. Snowden is vertrokken uit zijn hotel in Hongkong, waar hij zich drie weken lang had verschanst, en was gisteravond nog spoorloos. Of hij zich nog in de miljoenenstad waar zijn foto op iedere voorpagina prijkt bevindt, is onzeker. Eerder had hij aangegeven voor zijn leven te vrezen als de CIA een prijs op zijn hoofd zou zetten.

Of dat realiteitszin of paranoia is, zal blijken. Het Amerikaanse ministerie van Justitie heeft hem nog niet officieel aangeklaagd. Daar wordt aan gewerkt. Bij de hele discussie of Snowden nu een boef of een heilige is, worden voorbeelden uit het verleden aangehaald. Hij wordt het meest vergeleken met Daniel Ellsberg, een militaire analist die in 1971 ontdekte dat de Amerikaanse bevolking was voorgelogen over de oorlog in Vietnam en de geheime documenten (The Pentagon Papers) doorspeelde naar the New York Times.

Het Witte Huis wijst echter op een essentieel verschil. Toen hielden de autoriteiten gegevens achter. Het hele afluistersysteem was echter bekend bij leden van het Congres en staat onder toezicht van justitie. Er is volgens president Barack Obama dan ook geen enkele aanleiding om het Prism-spionageprogramma af te schaffen. Obama heeft genoeg steun in het Congres voor de voortzetting.

Hoe lang de klokkenluider ondergedoken kan blijven is onzeker. Hij zal in ieder geval zijn spaargeld moeten aanspreken, want zijn goedbetaalde baan is hij kwijt. Het bedrijf waarvoor hij op Hawaï werkte, Booz Allen, heeft hem ontslagen. Het feit dat Snowden geheime informatie heeft gelekt heeft de onderneming geschokt.

Privésector

Dat Snowden als werknemer van een privéonderneming toegang had tot geheime regeringsinformatie is niet zo vreemd. De Amerikaanse geheime diensten draaien voor een groot deel op dit soort buitenstaanders. Bijna een half miljoen werknemers uit de privésector hebben een

betrouwbaarheidsverklaring ontvangen waarmee ze mogen werken met 'Secret'- of 'Topsecret'-documenten.

# De Telegraaf

13 juni 2013 donderdag

## Snowden en vriendin lichten sluier op

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 542 woorden

Van onze correspondent NEW YORK, donderdag

Klokkenluider Edward Snowden zegt dat hij niet in Hongkong is om de Amerikaanse justitie te ontlopen. Hij wil de stad en het juridische systeem daar gebruiken om meer uitleg te geven over het in zijn ogen schandalige afluisteren van het internationale telefoonverkeer en het bespioneren van internetdata door de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA.

De 29-jarige voormalige CIA-werknemer en computeranalist zegt ook dat hij noch een verrader, noch een held is. Ik ben een Amerikaan. Dat verklaart hij in een interview met the South China Morning, de krant die hem in Hongkong opspoorde nadat hij was vertrokken uit zijn hotelkamer waar hij zich wekenlang schuil had gehouden.

Snowden zegt in het interview ook dat hij in Hongkong wil blijven. Ik heb meerdere kansen gehad om te vertrekken. Mijn intentie is om het gerechtshof hier en de mensen van Hongkong te laten beslissen over mijn lot.

De klokkenluider lijkt bewust voor Hongkong, dat onder de invloedssfeer van China valt, te hebben gekozen. Hij is het niet eens met de mensen die menen dat dit een vergissing is omdat de metropool een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS heeft.

Volgens Snowden hackt de NSA ook routinematig tienduizenden computers, in China, Hongkong en de rest van de wereld. Doelwit zijn politici, zakenmensen, studenten maar ook de Chinese Universiteit in Hongkong. En in plaats van zich alleen te richten op individuele computers of netwerken, hackt de geheime dienst ook grote internetknooppunten waar miljoenen computers op zijn aangesloten en tapt daar het verkeer af.

Ook de vriendin van Snowden treedt uit de schaduw. Lindsay Mills, die voordat haar vriend met de noorderzon vertrok uit het huis waarin hij met haar op Hawaï woonde, laat op haar blog weten dat ik me alleen voel, verdwaald op zee, zonder kompas.

Veel informatie verstrekt ze niet in haar wollige en artistieke teksten waarin ze haar vriend uitsluitend E. noemt. Het wordt ook niet duidelijk waar ze nu verblijft. Op de foto's waarop ze samen met Snowden te zien is kun je zijn gezicht niet zien. Kennelijk wist ze van Snowdens geheime werk en vond ze dat wel interessant. Mills, die deel uitmaakte van een artistieke paaldansgroep, schreef voor een voorstelling: Ik ben een mysterieuze internationale vrouw. Tenminste in de show. Een beetje 007.

### Claims

Ondertussen hebben grote Amerikaanse internetfirma's, waaronder Google, Facebook en Microsoft, de Amerikaanse regering gevraagd of ze meer openheid mogen geven over de verzoeken die ze van de geheime dienst krijgen om hen toegang tot het web te verschaffen. Volgens Google zijn de claims dat

het bedrijf de spionnen veel gebruik laat maken van hun informatie onjuist en voedt alle geheimzinnigheid alleen maar die speculatie.

De Amerikaanse regering houdt vol dat het bespioneren noodzakelijk is in de strijd tegen terrorisme. Uit een peiling van een Amerikaans tv-station blijkt dat maar een kleine meerderheid (53%) het daarmee eens is. Het afluisteren van gewone Amerikanen wordt door 58 procent afgewezen maar door 75 procent goedgekeurd als er de verdenking van terrorisme bestaat. Overigens is Snowden nog niet officieel aangeklaagd noch is er om zijn uitlevering door de autoriteiten in de Verenigde Staten gevraagd.

# De Telegraaf

13 juni 2013 donderdag

**Nederland is naïef;**

**'Ik geef graag mijn privacy op als hierdoor levens kunnen worden gered'**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 6

**LENGTH:** 579 woorden

Ruim de helft van de deelnemers aan de Stelling van de Dag vindt het helemaal geen probleem dat veiligheidsdiensten uitgebreid meekijken in onze computers, Facebook of mobiele telefoonverkeer. Hoe kunnen anders bomaanslagen worden voorkomen? Denken de mensen die zich opwinden over deze praktijken dat veiligheidsdiensten gedachten kunnen lezen of dat terroristen komen vertellen wat ze van plan zijn?

Deze week werd bekend dat Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten gebruik maken van gespecialiseerde bedrijven om zo alle internetverkeer te volgen. Ook de Nederlandse AIVD krijgt zo informatie. Een meerderheid van 66 procent zegt zich absoluut geen zorgen te maken over de activiteiten van de AIVD. Vuur moet je nu eenmaal met vuur bestrijden, zo zegt u symbolisch.

Taak U vindt dat er voor niets ophef rond deze praktijken is ontstaan. Het is simpelweg de taak van de AIVD om overal rond te kijken. U voegt daar nog aan toe: Iedereen weet dit al en nu ineens op de achterste benen staan? Doe niet zo naïef! Veiligheid heeft nu eenmaal een prijs. Als je niets verkeerd doet, heb je ook niets te vrezen.

Deze week werd eveneens bekend dat in Nederland telefonie al jaren wordt onderschept. Gegevens van onder meer mobiele gesprekken worden in een grote bulk opgeslagen om deze na te speuren op gevaarlijke activiteiten. Is dit ongeoorloofd of juist prima dat inlichtingendiensten dit doen? Uw mening daarover is verdeeld. De helft van de respondenten zegt het niet erg te vinden. Ik heb niets te verbergen en geef bovendien graag mijn privacy op als hierdoor levens kunnen worden gered. De andere helft heeft wel moeite met deze praktijken. De AIVD heeft niets te maken met mijn gesprekken. We begeven ons hiermee op een hellend vlak.

Ruim een derde van de deelnemers heeft wel degelijk bezwaren tegen uitgebreide spionagepraktijken. Het gaat om de schaal waarop het plaatsvindt. Alles en iedereen bespioneren zonder aanzien des persoons is niet wenselijk. Wat legaal is hoeft nog niet legitiem te zijn. Het kan zelfs moreel verwerpelijk zijn.

Het spionageschandaal is naar buiten gebracht door Edward Snowden, een werknemer van het Amerikaanse bedrijf dat het internet voor de geheime dienst in de gaten houdt. **Bijna twee derde van u vindt dat hij daar goed aan heeft gedaan.** Dertig procent is het niet eens met zijn actie. Inmiddels is hij overigens door zijn werkgever ontslagen. De helft van de respondenten vindt dat terecht. Diezelfde helft deelt de mening van het bedrijf dat Snowden de ethische code van het bedrijf heeft geschonden. Bijna veertig procent is het niet eens met deze visie. **Een enkeling noemt Snowden zelfs een held.**

SP-Kamerlid Ronald van Raak heeft inmiddels om opheldering gevraagd bij minister Plasterk. De helft van u vindt dat een goed idee. Er moet opheldering komen over de activiteiten van de AIVD. De andere helft van de deelnemers aan de Stelling van de Dag vindt het echter helemaal niet verstandig. De politiek moet de veiligheidsdienst niet voor de voeten lopen. De AIVD werkt voor onze veiligheid. De SP probeert hier klaarblijkelijk weer politiek gewin uit te halen, zo houdt u Van Raak voor. U zegt: Als er een aanslag wordt gepleegd en de diensten waren daar niet van op de hoogte is de politiek en het volk ontstemd en boos. En nu is dit weer niet goed. Gewoon niet zeuren!

Ina Eggink

# De Telegraaf

15 juni 2013 zaterdag

**SP wil Snowden horen**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 3

**LENGTH:** 203 woorden

door Jorn Jonker DEN HAAG, zaterdag

De SP rolt de rode loper uit voor **de wereldberoemde klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die spoorloos is verdwenen.** De man die een boekje opendeed over het Amerikaanse spionagesysteem Prism, wordt binnenkort uitgenodigd door de griffier van de Tweede Kamer.

Kamerlid Van Raak zit achter het uitnodigen van de klokkenluider voor een besloten hoorzitting die de Tweede Kamer wil houden. Daarin moet duidelijk worden of experts denken dat Nederlandse inlichtingendiensten, zoals de AIVD, de spionage-informatie van Amerika gebruiken.

Het lijkt Van Raak een goed plan om de bron van al het recente nieuws op de lijst te zetten van mensen die de Kamer wil spreken. **Hij weet toch het beste hoe het zit. En dan kunnen we hem meteen een verblijf hier aanbieden.** Snowden hangt vervolging in Amerika boven het hoofd en zoekt nog een veilig heenkomen. Van Raak heeft alle vertrouwen in de griffier, die door de SP'er nu een lastige klus heeft.

Ook al wordt Snowden gevonden, dan is de kans klein dat hij op de Nederlandse uitnodiging ingaat. Ons land heeft een uitleveringsverdrag met de VS en de opgejaagde klokkenluider heeft vermoedelijk wel andere zaken aan zijn hoofd dan ons parlement inlichten.

# De Telegraaf

17 juni 2013 maandag

## **Britten bespioneerden bondgenoten op G-20**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 203 woorden

Van onze redactie buitenland LONDEN, maandag  
Britse veiligheidsdiensten hebben bij twee G-20 toppen in het Verenigd Koninkrijk in 2009 delegaties van de deelnemende landen afgeluisterd.

Dit meldt The Guardian op basis van stukken die zij van de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden heeft gekregen.

De pikante onthulling komt aan de vooravond van de G-8-top in Noord-Ierland.

De telefoongesprekken van ondermeer de Zuid-Afrikanen en de Turken werden afgeluisterd en hun e-mails bekeken. De delegatieleden werden meegelokt naar nep-internetcafés waar de computers zodanig waren aangepast dat de geheime dienst kon meelesen. Het zou vaker voorkomen dat bondgenoten elkaar bespioneren maar bewijzen ervoor worden zelden geleverd.

De naar boven gekomen feiten leiden mogelijk tot spanning tussen de delegaties die de G-8 bezoeken. Zij zullen van premier Cameron waarschijnlijk opheldering willen van de activiteiten van de geheime dienst in 2009 en zich afvragen of de afluisteroperatie deze week wordt herhaald.

Volgens The Guardian roept de onthulling nieuwe vragen op over de grenzen die er bestaan voor de ijver van de Britse geheime dienst GCHQ en zijn Amerikaanse zusterorganisatie NSA om terroristen op te sporen.

# De Telegraaf

19 juni 2013 woensdag

## **Internetspionnen 'hebben 50 aanslagen voorkomen'**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 310 woorden

Van onze correspondent NEW YORK, woensdag  
Het bespioneren van het internet en het telefoonverkeer heeft meer dan vijftig aanslagen in twintig landen voorkomen. Een daarvan was een aanslag op de beurs van Wall Street in New York.

Dat stelt de baas van de National Security Agency (NSA) Keith Alexander. Zijn dienst was in opspraak gekomen, nadat de **naar Hongkong gevluchte** klokkenluider Edward Snowden had verteld over het op grote schaal meekijken van de NSA op het internet.

Alexander heeft echter geen twijfels over het nut van het programma, dat door veel Amerikanen als een overdreven inbreuk op hun privacy wordt gezien. Aan een comité van het Congres vertelde Alexander gisteren dat ik liever die zaak bespreek dan dat ik moet uitleggen waarom we een tweede aanval zoals die van 9/11 niet hebben kunnen voorkomen.

De verklaring kwam in een openbare vergadering. Vandaag gaat Alexander in detail op de kwesties in tijdens een besloten vergadering.

De Amerikaanse president Barack Obama heeft op de tv-zender CBS nog eens verteld hoe belangrijk hij de spionageprogramma's vindt. Hij zei meer openheid te zullen betrachten, maar stelde wel dat dit alleen kan als het spionageprogramma er niet door in gevaar komt.

De president stelde ook nadrukkelijk dat zijn beleid anders is dan dat van zijn voorganger George W. Bush. Zo maakte hij een einde aan omstreden verhoormethoden en streeft hij nog steeds naar het sluiten van de beruchte gevangenis op Guantanamo Bay. Ook zou hij voor meer toezicht op de geheime diensten hebben gezorgd.

Behalve Obama vrezen ook de grote hightechbedrijven als Google, Facebook en Apple voor hun imago. Ze ontkennen dat ze opsporingsambtenaren rechtstreeks toegang hebben gegeven tot hun servers. Wel wordt toegegeven dat er tienduizenden verzoeken zijn binnengekomen van de geheime diensten om te mogen 'meekijken en af te luisteren'.

# De Telegraaf

21 juni 2013 vrijdag

**Nauwe banden NSA en internetbedrijven;  
Personele connecties onthuld**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 394 woorden

Van onze verslaggever AMSTERDAM, vrijdag

De samenwerking tussen grote internetbedrijven zoals Facebook en de Amerikaanse geheime dienst NSA is nog veel nauwer dan tot nu werd aangenomen. Gisteren werd bekend dat het voormalig hoofd beveiliging van Facebook Max Kelly verantwoordelijk voor het beschermen van de privégegevens van bijna 1 miljard gebruikers in 2010 voor de spionagedienst NSA is gaan werken.

Deze verwevenheid is heel gevaarlijk, zegt Simone Halink, van de digitale burgerrechtenorganisatie Bits of Freedom. Het opvragen van privégegevens wordt veel gemakkelijker als medewerkers bij NSA en Facebook ooit collega's van elkaar zijn geweest en je de kans loopt dat ze vriendendiensten voor elkaar verrichten. Onlangs onthulde oud-NSA-spion Edward Snowden al dat de geheime dienst in het Prism-project op grote schaal telefoon- en privégegevens van internetters, zoals Facebook-gebruikers verzamelde.

Ook de populaire gratis online telefoondienst Skype werkt achter de schermen samen met de NSA blijkt nu. De telefoondienst startte vijf jaar geleden het project Chess om gesprekken op een gemakkelijke manier beschikbaar te stellen voor inlichtingendiensten. Het project was zo geheim dat

slechts een 'handjevol' mensen binnen Skype afwist van Chess, vertelden betrokkenen aan dagblad The New York Times .

Twee democratische senatoren stellen overigens dat de Amerikaanse overheid nauwelijks iets heeft gehad aan de telefoongegevens die zijn verzameld met het Prism-programma. Om dan te zeggen dat het programma 'tientallen aanslagen' heeft voorkomen is misleidend , concluderen Udall en Wyden die door president Obama vertrouwelijk zijn bijgepraat over het omstreden project.

#### Samenwerking

De nauwe samenwerking tussen de Amerikaanse technologiesector en de NSA is de afgelopen jaren veel intensiever geworden doordat er steeds meer data van internetgebruikers van Facebook, Google en Yahoo worden opgeslagen, zeggen experts. Het bewaren van deze gegevens, die ook interessant kunnen zijn voor inlichtingendiensten, is namelijk goedkoper geworden.

Als deze twee werelden te veel in elkaar overlopen, krijg je een grote controlestaat , zegt internetdeskundige Brenno de Winter. Een reeks verdachte zoekopdrachten of verkeerde vrienden op Facebook kunnen iemand in één klap verdacht maken. Het is zorgelijk dat zo weinig mensen dit beseffen.

Max Kelly

# De Telegraaf

24 juni 2013 maandag

**Snowden blijft VS tarten;  
Klokkenluider reist halve wereld over uit angst voor arrestatie**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 587 woorden

Van onze correspondenten MOSKOU, NEW YORK, maandag

De Amerikaanse diplomatieke dienst staat in zijn hemd nadat een handjevol landen bereid was de voor de Amerikaanse justitie op de vlucht zijnde klokkenluider Edward Snowden te helpen. Gisteravond zag het er naar uit dat de man die de wereld vertelde dat de VS op grote schaal op internet spioneert politiek asiel zou aanvragen in Ecuador.

In Moskou reageerde een douanebeambte gisteren enthousiast op de komst van de klokkenluider. Hij is welkom, iedereen die een vijand is van de Verenigde Staten is onze vriend.

Dat Snowden eerder uit Hongkong mocht vertrekken is een blamage voor Barack Obama. Experts menen dat er in Hongkong niets gebeurt zonder Chinese toestemming en de Amerikaanse president heeft net een top met zijn Chinese collega Xi achter de rug. Die was bedoeld om een betere relatie te creëren. Dat lijkt niet erg gewerkt te hebben. De verklaring van Hongkong dat een Amerikaans verzoek om uitlevering niet compleet was lijkt een drogreden. China, dat eerder door de VS ervan was beschuldigd op grote schaal via internet bedrijfsgeheimen te stelen, doet nu boos omdat de VS weer in China blijkt af te luisteren.

Hoewel de Russische autoriteiten eerder op de dag hadden verklaard een mogelijke asielaanvraag 'serieus in behandeling' te nemen, koos de voortvluchtige oud-medewerker van de Amerikaanse inlichtingendienst NSA (National Security Agency) voor Ecuador. In Moskou ging men er gisteravond vanuit dat Snowden binnen 24 uur via 'een veilige route' dat wil zeggen niet over Amerikaanse

grondgebied, om aan het gevaar dat zijn vliegtuig alsnog wordt onderschept te ontkomen verder zou reizen.

Men gaat er vanuit dat Snowden via Cuba en Venezuela naar Ecuador reist. Drie Latijns-Amerikaanse landen die als anti-VS bekend staan.

Privacy Critici vinden de cyberinbraken van de VS een grove schending van het recht op privacy en de Amerikaanse grondwet, maar president Barack Obama rechtvaardigde het handelen dat hiermee aanvallen op de VS zijn voorkomen. Hij geniet daarvoor steun van beide partijen in het congres waar weinig sympathie is voor Snowden.

Nadat de Ecuadoriaanse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken, Ricardo Patino Aroca, gisteren via Twitter had bevestigd dat zijn land een asiolverzoek van Snowden had gekregen, werd er door sommigen op de Russische sociale media getreurd. Jammer, Snowden zou in Moskou een goed maatje zijn geweest van Gérard, merkte iemand op, doelend op de beroemde Franse acteur en fiscale vluchteling Gérard Depardieu die onlangs een Russisch paspoort en een gratis appartement kreeg.

Intussen werd de voortvluchtige Amerikaan op het Moskouse vliegveld bijgestaan door een advocaat van WikiLeaks, de organisatie van tot dusver `s werelds bekendste klokkenluider Julian Assange die vorig jaar juni vluchtte naar de ambassade van Ecuador in Londen om aan uitlevering aan Zweden (waar hij wordt gezocht voor een verkrachtingszaak) te ontkomen. Ook Assange is bevreesd dat hij uiteindelijk aan de Verenigde Staten zal worden uitgeleverd, nadat hij eerder in het WikiLeaks-schandaal duizenden vertrouwelijke diplomatieke berichten had laten lekken.

De verhoudingen tussen de Russen en de Amerikanen, die al op een dieptepunt verkeren, dreigen door de Moskouse tussenstop van Snowden verder te verslechteren. De Amerikaanse senator Charles Summer brieste op CNN dat Poetin persoonlijk van de vlucht van Snowden moet hebben geweten. Poetin lijkt er bijna altijd op uit te zijn om met een vinger te prikken in het oog van de VS.

# De Telegraaf

25 juni 2013 dinsdag

**Afbreuk**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 3

**LENGTH:** 232 woorden

Klokkenluider Edward Snowden is op de vlucht voor de Amerikaanse justitie die hem verdenkt van spionage na het laten uitlekken van geheime documenten van de inlichtingendienst National Security Agency (NSA). De affaire die Snowden vanuit Hongkong aan het rollen bracht, heeft repercussies over de hele wereld.

Zo onthulde hij afgelopen vrijdag nog dat de Britten bij het massaal aftappen van glasvezelkabels waarschijnlijk veel verder gaan dan de Amerikanen. Snowden verdedigde zijn handelwijze stevast met een verwijzing naar de bescherming van burgerrechten.

Inmiddels is Snowden ingepalmd door de groepering rond WikiLeaks-oprichter Julian Assange. Niet geheel toevallig heeft de Amerikaan, net als Assange, asiel aangevraagd in Ecuador. Terwijl Assange nog steeds in de Londense ambassade van het Latijns-Amerikaanse land zit opgesloten, zou Snowden pogen om via Cuba en Venezuela naar Ecuador te vliegen.



Assange is lang niet zo verheven als hij zich voordoet. Diens zelfverkozen gevangenschap heeft alles te maken met zijn pogingen om te ontsnappen aan de Zweedse justitie die hem wil vervolgen wegens verkrachting van twee vrouwen. En de anti-Amerikaanse president Correa van Ecuador, die Snowden met open armen wil ontvangen, heeft weinig op met grondrechten, getuige de beknotting van de media in zijn eigen land. Zo beschouwd doet deze kongsi afbreuk aan de authenticiteit van Snowden.

# De Telegraaf

25 juni 2013 dinsdag

'Spion één na oudste beroep'

SECTION: 1; Blz. 13

LENGTH: 333 woorden

door Frank van Vliet NEW YORK, dinsdag

De pot verwijt de ketel dat hij zwart ziet. Dat kunnen de Chinese leiders zeggen met dank aan klokkenluider Edward Snowden, die onthulde dat de Amerikaanse geheime dienst wereldwijd het telefoon- en internetverkeer bespioneert.

Dat komt de Chinezen uiteraard prima uit want tot nu toe stonden ze zelf te boek als de grootste dieven van digitale informatie. Door middel van ongekende spionage via cyberspace werden militaire en bedrijfsgeheimen achterhaald. Miljarden aan duur onderzoek werden zo voor een koopje illegaal opgepikt. Daarmee zou China op militair terrein bijna voor niets een kwart eeuw achterstand hebben ingehaald.

Er zit echter nogal wat ironie aan de vlucht van Snowden naar China en Rusland. Een cynische Amerikaanse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken John Kerry vroeg zich dan ook af of de vrijheid van het individu, waar Snowden zegt zo bezorgd over te zijn, werkelijk beter wordt gegarandeerd in China en Rusland waar de klokkenluider zijn heil had gezocht. China was natuurlijk Hongkong, dat een aparte status heeft met China en waar veel belangrijke zaken niet gebeuren zonder dat Peking er iets over heeft te zeggen.

Snowden onthulde onder andere dat de VS onder meer toegang hebben tot het mobiele telefoonverkeer in China, inbreken op het netwerk van de Tsinghua Universiteit van Peking, een van de kruispunten waar al het Chinese internetverkeer samenkomt, en hacken bij het hoofdkwartier van Pacnet in Hongkong, een van de grootste glasvezelkabelbedrijven van Azië.

De illusie dat privacy op het internet bestaat, is door Snowden keihard onderuitgehaald. Volgens John Suffolk, hoofd beveiliging van de Chinese netwerkleverancier Huawei, zegt de klokkenluider die in de VS heel wat minder populair is dan elders op de wereld, echter niets nieuws. Hij vindt de beschuldigingen over spionage op het net maar hypocriet. Volgens Suffolk houdt iedere overheid zich ook daar met spionage bezig. Spion is het op één na oudste beroep ter wereld.

# De Telegraaf

25 juni 2013 dinsdag

## Peking en Moskou lachen in hun vuistje om Snowden

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 607 woorden

door Pieter Waterdrinker MOSKOU, dinsdag

De saga rond de Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden leek gisteren te ontaarden in een bizar kat-en-muisspel tussen de voortvluchtige en de wereldpers, waarbij het Witte Huis dat Moskou opnieuw om zijn uitlevering verzocht verder in zijn hemd werd gezet en het Kremlin stilletjes in zijn vuist leek te lachen.

Het lijkt erop dat Snowden iedereen voor de gek heeft gehouden, meldde het Russische tv-journaal Vremja gisteravond met amper verholen leedvermaak, doelend op een Aeroflot-vlucht eerder op de dag naar Havana. Ruim dertig journalisten hadden voor de vlucht naar Cuba reeds in het vliegtuig plaatsgenomen, toen stoel 17 A die bestemd zou zijn geweest voor Snowden leeg bleek te blijven.

Terwijl het journaille van de Moskouse luchthaven Sjeremetjevo-II voor de ruim elf uur durende vlucht naar het palmrijke eiland opsteeg, ging op de grond de geruchtenmachine over de verblijfplaats van de 30-jarige Amerikaan verder.

Volgens het oorspronkelijke plan zou de klokkenluider via Havana verder vliegen naar Ecuador dat hem een soort asielstatus heeft verleend. Zat Snowden alsnog in de bewuste Airbus naar Havana, maar dan buiten het oog van de passagiers in het personeelsgedeelte onderin? Bevond hij zich nog steeds op het Moskouse vliegveld? Of was hij inmiddels met een andere vlucht gevlogen?

Het enige dat Julian Assange, oprichter van WikiLeaks, kwijt wilde is dat Snowden op een veilige plek was en werd bijgestaan door een medewerker van zijn organisatie. Vanwege de oorlogszuchtige bedreigingen van de Amerikaanse regering, vergrootte Assange het rookgordijn rond Snowden, kunnen we helaas niet onthullen in welk land hij zich bevindt.

Sinds zijn onthulling dat de Amerikaanse inlichtingendienst NSA via het zogeheten Prism-programma internet- en telefoongegeven van burgers verzamelt, geldt Snowden, die als medewerker van de Amerikaanse inlichtingendienst ooit een goedbetaalde baan had en een huis op Hawaï, als staatsvijand nummer één.

### Uitlevering

Maar zowel de autoriteiten van Hongkong, waar Snowden verbleef totdat hij zondag plots op het vliegtuig stapte naar Moskou, als de Russen gaven geen gehoor aan de roep van Washington tot uitlevering. Sterker nog: het Kremlin liet een woordvoerder zeggen helemaal niets over Snowden te weten. Volgens de woordvoerder van het Witte Huis, Jay Carney, is Snowden nog steeds op Russisch grondgebied.

Hij verklaarde alsnog te hopen op medewerking van de Russen bij de uitlevering. Maar waarom zouden we naar de Amerikanen luisteren, vroeg het invloedrijke Doemalid en tv-commentator Aleksej Poesjkov zich af.

De zelf opgelegde rol van de Amerikanen als 'politieman van de wereld' wordt vrijwel dagelijks op de Russische staatstelevisie belachelijk gemaakt, en velen in het Kremlin vinden het prachtig dat er landen bestaan als Ecuador, Venezuela en Cuba die de macht van de hypocriete Amerikanen openlijk tartten.

In Rusland werd intussen druk gespeculeerd dat Snowden mogelijk eerst uitgehoord zou worden door de nationale Veiligheidsdienst FSB. De Amerikaan zou volgens sommige bronnen nog in het bezit zijn van vier laptops met geheime informatie waarvan hij mogelijk nog niet alles heeft laten lekken. Reken maar dat de Russen hem niet zomaar laten gaan, liet een ingewijde weten.

Intussen dreigt het schandaal de relaties tussen Washington en Moskou enerzijds en die tussen Washington en Peking anderzijds ernstig te schaden. De Amerikaanse minister van Buitenlandse Zaken, John Kerry, heeft gedreigd met maatregelen als zou blijken dat Moskou en Peking bewust hebben geholpen Snowden uit handen van de Amerikanen te houden.

**LOAD-DATE:** 24 August 2013

**LANGUAGE:** DUTCH; NEDERLANDS

**PUBLICATION-TYPE:** Krant

**JOURNAL-CODE:** Telegraaf

# De Telegraaf

26 juni 2013 woensdag

**Staatsgeheim blijft gevoelige kwestie;  
Ook in Nederland celstraffen voor spionage**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 537 woorden

door Charles Sanders AMSTERDAM, woensdag

De affaire rond Edward Snowden maakt duidelijk dat de Amerikanen alles op alles zetten om hun oud-CIA-medewerker te laten boeten voor het uit de school klappen.

Maar lekken van staatsgeheimen leidt niet alleen bij grote mogendheden als de Verenigde Staten, China en Rusland tot verzoek om uitlevering en strafvervolgning van onderdanen.

Ook in Nederland liggen zaken uiterst gevoelig als het de nationale veiligheid betreft. Zo werd voormalig luchtmachtpiloot Chris V. twee maanden geleden in hoger beroep tot vier jaar cel veroordeeld na een aanvankelijk vonnis van vijf jaar. De oud-kapitein zou gegevens van de F-16 hebben willen verkopen aan de militaire attaché van de Russische ambassade in Den Haag.

Experts verklaarden voor de rechtbank dat er niets geheim meer is aan het uit 1979 stammende jachtvliegtuig, maar dat mocht voor V. niet baten. Alleen al zijn voornemen om technische specificaties van de F-16 het zou zijn gegaan om informatie over de wapencapaciteit van de Nederlandse toestellen aan de Russen te slijten bleek genoeg om hem al die jaren op te sluiten.

Ambtenaar Raymond P., ambtenaar op het ministerie van Buitenlandse Zaken, werd 23 april jongstleden veroordeeld tot twaalf jaar cel. P. spioneerde voor de Russen en leverde geheime dienst SVR in totaal 446 belangrijke documenten, onder andere over NAVO-operaties in Afghanistan.

Het OM sprak van de grootste spionagezaak in de Nederlandse geschiedenis. De voormalige diplomaat viel door de mand na een grootschalig FBI-onderzoek. De Amerikanen wisten tien Russische spionnen schaakmat te zetten, onder wie de rondborstige Anna Chapman.

Twee weken geleden zorgde oud-premier Ruud Lubbers voor consternatie door te verklaren dat er op vliegbasis Volkel atoombommen van de Verenigde Staten liggen en dat het hem verbaast dat die rare dingen daar nog steeds zijn opgeslagen .

Publiek geheim, maar nooit eerder door zo'n prominent geuit. Vandaar dat Lubbers nieuwsuitzendingen tot in Engeland en de Verenigde Staten haalde. Het Openbaar Ministerie liet weten de uitspraken te onderzoeken, net als die van een andere oud-premier, Dries van Agt, toen die enkele dagen later hetzelfde zei.

Advocaat Michael Ruperti: Als een doodgewone militair iets dergelijks had onthuld, was hij onherroepelijk voor de rechtbank gesleept. Juist omdat het hier om staatsgeheimen gaat. Ik ben benieuwd met welke conclusies het OM in het geval van deze twee voormalige premiers komt.

In de zaak van Edward Snowden omschrijft de Nederlandse hoogleraar en strafpleiter Geert-Jan Knoops de man als een Robin Hood in de schimmige inlichtingenwereld . Ondertussen is duidelijk dat de Amerikanen met alle middelen op Snowden jagen. Vanuit het CIA-hoofdkwartier in Langley worden satellieten en onbemande vliegtuigen ingezet om de van hoogverraad verdachte oud-agent op te sporen. Vraag is of de geheime dienst hem met een Hellfire-raket zal liquideren, mocht het te lastig blijken hem levend te pakken , zegt een Amerikaanse operator van een MQ-9 Reaper-eenheid op Creech Air Force Base in Indian Springs, Nevada. Want als ze hem in de camera's hebben gevangen, is executie door middel van een raketaanval een koud kunstje

# De Telegraaf

26 juni 2013 woensdag

**Obama onder vuur om Snowden;  
Kritiek op president zowel uit linkseals rechtse hoek**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 7

**LENGTH:** 528 woorden

door Frank van Vliet NEW YORK, woensdag

Het heeft lang geduurd, maar nu barst de kritiek op Barack Obama toch echt los vanwege zijn onmacht rond de zaak van **de voortvluchtige klokkenluider Edward Snowden.**

De Republikein Paul Ryan was zoals altijd uitgesproken. De hele affaire toont een Witte Huis dat meer en meer onbekwaam is.

De kwestie overschaduwde de agenda van de president die vandaag voor een week naar Afrika vertrekt, goede sier wil maken met zijn plannen om het klimaat te verbeteren, en voortgang boekt bij zijn poging om tientallen miljoenen immigranten een kans op een legale status te gunnen.

## Consequenties

Wat beklijft, is het beeld van een twijfelende president. Of het nu om Syrië gaat of om Snowden, Niemand is bang voor die vent. Niemand zegt dat er echte consequenties zijn als je hem tegenwerkt. Dat is een beroerde positie om je in te bevinden als president, meent Eliot A. Cohen, een voormalige adviseur van de voorganger van Obama, George W. Bush.

De kritiek op Obama komt uit zowel linkse als rechtse hoek. Links verwijt hem klokkenluiders keihard aan te pakken. Rechts meent dat Obama de federale staat te veel laat regelen.

De kritiek uit Republikeins kamp rond de affaire-Snowden kwam laat op gang omdat het hele af luister- en mee leesschandaal, zoals zoveel van de antiterreurmaatregelen van Obama, een voortzetting was van de politiek van Bush. Hoewel Obama stelt dat hij meer toezicht op dat programma heeft toegestaan, zijn weinigen daarvan overtuigd. Het hele proces vindt in grote geheimhouding plaats. Het Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court dat er toezicht op houdt, komt in het geheim bijeen en publiceert zijn oordelen nooit. Congresleden die er vragen stellen worden doorgaans afgewimpeld. Volgens Julian Assange, de oprichter van klokkenluidersite Wikileaks en beschermheer van Snowden, probeert de regering-Obama klokkenluiders te verpletteren.

## Ecuador

Dat zowel Assange als mogelijk Snowden hulp krijgt van Ecuador, een land dat in de top tien staat van landen waar journalisten niet goed kunnen werken, maakt zijn argument wat zwak. Desondanks staat overeind dat de internationaal twijfelende Obama nationaal wel hard kan optreden. Onder Obama worden acht klokkenluiders, de bekendste is naast Snowden de militair Bradley Manning die documenten lekte naar Wikileaks, vervolgd. Daarbij worden lange gevangenisstraffen gelijst. Onder alle voorgangers van Obama werden er maar drie klokkenluiders aangeklaagd.

De president houdt zich rond de Snowden-zaak nadrukkelijk op de achtergrond. Hij laat het grotendeels over aan zijn minister van Justitie, Eric H. Holder, of zijn woordvoerders. Types als Paul Ryan mogen daar schande van spreken, maar volgens sommige experts is het juist een verstandige keuze. De president heeft niets te winnen door zich met Snowden te bemoeien. Het is beter je te verschuilen als niet alleen grootmachten als China en Rusland, maar ook het onbeduidende Ecuador je tegenwerken. De Chinezen, woedend over de cyberspionage op hun gebied, waren niet tot samenwerking bereid, de Russen genieten van de aanvallen op de VS en Ecuador past in het rijtje van anti-Amerikaanse staten als Venezuela en Cuba.

# De Telegraaf

26 juni 2013 woensdag

## Respect voor klokkenluider

SECTION: 1; Blz. 7

LENGTH: 267 woorden

door Anke van Ravensteijn AMSTERDAM, woensdag

Wereldwijd houdt het deemoederen flink bezig of Edward Snowden als een held gezien moet worden die onze privacy heeft gered, of dat hij ons in gevaar heeft gebracht doordat zijn onthulling de bestrijding van terrorisme belemmert. Het grootste deel van de Telegraaflezers vindt dat voormalig NSA-werknemer Snowden een held is en geen verrader. Aan het einde van de middag stond de teller op 39.583 stemmen, waarvan 72 procent op 'held' en 28 procent op 'verrader'. De meerderheid is dus

blij met het inzicht dat de klokkenluider gaf in de spionagepraktijken van de Amerikaanse overheid op gewone burgers. Jessica Smilda (24) uit Ameland stuurt bijvoorbeeld: Van mij mag de wereld net zo eerlijk worden als deze klokkenluider! Door zo'n man komen de mensen er achter wat er echt gebeurt in ONZE wereld.

Anthonij Rietman (51) uit Kampen vindt het een goede zaak dat we als burgers van Nederland nu iets meer inzicht krijgen in de wijze waarop de inlichtingdiensten werken: Het feit dat ze zich in de VS als een wesp gestoken voelen, geeft aan dat ze hetzelfde zijn als niet-democratische landen. Ze zijn net maffia die afrekenen met iemand die geheimen verklapt.

Dries ter Borg (87) uit Barnsveld en Jaap Kieviet (59) uit Den Burg (Texel) laten een tegengeluid horen. Ter Borg vindt Snowden een verrader: Ik heb de oorlog meegemaakt en je mag nooit je land verraden. Bovendien geeft dit een sein aan terroristen. Kieviet vindt dat we wat moeten inleveren voor een veilige wereld: We moeten het vieze spelletje meespelen, aardige jongens winnen nooit.

# De Telegraaf

27 juni 2013 donderdag

**Waar is Edward Snowden?;  
Amerikaanse klokkenluider weet te veel om zomaar te laten lopen**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 13

**LENGTH:** 460 woorden

door Pieter Waterdrinker MOSKOU, donderdag

Terwijl een leger van journalisten gisteren voor de vierde achtereenvolgende dag in de transitzone op het Moskouse vliegveld Sjeremetjevo-II tevergeefs zocht naar de voortvluchtige Amerikaanse klokkenluider Edward Snowden, dreigen de betrekkingen tussen Washington en het Kremlin door het internationale lekschandaal in rap tempo te verslechteren.

Intussen heeft Snowden zelf verklaard nog niet geopenbaarde geheime informatie gecodeerd te hebben verstuurd aan diverse personen die van hem een wachtwoord zullen krijgen zodra hij wordt opgepakt of hem iets overkomt.

Achter de schermen is er koortsachtig diplomatiek overleg tussen Rusland en de VS, waarbij ook de onderlinge veiligheidsdiensten FSB en CIA betrokken zijn. Maar intussen lijkt Rusland ook voordeel te willen halen uit de zaak. President Poetin beschuldigt de Amerikanen ervan er dubbele standaarden op na te houden door Rusland voortdurend te kritiseren over de mensenrechten maar er zelf nog altijd gevangenen op nahoudt op Guant-namo Bay.

Het Russische Hogerhuis heeft gisteren aangekondigd een onderzoek te beginnen in hoeverre de Amerikanen met hun digitale inbreekpraktijken ook de privacy van Russen en daarbij de mensenrechten hebben geschonden.

Lekken

Snowden, die in eigen land wordt gezien als een verrader nadat hij informatie over het inbreken van de Amerikaanse veiligheidsdiensten op telefoon- en computeraccounts heeft laten lekken, lijkt intussen volledig opgelost. Poetin verklaarde eerder dat zijn land hem liever kwijt dan rijk is en dat de Russische geheime dienst geen enkel contact met hem heeft gehad.

Maar dat laatste is zeer onwaarschijnlijk, laat een ingewijde in Moskou op basis van anonimiteit weten. Ten eerste: hoe kan Snowden helemaal uit zichzelf zijn verdwenen? Ten tweede: de man is

goud waard, want hij is vermoedelijk ook in het bezit van geclassificeerde geheime informatie. Hij is een veel te lekker snoepje om zomaar te laten lopen.

De 30-jarige Snowden vloog zondag onverwacht van Hongkong naar Moskou om vandaar via Cuba door te reizen naar Ecuador, dat hem een asielstatus in het vooruitzicht heeft gesteld. Hongkong liet hem gaan omdat de Amerikanen zijn middelste naam in het uitleveringsverzoek fout hadden gespeld.

Gisteren liet de regering van Ecuador plots weten dat de behandeling van de asielaanvraag nog wel twee maanden zou kunnen duren. Het zou eerst de argumenten van Washington willen bestuderen.

De voorzitter van de Amerikaanse senaatscommissie voor Buitenlandse Relaties, Robert Menendez, dreigde gisteren dat Ecuador zijn status als bevoorrechte handelspartner van de VS verliest als Snowden toegelaten mocht worden tot het land. Dat zou een miljoenenverlies aan export betekenen voor Ecuador.

# De Telegraaf

28 juni 2013 vrijdag

'Snowden zaak diplomaten'

SECTION: 1; Blz. 13

LENGTH: 244 woorden

Van onze redactie buitenland DAKAR, vrijdag

President Barack Obama heeft nog geen contact gehad met de Russische president Vladimir Poetin of zijn Chinese ambtsgeenoot Xi Jinping over Edward Snowden, de Amerikaanse klokkenluider die de wijk genomen heeft naar Moskou, na eerst naar Hongkong te zijn gevluht. Volgens Obama moet de zaak afgehandeld kunnen worden via de normale diplomatieke kanalen.

Ik heb president Xi noch president Poetin persoonlijk gebeld. Ten eerste omdat dat niet nodig zou moeten zijn en ten tweede omdat er een hoop andere zaken zijn waar we met Rusland en China over moeten praten, liet Obama weten tijdens een persconferentie in Senegal, waar hij momenteel een staatsbezoek aflegt. Dit geval van één verdachte die we uitgeleverd willen zien, moeten we niet verheffen tot een niveau waarop ik zelf moet gaan onderhandelen.

De klokkenluider verblijft nog steeds in de transitruimte van het vliegveld in Moskou. Hij heeft asiel gevraagd bij Ecuador, maar dat land heeft al laten weten dat de behandeling van die aanvraag nog geruime tijd in beslag kan nemen.

Snowden lijkt er in het verleden overigens heel andere opvattingen op na te hebben gehouden over klokkenluiders dan tegenwoordig. Deze mensen zouden ze in hun kruis moeten schieten, schreef hij volgens de website Ars Technica in 2009 in reactie op het uitlekken van geheime informatie over Amerikaanse maatregelen tegen Iran. Destijds werkte hij als technicus voor de CIA in Genève.

# De Telegraaf

29 juni 2013 zaterdag

**Nieuwe spionagerel VS;  
Oud-generaal klapt uit de school over Stuxnet**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 9

**LENGTH:** 371 woorden

Van onze redactie buitenland WASHINGTON, zaterdag  
Het Amerikaanse defensie- en inlichtingenapparaat heeft er sinds gisteren weer een nieuw hoofdpijndossier bij.

Nadat eerder deze maand computertechnicus Edward Snowden met een spreekwoordelijke koffer vol spionagegeheimen de wijk nam naar Moskou, kwam gisteren generaal James E. Cartwright, van 2007 tot 2011 de een na hoogste militair in de VS en een belangrijke adviseur van president Obama, in opspraak.

De 63-jarige generaal, inmiddels gepensioneerd, zou er volgens nieuwszender NBC News van verdacht worden dat hij zeer geheime informatie over het Stuxnet-virus, een computervirus dat in 2010 door de VS op de Iraanse nucleaire installaties werd losgelaten, naar de pers gelekt heeft.

Langelegd

Als gevolg van Stuxnet werden zo'n 1000 Iraanse ultracentrifuges, waarmee uranium verrijkt wordt, tijdelijk lamgelegd. De New York Times onthulde het bestaan van het programma in juni vorig jaar.

Cartwright was van 2007 tot 2011 vicevoorzitter van de Joint Chiefs of Staff, het hoogste militaire orgaan van de VS. In die rol werd hij een van de belangrijkste adviseurs van president Obama. Volgens de New York Times was hij een van de centrale spelers bij de cyberaanvallen op Iran. Bronnen binnen het Amerikaanse ministerie van Justitie hebben in de pers inmiddels bevestigd dat de generaal doelwit is van een strafrechtelijk onderzoek.

Over de nog steeds op het vliegveld van Moskou bivakkerende klokkenluider Edward Snowden lijkt ondertussen achter de schermen volop onderhandeld te worden. Lonnie Snowden, de vader van de klokkenluider, heeft in een brief aan de Amerikaanse minister van Justitie Eric Holder geschreven dat hij er alle vertrouwen in heeft dat zijn zoon naar huis zal komen als hij niet vastgezet wordt voor het proces, hem geen spreekverbod opgelegd wordt en als hij kan kiezen waar het proces plaats moet vinden.

Vader Snowden, die zegt zijn zoon in april voor het laatst gesproken te hebben, verklaarde in een interview met NBC News ongerust te zijn over de rol die WikiLeaks in de hele affaire speelt. Als je naar het verleden van WikiLeaks kijkt, hebben ze niet bepaald oog voor de Amerikaanse grondwet. Ze willen gewoon zo veel mogelijk geheimen onthullen.



# De Telegraaf

29 juni 2013 zaterdag

**Wapen jezelf;  
Big Brother**

**SECTION:** 1; Blz. 24

**LENGTH:** 707 woorden

Ongebreideld blijkt de honger van de Amerikaanse en Britse geheime diensten naar persoonlijke gegevens die via de computer worden uitgewisseld. De onthullingen van klokkenluider Edward Snowden hebben de discussie over internetprivacy doen opblaaien. Grote bedrijven als Google, Facebook, Microsoft en Apple blijken zo lek als een mandje. Niet iedereen vindt het een prettig idee dat zijn privégegevens niet veilig zijn. Voor de 'lekkere' internetdiensten die massaal worden bespied, bestaan veilige alternatieven.

In ruil voor hun gratis diensten maken internetbedrijven je persoonlijke gegevens te gelde. De hele interneteconomie drijft daarop. Telkens wanneer je via een zoekmachine naar content zoekt, e-mails uitwisselt, een YouTube-filmpje bekijkt, foto's bij een online dienst opslaat of berichten op Facebook post, laat je digitale sporen achter.

Uit al die data kan de dienstverlener aan wie men zijn gegevens toevertrouwt, een perfect beeld van de gebruiker opbouwen. Die gegevens worden weer doorverkocht aan andere bedrijven die je gerichte aanbiedingen willen doen. Pure commercie die je op de koop toe moet nemen.

Onlangs werd echter ook duidelijk dat de Amerikaanse geheime dienst en andere overheidsinstanties graag over de schouder van de providers meekijken. Als dat gebeurt om terrorisme te bestrijden, zullen weinigen daar moeite mee hebben. Anders wordt het als zich een soort spionagestaat ontwikkelt waar de bescherming van de persoonlijke levenssfeer met voeten wordt getreden.

Wie gelooft dat het in de Verenigde Staten die kant op gaat, kan alternatieven voor de grote 'lekkere' Amerikaanse online diensten overwegen. De website Prism-break.org biedt een overzicht van diensten die buiten het schootsveld van de Amerikaanse National Security Agency (NSA) vallen.

Voor bijna alle software van bekende fabrikanten bestaat een gratis alternatief waarmee 'Big Brother' weinig kan. Door het open en vrije karakter van deze software (open source) is het nauwelijks mogelijk een geheime achterdeur in te bouwen die spiedende overheidsdiensten kunnen gebruiken. Het probleem is echter dat veel van deze alternatieven kwalitatief minder zijn.

Neem Facebook. Wie zich wil onttrekken aan haar verzamelwoede, kan uitwijken naar een sociaal medium als Diaspora. Een echt alternatief is dit echter niet, want geen van je vrienden zit daar.

E-mails zijn in principe te versleutelen, maar dat kost behoorlijk wat moeite. Als particulier moet je wel heel zwaar aan je privacy hechten, wil je een programma als Pretty Good Privacy gaan gebruiken. Een kleinere stap is het om in plaats van Gmail of Outlook.com (vroeger Hotmail) een mailadres van een kleine, lokale provider te gebruiken. Ook RiseUp biedt veilige e-mailadressen.

Nog moeilijker wordt het om naar een niet-Amerikaans besturingssysteem uit te wijken. Wie eenmaal Microsoft Windows, Apple OS X of Google Chrome OS gebruikt, zal zich wel twee keer bedenken voordat hij naar Linux overschakelt. Voor de massa zijn vrije besturingssystemen als GNU/Linux, Debian en Fedora weinig aantrekkelijk. Ook internationale betaaldiensten als PayPal zijn moeilijk te omzeilen.

Eenvoudiger is je browser te veranderen. Firefox, ontwikkeld door de non-profit organisatie Mozilla waaraan honderden vrijwilligers uit de hele wereld zijn verbonden, is een prima alternatief voor Internet Explorer of Google Chrome. Deze populaire browser geldt als minder vatbaar voor spyware. Helemaal anoniem werkt Tor Browser Bundle. Mozilla maakt ook de veilige e-mailcliënt Thunderbird.

Een zoekmachine die aan de hoogste privacyeisen voldoet, is Ixquick.com. Deze meta-zoekmachine gebruikt versleutelde verbindingen. Belangrijker nog is dat geen enkel persoonlijk zoekgegeven wordt opgeslagen, laat staan dat deze met derden wordt gedeeld. De servers van Ixquick staan in Nederland, dus buiten de invloedssfeer van de Amerikaanse overheid. Ixquick biedt op een veilige manier zoekresultaten van andere zoekmachines. Zuster StartPage.com doet hetzelfde, maar dan uitsluitend op basis van Google.

OpenStreetMap is een goed alternatief voor de kaartendiensten van Google en Microsoft.

Wie zich na alle recente onthullingen zorgen over zijn privacy maakt, kan zelf maatregelen treffen om zijn internetgegevens te beschermen.

### **Bijlage 3. Krantenartikelen The Washington Post**

## **Will disclosures put programs in legal jeopardy? Some experts have doubts.**

Jerry Markon

751 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The disclosures of the sweeping government collection of telephone and Internet records have reinvigorated a debate over whether the programs can be challenged by those who see them as unconstitutional surveillance.

In revealing his identity Sunday as the principal source of the recent leaks, Edward Snowden, a contractor for the National Security Agency, said he hoped the programs will now face legal jeopardy for the first time. The same day, Sen. Rand Paul (R-Ky.) vowed to bring a class-action lawsuit against the Obama administration over the spying, saying he is seeking the support of 10 million Americans.

But experts and lawyers who have been through the legal wars over surveillance sounded a strong note of caution Monday, saying the government fiercely resists such lawsuits on national security grounds. About 70 suits were filed after the George W. Bush administration's warrantless wiretapping was revealed in 2005; nearly all have been dismissed, including one thrown out by a federal appeals court Monday.

