Spaces of Belonging in Exile

A Survey of Literary Exile and Its Spatial Components

MA Literary Studies

Literature in Society. Europe and Beyond, Leiden University

01 February 2019

Zeynep Erol

S2235897

Supervisor: Dr. Esther A. Op de Beek

Second Reader: Dr. Bram K. Ieven

1. Introduction

Modernity came with two contradicting needs; mobility and stability, both of which the human mind turns out to be interested in. In his book *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience (2001),* Yi-Fu Tuan analyzes the controversial positions people take with respect to the social and cultural environment. The modern person has both the intrinsic need to belong and the curiosity towards the buffet of possibilities the world seems to serve. Tuan mentions that the concept of freedom is heavily imbued with space in the Western world, as "it suggests the future and invites action"; however openness also leads to vulnerability (Tuan 54). Being vulnerable to the outside world, like children are, requires some kind of "directness and intimacy that are the envy of adults bruised by life" (Tuan 54). Unprepared for the dangers, adults have always felt both an excitement and fear towards the unknown that awaits them. Unable to be in one place or go in one direction, modern people seem to have sacrificed the time needed to establish roots, in order to get to other places. With this precarity, the experience of place and its meanings in the Westernized ways of living became 'superficial' (Tuan 183).

The concept of exile has gained relatively varied associations during and after the modern era, correlating with both the conditions of exile and their interpretations across disciplines. The act of exile itself actually has long historical roots, analyzed from within many scientific disciplines. We see the departure of humankind from a migratory state to settlements as an evolutionary transition. Starting 60.000 years ago, we see periods where different needs and conflicts urge humans to move. In his article titled *The Exile Experience Reconsidered (2014)*, the academic Renato Camurri touches upon the distinction between the historical and the postmodern exile. He writes that it is important "to avoid confusing the historical experience of exile... with the representation of exile as a postmodern metaphor of life or as a kind of exile of the soul, typical (and necessary) for artistic creativity" (6).

There are not two, but many interpretations of the exile experience today. It is possible to find variations of experiential and experimental narratives of exile in literary texts, specifically in the postmodern writings on identity. In his book of philosophical essays, *The Trouble with Being Born (2012),* the Romanian philosopher Emil M. Cioran expresses this metaphorical aspect infused with the intellectual understanding of alienation as such; "All my life, I have lived with

the feeling that I have been kept from my true place. If the expression "metaphysical exile" had no meaning, my existence alone would afford it one" (92). Before the peak of globalization and technological advancements, humankind was experiencing dire conditions, which led to the exile, or banishment, of certain groups and migration of many. In its historical sense, exile allowed no time for self-reflection or spiritual ruminations. Whereas, Edward Said writes: "...the stigma of being an outsider … "exile" carries with it, I think, a touch of solitude and spirituality" (Said 2000: 286) which reflects the intellectual, as well as the physical exile of our modern age. Experiences and labels of being an outsider and a marginal have gained special and distinguishing connotations.

In particular, modernism and postmodernism had subsequent impacts on how we think about exile. Professor of literary and transnational studies, Ástráður Eysteinsson writes: "Modernism is viewed as a kind of aesthetic heroism, which in the face of the chaos of the modern world...sees art as the only dependable reality" (1992: 9). Exile literature also became an artistic tool for modernists to claim their outsider images. The fast paced processes of life, science, societal dynamics caused confusions which were understood by the modernists as the disruption of the established traditional, historical, political and social categorizations. Postmodernist critiques disrupted these "meta-narratives, truth systems, social/signifying hierarchies, and the foundations of knowledge" (McClennen 18). In the meantime, intellectual exiles, dissidents, writers have endured the process of being estranged for life, have been cultural and political figures remembered mostly for their ideologies and not as their personalities. In *Intellectual Exile: Expatriates and Marginals (1993)* Edward Said writes: "The pattern that sets the course for the intellectual as outsider, which I believe is the right role for today's intellectual, is best exemplified by the condition of exile, the state of never being fully adjusted, always feeling outside the chatty, familiar world inhabited by natives (so to speak), tending to avoid and even dislike the trappings of accommodation and national well-being" (117). Thus the exile literature in its modern sense became a growing reflection on the estrangement of people, and had been occupied, firstly, with the concept of *belonging*.

1.1. Hypotheses

In my thesis, I will examine the relation between the physical uprooting of the exile condition and the foreignness within the modern societies through narrative styles and spatial constructs. The presentation of exile is related firstly to the change of sense of place and identifications of places. The exile, through various means of adaptations, tries to either recreate the old home or create a new home. In this paper, I will analyze the experiences of belonging in exile literature from two perspectives. The narratological perspective will focus on the spatiotemporal components of the exile narratives, while the authorial perspective will focus on the use of language, how the experience of exile is expressed creatively through it and the dialectical games in exile narratives. The aim of this paper is to show that literature can convey the physical and metaphysical exilic condition, and provide a home for the exilic writer as well. I will argue that Western exilic literature can be seen as an examination of the discrepancy between the intimate values of traditional communities and the superficiality of globalization. There is a dialectical relation between the permanence of traditional values and the transience of the modern values, where neither side is appreciated on their own as much as when they are recognized with reference to each other. The exiles that are situated in short-lived physical conditions, also experience banishment as both a cultural and an intellectual issue. Metaphorical and intellectual exiles, while valuing this transitory state, depict a representation of exile. The difference mostly occurs when the purely referential exilic experience derives from the intrinsic dilemma between modernist thought and the escapist or existential approach on life as a phenomenon, while the physical exile necessitates a process of adjustment to changes and facing scrutiny on cultural values on a daily basis. I will contribute to the dialectical tradition of space and place, depicted in literary narratives through dualities, and explore the representations of belonging in literature.

I will use two books intertwined with exile literature; *Springtime in a Broken Mirror (2018)*, a book of fiction, written by Mario Benedetti; and *Letters of Transit (1999),* a nonfiction written collectively and edited by Andre Aciman. I will observe the meaning of home and belonging in relation to spaces and places, as well as how they are portrayed through the narrative structures. In Latin American literature, exile has a vast cannon infused with

imaginative writing and political subtexts. Benedetti reflects these cultural undertones in a poetic manner while focusing on the experience of exile and imprisonment. A collection of memoirs and writings, all the exile writers in *Letters of Transit* use the English language for writing and their experiences in adjusting to the Westernized way of living. For my theoretical framework, I will be using primarily Mieke Bal's *Narratology (1985)* and Yi-Fu Tuan's *Space and Place (1977).* By using one textual and one geographical reference, I will be able look at the narrative representation of exile in fiction and the experience of space by the exilic writers.

Literary theories have been harboring controversial thoughts on the relation between author and narrator, so much so that with the question of censorship the topic became a moral issue. While there can never be a consensus on such a condensed subject, in exile literature I see it beneficial to talk about an author. In my analysis of the works from authorial perspectives, I will not refer to any ideologies related to those authors as my concern is limited to the human condition in exile, how each experience may differ for each individual writer and how there may be common notions among exilic writers. My choice of combining fictional and non-fictional works by exile writers mainly derives from this reason. And again, because of my dual approach, I am able to analyze two separate layers of exilic works when discussing the relationship between restrictive (imagined) and accessible (real) nature of narrative spaces. The primary source of my reasoning comes from the interrelated nature of emotions, memory and language. Milan Kundera writes in the preface of *Life is Elsewhere (2000)*: "For a novelist, a given historic situation is an anthropologic laboratory in which he explores his basic question: What is human existence?" (Bloom 117). Kundera, similar to Benedetti, "weaves an author-figure into his texts with stark autobiographical intrusions that threaten the provocative flippancy with which Roland Barthes announced/pronounced the demise of the author in his famous essay" as John O'Brian writes (Bloom 113). Yet, I would argue that the texts I will analyze don't break the barriers between author and narrator as radically as Kundera does. I should also note that the 'author' here is referencing the real author who has experienced exile and through exile literature, the restricted spaces of memories, imaginations and emotional reflections are transferred onto writing.

As exiles don't have a collective memory like nations and races do, this exploration is mostly dependent on historical collections and personal experiences, leaving the author in

exploration of ‘others’ like her. I believe the authors of both books I have chosen are aware of this intertwined nature of exile with life, more so in modern conditions as a metaphor.

The strictly personal spaces that are manifestations of the cognitive and psychological experiences of the exile writers, when juxtaposed with publicly accessible spaces, expose intrinsic human needs such as place attachments,sense of belonging and nostalgia. Thus, I will be arguing that an exilic writer creates a new literary identity by adding to his craft of writing the experience of looking through the eyes of an exile, an outsider.

I will begin by introducing the concepts the concepts ‘space’ and ‘place’ in relation to exile and uprootedness, which will allow me to survey the two books of my choice in spatial respects. I will look into the topic of meaning-making in accordance with identity, and belonging. I will then observe how the characters are situated in and related to spaces and places in exile. Topics of memory, nostalgia and liminality will carry importance in this study as well as the real and imagined exilic spaces. The scholars I will be using claim that in literary analysis, it is not possible to separate spatial notions from temporal aspects, an idea which gained prominence due to Mikhail Bakhtin and, per his accolade, Einstein (1986: 121-122). I will integrate the spatiotemporal complexities of narratives into my partial analysis of exile; how its experiences are conveyed through literature and how narratives can allow for belonging and identity to form in foreign places. I will mostly be using the primary references as survey in my explanation for the relative theories and frameworks. In that regard, this paper will present a strong case for the importance of spatial narratives in exile literature and in poetics of belonging, instead of giving a thorough analysis of the texts in those areas.

1.2. Case Studies

Springtime in a Broken Mirror (*Primavera con una esquina rota, 1995*) is a novel written by Uruguayan writer Mario Benedetti in exile. While combining different focalizations and mixing the autobiographical with the fictional, Benedetti approaches the experience of exile, separation, and alienation from various perspectives. Throughout the novel, the narration and focalization change to give a certain width and depth to the story. Benedetti’s political past is also reflected through the passages of his own experiences that disrupt the chronological

narration. Beyond the fact that he is a Latin American exile writer, Benedetti has a transcendental approach to fiction, what could almost be explained as spiritual teaching on the love of life. The first English translation of the book, which was titled *Spring with a Broken Corner (1983),* is reminiscent of Gaston Bachelard's thoughts on what home means to us beyond description. "For our house is our corner of the world," he says. "As has often been said, it is our first universe, a real cosmos in every sense of the word. If we look at it intimately, the humblest dwelling has beauty" (Bachelard 55). It is this essence of beauty that is present in Benedetti's book which arises from the very intrinsic question of belonging.

Letters of Transit: Reflections on Exile, Identity, Language, and Loss is a collection of memories written by known exile writers, who tell their experiences of detachment, alienation and in some cases, adaptation. While some look at the actual experience of exile, some give weight to the political, cultural and lingual representations of exile as a metaphysical subject. In all texts, the writers from all over the world, achieve to reflect have their unique take on this global, yet personal, experience of exile. More importantly, the book provides different perspectives on the literature of exile and exilic writers.

In its introduction Aciman, the book's editor and also an exilic writer, points to the locus and prospect of home. "The question our five writers ask is how do you— indeed, can you ever—rebuild a home? What kinds of shifts must take place for a person to acquire, let alone accept, a new identity, a new language?" (Aciman 9).

Many exiles such as Mario Benedetti provide a representation of the politically motivated experience of exile which, as William Lowe and Terese Whitfield write "internal and external, enforced and involuntary, has been a constant condition of Latin American experience" (229). While Benedetti's fiction provides a narrative representative of the political exile in Latin America and imprisonment, through multiple focalizations, *Letters of Transit* takes a step back into the personal experience of the exilic writer and how their exile narratives come into being.

The surface image of exile, as beautiful as it may be, has origins in fear of change and a sense of mourning for the past. Loss of control in an unknown environment usually marks the beginning of great stress. When identity is under threat, literature does not fail to express and reflect. And that is what the exilic writer naturally does; to reflect on his experiences through

language. In *Minima Moralia* (1998), Theodor Adorno writes: "For a man who no longer has a homeland, writing becomes a place to live" (87).

2. Spatiotemporal Concepts in Exile Literature (Chronotopes of Exile Literature)

In narratives of exile, there are certain conceptual approaches related to the flexibility of language and semantics, which in turn are used within the experiential narratives. These concepts are based on two main constructs of experience; space and time. In exile literature, the spatiotemporal factors are mostly valued for their interactions. Literature allows for metaphysical spaces and anachronic time to occur. The narrative spaces thus have endless possibilities of expression through these two concepts. Mikhail Bakhtin coined the term *chronotope* to indicate the interwoven nature of space and time in literature. For a logical flow and ease of comprehension, I will start with the spatial aspects of exile narratives and then delve into the temporal approach of these spaces. The two sections naturally will be closely related to each other, thus proving "the intrinsic connectedness of temporal and spatial relationships that are artistically expressed in literature" (Bakhtin 2008, 84).

In this part, I will use Bal's concept of space to base my narrative analysis on, and take Tuan's relational concepts of space and place to analyze their experiential aspects. This will allow me to analyze place and space as social, as well as narrative constructs in the further sections.

Fear of the invasion of space feeds the narrative, as Bal claims, which often points at the symbolic importance of spaces and boundaries. "In the world narrative conjures up … things can happen because that world is spatial. It gives space to events, so that events can, as the phrase goes, *take place*" (Bal 212). In exile narratives, the fear of invasion of inner and outer spaces gains special importance. Tuan writes that space in the Western sense mostly means freedom. "On the negative side, space and freedom are a threat" (54). And for the exilic, who has lost the intimacy or the familiarity of a hometown, freedom might seem very relative. The modern intellectual is also looking for the familiar, and the narrative of modern exile is also able to capture the essential dilemma of intimacy and freedom.

