Migration in the Myth:

The Role of Migration in Tolkien's Fiction

MA Thesis: English Literature and Culture

Student Name: Jonathan Lench

Student Number: 2233975

Date: Friday 3rd January 2020

First marker: Dr Thijs Porck

Second Marker: Dr Michael Newton

Leiden University, Department of Literary Studies

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank everybody who helped and supported me in the process of writing this Thesis. Firstly, Dr Thijs Porck, for his excellent advice and unwavering support throughout this process. Secondly, to my family, who's love, support and understanding have helped me at every point of writing. Finally, I would like to give thanks to all of my friends and housemates who were there for me over the past year, who made library coffee breaks fun, the writing process joyful and who were enduringly supportive throughout the year.

Contents:

INTRODUCTION

Migration was of central concern throughout Tolkien's life, as his youth was defined by movement from South Africa to England. Echoes of this transition, and Tolkien's cultural liminality as caused by it, is an aspect of Tolkien's life that is perceptible throughout his fiction. Within Tolkien's fiction migrations and inter-cultural meetings are central to many of the storylines. These stories eventually also become part of the vast back-cloth of history that lends Middle-earth its characteristic depth, an aspect of his fiction that, according to critics such as Shippey and Drout, contributes to the success of his fantasy world-building.[1]

The history of Middle-earth is defined by migration and its antecedent themes. Migration is one of the main complicating actions that propels the narratives, and the story of Arda itself, forwards. In addition, it is also a theme used by Tolkien to create societies, individuals with the "inner consistency of reality".[2] This inner consistency is created by the historical contextuality of his world, or as Tolkien himself would call it, a "feigned history".[3] Tolkien's feigned history is a constituent part of Middle-earth being a believable and immersive space, as each setting, character and society is the product of this history. This history gives the perception to the reader of a world that exists beyond the text. As Farah Mendlesohn[4] has previously written of epic fantasy, the story is as much about the world, if not mostly about the world, as it is about the individual characters. Yet, despite this centrality of migration to Tolkien's world-building, this has yet to be extensively examined within an academic context. This project therefore seeks to examine the centrality of migration to Tolkien's fantasy.

---

[1] Tom Shppey. *The Road to Middle Earth: How J.R.R. Tolkien Created a New Mythology,* rev. and exp. edn . *(*London: Harper Collins. 2006), 85.
[2] J.R.R. Tolkien, "On Fairy-Stories," in *Tree and Leaf (*London: Harper Collins, 2004), 56.
[3] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Letters of JRR Tolkien,* ed. Humphrey Carpenter with the assistance of Christopher Tolkien, *(London: Harper Collins,* 2006), letter no. 131, 143.
[4] Mendlesohn, Farah, *Rhetorics of Fantasy.* (Middletown CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2008), 61.

In order to effectively analyse the various themes and ideas within the concept of migration, this thesis shall use two key methodologies. The first of which is a source analytical approach to Tolkien's works. This will be used to examine Tolkien's key sources and inspirations for his Legendarium, and examine how crucial themes, aesthetics and ideas carry over into his writing. The purpose of using source analysis, in this project, is to understand how Tolkien uses medieval aesthetics and storytelling techniques to allude to a wider history of his world. Or, to use Shippey's phrase, to "discover what a great cook has in their kitchen"[5] and how Tolkien uses these storytelling techniques to create a rich historical back-cloth to the world of Middle-earth. I will then develop these insights by applying the cultural theoretical lenses of race and alterity to understand the ways in which Tolkien creates deep, believable societies and how examining Tolkien's societies in this way can contribute to discussions of alterity and race within Tolkien studies. In addition to understanding the full depth of Tolkien's societies, cultural theories also give a vocabulary within which to discuss the dynamism of Tolkien's world, and fully deconstruct the implications of the changes that take place over the course of his Legendarium.

The first chapter shall most fully engage in source analysis, focusing specifically upon how Tolkien captures the historical tone of Anglo-Saxon literature. I shall argue that Tolkien constructs this historical tone in *The Lord of the Rings* done by having characters and societies that harken back to a migration myth. There are many Anglo-Saxon texts where this trope repeats itself, and this chapter shall juxtapose Tolkien's fiction with these texts to extrapolate the importance of the act of migration on Tolkien's fiction. Exploring the ways in which Tolkien utilises imagery, and transmutes the Anglo-Saxon zeitgeist into his various Elven societies, is revealing about how feigned history constructs depth and believability within the

[5] Tom Shippey, "Why Source Criticism?" in *Tolkien and the Study of His Sources : Critical Essays*, ed. Jason Fisher (Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 2011), 7-17.

various cultures of Middle-earth. This chapter shall utilise Nicholas Howe's *Migration and Mythmaking in Anglo-Saxon England*. Within this book, Howe demonstrates the existence of a cultural memory in Anglo-Saxon England that stems from the memory of migration from continental Europe to the British Isles.[6] I shall adapt and expand upon Howe's argument, as well as showing how Tolkien used similar mythmaking in Middle-earth to underpin his creation of rich and deep societies.

The second chapter shall depart from source critical analysis, instead examining the importance of cross-cultural connections in Tolkien's fiction. Tolkien's usage of inter-cultural marriages shall be examined in two parts. Firstly, I shall extrapolate the importance of cross-cultural marriages and encounters within Tolkien's fiction. Herein, I shall show that in the boundary-transgressing unions of men and Elves, Tolkien contextualises the merging of Elven and Human culture later in the Legendarium. Moving from this, this chapter shall then examine the importance of languages in the construction and presentation of these unified cultures, but also in producing culturally liminal and complex characters (e.g. Aragorn). This chapter aims to show the importance of not only the movement of peoples between lands, but also between cultures to Tolkien's world-building.

The last chapter focuses on applying the analysis of the previous two chapters to Tolkien's views on race. It shall begin with a bibliographic analysis of the topic, examining why the issue exists, its polemical nature as well as previous defences of Tolkien by scholars. This shall then form the groundwork of a defence of Tolkien's work against the charge of racism, based on the analysis of the previous two chapters. Ultimately, I shall argue that Tolkien's world is best perceived as a feigned history, and that in examining the developmental trajectory of his world, rather than simply the world as it is presented in isolated moments,

[6] Nicholas Howe. *Migration and Mythmaking in Anglo-Saxon England*. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989).

Tolkien expresses a distinct attitude on racial issues. Tolkien, was a culturally liminal author, raised with late Victorian sensibilities and yet writing in the demographically transformational 1950's, captures the sense of whiplash and transition in his fiction. There are consistent references to epistemic crises in his Legendarium, which potentially mirror Tolkien's own difficulties in keeping with the acceptable notions of race in the real world. Yet, when examining the narrative resolutions of racial tensions, it is clear that Tolkien admires multi-culturalism and racial commensuration, rather than division and white supremacy, as many commentators accuse Tolkien's Legendarium of.

This project therefore seeks to probe the way that Tolkien builds cultures as part of his world, and in doing so, also examining the accusations of Tolkien's support for white supremacist, eugenicist and racist attitudes. This study finds impetus as more than a scholarly debate about which side of history Tolkien's fiction sits on. As of time of writing, there are many white supremacist groups using Tolkien's work as the literary groundwork upon which to base their ideologies. The website *Counter-currents* for example has a large selection of articles applying Tolkien's Legendarium to their white supremacist agenda.[7] Moreover, a far-right activist group called 'Erkenbrand'[8] (named after a character from *The Lord of the Rings*), has emerged in The Netherlands. As Helen Young cautions,[9] it is vitally important that the issues of race, migration and cultural interactions are examined and reckoned with by Tolkien scholars, and that convincing frameworks are constructed to counter these ideological co-options of Tolkien's work.

[7] Brittanicus. "Tolkien: The Master of Middle-Earth". *Counter-Currents* (blog), last modified August 7, 2010, https://www.counter-currents.com/2010/08/tolkien-master-of-middle-earth/

[8] Richard Echo-Hawk. "Tolkien's White Fire Sword" *The Wandering Company* (blog), last modified December 30, 2016, https://thewanderingcompany.wordpress.com/2016/12/30/tolkiens-white-fire-sword/

[9] Helen Young, "Review of *The Body in Tolkien's Legendarium*," *Journal of Tolkien Research* 1, 1 (2014): 5, http://scholar.valpo.edu/journaloftolkienresearch/vol1/iss1/5/.

CHAPTER ONE- MIRRORING THE MEDIEVAL

> As for the rest of the tale it is, as the Habit suggests, derived from (previously digested) epic, mythology, and fairy-story, not however, Victorian in authorship, as a rule to which George MacDonald is the chief exception. Beowulf is among my most valued sources; though it was not consciously present to the mind in the process of writing[10]

Introduction

This chapter shall focus on the medieval influences upon Tolkien's fiction, demonstrating that the history of the Anglo-Saxon peoples, and their intimate tie to migration in their stories, inspired Tolkien's feigned history in his Legendarium. It has been repeatedly remarked by critics that the key to Tolkien's successful world-building is his creation is the "impression of depth".[11] This impression of depth is created by the historical tone of Middle-earth. Each character, setting, interaction and event is the consequence of a fully constructed imagined history. The stories that are referenced by characters in the world construct Middle-earth as a believable, realistic setting. It is a fantasy world that hums with dynamism and the richness of age, rather than a world that is a contrived one-dimensional canvas built merely for the convenience of one story to be told.