"The courts have made it very hard to do this," said Steven Goldberg, a lawyer in Portland, Ore. "How do you get a judge to be strong enough to stand up to what we call the government's talismanic utterance of national security in court?"

Goldberg lost one such high-profile case, filed by the al-Haramain Islamic Foundation, even though the government accidentally turned over a document that the charity's attorneys said showed it was a target of warrantless surveillance. A federal appeals court in California last year dismissed the lawsuit, ruling that the government was immune from such claims.

Other lawyers expressed optimism that Snowden's disclosures, by forcing the Obama administration to publicly acknowledge the programs' existence, could trigger further, more-successful lawsuits. The American Civil Liberties Union took an initial legal step Monday, urging the secret court that oversees government surveillance in national security cases to make public its opinion that was the legal basis for the newly revealed phone program.

The disclosures fueling the debate over surveillance and privacy came last week, starting with a report by the British newspaper the Guardian about the program that collects data on all phone calls made on the Verizon network. Later in the week, The Washington Post and the Guardian disclosed the existence of a separate program, code-named PRISM, that collects the Internet data of foreigners from major Internet companies.

Robert Chesney, a national security expert at the University of Texas Law School, said the new revelations will not help potential plaintiffs overcome government arguments that they lack legal standing to sue or that the programs are privileged as a state secret. Created in the 1950s and rarely used until after the attacks of

Sept. 11, 2001, the state-secrets privilege allows the government to urge courts to dismiss cases on the grounds of potential damage to national security or foreign policy.

"Revealing that they do this sort of thing does nothing," said Chesney, who added that the surveillance activity "is exactly what was contemplated" by 2008 amendments that expanded the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act and were meant to strengthen the government's monitoring of potential terrorists.

Jonathan Hafetz, a law professor at Seton Hall University, disagreed, saying the new revelations make it harder for the government to argue that cases should not go forward because plaintiffs cannot prove they were targets of surveillance. The Supreme Court accepted such an argument in narrowly dismissing a challenge to the 2008 law in February, with Justice Samuel A. Alito Jr. writing for the majority that the law's challengers could only "speculate" about the surveillance.

"It's very hard for the government to maintain now that they are not in fact sweeping up our communications," said Hafetz, a former ACLU lawyer. "It makes it clear that these claims are far from speculative."

The recent revelations "could be game-changer," Hafetz said, though he added, "None of this mean lawsuits will succeed."

Snowden, in an interview with The Post, argued that the legal landscape has changed. "The government can't reasonably assert the state-secrets privilege for a program it has acknowledged," he said.

Obama administration officials, in response to the furor created by Snowden's leak of information, have acknowledged that both programs exist and defended them as vital for protecting Americans from terrorism. They have revealed few details, speaking about the programs in general terms.

## Reaction to news of government actions blurs party lines

Karen Tumulty

1188 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

A late-spring storm of Washington controversies has created a rare event in these partisan, polarized times: a shared I-told-you-so moment for the left and the right.

For anyone worried about the potential for government overreach, the past few weeks have brought more cause for concern.

The Internal Revenue Service targeting conservative groups for special scrutiny. The Justice Department subpoenaing the records of media organizations in a search-and-destroy mission against their sources of information. The National Security Agency sweeping up phone records and secretly tapping into the Internet services that have become the nervous system of 21st-century life.

All raise questions that go beyond the ideological differences over the size and cost of government that have come to define the Democratic and Republican parties.

In a different way, each of the controversies stirs misgivings - sometimes dismissed as paranoia - that the most ardent liberals and conservatives have long held about Washington's power and reach.

That explains why the newly revealed leaker of classified information about government surveillance, 29-year-old tech specialist **Edward Snowden**, has been hailed as a "hero" by figures as diverse as conservative commentator Glenn Beck, liberal filmmaker Michael Moore and Daniel Ellsberg of Pentagon Papers fame.

And the scandals - or pseudo-scandals, depending on one's point of view - land at a time when polls show the public's trust in the federal government is at or near all-time lows.

"All of those things fit together as almost a patchwork quilt of too much, too far and too intrusive," Democratic pollster Peter D. Hart said. "It's not bringing people together. It's uniting in outrage."

More unsettling for people of both parties is the through-the-looking-glass quality of the controversies.

That is particularly true of President Obama's aggressive use of the surveillance measures that President George W. Bush sought in the wake of the Sept. 11, 2001, attacks. Democrats, including then-Sen. Barack Obama, decried these measures as overreach.

"When you give your government power, it's for always. It's not just for when your team is in office," said conservative activist Grover Norquist, who loudly criticized the domestic surveillance programs when they became public during the Bush years. "And when you give people power, it demands to be used. . . . Obama was continuing and building on powers the Republicans demanded the government should have."

Qualms like that have produced some unusual alliances.

Vermont's Patrick J. Leahy (D), the liberal Senate Judiciary Committee chairman, has teamed with Sen. Mike Lee (R-Utah), a tea party champion, on a bill that would require the government to obtain a search warrant, based on probable cause, before it obtains e-mail and other electronic communications. (The current law, written in the pre-Internet era, allows electronic messages older than 180 days to be more easily accessed with a subpoena.)

Although the bill was blocked last fall by Judiciary Committee Republicans, it sailed through the committee in April. On Thursday, the ardently libertarian Sen. Rand Paul (R-Ky.) announced that he was joining as a co-sponsor.

"There is a strain in American politics that brings people like Durbin and Mike Lee and Rand Paul together - the libertarians meet the left," said Sen. Richard J. Durbin (D-Ill.), the liberal Senate majority whip who has sought to restrain the government's surveillance authority.

That was true even before the recent crop of revelations.

In March, Paul created a sensation among the left and the right when he took to the Senate floor and staged a rare "talking filibuster," orating nearly 13 hours straight to protest the Obama administration's policies on the use of unmanned drones.

He and his allies drew the scorn of many of their colleagues - Sen. John McCain (R-Ariz.) called them "wacko birds." But the Internet lit up with more than 1 million tweets relating to the filibuster, 450,000 with the hashtag #standwithrand.

And one of those who joined Paul in the effort was Sen. Ron Wyden (D-Ore.), a liberal. "Mr. President, what it comes down to is, every American has the right to know when their government believes that it is allowed to kill them," Wyden said, delivering what was probably the most blistering line of the debate.

It remains to be seen how much the more recent controversies will shift the overall political dynamic.

The latest to erupt are the revelations about the extensiveness of government surveillance. Supporters of the programs, such as Sen. Dianne Feinstein (D-Calif.), say that what has been revealed was merely an extension of existing measures and that such tactics have been invaluable in keeping the country safe.

Although Sept. 11 is more than a decade behind us, Americans remain fearful of a sneak attack by terrorists. After the Boston Marathon bombing in April, there was a torrent of criticism questioning why the government did not catch signals that the two brothers suspected in the bombing might have been planning the attack.

Meanwhile, Americans have grown more accustomed to surrendering slivers of their privacy. In exchange for discounts and convenience, they let Amazon know what they read, iTunes know what they listen to and Safeway know what they eat.

When respondents in a Time-CNN poll were given a choice two weeks after the marathon bombing, however, 61 percent said they were more concerned about the government enacting new anti-terrorism policies that restrict civil liberties, compared with 31 percent who said they are more worried about the government failing to enact strong new anti-terrorism policies.

Durbin said he was surprised by the poll result, which he believes suggests a different public attitude than prevailed after the Sept. 11 attacks.

"The Time poll was done after Boston, when you would have thought that would have colored the answer, and it didn't," Durbin said.

By contrast, a new Washington Post-Pew Research Center poll released Monday shows little underlying shift in Americans' continue prioritization of terrorism investigations over privacy protections.

When Durbin and Lee offered an amendment in July that would have imposed more limits on warrantless surveillance of citizens, it got only three votes in the Judiciary Committee: their own and that of Sen. Christopher A. Coons (D-Del.).

"It might get a different vote today," Durbin said. "I don't know if it would pass, but I think it would get more than three."

Norquist also argued that, taken together, the controversies may have created a new, more enduring awareness of the dangers of unbridled government.

The aggrieved now include tea party activists who believe they were unfairly singled out by the IRS, liberals who expected Obama to exercise more restraint, and the news media, fearful of a chilling effect on the flow of vital information.

"It's easier for both teams to say those are powers no one should have," Norquist said about the recent revelations. "It gored the right. It gored the left. And it gored the judge - the press."

## A surveillance history lesson

Walter Pincus

992 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A13

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

A little history and a little law are needed in the wake of the current uproar over the re-discovery that the National Security Agency has been vacuuming up telephone records of Americans and e-mails, phone messages and other Web data related to suspected overseas terrorists.

Let's start with a bit of history.

Forty-three years ago, the staff director and counsel of a Senate Foreign Relations subcommittee, set up by then-Chairman J.W. Fulbright (D-Ark.), traveled the world gathering facts as part of an investigation of military involvement in U.S. foreign policy. They visited NSA listening posts in Europe and Asia and interviewed those who ran the facilities. They were surprised at the data being collected, not just overheard communications but also cables and intercepts from satellites. Using their information, the committee called the NSA director, Vice Adm. Noel Gayler, to testify in closed session. He refused to discuss his agency's operations on grounds that only Senate and House Armed Services subcommittees dealing with intelligence matters could get such testimony.

Gayler was told the committee had already gathered information in the field and gave him a week to put together testimony answering the panel's questions or he would be subpoenaed and face contempt for failing to appear or to testify.

Gayler did show up, and the committee got the information it demanded, which included a full description of the NSA's then-expanding worldwide collections, how the material was being used, and the means by which the NSA minimized reading or listening to non-relevant material on U.S. citizens.

I know about these events firsthand because I was that staff director. In a classified annex of the subcommittee's report, there were recommendations relating to the NSA.

Now some legal history.

In 1979, 34 years ago, the Supreme Court upheld a decision by the Maryland Court of Appeals, which said, "There is no constitutionally protected reasonable expectation of privacy in the numbers dialed into a telephone system." The phone company automatically creates and stores a record of every call from a phone, the number called and time spent. "It is too much to believe that telephone subscribers, under these circumstances, harbor any general expectation that the numbers they dial will remain secret" is what then-Justice Harry A. Blackmun wrote in the court's majority decision.

Another piece of history:

Seven years ago, on May 5, 2006, USA Today disclosed that the NSA "has been secretly collecting the phone call records of tens of millions of Americans, using data provided by AT&T, Verizon and BellSouth," attributing that information to "people with direct knowledge of the arrangement."

The newspaper continued: "The NSA program reaches into homes and businesses across the nation by amassing information about the calls of ordinary Americans - most of whom aren't suspected of any crime. This program does not involve the NSA listening to or recording conversations. But the spy agency is using the data to analyze calling patterns in an effort to detect terrorist activity, sources said in separate interviews."

Sound familiar? How about this response, that same day, from President George W. Bush: "First, our intelligence activities strictly target al-Qaeda and their known affiliates. . . . Second, the government does not listen to domestic phone calls without court approval. Third, the intelligence activities I authorized are lawful and have been briefed to appropriate members of Congress, both Republican and Democrat."

It is worth noting that two days after the USA Today disclosure, a Washington Post poll showed that 63 percent of those polled said it was acceptable for the government to collect tens of millions of phone records, while 35 percent considered that unacceptable.

In 2008, Congress passed amendments to the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act (FISA) that allowed the FBI and the NSA, with approval of the FISA court, to intercept or acquire stored communications or other data from service providers when a foreign target is involved.

On March 15, 2012, Wired magazine published a long article by James Bamford, who has written books about the NSA. Bamford described the agency's new \$2 billion Utah Data Center and its ability to "intercept, decipher, analyze, and store vast swaths of the world's communications as they zap down from satellites and zip through the underground and undersea cables of international, foreign, and domestic networks."

He wrote that when the center is fully running at the end of this year, "stored in near-bottomless databases will be all forms of communication, including the complete contents of private emails, cell phone calls, and Google searches, as well as all sorts of personal data trails - parking receipts, travel itineraries, bookstore purchases, and other digital 'pocket litter.' "

Was there any follow-up in the mainstream media to Bamford's disclosure, or anything close to the concerns voiced on Capitol Hill this past week? No.

That's because the American public at large is more accepting of the government's involvement in their lives - along with Facebook, Google, Amazon, Apple - than is **Edward Snowden**, the 29-year-old who leaked the highly classified NSA documents. He appears to believe the public is unaware, and, as he told the Guardian, knowing "what's happening, you [meaning the public] should decide whether we should be doing this."

I believe the public has decided. I have never forgotten one thought in a lecture I heard at Yale University back in the early 1950s when Sen. Joseph R. McCarthy (R-Wis.) was carrying on his anti-communist witch hunt. Professor Harry R. Rudin declared that the two peoples most willing to trade civil liberties for personal security were the Germans and the Americans. Sixty-plus years later, I think the reaction to 9/11 that we still see proves again that Rudin was right.

## In NSA leak, a well-deserved hosing

Dana Milbank

818 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A02

English



Keep your distance: The director of national intelligence is having intestinal distress.

"For me, it is literally - not figuratively, literally - gut-wrenching to see this happen," James Clapper told Andrea Mitchell over the weekend, referring to leaks about the government's secret program to collect vast troves of phone and Internet data.

There might be a bit more sympathy for Clapper's digestive difficulty if he hadn't delivered a kick in the gut to the American public just three months ago.

Sen. Ron Wyden (D-Ore.) asked Clapper at a Senate hearing in March, "Does the NSA collect any type of data at all on millions or hundreds of millions of Americans?"

"No, sir," Clapper testified.

"It does not?" Wyden pressed.

"Not wittingly. There are cases where they could inadvertently, perhaps, collect, but not wittingly."

We now know that Clapper was not telling the truth. The National Security Agency is quite wittingly collecting phone records of millions of Americans, and much more.

As the administration and some in Congress vent their anger about leaks to The Post and to Britain's Guardian newspaper, officials have only themselves to blame. It is precisely their effort to hide such a vast and consequential program from the American public that caused this pressure valve to burst. Instead of allowing a democratic debate about the programs in broad terms that would not have compromised national security, their attempts to keep the public in the dark have created a backlash in which the risks to national security can't be controlled.

**Edward Snowden, the leaker, did the honorable thing in revealing his identity; it would be more honorable if he would turn himself in and face the consequences for his law-breaking.** But there is little honor in the way administration officials and lawmakers have avoided responsibility. Obama administration officials are blaming Snowden, while some lawmakers complain disingenuously that the administration kept them out of the loop.

"All of us are sort of asking what in the world has gone on," a seemingly bewildered Eric Cantor (R-Va.), the House majority leader, alleged Monday on CBS's "This Morning."

Host Norah O'Donnell asked whether he had known about the program before the leaks.

"Well," Cantor replied, "there are a variety of - of classified programs that exist for us to, again, guard against a terrorist threat. And . . ."

Asked whether the Obama administration's surveillance went further than the George W. Bush administration's, Cantor said that "these are questions we don't know the answers to."

"How do you not know the answer?" O'Donnell asked.

Good question. All 535 members of Congress had authorization to learn all about the programs. Senators even received a written invitation in 2011 to view a classified report. Likewise, Rep. Peter King (R-N.Y.), a former chairman of the Homeland Security Committee, said Monday that members "could have gotten a briefing whenever they wanted to."

But apparently few bothered. Worse, lawmakers quashed efforts to allow even modest public disclosure of the broad contours of the program. Steven Aftergood, who runs the Federation of American Scientists' Project on Government Secrecy, lists the various ways in which the administration, Congress and the courts denied the public any right to know:

The Justice Department and the DNI promised a new effort to declassify opinions issued by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court; Justice official Lisa Monaco, now Obama's counterterrorism director, said all significant FISA rulings would be reviewed for declassification. But no new opinions were declassified under the initiative.

The House last year turned back attempts to require public reports on the general outlines of the government's surveillance programs. The various disclosure proposals, offered by Democratic Reps. Bobby Scott (Va.), Jerrold Nadler (N.Y.) and Sheila Jackson Lee (Tex.), were defeated by the Judiciary Committee.

In the Senate, amendments to provide modest disclosures and declassifications, offered by Wyden and fellow Democratic Sens. Jeff Merkley (Ore.) and Mark Udall (Colo.) during the FISA renewal in December, were all defeated.

The FISA court itself colluded in the secrecy. After senators asked the court to provide declassified summaries of its decisions, the chief FISA judge, Reggie B. Walton, responded with a letter on March 27 citing "serious obstacles" to the request.

"It was a shoddy performance all around," Aftergood said Monday. "The pervasive secrecy on this topic created an information vacuum. If congressional oversight was not going to fill it in, it turned out leaks would. That's not the optimal solution."

Not optimal, but probably inevitable. Officials who denied the public a responsible debate on surveillance will now have a debate on Snowden's terms - and there's no use in bellyaching about it.

## Amid rise of outsourcing, shakier vetting

Robert O'Harrow Jr. Dana Priest Marjorie Censer

1285 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A05

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The unprecedented leak of top-secret documents by National Security Agency contractor **Edward Snowden** raises far-reaching questions about the government's rush to outsource intelligence work to contractors since the Sept. 11, 2001, terrorist attacks.

Never before have so many U.S. intelligence workers been hired so quickly, or been given access to secret government information through networked computers. In recent years, about one in four intelligence workers has been a contractor, and 70 percent or more of the intelligence community's secret budget has gone to private firms.

Booz Allen Hamilton, which hired the 29-year-old Snowden three months ago to work at the NSA, has been a leader among more than 1,900 firms that have supplied tens of thousands of intelligence analysts in recent years, including technologists and field spies.

But in the rush to fill jobs, the government has relied on faulty procedures to vet intelligence workers, documents and interviews show. At the same time, intelligence agencies have not hired enough in-house government workers to manage and oversee the contractors, contracting specialists said.

On Monday, lawmakers said they will examine Snowden's hiring and the growing use of private companies for intelligence work.

"We'll be going over every inch of this," said Rep. Adam B. Schiff (D-Calif.), a member of the House Intelligence Committee who expects confidential briefings on the leak in the next few days. Public hearings are likely as well, he said.

Schiff said the committee long has worried about the cost of outsourcing but now will scrutinize the security risks more closely. "Now I think we'll be looking that through an entirely different lens," he said.

Intelligence officials, government auditors and contracting specialists have warned for years that the vulnerability to spies and breaches was rising, along with contracting fraud and abuse.

"When you increase the volume of contractors exponentially but you don't invest in the personnel necessary to manage and oversee that workforce, your exposure increases," said Steven Schooner, co-director of the government procurement law program at George Washington University. "This is what happens when you have staggering numbers of people with access to this kind of information."

The reliance on contractors reflects a major shift toward outsourcing over the past 15 years, in part because of cutbacks in the government agencies and commitment to smaller government by the George W. Bush administration.

Most of the work went to the largest contractors, including Booz Allen Hamilton, which had \$5.8 billion in revenue last year. Almost all of Booz Allen's work was for the government, and nearly a quarter of that was for intelligence agencies.

In the first few years after 2001, when the competition for qualified job candidates was the fiercest, it was not unusual for companies to give signing bonuses of \$30,000 or a new car for workers with top-secret security clearances.

By 2010, the overall intelligence budget had grown by 250 percent since 2000. Nowhere was the growth larger than at the NSA. The budget there doubled, as did the physical infrastructure. The hidden Fort Meade complex includes as much square footage as the Pentagon and is surrounded by 112 acres of parking lots, according to military construction documents filed with Howard County. Ten thousand employees are to be added in the next 15 years, according to the plans.

Many of the NSA's contractors are located in the 285-acre National Business Park, which is connected to the agency by a private road. Booz Allen shares the skyline there with other giants: L-3 Communications, Northrop Grumman and SAIC, to name a few.

By the mid-2000s, all of the intelligence agencies had become dependent on private contractors such as Snowden - who says he made \$200,000 a year - to perform everything from information technology installation and maintenance to intelligence analysis and agent protection.

Private contractors working for the CIA recruited spies, protected CIA directors, helped snatch suspected extremists off the streets of Italy and even interrogated suspected terrorists in secret prisons aboard.

The Defense Security Service, the agency that grants security clearances to many of the Defense Department's intelligence agencies, became so overwhelmed with that task that on April 28, 2006, it shut down the clearance process altogether. Its backlog of pending cases had reached 700,000, and it had run out of money to process any more. The government's solution was to hire more contractors to administer the security clearance reviews.

Over time, the backlog has been dramatically cut. "A long while ago, we were looking at well over a year for even low-level clearances, and the government has gotten it down to roughly four, five, six months," said Evan Lesser, who founded ClearanceJobs.com, a career site that specializes in cleared candidates. "Whether that is at the sake of quality is, I think, surely a debate that could be had."

By 2011, more than 4.2 million government and contract workers had security clearances, and more than a third of them had top-secret access.

But little has been done to beef up the infrastructure needed to ensure that money is well spent and, more important, to protect the reservoirs of secret information the government is gathering to pursue its battle against terrorism.

A review by the Government Accountability Office in 2009 found that of 3,500 security clearance reviews, almost nine in 10 lacked documentation. Of those, nearly a quarter were still approved. "DOD adjudicators granted clearance eligibility without requesting missing investigative information or fully documenting unresolved issues in 22 percent of DOD's adjudicative files," the auditors said.

Glenn Voelz, an Army intelligence officer previously assigned to the Joint Chiefs of Staff at the Pentagon, warned in a 2009 essay that "the rapid and largely unplanned integration of many nongovernmental employees into the workforce presents new liabilities that have been largely ignored to this point," including espionage and counterintelligence.

Among the most aggressive, connected and successful contractors is Snowden's most recent employer, Booz Allen Hamilton.

The McLean-based Booz Allen has almost 25,000 employees and recorded \$5.8 billion in revenue for fiscal 2013, earning \$219 million in profit. Its profits have been soaring in recent years. Nearly all of its revenue comes as a result of "strong and longstanding relationships with a diverse group of clients at all levels of the U.S. government," the company said in a financial filing.

The largest shareholder of the firm is the Carlyle Group, which owns more than two thirds of the shares.

Booz Allen is often referred to as something of a gold standard for intelligence, cybersecurity and other national security issues. It recently described a cutting-edge program this way: "Developing predictive intelligence services that include anticipatory cyber threat solutions, protection, and detection capabilities and the application of social media analytics designed to provide early identification of trends that would otherwise not be possible using after-the-fact analysis of traditional data sources."

A Booz Allen spokesman declined requests for interviews. In a statement Sunday, the company said: "Booz Allen can confirm that **Edward Snowden**, 29, has been an employee of our firm for less than 3 months, assigned to a team in Hawaii. News reports that this individual has claimed to have leaked classified information are shocking, and if accurate, this action represents a grave violation of the code of conduct and core values of our firm. We will work closely with our clients and authorities in their investigation of this matter."

## 7 facts about Booz Allen Hamilton

Neil Irwin

734 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A05

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The leaker of sensitive documents from the National Security Agency, **Edward Snowden**, is an employee of Booz Allen Hamilton, one of the largest and most successful contractors for defense and intelligence agencies. So what is Booz Allen? Here's what you ought to know, according to information gleaned from the company's filings with the Securities and Exchange Commission.

It's huge. Booz Allen has 24,500 employees, \$5.8 billion in revenue for its 2013 fiscal year, \$219 million in profits and a stock market value of \$2.5 billion. It leases 3.2 million square feet of office space across many facilities, which is more space than the Empire State Building.

It makes its money servicing the federal government. Says the company's 10-K filing: "We have strong and longstanding relationships with a diverse group of clients at all levels of the U.S. government. During fiscal 2013, we derived 99% of our revenue from services under more than 5,700 contracts and task orders. The single largest entity that we served in fiscal 2013 was the U.S. Army, which represented approximately 16% of our revenue in that period. We derived 91% of our revenue in fiscal 2013 from engagements for which we acted as the prime contractor."

It's majority-owned by the Carlyle Group. The Washington-based private equity company engineered the company's split from its commercially focused cousin in 2008 and remains the largest shareholder. Carlyle owns 67.3 percent of Booz Allen's stock. For Carlyle, the Booz Allen deal is a return to its roots. The company made its name in the 1980s and 1990s with a number of buyouts of government contractors. But now it is a global private equity giant that invests in almost anything you might imagine, with \$176 billion in assets managed in 114 funds.

Its profits have risen rapidly in the past few years. In the fiscal year ended March 31, 2010, the company reported operating income of less than \$200 million on revenue of \$5.1 billion, as almost every dollar it brought in went out the door to employees. In the three years since, revenue has risen only modestly to \$5.8 billion but operating income has more than doubled to \$446 million. In other words, sales are rising slowly, but profit margins rose dramatically. That explains how bottom-line earnings went from \$25 million in fiscal 2010 to almost nine times that in 2013.

It's trying to figure out how to identify terrorists through social media. On April 1, Booz Allen created a "Strategic Innovation Group," with 1,500 employees, aimed at creating new products that clients (read: government agencies) don't know they need yet. Among its areas of focus? "Developing predictive intelligence services that include anticipatory cyber threat solutions, protection, and detection capabilities and the application of social media analytics designed to provide early identification of trends that would otherwise not be possible using after-the-fact analysis of traditional data sources."

It pays well. Snowden reportedly made \$200,000 annually despite not having a college degree. But that's nothing compared with the top brass. Chairman Ralph W. Shrader was paid \$1.2 million in base salary and a total of \$3.1 million in fiscal 2012. Four named executive vice presidents had total pay packages in the range of \$2 million to \$3 million.

The biggest risk for the company? That its relationship with U.S. government agencies will sour. Every public company must list "risk factors" for investors in its SEC filings, the things that could cause the company's earnings to fall. Booz Allen lists this as its first risk factor: "We depend on contracts with U.S. government agencies for substantially all of our revenue. If our relationships with such agencies are harmed, our future revenue and operating profits would decline." It goes on to note that "any issue that compromises our relationship with the U.S. government generally or any U.S. government agency that we serve would cause our revenue to decline." It is of course too early to say whether the leaks by Snowden would damage those relationships, but the company's stock did decline 2.6 percent Monday, on a day when the overall stock market was little changed.

## NSA leaker's access examined

Peter Finn Greg Miller Ellen Nakashima

1465 words

11 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Counterintelligence investigators are scrutinizing how a 29-year-old contractor who said he leaked top-secret National Security Agency documents was able to gain access to what should be highly compartmentalized information, according to current and former administration and intelligence officials.

**Edward Snowden** worked as a systems administrator at an NSA Threat Operations Center in Hawaii, one of several such facilities that are tasked with detecting threats to government computer systems. He had previously worked for the CIA, U.S. officials said.

Snowden leaked documents to The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper on distinctly different operations: the NSA's collection of data from U.S. phone call records and its surveillance of online communications to and from foreign targets.

Investigators are "working with the NSA and others around the intelligence community to understand exactly what information this individual had access to and how that individual was able to take that information outside the community," a senior U.S. intelligence official said.

Among the questions is how a contract employee at a distant NSA satellite office was able to obtain a copy of an order from the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court, a highly classified document that would presumably be sealed from most employees and of little use to someone in his position.

A former senior NSA official said that the number of agency officials with access to such court orders is "maybe 30 or maybe 40. Not large numbers."

Snowden's exact whereabouts were unknown Monday, and it was unclear whether U.S. officials had sought to interview him or have him apprehended by officials in Hong Kong, where he had taken refuge.

Administration officials said Monday that they are working to confirm that Snowden leaked the documents and build a case against him without relying on his admissions in his video interview with the Guardian. Investigators also need to determine whether anyone else was involved in disclosing the information to reporters, officials said.

FBI agents are interviewing Snowden's family and associates, said officials who spoke on the condition of anonymity to discuss the investigation.

Snowden, who said he leaked top-secret documents to expose abuse and not to cause damage to the United States, told the Guardian that he had "full access to the rosters of everyone working at the NSA, the entire intelligence community, and undercover assets all around the world, the locations of every station we have, what their missions are and so forth."

Officials questioned some of Snowden's assertions in his interview with the Guardian, saying that several of his claims seemed exaggerated. Among them were assertions that he could order wiretaps on anyone from "a federal judge to even the president."

"When he said he had access to every CIA station around the world, he's lying," said a former senior agency official, who added that information is so closely compartmented that only a handful of top-ranking executives at the agency could access it.

Current and former administration officials were flummoxed by Snowden's claim that he was authorized to access the orders from the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court.

The order probably would have been accessible to the NSA general counsel's office, the compliance office that deals with the court, and the operational arm carrying out the collection, former officials said.

One former NSA official said the NSA employs layers of security to scrutinize employees, including keystroke-monitoring systems to identify potential breaches or unwarranted searches of NSA databases.

Joel Brenner, a former NSA inspector general, said any investigation needs to focus on how Snowden "had access to such a startling range of information."

"The spy you want in an organization may not be the executive assistant to the secretary of state," Brenner said. "It may be the guy in the bowels of the IT department because he has system-administrator privileges and because that person is also in a position to insert malware into your system to facilitate remote access."

Further information about Snowden's personal and professional life was scant Monday.

His mother, who lives in Maryland, and his father, who retired from the U.S. Coast Guard in 2009 and lives in the Lehigh Valley area of Pennsylvania, would not speak about their son. The parents divorced in 2001, about two years after Snowden left high school.

Snowden's girlfriend, Lindsay Mills, has been "in complete shock" upon learning that he revealed classified records about top-secret government surveillance programs, said one of her friends who asked not to be identified because of the ongoing criminal investigation. "I have recently talked to her," the friend said. "I know she didn't have any idea."

Three people friendly with Mills and her parents said she had been dating Snowden for several years and moved with him when he relocated briefly to Hawaii.

Snowden joined the Army in 2004 and trained for the Special Forces for four months before leaving the service without finishing, an Army spokesman said. Snowden said he departed because he had broken his legs in a training accident and was discharged. An Army spokesman did not confirm that account, saying only that "he did not complete any training or receive any awards."

Snowden said he then worked at the University of Maryland as a security guard at a secret NSA facility near the College Park campus. University spokesman Brian Ullmann confirmed that in 2005, Snowden worked

for less than a year as a "security specialist" for the school's Center for Advanced Study of Language. The university-affiliated center, founded in 2003, is not a classified facility.

Snowden said that after his stint at U-Md., the CIA hired him to work on technology security. The agency has declined to comment on his employment.

Snowden said he left the CIA in 2009 to work for the NSA through two private contractors, first at a Dell computers operation in Columbia, and then at Booz Allen Hamilton. Dell spokesman Scott Radcliffe would not confirm whether Snowden worked there, saying that "the Justice Department has asked us to refer all questions to them." The government contractor confirmed that Snowden had worked there for the past three months in an office in Hawaii. He flew to Hong Kong after telling his supervisor in Hawaii that he needed medical treatment for epilepsy.

One administration official said it is too early to determine how the United States will attempt to take custody of Snowden. Officials may simply attempt to see if the authorities in Hong Kong will deport him and avoid the need for a full extradition procedure.

"Ultimately, a lot of these cases get resolved through something other than formal extradition," said Shane Kadidal, a lawyer at the Center of Constitutional Rights in New York.

In Hong Kong, Snowden is believed to have checked out of a hotel Monday where he was thought to be staying.

Some in Hong Kong said the semi-autonomous jurisdiction may not offer Snowden the protection he hopes for. "Hong Kong is definitely not a safe harbor for him," said Regina Ip, a lawmaker and chairman of the New People's Party.

Hong Kong has its own legislative and legal systems but ultimately answers to Beijing, under the "one country, two systems" arrangement, established when oversight of Hong Kong was transferred from the British to the Chinese in 1997. The extradition treaty between Hong Kong and the United States was established at the time of the British-Chinese handover because the treaty needed the blessing of Hong Kong's new sovereign ruler, the Chinese government.

The treaty says that Hong Kong can refuse to transfer a suspected criminal to the United States if the person is a People's Republic of China national and if giving up the person "implicates" the "defense, foreign affairs or essential public interest or policy" of the PRC.

Given the touchy nature of China's relationship with the United States and Hong Kong, experts said the Chinese government is likely to stay in the background with Snowden's case.

Ip noted that the United States and Hong Kong have a strong record of cooperation on the extradition of fugitives.

Top officials from the Justice Department, the FBI and the NSA will appear Tuesday in front of House members to discuss the NSA's surveillance efforts and the fallout from the leaks. The Senate will hold a similar closed hearing on Thursday.

Administration officials stressed Monday that they have briefed Congress repeatedly on surveillance programs



## Snowden's girlfriend shocked by events

Carol D. Leonnig Julie Tate

833 words

12 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

**Edward Snowden**, the government contractor who leaked documents revealing a top-secret government surveillance program, was so cautious and distant that even his girlfriend of eight years referred to him as "my man of mystery."

For a 29-year-old who made his living in the digital world, Snowden has left remarkably few online traces. But as reclusive and private as he was, his longtime girlfriend, Lindsay Mills, 28, who moved with him to Hawaii last year, was outgoing and expressive. Writing in a blog that has vanished from public view, Mills, a native of Laurel, told of having to "kidnap" Snowden and "force a little adventure" on him to get him to join friends on a hike to a waterfall.

Mills's blog, "Lsjourney," in which she described herself as a "world-traveling, pole-dancing superhero," was publicly viewable after Snowden announced Sunday that he was the source of leaks to The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper about the surveillance programs, but the blog had been taken down by early Tuesday.

Friends of Mills confirmed that she wrote the blog and that the boyfriend she refers to as "E" was Edward Joseph Snowden. Mills, who moved to Honolulu with Snowden, graduated from Laurel High School in Maryland in 2003 and from the Maryland Institute College of Art in 2007.

In her postings, she described swing dancing and pole dancing at venues in Hawaii, and being alone for two weeks starting in late March because Snowden was headed to the mainland for a two-week business trip.

Friends said Mills was completely unaware of Snowden's decision to leak classified records detailing surveillance programs through which the United States collects reams of e-mails, phone records and electronic data.

"I just talked to her," said a friend of Mills's in Hawaii. "I know she didn't have any idea."

Mills did not respond to messages left on her home phone or cellphone. Efforts to reach her father, mother and stepfather also were unsuccessful.

In a blog post Monday, Mills said she wouldn't be sharing updates for a while. Friends said she is in shock over Snowden's sudden departure for Hong Kong.

"As I type this on my tear-streaked keyboard I'm reflecting on all the faces that have graced my path," she wrote. "The ones I laughed with. The ones I've held. The one I've grown to love the most. And the ones I never got to bid adieu. But sometimes life doesn't afford proper goodbyes."

Unlike Mills, Snowden had virtually no online presence until he revealed himself as the source of the leaks. Neighbors in the couple's Honolulu neighborhood of Waipahu said Snowden rebuffed their overtures and provided no personal information.

He and Mills moved to Honolulu when he got a job with the consulting firm Booz Allen Hamilton as a systems analyst for the National Security Agency Threat Operations Center. Booz Allen said Tuesday that Snowden was fired on Monday.

When members of Carolyn Tijing's family, which lived across the street, tried to introduce themselves, Snowden said "fine," kept his head down and kept walking to his house, Tijing said.

"It was a no go, no conversation at all," she said.

Numerous members of Snowden's class at Arundel High School, where he attended ninth grade and part of 10th grade, said they do not remember him. The principal at the time also had no recollection.

But Mills, in her blog, appeared comfortable sharing intimate thoughts, including occasional frustration with Snowden. She wrote of having deep conversations with him as they weeded their unruly yard, of recoiling when he critiqued her dance routine, of her disappointment when she learned that he would have to "be preoccupied with work the next few days."

Life in Hawaii was a continual adventure for Mills. She and Snowden went to the zoo together and bathed in the lagoons of Waikiki. When they arrived in the state, Snowden surprised Mills in the baggage claim area with a lei of purple and yellow flowers, she wrote.

Mills is open and warm, "a really beautiful and kind person," said a friend and fellow dancer in Hawaii, who asked not to be identified so as not to be besieged by reporters.

In September, Mills wrote of a successful effort to persuade Snowden to go hiking with her and several friends: "At two of my favorite places on the island . . . a plot to get E out in nature was formed."

The next month, though, she wrote of feeling low after "a weekend of cleaning house and heavy conversations."

"Trouble of loving someone you are incompatible with means having the same endless talk for eight years in a row," a post on Instagram said. "One of those times I wish I had wings."

## Moore's Law, J. Edgar Hoover and the real roots of the NSA surveillance scandal

Neil Irwin

821 words

12 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A12

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The lines are already being drawn over whether to view **Edward Snowden**, the National Security Agency leaker, as a hero who blew the whistle on a dangerous government intrusion into privacy or a villain who criminally endangered our national security. But the debate over government surveillance should start with a different name: Gordon E. Moore.

Moore is the co-founder of Intel who in 1965 came up with Moore's Law, which predicted that computing power would double every year. The trend has kept up for two generations and counting, causing exponential growth in computers' ability to process information.

When Moore's Law was conceived, and J. Edgar Hoover was at the height of his power running the FBI, a world in which the government could plausibly suck in all the data created by hundreds of millions of Americans or billions of earthlings was simply beyond imagining. (Well, not completely beyond imagining. George Orwell did quite a good job of that.)

If you were a federal agent who wanted to intercept somebody's mail, you had to go down to the post office to get it. If you wanted to wiretap a phone call, you needed to physically install a wiretap. Read, for example, John Judis's account of being tailed by the FBI as a young radical in the 1960s and '70s, and think of the sheer manpower - and money - that was deployed to monitor every minor lefty activist of that era.

Of course, that variety of surveillance state was largely done away with in the post-Watergate reforms. Domestic spying was limited to investigations that obtained a warrant, which in turn required credible evidence of a crime before G-men could snoop. But the entire legal regime was still based on the premise that state monitoring of private communications was something that could be done only by those traditional means of investigating a possible crime.

Fast forward 40 years. Digital storage and computing speeds are such that it is within the technical capacity of the government to archive every telephone conversation on Earth. I have at my fingertips, thanks to my Gmail account, every e-mail I have written since 2005, nearly 26,000 separate conversations - and if Snowden's accusations about the Prism program are accurate, so does the NSA (though there's a lot we don't know about what steps the government has to go through to exploit the technology). The Google servers alone contain vast quantities of information, instantly searchable, belonging to their many millions of customers, like me.

In proving Moore's Law, all the world's information can be stored, catalogued and accessed in ways that would make Hoover leap with delight.

Meanwhile, the old system of separating domestic and international spying is looking more and more antiquated. It's fine to have a 1970s-era principle that the FBI can't spy on radical citizen activists unless it has evidence that they are looking to commit a crime, while the CIA can spy on the Soviets with few limits. But in a world where loose networks of terrorists incite our biggest fears and where information is pinged around the world with little respect for national boundaries, the old distinctions aren't particularly useful.

What could or should the intelligence agencies have done with Boston Marathon bomber Tamerlan Tsarnaev? He was a legal resident of the United States who was not known to have committed any crimes before the attack but may have had connections to Chechen radicals. These situations rapidly become a legal knot, and it's hard to know from constitutional principles exactly where the lines ought to be.

Couple that with the extreme secrecy around what exactly the U.S. government's technical capacities are, and what legal authorities they are based upon, and you have a nasty combination. The people (up to and including the president) who know what Prism and similar programs are truly capable of argue that disclosing those details would make it too easy for bad guys to evade government monitoring. So we have to just trust that they aren't overstepping any boundaries of legitimate civil liberties.

So, it's: Just trust us on this.

Put it all together and we end up here: Technology has made possible the monitoring of private communications on a scale that was unthinkable a generation ago. The legal regime that governs use of the communications has evolved slowly to deal with that reality. And the people who actually know what the government is doing, and what it's capable of doing, say they can't tell us those details. Is it any mystery why people are uncomfortable with what they've been learning in the past few days?

## The low-profile, tech-savvy intelligence risk

Greg Miller

1222 words

12 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

In the span of three years, the United States has developed two gaping holes in its national security hull, punctures caused by leakers who worked at the lowest levels of the nation's intelligence ranks but gained access to large caches of classified material.

The parallels between **Edward Snowden**, who has declared himself the source of leaks on National Security Agency surveillance programs, and Bradley Manning, a U.S. Army private on trial for sending hundreds of thousands of secret files to the WikiLeaks Web site, go beyond generational ties.

Both enlisted in the Army during the war in Iraq only to later say they were disillusioned by that conflict. Neither has a college degree or extensive academic training in computer science. And yet both were technically savvy, able to navigate sensitive computer networks and smuggle classified files.

The back-to-back breaches - seen by many as the most significant in decades - have forced U.S. intelligence officials to examine whether the cases are isolated in scope or part of a new category of exposure emerging at the edges of classified U.S. networks.

U.S. officials said counterintelligence teams are already looking beyond the details of the Snowden case at any vulnerabilities it has exposed.

"At this point, we're still looking at this as an anomaly," a senior U.S. intelligence official said. But he said a damage assessment ordered by Director of National Intelligence James R. Clapper Jr. is broad in scope, focused largely on the implications of a case in which highly sensitive materials were somehow within the grasp of a contractor who moved through a series of low-ranking jobs for the CIA and the NSA.

Snowden and Manning both took advantage of access to computer systems that expanded exponentially in the aftermath of the attacks of Sept. 11, 2001, partly in an effort to make critical information available across agencies.

Since the disclosures by WikiLeaks in 2010, the Pentagon has taken steps to better protect its classified networks. It has banned the use of thumb drives unless special permission is given, mandated that users have special smart cards that authenticate their identities and required analysts to review computer logs to identify suspicious behavior on the network.

Despite such measures, it remains impossible to guarantee security on any classified network. Since going public, Snowden has attributed his extensive access to his role as an ordinary systems administrator for the NSA, although he offered few specific details about where he found or how he removed such sensitive files.

In an e-mail to a Washington Post reporter last month, he said he wanted "to embolden others to step forward," suggesting that he hoped his leak would trigger follow-up disclosures.

Among the files he obtained were a secret order issued by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court and 41 briefing slides on a highly classified program, called PRISM, in which mainstream technology companies including Microsoft, Google and Facebook have given the NSA extensive access to e-mails, videos and other content.

The records released by Snowden are fewer in number but more sensitive and of higher levels of classification than the U.S. diplomatic cables and military reports Manning sent to WikiLeaks after he downloaded them while serving in Iraq.

Snowden has praised Manning but also sought to differentiate himself from his predecessor. In particular, Snowden has indicated that he sought to be more responsible, withholding records he had that might put U.S. intelligence operatives in jeopardy, unlike Manning, who is accused of turning over thousands of pages, some of which contained the names of informants.

But their motivations and backgrounds have extensive overlaps. Both entered the military or government jobs during an era of massive hiring binges, controversial wars and repeated disclosures of alleged abuses by the U.S. military, the CIA and the NSA.

Both have said they wanted to call attention to abuses by the U.S. government, although critics have called them traitors who acted out of an exaggerated sense of self-importance.

Manning was gifted with computers and had begun learning the C++ programming language by the time he was 8. He never found a path to college and instead enlisted in the Army, where he was groomed for a career as an intelligence analyst.

Snowden's plans to pursue a Special Forces career were derailed, he said, by leg injuries he sustained during training that ended his military stint after just three months.

It is less clear how Snowden came by his computer skills. But, as with Manning, his technology savvy appears to have helped him obtain a string of jobs that enabled him to snoop on and eventually steal sensitive files.

Their actions and motivations bear little resemblance to high-profile security breaches of the 1980s and '90s. The best-known cases involved mid-career officials such as the CIA's Aldrich Ames and the FBI's Robert Hanssen, who were convicted of selling secrets to the Soviet and Russian governments for financial gain.

The closest parallel for Snowden and Manning may be Daniel Ellsberg, who in 1971 was the New York Times' and The Washington Post's source for the Pentagon Papers, a secret assessment of the Vietnam War that eroded the credibility of U.S. government's more-optimistic public claims about the conflict. Ellsberg in recent days has praised Snowden and described the material Snowden disclosed as more significant than the documents he leaked four decades ago.

There are differences, however. Ellsberg was a senior military analyst working at the Pentagon who had a direct role in drafting the Pentagon Papers. The document was largely a record of U.S. decision-making rather than a blueprint of ongoing operations. Drafts were undoubtedly stored in safes, not on networks where they might be read by low-level employees at distant military or intelligence outposts.

A former senior NSA official recalled procedures in the 1970s that were archaic but secure. "When hot documents would go around they'd be in a double-sealed envelope, and some person would wait while you read it, re-envelope it and leave," the former official said. "By contrast, now you bring it up on your computer screen."

Some U.S. officials question whether there is a generational gap in views on privacy and government transparency. Manning and Snowden, who are in their 20s, grew up with technology and the Internet as fixtures in their lives.

"We are recruiting Americans from a culture that has a deeper desire for absolute transparency than any previous cohort of people entering the service," said Michael V. Hayden, former CIA and NSA director. "They are coming from a culture in which, for many, transparency is an absolute good, and it appears that in these two cases it influenced these people."

Snowden appears to have left fewer online footprints than many of his generation, with no evidence of Facebook or Twitter accounts. In his comments to The Post, he indicated that was in part because of what he had learned.

The Internet "is a TV that watches you," he said, a technology "governments are abusing . . . to extend their powers beyond what is necessary and appropriate."

## Dozens of attacks foiled, NSA says

Ellen Nakashima Jerry Markon

1469 words

13 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The head of the National Security Agency defended his agency's broad electronic surveillance programs Wednesday, saying that they have helped thwart dozens of terrorist attacks and that their recent public disclosure has done "great harm" to the nation's security.

Facing his first public grilling since it was revealed that the NSA has secretly collected millions of telephone records as well as e-mails and other Internet data, Gen. Keith Alexander sought to aggressively rebut congressional and other criticism of the Obama administration's anti-terrorism tactics.

He said the surveillance programs were critical to unraveling terrorist plots at home and abroad. In particular, he cited the cases of Najibullah Zazi, an Afghan American who pleaded guilty to planning suicide attacks in New York, and Pakistani American David C. Headley, who was arrested in 2009 for his role in a terrorist attack the year before in Mumbai, and who was plotting to attack a Danish newspaper that published a satirical cartoon of the prophet Muhammad.

"I think what we're doing to protect American citizens here is the right thing," Alexander said under sometimes hostile questioning before the Senate Appropriations Committee. "Our agency takes great pride in protecting this nation and our civil liberties and privacy."

Alexander's appearance featured the unusual spectacle of the head of the ultra-secretive NSA publicly discussing highly classified programs as the administration is pursuing possible criminal charges against a former NSA contractor who says he leaked the details of those efforts.

Alexander's words reflected the intense debate consuming Washington since last week's revelations that the government has been collecting the call records of millions of Americans and scooping up e-mail and other user records of foreign targets from nine leading technology companies, including Google, Facebook and Microsoft.

The confessed leaker, **Edward Snowden**, 29, surfaced publicly again Wednesday, saying that the United States has mounted massive hacking operations against hundreds of Chinese targets since 2009 as part of a global campaign. Snowden, in an interview in Hong Kong, vowed to fight the U.S. government in the courts if it attempts to extradite and prosecute him.

U.S. officials said criminal charges are being prepared against Snowden, but they declined to specify the nature of the charges or when they might be filed. The officials spoke on the condition of anonymity to discuss ongoing deliberations.

The Obama administration has defended its extensive surveillance, and President Obama has said he welcomes a public debate about the programs. Alexander followed up on that pledge Wednesday, vowing to quickly make public data showing the phone program has prevented attacks.

"Over the next week, it will be our intent to get those figures out. . . . I want the American people to know we're being transparent here," he said.

The phone-records program, disclosed last week by Britain's Guardian newspaper, collects customer "metadata," including the phone numbers dialed and the length of calls - and, senators said, location data, which intelligence analysts use to detect patterns and personal connections. The administration said that the program does not monitor the content of calls and that it has been reviewed by a secret surveillance court and Congress.

A separate Internet surveillance program, known as PRISM, allows the NSA to collect videos, photos, e-mails, documents and connection logs for foreign users thought to be located overseas through nine leading Internet companies. The government obtains the data through orders approved by the secret court established by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act. That program was disclosed by The Washington Post and the Guardian.

Alexander appeared at a hearing to discuss cybersecurity spending, but some committee members took the opportunity to question him about the surveillance programs.

The four-star Army general said he thinks the leaks have hurt national security. But he said it is important to allay concerns across the political spectrum that the government surveillance was exceeding constitutional bounds.

"Grave harm has already been done by opening this up," he said. "There is no doubt in my mind that we will lose capabilities as a result of this, and that not only the United States but those allies that we would help will no longer be as safe as they were two weeks ago."

But, he said, he wanted to counter perceptions the agency was violating privacy. "If the perspective is we're trying to hide something because we did something wrong, we're not," he said.

Senators pressed Alexander on how Snowden, a fairly low-level contract employee doing computer systems work, could have had access to so much classified information.

"How on Earth does this happen?" asked Sen. Jon Tester (D-Mont.).

Acknowledging "grave concerns" about Snowden's apparently extensive access to highly sensitive data, Alexander replied: "In this case, this individual was a system administrator with access to key parts of the network. That is of serious concern to us and something that we have to fix."

The Office of the Director of National Intelligence has ordered a damage assessment following Snowden's disclosures. A senior intelligence official said Wednesday that the CIA also has opened an internal investigation to determine what activities Snowden was involved in when he worked there.

"Obviously, Mr. Snowden's actions over the past week-plus are generating a lot of activity on the part of the intelligence community and the CIA," said the official, who spoke on the condition of anonymity to discuss an ongoing inquiry.

CIA officials could not say exactly when he worked there. After leaving the agency, he worked for the technology company Dell and later for Booz Allen Hamilton, the consulting firm. While working for Booz Allen this year, he was assigned to the NSA's Threat Operations Center in Honolulu, where he is believed to have downloaded highly classified material.

Under questioning from Sen. Patrick J. Leahy (D-Vt.), Alexander said the PRISM program was critical to developing the key lead in the Zazi case. He said the program turned up information from operatives overseas, which led to connections to an unidentified person in Colorado. That data was passed to the FBI, which determined the person was Zazi, he said.

From there, the phone records program was used to "find out connections from Zazi to other players throughout communities, specifically in New York City," Alexander said.

He said that the PRISM program helped develop information that led to Headley and that the phone records program provided "corroborating" evidence.

"These authorities complement each other in helping us identify different terrorist actions and help disrupt them," he said. "The reality is they work together."

Alexander seemed to suggest that current surveillance programs might have helped prevent the attacks of Sept. 11, 2001. He said that one of the attackers was picked up in telephone intercepts but that officials did not have the data to make the right connections before the attacks.

In interviews with The Post and the Guardian last week, Snowden said that he was motivated by what he considered a widespread invasion of privacy by the NSA. In Hong Kong, where he has been hiding, he added that the United States has engaged in a worldwide hacking campaign.

The South China Morning Post, which said it interviewed Snowden at an undisclosed location in Hong Kong, said he presented "unverified documents" describing an extensive U.S. campaign to obtain information from computers in Hong Kong and mainland China.

"We hack network backbones - like huge Internet routers, basically - that give us access to the communications of hundreds of thousands of computers without having to hack every single one," he told the newspaper.

According to Snowden, the NSA has engaged in more than 61,000 hacking operations worldwide, including hundreds aimed at Chinese universities, businesses and public officials.