As the scopes of the reachable world expanded and mobility became easier, the modern human has come to a realization that the intimacy of home was a need, and stability was a necessity of that. Edward Said says: “We have become accustomed to thinking of the modern period itself as spiritually orphaned and alienated, the age of anxiety and estrangement” (276). Modern experiences are lived within spacious worlds, with more options and more people than before. Yet the individuality of the Western culture has become the key aspect of living in this modern world. The search for a Baudelairian happiness, “results in an erotic failure” (Boym 64). Crowds cause disparate groups, and intimacy becomes the key figure in the formation of imagined communities and geographies. This dilemma is the new state of modern and postmodern cultures. “The twentieth century embraced intimacy as an ideal and also rendered it deeply suspicious.” writes Boym (488).

Displacement becomes a crisis when a person has no or little control over the changing circumstances, and loses the comforting and affectionate place that is home. Thus, home is naturally, one of the prominent themes of exilic spaces. But more than that, to feel at home becomes a metaphysical concept: “to know that things are in their places and so are you; it is a state of mind that doesn't depend on an actual location” (Boym 533).

In a broader sense, intimacy gains its place firstly according to the outer elements such as society, culture, nation and collective history. The identity of an individual comes into play only when that intimate space has been breached by a real or imaginary factor. Thus, the intimate becomes both a need and an issue of complexity.

In a way, “Intimate places are places of nurture where our fundamental needs are heeded and cared for without fuss” writes Tuan (137). He gives the examples of childhood and sickness. A sick person, given that person is “secure in the familiarity of his home and comforted by the presence of those he loves, appreciates the full meaning of nurture” (137). And consequently, “The lasting affection for home is at least partly a result of such intimate and nurturing experiences” (138).

Tuan makes the argument that place, in human life, “is a pause in movement” (138). which allows the person to make intimate connections. By this, Tuan seems to be referring to the role of place in organizing human experience and the experience of temporality through its disruption as a part of meaning-making. “The pause makes it possible for a locality to become a

center of felt value" (Tuan 138). The temporary center of that moment, that pause allows association to be made, and information to be acquired. Remembering, then, is a pause in memory, a way to acknowledge a connection of the past, even if it's from a second or a year ago. "The lasting affection for home is at least partly a result of such intimate and nurturing experiences" (Tuan 138). Similar to the interpersonal relationships, the process of forming a bond between a person and a place requires an awareness of self and the distinguishing of the self from other places. For some exiles, the intimate connection with home is severed for life and at-homeness is no longer a concept related to the outer space, but rather an intimacy with oneself. The acceptance of losses and adjustment processes are underlined by a process of meaning-making. We see this adjustment most clearly in literature; where words play and meanings diverge from a reference only to follow another. Space, for humans and more so for the exilic, appears to be limitless, abstract area. The spatial narrative is understood primarily as a "way characters bring their senses to bear on" (Bal 217).

If we say that sense of place is a mechanism of meaning-making through the experience of temporal organization of human experience, then the sense of space gains a meaningful label through the collective agents such as political, social or public. Experiential space cannot transform into place "without introducing the objects and places that define space" (Tuan 136). This is what Bal calls the 'frame'. Through these frames, Mieke Bal writes, the inner space might be "experienced as confinement, while the outer space represents liberation and, consequently, security" (218).

Place-identity, similar to a sense of place, is the whole of a person's impressions, emotions and the cognitive data "about the physical world in which the individual lives" (59). Creating a more individualistic perspective allows a form of identification with places in a subjective and personal manner. Mieke Bal calls these personal links to places, the *points of perception*. "These places seen in relation to their perception constitute the story's space. That point of perception may be a character, which is situated in space, observes it, and reacts to it. An anonymous point of perception can also dominate the presentation of certain places" (Bal 323).

Since the narrator is the narrative point of contact, we can say that a sense of a place is achieved through through points of perception. In exile narratives, spaces and places tend to have deep connotations. This is due to the fact that both the frame and the context of the exilic stories

depend on spatial changes of meaning and attachment, and so space rarely functions as a background.

In exilic narratives, we can say that spaces attain meaning through points of perception and become certain places within the fabula of the story. The most popular spatial form in the exile stories are thematized spaces. Mieke Bal writes that thematized space, instead of becoming solely a stage, "becomes an object of presentation itself, for its own sake" (228). In *Letters of Transit*, even though the cities of exile and the hometowns are often mentioned by the writers and have fairly important roles, they rarely have enough unique characterizations that go beyond the concepts of "home country" and "host country" to be labeled solely as objects of action. Although rarely the writer expands on the distinctions of two locations and includes them in their narrative. Then the places act as a character in a story and through this relationship between the characters and the places the narrative forms its base. In *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, similarly, both the city of exile and prison become thematized spaces in a very conceptual manner. As we will see, while in *Letters of Transit*, the city and country names are clearly stated, as a manner of the autobiographical-writing style, in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, the exile city is given fake names and discretely referenced.

Mieke Bal writes that most often "the boundary that delimits the frame can be heavily invested with meaning" (219). It is also true in narratives, as they "can endorse that meaning, reject or change it, or play on different ways in which characters are situated in relation to it." (Bal 219). Thus both points of perception and chronotopic limitations can change the narrative. In the case of exile narrative, we see an overlap of the concrete borders of places (countries, cities, nations, etc.) and the abstract borders of spaces (public, private, familiar, strange, etc.). As I will explain later, literature allows for a new approach to these borders and their in-between spaces through different narrative and poetic techniques. One of the commonly used analytical approaches to the duality of concepts, or two sidedness of being in-between is told through dialectics.

Dialectical thinking refers to the duality of states, to the togetherness of opposites, such that every experience is understood with respect to what remains outside of it.McClennen claims that "the history of dialectical thinking is as long as the history of exile" (29). The dualities in exile narratives, as I will expand later on, are complex and multi-faceted. This is due to the fact

that firstly, no word or concept has only one appropriate opposite; and secondly, the exile narrative, as well as the modern and postmodern narratives, are predicated on the in-between spaces, unclear or controversial aspects as much as they are about dichotomies.

We come across the good-evil, order-chaos and Yin-Yang dialectics in popular culture and as part of the modern and postmodern rhetorics. Modern world has witnessed the rise of dystopian fictions and politically imbued East-West comparisons, in which West is defined through formulizations of East.

All dialectics have different values to state and points to make, yet all carry the ambiguity of the human life. McClennen states: "The dialectic is about change, process, and flux (30). Similarly, in exile narrative there are many implied and explicit dialectics. The inner-outer spaces of the exile narrative is a spatially exercised one, whereas the dynamic-steady rhythms are focused on temporal changes. In the next chapters I will discuss in detail how these dynamic and steady spaces can form in narratives of displacement and exile. After that, I will look the inner-outer dilemmas in narratives of belonging and how the liminal nature of exile can break that duality.

Based on their rhythms, the exile can be perceived as a combination of two contrasting spaces: the dynamic and the steady. Similarly, an individual living in the modern world also experiences these two rhythms in her daily life. The constantly moving and unreliable outside world, similar to the public space, represents the mobile and fast spaces. Whereas the intimate and trustworthy inner world consists mainly of memories and personal spaces of the individual. The outside world is not under the control of the individual, but the inner world can be. Mostly, the intimate relationships with one another and within oneself allows a calm and steady space. Intimacy, as understood in the modern world, mostly refers to this closeness and familiarity that is intrinsic by nature.

2.1. Dynamic and Steady Spaces

In literature, temporality can be rather indeterminate from the perspective of the reader, as well as the narrator. The events may be told in parallel, in conjunction, or in contrast to each other as well as instead of one another, such as in the case of most science fiction narratives. The

temporal complication can be caused by intentional fragmentation of time, or from the lack of temporal clues across narratives. Bal recognizes "the many ways in which narratives complicate this apparently self-evident temporality that are of interest" (126).

In this chapter, I will provide the necessary conceptual framework for my argument and examination of the chronotopic narratives in exile literature. This will include the temporal adversities which affect the rhythm of narration and the incomprehensible aspects of experienced spaces.I will then use these concepts to analyze the real and imagined spaces of exile. These spaces will be observed according to their experiential and narrational attributes. This will allow me to make a statement about the spaces literature allows to be transmitted which are not accessible in real life.

In *Narratology*, Bal states that spaces "can function steadily or dynamically" which is similar to the mobility-stability duality we've mentioned before. She writes that "a steady space is a fixed frame...within which the events take place" (Bal 228). This is similar to Tuan's concept of place, a symbol of stability. He writes "...if we think of space as that which allows movement, then place is pause; each pause in movement makes it possible for location to be transformed into place" (Tuan 6). To move it further into a distinction, we can say that places are stable and framed spaces. They carry meaning through manners of distinguishments, comparisons. Space acts as a field of possibilities resulting from potential moves and directions. Bal writes that a "dynamically functioning space is a factor which allows for the movement of characters. Characters walk, and therefore need a path" (228).

The way space is presented also depends on the temporal qualities of experience within that space, which means that in narrative spaces, the narrator's point of perception also acts, to reference Mark Currie, as a bookmark that moves over time "from the beginning to the end of the novel and as it does, it will represent the reader's present in the narrative" (Currie 5).

The reader becomes aware of the spaces in passing if they are not detailed in the narration. Whereas if "separate segments of narrative are devoted to the presentation of information about space alone, we have descriptions. The space is then not simply indicated in passing, but is an explicit object of presentation." (Bal 221) Through the movements in space, we can talk about the experience of time and space together. Uncertainty and change create dynamic

spatiality in exile literature. Change triggers retrospection and creates exilic spaces. This dynamic relation establishes the story's "narrative rhythm" (Bal 226).

The narrative rhythm is also affected by other elements related to, but not limited to, time, space, pace, distance and direction of the fabula. While helping with the formulation of the narrative, these building blocks also emerge as motives within the exile literature and other narratives of estrangement, particularly the ones I will analyze.

If we see time as a linear concept, a moving narrative would have two main points; a beginning and a direction. A direction has to include certain places such as an origin, which Tuan calls 'home' and instead of an ending, since we are talking about the moving image, we indicate the goal as an unreached point in space. It may not ever be reached, but in the narrative, it is indicated, thus it exists in any case.

Tuan writes that "we acquire the feel of distance by the effort of moving from one place to another, by the need to project our voice, by hearing the dogs bark at night, and by recognizing the environmental cues for visual perspective" (Tuan 16). As we experience space, we reflect on its varied qualities and also on our subjective understandings of those spaces. "Human spaces reflect the quality of the human senses and mentality" (Tuan 16). The term 'vastness' immediately indicates an area big enough to be outside of comprehension for the human eye in a single gaze, and for that matter out of our tactile limits. Although still observable, vast spaces come with a certain distance, unreachability. Direction, furthermore, enables persons to relate to otherwise vast spaces of human experience that are outside of the scope of human perception, such as 'home' one does not even fully remember.

Concepts such as the ocean, the sky, galaxies, and even temporal structures like thousands of years might arise similar feelings for the imagining mind. Bal goes one step further and says that "*Monumental time* is a temporality that denies even that *historical time*; it aspires to eternity," writes Bal (134). Thus we can say that objects which carry vastness need not be perceptively real all the time.

As the term is more experiential than scientific, we cannot give a precise measurement for the vastness nor can we categorize the spaces as such. For some, the vastness of a country, or a continent might be enough. For a child, the threshold is even lower.

Vast spaces may also symbolize slower pace like the orbit of the Earth, or a deeper sound like the demolition of a building. This aspect is due to the physics of vibrations; simply put, bigger masses vibrate slower. If we were to think of vastness as a temporal concept, the time experienced would be slow paced and would be prolonged, resulting in more spatial experience. Bal demonstrates this difference of temporal experience through "the small time of moments and the variations of intensity of experience" and gives the example of a mother with a child where the "routine of small acts of care determines the experience of time" (127).

The life of the exilic, or of any person who regularly faces anxiety or fear, would be separated by emotional ups and downs into these 'micro times'. Bal gives the example of an undocumented immigrant, who is in the hands of uncertainty for long periods of time. It is "a kind of social schizophrenia, which makes the migrant always hasty and always stagnating at the same time; and always in a different experience of time from the residents of the host country" (Bal 127).

In narratives, the present is understood as the most event happening at that moment. It is happening in the now. Tuan associates spaciousness with being free, which means "the ability to transcend the present condition" (51). The exilic spaces are mostly created through deep connections with the past or the future. A happy future or a comfortable past might be freeing experiences for the exilic. To the exilic, the present becomes a foreign space, and the mind tends to find solace in the past or in the future. These anachronic places gain priority in spatial narrations.

In the case of nostalgia, remembrance and other plays of memory, we can say that it is useful "to show various interpretations of an event, to indicate the subtle difference between expectation and realization, and much else besides" (Bal 131). Depending on the direction of the anachrony, the event may be happening in the past, which is called retroversion; or in the future, which is called anticipation. In narratives, we come across anticipations much less frequently. They usually function as "an allusion to the outcome of the fabula...to generate tension or to express a fatalistic vision of life" (Bal 149). As we will see in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, the juxtaposition of the distant narratives within a close sequential order creates a sense of separation within the fabula. The 'anachronies', most importantly nostalgic recalls and yearnings will be examined in nostalgic spaces, while 'anticipations' will be examined in hopeful spaces.