Migration plays a seminal role in the sources that inspired Tolkien's world-building. Tolkien mimics the historical, referential style of many Anglo-Saxon works, creating the perception of a dynamic world produced by a long history. Every story Tolkien tells, much like his Anglo-Saxon sources, subtly connects to a network of tales that go before it. Many aspects of the history of Middle-earth manifest as fragmentary memories and idiomatic statements connected to tales chronologically much earlier in his Legendarium. Some examples of this 'referencing' are Elrond's harkening back to Beleriand,[12] the invocation of Helm Hammerhand

[10] Tolkien, *Letters,* letter no. 25, 31.
[11] Shippey, *The Road to Middle-earth,* 259.
[12] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Fellowship of the Ring,* (London: Harper Collins, 2005), 243.
Beleriand is a part of Middle-Earth destroyed following the concluding events of *The Silmarillion*. By the time *The Lord of the Rings* takes place, it has been destroyed for many hundreds of years.

at the Battle of Helm's Deep[13] or contextualising references to Beren and Lúthien in the den of Shelob.[14]

A constituent part of these references is the memory of a migrant past. A clear expression of the importance of migration to Tolkien's creation of historicity are his various Elven peoples. Tolkien's Elven societies are created, and change, based on migration. To explore the importance of migration to Tolkien's world-building, this chapter shall firstly examine the memory of migration as found in Anglo-Saxon sources known to be inspirational to Tolkien's fiction. The first section will outline the centrality of a migratory past to the Anglo-Saxon psyche and how cultural memory of migration is expressed in two works: Bede's *Ecclesiastical History of England* and the *Sermo Lupi Ad Anglos* of Wulfstan. Following this, I shall show how this migrant history finds expression across numerous works of Anglo-Saxon literature in the subtext of these works. Tolkien adapts this sub-textuality in his fiction to create the impression of a hidden, yet culturally formative, past. The usage of this style is evident in Tolkien's creation of referential idioms in the dialogue of *The Lord of the Rings*, and use of imagery that parallels his Anglo-Saxon inspirations. Lastly, the various ways that the early stories of the Legendarium contextualise Middle-earth, as it is portrayed in *The Lord of the Rings*, shall be explored in depth, in light of the analysis of his Anglo-Saxon inspirations. The use of references in dialogue and description of settings in *The Lord of the Rings* are contextualised by the vast backcloth of history that is created in *The Silmarillion.* In doing so, this chapter shall explore how Tolkien uses migrations to create this history and to bestow Middle-earth with the feeling of being a vast, believable world.

[13] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* (London: Harper Collins, 2005), 540.
[14] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Return of the King,* (London: Harper Collins, 2005), 723.

Outlining Anglo-Saxon histories

The Anglo-Saxon people, following their conquest of the British Isles in the 5th and 6th centuries, were defined culturally by their transition (both physical and cultural) from continental Germanic tribes to an island people. The Anglo-Saxon migrations are detailed by Bede in his *Ecclesiastical History of England* as follows:

> Those who came over were of the three most powerful nations of Germany Saxons, Angles, and Jutes. From the Jutes are descended the people of Kent, and of the Isle of Wight, and those also in the province of the West Saxons who are to this day called Jutes, seated opposite to the Isle of Wight. From the Saxons, that is, the country which is now called Old Saxony, came the East Saxons, the South Saxons, and the West Saxons. From the Angles, that is, the country which is called Anglia, and which is said, from that time, to remain desert to this day, between the provinces of the Jutes and the Saxons, are descended the East Angles, the Midland Angles, Mercians, all the race of the Northumbrians, that is, of those nations that dwell on the north side of the river Humber, and the other nations of the English.[15]

Anglo-Saxon historians were therefore acutely aware of their continental origins and how this created the various kingdoms that comprised Britain. These various kingdoms and histories have two progenitor leaders, "Hengist and Horsa".[16] Through their leadership, the Anglo-Saxon tribes came to inhabit the British Isles. The language and justification of religion is also used by Bede in his Ecclesiastical History, where he says "the fire kindled by the hands of these pagans proved God's just revenge for the crimes of the people".[17] The Anglo-Saxons here are referred to as Pagan, and nevertheless, instruments of God's will. The language of divinity represents a connection, and memory of, their Germanic, Pagan past, but also, still casting their ancestor tribes as part of a divine plan for the British Isles. Bede's focus on this transition reveals that the Saxon's were conscious of their transition from continent to Island, and that this was embedded in their history and religious beliefs.

---

[15] Bede. *Bede's Ecclesiastical History of England.* Trans. A.M Sellar, *The Project Gutenberg,* last modified December 17, 2011, http://www.gutenberg.org/files/38326/38326-h/38326-h.html

[16] Ibid.
[17] Ibid.

Bede wrote this history in the 8th century, yet this memory of migration is also expressed at the end of the Anglo-Saxon period, in Wulfstan's *Sermo Lupi*. As Holmes remarks about this sermon, it harkens to a distant "spiritually heroic"[18] past. Wulfstan exclaims that there "was a historian in the time of the Britons, called Gildas…He [God] finally allowed the English army to conquer their land, and destroy the host of Britons entirely".[19] In this speech, intended as a rallying cry against the marauding Scandinavian armies, Wulfstan alludes to the same origination myth as Bede. evidence of an enduring, national mythology, within which the Anglo-Saxons conceptualise and frame their identity. This reference that Wulfstan uses in his sermon, of the Anglo-Saxons coming to England as an instrument of God's will, shows that this migration is referenceable for rhetorical effect. There is evidence, therefore, that the transformative effect of migration embedded within Anglo-Saxon culture and within the Anglo-Saxon cultural psyche.

Such a reference to history suggests that this mythology was imbued into the cultural psyche of the Saxons, enough that it can be used as a rhetorical reference in a politically charged sermon. The mythicised past of the Anglo-Saxons both contextualises and informs Wulfstan's present cultural state. This Biblical element to the Anglo-Saxon conquest demonstrates how central and all-encompassing this identity was to the Saxon peoples and kingdoms, as it is intimately tied to their faith. This conception of the Anglo-Saxon kingdoms was imbued into their cultural rhetoric; they were destined to overtake the British Isles.

Anglo-Saxon memory of migration

The centrality of migration to Saxon culture is not just limited to their political and cultural rhetoric, as exhibited by Bede and Wulfstan. It also pervades their literature and the ways in

[18] John R. Holmes. "Oaths and Oath Breaking," in *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth,* ed. Jane Chance. (Lexington, KT: University Press of Kentucky, 2004), 249-263.
[19] Wulfstan. *Sermo Lupi Ad Anglos* trans. Dorothy Whitlock, 2nd ed. (London: Methuen, 1952), 30.

which they are narratively portrayed. This mythology is clearly expressed in the *Old English Exodus*, a text known to be of professional interest to Tolkien, as he had a vast array of lecture notes and remarks about the text, that have posthumously been compiled into an edition.[20] The *Old English Exodus* is an intensely syncretic work that recasts the Israelite people in the language and cultural milieu of Anglo-Saxon England. Further to this, it casts the Saxon people as an inheritor of the Israelite exodus. In the retelling of the biblical story of *Exodus*, the language of trans-ocean migration is used to construct this syncretic understanding of the Israelites as , and construct Moses, in Lavinsky's words, as a "valiant commander",[21] in the vein of an Anglo-Saxon warlord. The Old English language used here is that of seafaring, they are "sæmen [seamen]".[22] This language is out of place in the Egypt based story of Exodus, as it takes place in a desert, yet the allegorical, referential language used by the *Exodus* poet reframes the story of *Exodus* into distinctly Anglo-Saxon terms and cultural frames. This places the Israelites and their Exodus out of Egypt, as Lavinsky (and prior to this, Howe) argues that this re-orientation of the *Exodus* into an Anglo-Saxon cultural framework is a reflection of the migration-based mythology extrapolated in the previous section.

Re-working a biblical story into a piece of poetry has two intentions. The first of which is persuasion. The persuasive element is to illicit piety. This piety is based upon the interrelatedness of the tales of *Exodus*, and the Anglo-Saxon migrations through linguistic syncretism that builds cultural commonality between the Saxons and the Israelites. Secondly, it positions and reinforces the notion that the Anglo-Saxons, in their migratory origins, are of similar ilk to the Israelites, and are subject God's divine planning in much the same way. This

[20] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Old English "Exodus",* ed. and comp. Joan Turville-Petre, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981).
[21] David Lavinsky, "Tolkien's Old English Exodus and the Problematics of Allegory," *Neophilologus 101*, 2, (2016): 310.
[22] Ibid.

dual intention demonstrates that the migratory language and mythmaking is embedded within the Anglo-Saxon zeitgeist: they perceived themselves as a people destined to migrate and enact God's will on the British Isles. This attitude is present in the idiosyncrasies of the Anglo-Saxon reproduction of the *Exodus* legend.