Senior American officials have accused China of hacking into U.S. military and business computers. Snowden's claims of extensive U.S. hacking of Chinese computers track assertions made repeatedly by senior Chinese government officials that they are victims of similar cyber-intrusions.

Snowden's assertions could not be verified, and U.S. officials did not respond to requests for comment.

It is unclear what step the U.S. government will take against Snowden, although it seems likely that he will face criminal charges. Kenneth L. Wainstein, a former assistant attorney general for national security, said the Justice Department has no choice except to prosecute him.

"The fact that you might have altruistic views doesn't give you license to unilaterally decide to disclose government secrets and possibly cause grave damage to the government's counterterrorism operations," he said in an interview.



## U.S. officials fear leaker has more classified files

Greg Miller Sari Horwitz

1222 words

14 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A03

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

A broad assessment of the damage caused by disclosure of documents on classified intelligence programs has concluded that the former National Security Agency contractor who claimed responsibility for the leaks probably obtained dozens of other sensitive files, U.S. officials said Thursday.

The disclosure came as NSA and FBI officials came under new pressure from senior lawmakers to defend the agency's interpretation of a law that it has used to sweep up the phone records of millions of U.S. citizens, and to declassify material to support NSA Director Keith B. Alexander's assertion that the surveillance programs have helped to thwart "dozens" of terrorist attacks.

The early findings by investigators evaluating the scope of the breach appear to bolster former NSA contractor **Edward Snowden's** claims that he made off with additional classified files that have yet to be exposed. Snowden, who has sought refuge in Hong Kong, said he has documents showing extensive U.S. cyber-intrusions worldwide.

U.S. counterintelligence teams "believe that he has more," said a U.S. official briefed on the status of the investigation. He said the NSA is "going through a major auditing" of materials to which Snowden had access, seeking answers about how he was able to obtain a classified Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court order and other records that should have been beyond his reach as a systems administrator.

U.S. officials are "worried that the disclosures will lead to a degradation over time of the effectiveness of the programs," said the official, who spoke on the condition of anonymity because the assessment is ongoing.

The leaks about NSA surveillance activities have triggered a polarizing debate over the legal basis and effectiveness of programs that have swept up data on millions of U.S. citizens and been hailed as critical in preventing multiple terrorist attacks.

Sens. Mark Udall of Colorado and Ron Wyden of Oregon, Democratic members of the Senate Intelligence Committee who have been critical of the NSA's activities, challenged Alexander's claims that "dozens" of attacks have been avoided as a result of the programs.

"We have not yet seen any evidence showing that the NSA's dragnet collection of Americans' phone records has produced any uniquely valuable intelligence," the lawmakers said in a statement Thursday. Contrary to Alexander's assertion, they said classified information they have reviewed suggests that "all of the plots that he mentioned appear to have been identified using other collection methods. The public deserves a clear explanation."

The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court order leaked by Snowden and subsequent disclosures indicate that the NSA has been collecting "metadata," which includes the numbers, locations and durations, on billions of phone calls in the United States over the past seven years. Alexander and others have emphasized that the data contain no names and that the NSA can't listen to the contents of those communications without additional permission from the court.

Lawmakers who support the program pushed the NSA to quickly declassify information about intercepted plots as well as about the safeguards the agency employs to protect U.S. citizens' privacy. But even supporters have offered conflicting characterizations of the programs' successes.

Rep. C.A. Dutch Ruppersberger (Md.), the ranking Democrat on the House Intelligence Committee, emerged from a closed-door briefing with Alexander on Thursday and said the leaks have damaged critical intelligence gathering programs that have "thwarted 10 possible terrorist attacks."

Rep. Mike Rogers (R-Mich.), the committee chairman, then stepped forward to say that the number "far exceeds 10." Rogers defended the collection of data on Americans, saying, "If you're going to connect the dots on a 9/11-style event . . . you have to have dots in the box in order to connect."

U.S. officials have so far identified two plots that they say the NSA programs helped to disrupt: a planned suicide bombing on the New York City subway system and a plot to attack a Danish newspaper by a Pakistani American, David C. Headley, who was arrested in 2009 for his role in a deadly attack the year before in Mumbai.

After a separate briefing attended by 47 members of the Senate, Sen. Dianne Feinstein (D-Calif.) indicated that the NSA is expected to declassify materials on those and other plots early next week. She said the process has been painstaking because Alexander "wants to be exact" with the data presented to the public.

"We'll make an assessment based" on what Alexander presents, said Feinstein, chairman of the Senate Intelligence Committee. But she also indicated that lawmakers are already planning new legislation that would bar contractors such as Snowden from "handling highly classified technical data."

The House and Senate hearings were part of a series of appearances on Capitol Hill by senior Obama administration officials to defend and explain the surveillance programs exposed by the leaks.

FBI Director Robert S. Mueller III was asked repeatedly during a House Judiciary Committee hearing to explain how the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, which serves as the basis for the controversial NSA programs, allowed the agency to collect so much data on Americans who are under no legal suspicion.

The law "fails to impose a meaningful limit on the government's ability to collect this type of information," said Rep. John Conyers Jr. (D-Mich.). "If every call is relevant, then the relevant standard we enacted into law has little practical meaning."

Mueller's response did little to clarify the administration's position, centering instead on its effectiveness as a rationale. He said the data gathered by the NSA "may be relevant in the future, has been relevant in the past, and its collection in this matter thereby satisfies the requirement for relevance, according to the court."

Mueller provided little information on the FBI's pursuit of Snowden, the 29-year-old former CIA employee and NSA contractor, except to say that the bureau is "taking all necessary steps to hold this person responsible for these disclosures."

Snowden's whereabouts have been unclear since he checked out of a Hong Kong hotel two days ago, but he has indicated that he will seek asylum and fight extradition to the United States.

Since coming forward Sunday as the source of the NSA leaks, Snowden has alluded to additional U.S. national security secrets that he is prepared to disclose. In an interview in Hong Kong with the South China Morning Post, Snowden said the United States has conducted massive hacking operations against hundreds of Chinese targets since 2009. The newspaper said he had presented "unverified documents" describing those hacking operations.

After scouring Snowden's employment records and computer access logs, U.S. officials believe he smuggled files from classified networks to which he had access as a systems analyst.

Snowden's decision to flee to Hong Kong and his disclosures about alleged U.S. cyber operations against the Chinese have raised some suspicions of ties to that government. Rogers said, "We're going to make sure that there's a thorough scrub of what his China connections are."

Other U.S. officials said no evidence has surfaced to substantiate those concerns.

## Tech firms in talks on disclosure

Brian Womack

550 words

15 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A11

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Google and Facebook are holding discussions with U.S. officials to disclose more information about national-security requests, people with knowledge of the matter said Friday.

The people asked not to be identified because the talks aren't public. The negotiations follow Google's open letter to Attorney General Eric H. Holder Jr. and FBI Director Robert S. Mueller III earlier this week asking for more leeway to report aggregate numbers of data requests.

Facebook General Counsel Ted Ulyot wrote in a blog post late Friday that the social-networking service had received permission to disclose some information about national security-related orders, though it may release numbers only in aggregate and as a range. He wrote that Facebook received between 9,000 and 10,000 requests for user data, affecting 18,000 to 19,000 user accounts, in the second half of 2012.

Microsoft and Facebook joined Google in asking for disclosure permission, seeking to reassure customers that authorities don't have unfettered access to users' personal details. While the companies have said they don't give the government direct access to their systems, thousands of technology, finance and manufacturing businesses are providing information to U.S. national security agencies, four other people familiar with the process said.

Chris Gaither, a spokesman for Google, and Andrew Ames, a spokesman for the Justice Department, declined to comment.

The AllThingsD Web site reported the Web companies' negotiations with the government earlier Friday.

The role of private companies has come under scrutiny since **Edward Snowden**, a computer technician who did work for the National Security Agency (NSA), disclosed this month that the agency is collecting millions of U.S. residents' telephone records and the computer communications of foreigners from Internet companies under court orders.

"Google's numbers would clearly show that our compliance with these requests falls far short of the claims being made," David Drummond, chief legal officer at Google, wrote on a blog post. "Google has nothing to hide."

The U.S. government program, code-named PRISM, traces its roots to warrantless domestic-surveillance efforts under President George W. Bush. According to slides provided by Snowden, PRISM gathers e-mails and other private data of foreign surveillance targets through arrangements that vary by company, overseen by a secret panel of judges.

The technology companies said they hand over data to the government only when compelled by law to do so. AOL, Apple and Paltalk released statements saying they've never heard of PRISM and don't give authorities access without a court order.

Google is seeking to disclose requests within the rules of national security laws, including the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act. The three-decade-old law lets intelligence agencies monitor the communications of non-U.S. citizens reasonably believed to be located outside the United States and involved in terrorist activities or other crimes.

Along with the NSA, the CIA, the FBI and branches of the U.S. military have agreements with companies to gather data that might seem innocuous, yet could be highly useful in the hands of U.S. intelligence or cyberwarfare units, according to the people, who have either worked for the government or are in companies that have these accords.

## Leaker of secrets preferred to keep his own life hidden

Carol D. Leonnig Jenna Johnson Marc Fisher

2756 words

16 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

He dropped out of high school in the middle of 10th grade, yet won well-paying positions that came with overseas travel and access to some of the world's most closely held secrets.

He had a vivacious, outgoing girlfriend and boasted online about his interest in nubile, beautiful women, even as he secluded himself in a world of computer games, anime and close study of the Internet's architecture.

**Edward Snowden**, the skinny kid from suburban Maryland who took it upon himself to expose - and, officials say, severely compromise - classified U.S. government surveillance programs, loved role-playing games, leaned libertarian, worked out hard and dabbled in modeling.

He relished the perks of his jobs with the CIA and some of the world's most prestigious employers. Yet his girlfriend considered it a major accomplishment when she got him to leave the house for a hike with friends.

Snowden, 29, emerged a week ago from his status as an anonymous source for stories in The Washington Post and the Guardian, announcing to the world that he was prepared to be prosecuted for breaking his pledge to keep classified materials secret. But as quickly as he popped up in a fancy Hong Kong hotel, he vanished again, going underground as U.S. officials said they were preparing a legal case against him and several members of Congress called him a traitor.

Although Snowden has repeatedly insisted that the documents he revealed are the story and that his life is of no interest, questions about his motives and rationale inevitably colored the debate over his decision to violate his oath.

Snowden could not be reached for comment; he has not been seen since Monday, when he left the Hong Kong hotel from which he revealed himself to the world. And for someone who spent most of his life deeply exploring the most powerful communications tool of the era, he has connected with remarkably few people.

Teachers, classmates, neighbors and fellow hobbyists consistently say they don't remember him, or they recall him primarily as a quiet sort who made a point of keeping his distance.

For years, Snowden has sought to keep his online activities hidden, posting under pseudonyms even as a teenager and hanging out on anime, gaming and technology sites, chatting with fellow webheads about how to be on the Internet without being traced. "I wouldn't want God himself to know where I've been, you know?" he wrote in 2003 on a bulletin board for the technically inclined.

But Snowden also craved the limelight. Even a decade ago, while debating a fine point of Internet structure, Snowden celebrated the response to one of his posts: "256 page views make me smile." He explored becoming a male model, having a portrait photographer shoot him in alluring poses on a wooden bridge. And when he went public as the leaker, he did so on video, offering an assured, even cocky, argument for the acts that drove him to hide halfway around the world from the government of the country he claimed to love.

Eddie Snowden was a shy, thin-boned boy who didn't say a lot. At Prince of Peace Presbyterian Church on Crofton Parkway, not far from Snowden's childhood home in Anne Arundel County, Boy Scout Troop 731 met weekly, but although Snowden was a Scout for several years in elementary and middle school, the troop's leaders and members recall little about him.

His two Scoutmasters said they don't remember Snowden at all. Fellow Scout Brad Gunson, who attended Crofton Middle and Arundel High schools with Snowden, recalled Eddie's high voice, feathery blond hair and obsession with computer video games.

"He liked fantasy games, video games," said Gunson, who now leads a band and teaches music. "There was this weird trend when we were kids - a killing game I can't remember. And Magic cards. I remember him being into that."

Gunson said several friends from Arundel High began trading e-mails and Facebook messages about Snowden last week after his face showed up on front pages and newscasts. They remembered playing tennis or a darkly themed online game with Snowden.

The owner of S&S Music in Crofton said Snowden took lessons there in the mid-1990s, but the owner could not recall what instrument the boy played. (In online posts a few years later, Snowden talked about owning a guitar.)

Another fellow Scout, John Baldwin, said in an interview that Snowden, two years his junior, didn't stand out in a troop serving the area around Fort Meade, the suburban military installation where the National Security Agency is headquartered.

"My troop fit the stereotype of having a lot of weird little guys - computer nerds who loved to run around in the woods," Baldwin said. Eddie "wasn't a troublemaker or anything. Just shy and friendly."

Classmates and neighbors said that in a place where government employees and contractors with high-level security clearances lived, it wasn't at all odd for adults to be secretive and avoid forming close friendships, and that attitude was evident among teenagers, too.

Twenty-five miles north of the capital, concrete barriers and guard stations surround the headquarters of the nation's biggest intelligence agency, the NSA, where an estimated 30,000 people acquire and interpret an unimaginable torrent of information gleaned from the world's digital, satellite and broadcast communications channels. Employees of the NSA and its corporate partners, dozens of which have offices in surrounding business parks, dominate nearby neighborhoods.

When Joshua Stewart, who grew up near Snowden and now works as a reporter at the Orange County Register, started talking to friends about the leaker, "we tried to come up with someone who didn't have a security connection, and we couldn't."

When Stewart moved away from the Fort Meade area, he was struck by how deeply unusual his home town was - a place where even at mid-morning coffee break time, the local Starbucks was virtually silent, bereft of the workplace conversation heard elsewhere.

"This is part of the culture of living in Crofton," Gunson said. "This is where a lot of people are making the money that gives them all this comfort - the big intelligence operation that Washington runs."

Halfway through 10th grade, during the 1998-99 school year, Snowden dropped out of Arundel High School, where he had made little impression. Neither the principal nor the teachers who taught his favorite subjects remember him. Several classmates racked their memories last week and came up empty.

The feeling was mutual. On the Internet chat rooms where he often would hang out at night, Snowden occasionally dashed off dismissive comments about high school. He took pride in building a career without having climbed the ordinary rungs of an American education. In one online posting, Snowden described his public school experience as "wretched."

Three years after Snowden left high school, his parents divorced. His father, Lonnie, was a career Coast Guard officer who retired and moved to Pennsylvania a few years ago; he has remarried. His mother, Elizabeth, chief deputy clerk for administration and information technology at Baltimore's federal court, has lived in a condo in Ellicott City since 2002. Neither parent responded to requests for comment.

Snowden dipped in and out of course work over the next dozen years, taking classes at Anne Arundel Community College, the University of Maryland's University College, the University of Liverpool and the Computer Career Institute, a for-profit college then affiliated with Johns Hopkins University.

He became a Microsoft Certified Solutions Expert - a status the computer giant offers as a gateway to tech jobs - but Snowden felt stuck in those first years of adulthood, describing himself on the Ars Technica site as someone "without a degree or clearance who lives in Maryland. Read that as 'unemployed.' "

In 2004, he enlisted in the Army Reserve as a Special Forces recruit. His religion, he wrote on his Army application form, was Buddhist. "Agnostic is strangely absent" from the form, he wrote in an online post, dismissing religion as "blindly making someone else's beliefs your own."

A few months earlier, a poster using the pseudonym "Chishinken," a name Snowden adopted in some technical online discussions, had written about beginning basic training and buying a rifle for someone who "has not fired a rifle since he was seven years old."

But Snowden's military career ended almost before it began. Less than four months after he reported to Fort Benning in Georgia for the Army's Advanced Individual Training program, Snowden was discharged.

In a message on Ars Technica, where he used the handle TheTrueHOOHA, Snowden said he broke both of his legs during training and was discharged as a result, though he complained that "after being cleared, they held onto me for another month just for s--ts and giggles."

Snowden "attempted to qualify to become a Special Forces soldier but did not complete the requisite training and was administratively discharged," said Col. David H. Patterson Jr., an Army spokesman at the Pentagon. The Army made no mention of any accident or injury.

Snowden struggled through a period of joblessness, spending long nights playing computer games and chatting online. (His fascination with games continued even as he rose to more responsible positions. "I

woke this morning with a new name," he announced excitedly in 2010, referring to his gaming avatar. "That name is Wolfking. Wolfking Awesomefox.")

He was into fitness as well, lifting weights and doing P90X, a high-intensity training program featuring intense workouts. "I am working pretty hard on the muscle tone," he wrote, saying he had reduced his body fat to between 9.5 percent and 10.5 percent.

In the early 2000s, he worked as an editor for Ryuhana Press, an online publisher of Japanese-style anime comics. In a fanciful profile he apparently wrote about himself, Snowden, depicted in a caricature wearing an "I [heart] Me" T-shirt, portrayed himself as a lover of the Baltimore Orioles, martial arts, girls, guns and the Japanese fighting video game "Tekken."

In 2005, he found a job as a security guard at the federally funded Center for Advanced Study of Language at the University of Maryland in College Park, where he sometimes had a 6 p.m. to 6 a.m. shift, he told online chatters.

Snowden said last week that his work at the university took place at a "covert facility," but, although some classified research is conducted there, the Defense Department-affiliated center is no secret; its Web site includes driving directions. Snowden said he worked for the NSA during that time, but a university spokesman said Snowden was a Maryland state employee.

In 2006, Snowden made a remarkable leap, from security guard to security clearance, from a lowly position of the sort that high school dropouts find themselves in to a job with double the salary. His new position with the CIA put him on the path to extensive travel, a six-figure income and extraordinary access to classified material.

Snowden spent about three years in Geneva and then in Japan, working, he said, for the CIA and later for a contractor, in both cases on computer network security.

How he managed that jump remains unclear, but Snowden was evidently proud of the move; in a 2006 post, he offered some advice: "First off, the degree thing is crap, at least domestically. . . . I have no degree, nor even a high school diploma, but I'm making much more than what they're paying you even though I'm only claiming six years of experience. It's tough to 'break in,' but once you land a 'real' position, you're made."

At 22, Snowden was confident enough to take on the role of career-advice maven, describing how to parlay any IT job, no matter how lowly, into a lucrative position: "Listen to what they say about networking. . . . If somebody likes you, it doesn't even matter if you put your pants on before your underwear in the morning - you will get the job.

"I have \$0 in debt from student loans, I make \$70k, I just had to turn down offers for \$83k and \$180k. . . . Employers fight over me. And I'm 22."

Snowden wrote about using the Foreign Service as a path to success: "It's an amazing deal if you can swing it. I'm not talking Foreign Service Officer, either, just standard IT specialist positions. They pay for your (ridiculously nice) housing and since you'll be posted overseas, the first ~\$80k you make will be tax-free."

Another time, he wrote that the ticket to world travel was to land a tech job with the State Department. "Get a clearance," he wrote. "If you're cleared, have a lifestyle, and have specialized IT skills, you can go anywhere in the world right now. Thank god for wars."

To Lindsay Mills, Ed Snowden - he was "E" on her blog, which was as expressive and public as Snowden was reserved and private - was a loyal sweetheart, but also a distant sort, "my man of mystery."

She thought they were essentially "incompatible," but she loved him. He was often preoccupied with work, yet he could still surprise her with a lei of purple and yellow flowers.

They met about eight years ago in Maryland, where Mills was a pole-dancing instructor at Xpose Fitness, a women's exotic dance and fitness center, two friends confirmed. Xpose specializes in combining fitness exercise with a style of dancing typically performed in strip clubs. (A manager at Xpose declined to comment.)

Mills grew up in Laurel, went to art school and competed in pole-dancing contests, according to a friend who spoke on the condition of anonymity because the friend suspected that Mills would not appreciate friends speaking about her to reporters.

But in Maryland and later in Hawaii, where Snowden took a job with Booz Allen Hamilton doing contract work for the NSA, Mills's friends said they rarely saw Snowden and knew little about him.

Mills made it her mission to try to draw her boyfriend out of the house. She exulted on her blog when she was finally able to "force a little adventure" on him and get him to join friends on a hike to a Hawaiian waterfall. Snowden's frequent business trips left her plenty of time to work with dance troupes and take courses in aerial silks, an acrobatic practice involving hanging from sturdy silk fabrics, said Terry Deleong of the Samadhi Hawaii dance studio.

Mills had no idea her beau intended to leak classified materials, according to a friend. On the day after Snowden announced he was the leaker and had forsaken "living in Hawaii in paradise and making a ton of money," Mills wrote her last blog post: "My world has opened and closed all at once. . . . Sometimes life doesn't afford proper goodbyes."

By 2010, Snowden was already thinking about the morality of the surveillance programs he was privy to. "Society really seems to have developed an unquestioning obedience towards spooky types," he wrote in an online forum. "Did we get to where we are today via a slippery slope that was entirely within our control to stop, or was it a relatively instantaneous sea change that sneaked in undetected because of pervasive government secrecy?"

Snowden last week said that his "sole motive is to inform the public as to that which was done in their name and that which is done against them." He made no mention of partisan politics, though he twice last year donated \$250 to libertarian Ron Paul's campaign for the Republican presidential nomination.

Snowden now presents himself as a reasoned protester, a conscientious objector of sorts, but he has also shown flashes of anger and even contempt for some aspects of American society. "Go back to your meaningless consumerist life," he wrote four years ago in a comment on a YouTube video that poked fun at the ritual of high school reunions.

He was no ascetic, though. He boasted online about relations with his girlfriend, noting at one point: "You have not lived until you've rolled over to post-coital Krispy Kremes. That's what being an American is all about."

## In Hong Kong, pressure mounts to avoid extraditing Snowden

Jia Lynn Yang

843 words

16 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL



**HONG KONG - Political pressure is growing here for the Hong Kong government to protect Edward Snowden, who has said he will remain in the city and allow the people here to "decide his fate."**

**Yet Snowden is depending on a place that isn't in control of even its own destiny.**

Hong Kong has a separate legal system from mainland China and an avowed devotion to free speech, but the city ultimately answers to Chinese leaders in Beijing, who may be wary of a confrontation with the U.S. government.

"Even we cannot decide our own fate," said Jerry Chan, 26, at a rally Saturday near the U.S. Consulate to support Snowden.

Sixteen years after its transfer from British to Chinese rule, Hong Kong remains a massive experiment in whether former Chinese leader Deng Xiaoping's idea of "one country, two systems" can work. And the surprise arrival of an American bearing information about a secret U.S. surveillance program could test the already uneasy relationship between Beijing and Hong Kong.

The chief executive of Hong Kong, Leung Chun-ying, made his first public comments Saturday about the case, saying the Hong Kong government would follow existing laws if and when the U.S. government requested help dealing with Snowden.

"When the relevant mechanism is activated, the Hong Kong [Special Administrative Region] Government will handle the case of Mr. Snowden in accordance with the laws and established procedures of Hong Kong," Leung said in a statement. "Meanwhile, the government will follow up on any incidents related to the privacy or other rights of the institutions or people in Hong Kong being violated."

The first step in the extradition process, once the U.S. government makes a formal request for Hong Kong's assistance, will be for Leung to decide how to proceed based on the extradition treaty between the two countries. Leung, who is widely viewed to be pro-Beijing, was selected by a small committee last year and has struggled to win popular support. In January, thousands of protesters called for his resignation.

"We call our so-called chief executive a puppet of Beijing," said Kris Cheng, 24, at the Snowden rally. "So in national security or defense issues, he has to listen to Beijing."

**A poll by the South China Morning Post showed that one in two Hong Kong residents thinks the government should not give up Snowden if the U.S. government requests an extradition.**

**The protest in Hong Kong on Saturday afternoon drew between 200 and 300 people amid steady rainfall.**

"Protect freedom! Defend Snowden!" shouted protesters in Cantonese as they walked toward the U.S. Consulate in the central district of Hong Kong, with a few holding up pictures of Snowden.

If political pressure continues to rise, the situation could become complicated for China's leaders. Agree to extradition, and they risk creating the impression of interfering with Hong Kong's legal process. Resist helping the U.S. government apprehend Snowden, and Beijing could hurt recent efforts to improve relations between the two countries.

The Chinese government may also be wary of stepping into any controversy related to government surveillance, given the vastness of its own security apparatus.

Despite its transfer to Chinese rule in 1997, there remains a gulf between Hong Kong and China, with resentment building from Hong Kong residents toward the increasing number of visitors from the mainland.

The border is marked by a barbed-wire fence that snakes along the Shenzhen River at the northernmost part of Hong Kong in the area known as the New Territories. Security here is so stringent that even entrance to neighborhoods in Hong Kong very close to the border is often restricted.

On a recent day at Lo Wu, one of the busiest border crossings in the world, there were teeming crowds of mainland visitors carrying bulk purchases back across the border to Shenzhen, the booming city just on the other side of the border from Hong Kong.

Chinese nationals require permits in order to enter Hong Kong, where they frequently shop for everything from diapers to iPhones, often because prices are better or because Hong Kong has a better selection of things to purchase.

Hong Kong residents, for their part, often view the mainland visitors as outsiders who cause problems, for instance driving up real estate prices with their widespread home purchases or even taking up too many hospital beds with pregnant women who wish to have their children born in the semiautonomous city. A recent survey showed only 16.6 percent of Hong Kong residents view themselves first as being Chinese citizens.

"It is a special [administrative] region of China, but Hong Kong people like to put the emphasis on 'special,' " said Zhang Junyi, an expert on Hong Kong history at the Chinese Academy of Social Science. "They believe they are different from mainland China."

## The compliant left

Dana Milbank

822 words

16 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A17

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Where have all the liberals gone?

President Obama, who as a Democratic senator accused the Bush administration of violating civil liberties in the name of security, now vigorously defends his own administration's collection of Americans' phone records and Internet activities.

Senate Democratic leader Harry Reid (Nev.) said he thinks Congress has done sufficient intelligence oversight. His evidence? Opinion polls.

House Democratic leader Nancy Pelosi (Calif.) defended the programs' legality and said she wants **Edward Snowden** prosecuted for leaking details of the secret operations.

Dianne Feinstein (D-Calif.), chairman of the Senate intelligence committee, accused Snowden of treason and defended false testimony given to her committee by the director of national intelligence, who in March had denied the programs' existence.

With some exceptions, progressive lawmakers and the liberal commentariat have been passive and acquiescent toward the secret spying programs, which would have infuriated the left had they been the work of a Republican administration.

When libertarian Sen. Rand Paul (R-Ky.) introduced legislation last week on June 7 to curb the surveillance powers, he had no co-sponsors. When he held a news conference this week to unveil a lawsuit claiming that the surveillance is unconstitutional, five members of Congress joined him - all Republicans.

I kept looking for liberal dissent - and then, on Wednesday morning, the news wires reported that a group called Voice of Resistance was meeting outside the Capitol, where demonstrators would proclaim Snowden a hero and flog an effigy of Rep. Peter King (R-N.Y.), one of the first lawmakers to brand Snowden a traitor. I arrived at the appointed place and time but found no protest. Instead, there were six journalists and a lone demonstrator, who was wearing an antiabortion baseball cap. He told me the group was actually a right-wing outfit. "The others are parking the car," he explained, before turning the topic to Rush Limbaugh.

Polling this last week by The Post and the Pew Research Center produced discouraging evidence that Democrats have shed their suspicion of government overreach now that one of their own is in charge. Sixty-nine percent of Democrats say that terrorism investigations should trump privacy as the government's main concern, compared with 51 percent in 2006, when the Bush administration's warrantless wiretapping program had come to light. Then, 37 percent of Democrats found the NSA's actions acceptable, compared with 64 percent now. (Republicans went in the other direction, suddenly becoming more privacy-conscious.)

Certainly, there are differences between now and then. Today, the program operates under court supervision and has at least the veneer of congressional approval (the administration circumvents the law's requirement that only "relevant" records can be collected by claiming that all phone records of all Americans are relevant). And it remains to be seen whether Snowden is a true whistleblower or somebody who means his country harm.

Yet it is jarring to see the left so compliant now that the surveillance has been sanctioned by a Democratic president. Even if the programs ultimately prove defensible, isn't it worth finding out what they really are before liberals accept a suspension of civil liberties they may come to regret?

The weakness of the liberals' argument for standing down was displayed by Reid, who assured reporters this last week that Senate intelligence committee members "have done their very utmost, in my opinion, to conduct oversight. And that's why the American people, in polls - two polls that I saw today - support what is happening with trying to stop terrorists from doing bad things to us."

While Reid tests the political winds to determine which constitutional rights Americans should have, those who should be overseeing the program are instead defending it with a just-trust-me logic. Feinstein declared that "these programs are within the law." The top Democrat on the House intelligence committee, C.A. Dutch Ruppersberger (Md.), promised that "we're not violating any constitutional rights." Both said they'd like to see more about the program declassified, but their past efforts to produce more disclosure have been weak.

A few Democrats have upheld the party's tradition of championing civil liberties - such as John Conyers (Mich.), who is introducing a bill with conservative Rep. Justin Amash (R-Mich.) to curtail the program, and Sen. Jeff Merkley (D-Ore.), who with Sen. Mike Lee (R-Utah) introduced legislation backed by six others requiring more disclosure of secret court rulings.

But the Conyers bill is likely to go nowhere in the House, and Reid was cool to the Merkley proposal, saying only, "I'll be happy to take a look."

If he does look, he'll find that they're doing what progressives should do: protecting the people from a too-secretive government.

## Tracking the life of Edward Snowden

516 words

16 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A08

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

June 21, 1983

Edward Joseph Snowden is born.

1980s and 1990s

Snowden and his family live in North Carolina for many years, and then move to Maryland. He attends Crofton Woods Elementary School, Crofton Middle School and then Arundel High School for 11/2 years.

1998

Snowden attends the first semester of 10th grade but drops out before continuing the second semester. He would have been in the class of 2001.

1999

Snowden enrolls in credit courses at Anne Arundel Community College. He continues attending classes for the next six years, taking breaks during the spring semesters of 2002 and 2003.

February to May 2002

"Ed Snowden" takes classes at the Computer Career Institute, a for-profit college then affiliated with Johns Hopkins University.

May 7, 2004

At age 20, Snowden enlists in the Army Reserve as a Special Forces recruit.

Sept. 28, 2004

Snowden is discharged from the Army without completing any training; he says he broke both his legs in a training accident.

2005

Snowden gets a job as a security guard at the federally funded University of Maryland Center for Advanced Study of Language, which conducts classified and unclassified research. Snowden is in the job for less than a year.

Fall 2005

Snowden takes his last classes at AACC. He never earns a degree or certificate.

2007

Snowden says the CIA stationed him with diplomatic cover in Geneva.

2009

Snowden says he left the CIA to work for a private contractor and was based at an NSA facility in Japan.

2009-2013

Over the next four years, Snowden says that he worked for the NSA through various outside contractors. Snowden said in a video interview with the Guardian that from 2007 to 2013, he held the following positions: systems engineer, systems administrator, senior adviser for the CIA, solutions consultant and telecommunications systems officer.

Summer 2009

Snowden enrolls in classes through the University of Maryland University College, which offers online classes.

2011

Snowden registers to study computer security through an online program offered by the University of Liverpool.

March 2012

Snowden makes a \$250 donation to Ron Paul's presidential campaign. In May, he gives another \$250 to Paul's campaign.

March/April 2013

Snowden works for Booz Allen Hamilton as an "infrastructure analyst" for the NSA based in Hawaii, he says. The company said in a statement in early June that Snowden worked there for fewer than three months.

April 2013

The date listed on the PRISM PowerPoint that Snowden leaked to the news media.

May 16, 2013

Snowden's first direct exchange with Washington Post reporter Barton Gellman.

May 20, 2013

Snowden tells his supervisors at the NSA that he needs time off for treatment for epilepsy and leaves for Hong Kong, according to the Guardian.

June 6, 2013

The Washington Post and the Guardian break the story about PRISM.

June 12, 2013

The South China Morning Post, a newspaper in Hong Kong, posts an interview with Snowden on June 12. Snowden is believed to be in Hong Kong.

## On March 12, 2004, acting atto

Barton Gellman

2007 words

16 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

On March 12, 2004, acting attorney general James B. Comey and the Justice Department's top leadership reached the brink of resignation over electronic surveillance orders that they believed to be illegal.

President George W. Bush backed down, halting secret foreign-intelligence-gathering operations that had crossed into domestic terrain. That morning marked the beginning of the end of STELLARWIND, the cover name for a set of four surveillance programs that brought Americans and American territory within the domain of the National Security Agency for the first time in decades. It was also a prelude to new legal structures that allowed Bush and then President Obama to reproduce each of those programs and expand their reach.

What exactly STELLARWIND did has never been disclosed in an unclassified form. Which parts of it did Comey approve? Which did he shut down? What became of the programs when the crisis passed and Comey, now Obama's expected nominee for FBI director, returned to private life?

Authoritative new answers to those questions, drawing upon a classified NSA history of STELLARWIND and interviews with high-ranking intelligence officials, offer the clearest map yet of the Bush-era programs and the NSA's contemporary U.S. operations.

STELLARWIND was succeeded by four major lines of intelligence collection in the territorial United States, together capable of spanning the full range of modern telecommunications, according to the interviews and documents.

Foreigners, not Americans, are the NSA's "targets," as the law defines that term. But the programs are structured broadly enough that they touch nearly every American household in some way. Obama administration officials and career intelligence officers say Americans should take comfort that privacy protections are built into the design and oversight, but they are not prepared to discuss the details.

The White House, the NSA and the Office of the Director of National Intelligence declined to comment on the record for this article. A senior intelligence official agreed to answer questions if not identified.

"We have rich oversight across three branches of government. I've got an [inspector general] here, a fairly robust legal staff here . . . and there's the Justice Department's national security division," the official said. "For those things done under court jurisdiction, the courts are intrusive in my business, appropriately so, and there are two congressional committees. It's a belts-and-suspenders-and-Velcro approach, and inside there's rich auditing."

But privacy advocates, such as Sen. Ron Wyden (D-Ore.), said the intelligence committee on which he serves needs "straight answers" to do vigorous oversight.

He added: "The typical person says, 'If I am law-abiding and the government is out there collecting lots of information about me - who I call, when I call, where I call from' . . . I think the typical person is going to say, 'That sure sounds like it could have some effect on my privacy.'

Two of the four collection programs, one each for telephony and the Internet, process trillions of "metadata" records for storage and analysis in systems called MAINWAY and MARINA, respectively. Metadata includes highly revealing information about the times, places, devices and participants in electronic communication, but not its contents. The bulk collection of telephone call records from Verizon Business Services, disclosed this month by the British newspaper the Guardian, is one source of raw intelligence for MAINWAY.

The other two types of collection, which operate on a much smaller scale, are aimed at content. One of them intercepts telephone calls and routes the spoken words to a system called NUCLEON.

For Internet content, the most important source collection is the PRISM project reported on June 6 by The Washington Post and the Guardian. It draws from data held by Google, Yahoo, Microsoft and other Silicon Valley giants, collectively the richest depositories of personal information in history.

Former NSA contractor **Edward Snowden**, 29, who unmasked himself as the source behind the PRISM and Verizon revelations, said he hoped for a systematic debate about the "danger to our freedom and way of life" posed by a surveillance apparatus "kept in check by nothing more than policy."

For well over a week, he has had his wish. Startling disclosures have poured out of the nation's largest and arguably tightest-lipped spy agency at an unprecedented pace. Snowden's disclosures have opened a national conversation about the limits of secret surveillance in a free society and an outcry overseas against U.S. espionage.

The debate has focused on two of the four U.S.-based collection programs: PRISM, for Internet content, and the comprehensive collection of telephone call records, foreign and domestic, that the Guardian revealed by posting a classified order from the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court to Verizon Business Services.

The Post has learned that similar orders have been renewed every three months for other large U.S. phone companies, including Bell South and AT&T, since May 24, 2006. On that day, the surveillance court made a fundamental shift in its approach to Section 215 of the Patriot Act, which permits the FBI to compel production of "business records" that are relevant to a particular terrorism investigation and to share those in some circumstances with the NSA. Henceforth, the court ruled, it would define the relevant business records as the entirety of a telephone company's call database.

The Bush administration, by then, had been taking "bulk metadata" from the phone companies under voluntary agreements for more than four years. The volume of information overwhelmed the MAINWAY database, according to a classified report from the NSA inspector general in 2009. The agency spent \$146 million in supplemental counterterrorism funds to buy new hardware and contract support - and to make unspecified payments to the phone companies for "collaborative partnerships."

When the New York Times revealed the warrantless surveillance of voice calls, in December 2005, the telephone companies got nervous. One of them, unnamed in the report, approached the NSA with a request. Rather than volunteer the data, at a price, the "provider preferred to be compelled to do so by a court order," the report said. Other companies followed suit. The surveillance court order that recast the meaning of business records "essentially gave NSA the same authority to collect bulk telephony metadata from business records that it had" under Bush's asserted authority alone.

Telephone metadata was not the issue that sparked a rebellion at the Justice Department, first by Jack Goldsmith of the Office of Legal Counsel and then by Comey, who was acting attorney general because John D. Ashcroft was in intensive care with acute gallstone pancreatitis. It was Internet metadata.

At Bush's direction, in orders prepared by David Addington, the counsel to Vice President Richard B. Cheney, the NSA had been siphoning e-mail metadata and technical records of Skype calls from data links owned by AT&T, Sprint and MCI, which later merged with Verizon.

For reasons unspecified in the report, Goldsmith and Comey became convinced that Bush had no lawful authority to do that.

MARINA and the collection tools that feed it are probably the least known of the NSA's domestic operations, even among experts who follow the subject closely. Yet they probably capture information about more American citizens than any other, because the volume of e-mail, chats and other Internet communications far exceeds the volume of standard telephone calls.

The NSA calls Internet metadata "digital network information." Sophisticated analysis of those records can reveal unknown associates of known terrorism suspects. Depending on the methods applied, it can also expose medical conditions, political or religious affiliations, confidential business negotiations and extramarital affairs.

What permits the former and prevents the latter is a complex set of policies that the public is not permitted to see. "You could do analyses that give you more information, but the law and procedures don't allow that," a senior U.S. intelligence lawyer said.

In the urgent aftermath of Sept. 11, 2001, with more attacks thought to be imminent, analysts wanted to use "contact chaining" techniques to build what the NSA describes as network graphs of people who represented potential threats.

The legal challenge for the NSA was that its practice of collecting high volumes of data from digital links did not seem to meet even the relatively low requirements of Bush's authorization, which allowed collection of Internet metadata "for communications with at least one communicant outside the United States or for which no communicant was known to be a citizen of the United States," the NSA inspector general's report said.

Lawyers for the agency came up with an interpretation that said the NSA did not "acquire" the communications, a term with formal meaning in surveillance law, until analysts ran searches against it. The NSA could "obtain" metadata in bulk, they argued, without meeting the required standards for acquisition.

Goldsmith and Comey did not buy that argument, and a high-ranking U.S. intelligence official said the NSA does not rely on it today.

As soon as surveillance data "touches us, we've got it, whatever verbs you choose to use," the official said in an interview. "We're not saying there's a magic formula that lets us have it without having it."

When Comey finally ordered a stop to the program, Bush signed an order renewing it anyway. Comey, Goldsmith, FBI Director Robert S. Mueller III and most of the senior Bush appointees in the Justice Department began drafting letters of resignation.

Then-NSA Director Michael V. Hayden was not among them. According to the inspector general's classified report, Cheney's lawyer, Addington, placed a phone call and "General Hayden had to decide whether NSA would execute the Authorization without the Attorney General's signature." He decided to go along.



The following morning, when Mueller told Bush that he and Comey intended to resign, the president reversed himself.

Three months later, on July 15, the secret surveillance court allowed the NSA to resume bulk collection under the court's own authority. The opinion, which remains highly classified, was based on a provision of electronic surveillance law, known as "pen register, trap and trace," that was written to allow law enforcement officers to obtain the phone numbers of incoming and outgoing calls from a single telephone line.

When the NSA aims for foreign targets whose communications cross U.S. infrastructure, it expects to sweep in some American content "incidentally" or "inadvertently," which are terms of art in regulations governing the NSA. Contact chaining, because it extends to the contacts of contacts of targets, inevitably collects even more American data.

Current NSA director Keith B. Alexander and Director of National Intelligence James R. Clapper Jr. have resolutely refused to offer an estimate of the number of Americans whose calls or e-mails have thus made their way into content databases such as NUCLEON.

The agency and its advocates maintain that its protection of that data is subject to rigorous controls and oversight by Congress and courts. For the public, it comes down to a question of unverifiable trust.

"The constraints that I operate under are much more remarkable than the powers that I enjoy," said the senior intelligence official who declined to be named.

When asked why the NSA could not release an unclassified copy of its "minimization procedures," which are supposed to strip accidentally collected records of their identifying details, the official suggested a reporter submit a freedom-of-information request.

As for bulk collection of Internet metadata, the question that triggered the crisis of 2004, another official said the NSA is no longer doing it. When pressed on that question, he said he was speaking only of collections under authority of the surveillance court.

"I'm not going to say we're not collecting any Internet metadata," he added. "We're not using this program and these kinds of accesses to collect Internet metadata in bulk."

## **Obama's chief of staff defends NSA surveillance**

Sean Sullivan

514 words

17 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A02

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

White House Chief of Staff Denis McDonough defended the administration's sweeping surveillance efforts Sunday, saying President Obama does not think the tactics have violated the privacy of any American, and he signaled that the president will be elaborating on the issue soon.

"I think you'll hear the president talk about this in the days ahead," McDonough said on CBS's "Face the Nation." "You'll hear what he said when he responded to reporters last week on this question, which is we

do have to find the right balance, especially in this new situation where we find ourselves with all of us reliant on Internet, on e-mail, on texting."

"Does the president feel that he has violated the privacy of any American?" asked CBS's Bob Schieffer.

"He does not," McDonough said.

McDonough also responded to The Washington Post's report about the origins of the legal structures that allowed Presidents George W. Bush and Obama to expand the reach of the government's surveillance efforts.

"I saw the Bart Gellman story, and he's obviously worked on this over the course of the last couple of weeks pretty aggressively," McDonough said. "I will say that much of what he was reporting on was a draft inspector general report about a program that was suspended now several years ago because of the way we saw its usefulness."

McDonough added that when Obama took office, his skepticism about surveillance programs led to key changes, including looping in Congress to a greater extent.

While McDonough declined to go into detail about the investigation involving **Edward Snowden**, the former National Security Agency contractor who acknowledged disclosing details of the agency's broad surveillance techniques, **he said he did not know where Snowden is currently located.**

**"I'm sure you'll understand when I tell you I don't want to get involved in any ongoing investigation or any kind of effort that's being undertaken. But I can tell you that I don't know where he is right now," McDonough said.**

Sen. Mark Udall (D-Colo.) said he doubts that the NSA telephone surveillance effort has made the country safer.

**"I don't think collecting millions and millions of Americans' phone calls - now, this is the metadata, this is time, place, to whom you direct the calls - is making us any safer," Udall said on NBC's "Meet the Press."  
"And I think it's ultimately perhaps a violation of the Fourth Amendment."**

Meanwhile, House Intelligence Committee Chairman Mike Rogers (R-Mich.) said that once Americans learn more about the extent to which the NSA's surveillance has helped thwart terrorist plots, they will warm up to the efforts.

"If you can see just the number of cases where we've actually stopped a plot, I think Americans will come to a different conclusion than all the misleading rhetoric I've heard over the last few weeks," Rogers said on CNN's "State of the Union."

## Obama defends broad surveillance

Juliet Eilperin

494 words

18 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

President Obama defended his administration's right to engage in extensive surveillance of U.S. communications in an interview with PBS host Charlie Rose, saying the programs had disrupted multiple terrorist plots and had adequate checks and balances.

During the interview - which was conducted Sunday before Obama left for Europe and was set to air Monday night - the president took pains to distinguish his national security approach from those of former president George W. Bush and former vice president Richard B. Cheney.

"The whole point of my concern, before I was president - because some people say, 'Well, you know, Obama was this raving liberal before. Now he's, you know, Dick Cheney.' Dick Cheney sometimes says, 'Yeah, you know? He took it all lock, stock and barrel,' " Obama said, according to a transcript provided by PBS. "My concern has always been not that we shouldn't do intelligence gathering to prevent terrorism, but rather are we setting up a system of checks and balances?"

The Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court, Obama argued, provided sufficient oversight of the National Security Agency's activities and said the government was "making the right trade-offs" in balancing privacy rights with national security prerogatives.

"What I can say unequivocally is that if you are a U.S. person, the NSA cannot listen to your telephone calls, and the NSA cannot target your e-mails," he added, before Rose interjected, "And have not."

"And have not," Obama reiterated. "They cannot and have not, by law and by rule, and unless they - and usually it wouldn't be 'they,' it'd be the FBI - go to a court, and obtain a warrant, and seek probable cause, the same way it's always been, the same way when we were growing up and we were watching movies, you want to go set up a wiretap, you got to go to a judge, show probable cause."

The number of requests for wiretapping orders from the FISA court, Obama said, is "surprisingly small."

Details about the NSA programs, disclosed to The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper by former government contractor **Edward Snowden**, has set off a furious debate in Washington about **Obama's civil liberties record**.

The president said in the PBS interview that the trade-off in privacy rights was worth it because the programs "have disrupted plots, not just here in the United States but overseas as well."

Referring to foiled terrorist Najibullah Zazi, who pleaded guilty in 2010 to trying to detonate explosives in the New York subway system, Obama said, "Now, we might have caught him some other way. We might have disrupted it because a New York cop saw he was suspicious. Maybe he turned out to be incompetent and the bomb didn't go off. But at the margins we are increasing our chances of preventing a catastrophe like that through these programs."

## Snowden says he can't get a fair U.S. trial

Ellen Nakashima Sari Horwitz

1000 words

18 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

**Edward Snowden**, who acknowledged leaking top-secret documents about extensive U.S. surveillance of telephone calls and Internet communications, claimed in an unusual live Web chat Monday that he sees no possibility of a fair trial in the United States and suggested that he would try to elude authorities as long as possible.

The U.S. government has "openly declar[ed] me guilty of treason and [said] that the disclosure of secret, criminal and even unconstitutional acts is an unforgivable crime," he said. "That's not justice, and it would be foolish to volunteer yourself to it if you can do more good outside of prison than in it."

Snowden's remarks came in a question-and-answer session on the Web site of Britain's Guardian newspaper. The Guardian and The Washington Post recently published articles about National Security Agency surveillance programs based on documents provided by Snowden. He is believed to have taken the classified material while working as an NSA contractor in Honolulu for the consulting firm Booz Allen Hamilton.

The spectacle of Snowden using the Internet to defend himself and level new accusations was the latest chapter in the unfolding story. The Guardian did not say where Snowden was when he responded to written questions from its reporters and the public. In a note on the site, the newspaper said the discussion was subject to "Snowden's security concerns and also his access to a secure Internet connection."

Snowden, 29, emerged June 9 from his status as an anonymous source for the articles. At the time, he was staying in an upscale hotel in Hong Kong, which he said he had chosen because he felt he might win asylum. He gave an interview to a Hong Kong newspaper last week, but since then he has disappeared.

Snowden said in the chat that the U.S. government has accused him of treason, but he faces no known charges. Justice Department officials said a criminal investigation is underway to determine the extent of the damage created by Snowden's leaks and the nature of any charges he might face.

One critical aspect of the damage assessment is how Snowden, as a low-level contractor, could have gained access to highly sensitive documents, including a top-secret order from a secret court compelling a unit of Verizon to turn over phone-call records, according to U.S. officials.

A former Justice Department official, who spoke on the condition of anonymity because he was not authorized to discuss the case publicly, said officials are probably gathering forensic material that would back up possible criminal charges. They could then file criminal charges in federal court in the District of Columbia or Hawaii or indict Snowden under seal. The official said prosecutors might choose to seal the indictment so Snowden would not know that he was subject to detention and arrest.

"Because this case is so extraordinarily high-profile, they have to be proceeding gingerly and getting all their ducks in a row to figure out what happened before rushing to indict Snowden," the former official said. "Given the timing of this coming after the [Associated Press] and Fox News case and other leak cases that have not gone well for the department, I think they want to be exceedingly careful. But I wouldn't be surprised if something happens soon."

The official also said the Justice Department's Office of International Affairs would already be negotiating with the Hong Kong authorities over a possible arrest and extradition.

In answering questions for 90 minutes, Snowden defended himself and sought to justify his actions. "All I can say right now is the U.S. government is not going to be able to cover this up by jailing or murdering me," he said. "Truth is coming, and it cannot be stopped."

The leaks, which covered two extensive NSA electronic surveillance programs, sparked an international debate and led to praise and condemnation for the former Maryland resident.

Snowden said leaving the United States "was an incredible risk" because NSA employees must declare any foreign travel 30 days in advance. He told his employers that he was taking time off for medical treatment.

"There was a distinct possibility I would be interdicted en route, so I had to travel with no advance booking to a country with the cultural and legal framework to allow me to work without being immediately detained," he said.

While in Hong Kong, he showed documents to the South China Morning Post newspaper that said the U.S. government had hacked into hundreds of targets in Hong Kong and mainland China.

He defended his leak Monday, saying he did not reveal any operations against legitimate military targets. "I pointed out where the NSA has hacked civilian infrastructure such as universities, hospitals and private businesses because it is dangerous," he said. "These nakedly, aggressive criminal acts are wrong no matter the target."

He also responded to speculation by former vice president Richard B. Cheney and others that he provided classified information to the Chinese government in exchange for asylum. "I have had no contact with the Chinese government," he said. "Ask yourself: If I were a Chinese spy, why wouldn't I have flown directly into Beijing?"

Snowden also criticized the Obama administration for what he called "overly harsh responses to public-interest whistleblowing," citing prosecutions of several government employees accused of leaking classified information. Among the cases he mentioned was that of Army Pfc. Bradley Manning, who faces possible life in prison in a court-martial, underway at Fort Meade in Maryland, over his leaking of documents to the anti-secrecy group WikiLeaks.

"These draconian responses simply build better whistleblowers," he said. "If the Obama administration responds with an even harsher hand against me, they can be assured that they'll soon find themselves facing an equally hard public response."

## Officials: Dozens of plots derailed

Ellen Nakashima

1070 words

19 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The U.S. government's sweeping surveillance programs have disrupted more than 50 terrorist plots in the United States and abroad, including a plan to bomb the New York Stock Exchange, senior government officials testified Tuesday.

The officials, appearing before a largely friendly House committee, defended the collection of telephone and Internet data by the National Security Agency as central to protecting the United States and its allies against terrorist attacks. And they said that recent disclosures about the surveillance operations have caused serious damage.

"We are now faced with a situation that, because this information has been made public, we run the risk of losing these collection capabilities," said Robert S. Litt, general counsel of the Office of the Director of National Intelligence. "We're not going to know for many months whether these leaks in fact have caused us to lose these capabilities, but if they do have that effect, there is no doubt that they will cause our national security to be affected."

The hearing before the House Intelligence Committee was the third congressional session examining the leaks of classified material about two top-secret surveillance programs by **Edward Snowden**, 29, a former NSA contractor and onetime CIA employee.