The narrative distances happen through the disruption of sequential ordering. This is mainly the play between the order of events in the story and the chronological sequence in the fabula, which is a "theoretical construction, which we can make on the basis of the laws of everyday logic which govern common reality" (Bal 128). These 'anachronies' can happen and function in multiple ways.

Concepts related to the modern sense of distinguishment such as separation, alienation, and estrangement may indicate a certain distance between the character and the event, object or another character. It may also indicate a distance between the present and the old or new life. A 'gap' is a common narrative topic in exile narratives as well as in narratives of belonging. Aciman writes on this feeling of loss or lacking: "What makes exile the pernicious thing it is is not really the state of being away, as much as the impossibility of ever not being away—not just being absent, but never being able to redeem this absence" (5). Home might exist in the memory of some exiles, or in the anticipations of those who dream of a home. In both of these temporal spaces for the exile, the home is always at a distance. In other words, estrangement is acknowledged as a common state of exile.

I have mentioned that directional time may be represented as an arrow. The direction of the arrow implies that there is a potential end, a goal at the end of this time. Tuan indicates this as "a point in time and a point in space" (179). In this context, goal is understood as a spatial component of the future. In modernist examinations of exile, the limitless aspect of future often indicates an unknown that can be terrifying as well as exciting. Likewise, Bal and Tuan both use the term 'goal' as a constitutive theme in their framings of distance and movement. Bal says "The character that is moving towards a goal need not always arrive in another space. In many travel stories, the movement is a goal in itself. It is expected to result in a change, liberation, introspection, wisdom, or knowledge" (223), while Tuan thinks "Distance is a meaningless spatial concept apart from the idea of goal or place" (136).

The goal then depends on the narrative direction of the story, which is directly or indirectly connected to the characters and their points of perception. An open space might not always be the goal. As Tuan observes, "In open space one can become intensely aware of place; and in the solitude of a sheltered place the vastness of space beyond acquires a haunting

presence" (54). In all narratives, however there needs to be a direction in the fabula which implies there are also goals of the characters.

2.2. Real and Imagined Spaces

I have mentioned some temporal notions related to exilic spaces. In a text, these notions can interact with each other through various methods. The main tool for the creation of new interactions is narration. Through narration, new spaces open up in texts. These spaces are firstly associated with mental accounts, images, and descriptions. Mieke Bal's definition of 'frame' in which characters act, is also applicable to these spaces. In this section of my thesis, each theme or subject has a connection with the narrator's sense of place. However, some places will be associated with the accessible spaces of the experiences which happen outside of the narrator, which I call real spaces; whereas restricted spaces, which are not accessible from the outer perspectives, will be reflected in memory-related or imagined experiences of the narrator, which I call imagined spaces. Even though familiar to the reader, each concept tends to be very dependent on the point of perception of the narrator to attain its meaning. It can even be said that each concept has even a deeper and more subjective meaning that is not fully intelligible outside of the mind. In this regard, literature provides an outlet for the inner state (thought, emotions, dreams) of the individual and provides an area for interpretation. And I will analyze the interactions and in-betweens of these real and imagined spaces.

In literature, the narrators and characters who have their inner world exposed seem more intimate and trustworthy for the reader, compared to the ones that are closed-off, silent or distant. These differences are mostly expressed through points of perception, the sequential ordering of the narrative and focalizations of the characters. I will start off with the relation between the narrator and the space, then go into the concept 'home' as both a real and imagined figure which is an important topic in one's sense of place. I will then delve into memory as a partially accessible inner space and nostalgia in relation to exile. This will allow me to expand on other imagined spaces such as imagined homelands, through what is mostly called 'imaginative narratives'. My aim in this section is to look at the creatively diverse narrations of spaces of exile and how they find a representative voice through literature.

Bal writes: “narrative quite frequently feeds off the horror of the invasion of space that leads to destruction” (219). I will examine the implications of this statement in two directions; firstly from the perspective of the exile, as a fear of change, loss and displacement; and secondly, from the perspective of the narration, as a tool that allows characters to be situated in unexpected, imaginary or restricted spaces. As the books I have chosen to analyze contain autobiographical as well as fictive notions, the narrative and the experiential tools can sometimes be read in conjunction with each other.

The real spaces in exilic narratives deal with the crisis of the present, so the narratives mostly are based in the *now*, so any event the narrator describes as happening in the story’s present, indicates to the location the event is *taking place*. Narratives by nature have the capacity to move and make characters move between temporal frameworks which allows the multi-temporal structure of exilic experiences to better manifest themselves. There are two techniques I want to mention in exile narratives that break the chronological sequences to get away from the present crisis of not belonging; retroversions or anticipations. As I will explain further, retroversions take the narrative into the past, while anticipations tend to focus on a future time. However, the imagined spaces take place in the imagination of the narrator, using both memory and clues from the present. Hence, the temporal clues become ambiguous. These spaces can be indicated by the disruption of the story’s sequential ordering through daydreams and hopeful narratives. Literature allows the reader to witness the narrator’s creative inner world through these imagined spaces, which are otherwise impossible to access.The exile narrative makes use of the rich world-making literature allows, through realistically impossible chronotopes. Thus, some of these spaces are only reachable through creative expression, and specifically, literature. One could argue all creative and artistic outlets have the capability to expose narrator’s inner world. While this is true, only literature, and perhaps poetry more so, allows the freeflow of verbal representation this vividly and without any other intervening tool or medium between the reader and the narrator.

Literature and literary arts have the capacity to link the reader and the narrator through creative ways. There is a very humane side of literature; firstly because its human-made nature of language use, but also because it uses language to integrate the reader within its fabulas by using psychological and mental triggers. In exile literature, the main fabule in this regard can be said to

be the persistent risk of invasion and deportation. In the life of the exile, this fear is so acute and real that it can be triggered by even small events. In modern cultures, this fears does not need a physical base, and nor do metaphysical exiles. Aciman writes that: "[Change] reminds me of the thing I fear most: that my feet are never quite solidly on the ground, but also that the soil under me is equally weak, that the graft didn't take" (14). This fear of instability state is true for both the real spaces of exile such as locational details and societal differences, as well as the mental perspective of intellectual exiles. Said writes:

> "Exile for the intellectual in this metaphysical sense is restlessness, movement, constantly being unsettled, and unsettling others. You can't go back to some earlier and perhaps more stable condition of being at home; and, alas, you can never fully arrive, be at one with your new home or situation" (1993: 117) .

House is the first place of attachment for all humans. The difference between a house and a home implies the difference between a building and a place of belonging. This change in perspective is achievable through spatial notions. Looking at it from the outside, a house appears as walls, closed confines, separation with the public. If we compare it with the vastness of a city, a house seems minuscule. It is strong and closed off, but not ours. Contrary to other buildings and closed off spaces, a house and its surroundings are chosen places. One's house, from both internal and external aspects, reflects their individual preferences. The house "provides shelter; its hierarchy of spaces answers social needs; it is a field of care, a repository of memories and dreams" (Tuan 164). Even if we had no say in choosing the location or the house, we would still have spaces within that house that are intimately ours. There are familiar objects we use or look at and locations we move or stay in. The house, through many senses, becomes embedded in the daily life and our memory. This attachment is no longer erasable.

This attachment can also be true for cultures and nationalities. In the collective systems of belief and history, places can bring people together within a house-like construct such as a nation, while casting others outside. These places of attachment carry memories, which requires time. Within history, we come across houses that have been demolished and abandoned. In war narratives, houses carry their own significance as places that were once filled with life. "The house is past," writes Adorno (39). He continues: "The bombings of European cities, as well as the labour and concentration camps, merely proceed as executors, with what the immanent

development of technology had long decided was to be the fate of houses" (39). The fates of those houses, like the fates of many people, carry a long history of loss, separation, and destruction.We see the effects of demolished archeological and architectural landmarks on humanity. In examples such as the burning of Notre Dame Cathedral or destruction of Palmyra, in Syria, show that loss of built heritage invokes a sense of loss in global scales. One reason may be that material structures are seen as symbols of lived experiences, and that humanity has always been intrigued by the passage of time and the human mortality.

Aside from its architectural aspects which are culturally and historically symbolic, houses are the constructs through which people recognize their roots. Some houses even become the main actors in stories, while others become intimate places of experience and memory. Explaining the Greek origin of the word *topography*, Boym writes: "The art of memory was invented after a catastrophe and began with the collapse of a house" (177). The belongingness creates attachment as well as possessiveness for the house, in which case we instinctively call it our 'home'. In times of crisis, sickness, and tiredness we tend to go home. As a nest, a place of intimate connections with others and a space of childhood, our homes carry the memories that are now part of our identities. Bachelard writes: "Indeed, at times dreams go back so far into an undefined, dateless past that clear memories of our childhood home appear to be detached from us" (105).

Leaving Poland as a kid, Eva Hoffman remembers the loss and distance this displacement caused in her life. "Poland was abruptly sundered from me by an unbridgeable gap; it was suddenly elsewhere, unreachable, on the other side, and I felt, indeed, as if I were being taken out of life itself" (Aciman 35). The intimate spaces we carry in our minds and believe to be a part of us are not fully reachable through any other means but literature. Memory is one of those inner spaces that allow the reader to get to know a character, or a narrator.

Memory is an intimate private space of the mind and has an important role in achieving a sense of belonging. It acts as a translator between identity and space, grouping the familiar thoughts and leaving the rest. A new understanding of memory, as an infallible mechanism, now claims it to be the source of imagination. The human mind brings together memories and experiences during the process of understanding. A part of the meaning-making is the association of what is perceived and how it relates to the memory. This complex mechanism between senses

and memory is not fully conscious, nor reliable. As a part of the adaptation and adjustment process, the memories and impressions change in creative ways. Imagination is understood as a part of memory due to this function of the human mind. Lived experiences and relived memories also play with the details of what is remembered, and how. Thus in time, what is remembered and what is created of the self get interlaced.

Mieke Bal writes: "the memory evokes a past in which people were dislodged from their space...but also, a past in which they did not yield" (224). The spacious and limitless quality of memory can assume many shapes and provide different narrative aspects.

The exile looks for the comfort and security firstly in her past. This might even become a habit. Aciman says that "...even a "reformed" exile will continue to practice the one thing exiles do almost as a matter of instinct: compulsive retrospection" (10).

In narrative terms, we can talk about the temporal distinguishments of past, present and future. While the present of the fabula is related to the tense used as well as narration that implies a present-ness, Bal writes about the direct discourse in anticipation and retroversion. "Properly speaking, here too there is no question of a real anachrony," she adds (138). In narratives, nostalgia can be categorized as retroversion. It takes the narrative out of the present and into the past. It is a tool for the mind to escape or remember, to rewrite the past, or to go to a happy memory. Svetlana Boym and Andrea Ritivoi distinguish two types of nostalgia. Restorative nostalgia tries to 'go back' to a warm place, to reconstruct the home. It is a state of mind that is "inevitably naïve, retrograde, and even paranoid insofar as it tends to read its necessary failure to restore the past as sabotage, conspiracy, or persecution" writes Andreea Deciu Ritivoi in *Yesterday's self: nostalgia and the immigrant identity* (2002: 27). Whereas reflective nostalgia seems somewhat pessimistic and realistic in its expectations. "In the reflective mode, nostalgia becomes fused with melancholy as it turns into a meditation on the passing of time" (Ritivoi 27).

Etymologically *nostos,* the Greek word meaning return or homecoming, comes together with *algia*, or pain, we are faced with a multifaceted and historically paramount feeling of homesickness, or *heimweh* in German.[1] Svetlana Boym retranslates these words as 'home' and 'longing' in that order, to come up with "a longing for a home that no longer exists or has never

[1] Boym translates algia as 'longing': "...a longing for a home that no longer exists or has never existed." (18) which coexists with the common translation of the word in this context.

existed" (18). This explanation coexists with the common understanding, yet Boym's interpretation also adds refers to the ambiguous meaning of belonging to nowhere, or being "homesick for a home that one never had" (Boym 17).

While nostalgia can be limited to the past as it is remembered, it can also become an emotional state. "Nostalgia describes a visit to the attic, where the old family album lies buried among other forgotten treasures, or maybe a trip to the ice-cream parlor where a jukebox still plays music from the 1950s" writes Ritivoi (14), referring to the common meaning of the word as used in daily life. Because of nostalgia, one cannot let go of the past, not in terms of a past lived as such, but of a past where the person belongs. Similarly, Boym writes; "Nostalgia is a sentiment of loss and displacement, but it is also a romance with one's own fantasy" (17).

Tuan claims that the driving force of nostalgia is firstly the precarity of change. When "changes are occurring too rapidly, spinning out of control, nostalgia for an idyllic past waxes strong." he writes (195). In Boym's historical approach to the word, there is more than one cause. Change implies a yearnin for experienced reality that has been partially or fully lost. However, nostalgia in cultural and national context can mean a yearning towards a time not experienced, ideologies of the past, and being "homesick for a home that one never had" (Boym 17).

In exile narrative, homesickness can carry both historical and modern connotations. Through various expressions of nostalgia, most exilic narratives situate 'home' as a central theme in their fabula. While some use it in their narratives as a starting place, some use it as a goal. On a narrative level, the loss of homeland and the loss of a metaphorical home both involve nostalgic yearnings for the unreachable. The two kinds of nostalgia I have mentioned can be viewed in juxtaposition with Claudio Guillén's distinction between exile and counter-exile literature. He writes: "A certain kind of writer speaks of exile, while another learns from it" (1976: 272).