Howe uses *Beowulf* as another example of the presence of a migration myth in the Anglo-Saxon psyche. Howe argues that "the myth exists in the texture of this poem, that is, the use of geography as a narrative convention".[23] The memory of migration exists behind the text, allusive in nature, to hearken to the continental past without ever specifically calling to it. In particular, Howe notes that the Beowulf poet is calling into attention the "pastness"[24] of the noble deeds which construct the historical context within *Beowulf*. Howe argues that the audience would have been "alert to its setting; connections between continent and island".[25] In this alertness to continental legends, myths and attitudes, the Anglo-Saxons also remain attuned to their continental past.

The connection between the Anglo-Saxons and the continent is also not lost on Tolkien in his own notes and commentaries on *Beowulf*. He gives great attention to the reference to Scyld Scefing, a legendary continental king (and supposed first king of Denmark). Tolkien, in his reading of *Beowulf*, suggests that "the poet is not explicit, and the idea was probably not fully formed in his mind".[26] This is one instance of a connection to their continental ancestors. Tolkien also notes other such references throughout *Beowulf*, such as the references to Halfdan the Old, arguing that this represents a cultural memory of connection between the Anglo-Saxons and continental Germanic tribes.[27] The presence of this reference to a continental

[23] Howe, *Migration and Mythmaking,* 105.
[24] *Ibid,* 106.
[25] *Ibid,* 105.
[26] J.R.R. Tolkien. *Beowulf: A Translation and Commentary, Together with Sellic Spell,* ed. Christopher Tolkien (London: Harper Collins 2014), 150.
[27] Tolkien, *Beowulf,* 151.

legend shows that the *Beowulf* poet is culturally attuned to a network of Germanic legends. Just as Wulfstan can reference a continental past for rhetorical purposes, the *Beowulf* and the *Exodus* poets' position and contextualise their works based on their connection to a continental past. Tolkien recognises in *Beowulf*, in much the same way as Howe, the presence of references to the Germanic pagan past. The historical connection subconsciously animates and situates the Anglo-Saxon tales within a continental Germanic framework, without ever being explicitly used. The migration myth is present in *Beowulf* in the most intertwined way. The poem is referencial to a heroic, continental past that its audience would have been alert to. This attunement to history is also not lost on Tolkien and indeed it is possible that this referential, sub-textual mythology inspired his construction of a feigned history in Middle-earth.

Middle-earth's migrants

The usage of, and allusion to, a network of histories and legends is also used by Tolkien in his fiction; stories from *The Silmarillion* comprise this network of legends as referred to *The Lord of the Rings*. Within his literary world-making, Tolkien embarks on a process of feigning history, of constructing a fantasy world that is situated in a tangibly rich history. Tolkien is greatly revealing in his foreword to the second edition of *The Lord of the Rings*: "I much prefer history, true or feigned, with its varied applicability to the experience of readers".[28] Migration, exile and the shifting of geography is an integral aspect of this, and the cultural mythmaking that is an integral aspect of the Anglo-Saxon works that inspired Tolkien is also present here. This preference for historicity forms the basis of Tolkien's literary techniques and how his world is so immersive and rich with detail.

The memory of migration, and its sub-textual allusions, is a technique that Tolkien utilises to create the sense of depth to his cultures. The historical tone of *The Silmarillion*

[28] Tolkien, *Fellowship*, 11.

echoes that of a compiled historical work or real-world mythical Legendarium. It begins with the creation of the world, introducing the deities of Tolkien's fiction and then charting the history of the world. It is the duty of the Valar to enact the music of Eru, this divine act of creation is the setting of all of Tolkien's fiction, and events are shaped by the grace of the Valar. The Valar are angelic, deific figures that form the pantheon of Gods that the Elves worship.[29] It maintains an omniscient, historical perspective and emotionally distant, yet descriptively lofty prose, mirroring ancient mythology and legends. *The Silmarillion* constructs a creation myth, alongside a Legendarium of tales. These stories form the bedrock of Middle-earth's multitude of societies.

The first use of this historical migration, and its national mythmaking, is in the section 'Of the Coming of the Elves'. Echoing Bede's prose style, use of listing and matter of fact consequential language, Tolkien describes the march of the Elves towards Valinor as such:

> They were arrayed in three hosts. The smallest host and the first to set forth was led by Ingwe, the most high lord of all the Elvish race….The Vanyar were his people; they are the Fair Elves…Next came the Noldor, the people of Finwe…They are the Deep Elves, the friends of Aule…The greatest host came last; and they are named the Teleri. In water they had great delight... The Sea-Elves therefore they became in the land of Aman[30]

Tolkien's elves follows the same pattern as the Germanic tribes that first settled the British Isles. Within this passage, names and identities are tethered to their migratory patterns and behavior.

The key example of the relationship between migration and the creation of new cultural identities is the Flight of the Noldor, the original event which brought, and rendered the Elves oathbound to, Middle-earth. Following the theft of the Silmaril gems by Morgoth.[31] Fëanor and

[29] For the purpose of brevity in this analysis, I will outline the characteristics of the Valar in footnotes as necessary.
[30] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Silmarillion* (London: Harper Collins, 2006), 42.
[31] Tolkien's Luciferian creator of evil.

his children swear an oath to defeat and challenge "whoso ever shall keep a Silmaril from them".[32] This oath, herein quoted only in part, triggers their expulsion from Valinor, the home of the Elves, and back to Middle-earth. This chapter of *The Silmarillion* holds at its core the theme of exile and the tumultuous consequences of exile upon a culture.

These same themes are present in the Anglo-Saxon exile poem *The Wanderer*, a work, that as Lee notes, "Tolkien turns to throughout his career".[33] It also is emblematic of the Anglo-Saxon concern with in the Flight of the Noldor, as identified by Donovan.[34] Within *The Wanderer*, the theme of lament and loss is constructed with the pathetic fallacy and imagery of the ocean, ice and winter. The eponymous Wanderer narrator holds intimate concern with the loss of his society and people. He describes "icy waters", "winter in his heart" and "hoar-frost"[35] to articulate the emotional experience of exile. There is also rhetorical questioning used to construct the sense of loss, "where has the horse gone? Where the man? Where the giver of gold?"[36] A tone of lament and loss pervades the poem, which speaks to the tumultuous experience of exile for Anglo-Saxon cultures.

Tolkien, in the chapter 'The Flight of the Noldor', physicalises the imagery of *The Wanderer* into a barrier for Fëanor and his followers to cross. Fëanor exiles himself from Valinor and in response, the Valar's threats act as a reframing of the lament and loss of community expressed in *The Wanderer* into a divine warning. As Fëanor and his host exile themselves from Valinor, they hear a booming voice upon their departure saying "tears unnumbered ye shall shed; and the Valar will fence Valinor against you, and shut you out, so that not even the echo of your lamentation shall pass over the mountain".[37] The threat here is

[32] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 74.
[33] Stuart Lee, "J.R.R. Tolkien and The Wanderer : From Edition to Application," *Tolkien Studies, 6,* (2009): 19.
[34] Leslie Donovan. "The Wanderer,*"* in *JRR Tolkien Encyclopaedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment* ed. By Michael C D Drout. (Routledge: New York, 2007), 691.
[35] *The Wanderer*. All quotations of *The Wanderer* are from *The Anglo-Saxon World* ed. and trans. Kevin Crossley-Holland. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 52.
[36] *Ibid*, 52.
[37] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 79.

to suffer the same fate as the wanderer; split from the comfort of their home and community. The threatening tone re-imagines the lamentation of *The Wanderer* into a dramatic, mythopoetic episode of a confrontation between Fëanor and the Valar. Herein, exile induced migration is a curse of the Gods upon the Noldor. The imagery of ice and winter, used in *The Wanderer* to articulate an emotional state, is adapted by Tolkien as a physical barrier and trial for the Noldor to overcome in their migration to Middle-earth. The Helcaraxë, ice fields stand between the Noldor and Middle-earth, it is a field of "grinding ice".[38] When crossing the Noldor "began to feel anguish from the cold"[39] and rifts between the followers of Fëanor and Fingolfin render some of the Noldor to wander "long in misery"[40] after this separation. This use of Anglo-Saxon imagery, and pre-occupation with transience and migration in Anglo-Saxon literature, is used by Tolkien in his fantasy world-building.

This mythological use of migration is also present in a discarded poem of 150 lines by Tolkien entitled "The Flight of the Noldoli from Valinor" written in approximately 1925. The topic of the poem is Fëanor's rallying cry of his people away from Valinor and is a key example of the use of Anglo-Saxon cultural themes and literary styles as a means of building the identities of his fictional societies. For example, in the following extract:

> Now come ye all,
> Who have courage and hope! My call harken
> To flight, to freedom in far places! [41]

This passage has several characteristics that are greatly revealing about Tolkien's Anglo-Saxon inspirations for Fëanor.

[38] *Ibid*, 82.
[39] *Ibid*, 81.
[40] *Ibid*, 82.
[41] J.R.R. Tolkien, *The Fall of Gondolin*, ed. Christopher Tolkien, (London: Harper Collins, 2018), 28.