Articles based on the material in The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper have raised concerns about intrusions on civil liberties and forced the Obama administration to mount an aggressive defense of the effectiveness and privacy protections of the operations.

Gen. Keith B. Alexander, the head of the NSA, told the committee that the programs had helped prevent "potential terrorist events over 50 times since 9/11." He said at least 10 of the disrupted plots involved terrorism suspects or targets in the United States.

Alexander said officials do not plan to release additional information publicly, to avoid revealing sources and methods of operation, but he said the House and Senate intelligence committees will receive classified details of the thwarted plots.

In testimony last week, Alexander said the surveillance programs had helped prevent an attack on the subway system in New York City and the bombing of a Danish newspaper. Sean Joyce, deputy director of the FBI, described two additional plots Tuesday that he said were stopped through the surveillance - a plan by a Kansas City, Mo., man to bomb the New York Stock Exchange and efforts by a San Diego man to send money to terrorists in Somalia.

The officials said repeatedly that the operations were authorized by Congress and subject to oversight through internal mechanisms and the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court, whose proceedings are secret.

Alexander said that more than 90 percent of the information on the foiled plots came from a program targeting the communications of foreigners, known as PRISM. The program was authorized under Section 702 of a 2008 law that amended the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act (FISA).

The law authorizes the NSA to collect e-mails and other Internet communications to and from foreign targets overseas who are thought to be involved in terrorism or nuclear proliferation or who might provide critical foreign intelligence. No American in the country or abroad can be targeted without a warrant, and no person inside the United States can be targeted without a warrant.

A second program collects all call records from U.S. phone companies. It is authorized under Section 215 of the USA Patriot Act. The records do not include the content of calls, location data, or a subscriber's name or address. That law, passed in 2001 and renewed twice since then, also amended FISA.

Snowden, a high school dropout who worked at an NSA operations center in Hawaii for 15 months as a contractor, released highly classified information on both programs, claiming they represent government overreach. **He has been in hiding since publicly acknowledging on June 9 that he leaked the material.**

Several lawmakers pressed for answers on how Snowden, a low-level systems administrator, could have had access to highly classified material such as a court order for phone records.

"We need to seal this crack in the system," said Rep. C.A. Dutch Ruppersberger (Md.), the ranking Democrat on the intelligence panel.

Alexander said he is working with intelligence officials to come up with a "two-person" rule to ensure that the agency can block unauthorized people from removing information from the system.

But Alexander and the other witnesses focused more heavily on justifying the programs and arguing that they operate under legal guidelines.

"As Americans, we value our privacy and our civil liberties," Alexander said. "As Americans, we also value our security and our safety. In the 12 years since the attacks on September 11th, we have lived in relative safety and security as a nation. That security is a direct result of the intelligence community's quiet efforts to better connect the dots and learn from the mistakes that permitted those attacks to occur on 9/11."

The officials described the privacy protections in detail.

Under Section 702, the NSA must destroy any data collected about U.S. persons - citizens or lawful permanent residents - that have nothing to do with foreign intelligence, a crime or terrorism, officials said. The agency may keep the data for five years and then must purge it.

Phone data are stored in a separate repository at the NSA that can be accessed by only 22 specially trained people, officials said.

A query can be made only if the analyst has "reasonable, articulable suspicion" that the phone number to be searched is associated with a specific terrorist organization, they said.

Both programs are subject to reporting requirements, though the reports are not public.

For instance, if there is a compliance problem - a wrong number is punched in - the error must be reported to the court immediately.

In addition, the Justice Department and the Office of the Director of National Intelligence conduct regular reviews and report to Congress and the courts on compliance.

Some lawmakers have raised doubts about just how critical Section 215 authority has been to foiling plots and asserted that much the same data may be obtained without amassing a government database of Americans' call records.

Alexander said he was reviewing the feasibility of having the companies retain the records and conduct searches at government request.

The potential drawback, he said, is loss of agility in a crisis.

## Extraditing Snowden may be complicated

Sari Horwitz Jia Lynn Yang

1269 words

20 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

If U.S. officials criminally charge **Edward Snowden**, they are likely to confront a complicated and lengthy process to bring the admitted leaker of top-secret documents back home to stand trial, according to extradition experts and law enforcement officials.

Although the United States has an extradition treaty with Hong Kong, where Snowden was last seen, the treaty offers an exception for political offenses. It also has a rare exception that would allow Snowden to stay in Hong Kong if the government there determines it to be in its best interest. He also could apply for asylum in Hong Kong, Iceland or another country. On Wednesday, the founder of WikiLeaks told reporters that his legal advisers had been in touch with Icelandic officials on Snowden's behalf.

"There are a number of hurdles that the government will have to jump through before Snowden will ever end up in a U.S. courtroom," said Stephen I. Vladeck, an associate dean at American University's Washington College of Law who studies national security law.

In the end, the ability to bring the former National Security Agency contractor back to the United States will come down to legal maneuvering and creative diplomacy, Vladeck said.

"The dirty little secret about extradition law," he said, "is it's really about 90 percent politics and only 10 percent law."

Snowden, 29, revealed himself June 9 as the anonymous source for articles in the British newspaper the Guardian and The Washington Post about the NSA surveillance of telephone calls and Internet communications. He was staying in an upscale hotel in Hong Kong, a city that he said he had chosen because he felt he might win asylum there.

But Snowden subsequently left the hotel, and it is unclear where he is. In an unusual live Web chat Monday, he said he sees no possibility of a fair trial in the United States and suggested that he would try to elude authorities as long as possible.

Justice Department officials have said that a criminal investigation is underway, led by agents from the FBI's Washington field office and lawyers from the department's national security division. Investigators are gathering forensic material to back up possible criminal charges, most likely under the Espionage Act, according to former Justice Department officials.

Snowden also could be charged with theft and the conversion of property belonging to the U.S. government, experts say. A thorny issue for U.S. authorities trying to build their case against Snowden involves how much to reveal about the highly classified material that he allegedly acquired, according to former Justice Department officials.

U.S. officials could file a criminal complaint and try to have Snowden detained in Hong Kong on a provisional arrest, extradition lawyers said. They would then have 60 days to file an indictment, possibly under seal, setting out probable cause. U.S. authorities could then formally move to extradite Snowden for trial in the United States - a move he could fight in the courts.

The United States has extradition treaties with about 120 countries, but that doesn't necessarily make it easier to extract people accused of a crime from those countries. For example, of 130 extradition requests to Britain since 2004, only 77 people were extradited to the United States.

To fight extradition, Snowden could invoke Article 6 of the 1997 pact between the United States and Hong Kong, which states that a suspect will not be surrendered to face criminal prosecution for an offense of a "political character."

That's a standard and historic exception in treaties between governments but one that lacks a standard definition or clear legal interpretation. In the United States, as well as in other states, what constitutes a political act has narrowed. How the Hong Kong courts would view such an assertion is unclear. If Snowden argues that he is an activist, said Simon N.M. Young, director for the Center of Comparative and Public Law at the University of Hong Kong, "this will be one of our first cases."



Hong Kong also has an additional and unusual exception in its treaty that could provide a defense for Snowden, according to Douglas McNabb, a lawyer who specializes in international extradition cases. Hong Kong authorities can refuse the extradition of a suspect "if they believe it should be denied from a defense or foreign policy perspective," McNabb said. "I have not seen that in any other treaty." Public sentiment in support of Snowden has built in Hong Kong, and hundreds rallied in the streets Saturday.

Should a Hong Kong judge rule against Snowden, he could continue to appeal, all the way up to Hong Kong's highest court, dragging the process out over many months. Bail is unlikely to be offered, so Snowden could be in jail at that point, possibly at the Lai Chi Kok maximum-security facility in Kowloon, where conditions are harsh. "That will be added pressure on him for how long he wants to fight it out here," Young said.

Aside from the courts, Snowden could plead for asylum, the route taken by WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, who has been holed up for a year in the Ecuadoran Embassy in London.

Snowden, in an interview with the Guardian, floated the idea of asylum in Iceland, which has historically provided a haven for whistleblowers and never granted a U.S. extradition request.

Johannes Skulason, an Icelandic government official, told the Associated Press on Wednesday that WikiLeaks spokesman Kristinn Hrafnsson had held informal talks with assistants at the Interior Ministry and the prime minister's office.

Skulason said Hrafnsson "presented his case that he was in contact with Snowden and wanted to see what the legal framework was like."

But the United States could try to prevent Snowden from traveling by asking the International Criminal Police Organization, or Interpol, to put out a "red notice," which is a bulletin for international fugitives and which alerts about 190 countries that there is an outstanding warrant for Snowden's arrest.

Snowden could also apply for asylum in another country's embassy in Hong Kong, as Assange did in London. Or he could make an asylum claim in Hong Kong after his travel visa expires in mid-August or if the U.S. government requests his surrender.

If he does apply for asylum, Snowden will be stumbling into a labyrinthine system criticized by human rights lawyers as dysfunctional and inefficient.

Hong Kong did not sign the United Nations' 1951 Refugee Convention, and so the government has no obligation to process refugee claims. Instead, it relies mostly on the U.N. High Commissioner for Refugees' office in Hong Kong, which is underderstaffed and has a backlog of asylum requests. In cases in which the applicants claim that they may be tortured if sent home, the Hong Kong government reviews the case. An estimated 5,000 claims are being processed by both the UNHCR and the Hong Kong government.

"We have asylum seekers who have been in Hong Kong for years," Young said.

Because the UNHCR and the Hong Kong government evaluate claims, Snowden could seek to have his asylum case reviewed by both. Complicating the picture are two recent court cases mandating that Hong Kong consolidate its refugee system and establish a new process.

"I think Mr. Snowden is much wiser from a legal perspective than many people initially gave him credit for," McNabb said. "I think he's thought about this for a long time."

## FBI chief admits agency uses drones in domestic surveillance

Phil Mattingly

458 words

20 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A16

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The FBI uses drones in domestic surveillance operations in a "very, very minimal way," Director Robert S. Mueller III said Wednesday.

Appearing before the Senate Judiciary Committee, Mueller acknowledged for the first time that the FBI uses "very few" drones in a limited capacity for surveillance.

"It's very seldom used and generally used in a particular incident when you need the capability," Mueller said when asked about the bureau's use of pilotless aircraft with surveillance capabilities. "It is very narrowly focused on particularized cases and particularized needs."

Mueller's remarks about the FBI's use of drones - and the regular use of the vehicles by other law enforcement agencies - come as lawmakers and civil liberties groups are raising concerns about the reach of the government in the wake of the disclosure of two highly classified National Security Agency surveillance programs.

Leaks by former intelligence contractor **Edward Snowden** to The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper unveiled surveillance programs that sweep up telephone call data from millions of U.S. citizens, as well as Internet traffic, that the Obama administration says involves foreigners based outside the United States who are suspected of plotting terrorist attacks.

Lawmakers, including Senate Judiciary Committee Chairman Patrick J. Leahy (D-Vt.), and civil liberties groups have raised concerns about the impact on privacy of drones used by federal law enforcement agencies. The Department of Homeland Security regularly deploys drones to oversee the southern border.

"This is a burgeoning concern for many of us," Sen. Mazie Hirono (D-Hawaii) said of drone use by the government as well as by private companies or individuals.

The Federal Aviation Administration estimates there may be about 10,000 active commercial drones in five years. Bills have been introduced in at least 18 states to limit or regulate such aircraft, according to the National Conference of State Legislatures.

Leahy said during a March hearing on drones that he was "convinced that the domestic use of drones to conduct surveillance and collect other information will have a broad and significant impact on the everyday lives of millions of Americans going forward."

Mueller said the FBI is in "the initial stages" of formulating privacy guidelines related to its drone use.

"There are a number of issues related to drones that will need to be debated in the future," Mueller said. "It's still in its nascent stages, this debate."

Homeland Security Secretary Janet Napolitano said Saturday in a Bloomberg Television interview that the operation of unmanned aircraft makes "our forces on the ground more effective" and that privacy concerns are regularly weighed and addressed by an office within the department.

## Firm that vetted Snowden is probed

Thomas Heath

381 words

21 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The Falls Church-based government contracting firm that performed a background investigation into **Edward Snowden** before he disclosed details of a secret federal surveillance program is under criminal investigation by the Office of Personnel Management, according to Sen. Claire McCaskill (D-Mo.). McCaskill said Thursday at a Senate hearing that the investigation into USIS, whose original name was US Investigations Services, is based on the "systemic failure to adequately conduct investigations under its contract" with the federal government.

In a statement, USIS said it "has never been informed that it is under criminal investigation." The company said it received a subpoena for records from OPM's inspector general in January 2012 and fully cooperated with "the government's civil investigative efforts."

The company declined to confirm whether it had screened Snowden, saying the thousands of investigations it conducts for the government are confidential.

Snowden was working for another Virginia government contractor, Booz Allen Hamilton, when he disclosed details of National Security Agency surveillance of U.S. citizens. The case has thrown a spotlight on the government's reliance on contractors for sensitive tasks. In 2011, more than 4.2 million government and contract workers had security clearances, and more than a third of them had top-secret access.

McCaskill spokesman Drew Pusateri said McCaskill was told of the investigation by OPM's inspector general.

Patrick McFarland, the inspector general for OPM, told the committee that there are concerns about USIS's background check into Snowden. "Yes, we do believe that there - there may be some problems," McFarland said at the hearing, according to the Reuters news agency.

According to its Web site, privately held USIS has 100 contracts to provide background checks for more than 95 federal agencies. The company was established in July 1996 "as a result of the privatization of the investigative branch of the Office of Personnel Management," according to the Web site.

The company's has more than 6,700 employees, and its clients include the departments of Justice, State, Homeland Security and Defense, plus about a dozen intelligence agencies, including the NSA and the National Reconnaissance Office. USIS is part of Altegrity, which is in turn owned by Providence Equity Partners.

## U.S. files charges against Snowden

Peter Finn Sari Horwitz

1038 words

22 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Federal prosecutors have filed a criminal complaint against **Edward Snowden**, the former National Security Agency contractor who leaked a trove of documents about top-secret surveillance programs, and the United States has asked Hong Kong to detain him on a provisional arrest warrant, according to U.S. officials.

Snowden was charged with theft, "unauthorized communication of national defense information" and "willful communication of classified communications intelligence information to an unauthorized person," according to the complaint. The last two charges were brought under the 1917 Espionage Act.

The complaint, which initially was sealed, was filed in the Eastern District of Virginia, a jurisdiction where Snowden's former employer, Booz Allen Hamilton, is headquartered and a district with a long track record of prosecuting cases with national security implications. After The Washington Post reported the charges, senior administration officials said late Friday that the Justice Department was barraged with calls from lawmakers and reporters and decided to unseal the criminal complaint.

A Justice Department spokeswoman declined to comment.

Snowden flew to Hong Kong last month after leaving his job at an NSA facility in Hawaii with a collection of highly classified documents that he acquired while working at the agency as a systems analyst.

The documents, some of which have been published in The Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper, detailed some of the most-secret surveillance operations undertaken by the United States and Britain, as well as classified legal memos and court orders underpinning the programs in the United States.

The 30-year-old intelligence analyst revealed himself June 9 as the leaker in an interview with the Guardian and said he went to Hong Kong because it provided the "cultural and legal framework to allow me to work without being immediately detained."

Snowden subsequently disappeared from public view; it is thought that he is still in the Chinese territory. Hong Kong has its own legislative and legal systems but ultimately answers to Beijing, under the "one country, two systems" arrangement.

The leaks have sparked national and international debates about the secret powers of the NSA to infringe on the privacy of Americans and foreigners. Officials from President Obama on down have said they welcome the opportunity to explain the importance of the programs and the safeguards they say are built into them. Skeptics, including some in Congress, have said the NSA has assumed the power to soak up data about Americans that was never intended under the law.

There was never any doubt that the Justice Department would seek to prosecute Snowden for one of the most significant national security leaks in the country's history. The Obama administration has shown a particular propensity to go after leakers and has launched more investigations than any previous

administration. This White House is responsible for bringing six of the nine total indictments ever brought under the 1917 Espionage Act. Snowden will be the seventh individual when he is formally indicted.

Justice Department officials had already said that a criminal investigation of Snowden was underway and was being run out of the FBI's Washington field office in conjunction with lawyers from the department's National Security Division.

By filing a criminal complaint, prosecutors have a legal basis to make the detention request of the authorities in Hong Kong. Prosecutors now have 60 days to file an indictment, probably under seal, and can then move to have Snowden extradited from Hong Kong for trial in the United States.

Snowden, however, can fight the extradition effort in the courts in Hong Kong. Any battle is likely to reach Hong Kong's highest court and could last many months, lawyers in the United States and Hong Kong said.

The United States has an extradition treaty with Hong Kong, and U.S. officials said cooperation with the Chinese territory, which enjoys some autonomy from Beijing, has been good in previous cases.

The treaty, however, has an exception for political offenses, and espionage has traditionally been treated as a political offense. Snowden's defense team in Hong Kong is likely to invoke part of the extradition treaty with the United States, which states that suspects will not be turned over to face criminal trial for offenses of a "political character."

Typically in such cases, Hong Kong's chief executive must first decide whether to issue a warrant for the accused's arrest. But the extradition treaty also says that in exceptional cases a provisional warrant can be issued by a Hong Kong judge without the chief executive's approval. The judge must give the chief executive notice, however, that he has issued the warrant.

A spokesperson at the office of Hong Kong chief executive Leung Chun-ying said there was no information on Snowden's case. The police department did not respond to calls or e-mails. At the police station for Central District in Hong Kong Island, police officers on duty said they had not heard anything about Snowden.

If Snowden is arrested, he would appear before a judge. Bail would be unlikely and, instead, Snowden would be sent to the Lai Chi Kok maximum-security facility in Kowloon, a short drive from the high-end Mira Hotel, where he is last known to have stayed in Hong Kong.

Snowden could also remain in Hong Kong if the Chinese government decides that it is not in the defense or foreign policy interests of the government in Beijing to have him sent back to the United States for trial.

Another option would be for Snowden to apply for asylum with the United Nations High Commission for Refugees, which handles most asylum requests in Hong Kong. The UNHCR was closed Saturday morning and did not immediately respond to requests for comment via e-mail and phone. The asylum application process can take months or even years because Hong Kong has a severe backlog. The Hong Kong government cannot formally surrender individuals until their asylum applications have been processed.

Snowden also could attempt to reach another jurisdiction and seek asylum there before the authorities in Hong Kong act.

## U.S. prosecutors file criminal complaint against NSA leaker

344 words

23 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Federal prosecutors have filed a sealed criminal complaint against **Edward Snowden**, the former National Security Agency contractor who leaked a trove of documents about top-secret surveillance programs, and the United States has asked Hong Kong to detain him on a provisional arrest warrant, according to U.S. officials.

Snowden was charged with theft and conversion of government property, the officials said.

The Justice Department has not charged Snowden under the Espionage Act, as it has other leakers of classified information. And while it could revise any indictment if Snowden is brought to the United States, that would be a damaging violation of the spirit of the extradition treaty that prosecutors would be unlikely to countenance, officials said.

The complaint was filed in the Eastern District of Virginia, a jurisdiction where Snowden's former employer, Booz Allen Hamilton, is headquartered, and a district with a long track record in prosecuting cases with national security implications.

Snowden flew to Hong Kong last month after leaving his job at a NSA facility in Hawaii with a collection of highly classified documents that he acquired while working at the agency as a systems analyst.

The documents, some of which have been published in The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper, detailed some of the most secret surveillance operations undertaken by the United States and the United Kingdom, as well as classified legal memos and court orders underpinning the programs in the United States.

The 29-year-old intelligence analyst revealed himself June 9 as the leaker in an interview with the Guardian and said he went to Hong Kong because it provided him the "cultural and legal framework to allow me to work without being immediately detained."

Snowden subsequently disappeared from public view but he is believed to still be in the Chinese territory; Hong Kong has its own legislative and legal systems but ultimately answers to Beijing, under the "one country, two systems" arrangement.

## U.S. publicly raises pressure on Hong Kong to arrest Snowden

Sari Horwitz Jia Lynn Yang

1022 words

23 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A14

English

Obama administration officials Saturday publicly increased pressure on Hong Kong to move quickly to arrest **Edward Snowden**, a week after U.S. officials asked its government to detain the admitted leaker of documents about top-secret surveillance programs.

White House national security adviser Thomas E. Donilon said U.S. officials "are in conversation" with Hong Kong authorities and have asked the special administrative region of China not only to arrest the former National Security Agency contractor but also to extradite him to the United States to stand trial on criminal charges.

"If Hong Kong doesn't act soon, it will complicate our bilateral relations and raise questions about Hong Kong's commitment to the rule of law," said another senior administration official, who spoke on the condition of anonymity because the official was not authorized to speak about an ongoing investigation.

The U.S. government, which has made the Snowden case a top priority and has devoted significant resources to prosecuting him, asked Hong Kong on June 14 to detain Snowden on a provisional arrest warrant. That same day, federal prosecutors filed sealed criminal charges against him, including theft, "unauthorized communication of national defense information" and "willful communication of classified communications intelligence information to an unauthorized person."

The fact that the U.S. government asked Hong Kong to detain Snowden emerged Friday when The Washington Post disclosed the contents of the sealed criminal complaint.

The White House referred all questions to Justice Department officials, who declined to comment.

The reasons for the apparent lack of action by Hong Kong are unclear. Officials might still be looking for Snowden. The South China Morning Post reported Saturday that Snowden is not under police protection but is in a "safe place" in Hong Kong. The newspaper also reported that Snowden had revealed more details about U.S. surveillance of Hong Kong and China.

Under the extradition treaty between Hong Kong and the United States, a provisional warrant, as opposed to a regular one, is a faster way to detain suspected criminals because it does not require the initial approval of Hong Kong's chief executive, currently Leung Chun-ying.

Instead, a judge can issue the warrant immediately. Simon Young, a legal professor at the University of Hong Kong, said a warrant for Snowden's arrest could have been issued as early as June 14.

Leung's office declined to comment on Snowden's case Saturday. The police department did not respond to calls and e-mails.

Douglas McNabb, a criminal defense lawyer who specializes in international extradition cases, said that if authorities know Snowden's location, he may already have asked for asylum, a complicated process that might have to be worked out before Hong Kong authorities could arrest him.

"If he applied for asylum, that process may trump being arrested on a provisional arrest warrant," McNabb said.

Snowden, who turned 30 on Friday, revealed himself June 9 as the anonymous source for articles in the British newspaper the Guardian and The Post about the NSA surveillance of telephone calls and Internet communications. He was staying in an upscale hotel in Hong Kong, a city he said he had chosen because he felt he might win asylum there.

Snowden subsequently left the hotel, and it is unclear where he went. In a live Web chat Monday, he said he sees no possibility of a fair trial in the United States and suggested that he would try to elude authorities as long as possible.

Meanwhile, plans to protect Snowden appeared to be unfolding. Olafur Sigurvinsson, an Icelandic businessman, told reporters Thursday that he has a private jet ready to take Snowden to Iceland, which Snowden named in interviews as a potential haven.

KK Yuen, a spokesman for the Hong Kong Aviation Center, which handles private jet flights out of Hong Kong, declined to comment on whether Snowden or anyone on his behalf had made plans for him to fly out.

Snowden could have trouble leaving on a private jet without tipping off authorities. Yuen said that all passengers must go through immigration and customs checks.

If Snowden is arrested, he must be brought "as soon as practicable" before a Hong Kong judge, according to the extradition treaty. The judge would decide whether he should be removed from Hong Kong under the treaty terms.

Donilon said in an interview with CBS News that U.S. officials believe the charges against Snowden "present a good case for extradition" under the U.S. and Hong Kong Agreement for the Surrender of Fugitive Offenders.

"Hong Kong has been a historically good partner of the United States in law enforcement matters, and we expect them to comply with the treaty in this case," Donilon said.

But Snowden can challenge any initial ruling to extradite him all the way to Hong Kong's highest court, a process that could take months to run its course.

To fight extradition, Snowden could invoke Article 6 of the 1997 treaty, which states that a suspect will not be surrendered to face criminal prosecution for an offense of a "political character."

Another unusual exception in the treaty could provide a defense for Snowden, according to extradition experts: Hong Kong authorities can refuse to surrender a suspect if extradition "implicates the defense, foreign affairs or essential public interest" of Hong Kong.

Regina Ip, a Hong Kong legislator and former security secretary, said Snowden will have plenty of defenders if he is arrested.

"I think if he stays in Hong Kong, there will be no lack of human rights lawyers who are happy to help him," she said Saturday.

Last weekend, 200 to 300 protesters marched past the U.S. Consulate to support Snowden, applauding his release of the documents.

Hong Kong is in an unusual position in the matter because it has an independent legal system but must ultimately answer to the Chinese leadership in Beijing.



## Snowden could find friendly soil in Latin America

Juan Forero

1099 words

24 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A07

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

BOGOTA, Colombia -

The three Latin American countries said to be helping Edward Snowden flee from American authorities are united in their opposition to the Obama administration and pursue foreign policy objectives designed to counter U.S. influence.

As Snowden, the intelligence contractor who disclosed documents about U.S. surveillance programs, arrived in Moscow from Hong Kong on Sunday, Russian media reported that he was booked on a flight to the Cuban capital, Havana, and from there on to Caracas, the Venezuelan capital.

By Sunday afternoon, Ecuador's foreign minister, Ricardo Patiño, said via his Twitter account that his government had received an asylum request from Snowden. Ecuador's embassy in London is hosting Julian Assange, founder of WikiLeaks, the anti-secrecy group that published reams of classified U.S. documents.

WikiLeaks, which is also assisting Snowden, said in a brief statement that he "is bound for the Republic of Ecuador via a safe route for the purpose of asylum." WikiLeaks said that once in Ecuador, Snowden's request for political asylum would be processed.

The Ecuadoran government of President Rafael Correa, a populist who expelled the U.S. ambassador from Quito in 2011, did not confirm the WikiLeaks account. But his administration, which has sought a greater role for the small country on the international stage, has reveled in the attention it has received since Assange holed up in its London embassy.

"Assange has been in the Ecuadoran Embassy in London for a year," Patiño said in a Thursday tweet. "We will not faint in this fight for liberty."

Analysts who closely follow the region said it would make sense for the former National Security Agency contractor to wind up in Venezuela or Ecuador. Both countries are led by self-styled leftist presidents who are publicly hostile to the Obama administration and position themselves to oppose U.S. policies in this region and beyond.

"Their foreign policy is based on being the anti-United States, and so this is consistent with that posture," said Carl Meacham, director of the Americas program at the Center for Strategic and International Studies in Washington. "They try, at every stop, to point out the problems they have with U.S. foreign policy."

In Venezuela, the new president, Nicols Maduro, a former foreign minister, has suggested that the United States had a hand in the death of Hugo Chavez, who led the country for 14 years and frequently accused Washington of hatching assassination plots against him. Chavez died in March after a long battle with cancer. He, like Correa, expelled the U.S. ambassador to his country.

"The different elite groups that represent the United States government and its imperial policies will have to recognize that in Venezuela there's a revolution," Maduro said this month. "They will have to accept our system, as they had to with Vietnam and other countries."

Ecuador's relations with Washington also have been strained, with Correa frequently critical of American policies in Latin America and eager to form alliances with U.S. adversaries such as Iran.

Still, Ecuador has an ambassador in Washington, and the United States last year appointed Adam E. Namm as ambassador in Quito.

Ecuador, Venezuela, Cuba, Bolivia, Nicaragua and a handful of smaller Caribbean countries belong to a Venezuela-led bloc called ALBA, which sees itself as an alternative to U.S.-led trade partnerships. ALBA, or the Bolivarian Alliance for the Peoples of Our America, also has clashed with the Obama administration after left-leaning leaders were ousted in Honduras and Paraguay.

"ALBA, in its permanent confrontation with the United States, looks for these kinds of possibilities," said Milos Alcalay, a former Venezuelan ambassador to the United Nations, referring to the possibility of Snowden finding asylum in the region. "This is part of the new Cold War against the United States."

Cuba, too, has been locked in conflict with the United States, with the Castro brothers battling a half-century-old American economic embargo. Since the 1960s, Havana has been a welcoming home for dozens of American fugitives. Perhaps the most prominent was CIA agent Philip Agee, whose 1975 book, "Inside the Company: CIA Diary," alleged U.S. misdeeds in Latin America and included a list of secret agency operatives.

But Havana may be a likely transit point for Snowden rather than serving as a long-term refuge. The island's communist government, now led by Ral Castro, Fidel Castro's younger brother, has recently revived diplomatic talks with the Obama administration. Giving Snowden asylum would inject new tensions into the strained relationship.

Jose Marti International Airport in Havana, though, could prove to be a key steppingstone for Snowden as he tries to escape U.S. extradition efforts. There are direct flights from Moscow, giving him ample possibilities to fly to Havana and from there fly on to Caracas or Quito.

The United States has been in touch via diplomatic and law enforcement channels with countries in the region through which Snowden might transit or that might serve as a final destination, said a U.S. official with knowledge of the administration's diplomatic efforts. American officials are letting diplomats in those countries know that Snowden is wanted on felony charges and that he should not be permitted to proceed with his travels, the official said.

Ironically, both Venezuela and Ecuador have been energetically criticized by press freedom organizations for clamping down on media outlets critical of the government.

Venezuela's government shuttered RCTV, a once-shrill critic of Chavez's government, and a range of anti-government radio stations. More recently, investors with close business ties to Maduro's government bought the only sharply critical television news station in the country, Globovision, which has since toned down its coverage.

Ecuador, though, has recently been at the forefront of activities that the New York-based Committee to Protect Journalists says amount to a blow to freedom of expression. A law proposed by Correa and approved June 14 establishes regulation of editorial content and provides authorities with the power to impose arbitrary sanctions and censor the press.

"It's a country where there is a vibrant press but where they have used laws, discrediting campaigns and the interruption of news programs and other obstacles to limit the work of journalists," said Carlos Lauria, who oversees the Latin American division of the Committee to Protect Journalists. "There is frankly a serious deterioration of free speech."

## WikiLeaks pledges its 'full help and assistance'

Anthony Faiola

910 words

24 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

LONDON - They made the most obvious of bedfellows: **Edward Snowden** and WikiLeaks.

When the former NSA contractor who leaked top-secret details of U.S. and British surveillance operations landed in Moscow on Sunday, Snowden disembarked from Aeroflot Flight SU213 with Sarah Harrison, a member of the WikiLeaks legal team, by his side. His arrival in Russia en route to a third country, in search of asylum from a U.S. extradition request, came after what appeared to be a Hollywoodesque plan to spirit him out of hiding in Hong Kong that was orchestrated with the aid of the whistleblower Web site.

On Sunday, WikiLeaks said in a statement that Snowden would petition Ecuador for asylum. The government in Quito - which has granted WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange asylum at its embassy in London - confirmed that it had received an official request for asylum from Snowden.

"This was an obvious thing for us to do, to support him in any way we can," said Kristinn Hrafnsson, an Icelandic journalist and WikiLeaks spokesman. "His revelations have been explosive and extremely important, and we've offered our full help and assistance."

The behind-the-scenes machinations again shined a spotlight on WikiLeaks, the crusading organization that has become a thorn in the side of Western governments with its occasionally damaging and often embarrassing revelations of official secrets.

The brand of assistance offered by WikiLeaks in legal cases is well documented and potent, with the group displaying an uncanny ability to tap assistance from countries hostile to the West and particularly the United States. For more than a year, for instance, Assange has defied the odds against the British and Swedish legal systems, holing up at the Embassy of Ecuador, a stone's throw from Harrods in opulent Knightsbridge, as he fights extradition to face allegations of sexual assault in Stockholm.

The marriage of Snowden and WikiLeaks is a natural match, both sharing an ideology of disclosure and a contempt for official secrecy. WikiLeaks has also been linked to Army Pfc. Bradley Manning, the source of a trove of classified material passed to the group and whose case has close parallels to Snowden's.

Hrafnsson said he personally established contact with Snowden last week while the American was in Hong Kong. He was vague about the operational details of their contact, saying only that "I used means that any journalist would."

Arrangements were then made, Hrafnsson said, for Harrison - a member of the WikiLeaks legal defense team who works under former Spanish judge Baltasar Garzon - to meet Snowden in Hong Kong and accompany him out of the autonomous region. Harrison, a British citizen, a journalist and a legal researcher, is not a lawyer. But she is considered a close confidant of Assange and a high-level member of WikiLeaks, and her presence suggested the direct involvement of the group's founder in the decision to aid Snowden. On Sunday, Harrison was still with Snowden in Moscow, Hrafnsson said.

WikiLeaks had for days been in the process of trying to find a friendly government willing to grant Snowden asylum, Hrafnsson said. He said he had made contact with the Icelandic government on Snowden's behalf, but had been told by officials there that asylum-seekers first needed to be present and within that nation's jurisdiction before any claim could be processed.

In a statement posted Sunday on its Web site, WikiLeaks said Snowden was heading to Ecuador: "Mr. Snowden requested that WikiLeaks use its legal expertise and experience to secure his safety. Once Mr. Snowden arrives in Ecuador his request will be formally processed."

Ecuador's foreign minister, Ricardo Patino, confirmed Sunday that his government had received a formal request for asylum from Snowden but did not elaborate.

Garzon, the legal director of WikiLeaks and lawyer for Assange, who once famously issued an international arrest warrant for former Chilean dictator Augusto Pinochet, said the group's legal aid for Snowden arose from a need to protect him.

"The WikiLeaks legal team and I are interested in preserving Mr. Snowden's rights and protecting him as a person," Garzon said in a statement. "What is being done to Mr. Snowden and to Mr. Julian Assange - for making or facilitating disclosures in the public interest - is an assault against the people." In a statement posted Saturday on the WikiLeaks Web site, Assange heralded Snowden. "The US government is spying on each and every one of us, but it is **Edward Snowden** who is charged with espionage for tipping us off," he said. "It is getting to the point where the mark of international distinction and service to humanity is no longer the Nobel Peace Prize, but an espionage indictment from the **US Department of Justice.**"

WikiLeaks' involvement in aiding Snowden seemed to propel his image among a certain segment of the global population as a crusader aligned with the anti-establishment forces that have rallied from Istanbul to Rio de Janeiro.

"WikiLeaks have a strong interest in protecting and promoting the activities of whistleblowers, so I hope they are able to help him," said Jim Killock, executive director of Open Rights Group, a British organization that campaigns for civil liberties. "We all owe **Edward Snowden** an enormous debt of gratitude. . . . Not everything whistleblowers do is legal, but their actions are absolutely vital when governments stretch the boundaries of the law."

## In Moscow, media scramble as rumors of Snowden swirl

Kathy Lally

750 words

24 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

MOSCOW - The arrival here of the Aeroflot flight from Hong Kong on a bright Sunday afternoon sent hordes of journalists fanning out across the city in hopes of spotting **Edward Snowden** and unleashed a torrent of rumors worthy of the darkest days of the Cold War. Scores of reporters and photographers crowded around Terminal F at **Sheremetyevo International Airport**, which no doubt was state-of-the-art when it was built - that would be for the 1980 Olympics. Its ceiling lights resembled coffee cans, or perhaps giant listening devices. The dim lighting cast an air of foreboding over a **Moscow arrival. There was no Snowden sighting.**

The passengers who trooped through the arrival area were besieged by reporters seeking information about Snowden, who has been charged with espionage in the United States for revealing the country's secret surveillance programs. But the passengers had little intelligence to offer, saying that they didn't know whether or not Snowden was on the flight, or that maybe he was but they hadn't been looking for him so wouldn't have recognized him.

Russia's government-connected media reported that Snowden was at the airport, hidden within a transit area. With reports swirling that Snowden would be flying to Havana on Monday afternoon - Aeroflot has a Havana flight at 2:05 p.m. Monday - and from there to Venezuela or Ecuador, other reporters took up positions at the embassies of those two countries.

The Venezuelan Embassy is conveniently located just up the street from a nest of journalists, the building on Sadovaya-Samotechnaya Street where many journalists were forced to live during the Soviet era, guarded by KGB officers who kept most Russians out. But two hours after the flight from Hong Kong landed, nothing seemed to be happening at the embassy.

The Ecuadoran Embassy, near the Irish Embassy and a busy hospital, also offered little payoff for a stakeout. An Ecuadoran diplomat's car was observed parked at the airport - identified by the Soviet system of assigning certain numbers to certain countries. RT, the television broadcaster financed by the Russian government, reported that a doctor from the embassy was examining Snowden at the airport. Russian officials said next to nothing, observing only that they had heard the reports.

The heart of the intrigue beat at the airport: If Snowden remained within the transit zone, he did not need a visa and could stay there until catching an onward flight, undetected by the TV cameras waiting on Russian soil.

According to the Web site of the Russian Embassy in Washington, a transit visa is required only if a passenger stays longer than 24 hours or if a change of airport is required.

The well-connected Interfax news agency said that if diplomats with official license plates met Snowden right at the steps to the plane, they could bundle him into a car and take him away without ever stepping on official Russian soil, meaning he could spend the night in diplomatic comfort.

"After getting into the car right from the gangway," Interfax quoted one person as saying, "Snowden formally will not be in Russia. In accordance with the extraterritoriality principle, diplomatic cars are part of the country represented by the embassy."

That was a scenario straight out of a spy movie, and Interfax later reported that Snowden in fact would need a visa even to get into a diplomatic car.

Meanwhile, Sergei Bout, whose brother Viktor was convicted in New York of arms smuggling and sentenced to 25 years in jail, suggested that Russia seize Snowden and trade him for Bout. The Bout case infuriated Russian officials, who were angry that the United States was able to extradite the Russian citizen from Thailand, and they have been demanding his return home.

Then there's the question of asylum. When reporters asked Dmitry Peskov, spokesman for President Vladimir Putin, whether Russia would consider giving Snowden sanctuary, he replied that all applications are considered.

Not exactly a robust invitation, but a comment that was enough to set off plenty of speculation.

A late rumor: Interfax reported that Snowden was in Terminal E at the airport, where he had a room in a hotel within the transit zone. RT reporters said they had heard talk of paperwork problems, so he would no doubt be subjected to many questions. And so the last question: Who would be asking?

## Snowden saga moves to Moscow

Kathy Lally Anthony Faiola Jia Lynn Yang

1499 words

24 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

**MOSCOW - Edward Snowden, the former government contractor who leaked top-secret documents about U.S. surveillance programs, fled Hong Kong for Moscow on Sunday with the assistance of the anti-secrecy organization WikiLeaks and asked the government of Ecuador to grant him asylum.**

Snowden's ultimate destination was uncertain, but Ricardo Patiño, Ecuador's foreign minister, tweeted Sunday afternoon that his government had received a request for asylum from Snowden. WikiLeaks released a statement saying Snowden was "bound for the Republic of Ecuador via a safe route for the purposes of asylum."

Despite U.S. officials' insistence that Snowden's passport was revoked Saturday, the Hong Kong government said Sunday that he left "on his own accord for a third country."

Ecuadoran diplomats were at Sheremetyevo International Airport, where Snowden landed aboard an Aeroflot flight about 5:05 p.m. (9:05 a.m. EDT). It was not clear whether they were meeting with Snowden or with others who accompanied him. Snowden did not have a Russian visa, according to several sources, so he was confined to a transit area within the airport.

**WikiLeaks, which has published hundreds of thousands of classified documents over the past several years, said it is aiding Snowden in his bid to avoid a return to the United States.** Snowden, 30, had fled to Hong Kong, where he revealed two weeks ago that he was the source of leaked National Security Agency documents. Federal prosecutors in Virginia filed espionage charges against him June 14 and had asked Hong Kong to detain him.

"The U.S. is disappointed and disagrees with the determination by Hong Kong authorities not to honor the U.S. request for the arrest of the fugitive, Edward J. Snowden," a Justice Department spokesman said Sunday. The spokesman, who declined to be identified, added that authorities in the United States and Hong Kong had "been in continual contact" since June 10, when the Justice Department learned that Snowden was in the Chinese territory.

**WikiLeaks said Snowden was accompanied on his flight to Moscow by Sarah Harrison, who the organization said is a British citizen, journalist and researcher working with the WikiLeaks legal defense team.**

**Kristinn Hrafnsson, an Icelandic investigative journalist and spokesman for WikiLeaks, said in a phone interview that Snowden would overnight in Moscow, which he described as "not a final destination." He declined to say when Snowden would be departing or where his final stop would be.**

Hrafnsson said he established contact with Snowden last week while the American was in Hong Kong. Arrangements were made for Harrison to meet Snowden in Hong Kong and accompany him out. Harrison was still with Snowden in Moscow, Hrafnsson said.

**"The WikiLeaks legal team and I are interested in preserving Mr. Snowden's rights and protecting him as a person," said Baltasar Garzn, legal director of WikiLeaks and attorney for Julian Assange, the group's founder, who has spent the past year holed up in the Ecuadoran Embassy in London. "What is being done**

to Mr. Snowden and to Mr. Julian Assange - for making or facilitating disclosures in the public interest - is an assault against the people."

U.S. officials, who spoke on the condition of anonymity because of ongoing diplomacy regarding Snowden, said his passport had been revoked before he left Hong Kong.

The State Department said privacy laws prevented it from commenting on Snowden's passport.

"As is routine and consistent with U.S. regulations, persons with felony arrest warrants are subject to having their passport revoked," said State Department spokeswoman Jen Psaki. ". . . Persons wanted on felony charges, such as Mr. Snowden, should not be allowed to proceed in any further international travel, other than is necessary to return him to the United States."

But the Interfax news agency, quoting a Russian law enforcement source, said Snowden could continue on his journey from Moscow without a U.S. passport if the country where he was seeking asylum provided him with travel documents. Those documents could include affirmation of refugee status, Interfax reported, or even a passport from the destination country.

The apparent cooperation of the Russian government in Snowden's attempt to avoid extradition to the United States outraged some members of Congress.

"What's infuriating here is [President Vladimir] Putin of Russia aiding and abetting Snowden's escape," Sen. Charles E. Schumer (D-N.Y.) said on CNN's "State of the Union."

"The bottom line is very simple," Schumer said. "Allies are supposed to treat each other in decent ways, and Putin always seems almost eager to put a finger in the eye of the United States, whether it is Syria, Iran and now, of course, with Snowden. That's not how allies should treat one another, and I think it will have serious consequences for the United States-Russia relationship."

Rep. Ileana Ros-Lehtinen (R-Fla.) agreed that Sunday's events call "into question what kind of relationship we ever have had with China and Russia. We pretend that everything is hunky-dory when it is not. It isn't with China. It isn't with Russia. It certainly isn't with Cuba, with Venezuela nor with Ecuador."

She added: "These are countries that violate press freedoms every day. And yet [Snowden]'s seeking political asylum in those very countries where . . . if he were to pull a Snowden in these countries, they'd jail him immediately."

Hong Kong's government said that the U.S. request for a warrant for Snowden's arrest "did not fully comply with the legal requirements under Hong Kong law" and that it had asked for "additional information."

"As the HKSAR Government has yet to have sufficient information to process the request for provisional warrant of arrest, there is no legal basis to restrict Mr. Snowden from leaving Hong Kong," the statement said.

A senior Justice Department official disputed that claim. "The request met the requirements of the agreement," said the official, who spoke on the condition of anonymity. "They came back to us late Friday with additional questions, and we were in the process of responding. Obviously, this raises concerns for us, and we will continue to discuss this with the authorities there."

The United States had asked Hong Kong to issue a provisional arrest warrant and filed charges against Snowden, including theft, "unauthorized communication of national defense information" and "willful communication of classified communications intelligence information to an unauthorized person."

If Snowden is relocating to Ecuador, he will have limited travel options. There are no direct flights from Moscow to Quito, and many would-be layover destinations would probably heed Washington's request to detain him. One likely exception would be Havana. There are direct flights from Moscow to Havana five days a week, including Mondays, and a direct flight from Havana to Quito on Fridays.

PatiÃ±o, the Ecuadoran foreign minister, recently said Quito would be willing to consider an asylum claim by Snowden. Speaking at a news conference in London after visiting Assange last Monday, PatiÃ±o suggested that his nation would approve such a request.

Authorities in Ecuador would weigh a petition "responsibly, just like we did so in Mr. Assange's case," he said during the news conference at the Ecuadoran Embassy.

Assange has been unable to leave the Ecuadoran Embassy because Britain has refused to provide him safe passage while he is sought by Sweden for questioning about sexual-assault allegations.

Ecuadoran President Rafael Correa has emerged as one of the most vehement critics of U.S. policy in the Western Hemisphere. In 2011, his administration expelled the American ambassador in Quito to protest a cable released by WikiLeaks that alleged the Ecuadoran police force was rife with corruption.

The extradition treaty between the United States and Ecuador, signed in 1872, states that offenses of "a political character" do not warrant extradition - much like the United States' agreement with Hong Kong.

It's unclear whether the Chinese leadership in Beijing had any role in Hong Kong's decision to let Snowden leave. Hong Kong is a semiautonomous region that prides itself on its independent legal system, but the government ultimately answers to the mainland, whose influence can be difficult to discern. Residents in Hong Kong are deeply resistant to any overt sign of interference from the Communist Party.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Beijing said in a statement Sunday that it had seen the reports of Snowden's departure and would continue to pay attention to developments but did not have "specific details." The government added that it was "deeply concerned" about reports of U.S. government cyberattacks on China, saying they "proved that China is a victim of cyberattacks."

## U.S. is worried about security of documents Snowden has

Ellen Nakashima Greg Miller

962 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A07

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The ability of contractor-turned-fugitive **Edward Snowden** to evade arrest is raising new concerns among U.S. officials about the security of top-secret documents he is believed to have in his possession - and about the possibility that he could willingly share them with those who assist his escape.

It's unclear whether officials in Hong Kong or in Russia, where Snowden fled over the weekend, obtained any of the classified material. A spokesman for the anti-secrecy group WikiLeaks, which has been assisting the former National Security Agency contractor, strenuously denied reports that foreign governments had made copies of the documents.



"This rumor that is being spread is a fabrication and just plays into the propaganda by the administration here that somehow Mr. Snowden is cooperating with Russian or Chinese authorities," spokesman Kristinn Hrafnsson said in a phone interview Monday.

Nonetheless, in 2010 and 2011, WikiLeaks published hundreds of thousands of sensitive U.S. documents it obtained from Army Pfc. Bradley Manning, and co-founder Julian Assange suggested in a teleconference call with reporters Monday that the group was interested in gaining access to the documents Snowden had obtained.

"In relation to publishing such material, of course WikiLeaks is in the business of publishing documents that are supposed to be suppressed," Assange said. He declined to say whether Snowden had shared any of the material.

The NSA has teams of analysts scouring systems that they think Snowden may have accessed, officials said. Analysts are seeking to retrace his steps online and to assemble a catalogue of the material he may have taken.

"They think he copied so much stuff - that almost everything that place does, he has," said one former government official, referring to the NSA, where Snowden worked as a contractor for Booz Allen Hamilton while in the NSA's Hawaii facility. "Everyone's nervous about what the next thing will be, what will be exposed."

Glenn Greenwald, the Guardian columnist who has published a series of stories based on documents provided by Snowden, said he has exercised discretion in choosing what to disclose. Snowden, too, has said he was selective in choosing what to disclose.

"I know that he has in his possession thousands of documents, which, if published, would impose crippling damage on the United States' surveillance capabilities and systems around the world," Greenwald told CNN. "He has never done any of that."

The Guardian, Greenwald said on "Meet the Press" on Sunday, has withheld "the majority of things that he gave us pursuant not only to his instruction, but to our duty as journalists."

Over the past several weeks, The Washington Post and the Guardian have published articles and portions of documents that describe two major surveillance programs. One, called PRISM, deals with the interception of e-mail and other Internet content of foreign terrorism suspects thought to be located overseas. The other involves the amassing of a database of Americans' phone call records - numbers dialed and received, length of call, but no content - which can be searched for a specific phone number when there is "reasonable, articulable" suspicion of a terrorist plot or activity associated with the number.

A former senior U.S. official said that the material that has leaked publicly would be of limited use to China or Russia but that if Snowden also stole files that outline U.S. cyber-penetration efforts, the damage of any disclosure would be multiplied. The official, like others in this article, spoke on the condition of anonymity because the official wasn't authorized to discuss the matters on the record.

U.S. officials said their assumption is that China and Russia have copied the materials that Snowden took from classified U.S. networks but that they had no way to confirm those countries had done so.

"That stuff is gone," said a former senior U.S. intelligence official who served in Russia. "I guarantee the Chinese intelligence service got their hands on that right away. If they imaged the hard drives and then returned them to him, well, then the Russians have that stuff now."

Hrafnsson said such assertions are unfounded. In his call with reporters, Assange insisted that neither the Chinese nor the Russians had debriefed Snowden during his stops in their territories.

Asked about the security of the trove of material thought to be on Snowden's laptop and the possibility that it could fall into the wrong hands, Assange said: "Mr. Snowden's material has been secured by the relevant journalist organizations prior to travel." Asked if he could elaborate, he said, "I'm afraid I cannot."

The damage assessment being conducted by U.S. officials is expected to take "a few months, at best," said a senior intelligence official. "We're looking for all of the information that was disclosed, and assessing the damage it may have caused in terms of national security sources," he said.

A second senior intelligence official said there were concerns that disclosure of U.S. surveillance methods would make it easier for terrorist groups to avoid detection. "The more material that gets made public the more capability we lose," the official said.

Already, several terrorist groups in various regions of the world have begun to change their method of communication based on disclosures of surveillance programs in the media, the official said. He would not elaborate on the communication modes.

"It's frustrating," he said. "Because if they find some other method to communicate, we go dark. And we miss dots. That's not something we're particularly excited about."

## Ecuadoran leader invites tussle with U.S. over Snowden

Juan Forero

1034 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A07

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

BOGOTA, Colombia - If **Edward Snowden**, the former intelligence contractor on the run from American officials, receives sanctuary in tiny Ecuador, he will be welcomed by a brash populist leader who savors tussling with the United States.

"Hello country and world," President Rafael Correa said in a Twitter message Monday. "Be assured that we will very responsibly analyze the Snowden case, and with absolute sovereignty take the decision we believe is most adequate."

But it was clear that Ecuador's government sympathizes with Snowden and considers the top-secret U.S. surveillance program he revealed "a danger to us all," as Foreign Minister Ricardo Patio put it. In a news conference, Patio praised Snowden's whistleblowing and read aloud the document leaker's letter to Correa requesting asylum.

Patio's explanation of how Ecuador views the Snowden affair was characteristic of the Correa administration's relationship with Washington: eager to pounce on a delicate issue and tweak "the Empire," as the United States is known to many of Correa's followers. And if Ecuador provides asylum to Snowden, it will propel Correa and his country of 14.6 million onto the world stage, to be scolded by Washington and venerated by the international left for standing up to the world's superpower.

Correa, 50, is among a group of leftist Latin American populists who have sought to steer their countries away from U.S. influence. Led for years by former Venezuelan president Hugo Chavez, who died in March, the bloc includes Evo Morales, the Aymara Indian leader-turned-president of Bolivia; Nicaraguan President

Daniel Ortega, whose army fought U.S.-trained contra guerrillas at the height of the Cold War; and the Castro brothers in Cuba.