Counter-exile, mostly prefers a pessimistic and "elegiac" approach (Guillen 272), similar to the reflective nostalgic, whereas for the restorative nostalgic "exile is the condition but not the visible cause of an imaginative response" (272). The 'imaginative response', as I will analyze further, can be seen in imaginative narratives as well as the restorative type of nostalgia which "manifests itself in total reconstructions of monuments of the past" (Boym 100). As reflective

nostalgics are interested in recreating the home and a sense of belonging, they linger "on ruins, the patina of time and history, in the dreams of another place and another time" (Boym 100). In the next section I will show that the aside from the nostalgic imaginations which dwell on the past, there are also non-temporal spaces that are accessible through narratives. And thus I will introduce an imaginative narrative through imagined space.

Temporality, specifically "temporal irreversibility" is also a critical part of nostalgia and "is at the very core of the modern condition" (Boym 21). This leads to different approaches towards the past; some narratives depict it as an intrinsic part of one's identity, while others see it as a past self that one wishes to burry. Yet one could argue by looking at exile literature that a stable and uniform identity is not possible. Nostalgia, in a way, can become part of the adjustment process, a way to reconcile, "to bridge the things here to things there, to rewrite the present so as not to write off the past" (Aciman 16).

Habits create the familiarity of daily life and in the case of displacement, may allow for a faster adjustment to the new life. Through small acts of daily rituals, the rhythm of one's life feels more stable against the backdrop of modern chaos of the urban cities. I have mentioned Bal's concept of micro time and how it is dependent on the experience of time. In a daily life, "the routine of small acts" take up most of this experiential time. We also refer to these routine and minor acts as habits. In exile narratives, changes in or unavailability of habitual acts are considered the first realization of a "forced" separation, the loss of belonging. When the exile notices that her habits are no longer possible or reachable, a reminiscent perspective takes over her life. In *Letters of Transit*, Andre Aciman writes "An exile reads change the way he reads time, memory, self, love, fear, beauty: in the key of loss" (Aciman 18). Every minor incident may become a cause for discouragement and mourning. While trying to reconcile the familiar with the alien and form new habits, the exile also has to face the newfound fear that nothing is permanent, and she is in fact not in control. Aciman likens this to a discrepancy in time between locals and foreigners in a city.

> "I hate it when stores change names, the way I hate any change of season, [...] because, like all foreigners who settle here, and who always have the sense that their time warp is not perfectly aligned to the city's, and that they've docked, as it were, a few minutes

ahead or a few minutes behind Earth time, any change reminds me of how imperfectly I've connected to it" (18).

Micro times they may be, habits take up many and varied spaces of the daily life. They may be ritualistic, meditative, or addictive. In any case, they implement familiarity to individual lives. One of the requisites of being an exile is to go through the separation of habits from identity. The exilic life is never constant and is "led outside habitual order" (Said 2012: 294). In a way nostalgia may provide a sense of familiarity and stability. It may become a trusting space, one that the exile creates for herself. "We lost our home," Hannah Arendt writes in *We Refugees* "which means the familiarity of our daily life" (2007:1). Sudden changes in place-identity and belonging also open up unexplainable spaces. Nostalgia takes the mind into the past, whereas imaginative narratives take it to a non-specific temporality where there is a possibility of a different future. In this sense, both nostalgia and imaginative narratives are notions of adaptation against deprivation.

In Ritivoi's psychoanalytic analysis it is maintained that nostalgia is also crucial for self-reflection and understanding one's identity. Ritivoi writes that "twentieth-century social scientists deem nostalgia a positive experience intended to bring one in touch with oneself, to provide the opportunity to reflect upon one's past (albeit obsessively sometimes), and to incorporate change into the more familiar background of previous experiences" (26). Looking back is a very intrinsically human act, and still may allow for endless opportunities to look at life differently. These new perspectives and meanings are especially complex and varied in exile narratives due to the constant self-inquiry and adaptation. Losses open up a spaces of self-creation, for the formation of additional identities. "To strengthen our sense of self the past needs to be rescued and made accessible" (Tuan 187).

In some instances, exile recognizes a past that cannot be reconstructed or reached. This is usually seen in conjunction with the reflective nostalgia. Adorno claims that every intellectual "in emigration is, without exception, mutilated, and does well to acknowledge it to himself" (12). He is a good example of the reflective nostalgic, although his pessimistic portrayal is only a portion of the exilic experience. As the exilic literature shows the multifaceted integrations in identity and the capability of human nature in extreme conditions of estrangement.

In certain situations, by protecting the past, the exile makes it a sacred memory. Said states that an exile knows that "in a secular and contingent world, homes are always provisional. Borders and barriers, which enclose us within the safety of familiar territory, can also become prisons, and are often defended beyond reason or necessity" (2012: 292). In some cases, under uninhabitable circumstances this realization cannot be achieved. And in that state, the mind of the exile may turn the nostalgic images into a place of reference. This may lead to new creative expressions of exile, much like in the case of its modern condition, the exile as an outsider. From now on, I will refer to the whole of these varied creative expressions, especially regarding the act of creating familiar and intimate spaces with the use of imagination, as imagined spaces.

Similar to nostalgia, imagined spaces derive from the mind and work through emotional associations and other cognitive systems. While nostalgia is understood as a reflection on change or a condition of adjustment, imagined spaces mostly examine the solitary or lonely states, and estranged conditions. For the most part, "nostalgia does not reject the present" (Ritivoi 27). Imagination, on the other hand, needs no borders in time or space, and belongs to no world except to the mind which creates it. In the imaginative narrative, "there is no need to return to a distant past, a past that is no longer our own, to find sacred properties attributed to the threshold" (Bachelard 260). It can confuse, interpret or deny the present moment, as well as the future and culminates in deprivation.

Imagined spaces are not accessible by an outsider, their inner complexity require various narrations and disruptions in the fabula. They are related to the real spaces through experiential notions.The duality between accessible real spaces and the restrictive imaginary spaces help create spatial depth in the story. A narrative replaces real with imaginary on rare occasions, and does so to achieve a specific intimacy.

When a narrator creates a space in the future, or a space that doesn't belong in the chronology or structure of the real world, such as utopias, we can talk about an imaginative narrative. These narratives can be optimistic or pessimistic, but mostly, they swing in-between moods. These spaces emanate a sense of hopelessness and hopefulness, sometimes within the same narrative. The imaginative narrative comes across as intimate and uncanny, thus creating an unreliable narrative, sometimes to the point of insanity. Boym's concept of 'diasporic intimacy' may also point to this state of in-between, while clinging onto familiar objects from the

past, not feeling attached to them. “At once homesick and sick of home, they developed a peculiar kind of diasporic intimacy, a survivalist aesthetics of estrangement and longing” (Boym 27).

As Rowe and Whitfield explain, Latin American literature has witnessed the formation of new identities “as a social necessity” against the political upheavals. “the need to transform societies marked by oppression, scarcity and the absence of an autonomous national culture” (233) The imagined homeland, in this case, was constructed from a lack of collective identity. This is similar to the case of restorative nostalgia, in which the memories of the past are integrated with the experiences of the present through “the act of imagining homeland identity” as Ernst van Alphen calls it (2003:53). The place of imagining is “radically framed by the historical dimensions of the place where the [it] takes place” (Alphen 53). Although, the mind is the primary location for both the imagined spaces and nostalgic spaces, so that they can interlace and overlap, within memory, imagined spaces carry a vastness that is not reachable solely through a gaze at the past. In imagined spaces, one’s sense of place does not come primarily from the things one was or owned, but from an integrative process of how life was and how it is. If a sense of belonging is not a given, such as in the case of exile, through the outer, social sphere, the exile creates an imagined space where she belongs. These limiting experiences allow and push her to create a world where she is free to be herself.

Although most individuals, experience similar thoughts and feelings in a foreign environment, there is a richness that comes with the accumulation of feelings of estrangement and depravity, that brings about a very spiritual aspect of exile.

Benedict Anderson was one of the first scholars to explore the need for togetherness forming an imagined state, in a communal aspect. His aim in analysis was to look for the underlying reasons for the creation of nationalism/nation-ness historically towards the end of 18th century. He claims that “through the spontaneous distillation of complex ‘crossing’ of discrete historical forces” was the primary act, much like the mass migrations happening today that lead to small communities within minorities (48). What’s more interesting is the second part of his statement, in which he claims that these forces “once created...became ‘modular’, capable of being transplanted, with varying degrees of self-consciousness, to a great variety of social terrains, to merge...with a correspondingly wide variety of political and ideological

constellations." (Anderson 48) These notions of being 'modular', being transplanted and carrying political and ideological notions are all intrinsic to most nation-based formations. Svetlana Boym describes her concept of 'diasporic intimacy' within the context of exiles in the United States. In America, all people are free and encouraged to speak their minds bluntly, which "Immigrants-and many alienated natives as well-cannot help but dread..." (423). Diasporic intimacy, she writes: "is not opposed to uprootedness and defamiliarization but is constituted by it" (423) In a counterintuitive way, it includes the first attribute of nation-ness Anderson mentions; which is discreteness, in this case, through language. "Diasporic intimacy can be approached only through...stories and secrets. It is spoken of in a foreign language that reveals the inadequacies of translation" (Boym 434). And its self-consciousness comes from the acceptance of not belonging: "In contrast to the utopian images of intimacy as transparency… it is rooted in the suspicion of a single home, in shared longing without belonging" (Boym 423). While diasporic intimacy sources its power from "the hope of the possibilities of human understanding and survival, of unpredictable chance encounters", it is not primarily ruled by political ideologies even though the common denominator is mostly national. Charles Simic writes about this family and other Yugoslavs getting together occasionally. He writes: "Nostalgia is big on the menu at such gatherings, and so is anger at how events turned out. My parents were tired of Balkan squabbles; they wanted a breather. Also, they didn't think there was a likelihood of ever going back. They turned out to be right" (Simic 111).

Even if their nations differ, in a foreign land the need for familiarity and intimacy might brings people together. When nation is not the primary home, exile opened up new forms of identification and attachments. Boym writes about Anderson's analysis of 'imagined communities': "Left out of Anderson's account are the stories of internal and external exiles, misfits and mixed bloods who offer digressions and detours from the mythical biography of a nation" (492). And through intellectual exiles, exilic writers and other marginalized individuals, new familiar and sacred spaces open up, which are compared against not nations but experiences of other places of belonging. These types of constructs, through the lens of modern and postmodern readings, are plentiful in academic analysis of exile literature and culture. With the transition from modern the postmodern understandings in arts and literature, all related concepts diversified. Exile, similarly became a reflection of the fragmented self in the postmodern world.

Thus the representations of these somewhat ambiguous fragments came to be part of a creative exile writing.

Magical realism is a literary genre that developed in the 20th century in Latin America. In Brazil, it was practically developed as an imaginative response for "the political situation of the country under the military dictatorship" (Smith 275). Cuban writer Lydia Cabrera is also thought to be "a precursor of Latin American magical realism" (Smith 289) In her literature, Cabrera showed "vivid realism, myth and fantasy,... and the imaginative, almost lyrical, use of language" (Smithe 289), which is a testimony to the power of expression evident in literature.

Imagined spaces can be seen as abstract ways to reach safety, nurture or love. In *The Poetics of Space*, Bachelards writes about the intrinsic connection between the house and the imagination. Bachelard says: "the imagination build[s] "walls" of impalpable shadows, comfort itself with the illusion of protection" (56). In particular, the mind wanders off when the body is limited or under the control of some other force. Prison and other heterotopias create good examples for this condition, as I will explain in liminal spaces.

The case of return from exile, or what Benedetti calls *desexilio* (dis-exile/un-exile), is analyzed by many academics as it captures the dissidence between the image of home and the reality (Markowitz et al 69). Adaptation and homecoming are variable processes in exile; for some exiles, they mean starting over in a new place with the knowledge of a prior life; and for some others they mean going back to their homeland and readjust. Don Rafael, an old exile, in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, ponders over his return back home: "You start from minus four, or minus twenty, or minus a hundred" (Benedetti 73). When exiles leave their countries, they usually leave behind a corrupted and chaotic country. This is especially true for Latin American exiles. In any case, return is a vast and varied subject for most of the political exiles, who have left their homeland precisely because they had identified with an ideology there.

The concept of imagined homelands is a product of the restorative nostalgic's approach to their homeland. While they may not be able to go back, they still may choose to identify with it. René Depestre, a Haitian poet, spent most of his life in exile. Yet "despite his absence from his native island, he remains essentially Haitian, identifying with his deprived countrymen, unrelentingly returning to the mythology of his heritage and expressing the obsessive, often

painful memories, associated with his homeland" (Smith 476). Instead of looking at the narratives of return, in this chapter I will look at the narratives of adjustment and hope.

2.3. Survey of the Real and Imagined Spaces

In my exploration of real and imagined spaces in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror,* I primarily look at how narrations reflect the character's inner world and imagined spaces, through their relations to the real spaces. As I have mentioned, the book has two primarily thematized spaces; exile and prison, both of which are predicated on the existence of a homeland or a home. The spaces of exile are observed by each character in different manners.

Don Rafael, father of Santiago, experiences the streets of his host country first as a dissident, a stranger. He is unimpressed by his 'room', where he lives. He believes that adaptation is necessary in exile, as well as owning one's conditions of exile. "After all, my exile is *my* exile" he writes (Benedetti 7, original emphasis). And he does that by 'taking charge of the streets', which are the representations of the real spaces in his exile. A political prisoner's father, Don Rafael, is forced to leave the country along with his daughter in law Graciela, her daughter Beatriz and Santiago's friend Rafael. Don Rafael's adaptive and calm nature portrays a good example of the Latin American writers, artists, journalists and other intellectual exile who had to live a good portion of their lives outside of their homelands.