Firstly, stylistically it is structured and constructed like an Anglo-Saxon poem as it is in alliterative verse style. The use of alliterative verse signals a connection to the themes and ideas of Anglo-Saxon literature that animate Tolkien's fiction. Additionally, Fëanor plays the same cultural role as Hengist and Horsa. Just as they led the Saxons to the British Isles, Fëanor rallies the Elves (in the case of this draft, the Gnomes) to his side and bids that they leave Valinor, sparking the vast history of the Noldor Elves in Middle-earth. This episode concludes with the phrase "small love for Fëanor or his sons had those that marched at last behind him, and blew their trumpets in Middle-earth".[42] With this quote finishing the chapter, the creation of an explanatory myth for the Noldor's presence in Middle-earth is completed. This myth mirrors the arrival of the Anglo-Saxons into the British Isles, and utilizes distinctly Anglo-Saxon literary techniques and themes to do so. It also forms the explanatory basis for the future of the Elves in Middle-earth, as well as for future generations of Noldor Kings. As it is stated in the end of *The Silmarillion*:

> Yet all of the Eldalie were willing to forsake the Hinter Lands where they had long suffered and long dwelt; and some lingered many an age in Middle-earth….Celeborn of Doriath, with Galadriel, his wife…who alone remained of those who led the Noldor to exile in Beleriand…and…Elrond Half-Elven, who chose…to be numbered among the Eldar…[43]

Herein, Tolkien demarcates a branching history, one where differing factions and nations construct distinct identities and national mythologies. This distinction creates the aesthetic differences between the Elven societies that the Fellowship visit and create an engrossing, believable fantasy world.

[42]Tolkien, *Silmarillion*, 87.
[43]*Ibid*, 269.

Perceiving the history

These events, aside from creating a tangible history and utilising Anglo-Saxon stories for their foundation, also create believable cultures and settings to be used in later texts. Drout has previously shown that the references used by characters within Tolkien's fiction invoke the "impression of depth…a culture *behind* the text".[44] Characters use various references with one another, alluding to a shared, referenceable history that lies outside of the immediate comprehension of the reader. Migrations and branching identities are integral to the history contained within these references. Upon introduction of Rivendell, and explaining their ability to stave off the dark riders, Gandalf explains "they do not fear the ringwraiths, for those who have dwelt in the Blessed Realm live at once in both worlds".[45] Herein is an example of such referentiality that is essential to Tolkien's world-building. The idiomatic reference to the migration of Fëanor,[46] with references to places the reader is intended to have no knowledge of, utilises the migrations of *The Silmarillion* as a means of constructing a historically contextualised identity for the people of Rivendell. Drout describes this use of idiom as part of the creation of an "epistemic situation",[47] wherein such references are not identified by the interlocutors as strange, but rely upon knowledge that the reader does not have. These idioms therefore convey a complex historicity, understood in full by the speakers (with full knowledge of the history) but only demonstrating the existence of this history to the reader. This event traces its understanding back to the flight of the Noldor, yet reverberates into Rivendell and its inhabitants. This reverberation can be felt by the reader through the idioms and dialogue. This is expanded upon in The Council of Elrond, where Elrond reminisces about the (now destroyed) land of Beleriand. He recalls the "glory of the Elder

[44] Michael D. C Drout. "Tolkien's Creation of the Impression of Depth," *Tolkien Studies, 11,* (2014): 171.
[45] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 238.
[46] The 'blessed realm' is another name for Valinor, the home of the Elves.
[47] Drout, "Impression of Depth", 172.

Days and the hosts of Beleriand"[48] of which he was witness to. These days he references are all stories that weave together what Tolkien called the "vast backcloth"[49] of his fiction.

This pattern is repeated when the Fellowship reach Lothlórien, the home of Galadriel and one of the original Noldor who crossed with Fëanor into Middle-earth. Rivendell and Lothlórien are directly contrasted by Tolkien via their divergent histories "In Rivendell there was memory of ancient things; in Lórien the ancient things still lived on",[50] constructing a distinct yet linked identity between the two Elven kingdoms. Their unique tone and style is determined by cultural rifts. The split of the Elven societies is outlined in *Appendix F*, "the Elves far back in the Elder Days became divided into two main branches: the West-elves (the *Eldar)* and the East-elves".[51] The Elves of Rivendell share a common and interwoven past with Lothlórien yet geography has rendered them distinct in style and tone. This difference is created from a feigned, divergent history of the two societies. Just as with the migration myth of Anglo-Saxon texts, the migration mythology of the Elven people lies underneath the surface of the text, animating the identities and interactions of the characters. It occasionally emerges in the form of references, idioms and sayings that gesture, as part of comfortable speech, to a history the reader has no immediate access to, but that the characters are intimately familiar with.

Conclusion

In conclusion to this section, Tolkien, in his creation of a feigned history, did more than create the impression of depth within *The Lord of the Rings*, but rather created fantasy societies and cultures of palpable depth. To do this, he was inspired by and drew from the storytelling methods of the Anglo-Saxons, and their own connections to a continental history. This historicity is used by Tolkien throughout his fiction to create the sense of a believable world,

[48] Tolkien, *Fellowship*, 243.
[49] Tolkien, *Letters*, Letter no. 131, 144.
[50] Tolkien, *Fellowship*, 349.
[51] Tolkien, *Return of the King*, 1172.

and believable societies, to the reader. Much as in the case of *Beowulf,* the history gestured at lies out of sight, and out of reach of the reader, yet remains perceptible in the text. Drout identifies Tolkien's fictional world a "pseudo-historical mythology".[52] This pseudo-history contextualises, in meticulous detail, how the world came to be. Tolkien's Elven races are defined by their oath-bound Western march, and all of its trials and tribulations; a feigned, constructed, mythical history.

[52] Michael D. C. Drout. "A Mythology for Anglo-Saxon England," in *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth*, ed. Jane Chance. (Lexington, KT: University Press of Kentucky, 2004), 229-249.

CHAPTER TWO- CONNECTING ACROSS CULTURES: LANGUAGE, MARRIAGE AND IDENTITY CONSTRUCTION IN MIDDLE-EARTH

> …the 'wheels of the world', are often turned not by the Lords and Governors, even gods, but by the seemingly unknown and weak- owing to the secret life in creation…[53]

Introduction

Migration plays a seminal role in the construction of Tolkien's fictional societies. The cultures throughout his fiction do not remain isolated behind impermeable borders, brushing shoulders only at the boundaries of their lands. Cross-cultural communication, engagement, conflict and inter-migration contribute to the historicity that Tolkien weaves into his fiction, enriching and complicating the identities of his characters. This also has the effect of challenging the hierarchies of his societies. Meetings and interactions between strange and wondrous peoples, creatures and settings change the societies and individuals of Middle-earth, just as migrations do. As Dawson argues, encounters with the other are a defining feature (and narratively propulsive) for Tolkien's stories.[54] These, sometimes fraught, interactions with 'the other' provide the characters with transformative experiences of alterity, shaping their relationship with other cultures, and changing developmental trajectory of the societies they inhabit. There is a repeated motif of cross-cultural communication, cultural, linguistic sharing and other effects of prolonged interaction (and sometimes conflict) between cultures. Aside from societies merging and interacting in ways that divert the course of their stories, individual characters with complex identities emerge from the interwoven histories of these societies. Key examples of individuals produced by mixed cultures are Aragorn, the exilic Dúnedain, Elrond Half-Elven and Eärendil, the man who forsook his humanity to become Elven. This chapter

[53] Tolkien, *Letters*, Letter no. 131, 149.
[54] Deidre Dawson, "Language and Alterity in Tolkien and Levinas," in *Tolkien and Alterity*, ed. Christopher Vaccaro, Yvette Kisor and Bonnie Wheeler (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 182-203.

shall therefore expand on the previous analysis by illustrating the importance of cultural interactions and inter-migration within Tolkien's world-building.

To do this, I shall firstly examine the complexities, challenges and importance of inter-marrying in Tolkien's fiction. This examination of inter-cultural marriage will present the importance of such marriages to the dynamic development of Tolkien's world. I will show that inter-racial marriage in Tolkien's fiction is used as a way of shifting and dissolving cultural boundaries . Thereafter, I shall extrapolate the wider importance of Elf/Human marriages in the historiography of Middle-earth, specifically examining the implications of their seminal role in progressing this history. Following this, I will explore the importance of cultural boundary crossing on the developmental trajectory of Tolkien's languages. The feigned history of Middle-earth alters and dictates the changes in language that the various societies go through throughout the Legendarium. This shall be done with reference textual analysis of *The History of Middle-earth* and the implications of which in *The Lord of the Rings*; outlining further the referenciality of Tolkien's world-building and how such migratory and linguistic patterns affect the subtext of *The Lord of the Rings*. Finally, I shall analyse the integral nature of these processes in the creation of complex identities of the principle characters of Middle-earth, as well as how they drive forward the story of the world. This analysis shall therefore be grounded in a combination of two emergent discourses of Tolkien studies: the growing influence of cultural studies on the field (a phenomenon noted by Ann-Reid in *Tolkien and Alterity*)[55] and the discussion of racial interactions in Tolkien studies. Ultimately, this chapter intends to show Tolkien uses cross-cultural interaction in his world-building to enrich the complexity and depth

[55] Robin Ann-Reid, "Race in Tolkien Studies: A Bibliographic Essay," in *Tolkien and Alterity*, ed. Christopher Vaccaro, Yvette Kisor and Bonnie Wheeler. (Cham, Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), 33-74.

of his characters and world. Furthermore, this chapter shall form the basis for engagement with arguments surrounding the question of race in Tolkien's fiction in the third chapter.