Although overshadowed by Chavez, Correa has rarely shied away from confrontation with Washington. He called former U.S. president George W. Bush "tremendously dimwitted," closed an American base that was vital for anti-narcotics programs, tossed out the World Bank's representative and defaulted on \$3.2 billion in sovereign debt. He also closely aligned Ecuador with Iran.

"Ecuador is looking to be an antagonist of the United States and looking for causes that will permit it to do that," Ramiro Crespo, an economist and political analyst in Quito, the capital, said of Ecuador's response to the Snowden saga.

Correa has a pragmatic, pro-business side rarely evident in Chavez or other strident nationalist leaders in the region. He has been accommodating to big companies in Ecuador, including oil conglomerates, drawing the ire of Indians and other groups usually close to the left.

"He knows his political power would be undermined if he doesn't have a strong economy, and he wouldn't have a strong economy without foreign investment coming in," said Michael Shifter, president of the Inter-American Dialogue in Washington.

But Shifter also described Correa as an impulsive leader who can react recklessly in tense situations, as when he waded into a police uprising in 2010, threw open his shirt and dared the officers to shoot him.

Now, with the Snowden affair, Correa is risking the jobs of tens of thousands of working-class Ecuadorans who benefit from a preferential trade agreement under which the United States imports flowers, asparagus, broccoli, tuna and other products tariff-free from the country. A peeved U.S. Congress might not renew the accord - which no other South American nation has with Washington and which is set to expire July 31 - if Snowden ends up on Ecuadoran soil, said analysts in Quito and in Washington.

"You can forget about trade preferences," Shifter said. "You can forget about cooperation."

Still, Snowden's flight might provide an opportunity for Correa as his government comes under sharp criticism from press freedom advocates over a new media law they say is designed to muzzle critics. Since first winning office in 2007, Correa has focused much of his energy on the media - pillorying reporters by name on his Saturday television show, filing libel suits and pursuing policies to weaken critical media outlets.

Offering sanctuary last year at the Ecuadoran Embassy in London to Julian Assange, the founder of WikiLeaks who is wanted for questioning in Sweden in connection with sexual assault allegations, and now aiding Snowden, could help Correa deflect that criticism, said Cesar Perez, the managing editor of *El Universo*, a newspaper in the city of Guayaquil.

"This is a way for President Correa to compensate for the bad reputation that he has, of being intolerant with free expression," said Perez, whose newspaper Correa has tried to weaken, according to the Committee to Protect Journalists.

Observers in Ecuador say Correa may calculate that the benefits of receiving Snowden outweigh the risks. In the Assange case, many Ecuadorans, even those opposed to Correa, supported his government in its scrape with the United Kingdom.

And the United States is a bigger, more powerful adversary.

"I don't know what people will think about Snowden, but I do know that Correa will be able to go on TV and say, 'Look, we defeated the United States,' " said Joyce Higgins de Ginatta, a businesswoman in Guayaquil.

Patio, speaking to reporters during a trade mission to Vietnam on Monday, said he could not say where Snowden was or how he would get to Ecuador, calling that "information we don't have." But the tenor of his comments pointed to Ecuador receiving Snowden with open arms - if Snowden, who was in Moscow on Monday, can make it to the South American country.

"The man who is trying to shine a light and show transparency over acts that have affected the fundamental liberty of all people is now being pursued by those who should be giving explanations to governments and the citizens of the world about the denunciations presented by Mr. Snowden," Patio said.

The foreign minister cast doubt on U.S. claims that Snowden betrayed his country.

"We have to ask who is betraying whom" Patio said. "Aren't some citizens especially loyal to their fellow citizens and the rest of humanity for revealing risks and dangers that affect us all?"

## Snowden out of sight as U.S. pressures Russia

Kathy Lally Anthony Faiola

1073 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

MOSCOW - **Edward Snowden**, sought on espionage charges after bringing secret U.S. surveillance programs to light, receded still further into the shadows Monday as the United States strenuously called on Russia to turn him over for prosecution.

Snowden, a former government contractor who has not been seen in public since he was said to have arrived in Moscow on Sunday after slipping out of Hong Kong, set off a flurry of diplomatic activity around the globe as frustrated U.S. officials tried to interrupt his flight to asylum. The 30-year-old fugitive has asked for refuge in Ecuador and other countries, according to Julian Assange, the WikiLeaks founder, who said he was advising Snowden.

After reporters and airline officials said Snowden failed to board a flight from Moscow to Havana on Monday afternoon as expected, the United States intensified its pressure on the countries suspected of offering him possible protection. Jay Carney, the White House press secretary, said the United States believed Snowden was still in Moscow.

The episode, which began with embarrassing disclosures about American intelligence-gathering, has reverberated from China to South America. As Snowden stays one step ahead of U.S. law, countries large and small are exploiting the opportunity to demonstrate their ability to flout American will.

"We continue to hope that the Russians will do the right thing," Secretary of State John F. Kerry, traveling in India, told NBC News. "We think it's very important in terms of our relationship."

Russian news agencies quoted a string of careful statements from unnamed sources who said they were powerless to intervene because Snowden remained in a transit area of the airport and had not crossed the border into official Russian territory.

"The Americans can't demand anything," Vladimir Lukin, Russia's human rights ombudsman and a former U.S. ambassador, told the Interfax news agency.

Ecuadoran Foreign Minister Ricardo Patiño, who was traveling in Vietnam, read from a letter he said Snowden had sent President Rafael Correa. In the letter, Snowden compared himself to Army Pfc. Bradley Manning, charged in the leak of a trove classified material passed to WikiLeaks, and said he did not believe he would be treated justly and that he could be executed if returned to the United States.

Assange, speaking to reporters by telephone from his sanctuary in the Ecuadoran Embassy in London, said Snowden was with Sarah Harrison, a top WikiLeaks lieutenant and Assange confidante who had escorted him from Hong Kong. Assange said that Snowden was in a "safe place" and that his "spirits are high" but would say only that he was "bound for Ecuador via a safe path through Russia and other states."

A former contractor for the National Security Agency, Snowden has presented the United States with a tantalizing and maddening mystery since he left Hong Kong early Sunday local time despite a request by the United States to detain him.

Journalists in Moscow have been led on one unsatisfying chase after another since Snowden arrived at the airport Sunday. About two-dozen of them bought tickets to the Monday flight to Havana - costing more than \$2,000 each, round-trip - and were dismayed when the seat in Row 17 reportedly assigned to Snowden remained empty as the plane took off. Some hoped, apparently in vain, that he was wearing a disguise or hiding in a crew area of the Aeroflot Airbus.

With no clear information about Snowden's plans, Russian media speculated that he would take the Tuesday flight to Havana and travel from there to South America. Another theory had it that the Russians were having second thoughts.

Carney said U.S. authorities were "in conversations" with their Russian counterparts regarding Snowden, who said he exposed a citizen surveillance program that he believed violated civil liberties. President Obama, in response to a reporter's question, said only that the United States was "following the appropriate legal channels and working with various countries to make sure that all the rules are followed."

Kerry, citing widespread Internet limits and human rights issues in Russia and China, said it was "no small irony" that Snowden was seeking cooperation from those countries in his quest to protect civil liberties.

"I hope it's a good sign he isn't on that flight," Kerry said in the NBC interview, "and that something else may take place. But I'm not going to prejudge anything other than to say that obviously this is important to us. And I hope the right thing will happen."

Kerry asserted that the United States had returned seven criminals wanted by Russia over the past few years. But the United States has also irritated Russia by refusing repeated requests to return Viktor Bout, convicted in New York of global arms smuggling and sentenced to 25 years in prison last year.

Assange said Ecuador had supplied Snowden with a "refugee document of passage" before his flight from Hong Kong, facilitating his travel to Moscow and, presumably, beyond. Assange described the move as an initial step in the process of seeking asylum and a necessary step given the revocation of Snowden's passport by U.S. authorities.

Patiño, the Ecuadoran foreign minister, said his government was "in close contact with the Russian government" but did not have specific information about Snowden's whereabouts.

Patiño said Ecuador, which has been sharply criticized for silencing journalists at home, was considering Snowden's asylum request. He praised the former government contractor for disclosing the surveillance program and said Ecuador was free to exercise its sovereignty as it saw fit with regard to Snowden.

When asked if he was concerned about damaging his nation's economic relationship with Washington, Patiño remained adamant. "Ecuador puts its principles above its economic interests," he said.

Correa, the Ecuadoran president, has emerged as one of the most vehement critics of U.S. policy in the Western Hemisphere. In 2011, his administration expelled the American ambassador in Quito to protest a cable released by WikiLeaks that alleged that the Ecuadoran police force was rife with corruption.

## Hong Kong: Shadowy envoy encouraged fugitive to leave

Jia Lynn Yang Peter Finn Sari Horwitz

1519 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

HONG KONG - The message was blunt and was delivered Friday night by a shadowy emissary who didn't identify himself but knew enough to locate **Edward Snowden's** secret caretaker: The 30-year-old American accused of leaking some of his country's most sensitive secrets should leave Hong Kong, the messenger said, and if he decided to depart the authorities would not interfere with his travel plans.

Since he had revealed himself on June 9 as the person who had turned over classified documents to The Washington Post and the British newspaper the Guardian, Snowden had moved between different hideaways guided by a Hong Kong resident, according to one of his lawyers, Albert Ho. Like the emissary, the caretaker's name has not been disclosed, but Ho said the resident "must be well-connected."

For more than a week, the U.S. government had been pressing the government of Hong Kong, a semiautonomous part of China, to arrest Snowden. Attorney General Eric H. Holder Jr. placed a call to his counterpart in Hong Kong. U.S. diplomats, the FBI and lawyers at the Justice Department all weighed in to urge Snowden's detention.

But the newly disclosed details of Snowden's stay in Hong Kong indicate that the authorities there, probably acting with the guidance of Beijing, didn't want him to stay in Hong Kong for a long, messy legal process to determine whether he would be extradited. **The new information also raises questions about whether the Obama administration could have done more to prevent the former National Security Agency contractor from slipping away.**

On the Friday that Snowden was quietly encouraged to leave, officials in Hong Kong were asking the U.S. Justice Department for more information about its provisional arrest warrant. Charles Mok, a Hong Kong legislator, said it appeared that the U.S. request for an arrest warrant never made it to a judge here. Rather, it seems to have been delayed by the administration of Chief Executive Leung Chun-ying, who is widely viewed as being sympathetic to Beijing.

The U.S. government is facing much the same quandary now that Snowden is in Russia, where the government of President Vladimir Putin is disinclined to assist the United States and may be only too happy to watch Washington squirm.

U.S. officials have expressed their frustration with Snowden's elusiveness in unusually blunt terms.

"We are just not buying that this was a technical decision by a Hong Kong immigration official," said White House press secretary Jay Carney. "This was a deliberate choice by the government to release a fugitive, despite a valid arrest warrant. And that decision unquestionably has a negative impact on the U.S.-China relationship."

There had been widespread speculation that the U.S. government would try to detain Snowden on its own somehow. Julian Assange, the founder of the anti-secrecy group WikiLeaks, which has been advising and supporting Snowden, said in a conference call with reporters Monday that "the kidnapping or incapacitating of Mr. Snowden must have been considered [by the U.S. government]."

But former intelligence officials said a rendition operation to snatch Snowden off the streets of Hong Kong was always a fantasy. There would be no element of surprise, no cooperation from local intelligence officials, and a target who had burrowed deep into the city's crowded neighborhoods.

Even keeping him under CIA or FBI surveillance would have been daunting, former officials said, because of the public attention surrounding the case as well as the fact that U.S. operatives are themselves under heavy surveillance in China and Russia.

"He didn't go out," Ho said of Snowden. "He spent all his time inside, in a tiny place."

Ho said he first met Snowden late Tuesday night, getting into a car at a prearranged spot. Inside the car was Snowden, wearing a hat and sunglasses.

Snowden didn't speak. When they arrived at the home where Snowden was staying, the American whispered that everyone had to put their cellphones in the refrigerator. "Then he became very outspoken," Ho said.

Snowden was "very smart" and analytical, said his lawyer, although he didn't seem to have anticipated just how complicated his situation in Hong Kong would become. "I don't think he ever had a well-thought-out plan," said Ho, although he added that Snowden seemed to have researched places where he could take refuge.

For two hours that night, Snowden talked with his lawyers, who also included Jonathan Man, an associate at Ho's firm, and Robert Tibbo, a refugee human rights lawyer. To mark Snowden's birthday later that week - he turned 30 Friday - Ho brought over a large pizza and fried chicken. There was also Snowden's preferred beverage, Pepsi.

The prospect of being detained worried Snowden, said Ho, especially because he would lose access to his computer, a situation that would be "totally intolerable."

Snowden asked Ho to reach out to the Hong Kong government to get a sense of what it was thinking.

By early Saturday morning in Hong Kong, Snowden learned of reports that he was the subject of a criminal complaint in the Eastern District of Virginia and that the United States had requested his arrest. There was nothing particularly surprising about the news, but it added to his sense of anxiety, Ho said.

Snowden told his lawyer about the strange message relayed through an intermediary that he should leave Hong Kong. He asked Ho to talk to the Hong Kong government to see whether it would confirm the signal.

By this point, Snowden was in contact with people from WikiLeaks. He considered flying out of Hong Kong on Saturday but balked for some reason. WikiLeaks officials in London said they had assisted Snowden in making his formal application for asylum in Ecuador and had also approached Iceland and "other countries" on Snowden's behalf. They would not specify which other countries had been contacted, nor what their responses had been.

Later Saturday, senior officials in Washington, including national security adviser Thomas E. Donilon, signaled their impatience with Hong Kong.

The United States was also secretly taking steps to block Snowden from traveling. Secretary of State John F. Kerry said in an interview with CNN on Monday that "the moment the [criminal complaint] was unsealed

and we knew of it, at that point, his passport was pulled within two hours." According to law enforcement officials, the U.S. government would not have been able to pull his passport earlier because the charges were still under seal.

On Saturday evening, Ho said he got a noncommittal response from the Hong Kong authorities. "There's nothing the government can say," was how he described it.

On Sunday morning, Snowden, accompanied by one of his lawyers, entered Hong Kong International Airport. They were followed by plainclothes Hong Kong policemen as they made their way, unmolested, through the regular departure channels.

Hong Kong officials said Snowden presented his U.S. passport although WikiLeaks has said it had already arranged Ecuadoran travel papers for Snowden. A WikiLeaks official joined Snowden on the flight.

The city government announced Snowden's departure when his Aeroflot flight to Moscow had exited Chinese airspace.

WikiLeaks said Russian officials were told of Snowden's travel plans prior to his departure from Hong Kong. Former senior U.S. officials who served in Moscow said the United States has little leverage in seeking cooperation on Snowden and that the Russian government likely has more to gain by holding the fugitive and ultimately allowing him to obtain asylum in another country.

One former intelligence official said Russian authorities were almost certain to debrief Snowden and seize any computer files he carried into the country. The South China Morning Post, which has interviewed Snowden, reported Monday that he had taken a job with Booz Hamilton Allen earlier this year with the express purpose of being assigned to the NSA and accessing classified documents.

Fiona Hill, the co-author of a biography of Putin and a senior fellow at the Brookings Institution, said the Russians, who have been frustrated in their attempts to get opponents of the government extradited from the West, are likely to let the United States "stew in its own juices."

There were contradictory reports about Snowden's exact location in Moscow on Monday. He failed to get on a flight to Cuba that was supposed to be the next leg in an apparent attempt to reach Ecuador. And it is unclear whether Russia is secretly negotiating with the United States or interviewing him before they allow his departure.

"They don't want to waste this opportunity to extract what they can," Hill said, "so they don't want Mr. Snowden to fly off too quickly."

## Obama's approach to crisis draws fire

Philip Rucker

970 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A07

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

It was bright and sunny in Washington on Saturday as President Obama stepped out of the White House in flip-flops and khaki shorts to hit the golf course with his buddies.



At the same time, officials throughout his administration were scrambling to keep one of America's most-wanted fugitives from evading extradition in Hong Kong.

The juxtaposition illustrates the hands-off approach Obama has taken - in public, at least - to the government's efforts to bring **Edward Snowden**, the 30-year-old former contractor who exposed classified details of U.S. surveillance programs, back to the United States to face charges of revealing government secrets.

Conservatives say Obama's posture in the case provides further evidence of a commander in chief whose credibility abroad has declined and who shrinks from presidential leadership at moments of international crisis, including in response to last fall's attacks in Benghazi, Libya.

"Nobody's afraid of this guy," said former George W. Bush administration adviser Eliot A. Cohen, who argues that Obama should have personally stood up to Chinese and Russian officials. "Nobody's saying there are any real consequences that would come from crossing him - and that's an awful position for the president of the United States to be in."

But some foreign policy experts were more sympathetic to the administration, saying that inserting Obama directly into the negotiations would be folly. It is embarrassing enough that Snowden is on the run, they said; the president's personal involvement would only further risk the United States' credibility abroad.

Administration officials have not detailed any actions that Obama has personally taken to bring Snowden to justice, saying only that he has set the administration's strategic direction and has been briefed regularly by his national security staff.

Unlike other crises, the White House has not distributed any photographs of Obama and his advisers monitoring Snowden's movements in the Situation Room or calling foreign leaders from the Oval Office. All known communications between U.S. officials and authorities in Hong Kong, China and Russia have been made by Attorney General Eric H. Holder Jr. and other underlings, although a senior administration official said Obama could become personally involved at some point.

Obama's first brief public comments on Snowden came Monday during an event focused on immigration. The remarks came nearly 40 hours after Snowden had set off on his global odyssey, jetting first to Moscow with the possibility of seeking asylum in Ecuador by way of Cuba.

"We are following the appropriate legal channels and working with various countries to make sure that all the rules are followed," Obama told reporters in response to a question Monday afternoon. "Beyond that, I will refer you to the Justice Department, which has been actively involved in this issue."

If Obama spoke out more forcefully, he would endanger the United States' standing unless he was prepared to retaliate against countries that refuse to detain Snowden, said Anthony H. Cordesman, a former State Department and Pentagon official now at the Center for Strategic and International Studies.

"I think it would be totally inappropriate for the president to put American prestige on the line to make threats," Cordesman said. "You have to handle it at lower levels. . . . You have to find much quieter ways of communicating to Russia and China."

Snowden's globe-trotting comes at a sensitive time for Obama's relationships with his counterparts in both China and Russia.

At a California summit three weeks ago between Obama and newly minted Chinese President Xi Jinping, Obama confronted Xi on China's widespread theft of intellectual property from U.S. companies.

And last week at the G-8 Summit in Northern Ireland, Obama and Russian President Vladimir Putin sat stiffly side by side and failed to resolve their substantial differences over bringing about an end to the worsening civil war in Syria.

When reporters asked Monday whether Obama had called either Xi or Putin to personally ask that they detain Snowden and extradite him to the United States, White House press secretary Jay Carney demurred.

"I have no presidential communications to read out to you," Carney said repeatedly. He added, "There is no reason why, given international law, given the relationships that we have with the countries in question, that this would require a communication from the president."

Obama's critics argue that Obama has lost influence internationally. Cohen - a top foreign policy adviser to Mitt Romney, Obama's 2012 Republican opponent - said Snowden's escape was "a humiliation" for the president.

"The Russians repeatedly have stuck a finger in our eye - over Iran, over Syria, over this," Cohen said. Obama, he added, "doesn't react in a way that causes them to think, 'My gosh, we've paid a price for taking this attitude.'"

Former ambassador Richard S. Williamson, another top Romney adviser, said the unwillingness so far of international authorities to extradite Snowden amounts to "a condemnation of the president's policies of disengagement and retrenchment around the world."

Complicating Obama's challenge is an intense fixation by the international media. Michael E. O'Hanlon, a senior fellow and defense strategy expert at the Brookings Institution, called it "a perfect media story" because of ongoing intrigue about Snowden's whereabouts coupled with his role in the renewed debate over security and privacy.

But, O'Hanlon added, "I don't see this as a top-tier issue on par with Iran's nuclear program, to the point where we should go to the mat over this. And even more importantly, I'm not sure what difference it would make if we did. This is still the way some of these governments do business with each other."

## Bill seeks limits on call data collection

Aaron Blake Ellen Nakashima

509 words

25 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The chairman of the Senate Judiciary Committee on Monday renewed long-frustrated efforts to expand congressional oversight of government surveillance programs following disclosures about the intelligence community's collection of phone and Internet records.

The FISA Accountability and Privacy Protection Act, introduced Monday by Sen. Patrick J. Leahy (D-Vt.), would raise the legal bar the government must meet before obtaining call detail records from U.S. phone companies, effectively narrowing the scope of collection.

The bill would amend Section 215 of the Patriot Act to require officials to demonstrate that the phone records sought are relevant not only to an authorized investigation but that they also have links to a foreign terrorist group or power.

The new push comes amid public outcry over disclosure this month of the top-secret phone data collection program in Britain's Guardian newspaper, which obtained a classified document from **Edward Snowden**, the former government contractor facing federal espionage charges.

A separate provision in Leahy's bill would terminate Section 702 of the FISA Amendments Act - authorizing a far-reaching Internet surveillance program - in June 2015, two years sooner than its current expiration date. Details of that program, called PRISM by the National Security Agency, were revealed in articles based on documents obtained by The Washington Post and the Guardian from the same NSA contractor.

The full Senate has rejected previous attempts by Leahy and others to win approval for such measures, including when Section 702 was up for reauthorization in December. It likewise defeated an effort to narrow Section 215 of the Patriot Act during a 2011 reauthorization.

Following the recent disclosures, Leahy and other lawmakers concerned about the reach into Americans' private communications may have new momentum.

Leahy's bill is co-sponsored by Sens. Mike Lee (R-Utah), Mark Udall (D-Colo.), Ron Wyden (D-Ore.), Richard Blumenthal (D-Conn.) and Jon Tester (D-Mont.). Udall and Wyden, members of the Intelligence Committee, have introduced similar legislation to narrow the scope of Section 215.

"The recent public revelations about two classified data collection programs have brought renewed attention to the use of government surveillance powers, which deserve close scrutiny by Congress," Leahy said in a statement. "The comprehensive legislation that I am introducing today will not only improve the privacy protections and accountability provisions associated with these authorities, but also strengthen oversight and transparency provisions in other parts of the USA Patriot Act."

The legislation calls for an unclassified report summarizing the impact of the surveillance program on Americans' privacy. It also would mandate formal reviews of Patriot Act Section 215 and the FISA Amendments Act Section 702.

Privacy advocates have argued that the government has interpreted those provisions too broadly, allowing authorities to collect the records of millions of Americans with no connection to foreign terrorism investigations. The Obama administration has argued that the broad collection of telephone and Internet data has proven critical to disrupting terrorism plots against U.S. interests.

## Putin: No grounds to extradite Snowden

Kathy Lally Will Englund

1164 words

26 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

MOSCOW- President Vladimir Putin revealed Tuesday that **Edward Snowden** was indeed here but would not be handed over, confirming Russia's willingness to confound the United States but offering few clues to the secret-spiller's mysterious journey.

Snowden, the former National Security Agency contractor charged with exposing clandestine U.S. surveillance programs, had arrived unexpectedly, Putin said, and was sorting out his next move within the transit zone of Sheremetyevo International Airport, just shy of the Russian border.

Since Snowden's arrival here from Hong Kong on Sunday, the United States and Russia have danced around each other like two boxers sparring in the ring, neither seeking a knockout but eager to take a few swings - Russia had no legal grounds to help, Putin insisted. They have a tense relationship that both sides find exasperating but neither wants to destroy.

It appears likely that the dispute over Snowden, which has engendered sharp rhetoric, will fall short of serious confrontation, according to Russia watchers who say neither side wants to permanently jeopardize the ability to talk over the issues that dominate their relationship - Iran, Afghanistan and even Syria.

The dynamics of the relationship stood in sharp relief as Putin discussed Snowden with reporters at a news conference in Finland. First he said that Snowden was a free man who was welcome to go on his way, ignoring the ardent U.S. desire for his return. But he also suggested that was hardly a reason to cause a dispute among friends.

"I hope this won't affect the businesslike nature of our relations with the United States," Putin said. "I hope our partners will understand this."

Secretary of State John F. Kerry has said repeatedly over the past few days that Russia was defying international convention by allowing an American fugitive to remain unhindered in a transit zone at the airport.

"There are standards of behavior between sovereign nations," said Kerry, who is traveling in Saudi Arabia. "There is common law. There is respect for rule of law."

"We are not looking for a confrontation," he said. "We are not ordering anything. We are simply requesting."

While the two sides were fighting over Snowden, their representatives were meeting in Geneva, trying to hammer out a deal for a conference on Syria. Kerry and Foreign Minister Sergei Lavrov meet next week in Brunei.

When Putin says the Snowden affair won't affect relations, he probably believes it, said Angela Stent, director of the Center for Eurasian, Russian and East European Studies at Georgetown University. Stent, who has a book on U.S.-Russian relations coming out soon, said Russia tends to compartmentalize its dealings with the United States, which tends to see linkages between issues.

"From Washington's point of view, we want to be able to work with the Russians on Syria, if this conference ever comes to pass," as well as Afghanistan, Iran and other issues, said Stent, who is on a visit to Russia. "We don't want other extraneous issues to intrude."

Of course, Russia is trying to extract maximum advantage and mount some of the "moral high ground" it often accuses the United States of considering its divine right, said Fiona Hill of the Brookings Institution. Putin, who detests the U.S. support for human rights groups in his country and accuses it of financing opposition, alluded to Snowden as an activist who hardly deserved jail.

"Ask yourself: Should such people be extradited to be jailed or not?" Putin said. "In any case, I would prefer not to deal with such issues, because this is just the same as shaving a piglet - too much noise but too little hair."

Russia says that it can't turn Snowden over, because he is in the airport transit zone, meaning he has not officially crossed the border.

The transit zone at Sheremetyevo, a melange of VIP waiting rooms, short-term hotel rooms, hard benches for people without proper papers awaiting deportation and the odd Federal Security Service interrogation suite, has taken on nearly mythical proportions as the world imagines Snowden there, detoured on his way to possible asylum in Ecuador. Passengers there are under careful scrutiny and subject to arrest as they would be anywhere else, but Russian officials have suggested that the transit zone is outside their control. That, Hill said, enables Russia to portray itself as a bystander. (Courts, including the European Court of Human Rights, say such transit zones do not lie outside a nation's laws.)

"As a transit passenger," Putin said Tuesday, "he has the right to buy a ticket and fly wherever he wants."

Putin said Russia has no grounds to extradite Snowden, because the two countries have no extradition treaty - a jab at the United States, which has resisted Russia's requests for one.

According to Glenn Greenwald, the Guardian newspaper columnist who has written a series of stories based on material provided by the former NSA contractor, Snowden has created encrypted versions of the classified files he obtained and given them to a number of associates. Those people would be given instructions on how to access the files under an unspecified set of circumstances.

Greenwald told the Daily Beast that Snowden "took extreme precautions to make sure many different people around the world have these archives to ensure the stories will inevitably be published."

James Collins, a former U.S. ambassador to Russia who is now at the Carnegie Endowment, said the Snowden contretemps, while harmful, is unlikely to shape the relationship.

"These things come up, and they get more or less gravity depending on how they're played," but they rarely have long-lasting consequences, Collins said. He suspected the Russians were eager to see the end of the episode.

"They find themselves now where the Chinese were a few days ago and are trying to figure out just how to manage this," he said.

China and Hong Kong also asserted strict legality in allowing Snowden to leave Hong Kong on Sunday, despite U.S. assertions to the contrary.

"The accusations against the Chinese government are groundless," said Ministry of Foreign Affairs spokesperson Hua Chunying. "We hope the United States can work with China [to] . . . strengthen dialogue and cooperation . . . and continuously promote new development of U.S.-China relations."

Amid all the rhetoric, Collins said, it was apparent Snowden has caused "serious damage" by alerting the "bad guys" of the world that they need to be more careful. "And that's not good for the Russians or anyone else who's a victim of terrorist activity."

For now, Russia and Putin were relishing a round they clearly thought they had won.

"Thank God, Mr. Snowden has not committed any crimes on the Russian Federation territory," Putin said Tuesday.

## In NSA leak, foes of U.S. see a chance to return i-fire

Colum Lynch

1080 words

26 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

It may be years before the full cost of **Edward Snowden's** intelligence leaks can be measured. But his disclosures about top-secret surveillance programs have already come at a price for the U.S. government: America's foes have been handed an immensely powerful tool for portraying Washington as a hypocritical proponent of democratic values that it doesn't abide by at home.

As Snowden continues his extraordinary flight from U.S. authorities, hopscoching the globe with the acquiescence of other governments, Washington's critics have savored the irony of the world's human rights champion being tripped up by revelations about its monitoring of phone and Internet communications.

Meanwhile, China, Russia, Cuba, and Ecuador - countries with dismal human rights records - have cast themselves as the champions of political freedom.

Russian President Vladimir Putin, confirming Tuesday that Snowden was holed up inside a secure transit zone at the airport in Moscow, said Russian authorities saw no reason to extradite him. He also jabbed at the U.S. treatment of the former NSA contractor and his new benefactor, WikiLeaks co-founder Julian Assange.

"Assange and Snowden consider themselves human rights activists and say they are fighting for the spread of information," Putin said. "Ask yourself: Should such people be extradited to be jailed or not?"

U.S. officials have rejected characterizations of Snowden as a whistleblower, while defending the NSA's surveillance programs as critical to protecting national security interests. They have also pointed out the irony in Snowden's decision to evade arrest by traveling to Hong Kong, a Chinese territory, as well as Russia - "powerful bastions of Internet freedom," Secretary of State John F. Kerry quipped recently.

On Tuesday, Kerry struck a more diplomatic note, saying during a stopover in Saudi Arabia that although "we are not looking for a confrontation" with Russia, the Obama administration "would hope that as a nation, as a sovereign nation, Russia would not see its interests in siding with a person who is accused of breaking the law in another nation and who is a fugitive from justice according to international standards of law."

For many of the countries that have long bristled under Washington's criticism of their policies, disclosure of details of the NSA's electronic monitoring has been a golden opportunity to return the favor.

In the aftermath of revelations by The Washington Post and Britain's Guardian newspaper, the state-controlled China Daily published a cartoon of the Statue of Liberty, her shadow in the form of a hooded spook hoisting a recording mike in one hand and a tape recorder in the other.

"The United States, which has long been trying to play innocent as a victim of cyber-attacks, has turned out to be the biggest villain in our age," the state Xinhua News Agency wrote in a commentary.

In Latin America, the Snowden affair has been a political coup for America's fiercest critics, including Venezuela, Cuba and Ecuador, where the contractor was said to have explored the possibility of asylum. Ecuadoran President Rafael Correa, who has been criticized for silencing journalists, has taken up

Snowden's cause. His foreign minister, Ricardo Patiño, said Snowden's asylum request "has to do with freedom of expression and the security of citizens around the world."

"Ecuador puts its principles above its economic interests," he told reporters during a stop-off this week in Hanoi. "We take care of the human rights of the people."

The Chinese and Russian governments have been more measured in their public comments. But they have been no less testy in their responses to American allegations that they had abetted Snowden's flight.

"We consider the allegations that Russia violated U.S. laws and all but colluded with Snowden to be absolutely groundless," Russian Foreign Minister Sergei Lavrov said Tuesday on Twitter. "We have nothing to do with Mr. Snowden or his movements around the world. He chose his route himself."

In failing to act on the Obama administration's extradition request, Hong Kong's government turned the table on Washington, saying that it had officially sought "clarification" from the United States about reports of its hacking of computer systems in Hong Kong. **It said it would follow up on the matter "to protect the legal rights of the people of Hong Kong."**

The international scrutiny stirred up by the disclosures has been reminiscent of the fallout from the leaking of hundreds of thousands of diplomatic cables by WikiLeaks in 2010.

**Kristinn Hrafnsson, a spokesman for WikiLeaks, which is helping Snowden in his bid for asylum, said the spying revelations have begun to turn international opinion against the United States.**

"Other countries are starting to examine how these programs touched them," he said. "Everyone is focusing on China and Russia right now, but I would not rule out that other countries in the world, even in Western Europe, would be favorable to Mr. Snowden right now. **There has to be at some point an acknowledgment that U.S. laws are not international laws and not everyone has to obey them.**

"What is being revealed now in these overgrown tactics and bullying is quite interesting, and it is being observed by countries all over the world," he added. "They are seeing an unwillingness by the United States to deal with the real issue at hand, the need to investigate and explore and critically examine the information that was revealed by Mr. Snowden and to examine evidence about whether Congress was lied to or misled."

The revelations have also unnerved some U.S. allies. In Germany, where memories of domestic surveillance by East Germany's Stasi state remain fresh, reaction has been mixed.

German Justice Minister Sabine Leutheusser-Schnarrenberger has not pulled any punches. "America has been a different country since the horrible terrorist attacks of Sept. 11, 2001," she wrote in Der Spiegel Online. "The relationship between freedom and security has shifted, to the detriment of freedom."

German Chancellor Angela Merkel was among the first foreign leaders to criticize the Obama administration's surveillance program. But her remarks have been more tempered in the ensuing days, in part, according to some observers, because Germany benefits from electronic snooping by the United States.

## NSA head says surveillance fact sheet was flawed

Greg Miller Ellen Nakashima

521 words

26 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A04

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

National Security Agency Director Gen. Keith B. Alexander acknowledged Tuesday that a fact sheet on the agency's Web site inaccurately described the extent to which the communications of U.S. citizens are protected from the spy agency's collection of e-mail and other material from technology companies.

The agency removed the four-page document Tuesday after lawmakers raised concerns about its accuracy.

In a letter to Sens. Ron Wyden (D-Ore.) and Mark Udall (D-Colo.), Alexander said he agreed that the fact sheet posted on the NSA Web site last week "could have more precisely described" the requirements governing the collection of e-mail and other Internet content from U.S. companies.

NSA spokeswoman Judith Emmel would not explicitly acknowledge that the fact sheet had been removed from the agency's Web site. Instead, she referred to the text of a 2008 law that governs NSA surveillance programs.

"Given the intense interest from the media, the public, and Congress, we believe the precision of the source document (the statute) is the best possible representation of applicable authorities," Emmel said in a prepared statement sent by e-mail to The Washington Post.

The withdrawal of the fact sheet underscores the difficulties the Obama administration has faced in its efforts to reassure the public about surveillance programs that have swept up data on millions of Americans and that operate under legal guidelines that are both classified and complex.

The NSA fact sheet outlined restrictions on a surveillance system known as PRISM, through which the agency has secretly gathered e-mail and other sensitive online material from technology companies including Microsoft, Google, Apple and Facebook.

The program, first described in documents leaked by former NSA contractor **Edward Snowden**, is supposed to target only "foreign persons" located outside the United States. But Wyden and Udall sent a letter last week to Alexander questioning some of the agency's claims.

The fact sheet "portrays protections for Americans' privacy as being significantly stronger than they are," the letter said. It also said that the document's description of "minimization" procedures designed to protect Americans against privacy intrusions were "somewhat misleading."

The senators did not elaborate on their objections or specify which statements they believed overstated privacy protections.

The fact sheet asserted broadly that the program "allows only the targeting . . . of communications of foreign persons who are located abroad." In his reply letter, Alexander acknowledged that the law allows for "the targeting of persons reasonably believed to be located outside the United States." That language leaves a fair amount of discretion to analysts to determine whether a person is overseas.



The exchange over the document is the latest instance in which senior lawmakers have challenged U.S. intelligence officials over their characterizations of the NSA programs.

This month, Director of National Intelligence James R. Clapper Jr. acknowledged that he had given what he called the "least most untruthful" response when he testified in March that the NSA does not collect data on millions of Americans.

## In 2009, Snowden denounced leakers

Peter Finn Julie Tate

1544 words

27 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

When he was working in the intelligence community in 2009, **Edward Snowden**, the National Security Agency contractor who passed top-secret documents to journalists, appears to have had nothing but disdain for those who leaked classified information, the newspapers that printed their revelations, and his current ally, the anti-secrecy group WikiLeaks, according to newly disclosed chat logs.

Snowden, who used the online handle "TheTrueHOOHA," was particularly upset about a January 2009 New York Times article that reported on a covert program to subvert Iran's nuclear infrastructure, according to the logs, which were published Wednesday by Ars Technica, a technology news Web site.

"They're reporting classified [expletive]," Snowden wrote. "You don't put that [expletive] in the NEWSPAPER."

At the time of the posting, in January 2009, Snowden was 25 years old and stationed in Geneva by the CIA.

"Are they TRYING to start a war?" he asked of the New York Times. "Jesus christ they're like wikileaks."

Snowden's libertarian and dogmatic online persona adds to the emerging portrait of a shape-shifting young man whose motivations and decision-making remain in flux.

When he burst into public view in the second week of June, Snowden cast himself as a lonely crusader reconciled to capture and prison but determined to use what freedom he had left to expose what he said were omniscient U.S. surveillance powers that threatened individual privacy.

"I have no intention of hiding who I am because I know I have done nothing wrong," Snowden told Britain's Guardian newspaper in a report that was published June 9 and revealed that he was in Hong Kong.

Two weeks later, the former NSA contractor is on the lam, presumed to be at a transit zone at a Moscow airport and forced to depend on a government the likes of which he had earlier seemed eager to avoid.

Although Snowden seems to have started out with a carefully considered plan to steal highly classified material and abscond to Hong Kong, he has since undertaken unscripted dodges to keep U.S. investigators at bay.

He has formed an unsurprising but impromptu alliance with WikiLeaks, gambled on Hong Kong's desire to be rid of him as well as on the Kremlin's benevolence, and turned for asylum to Ecuador.

The maneuvers have left the 30-year-old open to charges that the idealism he first professed has given way to self-preservation.

Critical parts of Snowden's biography remain opaque, particularly his entry into the intelligence community without even a high school diploma. He somehow made the jump from security guard at the federally funded University of Maryland Center for Advanced Study of Language, which conducts classified and unclassified research, to CIA recruit in 2007.

The CIA assigned him to Switzerland, and in his commentary on his first taste of life abroad, he complained about bad hamburgers and intermissions in movies.

"God I hate metric," wrote Snowden on #arsifical, a channel on Ars Technica's public Internet Relay Chat (IRC) server. "Why can't they use real numbers over here?"

Editors at Ars Technica said chats on #arsifical are not archived, but they obtained the logs involving Snowden from multiple, independent sources. The Washington Post reported this month that Snowden used the handle TheTrueHOOHA. Elements of TheTrueHOOHA's biography and personal views correspond with Snowden's.

Snowden's postings offer some glimpses into his political opinions. He admired Rep. Ron Paul - calling him "dreamy" - supported Second Amendment rights and considered Social Security a crutch that should be eliminated. He called those who disagreed with him "retards."

In the run-up to the 2008 election, he described President Obama's opponent, Sen. John McCain, as an "excellent leader" and "a guy with real values." Speaking of Obama, he said that "we need an idealist first and foremost."

He dismissed Hillary Rodham Clinton, Obama's opponent in the Democratic primaries, as "a pox on the country."

Snowden wondered how the anonymous sources for the New York Times article could have disclosed classified information. "Those people should be shot in the balls," he wrote.

There was only the faintest hint that Snowden was becoming disillusioned with the U.S. surveillance programs he would later reveal. "WE LOVE THAT TECHNOLOGY [EXPLETIVE]," he wrote in March 2009. "HELPS US SPY ON OUR CITIZENS BETTER."

Indeed, as he told the Guardian in a videotaped interview this month, his disillusionment with his work as a systems analyst in the U.S intelligence community was gradual. "Over time that awareness of wrongdoing sort of builds up and you feel compelled to talk about," he said. "And the more you talk about, the more you're ignored, the more you're told it's not a problem, until eventually you realize that these things need to be determined by the public and not by somebody who was simply hired by the government."

In 2009, Snowden left the CIA to work for a private contractor and was based at an NSA facility in Japan. Three years later, he moved to Hawaii, where he again worked at an NSA facility.

In January, Snowden, without identifying himself, contacted the documentarian Laura Poitras, who has covered surveillance and counterterrorism issues, and told her that he wanted to get her encryption key and use a secure channel to communicate. In February, he also contacted Guardian columnist Glenn Greenwald. Poitras also spoke to reporter Barton Gellman about some of the correspondence she had with Snowden, according to an interview she gave to Salon, the news Web site.

In March, Snowden took a position with the contractor Booz Allen Hamilton, apparently to maximize his access to classified material at the NSA.

"My position with Booz Allen Hamilton granted me access to lists of machines all over the world the NSA hacked," Snowden told the South China Morning Post in an interview in Hong Kong this month. "That is why I accepted that position about three months ago."

On May 20, after telling his supervisor that he needed treatment for epilepsy, Snowden flew into Hong Kong carrying four laptops. He met with Guardian journalists there on June 1. The first Guardian article based on NSA documents appeared June 5, followed the next day by articles in The Washington Post and the Guardian on another surveillance program.

Snowden said he chose the semiautonomous Chinese territory because it had the "cultural and legal framework to allow me to work without being immediately detained." He stressed in interviews that he had no interest in aiding foreign powers.

"Anyone in the positions of access with the technical capabilities that I had could suck out secrets, pass them on the open market to Russia; they always have an open door as we do," he told the Guardian.

Snowden's supporters in WikiLeaks have said that neither Chinese nor Russian intelligence officials have debriefed the American and that agents from those countries have not had access to his computers.

President Vladimir Putin also said Tuesday that staffers of the FSB, the Russian security service, "didn't work and aren't working" with Snowden. Former U.S. intelligence officials have questioned whether Russia would not take the opportunity to obtain NSA documents that could include material affecting its interests.

Once he was out in the open, Snowden was no longer in control of his fate. His original plan was to show up in Hong Kong and have a "free" and "simple" life there, according to one of his attorneys, Albert Ho. At a meeting in Hong Kong more than a week ago, his attorneys laid out the charges he could face, the likelihood of detention in Hong Kong and an extradition proceeding that could lead to his return to the United States, where he could face life in prison if convicted.

Snowden, who said he expected the United States to seek his arrest, selectively leaked documents after arriving in Hong Kong that would be of interest to China - an attempt by Snowden, Greenwald has said, to ingratiate himself with possible benefactors.

He showed the South China Morning Post records about U.S. hacking in China; the Guardian later reported that the communications of then-Russian President Dmitry Medvedev were tapped by an NSA facility in England during a Group of 20 summit in London in 2009.

While in Hong Kong, Snowden made contact with activists from WikiLeaks. The group has said little about its role, except that it helped Snowden obtain temporary travel papers and that one of its top advisers, Sarah Harrison, accompanied him to Moscow.

"In the end, it was Mr. Snowden who took the decision on his own fate, based on the information that he had," said Kristinn Hrafnsson, a spokesman for WikiLeaks. "I cannot go into details about the back-and-forth between Mr. Snowden and his legal team."

Snowden had earlier told the Guardian that "my predisposition is to seek asylum in a country with shared values. The nation that most encompasses this is Iceland. They stood up for people over Internet freedom."

## Diplomacy applied late in the game

Philip Rucker Sari Horwitz

1468 words

28 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

For the first 12 days, the Obama administration's effort to extradite government leaker **Edward Snowden** from Hong Kong was a by-the-book legal affair - overseen by the Justice Department and involving few if any diplomatic overtures, according to senior administration officials.

That legalistic approach has resulted in a political and public relations debacle. By the time U.S. officials had begun applying diplomatic pressure on Hong Kong and Chinese authorities last weekend, it was too late: Snowden had boarded a flight to Moscow in search of asylum.

The missteps have thrust the United States into a geopolitical confrontation that has embarrassed the Obama administration and strained relations with China, Russia and other countries.

President Obama on Thursday defended the handling of the international chase for the former government contractor, calling it a legal matter and saying he was "not going to be scrambling jets to get a 29-year-old hacker." Asked whether he had personally called Chinese President Xi Jinping or Russian President Vladimir Putin about Snowden, Obama said he had not.

"I shouldn't have to," Obama added at a news conference in Senegal. "I'm not going to have one case of a suspect who we're trying to extradite suddenly being elevated to the point where I've got to start doing wheeling and dealing and trading on a whole host of other issues simply to get a guy extradited."

But many experts in extradition law argue that that is precisely what's needed in the case. They said the Obama administration underestimated how much diplomatic finesse and creativity would be required to detain Snowden, allowing him to move further outside the reach of the U.S. government.

"The administration followed the playbook and played it correctly, except what they didn't seem to anticipate is that Hong Kong would not comply," said Jacques Semmelman, a former federal prosecutor and expert on extradition procedure.

Stephen I. Vladeck, an associate dean at American University's Washington College of Law who studies national security law, said the administration made mistakes by just going "through the motions."

"It should have been clear from the get-go that the government was going to need more than just a prima facie case for extradition here, but also the political and diplomatic cooperation of the Hong Kong - and, perhaps, Chinese - authorities," Vladeck said.

P.J. Crowley, a former State Department spokesman under Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton, said extradition requests as high-profile as Snowden's should not be seen "through a legal lens."

"This is about politics and about perceived and competing interests on all sides," Crowley said. He added: "When it becomes public, then it becomes a diplomatic issue. And when it becomes personal, it becomes a political issue."

To be sure, the full extent of the Obama administration's diplomatic entreaties to Hong Kong and Beijing might not be known publicly. Considering the profile of Snowden's case, experts said they would be surprised if there had not been secret high-level diplomatic talks between U.S. officials and authorities in Hong Kong and Beijing.

"They don't like to make this public," said Leslie H. Gelb, president emeritus of the Council on Foreign Relations. "They'd rather do it by the books, because if China and Russia reject us, it's better to reject the Justice Department than the White House."

Still, the Obama administration's public accounts thus far show that it pursued Snowden's extradition from Hong Kong primarily through legal channels. When Obama was asked about Snowden on Monday, he referred reporters to the Justice Department.

After Snowden revealed himself June 9 as the leaker of classified documents revealing National Security Agency surveillance programs, administration officials said they followed interagency protocols in trying to return Snowden to the United States to stand trial.

The White House's National Security Council has coordinated the broad response to the Snowden case but let officials at the Justice Department - lawyers, not diplomats - take the lead on the extradition process and make their own decisions, according to a senior administration official. The official, like others interviewed, spoke on the condition of anonymity to discuss details of the government's response.

Although the Justice Department followed protocol laid out in its extradition treaty with Hong Kong, there were also some low-level communications between U.S. consulate officials and the Hong Kong and Chinese governments, administration officials said.

On June 14, the United States filed criminal charges against Snowden in federal court, but they took a gamble by sealing the charges - which meant they could not use them as cause to revoke his passport. U.S. officials said they feared Snowden might flee if he found out about the charges, and they wanted time to work out the provisional arrest request with Hong Kong.

Extradition is generally a lengthy process, but Justice Department officials believed it was advancing at a rapid pace with Snowden. "It was an unbelievably quick turnaround," one law enforcement official said.

On June 19, Attorney General Eric H. Holder Jr. called his counterpart in Hong Kong, Secretary for Justice Rimsky Yuen, to personally underscore the importance of arresting Snowden. At the White House, where national security aides kept Obama up to speed with regular briefings, officials said they believed Justice lawyers were close to an agreement.

But on the night of June 21 - after the Justice Department had unsealed Snowden's criminal charges - U.S. officials realized they had hit a snag, according to a senior administration official. That's when Hong Kong authorities raised questions about the U.S. charges against Snowden and sought clarification about paperwork, the official said.

As U.S. officials were preparing a response letter and fired off their first strongly worded public statement warning Hong Kong of complicating relations with the United States, they learned that Snowden was on an Aeroflot flight bound for Moscow, the senior administration official said.

"It wasn't necessarily clear that someone other than the Department of Justice and the interagency process we already had was going to be needed," the official said.

In the final hours before Snowden departed, the State Department stepped up its involvement. On Saturday, State revoked his passport, according to a senior State Department official. A passport cannot be

revoked in a criminal matter until the charges are made public, which had just been done the night before, the official said.

Hong Kong authorities said they did not receive the official U.S. notice until Wednesday. But State Department spokesman Patrick Ventrell said they "were well aware of our interest in Mr. Snowden and had plenty of time to prohibit his travel."

Yuen, the Hong Kong justice minister, said this week that his country allowed Snowden to travel because of alleged mistakes by the United States in making the extradition request. Yuen said in an interview with the South China Morning Post that the name used in U.S. diplomatic documents was Edward James Snowden, while the Justice Department referred to him as Edward J. Snowden and Hong Kong's Immigration Department had him recorded as Edward Joseph Snowden.

Yuen also said the United States failed to provide adequate evidence or explain how two of the three charges in its arrest request fell within the scope of the extradition treaty signed by both nations in 1996.

U.S. officials insisted that they followed procedure and said Hong Kong's concerns amounted to a stalling tactic. One U.S. official close to the discussions said Hong Kong's claim that it could not properly identify Snowden because of inconsistencies in his middle name was "laughable," noting that his videotaped confession was being replayed "all over the news."

Justice officials said that if Hong Kong authorities really wanted the issue clarified, they would have waited for U.S. officials to provide answers before allowing Snowden to leave the country.

Experts said that Hong Kong authorities seized on procedural irregularities, fairly or not, to delay the U.S. request long enough to allow Snowden to flee to Russia.

"It's really hard to play Monday-morning quarterback in a case like this," Vladeck said, "because there's no guarantee that Hong Kong would have cooperated - even if all the i's had been dotted and t's crossed."

As for Snowden, all evidence suggests he remains ensconced in the transit area at Moscow's Sheremetyevo Airport. On Thursday, another daily Aeroflot flight to Havana closed its doors without any sign that the American fugitive was on board.

## Ecuador pulls out of trade deal with U.S.

Juan Forero

479 words

28 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

BOGOTA, Colombia - The leftist government of Ecuador, under pressure from the Obama administration for considering a request for sanctuary from the American intelligence leaker **Edward Snowden**, announced Thursday that it will back out of a preferential trade pact with the United States that top Ecuadoran officials say is being used to blackmail their country.

The move, which President Rafael Correa's government described as unilateral, came a day after the chairman of the Senate Foreign Relations Committee pledged to do all he could to block trade benefits for Ecuador should it grant Snowden political asylum.

"Our government will not reward countries for bad behavior," Sen. Robert Menendez (D-N.J.) said in a statement Wednesday. "Trade preferences are a privilege granted to nations, not a right."

Snowden, the former National Security Agency contractor who is presumed to be in Moscow, has asked for asylum in Ecuador. While the government has made no decision in response to the request, Foreign Minister Ricardo Patiño voiced sympathy for the 30-year-old fugitive in lengthy comments Monday.

At a news conference Thursday, Minister of Communications Fernando Alvarado pushed back at perceived efforts to influence Ecuador's decision. It "doesn't accept pressure or threats from anybody, and it doesn't trade its principles or give them up for commercial interests, no matter how important," the Quito-based newspaper El Comercio quoted him as saying.

Alvarado said his country "unilaterally and irrevocably renounces those trade preferences" and defiantly quipped that Ecuador would provide \$23 million to the Obama administration for human rights training.

Later in the day, Correa said that Snowden would have to make it to Ecuador or get inside one of its embassies to have his bid for asylum processed. Snowden "is not in Ecuadorian territory so, technically, we cannot process his request," the president said.

The Andean Trade Promotion and Drug Eradication Act has allowed Ecuadoran exporters of flowers, tuna, artichokes and many other products to ship tariff-free to the United States.