While the country Uruguay comes up several times in writing, the host country is not mentioned directly. As an implication of the importance of relationships and shared cultures, Don Rafael names the host country "Lydia" after a woman he has met there. Before feeling estranged and in-between, he had asked himself : "Can it be that the condition of being foreign is a state of mind?" (133). In time, he adjust to the state of temporary belongingness, a sense of attachment for this country "Lydia" as they spend time together. But his distress, caused by the same unforeseeability of the future keeps him on his toes. "I can't live here that way, with the obsession that tomorrow or next October or in two years I'm going to slip my moorings and embark on my return, a mythical return, because living provisionally like that is always incomplete…" (138).

Rolando Asuero, Santiago's close friend, also tries to adapt to the daily life of this new city. He proposes an outing to the cinema but Graciela refuses. Restorative nostalgics, who "engage in the antimodern myth-making of history by means of a return to national symbols and myths and, occasionally, through swapping conspiracy theories" (Boym 100) can create their imagined homelands through various means of creativity and imagination. This may involve reconstructing the rituals and monuments similar or reminiscent of the homeland, while providing social satiety that comes from communal shared values, creating a deeper sense of togetherness.

Imagined homelands can be the collective recollection of a lived past. Eva Hoffman gives the example of refugee camps which "remained until the late 1950s, their inhabitants existing in virtual isolation, many never learning English and always hoping that the magic moment of redemption—the moment of return—was around the corner"(Aciman 42). She notes the discrepancy between the real and the imagined when she writes: "the actual Poland was no longer the one they remembered; it had changed in ways they would surely have found unpalatable, or at least highly perplexing, had they actually been able to go back" (Aciman 42).

I have mentioned that the two types of nostalgia can be applied to the exile narrative in conjunction with the Guillén's exile and counter-exile literatures. Although these distinctions help analyze the exilic experiences, they do not suggest that an exilic narrative can only be one or the other. *Springtime in a Broken Mirror* is a good example of the rapid transition between "imaginative presentations" of fictional exile and the "autobiographical conveyance of actual experience of exile" (Guillen 272). The book does this through two ways; by disrupting primary fabula with embedded narrative texts and by giving the impression of vague chronology through epistolary style narratives. By intermittently introducing the autobiographical narratives, the book achieves a mix-media status. An important result of this is the strengthened validity of exilic experiences and the mix of author with the narrator. "The play with sequence, although too complex to trace, calls attention to itself, because it contributes to the important wavering in the novel between supernatural and 'real' existence – a wavering that is, among other things, a metaphor for the bond between history and present, group and individuals" (Bal 132).

Santiago's psychology shifts from a state of depravity to hopefulness. Eva Hoffman calls this the 'psychic split'. She explains: "living in a story in which one's past becomes radically

different from the present and in which the lost homeland becomes sequestered in the imagination as a mythic, static realm" (Aciman 42) I looked at how these splits in emotions are reflected in narrations relating to Santiago in conjunction with his imagined spaces. When he learns that he is getting out of prison, his need for these spaces cease. He writes: "Faced with this new possibility, all of a sudden, I've stopped fantasizing, taking refuge in memories, reconstructing episodes from Solís or in our house, seeing shapes and faces in the damp patches on the walls" (Benedetti 118). This hopeful tone in narration, similar to restorative nostalgia which "proposes to rebuild the lost home and patch up the memory gaps", carries images of a happy future (Boym 99). However, a hopeful narrative goes beyond reality to find an anchor, made of dreams. Nostalgia forms out of an inconsistency between the past and the present, whereas hopeful narrative is an inconsistency between the present and the future. It's an illusion, a sweet dream.

Unlike imaginative narratives, reflective nostalgia makes clear that there is an awareness "of the gap between identity and resemblance; the home is in ruins or, on the contrary, has been just renovated and gentrified beyond recognition" (Boym 114). This dichotomy is captured in the Graciela-Santiago narrative. Graciela asks Ronaldo in a dialogue if he has noticed how the description of the scenery changes depending on which side of the train a person sits. She says: "when I'm facing forward, I feel as if the scenery is rushing towards me and… it makes me feel optimistic" (Benedetti 29). The narratives of each have different takes on their time spent alone. Santiago, a restorative nostalgic, is ruminating in imaginative spaces, hopeful for the future. Whereas Graciela is facing backwards, much like a reflective nostalgic. "I feel as if the scenery is pulling away from me, dwindling, dying. Frankly, it depresses me," she says (Benedetti 29).

Graciela's approach is reminiscent of Edward Said when he writes about the impossibility of reaching a home while being reminded of its existence.

> "The fact is that for most exiles the difficulty consists not simply in being forced to live away from home, but rather, given today's world, in living with the many reminders that you are in exile, that your home is not in fact so far away, and that the normal traffic of everyday contemporary life keeps you in constant but tantalizing and unfulfilled touch with the old place" (Said 1993: 114).

Imagination has both resistive and adaptive powers. It takes no space in the world, yet it has limitless space in the mind to trigger all varieties of emotions. Creations of this kind carry the restriction of being solely within the self. It is a comforting thought, to be outside of one's mind looking in, as it allows the self to observe itself. Guillen writes that counter-exile is the "imaginative presentation of relatively fictional themes, ancient myths or proposed ideas and beliefs growing from what are essentially the consequences in the changing writer,or group of writers,of the initial experiences" (272).

2.4. Survey of Temporal Distances in Springtime in a Broken Mirror

So far, I have established that exile narrative grants special importance to the relation between real and imagined spaces. In this section, I will look at the narrative techniques that create chronotropic distances between reader and narrator or in-between characters of the books. I will mos specifically look at how anachronies, retroversion or anticipation, are used. The distances between narratives as well as the character-reader distances may be effected through focalizations.

As I have explored, memory can be used as a disturbance in sequential ordering. It is a way of disrupting the chronological order of story for a brief and controlled manner, which gives way to more information about the narrator. It is also "the joint between time and space" (Bal 238).

Memories can open up a safe space for the exile, or in Santiago's case, a prisoner. He has to use his memories to provide himself the mental space. He writes to Graciela of the important people he has met and seen as if he's floating in a dreamlike state. "Memories of a child, adolescent and grown man, but beyond any doubt, memories of mine. In other words, when I raise the curtain, I am, as you may have appreciated, oh so interesting, I applaud myself and demand, Encore, Encore, Encore" (Benedetti 59). Boym's approach to this escape of the mind is a part of nostalgia. It is a "sentiment of loss and displacement, but it is also a romance with one's own fantasy" (16).

Playing with sequential ordering might also be useful in emphasizing the difference between expectation and realization, or hopeful and realistic narrations. Most of Santiago's

monologues are used to recreate his time with Graciela or to imagine the future with her. When juxtaposed to Graciela's silent inner self, whose emotions are mostly narrated through an external focalizor, we see that their expectations don't match. "If the contents of an internal retroversion overlap that of the primary fabula, then the retroversion usually serves as compensation for a gap in the story" writes Bal (153).

Eva Hoffman writes about her situation: "one certain outcome of exile that takes place in a bipolar world is the creation of a bipolar personal world" (35). She becomes aware about this temporal division through her displacement. She writes: "Temporally, the past is all of a sudden on one side of a divide, the present on the other" (Aciman 35) A play on the temporality is used by many exilic writers as it comes to them naturally, through their progress of nostalgia.

A functional way we can analyze most of the retroversions, especially in Santiago's narrative, is as to complete the gaps on the story and to get the reader closer to him by sympathising. Again, if we look at the beginning of the book which starts with Santiago writing about his experience in prison, we see that his is mostly the primary narrative. Another way the narrative distance between Graciela and Santiago is achieved through their different perspectives on life. Santiago's hopeful nature does not yield to Graciela's cold or sometimes absent letters. The different experiences of time is a big unspoken factor in their relationship.

Another use of narrative distances in this book is the mirroring of the distance between the exile country and the homeland. Female personification of the homeland is a common tool in Hispanic literature, especially in Latin American narratives. Graciela, much like the home in the past, changes in time and even though Santiago's passion for her is alive, he cannot help but notice the separation. Fittingly titled as 'Battered and Bruised', narrations of Graciela are the most distant and yet somehow heartbreaking at the same time. Her pessimistic approach is almost like the embodiment of the survivors guilt an exile may experience. This distance is emphasized through non-character bound focalization of Graciela's chapters, in which the reader can only assume her feelings through her dialogues which are limited as well.

Bal writes that when the same event is told through different perspectives, this might "...result in neutrality towards all the characters," (246). In the case of Rafael Asuero, the reader is able to reach his thought process as the character-bound focalization allows a window to his inner self. Other characters in the story, Don Rafael, Beatriz and Santiago, all have character

bound focalizations. Thus the character who is further away is Graciela. Bal continues to point out that "...there usually is not a doubt in our minds which character should receive most attention and sympathy" (246). If we look at the richness and openness of Santiago's inner world, we can see that this is true.

Bal mentions two other "aspects of chronological deviation" which are distance, and span (134), there is also an important distinction Bal makes based on the nuances of anachrony. The subjective anachrony can be seen in *Letters of Transit* for the most part, as the act of remembrance is also remembered. Bal defines this 'unreal' anachrony as the "so-called 'stream-of consciousness' literature" (138). Compared to the objective anachrony, it "is an anachrony which can be only be regarded as such if the 'contents of consciousness' lie in the past or the future; not the past of being 'conscious,' the moment of thinking itself" (138).

Santiago's narration captures rapid directional changes between his stream of consciousness and the chronological sequence of the primary fabula so much that, after a while it becomes hard to follow. This is made partially through constant switching of the narrations, which carry different focalizations and thus are harder to pin down chronologically. Bal asks "Which time should we consider the primary story-time: that is, the time in relation to which the other units may be called anticipations?" (139). Even though near the end of the story, sequential ordering is easier to mark through a big event, in the middle passages, there is no clear answer. Between the internal retroversions of Santiago and Don Rafael, they sometimes overlap with the narrative. They may even 'overtake' the primary narrative (Bal 144).

The last two chapters that are titled 'Extramural' are the stream of consciousness of Santiago's internal focalization. These are the two instances within the book which clearly delineate the presence of the fabula. The narrator jumps from thought to thought while observing the outside in a hasty manner. The excitement and dynamism is evident in many ways. A very similar and much analyzed segments are found Toni Morrison's *Beloved (2016)*, where the fragmented inner voice of three women take on a poetic and frantic narration. These instances of breaking down the linguistic barriers and form in literature are specifically powerful in depicting the restricted spaces of the mind of characters.

We can also note that since both Don Rafael and Santiago are alone at the time of narration, or as they write the letters or journals, there is no way of deciding if the retroversions

are happening internally or externally. Bal writes that "If the retroversion begins outside the primary time span and ends within it, we refer to a mixed retroversion" (143), which might apply in this case.

Don Rafael's nostalgic tone switches from a restorative and hopeful stance to a reflective one throughout the novel. While his adaptive outlook on life allows a different telling of the state of exile. Especially his age and his separation from his son, who is in prison, allows a wider exploration of how life changes the self and how some humans endure all.

He explains: "All of a sudden, the past becomes lavish, though I don't know why" (Benedetti 48). He sees a future yet, he cannot let go of the past. Acknowledging his old age he writes: "What is this, exile if not another beginning? And every beginning is youthful. So I, an old beginner, am growing young again" (Benedetti 48).

2.5. Liminal Spaces

I've mentioned the complex and sometimes vague relation between the past, the present, and the future and how they might be reflected in the narration. With nostalgia, the past and with imagination, a sense of future is exposed. There is a connection, a sense of belonging, that has gotten stronger through remembrance and nostalgia.

When there is a discrepancy in both temporal and spatial aspects, and even a lack of experiential time and space at times, we can talk about liminal spaces. Situated in-between the past and the future, exile lives "in the median state, neither completely at one with the new setting nor fully disencumbered of the old... nostalgic and sentimental on one level, an adept mimic or a secret outcast on another" (Said 1993:114). These spaces tend to carry transitory qualities while an expected end that a linear sequence could propose, is missing. Thus there is a sense of displacement in both planes. Some academics claim that being in exile is already a liminal stage, in which neither the old home nor the host place is reachable. Jennifer Ann Fawcett expands on the correlation between home and liminality and writes: "we see that home is actually absent, and that liminality conveys a sense of homelessness" (2008:62) This quality of liminal spaces implies that they carry no associations of self whatsoever, nor can they become

places of meaningful attachment. Thus liminal spaces do not allow the individual to belong in any circumstance.

Acknowledging this impossibility of reaching home, Said writes: “You can't go back to some earlier and perhaps more stable condition of being at home; and, alas, you can never fully arrive, be at one with your new home or situation,” (1993:117). As Turner explains: “Liminal entities are neither here nor there; they are betwixt and between the positions assigned and arrayed by law, custom, convention, and ceremonial” (95).

In the liminal spaces time is either expensive or not recognized. In the exile narrative, we can place liminality, broadly as a state in between past and future, and between here and there. Reflection in liminality achieve a transitory, incomplete feeling. Sense of place in liminality can be achieved through borders because the liminal is too dynamic to have a stable meaning. I will explain this further in the case of prison.