Beren and Lúthien

The most evident example of Tolkien's concern with cross-cultural connections is the recurring plotline of inter-cultural marriages, and their complications. The inter-cultural marriages of Tolkien's Legendarium are always central to the narratives (and feigned history) of the respective cultures. These unions often represent the complexities of the historiography and cultural divisions that must be overcome for the story to progress. Rogers has previously identified the importance and complexities of inter-cultural marriages to Tolkien's Legendarium. In her essay on the topic, she shows inter-cultural marriages are a way to assuage conflicts, but are presented as complex and difficult because of the boundaries that they must cross to be successful.[56] Herein, I will develop this analysis to show that the children of these marriages are equally as integral to Tolkien's Legendarium as the marriages themselves. The children of men and Elves hold a uniquely liminal position between factions and further enrich the historiography of Middle-earth. The key examples of this effect, to be discussed below, are the unions between Beren and Lúthien and between Eärendil and Elwing.

Beren and Lúthien are the first example of an inter-cultural marriage that takes place in Tolkien's fiction; they are of seminal importance to Tolkien's mythology. Christopher Tolkien, in the preface to *Beren and Lúthien,* states that the tale is fundamentally a "heroic-fairy-romance",[57] wherein the two characters must overcome many boundaries to realise their love for one another. In utilising this narrative structure, Tolkien draws attention to seemingly incommensurable cultural/ontological boundaries between Beren and Lúthien. It is within

[56] Hope Rogers. "No Triumph Without Loss: Problems of intercultural Marriage in Tolkien's Works," *Tolkien Studies, 10*, (2013): 82.

[57] J.R.R. Tolkien, *Beren and Lúthien*, ed. Christopher Tolkien, (London: Harper Collins, 2018), 12.

these boundaries that the impetus for heroism is constructed. The revolutionary culture/race crossing attitude of Beren is an essential aspect of even the earliest drafts of *Beren and Lúthien,* wherein "Beren cared not whether she were Vala or Elf or child of Men".[58] The emphasis in this early draft is upon Beren's lack of consideration for the traditional boundaries that (in the milieu of Middle-earth) should have prohibited him. Yet, in early drafts Beren was merely a different type of Elf, not a child of Man.[59] Christopher Tolkien notes that it later became "an altogether essential"[60] element that Beren was a mortal man and Lúthien an immortal Elf. Tolkien chose to accentuate the ontological rift between the two, signaling both the gravity and drama of the act of crossing that rift. Dawson has previously identified that the "courage to transgress cultural boundaries"[61] is part of the heroism of the narrative, but also, the heroism of crossing these boundaries changes Middle-earth once the boundaries are dissolved.

Thingol, the father of Lúthien, is one such cultural barrier for Beren and Lúthien to overcome. Upon summoning Beren to his halls, he asks him "What would you here, unhappy mortal, and for what cause have you left your own land to enter this?"[62] Here, Thingol, in anger, unravels the key problematising element of inter-cultural love in Tolkien's stories: the disapproval of figures in power. Firstly, a key problem is exposed by the use of "mortal" as an insult. In doing so, he calls attention to, what he believes to be, the incommensurable ontological divide between Beren and Lúthien. Furthermore, through the figure of Thingol, Tolkien constructs the narrative hurdle for Beren to cross in order to erode the barrier between Men and Elves. This narrative hurdle is in the form of a suicidal heroic act (the claiming of a Silmaril from the crown of Morgoth). The gravity and intensity of the task shows both the

[58] Tolkien, *Beren and Lúthien,* 42.
[59] *Ibid 32.*
[60] *Ibid.32*
[61] Dawson, "Language and Alterity", 82.
[62]Tolkien, *Silmarillion, 150.*

difficulty of breaking down the boundaries between Men and Elves, but also the anger of Thingol such that he would send Beren to his death.

In the conclusion of the narrative, it is clear that at the end of Beren and Lúthien 's individual story: the boundaries between cultures have been eroded. Whilst Beren claims the Silmaril, he loses it along with his hand to the hound Carcharoth. Upon returning to King Thingol and recounting the story, Thingol's attitude is described in inherently different terms, "it seemed to Thingol that this man was unlike other mortal Men…and the love of Lúthien a thing new and strange".[63] In perceiving Thingol's own sift of attitude, there is also an expansion of the scope of possibility for the Elven society which he represents. Beren's love for Lúthien is described in terms of alterity: it is strange and different, yet not dangerous or rage inducing as Thingol previously perceived it. This overcoming of ontological separation, as will be analysed in the following section, enriches and forwards the world of Middle-earth.

The language within Beren and Lúthien's episode of *The Silmarillion* draws further attention to the importance of their story to the future of Middle-earth's societies. The creative power of language is exemplified by Lúthien. To overcome the death of her beloved Beren, Lúthien sings to the Valar, in hopes that they may take pity. Tolkien describes the song as "most fair that ever in words was woven, and the song most sorrowful that ever the world shall hear".[64] The imagery of music here is crucial to understanding the importance of Beren and Lúthien to Tolkien's Legendarium, as it holds a privileged place in the act of creation. The story of the world begins as "The Music of the Ainur" and the creation of the world is initially described as "Beauty…wakened into song".[65] Language and music has been previously identified by Zimmer as a signal of world-building potential, she argues that "the world was first created through language…it seems reasonable to try this same means when recreating

[63]Tolkien, *Silmarillion*, 167.
[64] *Ibid*, 167.
[65] *Ibid*, 8.

it"[66]. The beauty of Lúthien's song is one instance of this re-creative power of music. The song was so beautiful that moved the Valar Mandos[67] "to pity, who never before was so moved, nor has been since"[68] and subsequently raised Beren from the dead, changing the laws of the world. The emphasis is upon the unprecedented nature of Mandos' pity, which mirrors that of Thingol. In placing the emphasis in the story upon the boundary transgressing nature of Beren and Lúthien, Tolkien is drawing attention to the political and social influence of their union.

Lúthien, in the weaving of her own song, mimics this act of creation, and Tolkien calls attention to the creative power of her and Beren's union by using this imagery. It is described by Tolkien as "the theme of two worlds…of the two kindred's that were made by Ilúvatar to dwell in Arda".[69] In this act of union, there is the beginning of a new history of Middle-earth, of closer ties between Man and Elf. She is described later (as shall be fully unpacked in the next section) as the "foremother".[70] The matrilineal focus on the recounted history here is greatly revealing, as it is from her music that the history unfolds, just as the world itself comes from the . In using this unusual compound, Tolkien demonstrates that her revolutionary act of cross-cultural marriage is integral to the emergence of new peoples. It is described at the end of their episode that "the fates of Beren and Lúthien might be joined"[71] and in doing so are the "Two Kindreds"[72] of Men and Elves also joined.

The legacy of Beren and Lúthien

The union of Beren and Lúthien, despite its difficulties and strife, produces a cross-cultural Middle-earth, where societies intertwined and produced a rich, believable aesthetic to Tolkien's

[66]Mary E. Zimmer "Creating and re-creating worlds with words," in *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth,* ed. Jane Chance. (Lexington, KT: University Press of Kentucky, 2004), 49-61.
[67] The keeper of the dead in Tolkien's pantheon of deities.
[68] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 170.
[69] *Ibid,* 170.
[70] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 194.
[71] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 187.
[72] *Ibid,* 187.

later settings. Their union 'turns the wheel' of Middle-earth, to borrow Tolkien's phrase. From Beren and Lúthien came the race of Númenoreans, later to be the men of Gondor. As Aragorn explains in *The Fellowship of the Ring*:

> ...from her lineage of the Elf-lords of old descended among Men. There live still those of whom Lúthien was the foremother, and it is said that her line shall never fail. Elrond of Rivendell is of that kin. For of Beren and Lúthien was born Dior, Thingol's heir; and of him Elwing the White whom Eärendil wedded..And of Eärendil came the Kings of Númenor, that is Westernesse…[73]

By the time *The Lord of the Rings* takes place, Beren and Lúthien had passed into legend. They are a cultural bookmark of the beginning of a new age, an age when union of Man and Elf changes the course of history. In Aragorn's brief outline of the history is embedded the story of Eärendil the Mariner, and it is in his story that the full importance of these cross-racial marriages to the progression of Tolkien's history are. The voyage of Eärendil, because of his dual Elf/Man is able to act as ambassador of both races to the Valar; "for the sake of Two Kindreds".[74] This phrase, "Two Kindreds" shows the importance of Eärendil's liminal identity to his plea for help, as he can act as a representative of both Elf and Man. In marshalling the assistance of the Valar in defeating Morgoth, Eärendil saves Middle-earth from Morgoth. Moreover, this political and racial union produces the Island of Númenor, and the Dúnedain; of which Aragorn is a descendent.