"The preferences were authorized for Andean countries as compensation for the fight against drugs but soon became a new instrument of pressure," Alvarado said.

The pact was designed to help generate jobs in countries involved in the drug trade; although Ecuador does not produce cocaine, it is an important drug conduit and is vulnerable to organized crime groups because of its weak institutions, according to State Department counternarcotics officials.

Within Congress, the decision to pull out of the pact may have been eased by long-standing opposition to it, which had been growing even before Snowden's asylum request. Lawmakers have been sharply critical of Correa for his country's ties to Iran and for having given sanctuary to WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange in Ecuador's London embassy.

## Security clearances questioned

Tom Hamburger Zachary A. Goldfarb

887 words

28 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Federal investigators have told lawmakers they have evidence that USIS, the contractor that screened **Edward Snowden** for his top-secret clearance, repeatedly misled the government about the thoroughness of its background checks, according to people familiar with the matter.

The alleged transgressions are so serious that a federal watchdog indicated he plans to recommend that the Office of Personnel Management, which oversees most background checks, end ties with USIS unless it can show it is performing responsibly, the people said.

Cutting off USIS could present a major logistical quagmire for the nation's already-jammed security clearance process. The federal government relies heavily on contractors to approve workers for some of its most sensitive jobs in defense and intelligence. Falls Church-based USIS is the largest single private provider for government background checks.

The inspector general of OPM, working with the Justice Department, is examining whether USIS failed to meet a contractual obligation that it would conduct reviews of all background checks the company performed on behalf of government agencies, the people familiar with the matter said, speaking on the condition of anonymity because the investigation has not yet been resolved.

After conducting an initial background check of a candidate for employment, USIS was required to perform a second review to make sure no important details had been missed. From 2008 through 2011, USIS allegedly skipped this second review in up to 50 percent of the cases. But it conveyed to federal officials that these reviews had, in fact, been performed.

The shortcut made it appear that USIS was more efficient than it actually was and may have triggered incentive awards for the company, the people briefed on the matter said. Investigators, who have briefed lawmakers on the allegations, think the strategy may have originated with senior executives, the people said.

Ray Howell, director of corporate communications at USIS, declined to comment on Thursday.

In a statement last week, USIS said it received a subpoena from the inspector general of OPM in January 2012. "USIS complied with that subpoena and has cooperated fully with the government's civil investigative efforts," the statement said. The company would not comment on the Snowden case.

It is not known whether USIS did anything improper on its 2011 background check of Snowden, the 30-year-old who leaked documents about the inner workings of the NSA and is now the subject of a global drama. He gained access to those documents after he was cleared to work at NSA contractor Booz Allen Hamilton.

Last week, Patrick E. McFarland, the inspector general of OPM, said he has concerns about Snowden's background check. "We do believe that there may be some problems," he said.

The broader concerns about background checks are not limited to USIS. McFarland's office has 47 open investigations into alleged wrongdoing by individuals in the background checks industry, according to a statement from the inspector general's office. Separately, since 2006, the watchdog has won convictions in 18 cases in which employees claimed to have verified information that ultimately turned out to be false or not even checked.

"There is an alarmingly insufficient level of oversight of the federal investigative-services program," McFarland said last week in congressional testimony. "A lack of independent verification of the organization that conducts these important background investigations is a clear threat to national security."



McFarland's office declined to comment on the details of the investigation. "We have never indicated whether the case was criminal, civil, or administrative," a statement from the office said.

Last week, Sen. Claire McCaskill (D-Mo.) said USIS is the subject of a criminal probe as a result of a "systematic failure" to conduct background checks. She did not elaborate. A spokesperson said Thursday that the senator stands by her statement.

Sen. Jon Tester (D-Mont.), who chairs a Homeland Security subcommittee, said he plans to introduce legislation within two weeks to increase oversight of the security clearance process, including giving inspectors general more power to audit funding and other aspects of the massive effort to provide 4.9 million Americans with authorized access to classified and other sensitive government information.

"I cannot believe that this is handled in such a shoddy and cavalier manner," Tester said in an interview Thursday. "I personally believe that if you are under criminal investigation, you should be suspended from the process until it is resolved."

Tester added: "We have spent hundreds of billions in this country trying to keep classified information classified and to keep people from outside coming in. And what we see here is that we have a problem from the inside."

USIS, which was spun off from the federal government in the 1990s, has become the dominant player in the background checks business. It does about 45 percent of all background checks for OPM, according to congressional staffers. USIS has 7,000 employees.

USIS has been under financial pressure in recent years because of federal cutbacks and less generous contracts from the government, according to financial analysts working at Moody's and Standard & Poor's. The firm's parent company, Altegrity, is owned by Providence Equity Partners, a private equity firm. USIS has two main competitors, KeyPoint Government Solutions and CACI.

## Surveillance aided 54 cases, NSA says

Peter Finn

463 words

28 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Gen. Keith B. Alexander, the director of the National Security Agency, provided new details Thursday about the extent to which the government believes its sweeping surveillance powers have led to the disruption of terrorist plots or the arrest of suspects.

Speaking at a conference in Baltimore, Alexander said that because of the surveillance programs, 42 terrorist plots were disrupted and 12 individuals were identified as having provided material support to terrorist groups. Of the 54 cases he referred to, Alexander said only 13 had a "homeland nexus" and the rest involved cases overseas. Alexander said 25 occurred in Europe, 11 in Asia and five in Africa.

Alexander said both the NSA's ability to collect the communications of foreign targets overseas using U.S. Internet firms and the collection of Americans' phone records had contributed separately to counterterrorism efforts.

"With these exceptional authorities came equally exceptional oversight by all three branches of the government," said Alexander.

In the case of the collection of metadata on Americans' phone use, Alexander said it is kept in "a virtual lockbox" which the NSA can access only if "we have reasonable, articulable suspicion."

The United States has described a small number of domestic cases in which NSA powers authorized by the USA Patriot Act and its amendments have led to arrests, including a plan to conduct suicide bombings in the New York subway system. But there has been no information on any foreign plot, and the details of those cases remain classified.

German Chancellor Angela Merkel said that "tips from American sources" had foiled a 2007 plot to attack U.S. troops and citizens in Germany. Four Islamist extremists were convicted of terrorism charges, including planning a massive car bombing near a U.S. Air Force base in Germany.

"Our allies have benefited," Alexander said Thursday. He bemoaned leaks about the programs by a former NSA contractor, **Edward Snowden**, who turned over highly classified NSA documents to The Washington Post and the British newspaper the Guardian.

"What is going on in these leaks is unconscionable in my opinion," he said. "It hurts our nation and our allies, and it's flat wrong."

Two Democratic senators, Ron Wyden of Oregon and Mark Udall of Colorado, have questioned whether the collection of tens of millions of domestic calling records has helped thwart plots.

"It appears that the bulk phone records collection program under section 215 of the USA Patriot Act played little or no role in most of these disruptions," the senators said in a statement. They did note that targeting foreign communications under Section 702 of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act was useful but that conflating these programs as one effort was misleading.

## NSA collected data with private sector after 9/11

Robert O'Harrow Jr. Ellen Nakashima

1316 words

28 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A06

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

In the days after the Sept. 11, 2001, terror attacks, American telephone companies offered the National Security Agency access to domestic calling records and their own analysis of calling patterns, a top-secret document shows.

At first, the NSA could not accept the help because it did not have the legal authority to collect data domestically. That changed on Oct. 4, when President George W. Bush gave his approval for what became known in classified circles as the President's Surveillance Program, or PSP.

The NSA immediately began cultivating an array of "private sector partners," including telephone companies, Internet service providers and Web services, according to a top-secret report by the NSA inspector general's office obtained by The Washington Post.

"Private sector partners began to send telephony and Internet content to NSA in October 2001. They began to send telephony and Internet metadata to NSA as early as November 2001," the IG report said.

The 57-page document, a working draft dated March 24, 2009, offers a short history of one of the most sweeping domestic surveillance efforts in American history. It was first posted by the Guardian newspaper in England.

The document contains new information about how the decade-long program came to be, including details about legal matters, funding and the fact that 60 lawmakers were briefed about it. The report also contains much that has already been disclosed by The Post and the Guardian, based on documents leaked by former NSA contractor **Edward Snowden**.

It depicts a program fashioned virtually from scratch in a time of crisis, by a handful of individuals, including Gen. Michael Hayden, the head of the NSA and Vice President Dick Cheney. Given the code name "Stellar Wind," the PSP was a set of four surveillance programs that brought Americans and U.S. territory within the domain of the NSA for the first time in decades. The PSP, which initially operated outside the restrictions of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, was eventually put under full FISA court control by 2007.

The report also offers new fodder for critics of domestic spying about the proper limits on domestic intelligence. In recent interviews with The Post, some former senior NSA officials said they had misgivings at the time.

"It was not something that I felt we needed to do or should do," said one former NSA official who spoke on the condition of anonymity in order to discuss top-secret matters. "I thought there was a way to do it, which was to put this under FBI control, using FBI authorities, and just let the FBI use our [NSA] tools. I was just thinking, what kind of precedent does this set?"

The NSA inspector general's office issued the classified report under a mandate from the FISA Amendments Act of 2008. The report also shows that NSA officials believed that there were no constitutional limits on the collection of digital metadata, including such details as the origin, destination and timing of calls and e-mails.

More significantly, the inspector general's report underscores the NSA's fundamental reliance on private-sector companies.

"According to General [Keith B.] Alexander, General Hayden's replacement as Director of NSA/CSS, if the relationships with these companies were ever terminated, the U.S. SIGINT system would be irrevocably damaged, because NSA would have sacrificed America's home field advantage as the primary hub for worldwide telecommunications," the report said.

Hayden, now a security consultant, was out of the country and unavailable for comment.

The four programs under the PSP involved the collection of Internet and telephone metadata and content. The Internet metadata program "was terminated in 2011 because it didn't have the operational impact that we needed," Alexander said Thursday while speaking at a cyber conference in Baltimore. Alexander said that the administration and Congress supported the shutdown and the "data was purged."

Greg Nojeim, senior counsel and civil liberties specialist at the Center for Democracy and Technology (CDT), said such a program was not supposed to happen under FISA.

"The document shows that the president authorized, and the NSA conducted, the very electronic surveillance that Congress enacted FISA to preclude," Nojeim said. "No court orders. No finding of probable cause. In fact, the FISA court doesn't even get briefed about it until four months later. Due process under this program at inception was just a handshake between the head of the NSA and the vice president's counsel."

The program was born at a time when the nation was experiencing its most acute security crisis since the Pearl Harbor attacks 60 years earlier. In the hours after Sept. 11, 2001, the NSA scrambled to determine how to use its surveillance tools within a legal framework that tightly proscribed domestic intelligence collection.

"General Hayden was operating in a unique environment in which it was a widely held belief that additional attacks on U.S. soil were imminent," the report said.

NSA officials found "collection gaps" that left the country vulnerable. "NSA believed that the FISA process was unable to accommodate the number of terrorist targets or the speed with which they changed their communication," the report said, adding that the average wait for FISA approval was four to six weeks.

Three days after the attacks, Hayden approved the targeting of terrorist-associated foreign telephone numbers on communication links between the United States and foreign countries, the report said.

On Oct. 2, Hayden briefed members of the House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence and Senate Select Committee on Intelligence about his decision to allow expanded data collection.

The president issued a memo on Oct. 4 that authorized "specified electronic surveillance" for a "limited period" to detect and thwart terrorism inside the United States. The order delegated authority to the secretary of defense, who passed on the authority to Hayden.

Under the initial authorization, as long as the NSA had probable cause to think one of the people communicating was in Afghanistan or was engaged in planning an act of international terrorism, the agency could collect communications data outside the FISA process. "The majority of known terrorist email addresses that NSA has tracked are hosted on U.S.-based providers," the report said.

Days later, the PSP's metadata analysis center was a round-the-clock operation with 20 analysts and software developers. Many of them were "former Russian traffic analysts," the report said. Within a week, 90 NSA employees were clear to view the PSP material.

The "PSP content collection" ultimately targeted 3,018 people in the United States from Oct. 4, 2001, to Jan. 17, 2007, the report said. Targeting of foreign nationals was broadened beyond Afghanistan shortly after the initial authorization. Of the targets, 34,646, or 92 percent, were foreign.

The report notes: "NSA leadership considered selectors for targets located in the United States to be extremely sensitive. As such, processes were set up to ensure strict compliance with the terms of the Authorization."

But the sweep of the PSP went beyond content and included the collection of vast amounts of metadata. Among the legal assumptions was that "metadata was not constitutionally protected" and not as sensitive as content.

"Nevertheless, processes were set up to document requests for metadata analysis and justifications for conducting such analysis under Program authority," the report said.

The report does not specify how much metadata was collected, but it pointed out that 37 billion minutes in telephone conversations originated or ended in the United States in 2003 alone.

"NSA determined that under the Authorization it could gain access to approximately 81% of the international calls into and out of the United States through three corporate partners," the report said.

## Snowden didn't betray Americans, his father says

Debbi Wilgoren

443 words

29 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A03

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

The father of fugitive **Edward Snowden** told NBC News that he believes his son would return to the United States if he were assured that he would not be jailed before trial or subjected to a gag order.

Lonnie Snowden told journalist Michael Isikoff that he has not spoken since April with his son - **who is believed to be hiding in a Moscow airport to evade arrest by U.S. authorities.**

**Edward Snowden** went into hiding in early June, after information he provided about U.S. data surveillance programs was published by The Washington Post and Guardian newspapers. He has said he revealed the information because he feared that the programs were violating the rights of private citizens. He has been charged with leaking classified documents.

The portion of the interview that aired on the "Today" show Friday morning did not explain how the elder Snowden had developed his opinion as to the conditions under which his 30-year-old son might return home.

Lonnie Snowden sent a letter to Attorney General Eric H. Holder Jr. with his suggestions about how to get his son to return to this country, Isikoff reported. **In the interview, he said he knew his son had broken the law but does not think he committed treason.**

**"He has betrayed his government, but I don't believe that he's betrayed the people of the United States," Lonnie Snowden said.**

"I love him. I would like to have the opportunity to communicate with him," he added.

Lonnie Snowden, a career Coast Guard officer who retired and moved to Pennsylvania a few years ago, told NBC that he did not trust WikiLeaks, the anti-secrecy organization that is providing his son with legal and logistical assistance.

"I am concerned about those who surround him," the father said in the interview. "I think WikiLeaks, if you've looked at past history, you know, their focus isn't necessarily the Constitution of the United States. It's simply to release as much information as possible."

**Edward Snowden** is reportedly seeking asylum from Ecuador. He surfaced in Hong Kong shortly after his leaked information was published, then vanished until he arrived in Moscow last Sunday.

He is believed to have been planning to travel from there to Ecuador, possibly via Cuba. But as a crush of journalists descended on the airport Monday, he did not board the designated Havana-bound flight. He has remained out of public view, as heads of government have verbally jostled over whether he should be extradited to the United States.

## Judge defends role in spying

Carol D. Leonnig Ellen Nakashima Barton Gellman

1854 words

30 June 2013

The Washington Post

WP

FINAL

A01

English

Copyright 2013, The Washington Post Co. All Rights Reserved

Recent leaks of classified documents have pointed to the role of a special court in enabling the government's secret surveillance programs, but members of the court are chafing at the suggestion that they were collaborating with the executive branch.

A classified 2009 draft report by the National Security Agency's inspector general relayed some details about the interaction between the court's judges and the NSA, which sought approval for the Bush administration's top-secret domestic surveillance programs. The report was described in The Washington Post on June 16 and released in full Thursday by The Post and the British newspaper the Guardian.

U.S. District Judge Colleen Kollar-Kotelly, the former chief judge of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court, took the highly unusual step Friday of voicing open frustration at the account in the report and the court's inability to explain its decisions.

"In my view, that draft report contains major omissions, and some inaccuracies, regarding the actions I took as Presiding Judge of the FISC and my interactions with Executive Branch officials," Kollar-Kotelly said in a statement to The Post. It was her first public comment describing her work on the intelligence court.

The inspector general's draft report is among the many documents leaked by former NSA contractor **Edward Snowden**, touching off a roiling national debate about the proper balance between the government's reach into Americans' lives and the effort to protect the nation in the Internet age.

The document portrays the surveillance court as "amenable" to the government's legal theory to "re-create" authority for the Internet metadata program that had initially been authorized by President George W. Bush without court or congressional approval. The program was shut down in March 2004 when acting Attorney General James B. Comey and senior leaders at the Justice Department threatened to resign over what they felt was an illegal program.

Kollar-Kotelly disputed the NSA report's suggestion of a fairly high level of coordination between the court and the NSA and Justice in 2004 to re-create certain authorities under the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act, the 1978 law that created the court in response to abuses of domestic surveillance in the 1960s and 1970s.

"That is incorrect," she said. "I participated in a process of adjudication, not 'coordination' with the executive branch. The discussions I had with executive branch officials were in most respects typical of how I and other district court judges entertain applications for criminal wiretaps under Title III, where issues are discussed ex parte."

The perception that the court works too closely with the government arises in large part from the tribunal's "ex parte" nature, which means that unlike in a traditional court, there is no legal sparring between adversaries with the judge as arbiter. Instead, a Justice Department official makes the case for the government agency seeking permission to carry out surveillance inside the United States. No one speaks

for the target of the surveillance or the company that is ordered to allow its networks to be tapped or to turn over its customers' data.

Some critics say the court is a rubber stamp for government investigators because it almost never has turned down a warrant application. However, that high approval rate doesn't take into account changes the court requires in some requests and other applications that the government withdraws.

For about 30 years, the court was on the sixth floor of the Justice Department's headquarters, down the hall from the officials who would argue in front of it. (The court moved to the District's federal courthouse in 2009.) "There is a collaborative process that would be unnatural in the public, criminal court setting," said a former Justice official familiar with the court, who spoke on the condition of anonymity because of the subject's sensitivity.

Kollar-Kotelly, who was the court's chief judge from 2002 to 2006, said she could not comment further on the matter because "the underlying subjects" in the report generally remain classified by the executive branch.

Other judges on the court have confided to colleagues their frustration at the court's portrayal, according to people familiar with their discussion.

The inspector general's report, combined with persistent refusals by the government to declassify the opinions, have left the public in the dark about the court's legal justifications for approving the broad surveillance programs.

"The court is a neutral party, not a collaborator or arm of the government," said one government official close to the court. "But the information out there now leaves people wondering how and why the court endorsed these programs."

The court historically has authorized in secret hearings classified warrants to wiretap the calls and monitor the movements of suspected criminals. After the terrorist attacks of Sept. 11, 2001, far-reaching programs to gather Internet and telephone content and metadata were launched under presidential authority, without congressional action or approval from the surveillance court.

The Internet metadata portion of that program had to be revamped after Comey and other Justice officials threatened to resign. Metadata are information indicating facts such as an e-mail's sender and recipient and its time and date, but not its content.

In May 2004, the NSA briefed Kollar-Kotelly on the technical aspects of that program's collection, according to the report. She also met with the NSA director, Lt. Gen. Michael V. Hayden, on two successive Saturdays during the summer of 2004 to discuss the issue, the report said.

"It was very professional," Hayden said in an interview. "We of course had to explain to her what it was we had been doing, what it was we wanted to do, how we would do it, what kind of safeguards we felt able to put in. We left it to her judgment whether there was proportionality in terms of was this worth doing, in the balance between security and liberty."

He said in response to her concerns, the agency made some technical adjustments so that "the odds were greater that you'd pick up fewer protected communications of U.S. persons."

Said Hayden: "She wasn't in league with us. We were down there presenting what we thought was appropriate."

On July 14, 2004, the surveillance court for the first time approved the gathering of information by the NSA, which created the equivalent of a digital vault to hold Internet metadata. Kollar-Kotelly's order authorized the metadata program under a FISA provision known as the "pen register/trap and trace," or PRTT.

The ruling was a secret not just to the public and most of Congress, but to all of Kollar-Kotelly's surveillance court colleagues. Under orders from the president, none of the court's other 10 members could be told about the Internet metadata program, which was one prong of a larger and highly classified data-gathering effort known as the President's Surveillance Program, or PSP.

But the importance of her order - which approved the collection based on a 1986 law typically used for phone records - was hard to overstate.

"The order essentially gave NSA the same authority to collect bulk Internet metadata that it had under the PSP," the inspector general's report said, with some minor caveats including reducing the number of people who could access the records.

On May 24, 2006, Kollar-Kotelly signed another order, this one authorizing the bulk collection of phone metadata from U.S. phone companies, under a FISA provision known as Section 215, or the "business records provision," of the USA Patriot Act.

As with the PRTT order, the Justice Department and NSA "collaboratively designed the application, prepared declarations and responded to questions from court advisers," the inspector general's report said. "Their previous experience in drafting the PRTT order made this process more efficient."

The court also agreed in 2007 to permit the government to collect the content of e-mails and phone calls to and from the United States when "there is probable cause to believe" that one of the parties is a member of al-Qaeda or an associated terrorist group. That program, known today as PRISM and described in documents obtained by The Washington Post, eventually was authorized by Congress.

Kollar-Kotelly could be a stern taskmaster when she thought the NSA was overstepping its bounds. In 2004, she temporarily shut down the government's surveillance program when she learned of a key NSA failure, The Post reported in 2006. The agency was not properly walling off information gained in warrantless surveillance and may have been using the information to obtain court warrants, which was forbidden. In 2005, the problem resurfaced and she issued a strong warning to the government that it had to fix the problem or would face trouble obtaining court warrants.

Kollar-Kotelly "understood the problems that the government, particularly the Defense Department and the intelligence community, were facing in trying to keep this country safe," said Robert L. Deitz, former NSA general counsel under Hayden.

But, he said, the court was no rubber stamp. "The judges ask searching questions," he said. "If they don't get the right answer, they don't stamp things 'reject.' They say, 'I'm not signing this.' Then we go back and say, 'Okay, we've got to do this the following way.' "

Still secret are the 2004 decision accompanying the PRTT court order and the legal opinion accompanying the 2006 business records order.

A former senior Justice Department official said he believes the government should consider releasing declassified summaries of relevant opinions.

"I think it would help" quell the "furor" raised by the recent disclosures, he said. "In this current environment, you may have to lean forward a little more in declassifying stuff than you otherwise would. You might be able to prepare reasonable summaries that would be helpful to the American people."



Lawmakers and civil-liberties advocates have been pushing the Obama administration for several years to declassify these opinions and other opinions from Justice's Office of Legal Counsel that explain the legal justification for these programs.

The Office of the Director of National Intelligence has led an effort to review these opinions to see what, if anything, can be declassified. But Robert S. Litt, ODNI general counsel, has argued that declassification can be difficult when so much of the legal reasoning is intertwined with facts that need to remain secret lest they tip off enemies about surveillance methods.

Still, the former official explained, segregating relevant facts from classified material is routinely done in criminal proceedings under the Classified Information Procedures Act. In those cases, the government can extract the information that is relevant to the defense, the judge approves it, and it is provided to the defense.

"This is not unheard-of in the unclassified world, and some kind of summary document can be generated," the former official said. "Maybe that's a middle ground that can be done."

## Bijlage 4. Krantenartikelen The Voice of America News

# British, US Papers Identify NSA Whistleblower

June 09, 2013 1:37 PM

A British and a U.S. newspaper have identified a contract employee of the National Security Agency as the source of leaked information that revealed the spy agency is monitoring Americans' phone calls.

Edward Snowden, 29, says he urged *The Guardian* and *The Washington Post* to name him as their source. He tells the papers he will not hide because he insists he did nothing wrong.

Snowden, who fled the United States for Hong Kong last month, says he knows he will be made to suffer for his actions. But he said he is willing to sacrifice a "very comfortable life" to reveal the truth about what he calls a massive surveillance machine the United States is building.

He also tells the *Post* that he plans to ask asylum in any country he says believes in free speech and global privacy.

*The Guardian* reported last week that the NSA was collecting the telephone records of millions of Americans. The newspaper, along with *The Washington Post*, also reported that a separate program called PRISM gives the NSA and FBI access to the servers of major Internet providers.

Learn more about PRISM

U.S. officials do not deny the reports. They say no one listens in on anyone's telephone calls, and that the data they gathered has stopped several terrorist plots.

The U.S. Justice Department says it has opened a criminal investigation into the leaks, but has given no other information.

British Foreign Secretary William Hague says eavesdropping by its GCHQ security agency is legal and no threat to privacy. But he refuses to confirm or deny reports it received data from the secret NSA program.

## Ex-CIA Employee Reveals His Motive for Leaks

June 10, 2013 7:02 AM

WASHINGTON—An ex-CIA employee working as a contractor at the U.S. National Security Agency said he was the source who leaked details of a top secret U.S. surveillance program, acting out of conscience to protect "basic liberties for people around the world."

Holed up in a hotel room in Hong Kong, Edward Snowden, 29, said he had thought long and hard before publicizing details of an NSA program code-named PRISM, saying he

had done so because he felt the United States was building an unaccountable and secret espionage machine that spied on every American.

His whereabouts were not immediately known on Monday, but staff at a luxury hotel in Hong Kong told Reuters that Snowden had checked out at noon.

Snowden, a former technical assistant at the CIA, said he had been working at the super-secret NSA as an employee of contractor Booz Allen. He said he decided to leak information after becoming disenchanted with President Barack Obama, who he said had continued the policies of predecessor George W. Bush.

"I don't want to live in a society that does these sort of things ... I do not want to live in a world where everything I do and say is recorded. That is not something I am willing to support or live under," he told The Guardian newspaper, which published a video interview with him on its website. The interview was dated June 6.

Both The Guardian and the Washington Post said last week that U.S. security services had monitored data about phone calls from Verizon and Internet data from large companies such as Google and Facebook.

In naming Snowden on Sunday, the newspapers said he had sought to be identified.

"The NSA has built an infrastructure that allows it to intercept almost everything," Snowden said in explaining his actions.

"With this capability, the vast majority of human communications are automatically ingested without targeting. If I wanted to see your emails or your wife's phone, all I have to do is use intercepts. I can get your emails, passwords, phone records, credit cards," he said.

### **Worked at NSA for 4 years**

The *Guardian* said Snowden had been working at the NSA for four years as a contractor for outside companies.

Three weeks ago, he copied the secret documents at the NSA office in Hawaii and told his supervisor he needed "a couple of weeks" off for treatment for epilepsy, the paper said. On May 20 he flew to Hong Kong.

The CIA and the White House declined to comment, while a spokesman for the Director of National Intelligence would not comment directly about Snowden himself but said the intelligence community was reviewing damage done by the recent leaks.

"Any person who has a security clearance knows that he or she has an obligation to protect classified information and abide by the law," said the spokesman, Shawn Turner.

The NSA has requested a criminal probe into the leaked information. On Sunday, the U.S. Justice Department said it was in the initial stages of a criminal investigation following the leaks.

Booz Allen, a U.S. management and technology consultancy, said reports of the leaked information were "shocking and if accurate, this action represents a grave violation" of

company policy.

It said Snowden had been employed by the company for less than three months and that it would cooperate with any investigations.

A spokesman for Dell Inc. declined to comment on reports that Snowden had been employed at that company. In 2009, Dell acquired Perot Systems, a U.S. government contractor that did work for U.S. intelligence agencies.

Snowden's decision to reveal his identity and whereabouts lifts the lid on one of the biggest security leaks in U.S. history and escalates a story that has placed a bright light on Obama's extensive use of secret surveillance.

The exposure of the secret programs has triggered widespread debate within the United States and abroad about the vast reach of the NSA, which has expanded its surveillance dramatically in since the Sept. 11 attacks on Washington and New York in 2001.

U.S. officials say the agency operates within the law. Some members of Congress have indicated support for the NSA activities, while others pushed for tougher oversight and possible changes to the law authorizing the surveillance.

### **Why Hong Kong?**

One legal expert was puzzled as to why Snowden fled to Hong Kong, because it has an extradition treaty with the United States while mainland China does not.

In routine criminal cases, unlike this one, Hong Kong had shown a willingness in recent years to extradite people to face charges in the United States, he said.

In the video, Snowden said that "Hong Kong has a strong tradition of free speech."

Hong Kong returned from British to Chinese rule in 1997, but still enjoys some autonomy in business and governmental functions.

However, under Hong Kong's Fugitives Offenders Ordinance, Beijing can issue an "instruction" to the city's leader to take or not take action on extraditions where the interests of China "in matters of defense or foreign affairs would be significantly affected."

Typically, U.S. visitors in Hong Kong are granted a 90-day visa. According to the Guardian, Snowden left Hawaii for Hong Kong on May 20.

Hong Kong's Security Bureau, which is charged with law enforcement and immigration matters, had no immediate response when asked about the case.

Glenn Greenwald, the Guardian newspaper journalist who broke the story and interviewed Snowden last week, told the local South China Morning Post newspaper he was not aware of the former CIA man's current whereabouts.

The U.S. Consulate declined to comment on the case.

Douglas McNabb, a Houston lawyer who specializes in extradition, said it would not be

difficult for the United States to provide justification for its request. "This guy came out and said, 'I did it,'" he said. "His best defense would probably be that this is a political case instead of a criminal one."

Snowden, who said he had left his girlfriend in Hawaii without telling her where he was going, said he knew the risk he was taking, but thought the publicity his revelations had garnered in the past few days had made it worth it.

"My primary fear is that they will come after my family, my friends, my partner. Anyone I have a relationship with," he said. "I will have to live with that for the rest of my life. I am not going to be able to communicate with them. They [the authorities] will act aggressively against anyone who has known me. That keeps me up at night."

In the video interview, the bespectacled, lightly bearded Snowden looked relaxed. He said he was ultimately hoping that Iceland, which values internet freedom, might grant him asylum.

## Iceland May Not Be the Haven US Leaker Hopes

June 10, 2013 11:07 AM

REYKJAVIK—The leaker who revealed top secret U.S. surveillance programs says he hopes to find shelter in Iceland, but he may be disappointed by the reception from a new government seen as less keen than predecessors to attract exiles and Internet renegades.

The country of 320,000 people has served as the home base for the fundraising efforts of anti-secrecy website WikiLeaks and earlier earned a reputation as a safe haven by taking in American fugitive former chess champion Bobby Fischer in 2005.

Edward Snowden, a 29-year-old contractor at the U.S. National Security Agency now holed up in a hotel room in Hong Kong after divulging NSA secrets, said he hoped to go to a country which encompassed his values of Internet freedom, naming Iceland.

But the government of newly-elected conservative Prime Minister Sigmundur David Gunnlaugsson, while still untested, is widely seen as closer to Washington than past administrations and less keen to foster the island country's cyber-haven image.

Snowden has yet to make a formal application for asylum and would have to go to Iceland to make the request, said Kristin Volundarsdottir, head of Iceland's Directorate of Immigration. Gunnlaugsson's government did not otherwise comment on the case.

"I would be very surprised if they (the government) would be eager to engage in any international disputes with the U.S. And it is pretty difficult to be granted asylum here," said Stefania Oskarsdottir, lecturer in political science at the University of Iceland.

"I think what this guy is saying is based on something he is imagining or hoping for rather than actual facts."

As a U.S. citizen, Snowden would not need a visa to enter Iceland and could immediately apply for asylum. He would be free to live in Iceland while immigration

authorities decide his case, which could take more than a year, according to Helga Vala Helgadóttir, a lawyer specializing in asylum cases.

“The government is perceived as being less welcoming to asylum seekers,” said Helgadóttir. While the decision rests with immigration authorities, Snowden could appeal to the interior ministry if his application were rejected.

Iceland has an extradition treaty with the United States, but it is unclear whether it would cover any crimes that Snowden might be charged with.

An Icelandic foundation championing free speech has offered to help him.

“We have a lawyer, we have everything set up,” said Smari McCarthy, head of the International Modern Media Institute and a member of the Pirate Party, a movement that promotes Internet freedom and holds three seats in Iceland's 63-seat parliament.

### Refuge for chess champion

Were Snowden to reach Iceland, his arrival could put public pressure on the government by voters proud of their image of supporting media freedoms and also angry about the secrecy that surrounded the collapse of their banks in 2008.

“This is coming at a very interesting point for us, because obviously in the wake of our financial collapse there is a very big emphasis on a pro-truth society here,” said Katrin Oddsdóttir, lawyer at law firm Rettur in Iceland, which specializes in human rights issues.

In 2010, with a center-left government in power in Iceland, WikiLeaks registered a company called Sunshine Press Productions there for its fundraising.

WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, now holed up in the Ecuadorian embassy in London to avoid extradition to Sweden for questioning over sex crimes, visited Iceland several times in the run-up to some of the website's major releases.

Icelandic member of parliament Birgitta Jónsdóttir helped Assange put together the “Collateral Murder” video package, which included footage of a U.S. helicopter attack on Iraqi civilians in which two Reuters journalists were killed.

Jónsdóttir has campaigned to make a free speech and Internet safe-haven status for Iceland enshrined in law.

Wikileaks won a ruling this year in Iceland's Supreme Court against MasterCard's local partner. The court upheld a lower court's ruling that the payment card firm had illegally ended its contract with the website.

In the Fischer case, the former child chess prodigy was wanted by the United States for evading taxes and breaking sanctions by playing a match in Yugoslavia in 1992. After years living abroad he was detained in Japan for nine months, until Iceland offered him asylum and citizenship in 2005. He spent his last years in Iceland before dying in 2008.

It was a conservative coalition of the same parties now in power in Iceland that pushed through the highly unusual step of granting Fischer citizenship.

“So the most interesting precedent that we have is actually a precedent which dates from a time when the same parties were in power as are now,” said Oddsdottir.

## Edward Snowden: High School Dropout to Intelligence Consultant

June 10, 2013 12:27 PM

A 29-year-old American man who claims to have exposed top secret U.S. surveillance programs appears to be a high school dropout who rapidly moved through U.S. intelligence circles.

Edward Snowden grew up in North Carolina and Maryland. In an interview with British newspaper *The Guardian*, he said he never completed high school, but studied computing at a Maryland community college and obtained a General Educational Development diploma.

*The Guardian* quoted the U.S. military as saying Snowden enlisted in the army reserve as a special forces recruit in May 2004 but did not complete the training and was discharged four months later.

Snowden told the paper that his military career was cut short after he "broke both his legs in a training accident."

*The Guardian* said Snowden got his first job as a security guard for the U.S. National Security Agency, or NSA, which assigned him to a covert facility at the University of Maryland.

The paper said Snowden's talent for computer programming helped him to move on to a job with the Central Intelligence Agency as an Information Technology security specialist. It says the CIA stationed him with diplomatic cover in Geneva, Switzerland by 2007. The CIA generally refuses to confirm or deny employment with the agency.

Snowden told the paper that he left the CIA in 2009 and took on several jobs as a private contractor for the NSA, including assignments at the computer company Dell and a U.S. military facility in Japan.

U.S. defense consulting firm Booz Allen Hamilton said it hired Snowden earlier this year at an office in Hawaii. It said he had been employed for less than three months when he told reporters that he was the source of leaks on the U.S. surveillance programs.

The company expressed shock at the revelations and said that if confirmed, Snowden's actions represent "a grave violation of the code of conduct and core values of our firm."

Neighbors said Snowden lived in a house near Honolulu for several months, sharing it with his girlfriend. They say he kept largely to himself and stored an usually large number of boxes in his garage.

*The Guardian* said Snowden is an Internet freedom advocate, placing stickers on his laptop bearing the names of groups such as the Electronic Frontier Foundation and the Tor Project.

It also quoted him as saying voted for a "third party" candidate in the 2008 U.S. presidential election. Snowden says he believed in the promises of President Barack Obama, who won that election, and waited to see how Mr. Obama would govern before exposing the secret programs.

Snowden said he eventually disclosed the information in part because Mr. Obama, in his view, "continu[ed] the policies of his predecessor."

## Experts: Snowden Extradition from Hong Kong Could be Complicated

June 10, 2013 1:47 PM

Experts said Monday that any attempt to extradite the man who says he leaked details about the U.S. government's secret monitoring of phone calls and Internet use from Hong Kong could be long and complicated.

The U.S. and Hong Kong signed an extradition treaty in 1996, just before the British handed over control of the territory to China, in which both parties agreed to hand over fugitives. While Hong Kong is a semi-autonomous Chinese territory, Beijing can veto extraditions if it believes returning a suspect to a foreign country would impinge on its "essential public interest or policy."

Edward Snowden, who says he worked as a contractor for the highly secretive National Security Agency in the United States, said he disclosed the country's surveillance programs because he grew increasingly concerned about the extent of the monitoring. He had taken up residence in a Hong Kong hotel, and on Sunday he urged two newspapers he had leaked information to, Britain's Guardian and The Washington Post, to disclose his identity.

A New York lawyer who has handled international extradition cases, Robert Anello, told VOA that any extradition of Snowden could take years, and be a complicated decision for China.

"Whether or not they would decide to override it and keep him is a political issue that would be a very involved decision. I mean, given China's relationship with the U.S., which at least appears to be relatively good these days, one might argue against it. On the other hand, if his computer is full of important information that would be of interest to a foreign government, they would have an interest in overriding it and maintaining him there," said Anello/

Ultimately, Anello said he thinks "the odds are very substantial" that the United States will be able to extradite Snowden.

Snowden told the Guardian he went to Hong Kong because it "has a strong tradition of free speech."

The Hong Kong government said only that it would abide by its laws, and could not comment on individual cases. U.S. authorities say they are in the initial stages of investigating the leaks, and no formal criminal charges have been filed.

One Hong Kong legal expert, Ronny Tong, said he is not certain that even if the U.S.



charges Snowden with offenses related to his acknowledged leak of the documents to the two newspapers it would lead to his extradition.

"If he is being indicted for the crime of espionage in United States, again I am not sure that that would suffice in Hong Kong, because in Hong Kong there is no law as yet which covers espionage or covers the leakage of national interest because we have failed in passing Article 23 legislation, which is the national security legislation in Hong Kong," said Tong.

Another expert, Shi Yinhong at the U.S. Research Center at Renmin University, questioned whether the Chinese government would want to approve Snowden's release to U.S. authorities.

"I also think that the Chinese government also will consider the indirect negative impact upon Chinese international prestige, because it's not in Chinese interest to help the U.S. government to take someone who has done nothing criminal against China, but maybe who will get some international sympathy," said Shi.

Snowden also expressed interest in seeking asylum in Iceland, but officials in the North Atlantic island nation said he would have to appear in person to seek asylum there.

In a lengthy interview with the Guardian, Snowden said his dismay grew over time at the extent of the U.S. surveillance of phone and Internet records. He said he believed that Americans not suspected of any wrongdoing were being targeted.

"Even if you're not doing anything wrong, you're being watched and recorded," said Snowden.

## White House Declines Comment on NSA Whistleblower

June 10, 2013 3:13 PM

WHITE HOUSE—The White House has declined to comment on the revelation of the identity of former CIA employee Edward Snowden, who leaked information about top secret U.S. government surveillance programs.

On Sunday, Snowden, a 29-year-old technician who worked for the CIA and later as a contractor for the National Security Agency (NSA), outed himself in interviews with *The Guardian* newspaper and *The Washington Post*.

Snowden said he disclosed secret documents to protect "basic liberties for people around the world." In a video interview with *The Guardian*, he acknowledged he could face prosecution, but he said he felt compelled to take the actions he did.

"Over time, that awareness of wrongdoing sort of builds up and you feel compelled to talk about it, and the more you talk about it the more you are ignored, the more you are told it's not a problem, until eventually you realize that these things need to be determined by the public, not by somebody who was simply hired by the government," he said.

The revelations were about "PRISM," an NSA program that gathers huge amounts of metadata from Internet companies, although intelligence officials say it does not target American citizens.

Another program collects data about phone calls. President Obama has said this does not mean authorities listen to Americans' phone conversations, which would require further approval by a special intelligence court.

Press Secretary Jay Carney declined Monday to comment specifically about Snowden, noting that the Department of Justice is investigating the unauthorized disclosure of classified information.

"The programs we have discussed because of the leaks that have happened lately, while legitimate subject of debate and discussion, we talk about the balance necessary," said Carney. "All involve court approval; they involve congressional review and oversight."

The Office of the Director of National Intelligence said the intelligence community is reviewing "damage from recent disclosures," adding that "any person who has a security clearance knows that he or she has an obligation to protect classified information and abide by the law."

There is now intense new debate across the United States about tradeoffs between security and privacy, and what many Americans consider unconstitutional government intrusions.

Last week, President Obama said Americans cannot expect 100 percent security and 100 percent privacy. He said the programs are under strict supervision, and that leaks increase vulnerability to terrorist attacks.

"Our goal is to stop folks from doing us harm, and if every step that we are taking to try to prevent a terrorist act is on the front page of the newspapers or on television, then presumably the people who are trying to do us harm are going to be able to get around our preventive measures," he said.

A recent Rasmussen poll found that 68 percent of Americans believe the government is listening to their telephone conversations, with 59 percent of likely voters opposing the practice of collecting phone data.

Since Snowden revealed his identity as the source of the leak, a petition supporting him and calling him a "national hero" and asking President Obama to pardon him was posted on a petition forum on the White House website.

Jay Carney declined any specific comment on the petition other than to note that guidelines require petitions to have at least 100,000 signatures before the White House issues a response.

# Privacy Advocates Praise NSA Contractor Who Exposed US Surveillance Program

June 10, 2013 7:47 PM

Some national security advocates are calling for the prosecution of ex-CIA employee Edward Snowden, who leaked details of a top secret U.S. surveillance program. But Snowden's supporters say he should be protected as a whistleblower for exposing U.S. constitutional violations of civil liberties.

To many who support increased security even at the cost of some personal privacy, Edward Snowden, the National Security Agency contractor who exposed vast government surveillance programs, is a villain.

The information he revealed included NSA programs to collect phone records and gain access to the Internet usage of millions of Americans. U.S. officials say the programs are legal and the data they gathered has stopped several terrorist plots.

Congressman Mike Rogers, the chairman of the House Intelligence Committee, wants Snowden to be tried for espionage.

"It's dangerous to our national security and it violates the oath of which that person took. I absolutely think they should be prosecuted," said Rogers.

But to others who think the NSA has exceeded its legal authority, Snowden is a hero for speaking out. Jesselyn Radack is with the Government Accountability Project.

"I think he is a whistleblower and it was incredibly brave, well thought out, risky action that he took for the benefit of people in this country. So I can't think of a better definition of a hero," said Radack.

She says the NSA data mining programs that Snowden leaked intrude on the privacy of Americans beyond the limits set by the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act of 2008 and the Patriot Act.

"So the laws have been clearly broken and he definitely disclosed information that reveals massive waste, abuse and patent illegality on a grand scale that I have not seen in a long time," said Radack.

President Obama has said that while the programs are classified, they are authorized by Congress. White House spokesman Jay Carney declined Monday to comment on the ongoing investigation, but said the president has tried to balance privacy rights with keeping Americans safe.

"I think the president's record on making the kinds of changes that he promised he would make to the ways that we pursue our fight against al-Qaida and our fight against terrorists and extremists, he has lived up to," said Carney.

Snowden is currently in Hong Kong and plans to seek asylum from any countries that he says believe in protecting free speech and global privacy.

# Damage from NSA Leak Being Assessed

June 11, 2013 4:32 AM

The U.S. government is investigating whether the disclosure of a highly classified U.S. surveillance program by Edward Snowden was criminal.

Snowden said Sunday he is the source for news reports of the U.S. National Security Agency's monitoring of phone calls and Internet data for threats of terrorism, a program the Obama administration says keeps America safe from terrorists.

Meanwhile, European officials are examining the spy programs and whether they violated local privacy protections. European governments have been trying to explain whether they let Washington spy on their citizens or benefited from snooping that would be illegal at home

EU officials in Brussels pledged to seek answers from U.S. diplomats at a ministerial meeting later this week in Dublin.

In Washington, lawmakers said they are looking at potential ways to keep the United States safe from terror attacks without giving up privacy protections.

Snowden's whereabouts are unknown since he checked out of a Hong Kong hotel on Monday. He said he will seek asylum in any country that believes in free speech and global privacy.

The information Snowden revealed included a secret court order directing Verizon Communications to turn over all its telephone records for a three-month period, and details about an NSA program code-named PRISM, that collected emails, chat logs and other types of data from Internet companies. These included Google, Facebook, Microsoft, Yahoo, AOL and Apple.

U.S. officials say the program is not designed to listen to telephone calls and the data they gathered has stopped several terrorist plots.

## Snowden Flight to Hong Kong Stirs Debate

June 11, 2013 8:10 AM

BEIJING—The revelation that former National Security Agency contractor Edward Snowden has fled to China's Special Administrative Region of Hong Kong is stirring up discussion among Chinese about Internet freedom and the measures governments take to monitor online activity in the name of national security.

Although state-media in China have given the case limited coverage, many people are busy commenting online about Edward Snowden's flight to Hong Kong and what he has exposed about U.S. Internet surveillance programs.

Some praise Snowden, calling him a hero for standing up to the U.S. government and compare him to WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange. Another calls the case another slap in the face of U.S. democracy.

Blogger and columnist Michael Anti writes about Internet issues in China. He said many people online in China are surprised that the U.S. is doing the same thing the Chinese government does.

"I do not think the Chinese government will [be] embarrassed by the case because Xi Jinping and Obama and talk about, the top issue is cyber security, so this case come out, it made the argument made by the American government about cyber security is less convinced [convincing] to the public," said Anti. "So I think this story benefited the Chinese government."

Anti said there are still contradictions between the leaker's statements and companies such as Google and others who have denied involvement, but the case could have a serious impact on Internet freedom in China.

"The [Chinese] government will say, 'We told you, every government does the same thing about Internet control, and all the criticism you [the U.S.] once made to us about Internet freedom, basically is very hypocritical,'" Anti noted.

University of Hong Kong legal scholar Simon Young agrees. "Like in many human rights debates that the U.S. and China have, this might well be an issue that fortifies the mainland authorities in rebuffing the U.S. in saying, 'Well you are no better than us, and look at how you defend these practices and policies so hence, what's wrong with what we are doing, in the mainland'," he said.

As the debate about the case goes global, U.S. officials have given no indication they might scrap the program, despite the backlash. Critics said the program is a threat to privacy protections and it exceeds the limits set by laws on American intelligence set up to thwart possible terrorist attacks.

U.S. President Barack Obama is coming under increasing pressure to take action in the case and possibly seek the extradition of Snowden. U.S. Senate Intelligence Committee chair Diane Feinstein says Snowden has committed an "act of treason" that should be prosecuted.

But Young said getting to that point could take a long time. Extradition or request for surrender, as it is called in Hong Kong, would involve both a lengthy court process and approval from Hong Kong's chief executive.

"Throughout this process it is possible to challenge the various decisions made in the higher courts and ultimately on appeal to the court of final appeal, if leave is granted. It would probably be definitely months and possibly even years if he tries to exhaust all of his appeal routes," stated Young.

Young adds residents in Hong Kong are likely to be sympathetic with Snowden's efforts to safeguard citizens privacy.

"I think these issues are largely about what you think about secrecy in government, interference in one's private life, and whistleblowing essentially, and in many respects Hong Kong's values in this area are probably very similar to Western values," said Young. "I mean, Hong Kong is an international city and like the United States we have constitutional protection against interference with privacy."

But just as much as the case is a legal matter, it is also political and diplomatic.

The revelation that Snowden was in Hong Kong came a day after U.S. President Obama and Chinese leader Xi Jinping held their first informal talks in California and focused on improving ties.

Political analysts say how they handle the matter could be the first major test Obama and Xi face in the effort to open a new chapter for U.S.-China ties.

## Internet Companies Want Permission to Reveal Details of NSA Spy Program

June 11, 2013 5:52 PM

Three big Internet companies want the Obama administration to let them reveal details of federal court orders to turn over information about their users to U.S. spy agencies.

Google, Facebook and Microsoft say they want everything transparent and out in the open. Google's chief legal official said Tuesday his company has "nothing to hide."

Google says media reports that it gives the spy agencies unlimited access to information about its customers are not true. It says government orders to keep the details secret just add to rumors and speculation.

The National Security Agency has acknowledged leaked newspaper reports that its program called PRISM collects emails and other data from Internet companies.

A former NSA contractor, Edward Snowden, leaked the story about PRISM and NSA monitoring of telephone calls to The Guardian and Washington Post.

He said it is important to reveal what he says is the government's massive surveillance program on private citizens.

The U.S. says information gathered by the NSA has foiled terrorist plots. The Justice Department is investigating possible criminal charges against Snowden, who fled to Hong Kong last month but whose exact whereabouts are not known.

The American Civil Liberties Union has filed a lawsuit in federal court challenging whether the NSA spy program is constitutional. The ACLU argues that the spying violates the rights to free speech and privacy. An ACLU attorney says the constitution does not let the government carry out unsuspecting surveillance of every person in the country.

## NSA Chief to Testify on Surveillance Program

June 12, 2013 7:04 AM

The head of the U.S. National Security Agency will likely face tough questioning about the government's controversial surveillance program when he appears before a congressional panel Wednesday.

General Keith Alexander's appearance before the Senate Appropriations Committee comes amid revelations his agency has collected e-mails other data from Internet companies through a program called PRISM.

Three of the world's biggest technology companies, U.S.-based Google, Facebook and Microsoft, are asking the Obama administration to let them reveal details of federal court orders to turn over information about their users to U.S. spy agencies. The companies say they want everything transparent and out in the open.

Edward Snowden, a former NSA contractor, revealed the story about PRISM and NSA monitoring of telephone calls to *The Washington Post* and the British-based newspaper *The Guardian*.

Snowden says it is important to reveal what he says is the government's massive surveillance program on private citizens.

The U.S. government says information gathered by the NSA has foiled terrorist plots. The Justice Department is investigating possible criminal charges against Snowden, who fled to Hong Kong last month, but whose exact whereabouts are not known.

The American Civil Liberties Union has filed a lawsuit in federal court challenging whether the NSA spy program is constitutional. The ACLU argues that the spying violates the rights to free speech and privacy. An ACLU attorney says the constitution does not let the government carry out unsuspected surveillance of every person in the country.

## NSA Leaks Could Be Significant

June 12, 2013 12:24 PM

Security experts say it will be some time before U.S. officials have an idea of the damage done by revelations about surveillance programs carried out by the National Security Agency. The programs in question involved widespread access to phone records and mining the Internet for communications from suspected foreign terrorists.

The man who says he was behind the NSA leaks, contractor Edward Snowden, has inspired some and angered others, including U.S. House Speaker John Boehner on ABC News.

"He is a traitor. The disclosure of this information puts Americans at risk. It shows our adversaries what our capabilities are and it is a giant violation of the law," said Boehner.

Disclosures about the NSA programs that combed through phone records and scanned Internet communications linked to suspected foreign terrorists worries security experts like Steve Bucci of the Heritage Foundation.

"We have now revealed to our enemies, terrorists that are out there, the way we try and monitor and anticipate their actions and that is going to be damaging to our anti-terrorism activities," said Bucci.

Bucci predicts terrorists will alter their communication methods as a result of the

disclosures.

"I think the bad guys will start taking steps to dive deeper to cloak their communications and there are ways to do that on line. And as they do that the result, potentially, is that we fail to anticipate an operation and Americans or friends of ours inevitably die because these bad guys managed to pull their operation off and we were not able to anticipate it sufficiently," he said.