In exile literature, we repeatedly come across an ambiguous state of nowhere.Sudden changes in place-identity and belonging open up unexplainable spaces. Svetlana Boym notes the word exile comes from *ex-salire*, or to leap outside, thus making it a mixture of “suffering in banishment and springing into a new life” at the same time (428). She claims that the act of leaping outside emphasizes a gap “often an unbridgeable one” which exposes “what is lost and what is found” (Boym 428).

Edward Said claims that the exile is at a position where stability is no longer attainable: “...there is no real escape, even for the exile who tries to remain suspended, since that state of inbetweenness can itself become a rigid ideological position, a sort of dwelling whose falseness is covered over in time and to which one can all too easily become accustomed” (1993:120). And that “inbetweenness” also carries shadows of a much more metaphysical and psychological yearning for home. “Modern nostalgia is a mourning for the impossibility of mythical return...a nostalgia for an absolute, a home that is both physical and spiritual, the edenic unity of time and space before entry into history.” writes Svetlana Boym (46). So the physical consequences of being out of place always touch the quizzical mind of the modern person. In a way, the type of exile who was forced out of a home naturally becomes an outcast.

The exiles then become, liminal *personae* or threshold people, as Victor Turner calls it. The people who are in that state have traits which “...are necessarily ambiguous, since this

condition and these persons elude or slip through the network of classifications that normally locate states and positions in cultural space" (Turner 95).

Similarly, the intellectual has this implication of never belonging. In her essay titled *A New Type of Intellectual: The Dissident* Kristeva explains this new intellectual connotation of exile as "...a form of *dissidence,* since it involves uprooting oneself from a family, a country or a language" (2002: 298). However, Said adds to this claim the upsides of being an intellectual exile, traits which could not have existed till now. He writes: "If you can experience that fate, not as a deprivation and as something to be bewailed, but as a sort of freedom, a process of discovery and doing things according to your own pattern, as various interests seize your attention and as the particular goal you set for yourself dictates, that is a unique pleasure" (1993:123).

2.5.1. Prison and Exile

Prison has an unnatural stance in Western societies, much like the exile's world which Said considers "is unnatural and its unreality resembles fiction" (reflections on exile 287) It is a place of reconciliation, and the distancing of the prisoner from society heavily accentuates its exilic side. A banishment from all humanity, in deprivation and under scrutiny, it is understandable that prison is a prominent symbol in many modern literary texts. Interpretation of prison lead to the illumination of its physical, psychological and societal aspects such as captivity, punishment, cleansing and reprimanding. Akin to the religious understanding of the word, it might indicate a purgatory space. Indeed, some are called 'purgatory' or 'correction' facilities. In *Des Espace Autres (Of Other Spaces, 1967),* Foucault notes that the heterotopias of deviation are spaces for "individuals whose behavior is deviant in relation to the required mean or norm are placed" (1984). Prisons are so much outside the societal systems that there is always an uncanny undertone.

In the 21st century, we struggle with the issues of distinguishing the structure and aim of spaces as heterotopic spaces multiply. In *The Ritual Process*, Turner writes that "By verbal and nonverbal means of classification we impose upon ourselves innumerable constraints and boundaries to keep chaos at bay, but often at the cost of failing to make discoveries and inventions: that is to say, not all instances of subversion of the normative are deviant and

criminous. Yet in order to live, to breathe, and to generate novelty, human beings have had to create spaces and times" (vii).

Prison, as a temporary place for most, is aimed for the function of straightening the devious behaviors of criminals to reintegrate them into society, in a safe and healthy manner. But a person who has been outside of society, and who has been put into a controlled environment as a captive cannot be expected to behave as a free person in control of her own life.

A second point relating to the uncanny aspect of the function of prison is precisely how it restricts the use of space for the prisoner in many aspects. "Space, a biological necessity to all animals, is to human beings also a psychological need, a social perquisite, and even a spiritual attribute." writes Tuan (58). And while a prisoner may have enough physical space to fulfil her biological functions, the social, psychological and spiritual aspects of a prison cannot be thought of as satisfactory.

In prison, change is not a reason for fear but a missing ingredient of life. For the exile living in a vast unknown or a prisoner who lacks control over life's uncertainties, any small deviation of the daily routine causes great impacts. The depravity of home and the nostalgic yearning for another time are the common denominators of both.

Brodsky commonly uses prison as a metaphor for exile. Boym claims this is true for "many formerly imprisoned writers" such as Solzhenitsyn "who during his American exile recreated the conditions of prisonlike confinement in a remote Vermont town" (588).

Although it may seem like a brutal comparison, exilic spaces are also a type of heterotopias. Exile may seem like an easy transitional space compared to a prison as exile has more control over her life. Heterotopias are illusory spaces which "seem to be pure and simple openings, but... generally hide curious exclusions" (Foucault 7).

Exilic spaces are open to most people. If you can adapt, you seem fine. But the facade of inclusion. "Everyone can enter into the heterotopic sites, but in fact that is only an illusion—we think we enter where we are, by the very fact that we enter, excluded" (7). These exclusions may also be hidden exile as in the case of Said's interaction with other academics in the US. Edward Said writes about the times he has been treated as a "peculiar creature" by many: "even a few friends, who had assumed that being Palestinian was the equivalent of being something mythological like a unicorn or a hopelessly odd variation of a human being" (Aciman 95). And

his identity stays unhinged through his busy routines and work schedule. “I quite deliberately avoided the self-questioning that would have landed me in a terminal depression” he writes (Aciman 95).

An exile usually feels an accusation for his actions, for disrupting an existing system. This feeling of inferiority might turn into a psychological prison sentence, cast aside from the cultural and societal belongingness exilic space becomes her main location.

The prison is imbued with symbols of captivity within its walls and freedom of an inner mental space. Its representation within the story has a lot in common with the state of exile, as I will discuss later on. The space of exile carries both the prospect of a new life and the limits of an unreachable freedom. Boym writes that for Brodsky,“the shrinkage of space and the extension of time become fundamental to his poetics” (588).

2.5.2. Prison in Springtime in a Broken Mirror

Santiago is in prison for his political actions. Within his year of captivity, through his letters we go back and forth in time and form his life story. If we decide that the narration of Santiago makes up the primary fabula, we can derive that as readers, we have very little perspective into the whole story. Moreover, throughout the narrative of Santiago, the relationship between the experience of prison and exile become somewhat analogous.

There are two main spatial settings in the novel; one is the prison Santiago is in and the other is the city where the others are in exile. Theresa Whitfield and William Rowe claim that in Latin America, “[t]he act of exile itself has become something that was not legally imposed but rather undertaken 'voluntarily' to avoid persecution, imprisonment or death in the imminent but unknown future” (229). Similarly, Santiago writes about prison as an exilic state. “One day I’ll leave behind this strange exile and become part of the world again…” (Benedetti 56). By using the narrative tools freely, Benedetti creates a distance with the host country while intermittently reminding the reader of Uruguay's past and qualities.

The purpose of prison in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror* is to create a juxtaposition of progress and non-progress. The alienating place of non-progress requires the individual to think back on life and relive it again. Whereas the exile, in a state of constant change and development,

needs to move on and adjust. Santiago mentions how he's learned to control his memories to keep his suffering under control. "When you've no choice but to stay in one place, you build up incredible mental agility. You can stretch out in the present as much as you like, or dizzily pitch yourself into the future…" (Bendetti 55). This walled-in space the narrator references, invokes claustrophobic feelings.

3. Language and Literary Spaces

The spaces I've observed so far function in providing the area for the narrative of the text. In this section, I aim to go beyond the narrative aspects and connect the experiential exile of the author to the text. Bal makes a clear distinction between the author and the narrator. She writes that her concern is mainly "the stronghold of a misconceived interpretive authority" (43). Regardless of this censorship problem, I believe that it is important to recognize, without dwelling on the individual interpretations, that the underlying 'mechanisms of exclusion' for "making interpretation a privileged form of art-processing" is evident in most literary works (Bal 43). This is especially true for autobiographically imbued texts such as exile, trauma and non-fiction narratives.

I do believe, especially in the case of writing through human experience, there is an aspect of the text that is naturally testimonial. Whether or not the text has fictional elements is more related to the narrative aspects of it. Narrative spaces are inherited technical tools within literature and other texts that have narrative qualities, whereas literary spaces are inherited literary voices, unique to the writer, even though they might be in relation with each other. My aim in this section is not to distinguish and discriminate authors based on their writings, on the contrary, it is to find the common experiences of exile writing.

I will look into the adaptable meanings of words, and how they may be used in exile literature. I will then touch upon the place of language in exile literature as both a new space of freedom and a place of belonging in relation to sense of place. And finally, through the explanation of dialectics in exile narratives, I will analyze the two main dialectical games in the books I have chosen.

3.1. Language and Style

Words are never the same. They change, adapt and get interpreted. “A word is seldom banal on its own: in music too the single note is immune to triteness” writes Adorno (85). And like words, no experience is the same when written through reflection, hope, integrity, loss, heartbreak, and hope. Exile literature is uniquely creative when it comes to language and words, as it depends on the leftover structure and leaves superficiality for others to worry about. Bachelard writes;

> “Words—I often imagine this—are little houses, each with its cellar and garret. Common-sense lives on the ground floor, always ready to engage in “foreign commerce,” on the same level as the others, as the passers-by, who are never dreamers. To go upstairs in the word house is to withdraw, step by step; while to go down to the cellar is to dream, it is losing oneself in the distant corridors of an obscure etymology, looking for treasures that cannot be found in words. To mount and descend in the words themselves—this is a poet’s life” (189).

Language is an important part of meaning-making. Its richness is partly due to the subjectivity of its developmental process, and to its communicability. It is the very best tool for freeing the complexity of the human mind, so as to not be overcome by them; it’s a tool for progress, for the accumulation of information. While it is part of a learning mechanism, it’s also the memory’s companion for adaptation. Our perceptions of a sound, a word, a phrase change through this process according to our exposure to the world.

In *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, emphasis on certain words are used by most of the characters on occasions. Santiago expresses his complex interpretations of the word ‘door’ in one of his letters. He mentions the word and how its meaning has changed since he’s been in prison. Language has the possibility of posing words within the frame of the narration, and this way, the symbols of limitation are reflected through the narrative itself. “You can’t have open bars and closed bars. But a door can mean so many things,” he claims (Benedetti 57). “When it’s closed (as it always is), it signifies enclosure, prohibition, silence, rage. If it were open… that would mean recovering reality, loved ones, streets, tastes, smells, sounds, images and the feeling of being free” (Benedetti 57).

Bachelard extensively discusses the possible meanings of door. “how many daydreams we should have to analyze under the simple heading of Doors!” he writes. “For the door is an entire cosmos of the Half-open” (259). Locked up between the walls and behind closed doors, how can a person be optimistic? How can Santiago find the inspiration to dream? His optimist stance is reflected in his daughter Beatriz. Her play with words seem to echo his childlike nature.

Language for Beatriz is forming under the influence of an exilic life. This causes her to confuse and mix words, misinterpret and adjust to her newly forming vocabulary. A representation of the adaptation process in its simplest form, her childlike manner allows the reader to recognize how even small details might affect the sense of familiarity. “Beatriz gives us a sense of the newness and contingency of language. Words are in the process of becoming signifiers in her world, and on the way they can be waylaid” (Kaminsky 71). In one chapter Beatriz analyzes about the word ‘freedom’ and how free countries also have “things that are very forbidden” (Benedetti 84). Killing and stealing are some of the examples she gives. “Of course, you can kill mosquitoes and cockroaches, and also cattle for steaks…” she adds (Benedetti 84). Then she points at the irony of the name of the prison her father is in: Liberty. Another example for her curious word associations is bars. She remembers her dream about being at the zoo with her father and her father telling him: “Beatriz, can you see those bars, that’s how I’m living now” (Benedetti 63).

In *On Truth and Lie in an Extra-Moral Sense* (1873), Nietzsche writes: “Once upon a time, in some out of the way corner of that universe which is dispersed into numberless twinkling solar systems, there was a star upon which clever beasts invented knowing” (246).

Active human communication starts when comparisons are used for learning different sounds and words. Language making is a form of learning where the differences in objects and places are experienced through senses. We go through a separation of the spaces firstly during our childhood. In time, the child separates the self from the other by observing the connections between them and strengthens this by using verbal cues for every object or person he/she comes across. This meaning-making process naturally involves places, objects, and people. “Language itself begins when the infant stops babbling indiscriminately and experiments with highly differentiated sounds” writes Tuan (34). But differentiation actually starts much earlier, with place recognition. A child may see shapes and the difference between them, but not necessarily

is aware of them. Most often than not "the child gains knowledge of and reacts to this environment without conscious awareness" (Proshansky et. al 63).

When classification is established through the logical use of words, then we can talk about a place-awareness. "Things are not quite real until they acquire names and can be classified in some way" (Tuan 29). Thus the feeling is also affected by knowledge in return. Any information on the subject would influence its attachment the memory. Both the spoken and the written language also allows for a feeling to be prolonged in time and to be remembered. Tuan hypothesizes on this topic: "Perhaps one reason why animal emotions do not reach the intensity and duration of human ones is that animals have no language to hold emotions so that they can either grow or fester" (107). Sometimes our emotions even act as evidence, and through them, we can claim certain rights. As we've established that how we use language to express ourselves depends heavily on our feelings and thoughts, we can analyze the literary side of language.

"To value literature at all is fundamentally to value it as the individual work of an individual writer tangled up in circumstances taken for granted by everyone… The problem for the interpreter, therefore, is how to align these circumstances with the work, how to separate as well as incorporate them, how to read the work and its worldly situation" (Said 2012: 13). This multifaceted nature of literature, and language, that is somewhat unique to each person, contributes to the nature of that person. We see this trait more prominently in writers and professional speakers, as well as professions that require sufficient control over language. Their manner of using language, through many practice and experiments, becomes a notable reflection of their personas. Although relevant, the literary voice is another concept much debated as it questions the very degree an author has agency over her voice and to what extent this is a narrator's voice.