These legends and stories that are passed between the generations of societies parallel the memories of migration extrapolated in the previous chapter. Just as the memory of leaving Valinor and the oath of Fëanor affects the cultures and world in *The Lord of the Rings*, so too do the stories of Beren and Lúthien and Eärendil. They are a fundamental part of the identity of the societies they beget. One example of their importance to the world of Middle-earth is

[73]Tolkien, *Silmarillion*, 194.
[74] As a result of the exile of Fëanor (as seen in the first chapter) the Valar deities refuse to engage in the politics and wars of Middle-earth.

Frodo's invocation of Lúthien while being chased by Ring-Wraiths. He cries "By Elbereth and Lúthien the Fair".[75] He draws on Lúthien as a name of strength and defiance, much as the story itself, as a heroic romance based around defiance, is expressed in *The Silmarillion.*

Another crucial example of the importance of Beren and Lúthien is in Rivendell, after the *Lay of Eärendil* has been sung. Bilbo says that "if I had the cheek to make verses about Eärendil in the house of Elrond, that is my affair",[76] It is revealed after this singing of this song that Elrond is the son of Eärendil and his grandmother was Lúthien.[77]It is in this knowledge of Elrond's heritage that the "cheek" of Bilbo's song is referenced in conversation, enhancing Drout's notion of referenciality in *The Lord of the Rings*. The fact that Beren and Lúthien are a cultural touchstone, referenceable in conversation to convey meaning, shows their importance to Aragorn and his Elven kin.

Therefore, these cross-cultural marriages and unions are integral to Tolkien's construction of a history that constructs the consistency of reality within Tolkien's societies. From these unions emerge divergent societal tracts, and from these tracts complex individual identities are constructed (as with the case of Aragon). The next section shall focus upon the implications of these marriages outlined here upon the developmental tracts of Tolkien's invented languages and world-building.

The importance of language to Tolkien's fiction

The importance of inter-culturality is demonstrated in Tolkien's fantasy languages. The languages of the constructed societies are the Archimedian point from which the stories of Arda emerge. These languages are however not merely cosmetic. Like the histories and idioms of the peoples of Arda, they develop and augment based upon the shifting political and social

[75] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 214.
[76] *Ibid*, 237.
[77] *Ibid*, 243.

structures of Middle-earth. Chrisopher Tolkien, in *The Lost Road,* states that the languages were "conceived in a very historical way"[78] and as such are greatly revealing about the history of Middle Earth. As Fimi and Higgins note in their introduction to *A Secret Vice,*[79] migration and the splintering of the Elven peoples construct divergent tracts of language and cultural ties. These complicated nexuses of cultural ties and language produce similarly complicated individuals.

As demonstrated in the previous chapter, movement and migration are integral to the identity formation of the Elves. Language is not exempt from this process, and just as the creative power of inter-cultural marriage historicises the aesthetics of later cultures, so too does linguistic sharing. Language is one of the most pivotal aspects where the importance of inter-cultural meetings, conflicts and blending animates Tolkien's world-building.

Language and cultural identity

In *The Peoples of Middle-earth*, the importance of language to the construction of the different societies of Middle-earth is explored. The languages of Elves and Men develop based on shifting societal demographics and alliances. *The Cambridge Handbook of Sociolinguistics*, "language plays a crucial role in the construction and maintenance of ethnicity".[80] Tolkien's fantasy languages are also indicative of ethnic and cultural identities.

An example the ways that the languages of the Elves change is their migratory patterns. They are even sub-divided into the speech of "exilic Quenya" and the regular Quenya spoken in the lands of Valinor. Tolkien writes in *The Peoples of Middle-earth* that " in the passing of

[78] J.R.R. Tolkien. *The Lost Road and Other Writings,* ed. Christopher Tolkien, (London: Harper Collins. 2019), 314.

[79]Dmitra Fimi and Andrew Higgins, introduction to *A Secret Vice: Tolkien on Invented Languages,* J.R.R. Tolkien (London: Harper Collins. 2016), 24.

[80] Carmen Fought. "Language and Ethnicity," in *The Cambridge Handbook of Socioloinguistics*. ed. Mesthrie Rajend (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), 238-258.

time it [Exilic Quenya] became wholly unlike to the Quenya of Valinor".[81] As such, the act of the flight of the Noldor, as examined in the previous chapter, created a new tract of language in Tolkien's world: one defined by the act of migration. This gradually changed language becomes a fundamental part of the exiled Noldor identity. Language change, in Tolkien's Legendarium, consistently follows this pattern of being symptomatic of seminal narrative events.

Another instance where language changes are a constituent part of identity construction are the kingdoms of men, specifically the men of Númenor and their descendants in Gondor. Númenor was geographically and culturally close to the Undying Lands,[82] giving them a lifespan "three times"[83] that of a man of Middle-earth, alongside great height and stature. This also extends to their linguistic connection. The language that they speak is no exemption to this identity development. In the *Peoples of Middle-earth* Tolkien writes that "the people of Elendil could still readily converse with the Eldar that spoke Noldorin".[84] The Island of Númenor, and its inhabitants, came "most alike to the elves", they were greater in stature and skill than those who inhabited Middle-earth. The Men of Númenor however, following their temptation by Sauron, attempt to invade Valinor, and cause the subsequent divine destruction of Númenor and irrevocably "changed the fashion of the world",[85] wherein "Valinor and Errsea were taken from it into the realm of hidden things".[86] In *The Silmarillion,* Tolkien explains that following this destruction, there were "nine ships" that bore the remaining Dúnedain to Middle-earth, wherein they "founded kingdoms".[87] This tumultuous event triggers linguistic and identity

[81] J.R.R. Tolkien. *The Peoples of Middle Earth.*, ed. Christopher Tolkien, *(* London: Harper Collins. 1997), 82.

[82] The ancestral home of the Elves and the Valar.
[83] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 182.
[84] Tolkien, *The Peoples of Middle-earth,* 42.
[85] Tolkien, *Silmarillion,* 223.
[86] *Ibid*, 224.
[87] *Ibid*, 225.

changes within the Dúnedain, changes that are formative for Aragorn, who is a product of these cross-cultural interactions.

In appendix F of *The Return of the King,* the history of the "mannish" language of the Dúnedain is explained in depth by Tolkien. The importance of Eärendil and Elwing here is in the background, yet integral, as they create this unique society of Men who are heavily influenced by Elven culture. Firstly, Tolkien explains that the Dúnedain alone of all the races of men spoke an Elvish tongue, as rooted in their history of both geographic, biological and cultural proximity to the Elves. However, "there were few of them that remembered the Elvish speech" and because of this they use the "Common Speech"[88] in their daily existence. Yet, despite the fact that they cannot use Elvish in daily dealings with peoples not of Númenorean descent, they "enrich" the Common Speech with "many words from Elven-tongues".[89] This "emboldened" speech spread under the rule of the Númenorean kings and led to the distinct naming schemes of Gondor's society. These naming schemes and linguistic crossovers demonstrate a shared cultural history

This linguistic connection between the Elves and the Men of Gondor echoes into the world of *The Lord of the Rings* in subtle, yet recognisable ways. For example, the Elven name for Gandalf, "Mithrandir"[90] is shared between the Elves of Lothlórien and the men of Gondor, as Faramir outlines saying that it is "after the Elvish fashion".[91] These linguistic connections allude to the shared and intermingled history of the Kingdom of Gondor and the Elves. The merging of the "Two Kindreds" originating in Beren and Lúthien.

The importance of the mingled history of Men and Elves to the aesthetics of language is perceptible when comparing the naming scheme for Gandalf between Rohan, a society of men

[88] Tolkien, *The Peoples of Middle-earth,* 34.
[89] *Ibid*.
[90] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 359.
[91]Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 513.

far removed from the Elf/Man marriages of Tolkien's fiction. Tolkien writes in the *Unfinished Tales* that the Rohirrim come from lands far away from the home they inhabit in *The Lord of the Rings.*[92] Wormtongue invokes the language of the Riddermark to insult Gandalf, calling him "*Lathspell*",[93] a word very phonetically distinct from the Elven infused language of Gondor, one of the many aesthetic differences that finds its root in history of Rohirric.

However, due to their close political and social relationship, the Rohirrim use most regularly the "common Speech", and "spoke it nobly after the manner of their allies in Gondor".[94] Rohirric and the common tongue is contrasted with the Dunland Tongue in the battle of Helm's Deep. The Dunland speech is the language of the Men who inhabited the lands of Rohan before the Rohirrim, yet were marginalised and pushed out by the Rohirrim. The anger and conflict ridden history is signalled by the presence of their language in the Battle of Helm's Deep. Gamling cries during the battle "there are many that cry in the Dunland tongue….it is an ancient speech of men…not in half a thousand years have they forgotten their grievance".[95] Here language is a further marker of difference, of division and of divergent histories that help to contextualise the events and conflicts that take place in *The Lord of the Rings.* Just as linguistic aesthetics mark a difference, yet friendliness, between Gondor and Rohan, here it is used as a marker of a fraught and bellicose history.