But many civil liberties activists have spoken out in defense of Snowden, including international security expert Jim Walsh from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

"In the balance between national security and privacy, which of course there always is, the burden is on national security to show that this is important and necessary, and no one has done that," Walsh told Alhurra television.

Snowden is also seen as a hero by perhaps the most famous leaker of all time, Daniel Ellsberg, the man who disclosed the Pentagon Papers about the Vietnam War in 1971.

"As for being called a traitor that is part of the price of telling the truth that the president does not want told. I paid that price myself," said Ellsberg.

But conservative analyst Steve Bucci fears that a backlash against the NSA programs by those concerned about civil liberties could weaken national security.

"The change in confidence or the drop in confidence of the American people in our government will cause us to try and reel back these systems. So right when the bad guys are going deeper, we are going to use less scrutiny and the next thing we are going to have is some more terrorist events," he said.

Experts say a full assessment of the damage caused by the leaks could take months.

## Snowden Vows to Stay in Hong Kong

June 12, 2013 1:48 PM

Edward Snowden, the man who leaked details of the U.S. government's secret monitoring of telephone calls and the Internet, says he plans to stay in Hong Kong and fight any U.S. effort to extradite him to face possible criminal charges.

The 29-year-old Snowden told the South China Morning Post on Wednesday that his intention "is to ask the courts and people of Hong Kong to decide my fate."

Hong Kong has an extradition treaty with the U.S. and has turned over some fugitives to the American government in recent years. But China retains the authority to block extraditions from its Hong Kong territory if it considers the allegations against suspects to be political.

Snowden said that people who think he made a mistake in traveling to Hong Kong before identifying himself as the source of the leaks about the surveillance programs "misunderstand my intentions." He told the newspaper, "I am not here to hide from justice; I am here to reveal criminality."



With his revelation of the secret monitoring, a lively debate is underway in the U.S. about how Snowden should be viewed.

He told the newspaper, "I'm neither traitor nor hero. I'm an American."

The U.S. government has acknowledged that in its fight against terrorism the National Security Agency has collected vast information about telephone calls, but says it has not listened to conversations. It also says it has monitored foreign use of the Internet through networks owned by major U.S. Internet companies.

Three of the world's biggest technology companies, U.S.-based Google, Facebook and Microsoft, are asking the Obama administration to let them reveal details of federal court orders to turn over information about their users to U.S. spy agencies. The companies say they want everything transparent and out in the open.

Snowden, a former NSA contractor, revealed details about the Internet and telephone surveillance to the *The Guardian* newspaper in Britain and *The Washington Post*. He said it is important to reveal what he says is the government's massive surveillance program on private citizens.

The U.S. government says information gathered by the NSA has foiled terrorist plots. The Justice Department is considering possible criminal charges against Snowden.

The American Civil Liberties Union has filed a lawsuit in federal court challenging whether the NSA spy program is constitutional. The ACLU argues that the spying violates the rights to free speech and privacy. An ACLU attorney says the U.S. Constitution does not let the government carry out unsuspected surveillance of every person in the country.

## NSA Chief: Surveillance Helped Stop 'Dozens' of Attacks

June 12, 2013 4:31 PM

WASHINGTON—The head of the National Security Agency told a U.S. congressional panel on Wednesday that dozens of terrorist attacks have been prevented thanks to a recently revealed surveillance program that has raised concerns about privacy.

Gen. Keith Alexander, director of the National Security Agency, appeared before a Senate panel looking into cybersecurity threats.

But a number of senators appeared more concerned about a secret surveillance program that has been mining Americans' telephone and Internet data.

Senator Patrick Leahy of Vermont asked the NSA chief how many attacks had been thwarted by data collected under Section 215 of the Patriot Act, which was signed into law shortly after the terrorist attacks on the United States on September 11, 2001.

**Alexander:** It's dozens of terrorist events that these have helped prevent.

**Leahy:** Ok, so dozens. Now we collect millions of millions of millions of records through 215, but dozens of them have proved crucial, or critical, is that right? Dozens?

**Alexander:** For both here and abroad, in disrupting or contributing to the disruption of terrorist attacks.”

**Leahy:** Out of those millions, dozens have been critical.”

**Alexander:** That’s correct.

The questioning came after details of the program were leaked by a government contractor.

Senator Richard Durbin of Illinois pointed out that the contractor, Edward Snowden, was a 29-year-old high school dropout who had worked as a security guard at the NSA. Durbin said he wanted to look at that resume.

“And ask you if you’re troubled that he was given that kind of opportunity to be so close to important information that was critical to the security of our nation,” Durbin said.

“I do have concerns about that, over the process, Senator. I have great concerns over that, the access that he had, Alexander said.

Alexander, who also heads the U.S. Cyber Command, promised to declassify some information in the coming days to show that the surveillance programs are working lawfully and in the national interest.

“This is not us doing something under the covers, this is what we’re doing on behalf of all of us, for the good of this country. Now, what we need to do, I think, is to bring as many facts as we can out to the American people,” Alexander said.

Several lawmakers said that U.S. intelligence agencies are engaged in a cyber war and need, as one of them put it, “a little space.”

## Chinese Media Focus on Snowden Leaks, US Spy Programs

June 13, 2013 12:17 AM

The front pages of Chinese state media were covered Thursday with the allegations of ex-CIA employee Edward Snowden, who says the U.S. government has been hacking computers in China for years.

Snowden is currently holed up in Hong Kong, where he fled after leaking top-secret documents that exposed surveillance programs carried out by the National Security Agency, where he had also worked as a contractor.

The 29-year-old on Wednesday told a newspaper in Hong Kong that he plans to stay in the former British colony and fight efforts to bring him back to the U.S. for criminal proceedings.

Speaking with the English-language *South China Morning Post*, Snowden said the NSA has been hacking computers in Hong Kong and mainland China since 2009. He said targets include public officials, businesses and the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

Those claims by Snowden were the top story on most of China's major news portals on Thursday, including on the front page of both the Chinese-language print version and

and English-language online version of the Communist Party-controlled *Global Times*.

The official *China Daily* also prominently featured a piece quoting Chinese analysts who said Snowden's revelations are "certain to stain Washington's overseas image and test developing Sino-U.S. ties."

Until now, Chinese officials and newspapers on the mainland had stayed relatively quiet on the issue. But its increased prominence Thursday suggests Beijing is willing to use Snowden's revelations of the U.S. surveillance programs to defend its own massive cyber security operations.

The development could complicate Washington's efforts to hold China accountable for alleged widespread Chinese cyber espionage and theft against U.S. targets. It could also provide ammunition for Beijing to defend its own massive domestic surveillance efforts.

The U.S. spy programs have already been criticized by some privacy and civil rights advocates in China, including dissident artist Ai Weiwei. In a Tuesday opinion piece in *The Guardian*, Ai said the U.S. initiatives are "abusively using government powers to interfere in individuals' privacy."

Ai, who is one of the most well-known critics of China's extensive system of online censorship, said the U.S. should not take advantage of its technological power, saying it could encourage other nations to do the same.

The documents Snowden leaked provided information on how the NSA collects and monitors telephone records and Internet content. Washington officials, who have confirmed the programs, have said they are not being misused and are necessary to stop terrorist attacks.

## Chinese Media Focus on Snowden Leaks, US Spy Programs

June 13, 2013 5:01 AM

The front pages of Chinese state media were covered Thursday with the allegations of ex-CIA analyst Edward Snowden, who says the U.S. government has been hacking computers in China for years.

Snowden is currently holed up in Hong Kong after leaking top-secret documents that exposed surveillance programs carried out by the National Security Agency, where he had also worked as a contractor.

The 29-year-old on Wednesday told a newspaper in Hong Kong that he plans to stay in the former British colony and fight efforts to bring him back to the U.S. for criminal proceedings.

Speaking with the English-language *South China Morning Post*, Snowden said the NSA has been hacking computers in Hong Kong and mainland China since 2009. He said targets include public officials, businesses and the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

"We hack network backbones - like huge Internet routers, basically - that give us access to the communications of hundreds of thousands of computers without having to hack

every single one," said Snowden.

He said the NSA has undertaken over 61,000 hacking operations globally, including hundreds in China and Hong Kong. U.S. officials have not yet commented on the accusations.

### **Leaks put US in 'awkward position'**

Snowden's claims were the top story on most of China's major news outlets Thursday, including on the front page of the Chinese-language version of the Communist Party-controlled *Global Times*.

The official *China Daily* also prominently featured a piece quoting Chinese analysts who said Snowden's revelations are "certain to stain Washington's overseas image and test developing Sino-U.S. ties."

### **Related - NSA Leaks Could Be Significant**

The exposure of the Internet surveillance program puts the U.S. in the "awkward position of having to explain itself to its citizens and the world," according to Li Haidong, a researcher of American studies at China Foreign Affairs University.

"For months, Washington has been accusing China of cyber espionage, but it turns out that the biggest threat to the pursuit of individual freedom and privacy in the U.S. is the unbridled power of the government," Li told the paper.

### **Beijing could use leaks as propaganda win?**

Until now, Chinese officials and newspapers on the mainland had stayed relatively quiet on the issue. But its increased prominence Thursday suggests Beijing is willing to use Snowden's revelations of the U.S. surveillance programs as a propaganda victory.

The development could particularly complicate Washington's efforts to hold China accountable for alleged widespread Chinese cyber espionage and theft against U.S. targets. It could also provide ammunition for Beijing to defend its own massive domestic surveillance efforts.

### **Related - Obama, Xi Discuss Cybersecurity**

The U.S. spy programs have already been criticized by some privacy and civil rights advocates in China, including dissident artist Ai Weiwei, one of the most prominent critics of China's extensive system of online censorship.

In a Tuesday opinion piece in *The Guardian*, Ai said the U.S. initiatives are "abusively using government powers to interfere in individuals' privacy."

"There is no guarantee that China, the U.S. or any other government will not use the information falsely or wrongly. I think especially that a nation like the U.S., which is technically advanced, should not take advantage of its power. It encourages other nations," said Ai.

The documents Snowden leaked provided information on how the NSA collects and monitors telephone records and Internet content. Washington officials, who have confirmed the programs, have said they are not being misused and are necessary to stop terrorist attacks.

## Snowden Charges Further Complicate US-China Ties

June 13, 2013 9:41 AM

BEIJING—China's state media have pounced on comments from former CIA analyst Edward Snowden that the U.S. government has been hacking computers in China for years, giving the issue prominent coverage. But when the Chinese foreign ministry was asked about the accusations Thursday, the response was slightly more muted.

State run Chinese media is reporting allegations from whistleblower Snowden that U.S. cyber attacks will weaken U.S.-China relations and stain Washington's image overseas.

When asked about Snowden's charges, China's Foreign Ministry spokeswoman Hua Chunying declined to comment specifically on his case, but reminded reporters that China also is a victim of cyber attacks. She said China strongly advocates cyber security and wants to carry out cooperation to maintain peace. Hua also said China will carry out constructive dialogue with the international community about cyber security.

### Muted reaction

Snowden's leaks came just days after a U.S./China summit in California, where U.S. President Barack Obama and Chinese President Xi Jinping agreed to form a working group on cyber security. Wang Dong, a Professor of International Relations at Peking University, said China's government likely will react cautiously to Snowden's charges. "President Xi Jinping and President Obama just had a very successful and very historic meeting in California. And they had talked over a broad range of issues, and agreed to build a new type of power relationship," said Wang.

Snowden claims the United States has been launching cyber attacks against Hong Kong and China since 2009, hacking universities, businesses, government officials and Chinese citizens in Hong Kong and the mainland.

### Whistleblower on the run

Snowden left the U.S. for Hong Kong in late May, where he said he has full faith in the local legal system and vows to resist extradition.

The state-run *China Daily* newspaper cites analysts saying the news of U.S. hacking could pose a challenge to growing good will between the two nations and that the Sino-U.S. relationship is constantly soured on cyber security.

Wang Dong said Snowden's allegations will effect U.S. China talks on cyber security and may put the United States on the defense going forward. "It will shift the balance in the sense that the U.S. government, the American media and others have been accusing China of doing this, and that and all of a sudden you have to defend your own record

about that.”

Snowden remains in hiding in Hong Kong after checking out of a hotel Monday morning in the city’s Kowloon District.

## FBI: Criminal Investigation Launched into NSA Leaks

June 14, 2013 6:41 AM

The director of the U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation, Robert Mueller, is vowing to take swift action against the former CIA analyst who has confessed to leaking documents exposing a pair of top secret government surveillance programs.

Speaking to lawmakers Thursday, FBI chief Mueller confirmed that a criminal investigation has been opened into the leaks, which he said have dealt a blow to U.S. national security.

"These disclosures have caused significant harm to our nation and to our safety. We are taking all necessary steps to hold the person responsible for these disclosures."

He did not mention the name of the confessed leaker, Edward Snowden, who is currently in Hong Kong, from where he has vowed to fight any attempt to extradite him to the U.S. to face charges.

Mueller defended the surveillance programs, saying they are a legal and crucial tool in preventing terrorist attacks. He said their disclosure could prompt potential terrorists to change their behavior and become more difficult to track.

General Keith Alexander, the head of the National Security Agency, says the programs carried out by his agency have helped foil dozens of terrorist attacks. Lawmakers say the NSA will soon present details on this claim.

Meanwhile, Snowden, an ex-NSA contractor, continues to speak with media outlets from Hong Kong. In his latest interviews, Snowden has moved beyond criticizing the domestic spying programs, and is now also focusing on what he says are widespread U.S. hacking attempts against foreign targets.

On Wednesday, he told the *South China Morning Post* the NSA has been hacking computers in Hong Kong and mainland China since 2009, with targets including public officials, businesses and the Chinese University of Hong Kong.

The revelation threatens to further complicate relations between China and the United States, which have already been trading increasingly fierce accusations on cyber hacking and espionage.

For the second straight day, Chinese state media, which often reflect official opinion, devoted a considerable amount of coverage to the issue.

An editorial in the Communist Party-controlled *Global Times* said Beijing deserves an

explanation from the U.S. on the alleged hacking attempts. It said Chinese officials should try to acquire more information from Snowden and "use it as evidence to negotiate with the U.S."

So far, there is no evidence Beijing officials have sought out any such information from Snowden, who is in an unknown location in Hong Kong, a semi-autonomous sovereign territory of China.

But the editorials now suggest Beijing would be willing to use the leaks to deflect pressure from Washington, which had attempted to hold China accountable for its alleged hacking attacks on U.S. targets.

A series of recent private and official reports have accused Chinese hackers of stealing information, ranging from the designs for dozens of top U.S. weapons systems to other trade secrets and commercial data that would benefit Chinese businesses.

## Americans Weigh Balance Between Privacy, Security

June 14, 2013 9:49 AM

Americans found out this week that intelligence agencies are tracking nearly every phone call they make. While some lawmakers and experts believe it's necessary to prevent terrorist attacks, others worry that the country's intelligence apparatus has grown too large.

Americans still only have a sketchy idea of how the phone surveillance program works and what it has achieved.

After a closed door meeting with the head of the National Security Agency, the chairman of the House Intelligence Committee, Mike Rogers, promised that details of how the phone surveillance program prevented terrorist attacks would be revealed in the coming days.

"So that the American public can see the full spectrum of successes of these programs, while protecting civil liberties and privacy," said Rogers. "You can do both."

Rogers said the program doesn't monitor phone conversations, but looks for patterns in the "metadata," that is, information on time, date, and numbers called. He labeled the former government contractor who leaked the surveillance program a traitor and rebuked those who consider him a hero.

The individual, Edward Snowden, also disclosed that American Internet companies have been giving the NSA information on foreigners suspected of terrorism.

The disclosure of these programs follows reports that U.S. journalists have had their phones tapped and that the nation's intelligence apparatus has grown to comprise around five million people with high-level security clearances.

Representative John Conyers of Michigan expressed his misgivings at a House Judiciary Committee hearing. "It's my fear that we are on the verge of becoming a surveillance

state, collecting billions of electronic records on law-abiding Americans every single day," said Conyers.

Testifying at the hearing, FBI Director Robert Mueller said all surveillance is conducted in full compliance with the law and with oversight from Congress and the courts.

He said the phone data mining program could have caught the men who carried out the September 11, 2001, terrorist attacks, because one of them - who was believed to be in the Far East - had actually been placing calls from San Diego to an al-Qaida safe house in Yemen.

"If we had had this program in place, at the time, we would have been able to identify that particular telephone number in San Diego," Mueller said.

The failure of intelligence agencies to pick up the trail of the hijackers who flew planes into the World Trade Center and the Pentagon has led to an overreach that is now being corrected, said Rudy deLeon, a national security expert at the Center for American Progress.

"So the pendulum is constantly moving and I think right now between our leaders in Congress, between the president and between the leaders on the national security side, we're having an appropriate debate on where that pendulum rests right now," he added.

But Steve Bucci of the Heritage Foundation worries that the outcome of the debate could weaken America's defenses.

"That we might back off, in my opinion, too much, and therefore make ourselves more vulnerable in the long term as well by taking some of these tools out of the hands of our intelligence apparatus so that we in the long term can't stop people we might have stopped before," said Bucci.

On Wednesday, the NSA chief, Gen. Keith Alexander, said that the phone surveillance program had prevented dozens of terrorist attacks, both in the U.S. and abroad, but declined to give details.

## Britain Asks Airlines to Block US NSA Leaker Snowden

June 14, 2013 11:46 AM

Britain has asked airlines worldwide to block American Edward Snowden, who leaked details of U.S. government telephone and internet surveillance programs, from boarding any plane headed for the United Kingdom, the Associated Press reported on Friday.

The Associated Press, in a report out of Bangkok, said British officials confirmed a travel alert from its Home Office issued on Monday, telling airlines to deny Snowden from boarding because "the individual is highly likely to be refused entry to the UK."

Snowden, a former U.S. National Security Agency (NSA) contractor who traveled to Hong Kong before the programs were made public, revealed on Sunday that he was behind leaked information describing the American government's surveillance efforts.



Various airlines in Thailand, Malaysia and Singapore confirmed the alert, according to the AP, which said it learned of the British letter to airlines from a photograph of the request seen at an airport in Thailand.

A spokeswoman for the Hong Kong Airport Authority said it has not received any notice from British authorities requesting that airlines block Snowden.

Snowden has said he plans to stay in Hong Kong to fight any effort to bring him back to the United States to face charges.

A spokesman for Britain's Home Office declined to comment on the AP report as did a spokesman for British Prime Minister David Cameron. U.S. officials could not be immediately reached for comment.

Cathay Pacific Airways Ltd declined to confirm the British request or the AP report, saying it was "inappropriate" to discuss government communications. Other airlines could not be immediately reached or had no immediate comment.

The British alert was issued by the UK Border Agency's Risk and Liaison Overseas Network, the AP report said.

## Hong Kongers Rally in Support of Snowden

June 16, 2013 7:15 AM

HONG KONG—Hundreds of people rallied in Hong Kong Saturday in support of former U.S. government contractor Edward Snowden, who fled to the semi-autonomous Chinese city last month after confessing to leaking documents on two top secret U.S. surveillance programs. To many, the case raises questions about Snowden's choice of Hong Kong as a haven as he fights an expected legal battle against extradition, and the broader implications regarding the secrets he has revealed.

Amid monsoon rains in the city where Snowden remains in hiding, hundreds of Hong Kongers, expatriates and tourists marched on the U.S. Consulate.

Participants delivered a letter for Ambassador Stephen Young, condemning U.S. cyber monitoring activities exposed by the former security consultant who fled Hawaii May 20.

Teacher's Union representative Tsui Hon-kwong compared Snowden's case to that of Chinese dissident Shi Tao.

"In 2004, Shi Tao blew the whistle and told the world that the Chinese government had given secret instructions to all the press in China that nothing about June 4 commemoration [the 1989 crackdown in Beijing's Tiananmen Square] must be reported," said Tsui. "The Chinese government got his name from Yahoo. Many Americans supported Shi Tao. I suppose it is our turn this time to support this American who is undergoing the same ordeal."

Snowden recently told a Hong Kong newspaper that the United States has been hacking local and mainland targets since 2009.

Charles Mok is a legislator and information technology expert. Snowden's revelations,

he said, risk allowing Beijing to legitimize its Great Firewall and other cyber-monitoring activities within and beyond China.

"I hope that in the end we are not going to see people justify totalitarian regimes snooping on their own people, just because even the Americans are doing it," he said. "I do not deny that there is a certain need of security and monitoring that needs to go on, but where do we strike the balance and what is the right level of transparency?"

From the U.S. Consulate, protesters continued on to Hong Kong government headquarters to deliver another letter. Organizer Tom Grundy appeared delighted by the turnout, which he estimated at 900, in contrast to a police figure of 300.

"I think Hong Kongers reactions are a mix of bewilderment and pride that Ed Snowden chose Hong Kong. You can see we have hundreds of people here - 28 groups - which is unprecedented for Hong Kong," he said.

Last year though, more than 100,000 people gathered outside these same offices in protest against the imposition of Chinese patriotism classes in Hong Kong. Just two weeks ago, another 60,000 gathered for the annual vigil in memory of the Chinese government's June 1989 crackdown on student protesters in Tiananmen Square.

Marchers blew whistles and chanted, "No Way NSA." Some, though, voiced concern that organizers had missed the broader debate emanating from Snowden's disclosure that U.S. Internet companies have been providing the National Security Agency, or NSA, information on foreigners suspected of terrorism.

Professor Francis Borchardt has lived in Hong Kong for two years. The U.S. citizen stood in the rain listening to the speeches, his three-year-old daughter perched on his shoulders.

"I'm a little bit disappointed with the way the organizers framed the whole issue," he said. "The issue for me at least is much broader. It's about the surveillance state and about keeping tabs on how that is progressing and how it is continually intruding on our lives. Just talking about this one NSA issue, just talking about Edward Snowden, yeah, it's important, but it's not the whole story."

Snowden is reported to have fled to Hong Kong because of the city's civil and political freedoms. YK Law, director of Hong Kong Human Rights Monitor, questioned that decision.

The former British colony has an extradition treaty with the U.S., he explained, and in 2004 forcibly deported a Libyan dissident, allegedly at the request of U.S. and U.K. authorities.

Law also warned that since the resumption of Chinese sovereignty in 1997, Beijing can legally intervene in Hong Kong matters related to national security and foreign affairs.

"So if the Chinese authorities intervene, then Hong Kong will have very little role to play [in Snowden's potential extradition]. I think China will probably see it as a good opportunity to embarrass the States, and they will be happy to see that dragging on," said Law.

As the march concluded, Hong Kong's Beijing-appointed leader, Leung Chun-ying, released a statement promising his government would handle Snowden's case in accordance with local law.

While the director of the U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation, Robert Mueller, is vowing to take swift action against Snowden, by Saturday night, the U.S. had yet to initiate proceedings to extradite the 29-year-old confessed leaker. This past week, Mueller told lawmakers that a criminal investigation has been opened into the leaks, which he said have dealt a blow to U.S. national security.

## Report: NSA Leaker Denies Contact with Chinese Government

June 17, 2013 2:03 PM

The British newspaper *The Guardian* says a former U.S. intelligence contractor who recently exposed some U.S. surveillance operations has denied he had any contact with the Chinese government.

The newspaper said Edward Snowden made the comment Monday in a live question and answer session with Internet users, hosted on *The Guardian* website. Snowden has been hiding in the autonomous Chinese territory of Hong Kong since leaking U.S. intelligence documents to several newspapers earlier this month.

Former U.S. Vice President Dick Cheney denounced Snowden as a "traitor" in a Sunday television interview, warning that the former National Security Agency contractor could provide classified U.S. information to Chinese authorities.

In Monday's online interview, Snowden is quoted as calling Cheney's assertion a "predictable smear" and saying that being labeled a "traitor" by the former vice president "is the highest honor you can give an American."

Snowden's comments could not be independently verified.

Chinese Foreign Ministry spokeswoman Hua Chunying also denied that Snowden has spied for China, calling the suggestion "complete nonsense."

In her Monday briefing, Hua urged U.S. authorities to pay attention to international concerns about their surveillance operations and provide what she called a "necessary explanation." It was the first comment by a Chinese official on the NSA leaks.

In another part of the online interview, *The Guardian* quoted Snowden as saying U.S. intelligence analysts have the ability to view the content of U.S. citizen phone and e-mail communications without a warrant, provided that they label such data collection as "incidental" to the search for suspected terrorists.

Snowden also criticized other U.S. political figures including President Barack Obama, senior members of Congress and Director of National Intelligence James Clapper. He accused them of colluding to expand a "suspicion-less surveillance" operation that he described as an abuse of human rights.

The former NSA contractor did not mention any specific cases of U.S. intelligence operatives viewing private communications of Americans and did not give any examples of alleged rights abuses by those operatives.

Some U.S. officials and lawmakers have accused Snowden of damaging national security by tipping off U.S. enemies about previously-secret surveillance programs and enabling them to change tactics. Snowden rejected that charge, saying "I did not reveal any U.S. operations against legitimate military targets."

Snowden fled to Hong Kong last month and has vowed to use its British-rooted legal system to fight any attempt to extradite him to the United States. The U.S. Federal Bureau of Investigation has said Snowden is under criminal investigation but it has not filed any charges against him or asked for his extradition.

In an earlier report Monday, *The Guardian* said documents leaked by Snowden show that Britain spied on diplomats attending the 2009 Group of 20 summit in London.

The newspaper said Britain's eavesdropping agency, the General Communications Headquarters or GCHQ, hacked into the phones and computers of Turkish and South African delegates at the summit. It said the GCHQ also tricked some G-20 delegates into using Internet cafes that it secretly modified to intercept diplomatic communications.

*The Guardian* published redacted versions of some of the documents, but their authenticity could not be immediately confirmed. Their release coincided with Britain hosting the first day of a Group of Eight industrialized nations summit in Northern Ireland.

## Obama Defends NSA Spying Programs

June 18, 2013 7:51 AM

U.S. President Barack Obama is defending the government's top-secret surveillance programs, while acknowledging widespread concerns the efforts are violating the privacy rights of ordinary Americans.

In a television interview broadcast late Monday on PBS, Obama insisted the National Security Agency is operating its phone and Internet monitoring efforts within the law.

The president has been under fire since last week's revelations of the NSA programs by the British newspaper *The Guardian* and *The Washington Post*. He says he has ordered intelligence officials to release as much information as possible "without further compromising the program."

Obama also said he has created a privacy and civil liberties oversight board to review the NSA efforts.

Earlier Monday, a report published in *The Guardian* said documents obtained from former U.S. intelligence contractor Edward Snowden, the man who exposed the NSA programs, show that Britain spied on diplomats attending the 2009 Group of 20 summit in London.

The newspaper said Britain's eavesdropping agency, the General Communications Headquarters or GCHQ, hacked into the phones and computers of Turkish and South

African delegates at the summit. It said the GCHQ also tricked some G-20 delegates into using Internet cafes that it secretly modified to intercept diplomatic communications.

*The Guardian* published redacted versions of some of the documents, but their authenticity could not be immediately confirmed. Their release coincided with Britain hosting the first day of a Group of Eight industrialized nations summit in Northern Ireland.

Meanwhile, in a live online question and answer session hosted on *The Guardian* website, Snowden was quoted as saying U.S. intelligence analysts have the ability to view the content of U.S. citizen phone and e-mail communications without a warrant.

But Snowden did not mention any specific cases of U.S. intelligence operatives viewing private communications of Americans and did not give any examples of alleged rights abuses by those operatives.

Snowden has been hiding in the autonomous Chinese territory of Hong Kong since leaking the information about the NSA spying programs earlier this month. During the online session, he denied speculation that he had any contact with the Chinese government.

Some U.S. officials and lawmakers have accused Snowden of damaging national security by tipping off U.S. enemies about previously-secret surveillance programs and enabling them to change tactics.

## US Pressure on China Over Hacking to Remain

June 18, 2013 9:08 AM

Analysts say the recent leaks exposing top-secret U.S. surveillance programs may benefit China temporarily, but will not likely sway Washington from putting more pressure on Beijing to stop alleged Chinese cyber hacking against U.S. targets.

The leaks by former U.S. intelligence contractor Edward Snowden came at an opportune time for China, just before U.S. President Barack Obama planned to prominently raise the issue of Chinese cyber hacking during a summit in California.

The original documents leaked by Snowden had little to do with China. They detailed a pair of classified domestic surveillance programs by the U.S. National Security Agency, under which authorities collected and monitored phone records and Internet usage.

Subsequent leaks by Snowden, who has fled to Hong Kong to fight extradition, revealed the NSA has been secretly spying on Chinese targets for years. That accusation prompted an angry reaction from China's state-controlled media.

The Communist Party-controlled *Global Times* newspaper on Monday published an editorial calling for Hong Kong, a semi-autonomous sovereign territory of China, to not extradite Snowden.

It also praised him as a hero who exposed the U.S. government's "violation of civil rights."

The *Global Times*, which often expresses official viewpoints, has also called for Beijing

officials to meet directly with Snowden in order to obtain more intelligence information that could be used during future negotiations with the United States.

Such comments suggest China will use Snowden's information to deflect diplomatic pressure from Washington, which has attempted to hold China accountable for a series of high-profile cyber hacking attempts originating from its soil.

But there is not yet any evidence that Snowden has directly provided sensitive intelligence to Chinese officials. In a question-and-answer session in *The Guardian* newspaper on Monday, Snowden denied having had any contact with the Chinese government.

Jeffrey Reeves with Hawaii's Asia-Pacific Center for Security Studies says that such assurances have done little to calm the fears of U.S. intelligence officials, since Snowden has promised to reveal more information in the coming days.

"I think absolutely there is a lot of concern from the FBI now that's investigating how much access he actually had," he said. "And people from the NSA are very concerned that he could potentially have quite damaging information."

But Steven Lewis, a China scholar with Houston's Rice University, said it is unlikely Snowden is in direct contact with the Chinese government, given its official reaction.

"If he was actually being run as a spy, and it was viewed as an exceptionally sensitive thing by the Chinese government, I do not think the *Global Times* would be allowed to speculate on that issue," he said.

Lewis says the leaks may have embarrassed the United States and made it more difficult for Obama to raise the issue of cyber attacks during his talks with Xi. But he doubts whether it will hamper U.S. efforts to raise the issue in the future.

William Martel, a professor of international security studies at Boston's Tufts University, agrees. He says that the United States will have no problem keeping up the pressure, as long as allegations of widespread Chinese cyber hacking continue to appear in the headlines.

"I think it takes a little pressure off China at this point, but long-term, if in fact, as many allege, that China has been engaging in cyber spying and hacking, the pressure and scrutiny will continue," he said.

President Obama echoed that sentiment in [an interview that aired Monday on "The Charlie Rose Show" on PBS television](#). Obama said the Chinese have understood his "very blunt" message that cyber attacks have the potential to "adversely affect the fundamentals of the U.S.-China relationship."

## Iceland Says It Received Informal Snowden Asylum Inquiry

June 18, 2013 11:34 AM

REYKJAVIK—Iceland has received an informal approach from an intermediary who says Edward Snowden, the former National Security Agency contractor who exposed the U.S.

government's secret surveillance programs, wants to seek asylum there.

Snowden, the former employee of contractor Booz Allen Hamilton who worked in an NSA facility in Hawaii, made world headlines after providing details of the program to *the Guardian* and *Washington Post* and then fleeing to Hong Kong.

In a column in Icelandic daily *Frettabladid*, WikiLeaks spokesman Kristinn Hrafnsson wrote that a middleman had approached him on behalf of Snowden.

“On 12 June, I received a message from Edward Snowden where he asked me to notify the Icelandic government that he wanted to seek asylum in Iceland,” Hrafnsson, who is also an investigative journalist in Iceland, told Reuters.

The Icelandic government, which has refused to say whether they would grant asylum to Snowden, confirmed it had received the message from Hrafnsson.

“Kristinn Hrafnsson has contacted two ministries in an informal way but not the ministers. There has been no formal approach in this matter,” a government spokesman said.

Hrafnsson declined to name the go-between to Reuters. Snowden has mentioned Iceland as a possible refuge.

Iceland has a reputation for promoting Internet freedoms, but Snowden has said did not travel there immediately from the United States as he feared the country of only 320,000 could be pressured by Washington.

“Iceland could be pushed harder, quicker, before the public could have a chance to make their feelings known, and I would not put that past the current U.S. administration,” Snowden said in an online forum in *the Guardian* on Monday.

WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, holed up in the Ecuadorian embassy in London to avoid extradition to Sweden for questioning over allegations of sex crimes, visited Iceland several times in the run-up to some of the website's major releases. Assange denies any wrongdoing.

## NSA Chief: More Than 50 Potential Terrorist Acts Prevented

June 18, 2013 11:54 AM

CAPITOL HILL—Top National Security Agency and Federal Bureau of Investigation officials say newly revealed surveillance programs have helped to stop more than 50 terrorist attacks in 20 countries around the world. The officials delivered a strong defense of the exposed surveillance programs to the House Select Committee on Intelligence, saying they are essential to national security and have not violated any laws or Americans' privacy rights.

FBI Deputy Director Sean Joyce outlined four terrorist plots that he said were foiled with the help of the top secret surveillance programs. Joyce said the NSA discovered one of

the plots while monitoring a known extremist in Yemen who was in contact with an operative in Kansas City, Missouri.

"We found through electronic surveillance that they were actually in the initial stages of plotting to bomb the New York Stock Exchange," Joyce said.

Joyce said those involved in the plot were arrested and later convicted. Joyce also said an NSA intercept of an e-mail from a terrorist in Pakistan in 2009 led authorities to Najibullah Zazi, who later pleaded guilty to a plot to bomb New York City's subway system.

Joyce said the program also linked an American citizen, David Headley, in Chicago to the 2008 terror attacks in Mumbai, India and to a plot to bomb the offices of a Danish newspaper that published a cartoon of the Prophet Muhammad. Joyce said the FBI would release details of more than 50 thwarted plots to the House and Senate intelligence committees in a classified setting, but not in an open hearing because of security concerns.

NSA chief Keith Alexander told the congressional panel U.S. intelligence officials were criticized after the September 11, 2001 attacks for "not connecting the dots" on pieces of information, and he said the surveillance programs are providing those dots. Alexander sought to answer concerns about privacy, saying the surveillance programs are limited and properly supervised throughout the process.

"Let me start by saying that I would much rather be here today debating this point than trying to explain how we failed to prevent another 9/11," Alexander said.

The intelligence officials stressed that no phone calls can be monitored without a court order. But some lawmakers expressed concern about the collection of ordinary Americans' phone records. Democratic Congressman James Himes said the recent disclosures by NSA contractor Edward Snowden still trouble him.

"They trouble me because of the breadth and the scope of the information collection. They trouble me because I think this is historically unprecedented in the extent of the data that is being collected on potentially all American citizens," Himes said.

Another congressman, Democrat Adam Schiff, suggested that perhaps changes could be made to the Patriot Act provisions, so that telecommunications companies could collect and store Americans' phone records instead of the government, and the government could ask for access to a specific individual's records only when there are substantial suspicions of a terrorist connection.

## NSA Leak Could Prompt Re-Analysis of Data Collection

June 20, 2013 12:36 PM

Recent disclosures about how the U.S. National Security Agency collects information for top-secret surveillance programs could prompt U.S. intelligence agencies to reconsider their data-collection processes and who has access to the information.



Heritage Foundation foreign policy studies director Steven Bucci said any time there is a leak or breach of sensitive intelligence information, it triggers a complete re-examination of the intelligence-gathering process.

He told VOA's *Encounter* program he is certain this is the response to information leaked by former National Security Agency (NSA) contractor Edward Snowden.

"It is not a Draconian 'let's go out and look for heads' kind of process. It is very much a bureaucratic let's go through all the rules, and see who did what," said Bucci.

He said the goal is to figure out what went wrong and prevent it from happening again.

"It's an appropriate response for a big organization to try to figure out how they could have stopped this thing from going wrong before it happens again," he said.

Intelligence officials and some members of Congress said Snowden put America at risk when he turned over information about secret data-mining programs to *The Washington Post* and *The Guardian* newspapers.

At the time, Snowden was employed as a technology expert for Booz Allen Hamilton, a private firm working under a contract with the NSA.

Rudy de Leon, a national security vice president at the Center for American Progress and a former deputy secretary of defense, said Snowden's actions will most likely prompt government agencies and contractors to re-think who has access to what.

"I'm sure those that gave this gentleman a clearance are now going through and doing an auditing to figure out exactly what went wrong," said de Leon.

De Leon said the U.S. has checks and balances in place to ensure that government surveillance programs designed to go after terrorists do not infringe on the rights and privacy of ordinary Americans.

He said investigators will want to know what prompted Snowden to disregard these safeguards.

"I think any time an individual who is in a position of trust believes that he or she is more important than the judiciary or the legislator or the executive branch in terms of making these decision, then I think that individual has got to be questioned just in terms of upholding the duties that he agreed to take on when he went to work for this contractor," said de Leon.

Snowden's leaks about the collection of phone and Internet data, as part of the government's efforts to prevent terrorism, have triggered hearings on Capitol Hill.

At a House Intelligence Committee hearing, Congressman Dutch Ruppersberger called for changes in how workers who have access to sensitive information are monitored.

"We need to change our systems and practices and employ the latest in technology that will alert superiors when a worker tries to download and remove this type of information. We need to seal this crack in the system," he said.

De Leon said when it comes to the U.S. government's role of balancing the need to protect citizens against the need to respect their rights and privacy, "the pendulum is constantly moving."

He said Americans expect the government to find a way to balance these important priorities.

Bucci said he fears that a public backlash against intelligence data-mining will force U.S. surveillance agencies to back off too much -- a move that he says could make the U.S. more vulnerable in the long run.

## US Seeks Snowden's Extradition, Urges Hong Kong to Act Quickly

June 22, 2013 4:41 PM

WASHINGTON—

The United States pressured Hong Kong on Saturday to act quickly on its request to extradite Edward Snowden, a former U.S. National Security Agency contractor charged with espionage for exposing secret U.S. surveillance activities.

"If Hong Kong doesn't act soon, it will complicate our bilateral relations and raise questions about Hong Kong's commitment to the rule of law," a senior Obama administration official told Reuters, speaking on condition of anonymity.

Sources say Snowden, who has been hiding in Hong Kong, has sought legal representation from human rights lawyers as he prepares to fight attempts to force him back to the United States to face trial.

U.S. National Security Adviser Tom Donilon told CBS News the United States had a "good case" against Snowden and expected Hong Kong to comply with its 1998 extradition treaty with the United States.

"We have gone to the Hong Kong authorities seeking extradition of Snowden back to the United States," Donilon said.

He added that U.S. law enforcement officials were in a "conversation" with Hong Kong authorities about the issue.

"Hong Kong has been a historically good partner of the United States in law enforcement matters and we expect them to comply with the treaty in this case," Donilon said.

A senior U.S. law enforcement source said extradition "can, of course, be a lengthy legal process" but expressed optimism that Snowden would be extradited.

The South China Morning Post said on Saturday that Snowden was not detained or in police protection - as reported elsewhere - and instead was in a "safe place" somewhere in Hong Kong.

The paper also quoted Snowden offering new details about U.S. spy activities, including accusations of U.S. hacking of Chinese mobile phone companies.

"The NSA does all kinds of things like hack Chinese cellphone companies to steal all of your SMS (texting) data," Snowden was quoted by the Post as saying during a June 12 interview.

Documents previously leaked by Snowden revealed that the NSA has access to vast amounts of internet data such as emails, chat rooms and video from large companies such as Facebook and Google, under a government program known as Prism.

They also showed that the government had worked through the secret Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Court to gather so-called metadata - such as the time, duration and telephone numbers called - on all calls carried by service providers such as Verizon.

On Friday, the Guardian newspaper, citing documents shared by Snowden, said Britain's spy agency GCHQ had tapped fiber-optic cables that carry international phone and internet traffic and is sharing vast quantities of personal information with the NSA.

### **Espionage charges**

The United States charged Snowden with theft of government property, unauthorized communication of national defense information and willful communication of classified communications intelligence to an unauthorized person, according to the criminal complaint made public on Friday.

The latter two offenses fall under the U.S. Espionage Act and carry penalties of up to 10 years in prison.

Scores of Americans have been sent back home from Hong Kong to face trial under the extradition treaty. But the process can take years, lawyers say, and Snowden's case could be particularly complex.

America's use of the Espionage Act against Snowden has fueled debate among legal experts about whether that could complicate his extradition, since the treaty includes an exception for political offenses and Hong Kong courts may choose to shield him from prosecution.

**Snowden says he leaked the details of the classified U.S. surveillance to expose abusive and illegal programs that trampled on citizens' privacy rights.**

President Barack Obama and his intelligence chiefs have vigorously defended the programs, saying they are regulated by law and that Congress was notified. They say the programs have been used to thwart militant plots and do not target Americans' personal lives.

Stephen Vladeck, a professor at American University's Washington College of Law who studies national security issues, said there is no clear definition of what constitutes a political offense under the treaty.

"My intuition says it'll be easier for Snowden to argue espionage is a political offense than (the U.S. charge of) theft of government property," Vladeck said.

The South China Morning Post reported on Saturday that Snowden said he had

documents showing NSA had hacked major Chinese telecoms companies to access text messages and targeted China's top Tsinghua University.

The NSA program also hacked the Hong Kong headquarters of Pacnet, which has an extensive fiber-optic network, the paper said.

## NSA Leaker Snowden Leaves Hong Kong

June 23, 2013 4:58 AM

The *South China Morning Post* is reporting that U.S. whistle-blower Edward Snowden has left Hong Kong on a flight to Moscow, heading to a third destination.

The paper said the Aeroflot flight carrying the former National Security Agency contractor left Hong Kong Sunday morning and is scheduled to arrive in Moscow after 5 p.m. (1400 UTC).

Various media reports have said that Snowden could take refuge in either Iceland or Ecuador. A spokesman for Iceland's Interior Ministry told VOA Friday that Snowden has not formally applied for asylum, and that such requests would need to come from someone who is already in that country.

On Saturday, White House officials said Washington had asked Hong Kong to extradite Snowden, who is facing espionage charges for exposing secret U.S. surveillance programs.

National Security Adviser Tom Donilon cited an extradition treaty and historically good diplomatic ties with the semi-autonomous Chinese city and said, "We expect them [Hong Kong authorities] to comply with the treaty in this case." But the Hong Kong government said Sunday that the extradition request did not fully comply with legal requirements.

Earlier Saturday, a senior administration official warned that any failure on the part of Hong Kong to act on the U.S. request will "complicate our bilateral relations."

The White House pressure came less than 24 hours after U.S. prosecutors unsealed a criminal complaint Friday charging Snowden with espionage and the theft of government property.

The secret NSA documents leaked to reporters earlier this month show the agency and other U.S. intelligence units have gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use at home and abroad.

Snowden says his actions were based on a belief that it is important to reveal massive surveillance of private citizens.

Senior U.S. officials say the surveillance does not monitor phone conversations, but looks for patterns in the metadata, including information on the time, date and numbers called.

Authorities say those measures have prevented at least 50 terrorist plots worldwide since the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. They also say Snowden's actions

have weakened their ability to foil future plots.

## Report: NSA Leaker to Fly to Venezuela After Leaving HK

June 23, 2013 9:45 AM

The former U.S. intelligence contractor wanted by the United States for leaking classified information flew from Hong Kong to Moscow on Sunday, and Russia's state news agency says he will fly on to Cuba and then Venezuela in a bid for political asylum.

Edward Snowden had been in hiding in Hong Kong since leaving the United States last month and releasing documents that indicated the extent of U.S. monitoring of telephone and Internet communications. He had said he would stay and fight extradition in Hong Kong, but left after the U.S. Justice Department unsealed espionage charges against him.

The Russian news agency, ITAR-Tass, quoted Aeroflot as saying Snowden was due to fly from Moscow to the Cuban capital Havana on Monday, before taking another flight to the Venezuelan capital, Caracas. The website Wikileaks said it was supporting Snowden in his attempt to seek asylum.

Venezuela is one of Latin America's strongest critics of U.S. foreign policy, but the two countries maintain diplomatic relations. There was no immediate word from the Venezuelan government about whether it would grant asylum to Snowden.

The United States had asked Hong Kong to extradite Snowden last week, after charging him with espionage and theft of U.S. government property for providing newspapers with classified documents about U.S. surveillance programs. The government of the autonomous Chinese region said the 30-year-old was free to leave Sunday because the U.S. extradition request did not fully comply with Hong Kong legal requirements.

The U.S. Justice Department issued a statement saying it will continue to discuss the matter with Hong Kong and pursue "relevant law enforcement cooperation" with other countries where Snowden may be attempting to travel.

Anti-secrecy organization WikiLeaks said its legal advisors and unnamed diplomats accompanied Snowden on his flight out of Hong Kong. It said Snowden had requested the group's legal expertise and experience to secure his safety.

WikiLeaks said it will help Snowden to find political asylum in what it called a "democratic nation."

U.S. National Security Adviser Tom Donilon said Saturday Washington expected [Hong Kong authorities] to arrest and extradite Snowden on the basis of a bilateral agreement. A senior U.S. administration official warned that any failure on the part of Hong Kong to act on the U.S. request will "complicate...bilateral relations."

The former contractor for the U.S. National Security Agency leaked documents showing that U.S. intelligence services have gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use at home and abroad.

Snowden told several newspapers that he exposed the programs because he believes they violate the rights of private citizens.

Senior U.S. officials have said the surveillance programs do not monitor the content of phone conversations, but look for patterns in the metadata, including information on the time, date and numbers called.

U.S. authorities also have said the programs prevented at least 50 terrorist plots worldwide since the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. They also have accused Snowden of weakening their ability to foil future plots.

## Snowden's Flight Raises Legal Questions for Hong Kong

June 23, 2013 1:00 PM

HONG KONG—The Hong Kong government says former security contractor Edward Snowden departed the semi-autonomous Chinese city just hours after the U.S. government requested his extradition. Questions are raised about Snowden's flight.

After a day of media speculation and government silence, Hong Kong leader Leung Chun-ying confirmed Edward Snowden left the southern Chinese city of his own accord early Sunday for a third-party country.

Snowden, who is under FBI investigation for revealing secret U.S. National Security Agency surveillance operations, had been in hiding in Hong Kong since fleeing Hawaii May 20.

Despite the extradition agreement between Hong Kong and Washington, Leung said Snowden departed "through a lawful and normal channel," and the United States had been informed.

Speaking to local public broadcaster RTHK, Hong Kong University Law Professor Eric Cheung questioned the legality of Snowden's free passage.

"The Hong Kong government needs to explain to the U.S. why it allowed Snowden to leave, not withstanding their surrender request," he said. "Hong Kong needs to give a satisfactory explanation, otherwise the [United] States might accuse Hong Kong of being in breach of its treaty obligations."

China political expert Willy Lam suggests Snowden's presence has been a headache for the local government, which answers to Beijing but has close ties to Washington.

"I would not be surprised if Snowden was encouraged to leave so Hong Kong would be spared a potentially acrimonious legal battle with the United States, if, as is highly possible, it was the intention of the Chinese government not to surrender him," said Lam.

Snowden boarded an Aeroflot flight to Moscow. Reports suggest he will subsequently travel to Venezuela by way of Cuba.

Explaining why Hong Kong authorities had not prevented the fugitive's departure, Leung

said the U.S. government provided insufficient information to process an arrest warrant.

Hong Kong Democratic Party chairman Emily Lau is skeptical. She suspects Leung was acting at Beijing's behest, and is concerned about the ramifications for Hong Kong citizens.

"The fact CY Leung dare not say anything for so long shows that he was waiting for orders from Beijing," she said. "The Americans may want to punish us [for instance, by] by not giving us visa-free treatment that is something Hong Kong has been fighting for."

U.S. officials say National Security Agency computer and telephone monitoring operations have foiled at least 50 terrorist plots.

Leung concluded his statement by demanding Washington clarify Snowden's allegation that Hong Kong computer systems have been hacked by U.S. agencies.

## US Presses Russia to Turn Snowden Over

June 23, 2013 2:12 PM

The U.S. says it is pressuring Russia to expel an intelligence contractor to the United States to face espionage charges for his disclosure of clandestine American surveillance programs.

In his secretive hide-and-seek run for asylum, Edward Snowden had been booked on a Monday flight from Moscow to Havana, with his possible eventual destination Ecuador, where he is seeking asylum. But the flight to the Cuban capital left with no sign of him on board.

WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, whose secret-disclosing organization is assisting Snowden, said the American fugitive is safe, but declined to disclose where he is.

White House spokesman Jay Carney said the U.S. has frequently returned criminal suspects to Russia and said it expected to Russia to turn over the 30-year-old Snowden to American authorities.

Carney criticized China for what he said was Beijing's "deliberate choice" to allow Snowden to fly Sunday from Hong Kong to Moscow. He said the Chinese decision "unquestionably" damaged relations between the U.S. and China.

U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry, on a visit to India, said U.S. authorities "don't know, specifically, where [Snowden] may head, or what his intended destination may be."

Ecuador's foreign minister, Richard Patino, said at a news conference in Vietnam that Snowden had asked for asylum but he "can't give information on Snowden's whereabouts." Patino said his government has been in contact with Moscow.

Kerry said it "would be deeply troubling" for Hong Kong and Russia to allow Snowden to continue his international journey to escape prosecution in the U.S.

National Security Council spokeswoman Caitlin Hayden says the White House is disappointed that Snowden was allowed to leave Hong Kong despite a "legally valid"

request for his arrest. The statement early Monday says the United States has registered "strong objections" with authorities in Hong Kong and the Chinese government. Assange said Snowden had a "refugee document of passage" from the Ecuadorian government before leaving Hong Kong.

Ecuador says it is analyzing Snowden's request for asylum. Patino said it would consider the asylum request based on the "principles of its constitution."

Quito has often criticized U.S. foreign policy, and Patino noted that the U.S. has refused in the past to extradite "fugitive bankers...who have hurt the interests of many Ecuadorians."

U.S. officials say Snowden's passport was revoked before he left Hong Kong for Moscow. The government has advised countries where Snowden may pass through or serve as his final destination that he is wanted on felony charges and should not be allowed to travel internationally.

Ecuador has sheltered Assange at its London embassy for the past year to prevent his possible extradition to the Sweden where he is under investigation for sexual assault. His lawyers say Assange fears he will be sent to the United States in connection with the group's publication of secret U.S. diplomatic cables in 2010.

Snowden leaked documents showing that U.S. intelligence services have gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use. He said he believes the programs violate the privacy rights of citizens.

A senior administration official sharply criticized Snowden's motives, saying his focus on transparency and individual rights "is belied by the protectors he has potentially chosen." The official listed China, Russia, Cuba, Venezuela and Ecuador, saying Snowden's failure to criticize those governments shows his "true motive" was to harm U.S. national security.

Senior U.S. officials have said the surveillance programs do not monitor the content of phone conversations, but look for patterns in the metadata, including information on the time, date and numbers called.

U.S. authorities also have said the programs prevented at least 50 terrorist attacks worldwide since the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. They have accused Snowden of weakening their ability to foil future plots.