Nevertheless, we can say that language reflects a side of identity and with it possessions of a person. I use the word possession, as this too is a trait which goes back to childhood, and advances with language acquisition. Tuan writes that children, "at least those of the Western world, develop a strong sense of property. They become strongly possessive" (32). This sense of possession wanes through the years, yet all humans recognize the need to personally possess, and in return, belong. "All human beings appear to have personal belongings and perhaps all have need of a personal place, whether this be a particular chair in a room or a particular corner in a

moving carriage" (Tuan 32). A chain of attachments give people their history, the narratives they need to 'know' who they are.

Ownership may also occur in the context of nations, cultures and the values attached to these concepts. Many writers, like Edward Said, claim the possession of the Eurocentrism is directly related to imperialism. He writes that despite the historical movements against acts of possession in recent years like colonialism and ethnic cleansing, "a great revision has taken place in cultural discussion which in my own way I feel I have contributed to, namely, the critique of Eurocentrism" (13). These dialectics opened up the valuable perspective of comparison, which provides literary means of acknowledging different views especially on the topic of belonging. Within the Western cultures and subcultures, words like estrangement, exile, migration gained relatively new meanings. This addition doesn't necessarily rid the word of old meanings, but they get pushed back into the depths of memory. The variety of meanings one word can carry becomes embedded in literature and arts, giving tools for the writer to get a sense across that can transcend the words used. In in the case of narration, Mieke Bal writes that narratives "can endorse that meaning, reject or change it, or play on different ways in which characters are situated in relation to it" (225).

The first aspect of language was that it allows the experience to be formed and expressed at the same time. The second, furthermore, is that language itself can become a mode of exile. This refers to the hardships of learning, talking and writing in a new language, and also to the creative possibilities opened up by encounters of exiles with a new language.

Similar to monuments, the written history of humans can be understood as a literary heritage. Exile literature, especially, has lived through a considerable length of history to have a colorful archive of inspirational tales. "The novelty of our time...is that so many individuals have experienced the uprooting and dislocations that have made them expatriates and exiles. Out of such travail there comes an urgency, not to say a precariousness of vision and a tentativeness of statement, that renders the use of language something much more interesting and provisional than it would otherwise be " (Said 2012:14).

In the context of exile words like homecoming, nostalgia and displacement gained new meanings. Ironically, an exile is someone who loses some parts of her language abilities, whether it be in expression, accent or transition into a new language entirely. To create or find a space in

a new language, to belong in there takes a lot out of an exile. More interestingly, a writer in need and search of expression needs to find ways in this new space for her own voice. “How does one communicate the pain of loss in a foreign language?” asks Boym (484). Aciman describes writing in a new language, in the case of the writers in *Letters of Transit*, in English: “Having chosen careers in writing, each uses the written word as a way of fashioning a new home elsewhere, of revisiting, transposing, or perpetuating the old one on paper, writing away the past the way one writes off bad debts, doing the one absurd thing all exiles do, which is to look for their homeland abroad, or to try to restore it abroad, or, more radical yet, to dispose of it abroad” (Aciman 5). Bharati Mukherjee sees the second language as an option finor artistry. In *Letters of Transit,* she writes: “The expatriate is the ultimate self-made artist, even the chooser of a language in which to operate, as Conrad, Beckett, Kundera, and Nabokov testify, an almost literal exponent of Joyce’s dream of self-forging in the smithy of his soul” (Aciman 57). While the host language, in this case English, and its relation with the authorial identity is a big topic, the question remains: “in what language will [the exile] express his confused awareness of these intimate paradoxes?” (Aciman 5).

In the section titled *Real and Imagined Spaces*, I have gone over exile’s explorations of identity through nostalgic narratives. For the exilic writer the process of exploration might seem like both a struggle and a creative factor. Boym writes: “Ordinary exiles often become artists of their lives, remaking themselves and their second homes with great ingenuity. Inability to return home is both a personal tragedy and an enabling force” (422). Writing in exile can also become a way to reconcile the past with the present. In a way, exile writers are using literature “as a way of fashioning a new home elsewhere, of revisiting, transposing, or perpetuating the old one on paper, writing away the past the way one writes off bad debts, doing the one absurd thing all exiles do, which is to look for their homeland abroad, or to try to restore it abroad, or, more radical yet, to dispose of it abroad” (Aciman 5). In this case, we can talk about the construction of a home in literature, a home in-between the pages. Adorno fittinly writes: “In his text, the writer sets up house” (87).

Andre Aciman writes about the other exile writers in *Letters of Transit*, “English has become the language they speak at home” (Aciman 7). Although their accents give them away and betray “the body’s inability to adapt or to square away the details of a naturalization that

should have been finalized decades ago" (Aciman 6), for Mukherjee the accent "is an amalgam of the places I've lived, my wardrobe is a similar hodgepodge, and so is our daily menu"(Aciman 62) From a liminal perspective "An accent marks the lag between two cultures, two languages, the space where you let go of one identity, invent another, and end up being more than one person though never quite two" (Aciman 7) Aciman claims that in their accents exiles partially keep the "reluctance to let go of things that are at once private and timeless, the way childhood and ritual and memory are private and timeless", while trying to adapt (6). One hand reaching the past, the other holding onto now, exilic fights the intuition to let go of one or the other, and try to find meaning where she is. "It is as though we sojourned in a limbo of being" writes Bachelard (105).

Don Rafael, in *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*, is an old-aged academic in exile, a character which might be read as a representation of an old Benedetti. In a short passage, Don Rafael mentions a sudden desire to write. "I haven't written in fifteen years… And, for fifteen years, I had no desire to do so. But now, suddenly, I do. Could this be a sign?" (Benedetti 33). He writes about the experience of exile. Whereas Santiago, much like a younger Benedetti, carries a passion for life, especially in politics. His passion for life is represented in his love towards his wife. These two forces of human nature; the passionate voice of a young man and the accepting humbleness of a senior come together in his poems as well as stories. In the introduction of *Little Stones at My Window: Piedritas En La Ventana (2013)*, a collection of poems by Bendetti, the translator Charles Dean Hatfield writes about Benetti's literary approach: "The human voice, rather than a dogmatic or didactic political voice is the driving force behind his writing; the exploration of the modern human condition and the search for social communion are constantly enacted in opposition to the vast structures and systems that separate humanity" (xiii).

3.2. Dialectical Games

Without getting into the structure of dialectics, I have actually mentioned some familiar dualities and dialectical concepts of exile literature. In my introduction, I built a connection between the states of mobility and stability of modern human condition, through which I have

explored dynamic and steady narratives in literature. Tuan exemplifies this with the "dialectical movement between shelter and venture, attachment and freedom" (Tuan 54), whereas Bal relates this dichotomy to the Western literature's inheritance of "the late biblical vision of heaven and hell, and from Latin and Greek mythology" (Bal 329). I have discussed two types of exile, physical and metaphysical, that I claim are intertwined at times. From the captivity and freedom of the inner state, I have mentioned the exilic writing and expression as well as two types of nostalgias. I have then related those to Guillen's concept of exile and counter exile. Under the same captivity-freedom context, I have analysed the relationship between prison and exile. From the narrative perspective I have analysed the real and imagined spaces, and the third state of liminality. While the opposites and dualities may construct different perspectives and clear distinctions, in exile narratives the in-between spaces and the dialectical momentum are just as important. McClennen explains this through Hegel's concept of "unities of opposites", which "provides the richest resource for analysing exile writing" (McClennen 30).

Dialectical narratives allow different aspects of the story to be seen, as the synchronized perspectives depict a multi-centered comparison of spaces. I have given the example of the narratives of Graciela and Santiago for this case. One of the highly addressed dialectics in the literature regarding distinguishments and attachments is the contrasting conceptual words of 'inside' and 'outside'. Bal writes: "When several places, ordered in groups, can be related to psychological, ideological, and moral oppositions, location may function as an important principle of structure" (349). The crisis of belonging naturally evokes a comparison of different places in exile's life.

Bachelard names this separation between the self-identified objects and the rest which he calls "the dialectical game of the I and the non-I" (Gaston Bachelard 56). Identity can be a part of this spatial duality.

The dialectical narratives gain overwhelming importance in most travel, displacement and modern urban narratives. In exile narratives today, it is possible to see all forms of dialectical narratives through the relationship of the inner world of the narrator with her outer world. McClennen writes: "Understanding exile writing as dialectical provides a common theoretical exploration for the tensions and anxieties inherent in exile writing that is sufficiently loose as to be pertinent to a broad range of applications" (30).

For some writers on the topic, the dialectical nature makes the analysis superficial and simplified. Because a stance in either side of a topic distinguishes an "opponent" or better yet two of them, the narrative might be understood to have taken place within the limitations of this dialectic of opposites. "Outside and inside form a dialectic of division, the obvious geometry of which blinds us as soon as we bring it into play in metaphorical domains. It has the sharpness of the dialectics of yes and no, which decides everything. Unless one is careful, it is made into a basis of images that govern all thoughts of positive and negative." (Bachelard 250) Simply using two opposites of a topic to explain a relation to it risks putting the writer into a discriminatory position based on the interpretation of the text. In *Letters of Transit,* Eva Hoffman writes: "In the "bipolar" mentality, the idea of home may become too dramatized or sentimentalized" (47). Bachelard calls this dialectic of opposition, the "geometrical cancerization of the linguistic tissue of contemporary philosophy" (251). Similarly, Bal writes "The oppositions we expect to function in fabulas can be traps as well as tools" (Bal 331).

However, it is undeniable that the human mind works in dichotomies, comparisons and associations. The most common form of these are the dual groupings of concepts and meanings. Tuan explains this as distinctions of "an "inside" and an "outside," of intimacy and exposure, of private life and public space", rather than being aware of them (107). "Constructed form has the power to heighten the awareness and accentuate, as it were, the difference in emotional temperature between "inside" and "outside " (Tuan 107). Literature, has the power, similarly, to evoke new aspects within dualities by novel associations of concepts.

I have demonstrated that part of the adaptation or recognition process for an exile is to go back and forth in memories and the now. This comparison of daily acts or intimate objects is observable in many exile literatures. Boym writes: "The main feature of exile is a double conscience, a double exposure of different times and spaces, a constant bifurcation" (493). The exile goes back and forth any time her place identity is disrupted even slightly, so much so that it can become a habit, a way of living. "Most people are principally aware of one culture, one setting, one home; exiles are aware of at least two, and this plurality of vision gives rise to an awareness of simultaneous dimensions, an awareness that—to borrow a phrase from music—is *contrapuntal*" (Said 2012:293).

In this section, I will look at the two common dialectics found in the books of my choice, to give concrete examples for how diversely concepts as simple as inside and outside can be used within exile narratives.

3.2.1. Us/Them

Social formations are a big part of the narrative of exile. They can be seen as alienating forces, or tools of adjustment into a foreign environment. The underlying ambiguities of social and national formations are discussed by Homi Bhabha from a modern perspective in *The Location of Culture (2012).* He claims that looking at the "problematic boundaries of modernity... these ambivalent temporalities of the nation-space" are seen. While historians and political theorists strive to create a homogeneous concept of nation, "transfixed on the event and origins of [it]", Bhabha claims that "the essential question of the representation of the nation as a temporal process" is missing (204).

Nations and societies form based on a set of values such as language, culture, nationality, etc. These value systems gain their own autonomy and, depending on where the exile positions herself, display either discriminating or supporting roles. Bhabha writes: "The language of culture and community is poised on the fissures of the present becoming the rhetorical figures of a national past" (20).

In the simplest sense, communities may embrace the intimate relations formed among their members and may impose certain rules, ideologies or rituals. Boym states that these cultural identities are "based on a certain social poetics or "cultural intimacy" that provides a glue in everyday life" (101). An identity belonging to the pattern of cultural and social environments "involves everyday games of hide-and-seek that only "natives" play, unwritten rules of behavior, jokes understood from half a word, a sense of complicity" Boym writes (101).

All modern states of social and governmental spaces are well aware that a sense of "togetherness" has to be achieved. As Said writes: "all nationalisms have their founding fathers, their basic, quasi-religious texts, their rhetoric of belonging" he writes (281). Unlike social spaces, national identities are more serious formations, according to Boym. "National memory reduces this space of play with memorial signs to a single plot" (101).

In nationalistic dialects, such as in the writings of most political exiles and emigres, it creates an inside/outside dichotomy within the public space, mostly as us and them. According to Bhabha this is mostly due to a "liminal, uncertain state of cultural belief when the archaic emerges in the midst of margins of modernity as a result of some psychic ambivalence or intellectual uncertainty," which derives from Freud's definition of 'uncanny' (Bhabha page)

Hannah Arendt writes: "What makes mass society so difficult to bear is not the number of people involved, or at least not primarily, but the fact that the world between them has lost its power to gather them together, to relate and to separate them" (52). Similarly, in *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*, Said writes: "All nationalisms in their early stages develop from a condition of estrangement" (280). He is relating to the feeling of estrangement as not only the outsiders, marginals, but as modern nations, whose people have become more and more separated. And each new medium, instead of diminishing this sense of estrangement, "affects the relationship between distance and intimacy that is at the core of nostalgic sentiment" (Boym 666). The type of reflective nostalgia that is felt under the heavy weight of no-return, becomes a narrative tool for the writer. This dialect can make or break nations."The conspiratorial worldview reflects a nostalgia for a transcendental cosmology and a simple premodern conception of good and evil" (Boym 102). This is essentially a quality of the nation-states, "transforming rivers, mountains, and other arbitrary features into the difference between the sovereignty of 'us' and 'them.'" (Decker and Winchock 1).