Language is a key indicator of identity and political relationships in Tolkien's fiction. The depth of the world presented in *The Lord of the Rings* is produced in part by the linguistic changes that take place within the Legendarium. In drawing on this body of myth throughout the episodes of *The Lord of the Rings,* Tolkien creates aesthetically complex societies created from the history of cultural unions. This is most clearly expressed in the languages and

[92] J.R.R. Tolkien, *Unfinished Tales* (London: Harper Collins, 2006), 182.
[93] *Ibid,* 670.

[94] Tolkien, *Return of the King,* 1152.
[95] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 524.

linguistic identities of Middle-earth. Further to this, characters gain complicated and distinct identities based on this cultural and linguistic history, as will be exemplified in the next section with the example of Aragorn.

Aragorn, language and the creation of identity

The importance of language to understanding Tolkien's cross-cultural connections does not just produce aesthetically distinct and believable cultures. It also produces complex and distinct individuals and characters to inhabit his world. The crucial example of such an identity is Aragorn. As a Dúnedain man, he speaks Elvish and the Common tongue, whilst holding various names and identities throughout the various cultures of Middle-earth. He has a liminal identity, characteristic of a descendent of Beren and Lúthien.

Firstly, Aragorn moves between identities based on his immediate contextual needs, appearing to either the patrons of the Prancing Pony as "Strider",[96] a name used to disguise his true identity. This then changes when he has dealings with the Elves of Middle-earth, where he becomes "Aragorn Elf-Friend"[97] or "Aragorn, Son of Arathorn"[98] to appeal to his dynastic title. Frodo remarks upon this complicated identity of Aragorn, when he says "You seem to have a lot of names".[99] These multitude of names speak to the wide variety of mingled historical identities that are imbued within Aragorn.

The key way in which Aragorn's complex identity is presented is in his ability to speak both Elven and the Common tongue, therefore he can communicate and belong amongst both Men and Elves. This bi-lingual element to his character, indicative of the Dúnedain's dual heritage, is one instance of an expansion and enrichment of the world based on cross-cultural meetings. The importance of open bilingual speech to liminal identities is expressed by Gloria

[96] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 152.
[97] *Ibid,* 343.
[98] *Ibid*, 171.
[99] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 232.

Anzaldua, a Chicana writer from the border territories between Mexico and America who harbors a similarly complex identity as Aragorn. She writes of her ability to speak multiple languages as such: "Ethnic identity is twin skin to my linguistic identity".[100] The expression of this identity comes through interchangeable language, and this is also expressed by Aragorn throughout *The Lord of the Rings.*

The first example of Aragorn's twin Elven identity comes when the Fellowship enter Lothlórien for the first time. He is "wrapped in some fair memory",[101] wherein he is recalling the memories of his beloved, Arwen (whom he refers to idiomatically in *Appendix A* as his "Lúthien"[102]). At the borders of Lothlórien he says "*Arwen vanimelda, namarie"*.[103] In this utterance, the reader gets a glimpse of Aragorn's Elven/Dúnedain heritage, that the woodland realm of Lothlórien invokes such memories from him alludes to this duality. Moreover, his use of the Elvish further establishes this connection.

Language as a signal of Aragorn's Elven heritage, and its importance to his character, is expressed when he is crowned as the King of Gondor. Upon receiving the crown, he says "Ea Earellom utulien. Sinome maruvan ar Hildinyar tenn…and those were the words that Elendil spoke when he came up out of the Sea on the wings of the wind".[104] The significance of this, both in terms of the allusion to the Númenorean migrant past and the Elven influence cannot be overstated. It presents the syncretism of the people of Gondor and their memory of an Elven past, and how that is embodied in the character of Aragorn. His identity as the inheritor of the Throne of Gondor echoes from history, as a Númenorean descendent of the romance of Beren and Lúthien, and shows how their border crossing love progressed the history of Middle-earth.

---

[100] Anzaldua, Gloria. "How to Tame A Wild Tongue," in *Borderlands/La Frontera* (San Francisco: Aunt Lute Books, 2007), 81.

[101] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 352.
[102] Tolkien, *Return of the King,* 1106.
[103] Tolkien, *Fellowship.* 352.
[104] Tolkien, *Return of the King,* 957.

This change, and the dissolution of boundaries that Beren and Lúthien fomented, can be felt in various instances throughout Tolkien's Legendarium.

Conclusion

The history of Middle-earth, and the settings and characters that are presented, only grow in complexity from the acts of movement analysed in the first chapter. Through inter-marrying of races and cultures in the early stages of the history, distinct and rich historical tracts of identities emerge that add to the believability and impression of depth that exists in Tolkien's world. Each of the characters acts, thinks and behaves in accordance with the history which is distilled within them. Aragorn is the key example of a product of this history, yet more characters can be examined in such a way that this analysis does not have the scope to present. Frodo, for example, is a product of the micro-cultures of The Shire as part Baggins and part Took. Sufficed to say, the blending and interactions of each of the peoples of Middle-earth enriches Tolkien's world and its peoples. Further to this, it foregrounds that Middle-earth is a dynamic world, in a constant state of flux, where identities interact and change based on the narrative arcs that take place. The full extent of this depth, like the history of migration in Chapter one, exists more in inter-textual references between texts and the cultural memory of seminal interactions.

CHAPTER THREE- ENDINGS AS BEGINNINGS: WORLD-BUILDING AND THE QUESTION OF RACE

> I am historically minded. Middle-earth is not an imaginary world…The theatre of my tale is this earth, the one in which we live now, but the historical period is imaginary. The essentials of that abiding place are all there (at any rate for inhabitants of N.W. Europe) so naturally it feels familiar, even if a little glorified by the enchantment and distance in time.[105]

Introduction

Encounters across borders and societies are incredibly important to the way that Tolkien's history unfolds. It is within the development of these histories that the impression of depth of his world is created. Societies change and shift as a result of their encounters with one another. This history is not an easy one, it is fraught with division, bellicosity and outright hatred between Tolkien's many fictional peoples. It is not merely confined to binary enmity between *good* and *bad*; as critics of Tolkien such as Salman Rushdie attest.[106] This history is one that develops and unfolds based upon the narratives that take place, old divisions regularly heal through alliances and the bonds between individuals, of which inter-marriage is an example. This historical perspective on the way Tolkien's world is constructed holds many implications for the way that Tolkien's portrayal of race can be understood. The question of race is important to Tolkien studies as a field, yet, Tolkien scholarship has been reluctant to fully engage with the controversies surrounding race in his fiction. The question of race is made even more pertinent by the prevalence of praise for Tolkien on websites such as *Counter-currents*, an avowedly neo-fascistic publication. These fascist commentators argue that its fantasy reproduction of an ostensibly western society, pre-occupation with the purity of bloodlines and

[105] Tolkien, *Letters*, Letter no. 183, 239.
[106] Rushdie, Salman. "Arms and the men and Hobbit", *The Guardian*, last modified January 4, 2003, https://www.theguardian.com/books/2003/jan/04/film.salmanrushdie.

the decline of the societies depicted makes these texts a mouthpiece for far-right, white supremacist ideologies.

This chapter shall be comprised of three parts. Firstly, I shall give a bibliographic overview of the discussions of race in Middle-earth, from both white nationalist readings, critical responses to Tolkien and his depictions of race, and those scholars who have attempted to exonerate Tolkien. This overview will form the basis of the discussions this chapter shall examine. Following this, I shall examine the key parts of *The Lord of the Rings* that seem to exhibit racist messages and beliefs. In doing so, I shall argue that racial strife, stereotypes and aggression are presented as a negative quality of the history that Tolkien constructs, rather than an authorial desire to essentialise and condone these qualities. The third section will argue that the course of Middle-earth's history, as presented in *The Lord of the Rings*, leans towards racial commensuration and co-existence, although the path towards commensuration is not presented by Tolkien as either an immediate nor an easy process. This commensuration is nonetheless presented as the inevitable course of Middle-earth's history and racial harmony is a constituent part of the triumph of good over evil. The imagery used by Tolkien and the conclusions of many story arcs of *The Lord of the Rings* demonstrates the significance of racial commensuration. This chapter shall ultimately argue that Tolkien's work is best interpreted through a mixture of historical and literary lenses and that a failure to account for the full historical scope and setting of his world results in imperfect and flawed responses to the question of race. The beliefs of certain characters, just as in the primary world, are a product of both innate biases and the particularities of their historical moment within the fiction.