## US Officials React to Travels of Elusive Intel Leaker

June 23, 2013 3:08 PM

U.S. officials and lawmakers are reacting with shock and indignation to news that a fugitive former U.S. intelligence contractor arrived in the Russian capital after being allowed to depart Hong Kong. News reports from Moscow say Edward Snowden intends to travel to Cuba with a possible final destination of Ecuador.

Earlier this month, Snowden leaked classified U.S. intelligence information concerning domestic surveillance of telephone and Internet communications. He then fled to Hong



Kong.

The Obama administration sought his arrest and eventual extradition to the United States for prosecution. Authorities in Hong Kong reportedly objected to the paperwork filed, and allowed his departure for Moscow.

Congressman Mike Rodgers, chairman of the House Intelligence Committee, said "Well, it is concerning."

Speaking on NBC's *Meet the Press* television program he said, "It appears as of today that he [Snowden] will catch another flight from Moscow, many believe to Cuba - we know there is air traffic from Moscow to Cuba. Every one of those nations is hostile to the United States."

Rogers says the Obama administration should use "every legal avenue" to bring Snowden back to the United States.

Appearing on CBS' *Face the Nation* program, Democratic Senator Dianne Feinstein agreed. "I want to get him caught and brought back for trial," she said.

Feinstein said she worries that Snowden may reveal more U.S. secrets unless he is apprehended. U.S. officials say great damage has already been done.

The director of the U.S. National Security Agency, General Keith Alexander, appeared on ABC's *This Week* program. "What Snowden has revealed has caused irreversible and significant damage to our country and to our allies," he said.

Snowden's actions contradict any claim he may have to being a heroic whistleblower, according to Republican Senator Lindsey Graham, who spoke on *Fox News Sunday*. "The 'freedom trail' is not exactly China-Russia-Cuba-Venezuela. So I hope we will chase him to the ends of the earth," he said.

Snowden told reporters his conscience dictated that he reveal the true scope of U.S. information-gathering activities.

## Kerry Warns of 'Consequences' for Aiding Snowden

June 24, 2013 9:31 AM

NEW DELHI, INDIA—U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry says there will be consequences for countries helping former U.S. intelligence analyst Edward Snowden avoid arrest for disclosing secret details of the U.S. government's surveillance of telephone and Internet activities.

Kerry says it would be "deeply troubling" if authorities in Russia or Hong Kong had adequate notice and willfully ignored U.S. efforts to gain custody of Snowden following espionage indictments.

"There would be, without any question, some affect, an impact on the relationship and consequences. With respect to Russia, likewise," he said.

Kerry is urging Moscow to live up to the law because he says that is in everyone's interest.

"In the last two years, we have transferred seven prisoners to Russia that they wanted. So I think reciprocity in the enforcement of the law is pretty important," said Kerry.

**Snowden traveled from Hong Kong to Moscow, despite a U.S. extradition request.** Kerry said when countries ignore legal standards they invite other countries to do the same, raising what he calls a "serious question for all of us in our relationships."

With Snowden seeking asylum in Ecuador with possible travel through Cuba and Venezuela, Kerry said all appropriate countries have been notified as to his legal status. But he said the Obama administration knows there are some countries that historically "play outside of that process."

Speaking to reporters in New Delhi following talks with Indian Foreign Minister Salman Khurshid, Kerry defended the surveillance program at the center of Snowden's disclosures.

"We take painstaking efforts, sometimes at the expense of endangering ourselves, to protect the rights of people," he said.

**Snowden leaked documents showing U.S. intelligence services gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use. He said he believes the programs violate the privacy rights of citizens.**

Khurshid echoed Obama administration justifications the program does not monitor content.

"To get access to content of communications is one thing. And being able to study by way of computer software patterns of communications, whether that is emails or telephone calls, is two different things," said Khurshid.

U.S. authorities say the programs have prevented at least 50 terrorist attacks worldwide since the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. Kerry said it is an important part of keeping Americans safe.

"This is a dangerous and complicated world we all live in. And I believe that the program the United States has pursued is a very judicious balance of civil rights, civil liberties, but also of the right of people to live free from being killed by terrorists and the right we have to be able to protect people in the effort to do that," said Kerry.

Kerry again questioned Snowden's motives, mockingly asking if he chose China and Russia as part of his "flight from justice because they are such powerful bastions of Internet freedom."

# Hong Kong Leader Defends Role in Letting NSA Leaker Flee

June 24, 2013 10:18 AM

Hong Kong's leader has defended his role in allowing a fugitive former U.S. intelligence contractor to leave the territory on Sunday despite demands by Washington for the American's extradition.

Hong Kong Chief Executive Leung Chun-ying said Monday there was "no legal basis" to stop Edward Snowden from leaving the city while authorities were processing the U.S. extradition request and "asking (Washington) for further important information" on the case.

The former U.S. National Security Agency contractor faces U.S. charges of espionage for disclosing clandestine American surveillance programs.

U.S. National Security Council spokesperson Caitlin Hayden said Sunday Washington is "disappointed" by the decision to permit Snowden to flee Hong Kong. She said the United States had submitted a "legally valid" request to Hong Kong to arrest him for purposes of extradition under a bilateral agreement.

Hayden also said Washington registered "strong objections" to Hong Kong authorities and the Chinese government and noted that such behavior is "detrimental" to U.S.-Hong Kong and U.S.-China relations.

Leung acknowledged what he called "expressions of displeasure" from some authorities in the United States.

But, he insisted Snowden's departure from Hong Kong as a "normal passenger" on a Russian flight to Moscow was lawful.

"This is a good example to illustrate 'one country, two systems', Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong, and the high degree of autonomy that we have," said Leung. "It is also a good example to illustrate the rule of law that we uphold and the procedural fairness and justice that we uphold."

Under the one country-two systems concept, Hong Kong has autonomy on social and economic affairs but Beijing exercises authority over matters of foreign policy and defense.

A U.S. official told Western news agencies on Sunday that Washington revoked Snowden's passport the day before to try to prevent him from traveling beyond Hong Kong, where he had been in hiding for a month since fleeing his home in Hawaii. Leung said Hong Kong authorities had not received any U.S. documents showing that Snowden's passport was invalid.

Hong Kong anti-establishment lawmaker Albert Ho disputed Leung's suggestion that the government handled the Snowden case independently.

Ho said he met with Snowden to offer legal advice and learned that a "middleman" had urged the American to depart the city, promising safe passage to a third country. The

lawmaker said Hong Kong officials declined to tell him anything about the safe passage offer, leading him to suspect the middleman acted on the orders of Beijing, leaving the city's government with little say in the matter.

Ho is a longtime critic of perceived Chinese government interference in Hong Kong affairs.

Some analysts said it appears that China orchestrated Snowden's exit to avoid a potentially lengthy legal battle in Hong Kong over the U.S. extradition request. They said Beijing wants to prevent the case from becoming an additional irritant in its already testy relationship with Washington.

Chinese Foreign Ministry spokeswoman Hua Chunying said Monday that Beijing "respects" the Hong Kong government's handling of Snowden. She gave no details about any role the Chinese government might have played in the case.

## Alleged NSA Snooping Target is One of China's Internet Hubs

June 24, 2013 10:24 AM

BEIJING—China's Tsinghua University, revealed by an American spy agency contractor to be a target of U.S. surveillance programs, is home to the country's oldest Internet hub and routes traffic from tens of millions of users.

The alma mater of many of China's top leaders including President Xi Jinping and former President Hu Jintao, Tsinghua's campus in northwestern Beijing hosts the China Education and Research Network (CERNET), one of China's six major backbone networks, according to state media.

"Tsinghua is known as the 'MIT of China'," said Duncan Clark, chairman of Beijing-based technology consultancy BDA, referring to the premier U.S. university, the Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

"It has strong research and technical capabilities," Clark told Reuters in e-mailed comments. "It also produces a lot of the nation's future elite [in government and business]. So it's not surprising, I guess, that it's a target."

The university did not respond to requests for comment.

But, in an interview with the Communist Party-backed Beijing Youth Daily, an unnamed official from Tsinghua's information department denied that it was the target of a U.S. cyber attack, saying that "reports that Tsinghua was hacked into are inaccurate".

On Saturday, Hong Kong's South China Morning Post newspaper said documents and statements from the contractor, Edward Snowden, indicated the NSA had hacked major Chinese telecoms companies to access text messages, attacked Tsinghua University, and hacked the Hong Kong headquarters of Pacnet, which has an extensive fiber optic submarine network.

**Snowden, who is wanted by the United States government, fled Hong Kong on Sunday**

to Moscow. He has asked for asylum in Ecuador.

Set up in 1994, CERNET was designed to provide Internet services to China's educational institutions, according to its web site. It connects 160 cities in China and more than 2,000 of China's universities and research institutes, including Beijing's other top university, Peking University, and Shanghai's Jiaotong University.

CERNET, which is operated by China's ministry of education, says on its website that it is China's "largest non-profit computer network and hosts the world's largest national academic network".

Luo Ping, a professor of Internet security at Tsinghua, said he had warned in research papers about U.S. attacks on China's backbone networks about five to six years ago.

"Those of us who do network security have known very early on that the National Security Agency has entered the backbone networks in China," Luo said. He did not however specifically comment on Snowden's claims.

In 2007, local media reported that Tsinghua's network had sustained large-scale virus attacks in 2006 and again in 2007, affecting over 10,000 computers on campus. The university was forced to shut down many infected computers to contain the virus.

"I believe they've taken some measures, but are still relatively weak," Luo said.

China on Sunday expressed "grave concern" over Snowden's allegations that the United States has hacked into Tsinghua and Chinese mobile network companies, and said it had taken the issue up with Washington.

When asked why Tsinghua could have been targeted by the United States, foreign ministry spokeswoman Hua Chunying said at a regular briefing on Monday that she was "not in a position to answer this question".

"Ask the party who conducted the attacks," Hua said.

Both China and the United States accuse each other of cyber attacks and the issue was top of the agenda when President Barack Obama hosted Xi at their first summit earlier this month.

China later said it wanted cooperation rather than friction with the United States over cyber security.

## Obama: US Using All Legal Channels to Capture Snowden

June 24, 2013 3:25 PM

U.S. President Barack Obama says the United States is using "all the appropriate legal channels" to try to apprehend the fugitive intelligence contractor who disclosed clandestine American surveillance programs.

The White House on Monday said it believes Edward Snowden is in Russia and is pressuring Moscow to expel him to face espionage charges in the United States.

In his secretive hide-and-seek run for asylum, Snowden had been booked on a Monday flight from Moscow to Havana, with his possible eventual destination Ecuador, where he is seeking asylum. But the flight to the Cuban capital left with no sign of him on board.

WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, whose secret-disclosing organization is assisting Snowden, said Snowden is safe, but he declined to disclose where he is.

White House spokesman Jay Carney said the U.S. has frequently returned criminal suspects to Russia, and said it expects Russia to turn over the 30-year-old Snowden to American authorities.

"Given our intensified cooperation with Russia after the Boston Marathon bombings, and our history of working with Russia on law enforcement matters, including returning numerous high-level criminals back to Russia at the request of the Russian government, that we do expect the Russian government to look at all the options available to them to expel Mr. Snowden back to the United States," he said.

Carney criticized China for what he said was Beijing's "deliberate choice" to allow Snowden to fly Sunday from Hong Kong to Moscow. He said the Chinese decision "unquestionably" damaged relations between the U.S. and China.

U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry, on a visit to India, said U.S. authorities "don't know, specifically, where [Snowden] may head, or what his intended destination may be."

The diplomat told VOA that the programs Snowden divulged have damaged U.S. counterterrorism efforts, and could cost lives.

"This man just took real information and put it out there because he happens to believe something that is not in fact justified by the facts. I think he has put counterterrorism at risk. He has put individuals at risk. And it may well be that lives will be lost in the United States because terrorists now have knowledge of something they need to avoid that they did not have knowledge of before he did this," he said.

Ecuador's foreign minister, Richard Patino, said at a news conference in Vietnam that Snowden has asked for asylum but he "can't give information on Snowden's whereabouts." Patino said his government has been in contact with Moscow.

Kerry said it "would be deeply troubling" for Hong Kong and Russia to allow Snowden to continue his international journey to escape prosecution in the U.S.

National Security Council spokeswoman Caitlin Hayden says the White House is disappointed that Snowden was allowed to leave Hong Kong despite a "legally valid" request for his arrest. The statement early Monday says the United States has registered "strong objections" with authorities in Hong Kong and the Chinese government. Assange said Snowden had a "refugee document of passage" from the Ecuadorian government before leaving Hong Kong.

Ecuador says it is analyzing Snowden's request for asylum. Patino said Ecuador would consider the asylum request based on the "principles of its constitution."

Quito has often criticized U.S. foreign policy, and Patino noted that the U.S. has refused

in the past to extradite "fugitive bankers...who have hurt the interests of many Ecuadorians."

U.S. officials say Snowden's passport was revoked before he left Hong Kong for Moscow. The government has advised countries where Snowden may pass through or serve as his final destination that he is wanted on felony charges and should not be allowed to travel internationally.

Ecuador has sheltered Assange at its London embassy for the past year to prevent his possible extradition to Sweden where he is under investigation for sexual assault. His lawyers say Assange fears he will be sent to the United States in connection with the group's publication of secret U.S. diplomatic cables in 2010.

Snowden leaked documents showing that U.S. intelligence services have gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use. He said he believes the programs violate the privacy rights of citizens.

A senior administration official sharply criticized Snowden's motives, saying his focus on transparency and individual rights "is belied by the protectors he has potentially chosen." The official listed China, Russia, Cuba, Venezuela and Ecuador, saying Snowden's failure to criticize those governments shows his "true motive" was to harm U.S. national security.

Senior U.S. officials have said the surveillance programs do not monitor the content of phone conversations, but look for patterns in the metadata, including information on the time, date and numbers called.

U.S. authorities also have said the programs prevented at least 50 terrorist attacks worldwide since the September 11, 2001 attacks on the United States. They have accused Snowden of weakening their ability to foil future plots.

## US Accuses China of Letting Snowden Flee

June 24, 2013 3:30 PM

The White House has accused the Chinese government of deliberately allowing a fugitive former U.S. intelligence contractor to flee Hong Kong, despite U.S. demands for the American's extradition.

White House spokesman Jay Carney said Edward Snowden's Sunday journey from Hong Kong to Moscow on a Russian passenger plane "unquestionably" has a "negative impact" on U.S.-China relations.

The former U.S. National Security Agency contractor faces U.S. charges of espionage for disclosing clandestine American surveillance programs.

Speaking to reporters on Monday, Carney said Washington believes Beijing made a "deliberate choice" to let Snowden leave Hong Kong in spite of what the spokesman called a "valid" U.S. arrest warrant.

Earlier in the day, Hong Kong Chief Executive Leung Chun-ying said there was "no legal basis" for local authorities to stop Snowden from departing while they were processing

the U.S. extradition request and "asking [Washington] for further important information" on the case. Leung said authorities also did not receive any documents showing that Snowden's U.S. passport had been revoked.

Chinese Foreign Ministry spokeswoman Hua Chunying said Beijing "respects" the Hong Kong government's handling of Snowden. She gave no details about any role the Chinese government might have played in the case.

Carney rejected the notion that Snowden's departure was merely a "technical decision" by a Hong Kong immigration official.

"I can say that the Hong Kong authorities were advised of the status of Mr. Snowden's travel documents in plenty of time to have prohibited his travel as appropriate. I think I did reflect our concern and disappointment in the failure to act by Hong Kong authorities, as well as the fact that we do not buy the suggestion that China could not have taken action," said Carney.

A U.S. official told Western news agencies on Sunday that Washington revoked Snowden's passport the day before to try to prevent him from traveling beyond Hong Kong, where he had been in hiding for a month since fleeing his home in Hawaii.

Leung acknowledged what he called "expressions of displeasure" from some authorities in the United States. He insisted, however, Snowden's departure from Hong Kong as a "normal passenger" on a Russian flight to Moscow was lawful.

"This is a good example to illustrate 'one country, two systems,' Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong, and the high degree of autonomy that we have. It is also a good example to illustrate the rule of law that we uphold and the procedural fairness and justice that we uphold," he said.

Under the one country-two systems concept, Hong Kong has autonomy on social and economic affairs, but Beijing exercises authority over matters of foreign policy and defense.

Hong Kong anti-establishment lawmaker Albert Ho disputed Leung's suggestion that the government handled the Snowden case independently.

Ho said he met with Snowden to offer legal advice and learned that a "middleman" had urged the American to depart the city, promising safe passage to a third country. The lawmaker said Hong Kong officials declined to tell him anything about the safe passage offer, leading him to suspect the middleman acted on the orders of Beijing, leaving the city's government with little say in the matter.

Ho is a longtime critic of perceived Chinese government interference in Hong Kong affairs.

Some analysts said it appears that China orchestrated Snowden's exit to avoid a potentially lengthy legal battle in Hong Kong over the U.S. extradition request. They said Beijing wants to prevent the case from becoming an additional irritant in its already testy relationship with Washington.



# Kerry: Lives May be Lost Due to Snowden's Betrayal

June 24, 2013 6:13 PM

NEW DELHI—U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry warns there will be consequences for countries that help former U.S. intelligence contractor Edward Snowden avoid arrest for disclosing secret details of U.S. government surveillance of telephone and Internet activities.

With Snowden on the run from Hong Kong, Secretary of State John Kerry said there will be consequences for countries that help him escape U.S. justice.

"All appropriate countries have been notified with respect to the status, his status, legally, and that is the appropriate step to take, to put them on notice that he is an indicted fellow, he is an indicted individual, indicted with three felony accounts and that he is wanted by the legal process of the United States," said Kerry.

Ecuador is considering Snowden's asylum request. Foreign Minister Ricardo Patiño said Snowden believes he would not receive a fair trial in the United States.

"The man who intended to expose acts that affects the fundamental liberties of all people now finds himself persecuted by those very people who should offer an explanation to the governments and the citizens of the world regarding the claims made by Mr. Snowden," said Patiño.

But in an interview with VOA, Kerry said Snowden has put counterterrorism at risk.

"He has put individuals at risk. And it may well be that lives will be lost in the United States because terrorists now have knowledge of something that they need to avoid that they didn't have knowledge of before he did this," said Kerry.

Snowden supporters say he is standing up for the right to privacy and exposing government misconduct in the collection of phone and Internet records.

"All governments, most governments do it, and China does it, the U.S. is doing it. So I think what he did was actually a very brave thing. He was willing to give up everything for that," said John Wakefield.

Kerry told VOA that Snowden is not a whistleblower like those who helped expose secret U.S. policies during the Vietnam War.

"He has betrayed his country because he took an oath. He swore that he would uphold the secrecy. He was given access to documents based on that trust and he violated that trust. And he hasn't violated it in any way similar, nothing similar to Daniel Ellsberg or somebody who was revealing a government who is actually lying or that had a completely distorted view of something going on. This man just took real information and put it out there because he happens to believe something that is not in fact justified by the facts," he said.

In an interview with the *Guardian* newspaper, Snowden said he wanted to help people decide for themselves if the surveillance is warranted.

"I think that the public is owed an explanation of the motivations behind the people who made these disclosures that are outside of the democratic model," said Snowden.

But Kerry says the surveillance program protects the right to live free from terrorism.

## Ecuador, Unusual Destination for Free Press Asylum Seeker

June 24, 2013 8:43 PM

In asking for political asylum from the government of Ecuador, NSA leaker Edward Snowden seems to be contradicting his earlier statement that he would look for a country that believes in protecting free speech and global privacy. The South American country's democratic but increasingly authoritarian government has been criticized by human rights groups for imprisoning journalists and political opponents.

Ecuador's Foreign Minister Ricardo Patiño says his government will consider Snowden's request for asylum because of the risk of persecution from the government of the United States.

"The state will consider the request, but also will consider some important international principles under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights," said Patiño.

On one hand, it is understandable why Edward Snowden, who leaked details of a top secret U.S. surveillance program, would look to Ecuador for asylum. Last year, Ecuador granted asylum to WikiLeaks' founder Julian Assange, who remains in that country's embassy in London. He is under extradition from Sweden on rape charges. Assange and Wikileaks have been assisting Snowden in avoiding extradition to the U.S. on charges of espionage.

Ecuador's President Rafael Correa has been a harsh critic of Washington, and these asylum cases could enhance his international stature. Carl Meacham, the director of the Americas Program at the Center for Strategic and International Studies in Washington, says the Ecuadorian leader wants to be seen on the same level as the Castros in Cuba and the late Hugo Chávez in Venezuela.

"The countries in the world that don't like the United States, what it stands for, that they would see him as a leader in that effort to say these things that are negative and point out faults with American foreign policy," said Meacham.

Even though President Correa obtained a doctorate in economics from the University of Illinois, he is critical of what he calls U.S. imperialism and capitalism. The president describes himself as a Christian Leftist, and defaulted on foreign loans he said were "illegitimate." He closed a U.S. airbase in Ecuador, saying the U.S. could keep the base if Ecuador could operate a similar base in Miami.

But on the other hand, Ecuador is an unusual destination for advocates of free speech, transparency and human rights. The opposition in Ecuador has accused President Correa of dictatorial policies. Reporters Without Borders criticized the president for shutting down several broadcasting outlets that were critical of the government. José Miguel Vivanco, with Human Rights Watch says Ecuador recently passed some of the

most restrictive media laws of any democratic country in the world, laws that ironically forbid the media from disseminating classified information.

“The case of Ecuador is unique in the region in terms of standards that imposed prior censorship on the media, even creates an environment for self-censorship and criminal punishment for journalists or anyone who cross the line,” said Vivanco.

While espionage and treason are not covered under Ecuador’s extradition treaty with the U.S., the United States does have some economic leverage. Ecuador relies on the U.S. for 45 percent of its exports. Under the Andean Trade Preferences Act, it is allowed to ship many goods duty free. Congress must soon vote to renew the program, but could opt to exclude Ecuador if its leaders give Snowden asylum.

## Spying Revelations Affect US-China Cyber Security Talks

June 25, 2013 3:40 AM

As the United States increases pressure on Russia to extradite fugitive intelligence contractor Edward Snowden, experts in China and Hong Kong - Snowden’s first choice of refuge - are beginning to gauge what impact his revelations will have on the ongoing efforts for global cyber security.

Before boarding a plane to Moscow, the former National Security Agency contractor told the Hong Kong-based South China Morning Post that the intelligence agency was monitoring telecommunications within China, and had targeted Tsinghua University, one of Beijing’s most prestigious schools, famous for training many of China’s current top leaders.

The school runs one of China’s six Internet backbones, the China Education and Research Network, through which the data of millions of people pass.

Benjamin Koo, a professor at Tsinghua’s department of mechanical engineering, says Snowden’s allegations, if true, suggest that the United States may have access to a huge amount of personal and academic data.

“This would be a severe violation of privacy to say the least,” he said. “Not to say [a violation of] intellectual property and also the ideas that we might want to keep to ourselves.”

Snowden’s allegations come ahead of next month’s U.S.-China Strategic and Economic Dialogue, S&ED, where cyber security will be a prominent issue.

Since 2011 the Obama administration has named China as the source of a significant amount of cyber attacks against American government agencies and businesses.

This year the Department of Defense has for the first time officially attributed these attacks directly to the Chinese government, or agencies within China’s military apparatus.

In response, the Chinese government has repeated statements saying that China is itself

a victim of attacks, with officials at China's internet security agency, CNCERT, linking many of those attacks to the United States.

Many analysts within China agree that government-backed cyber surveillance is a standard occurrence in a country that is defending its interests in the digital age.

"If the NSA is funding a big program to do this, I would imagine - based on proportion - there will be a lot of politicians on our side that would be saying we should be putting a lot of money into it too," says Koo, "Whoever is holding the lower end in this game is not going to feel comfortable."

Media reports have linked some research centers in China, including Beijing's Tsinghua University, to Chinese military-backed training centers for cyber-warfare against Western targets.

Nicholas Thomas, Associate Professor at the Department of Asian and International Studies of City University of Hong Kong, says that China has been very active in pursuing asymmetric warfare capacity.

"This is a lesson going back 20 years," he says. "China has realized that U.S. information warfare capacity far exceeded its own and could prove to be the decisive factor in any conflict."

But apart from cyber attacks for military and intelligence purposes, the United States has blamed China for stealing intellectual property from U.S. businesses as well.

A report released in the United States earlier this year calculated a loss of hundreds of billions of dollars each year due to Chinese hacking into commercial entities in the United States.

Analysts say that the report, which was published before the informal meeting in California between President Barack Obama and President Xi Jinping, increased the level of public pressure on Mr. Obama to raise the issue during those talks.

Wu Riqiang, professor of international relations at Beijing's Renmin University, says that it is unlikely that recent revelations about NSA spying on China will have a substantial impact on next month's discussions on cyber security during the S&ED.

At the same time, Wu believes that Snowden has put the United States in an awkward position.

"The Snowden affair might dilute the attention that people in the United States put on hacking for economic motives," he says.

Tsinghua University professor Benjamin Koo says that the allegations of the United States spying on academic centers in China is going to open up new territory in the two countries' discussion on cyber security.

"It makes the two countries stand on the same footing," he says.

# Russia Denies Involvement in Snowden's Affairs

June 25, 2013 6:13 AM

MOSCOW—Russia's foreign minister Sergei Lavrov says the Kremlin has had no role in the affairs of former U.S. National Security Agency contractor, Edward Snowden, and is not conspiring to help him evade prosecution in the United States.

Lavrov said Snowden independently chose his own route - apparently referring to Snowden's reported departure from Hong Kong - emphasizing that Russia heard about it from the media.

Lavrov said Snowden has not crossed the border into Russia and the Kremlin thinks the attempts by the United States to make it seem like Russia is violating U.S. law are unfounded and unacceptable.

Lavrov's comments are the first official reaction from the Kremlin since Snowden allegedly flew from Hong Kong to a Moscow airport on Sunday. Reporters have not seen Snowden, but he is believed to be in the airport's transit zone.

Washington says Snowden is in Russia and has been pressuring Moscow to expel him and send him back home so he can face charges of espionage.

Lavrov said Russia is not violating any laws stressing that there are no legal grounds for Washington's behavior and claims.

Tensions between Moscow and Washington have risen lately. Both sides disagree on several important issues including missile defense, Syria, child adoptions and now Snowden.

Later Tuesday, Secretary of State John Kerry said the United States is not looking for a confrontation with Russia and called for "calm and reasonableness" in the Snowden situation.

## Putin: Snowden in Transit Zone and Will Not Be Extradited

June 25, 2013 1:52 PM

Russian President Vladimir Putin says former American intelligence contractor Edward Snowden is in the transit zone of a Moscow airport, but will not be extradited to the United States.

Speaking during a visit to Finland, Putin dismissed allegations Russia is breaking the law in the case as "nonsense and rubbish." He said Russia does not have an extradition agreement with the United States.

Snowden is wanted by the United States for revealing a pair of top secret U.S. surveillance programs and other confidential intelligence, but Putin says he has not broken any laws in Russia. He said Snowden is a free man and the sooner he chooses

a final destination the better.

He also said Snowden has never worked with Russian security agencies.

Putin said he hopes the affair will not affect relations with Washington.

Earlier Tuesday, Secretary of State John Kerry said the United States is not looking for a confrontation and called for "calm and reasonableness" in the Snowden situation.

Snowden flew Sunday to Moscow from Hong Kong, where he had been in hiding.

Ecuador's foreign minister says Snowden has asked for asylum in his country and his government has been in contact with Moscow.

Earlier, Russian Foreign Minister Sergei Lavrov denied Russian involvement in Snowden's plans.

"He independently chose his route, and we learned as did everyone else from the mass media," he said. "He did not cross the Russian border, and we think all of the attempts that we are now witnessing, attempts to accuse the Russian side of violating U.S. law and almost conspiring, accompanied by threats towards us are totally unfounded and unacceptable."

On Monday the White House blasted Beijing for "deliberately" allowing Snowden to leave Hong Kong, despite a valid warrant for his arrest. It said the move "unquestionably" damaged U.S.-China relations.

Beijing Foreign Ministry spokesperson Hua Chunying denied the U.S. accusations.

"U.S. allegations against China are baseless," said Hua. "China's position over bilateral relations is clear. It is to the interest of both parties to preserve and strengthen dialogue and cooperation, control disputes and friction, work to bring more progress."

## Kerry: US Not Looking for Confrontation with Russia over Snowden

June 25, 2013 2:52 PM

JEDDAH, SAUDI ARABIA—U.S. Secretary of State John Kerry says Washington is not looking for a confrontation with Moscow over former U.S. intelligence analyst Edward Snowden. Snowden is in Russia avoiding arrest for disclosing secret details of U.S. government surveillance of telephone and Internet activities.

A day after warning Russia of "consequences" for helping Snowden, Secretary Kerry said there is no need to "raise the level of confrontation."

He is trying to downplay the diplomatic standoff, after Russian Foreign Minister Sergei Lavrov called accusations of Russia violating U.S. laws or conspiring with Snowden "absolutely baseless and unacceptable." Lavrov says Moscow has nothing to do with Snowden "or with his issues with American law enforcement."

Speaking to reporters in Saudi Arabia, Kerry said that while there is no extradition treaty between Russia and the United States there are what he called "standards of behavior between sovereign nations."

"There is respect for rule of law," said Kerry. "And we would simply call on our friends in Russia to respect the fact that a partner nation, a co-member of the permanent five of the United Nations, has made a normal request under legal systems for law to be upheld."

Kerry says the Obama administration hopes Russia does not see its interests as siding with a person who he calls "a fugitive from justice according to international standards of law."

"They do not have to enforce the law, but they certainly can allow him to be subject to the laws of our land and our constitution, which he is a citizen of," said Kerry. "And that is what we call on them to do. We are not looking for a confrontation. We are not ordering anybody."

He says the United States is "simply requesting under a very normal procedure for the transfer of somebody" just as Kerry says the United States transferred to Russia seven people in the past two years.

"Without any clamor. Without any rancor," said Kerry. "Without any argument and according to our sense of the appropriateness of meeting their request. And that is what we would hope they will reciprocate with here today."

Meanwhile Tuesday while visiting Finland, Russian President Vladimir Putin dismissed allegations Russia is breaking the law in the case as "nonsense and rubbish."

Putin said he would not extradite Snowden because he has not broken any laws in Russia. He said Snowden is a free man and the sooner he chooses to move on from a Moscow airport transit area, the better for him and Russia.

Putin said Snowden has never worked with Russian security agencies and he hopes the affair will not affect relations with Washington.

Snowden leaked documents showing that U.S. intelligence services have gathered data for years about patterns of telephone and Internet use. He said he believes the programs violate the privacy rights of citizens.

Snowden is facing charges of theft of government property, unauthorized communication of national defense information, and the willful communication of classified intelligence information to an unauthorized person, each of which carries a maximum 10-year sentence.

## Can Pressure Bring Snowden to US?

June 25, 2013 8:12 PM

The U.S. government is accusing Edward Snowden of espionage for leaking classified information about American surveillance programs.

Ariel Cohen, with the Heritage Foundation, said this is a huge embarrassment for the Obama administration, given the security breach.

“Somebody with so much access is allowed to just board the plane carrying, allegedly, four laptops with him and skipping to Hong Kong - that is a failure of security of enormous proportions.”

Snowden did not stay in Hong Kong as Chinese authorities allowed him to leave for Moscow.

White House spokesman Jay Carney strongly criticized that decision.

“This was a deliberate choice by the government to release a fugitive, despite a valid arrest warrant and that decision unquestionably has a negative impact on the U.S.-China relationship,” he said.

### **Washington urges Moscow to expel Snowden to US**

Carney also urged Russian officials to expel Snowden to the United States.

But Charles Kupchan, with Georgetown University, says in China and Russia, there are domestic political pressures to help Snowden.

“There is a certain frustration and impatience with American lecturing about domestic freedoms, the lack of democracy, domestic surveillance - and now, all of a sudden, the United States has been shown carrying out its own surveillance,” said Kupchan. “I think there is a certain amount of what one might call ‘schadenfreude’ - enjoyment on behalf of others of the plight that the United States finds itself in.”

Some analysts are asking what the United States can do to pressure Moscow to expel Snowden.

“There are lots of issues in play with the Russians from Iran to Afghanistan, to the issue of intelligence cooperation in dealing with extremism, to the question of missile defense and arms control,” said Charles Kupchan. “But does the United States really want to take one of those issues in which it has clear geopolitical interests and tie it to Snowden? I think the answer is that that kind of linkage is problematic.”

As for China, Kupchan said the United States doesn’t want to end up doing things that harm its own interests.

“And in that respect, I don’t think the U.S. has a lot of sharp arrows in its quiver. There is a lot at stake with China and yes, the U.S. can and should express its displeasure with the fact that Hong Kong let Snowden out,” said Kupchan. “But it’s hard to see powerful punishments that don’t in some ways work to the disadvantage of the United States.”

Kupchan says in the final analysis, it is better for the United States to let the Snowden affair run its course.



# Snowden Remains Out of Sight at Moscow Airport

June 26, 2013 7:04 AM

Former American intelligence contractor Edward Snowden spent a fourth day out of public sight at a Moscow airport Wednesday, as U.S. officials continued to pressure Russia to extradite him.

Russian President Vladimir Putin on Tuesday confirmed that Snowden is in the transit zone of Sheremetyevo Airport, but said he had no intention of handing him over to Washington.

Speaking during a visit to Finland, Putin dismissed allegations Russia is breaking the law in the case as "nonsense and rubbish." He said Russia does not have an extradition agreement with the United States.

Snowden is wanted by the United States for revealing a pair of top secret U.S. surveillance programs and other confidential intelligence, but Putin says he has not broken any laws in Russia. He said Snowden is a free man and the sooner he chooses a final destination the better.

He also said Snowden has never worked with Russian security agencies. Putin said he hopes the affair will not affect relations with Washington.

Earlier Tuesday, Secretary of State John Kerry said the United States is not looking for a confrontation and called for "calm and reasonableness" in the Snowden situation.

Snowden flew Sunday to Moscow from Hong Kong, where he had been in hiding. His travel plans are unknown after he failed to show up for a flight he was expected to take from Moscow to Havana, reportedly on his way to seek asylum in Ecuador.

Ecuador's foreign minister says Snowden has asked for asylum in his country and his government has been in contact with Moscow.

# Ecuador Tells US to Send Snowden Position in Writing

June 26, 2013 10:31 AM

WASHINGTON—Ecuador said on Wednesday the United States must "submit its position" regarding Edward Snowden to the Ecuadorean government in writing as it considers the former U.S. spy agency contractor's request for asylum.

Ecuador, in a statement from its embassy in Washington, said it would review the request "responsibly."

"The legal basis for each individual case must be rigorously established, in accordance with our national Constitution and the applicable national and international legal framework. This legal process takes human rights obligations into consideration as well,"

the statement said.

“This current situation is not being provoked by Ecuador,” the embassy said.

Snowden, 30, a former employee of the U.S. contractor Booz Allen Hamilton, appears to be still in hiding at a Moscow airport awaiting a ruling on his asylum request from the tiny South American nation's leftist government.

He fled to the Russian capital from Hong Kong on Sunday, evading a U.S. request that he be extradited to face charges that he stole and leaked details of secret U.S. government surveillance programs.

Ecuadorean President Rafael Correa has not flinched in the past from taking on western powers.

His government is already embroiled in a dispute with Britain and the United States over its sheltering of Wikileaks founder Julian Assange at its embassy in London.

In its statement on Wednesday, the embassy said it “strongly rejects” statements made by U.S. government officials that it said contained detrimental, untrue and unproductive claims about Ecuador. It did not elaborate on those statements.

Ecuador, the statement said, has signed human rights agreements and is committed to the rule of law and the fundamental principles of international law.

## Ecuador: Snowden Decision Could Take Months

June 26, 2013 10:50 AM

Ecuador says it could be several months before it decides whether to grant asylum to a former U.S. intelligence contractor accused by American authorities of espionage for leaking details of clandestine surveillance programs.

Foreign Minister Ricardo Patino on Wednesday compared the case of Edward Snowden, the U.S. fugitive now encamped in the transit zone of a Moscow airport, to that of Julian Assange, co-founder of the secret-disclosing WikiLeaks group whom Ecuador is already harboring in its London embassy.

At a news conference in Malaysia, Patino said it took the Andean nation two months to decide to grant Assange asylum and to not expect it to act any faster on Snowden's asylum bid. He said the country would consider a variety of factors, including whether granting Snowden asylum would hurt trade with the United States, which is seeking Snowden's extradition.

"When we make a decision, we will consider all these risks," he said.

Snowden spent a fourth day out of public sight Wednesday at the Moscow airport, as U.S. officials continued to pressure Russia to extradite him.

Russian President Vladimir Putin on Tuesday confirmed that Snowden is in the transit zone of Sheremetyevo Airport, but said he had no intention of handing him over to Washington, adding that Russia does not have an extradition agreement with the United

States.

Snowden is wanted by the United States for revealing a pair of top secret U.S. surveillance programs and other confidential intelligence, but Putin says he has not broken any laws in Russia. He said Snowden is a free man and the sooner he chooses a final destination the better.

He also said Snowden has never worked with Russian security agencies and that he hopes the affair will not affect relations with Washington.

Secretary of State John Kerry said the United States is not looking for a confrontation and called for "calm and reasonableness" in the Snowden situation.

Snowden flew Sunday to Moscow from Hong Kong, where he had been in hiding. His travel plans are unknown after he failed to show up for a flight he was expected to take from Moscow to Havana, reportedly on his way to seek asylum in Ecuador.

## Obama: 'Significant Vulnerability' at US Spy Agency

June 27, 2013 10:15 AM

U.S. President Barack Obama says the disclosure of the government's clandestine surveillance programs by a former intelligence contractor shows there is a "pretty significant vulnerability" at the secretive National Security Agency.

At a news conference Thursday in Senegal, however, the U.S. leader said he has no intention of "wheeling, dealing and trading" with foreign governments to secure the return of Edward Snowden to stand trial on espionage charges.

Snowden fled to Hong Kong and leaked details of two NSA programs that monitor telephone and Internet communications in the United States. Later Snowden flew to Russia, where he is living in a transit zone at a Moscow airport while seeking asylum in Ecuador.

Obama said he had not called either Chinese President Xi Jinping or Russian President Vladimir Putin to request Snowden's extradition. The president said he "should not have to" and the extradition request should be dealt with through "regular legal channels."

"This is something that routinely is dealt with between law enforcement officials in various countries," said the president.

Putin said Russia does not plan to extradite Snowden to the United States.

If Snowden leaves Russia on a flight to another country, Obama said he has no intention of trying to force down his aircraft to capture him.

"No, I am not going to be scrambling jets to get a 29-year-old hacker," said Obama.

# Swiss to Press US Further on Snowden's Geneva Stint

June 27, 2013 12:23 PM

GENEVA—Switzerland wants to hold further talks with Washington on fugitive Edward Snowden's activities as a CIA operative in Geneva after receiving only a "diplomatic" reply to its initial questions, the Swiss foreign minister said on Thursday.

Snowden, a fugitive former U.S. spy agency contractor who infuriated Washington by leaking details of secret U.S. government surveillance programs worldwide, worked in Geneva between 2007 and 2009.

He remains in limbo at Moscow's Sheremetyevo Airport, where he has been waiting in the transit area since fleeing there from Hong Kong, where he broke cover earlier this month.

"[The Americans] have replied that they have been respecting Swiss laws and they have never done anything particularly problematic," Didier Burkhalter told reporters. "So the reply was very diplomatic, we have taken note of it. We have decided to discuss these points further in the future with the Americans but it's clear that for them there was no problem."

According to the *Guardian* newspaper, which first identified Snowden as the source of the leaks, he had a "formative" experience during his time with the CIA in the Swiss city.

Snowden told the paper that the CIA deliberately got a Swiss banker drunk and encouraged him to drive home. When the banker was arrested, a CIA operative offered to intervene and later recruited him.

Swiss President Ueli Maurer has said he doubts the version of events printed by the *Guardian*, but if prosecutors decided to launch a criminal investigation, the Swiss cabinet would approve such a move as a formality.

## Snowden's Stay in Moscow Souring Relations with US

June 27, 2013 4:46 PM

MOSCOW—Edward Snowden, the fugitive American intelligence leaker, missed another plane to Havana on Thursday. As an overnight stopover in Moscow drags on, Snowden's stay is taking a toll on the U.S.-Russia relationship.

President Obama took time out on a trip to Africa to prod the Kremlin to turn over Snowden.

"My continued expectation is that Russia or other countries that have talked about potentially providing Mr. Snowden asylum recognize that they are part of an international

community, and that they should be abiding by international law," Obama told reporters in Senegal.

Separately, U.S. Defense Secretary Chuck Hagel told reporters in Washington: "I would hope that the Russians do the right thing here and turn Snowden over to the United States. He has broken laws and I think, as far as I know, the decision of the Russian Government, at least a final decision, hasn't been made yet."

American congressmen have come out with a series of statements sharply critical of the Kremlin.

"Snowden has overstayed his welcome at the Moscow airport," Sen. Bob Menendez, a Democrat from New Jersey, said Thursday. "I call on the Russian government, in the interest of justice, as well as U.S.-Russian relations, to release him into the custody of the U.S. government today."

### **Kremlin showing no sign of cooperating.**

"For political reasons it is impossible for both China and Russia to extradite him to the United States," said Fyodor Lyukanov, who edits *Russia in Global Affairs* magazine. "That will make enormous damage to their reputations because at least half of the world believes Snowden is a hero because he revealed this big brother practice of the state."

American intelligence experts worry that Russian officials have copied the memories of the four laptops that Snowden brought with him.

Russian President Vladimir Putin rejects U.S. pressure over Snowden.

"He's in the transit hall as a transit passenger now," President Putin said on a visit to Finland Wednesday. "Our special services have never worked with Mr. Snowden and aren't working today."

In Hong Kong, Snowden told journalists Glenn Greenwald and Laura Poitras with *The Guardian* newspaper he rejects accusations that he leaked America's secrets to help foreign powers.

"Anyone in the position of access with the technical capability that I had could suck out secrets and pass them on the open market to Russia," Snowden said in a videotaped interview. "They always have an open door, as we do."

The longer Snowden stays in Russia, the more he is winning conservative support in the country. Russian lawmakers and some human rights leaders now want the Kremlin to grant Snowden asylum. One Russian Senator, Ruslan Gattarov, invited Snowden to address a parliamentary working group set up to explore allegations of American wiretapping of Russian citizens.

President Putin says he will not extradite Snowden to the United States. But he wants the fugitive to keep moving. "Mr. Snowden is a free man," he said in Finland. "The sooner he chooses his final destination, the better it would be for us and for himself."

### **Possible Eventual Destination**

If Snowden keeps missing flights to Havana, a new solution could be on the horizon. Venezuelan President Nicolas Maduro has said that he is considering granting Snowden asylum. Next week, President Maduro is to fly to Moscow in Venezuela's presidential jet, an Airbus, to attend a conference of gas-producing nations.

In the roomy jet, he could bring along two other left-leaning leaders of South American gas-producing nations, Bolivian President Evo Morales and Ecuadorian President Rafael Correa. Ecuador has said it is reviewing an asylum request from Snowden.

Conceivably, Snowden could fly directly from Moscow to Caracas with this high level entourage. Perhaps aware of this possibility, President Obama promised not to take extraordinary measures.

"No, I'm not going to be scrambling jets to get a 29-year-old hacker," he said, referring to Snowden who turned 30 last week in Hong Kong.

## Top US Officer Rejects Comparison of US, Chinese Cyber Snooping

June 27, 2013 5:13 PM

WASHINGTON—The top U.S. military officer on Thursday dismissed comparisons of Chinese and American snooping in cyber space, saying all countries gathered intelligence on their potential adversaries but Beijing's problematic "niche" was intellectual property theft.

Army General Martin Dempsey, the chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff, also said the U.S. government was close to completing an update of its rules of engagement in cyber space and that Americans needed to understand a cyber-attack could trigger a real-world military response.

"All nations on the face of the planet always conduct intelligence operations in all domains," Dempsey told an audience at the Brookings Institution think-tank after he was asked about intelligence leaks showing the National Security Agency targeted Chinese institutions for cyber spying.

He rejected suggestions that the leaks by NSA contractor Edward Snowden demonstrated hypocrisy on the part of the United States, which has been sharply critical of Chinese hacking of U.S. government and commercial computer networks.

"China's particular niche in cyber has been theft and intellectual property," Dempsey said. "I've had some conversations about that with them. Their view is that there are no rules of the road in cyber, there's nothing, there's no laws that they are breaking, there's no standards of behavior."

That disagreement is a point of friction in ties between the two countries and was discussed earlier this month by Presidents Barack Obama and Xi Jinping at a summit in California.

Dempsey said the two countries would have their first formal discussions next week to try to establish rules for conduct in cyber space "so we don't have these friction points."

## Strong Accusations

The United States has become increasingly vocal about Chinese hacking, which officials say has cost the United States hundreds of billions of dollars in lost intellectual property and is helping U.S. adversaries speed development of high-tech weapons systems.

The Pentagon's annual report on China in April for the first time directly accused the Beijing government and military of being behind the hacking.

Dempsey, in his remarks on cyber security at Brookings, said the government could not completely prevent insiders like Snowden from disclosing secrets if they were willing to break the law, but he said it could take steps to mitigate the risk.

He said a shift to so-called "cloud" or "thin client" computing could boost security and reduce the number of systems administrators needing with broad access. Deeper background checks and greater oversight also could be imposed, he said.

Snowden was a systems administrator working for Booz Allen Hamilton in Hawaii on an NSA contract when he disclosed details of secret U.S. surveillance programs.

"I think systems administrators is the right place to begin to clean this up ... because they have such ubiquitous access, and that's how he ended up doing what he did," Dempsey said.

Dempsey said the U.S. government is close to completing an update of its rules of engagement for dealing with a cyber-attack, describing them as a "playbook" that outlines the roles and responsibilities of the different agencies involved.

He cautioned against assuming a cyber-attack that caused significant damage would automatically be met with a cyber-response of similar scope and destructiveness.

"I think what the president ... would insist upon, actually, is that he have the options and the freedom of movement to decide what kind of response we would employ," Dempsey said.

"That's why I say I don't want to have necessarily a narrow conversation about what constitutes war in cyber, because the response could actually be in one of the other traditional domains" of air, sea, space or land, he said.

## Snowden's Father: Son Would Return for US Espionage Trial

June 28, 2013 12:42 PM

The father of the former U.S. intelligence contractor who leaked details of the government's clandestine surveillance programs said he believes his son, under certain conditions, would be willing to return to the United States to face espionage charges.

In an interview aired on NBC's Today show Friday, Lonnie Snowden said that through

his lawyer he has told U.S. Attorney General Eric Holder that his son Edward would probably return home if the government promises to let him be free in advance of a trial, not prohibit him from speaking publicly about the case and let him choose where he would be tried.

There was no immediate response from the Justice Department. But criminal suspects in the U.S. do not have a choice in where they stand trial, and judges usually make the decisions whether to free suspects until their trials start and whether they should be limited in what they can talk about publicly.

Edward Snowden fled to Hong Kong and then disclosed key documents about the surveillance programs being conducted by the U.S.'s secretive National Security Agency to thwart terrorism. Last weekend, Snowden flew to Russia and now is believed to be staying in a transit zone at a Moscow airport, while seeking asylum in Ecuador.

The U.S. is seeking his extradition, but Russian President Vladimir Putin said he has no intention of turning the 30-year-old Snowden over to American authorities.

The elder Snowden said he did not believe his son had committed treason. But he acknowledged that he "has in fact broken U.S. law, in a sense that he has released classified information."

The father said, "And if folks want to classify him as a traitor, in fact he has betrayed his government. But I don't believe that he's betrayed the people of the United States."

## US Urges Ecuador to Deny Snowden Asylum

June 29, 2013 2:55 PM

U.S. Vice President Joe Biden has spoken to Ecuador's president about Edward Snowden, the fugitive former intelligence contractor who is seeking asylum in Ecuador.

President Rafael Correa says Biden asked him to reject the asylum request from Snowden, who is wanted by the United States for leaking information about secret surveillance programs.

President Correa revealed details of his conversation with Biden during his weekly address on Saturday. Correa said he spoke to the vice president on Friday.

White House officials say Biden discussed Snowden's case with Correa but declined to provide details.

Snowden fled to Hong Kong and then disclosed key documents about the surveillance programs being conducted by the secretive National Security Agency to thwart terrorism.

Earlier this month he flew to Moscow and is believed to be staying in a transit zone at the airport, while seeking asylum in Ecuador.

Officials in Ecuador have said they cannot consider any asylum request from Snowden unless he is in the country.

Ecuador granted refuge to WikiLeaks founder Julian Assange, who remains in the country's embassy in London.



President Correa said what the U.S. should do is focus more on explaining its surveillance programs than on catching Snowden.

On Friday, Snowden's father, Lonnie, told NBC's Today show that he believed his son, under certain conditions, would be willing to return home to face espionage charges.

Lonnie Snowden said his son might be willing to return if the U.S. promised to let him be free in advance of the trial, not prohibit him from speaking publicly about the case and let him choose where he would be tried.

The elder Snowden said he believed his son had broken U.S. law, but added that he did not think his son was guilty of treason.

## EU Furious Over Reported NSA Surveillance

June 30, 2013 12:53 PM

Senior European Union officials have angrily demanded answers from the United States after a German magazine alleged the U.S. National Security Agency bugged EU offices and gained access to its internal computer networks as part of its spying activities.

The president of the European Parliament, Martin Schulz, said Sunday that if the reports are true "it would have a severe impact on EU-U.S. relations." He called for "full clarification" from U.S. authorities.

Germany's justice minister accused Washington of using "Cold War" methods against its allies, saying it is "beyond comprehension that our friends in the U.S. see Europeans as enemies."

Some have called for a suspension of talks on the trans-Atlantic free trade agreement.

On Saturday, the German weekly *Der Spiegel* reported that the NSA placed listening devices in European Union offices in Washington, Brussels and at the United Nations in New York, and infiltrated EU computers to monitor telephone conversations, e-mails and other documents.

It quoted secret U.S. documents obtained from fugitive whistleblower and former NSA contractor Edward Snowden.

Snowden fled the U.S. to Hong Kong in May and then disclosed key documents about the surveillance programs being conducted by the National Security Agency to thwart terrorism.

Earlier this month, he flew to Moscow and is believed to be staying in a transit zone at the airport while seeking asylum in Ecuador.

Ecuadorian President Rafael Correa said Sunday that Snowden's fate is in the hands of Russian authorities because he cannot leave the airport without a valid U.S. passport. He said his government cannot begin considering asylum for Snowden until he reaches Ecuador or an Ecuadorian embassy.

Russia has repeatedly stated that Snowden is not on Russian territory in the airport's

transit area and he is free to depart whenever he wants. Russian authorities repeated that position Sunday in response to Mr. Correa's comments.

U.S. Vice President Joe Biden asked Mr. Correa in a telephone call Friday to reject Snowden's asylum request.

According to an NSA document dated September 2010, only a few countries labeled as close friends by the U.S. are explicitly exempted from monitoring - Britain, Australia, Canada and New Zealand.

*Der Spiegel* reported that on an average day, the NSA monitored about 20 million German phone connections and 10 million Internet data sets, with the rate rising to 60 million phone connections on busy days.

The magazine said that in France the U.S. taps about two million data connections per day.