In *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays* Edward Said writes on this dilemma of belonging;

> "And just beyond the frontier between "us" and the "outsiders" is the perilous territory of not-belonging: this is to where in a primitive time peoples were banished, and where in the modern era immense aggregates of humanity loiter as refugees and displaced persons" (281).

The names of these dialectical games might change, but the core structure remains as the two dichotomies of power and meaning. For some, when the mind lets go of this fight the process of adjustment and might start. For others, this function of this game is precisely to understand and relate to the Other. Bhabha points out that to read "between these borderlines of the nation-space" allows us to "see how the concept of the 'people' emerges within a range of

discourses as a double narrative movement" (208). As carriers of the in-between identities, sometimes belonging to both and sometimes to neither, exiles gain a vision larger than a citizen, a patriot, a neighbor can. In a way, they also violate the social structures through this new perspective while trying to make sense of them.

3.2.2. Here/There

The dialectics of 'here' and 'there' is usually used in exile narratives as a comparison of the past and the present. This nostalgia imbued act allows the exile to make associations and get accustomed to the new environment. From a literary aspect, it allows the writer the creative space of reflection.

In a foreign place, the alienated mental space of the mind might need an anchor. For the exile who is under the constant scrutiny of the surroundings, of time familiar places may provide solace. "The rapid pace of industrialization and modernization increased the intensity of people's longing for the slower rhythms of the past, for continuity, social cohesion, and tradition" (Boym 57). Nature is one of the important symbols of this peaceful state, where the rhythm of life seems to be slowing down. Yi Fu Tuan's approach to place derives from a similar understanding: "Place is an organized world of meaning. It is essentially a static concept" (Tuan 179). In the midst of a chaotic picture, the eyes find somewhere familiar.

In *Letters of Transit,* Aciman's description of Straus Park provides a good illustration of this search for stability in dynamic spatialities. Tuan writes "If we see the world as process, constantly changing, we should not be able to develop any sense of place" (179). Aciman expresses that he feels at home in this park, situated at an "intersection of four" New York City, in a place where he is an exile, becomes suddenly four cities at once. "I was in one place that had at least four addresses." he writes. The beauty of this place for Aciman comes from what it represents and evokes in him; a sense of stability and familiarity.

> "There were moments when, despite the buses and the trucks and the noise of people with boom boxes, the traffic light would change and everything came to a standstill and people weren't speaking, and the unrelenting sun beat strong on the pavement, and I would

almost swear this was an early summer afternoon in Italy, and that what lay behind Riverside Park was not just my imaginary Seine, but the Tiber as well " (Aciman 19).

His small game of memory, finding the familiarities between this city and the others becomes a starting place of his daily life rituals. "I would return to Straus Park every day, because returning was itself now part of the ritual of remembering the shadow cities hidden there...This became my habit, and ultimately my habitat " (Aciman 20). Within the unknown spaces of exile, the recognition of places brings back the old meaning of home to these new shadows cities.

The daily life, the routine becomes overemphasized for anyone not able or willing to construct a stable rhythm of life, staying put in one place. Tuan names this routine-based adaptation process as the "feel" of a place. "It is made up of experiences, mostly fleeting and undramatic, repeated day after day and over the span of years. It is a unique blend of sights, sounds, and smells, a unique harmony of natural and artificial rhythms such as times of sunrise and sunset, of work and play " (Tuan 183-4).

Anachronic segments like this where the memory bridges the gaps through nostalgia and imagination create a dynamic narrative. When done right, they are both appealing and rich. This 'cinematic image of nostalgia' as Boym credits it, is like "a double exposure, or a superimposition of two images-----of home and abroad, past and present, dream and everyday life. The moment we try to force it into a single image, it breaks the frame or burns the surface" (16). These segments emphasize the temporality, yet also create another space that belongs nowhere, it is simply an image in passing. Just like Bachelard's half-open door, the space in passing is "the very origin of a daydream that accumulates desires and temptations: the temptation to open up the ultimate depths of being, and the desire to conquer all reticent beings" (259).

In S*pringtime in a Broken Mirror*, Don Rafael uses dialectics of here and there to explain the realization of his own nostalgia: "Back there I had always taken the same route home. And that was the thing I missed, being here" (Benedetti 7). As a carrier of these in-between identities, belonging to sometimes both and sometimes neither, exiles gain a vision larger than a citizen, a patriot, a neighbor can. In his foreword, Andre Aciman writes "With their memories perpetually on overload, exiles see double, feel double, are double" (8). In a way, he/she also violates the

social structures through this new perspective. The identification of being an exile disturbs the stability of the present by propagating new spaces and places in different directions.

Through these two points, narratives arrive at a 'third space' "that enables the emergence of multiple positions… forgoes an analysis of actual social spaces where cultures interact and literature as an institution of cultural memory intervenes" (Seyhan 5) Perhaps as an addition to Bhabha's perspective on nations, we can add this creation of third space which includes the historical aspect and variety of nation narratives. Seyhan writes: "We engage in history not only as agents and actors but also as narrators or storytellers…Our understanding of the present is invariably predicated on actual or imagined links to, or ruptures from, a recalled past" (2).

4. Conclusion

I have looked at two aspects of the modern exilic tradition; one of which is related to the text itself, while the other is focused on the condition of the exilic author. Modernity has symptomized physical and metaphysical aspects of exile, which I believe, are interlaced. It is evident that exilic writings carry universal themes that are resonant with some of the modern issues of being human. Feeling alienated and estranged, losing loved ones and familiar places are part of human life and the exilic life even more so. Today, the very fabric of postmodernity leads to a fragmented and flexible model of personality. Considering the recreation and reanalysis of movement and mobility in the 21st century, a literary genre of displacement is unavoidably integrated with concepts like space and time. The current condition of exile, whether it be political or otherwise, brings together the basic need of human intimacy with the prospect of a better future.

Through my survey of the two books, I have seen that exile literature has a close connection to the societal and global connotations of belonging and attachment. From spatial perspectives each book allowed me to look at the different aspects of exile writing; through various narrative techniques *Springtime in a Broken Mirror* was helpful in demonstrating the restricted spaces of exile condition and the imagined spaces which consequentially open up, while *Letters of Transit* lead me to the inner processes of writing in and about exile. Although my case studies were different from each other in cultural and technical perspectives, I believe

that presenting them in various parts of my thesis was beneficial in bringing about different topics of discussion for the exile genre. Similarly, my theoretical base was created from a combination of space and narration, while I did not limit myself in venturing into a mixture of texts on poetics, philosophy, and psychology of spatial concepts.

The first part of my thesis involved the theoretical approaches related to the narration of space, whereas the second part was more integrated with the literary styles of exile where I analyzed mostly the exilic themes of space. Even though these two parts allowed me to come to the broad conclusion that literature can allow exilic writers the space to belong and express themselves, I have realized many other representations of exile can be achieved. I've only looked into the narratological aspects of cultural differences but a larger study can be made with different kinds of exile literature, taken as reflections upon their cultures of belonging and integration. From a broader perspective, the condition of displacement can be analyzed in relation to modern cultures.

I have done brief comparisons of cultural differences in exile literature. Through these comparisons, I have been able to see the possibility of making a larger study focusing on national or cultural aspects of exile literature. For example, in Latin American cultures, exile literature has a thick archive, as well as exile narratives related to wars, mass immigration, and other societal, political and environmental conditions. These conditions also create their own cultures of representatives that are prominent in most Latin American countries. While Latin American writing has imaginative undertones that rely on the genre of magical realism, the exile writers in the US have the common theme of the English language and Western culture. In the writings of exiles who have moved to the countries where the Western traditions of individuality and objectivity are prominent, it is common to see the exiles who come from other traditions to get into the dilemma of intimacy and openness. The collection of memoirs on exile and writing Aciman has gathered shows that there are many other dilemmas that arise from switching to English from the mother tongue.

Through my studies on the concept of belonging, I have come across examples of literature that are very much related to the modern conditioning of happiness. My research was focused on the exile state and mentality, however, there are other forms of displacements that our modern era has affected which are yet to be analyzed in detail.

In *The Promise of Happiness (2009)*, Sara Ahmed mentions societal and economic factors as a way of creating the expectation of happiness in different ways and various mediums within Western societies picking up on this need to 'find happiness' in a generic way. I think that to be in search of something better, or a way to be happier are two of the main aspects which drive people outside of their homes, homelands or comfort zones. What I have mentioned as a 'home' can also be understood as 'happy spaces' where the individuals expect to be happy. This happiness literature can be further analyzed in relation to exile, immigration and other forms of estrangement.

I have come to the realization that my aim in separating the personal from the cultural components of exile can be applied to any literary text which includes separations from familiarity. Thus literature can also show how the culture has an effect on the personality, as well as in some cases, such as Toni Morrison and Edward Said, the reverse is also true.

Details like these require me to conclude my analysis by stating that in merging social sciences and humanities to understand artistic spaces can reveal relatively new interpretations. My approach to the exile condition also validated my belief that representations of the interpersonal and global changes in the modern world can be amply manifested in literature.

5. Works Cited

Aciman André. *Letters of Transit: Reflections on Exile, Identity, Language, and Loss*. New Press, 1999.

Adorno, Theodor W., and Mielke Joaquín Chamorro. *Minima Moralia*. Taurus, 1998.

Alphen, Ernst Van. "Imagined Homelands: Re-Mapping Cultural Identity." *Mobilizing Place, Placing Mobility*, pp. 53–69., doi:10.1163/9789004333451_005.

Anderson, Benedict R. OG. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Verso, 1990.

Arendt, Hannah, et al. *The Jewish Writings*. Schocken Books, 2007.

Bachelard, Gaston. *The Poetics of Space*. Penguin, 2014.

Baranczak, Stanislaw. "Life Is Elsewhere," The New Republic, Vol. 205, No. 5 (July, 1991).

Bal, Mieke. *Narratology: Introduction to the Theory of Narrative, Fourth Edition*. University of Toronto Press, 2017.

Benedetti, Mario, and Charles Dean Hatfield. *Little Stones at My Window/ Piedritas En La Ventana*. Curbstone Press, 2003.

Benedetti, Mario. *Springtime in a Broken Mirror*. Penguin Books, 2018.

Bloom, Harold. *Milan Kundera*. Chelsea House Publishers, 2003.

Boym, Svetlana. *The Future of Nostalgia*. Basic Books, a Member of the Perseus Books Group, 2016.

Camurri, Renato. "The Exile Experience Reconsidered: a Comparative Perspective in European Cultural Migration during the Interwar Period". *Transatlantica* (Online). 1. 2014

Cioran, E. M. *The Trouble with Being Born*. Arcade Pub., 2012.

Currie, Mark. *About Time: Narrative, Fiction and the Philosophy of Time*. Edinburgh University Press, 2007.

Decker, Jessica Elbert, and Dylan Winchock. *Borderlands and Liminal Subjects: Transgressing the Limits in Philosophy and Literature*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.

Eysteinsson Ástráður. *The Concept of Modernism*. Cornell Univ. Pr., 1994.

Foucault, Michael. "Des Espace Autres." *Architecture /Mouvement/ Continuité* , Oct. 1984. (Although not reviewed for publication by the author and thus not part of the official corpus of his work, the manuscript was released into the public domain for an exhibition in Berlin shortly before Michel Foucault's death. Translated from the French by Jay Miskowiec.)

Guillén, Claudio. "On the Literature of Exile and Counter-Exile." *Books Abroad*, vol. 50, no. 2, 1976, pp. 271–280. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/40130427.

Kristeva, Julia, and Toril Moi. *The Kristeva Reader*. Blackwell, 2002.

Kundera, Milan, and Aaron Asher. *Life Is Elsewhere*. Faber and Faber, 2000.

Markowitz, Fran, and Anders H. Stefansson. Homecomings Unsettling Paths of Return. Lexington Books, 2004.

McClennen, Sophia A. *The Dialectics of Exile: Nation, Time, Language, and Space in Hispanic Literatures*. Purdue University Press, 2004.

Morrison, Toni. *Beloved*. Vintage, 2016.

Nietzsche, Friedrich Wilhelm, et al. *Writings from the Early Notebooks.* Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Ramirez, Luz Elena., and Verity Smith. *Encyclopedia of Latin American Literature*. Facts on File, 2008.

Ritivoi, Andreea D. *Yesterday's Self: Nostalgia and the Immigrant Identity*. Lanham, Md: Rowman & Littlefield, 2002.

Rowe, William, and Teresa Whitfield. “Thresholds of Identity: Literature and Exile in Latin America.” *Third World Quarterly*, vol. 9, no. 1, 1987, pp. 229–245. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/3991856.

Said, Edward W. “Intellectual Exile: Expatriates and Marginals.” *Grand Street*, no. 47, 1993, p. 112., doi:10.2307/25007703.

Said, Edward W. *Reflections on Exile: and Other Essays*. Granta, 2012.

Seyhan, Azade. *Writing Outside the Nation*. Princeton University Press, 2001.

Tuan, Yi-fu. *Space and Place: the Perspective of Experience*. University of Minnesota Press, 2014.

Turner, Victor. *The Ritual Process: Structure and Anti-Structure*. Aldine Publ. Comp., 1995.