White nationalist readings and scholarly warnings

The crucial aspect of any racial criticism in Tolkien's fiction is in understanding the core of why it is such a contentious issue. The issue is rooted in various far right publications and, what I shall tentatively call, 'analysis' of Tolkien's work. An example of fascist co-option is the

various articles on the website *Counter-Currents*, which applies Tolkien's work to the worldview of white supremacy. Among such publications is an article arguing that *The Lord of the Rings* operates in part as a didactic warning about the dangers of "racial intermixture".[107] The article asserts that the threat of racial intermixture forms the basis of many of Tolkien's imagined history, as Tolkien does repeatedly utilise the medieval trope of the broken bloodline and the reconnection of the king to his throne. An often quoted aspect of Tolkien's world on white-supremacist forums is the notion of the blood of Númenor being mixed with "lesser men".[108] These commentators also latch onto the presence of the "marauding Easterlings" and "Wainriders"[109] assaulting the Kingdom of Gondor; Gondor representing 'European peoples' in this instance. Such interpretations have made their way before into mainstream political discourses. For example, the BNP (British National Party- a far right political party in the UK) once declared it "essential reading…for anyone that is stirred by the struggle to win back our homeland".[110] Tolkien's works therefore have been recommended and praised by white supremacists as a mouthpiece of these worldviews, rendering Tolkien's works a controversial object of study.

There are also non-white supremacist academic commentators and journalists who have argued that Tolkien's fiction is deeply problematic. Writing in *The Guardian* in 2002, John Yatt accuses Tolkien of "genetic determinism" wherein "white men are good, dark men are bad and orcs worst of all".[111] Such criticisms have solid textual evidence. The Haradrim, Tolkien's Eastern peoples, are consistently disparaged physically and are depicted as a hostile

[107] Brittanicus. "Master of Middle-earth.".

[108] *Ibid.*

[109] *Ibid.*

[110] "Did Tolkien have a Racist Message?" *The Sunday Times*, last modified December 22, 2002, https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/did-tolkien-have-a-racist-message-fng6ptt385x.

[111] Yatt, John. "Wraiths and Race", *The Guardian*, last modified December 2, 2002, https://www.theguardian.com/books/2002/dec/02/jrrtolkien.lordoftherings.

other. Phrases such as, "as bad as orcs they look"[112] pepper their descriptions within the text. Further to this, Tolkien himself is quoted as describing the orcs as a "mongoloid type",[113] invoking the racist rhetoric of the late Victorian period. Stephen Shapiro is equally condemning of Tolkien's fictional depictions of race, saying that the Fellowship are "uber-Aryan".[114] This uber-Aryan presentation, Shapiro argues, plays into discourses of a disappearing Western civilisation. He claims that the narrative of *The Lord of the Rings* centers around this uber-Aryan Fellowship against the unambiguously evil tides of the Eastern peoples. Yatt and Shapiro represent the two most prominent critiques of Tolkien's depictions of race and they largely sparked the contemporary debate on the subject.

With such a raft of criticisms, it is not surprising that many scholars within the field of Tolkien studies have issued warnings about the racist messaging in Tolkien's Legendarium. One such warning was made by Drout and Wynne in 2001, in their bibliographic analysis of Tolkien studies since the 1980's. They argue that Tolkien studies, in not keeping step with the trends in literary studies, risks self-marginalisation and irrelevance to the wider field of literary studies[115]. This has been re-iterated by Helen Young. Young criticises Tolkien studies for being (albeit understandably for an emergent field), overly "defensive"[116] when faced with criticism of the Legendarium. She argues, like Drout, that full engagement with critical racial theory is the only way to dispel the criticisms of race in Tolkien's fiction. In response to these criticisms,

[112] Tolkien, *The Two Towers*, 679.
[113] Dmitra Fimi. "Revisiting Race in Tolkien's Legendarium: Constructing Cultures and Ideologies in an Imaginary World". *Dmitra Fimi (*blog.), last modified December 2, 2018, http://dimitrafimi.com/2018/12/02/revisiting-race-in-tolkiens-legendarium-constructing-cultures-and-ideologies-in-an-imaginary-world/.

[114] Shapiro, *as quoted by* Ann-Reid, "Tolkien and Race", 42.
[115] Drout, Michael D. C. and Hilary Wynne, "Tom Shippey's *J. R. R. Tolkien: Author of the Century* and a Look back at Tolkien Criticism since 1982,", *Envoi* 9, 2, (Fall, 2000): 131.
[116] Young, "Review of *The Body in Tolkien's Legendarium*".

many recent critics have posited defences of Tolkien's Legendarium, with varying degrees of success.

On the multiple defences from Tolkien scholars

One defence is that the way that readers (and in the case of the Peter Jackson movies, viewers) find in Middle-earth a perceptibly diverse world, as argued by Straubhaar. Strauubhaar argues that a "poly-cultural, poly-lingual world is absolutely central to Tolkien's narrated Middle-earth and is easily perceptible as such".[117] Strauubhar further notes that there is a disjunct in understanding these moments, as they come often from dialogue of typically untrustworthy characters, such as Gollum, taking the fault away from the authorial voice. This argument, as noted by Reid, is intended to "remove the topic from the dialogue completely"[118] or at least to minimise the importance of other, more problematic elements of Tolkien's fiction (such as the depictions of the Haradrim). This as a defence, whilst having much merit, does minimise the importance of insensitive racial depictions and inter-relations in the Legendarium.

Another defence that is used, as most effectively conveyed by Dimitra Fimi, is that we see in Tolkien's fiction an expression of the cultural whiplash he experienced throughout his life. Tolkien was raised in a late Victorian milieu, writing from this time and up until the massive cultural shifts of the 1950s. Tolkien speaks in Edwardian conceptions of race, using words such as "mongoloid" in reference to his aesthetic choices for the orcs. Fimi argues that Tolkien's fiction is the product of his historical liminality, and whilst he somewhat adapted to more modern attitudes on race, there were still Edwardian hangovers. She argues that in writing from a time of "tumultuous cultural change".[119] This change can be felt in the inconsistencies between his descriptions of orcs and reproductions of racist stereotypes (both inside and outside

[117] Sandra Bailif-Strauubhar, "Myth, Late Roman History, and Multiculturalism in Tolkien's Middle-earth," in *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth: A Reader*, ed. Jane Chance (Lexington, KT: The University Press of Kentucky, 2004), 101-109.
[118] Ann-Reid, "Tolkien and Race", 44.
[119] Fimi, "Revisiting Race in Tolkien's Legendarium"

of his fiction), yet at the same time, being avowedly against racism and very much in favour of empathy and understanding of those different to ourselves. The inconsistency as Fimi calls it, is rooted in this longitudinal process. This defence is also with much merit: Tolkien was indeed a product of a very unique era, and Middle-earth, as Fimi argues, was created over "60 years"[120] of interconnected writings. There are, however, also difficulties that such a defence creates. Whilst it may exonerate the personal character of Tolkien from the difficulties of racism, it does not provide a useful lens through which to properly defend Tolkien's Legendarium and its stories. Nor does it allow us, as critics, to directly challenge the ideological co-options of the Legendarium from white supremacist commentators.

The insufficiency of this defence is also noted by Gehl in the book *Shakespeare and Tolkien*. He argues that, much as within *Othello*, a particularly British notion of 'the other' is present within Tolkien's fiction. He does not read *The Lord of the Rings* as a story specifically of the civilised Europeans vs the barbaric eastern peoples. However, he does also suggest that citing the inter-cultural marriages and poly-lingual world is insufficient in tackling the full scale of the issue.[121] In challenging the simple dismissal of racist allegations, Gehl does invite a more nuanced understanding of race in Tolkien's fiction. The various defences of Tolkien's Legendarium are only partially effective. Some seek to dismiss the issue, whilst others are content to relegate it as merely a product of the time period Tolkien was writing in. The next sections shall focus upon using these defences, with their individual merits, to formulate a response to critics of Tolkien's depictions of race, whilst strengthening previous arguments.

[120]Fimi, "Revisiting Race in Tolkien's Legendarium.".
[121] Robert Gehl, "Something is stirring in the East: Racial Identity, Confronting the "Other" and Miscegenation in *Othello* and *The Lord of the Rings" Tolkien and Shakespeare: Essays on Shared Themes and Language.* ed. Janet Brennan Croft (Jefferson, NC: Macfarland & Company inc. 2007), 251-267.

Bridging biography and history

Throughout the past chapters, I have shown, with numerous representative case studies, that Tolkien's races and peoples change according to migratory patterns and cross-cultural interactions. These interactions produce, and alter the course of, the history that Tolkien creates. The romance of Beren and Lúthien begets the Númenoreans, and the Flight of the Noldor explains the presence of the Elves in Middle-earth. These histories are woven into the identities of the societies of Middle-earth. This historically minded and dynamic world-building, I shall argue, can be a pathway to an understanding of race in the Legendarium. I shall outline the changing world within which Tolkien was writing and chart the shift from late Victorian to the 1950's, across which Tolkien was writing. As Stuart Hall writes, "we all write from a particular place and time".[122] It is by examining how Tolkien responds, in his fiction, to the changing world in which he lived, that the nuances of his attitude towards race are revealed.

Following this, I shall argue, like Fimi, that this formative, transitional history within which Tolkien was writing is reflected in Middle-earth. Based on the importance of changing identities and national mythmaking in Tolkien's fiction, this chapter shall develop Fimi's argument, showing that racial issues in Tolkien are best approached as an organic, developing part of his imagined history. Or to put it another way, racism is a narrative barrier erected by Tolkien as a challenge for the forces of good to overcome. This history, much like the history of the UK in Tolkien's era, is flawed, and fraught, but the history in Tolkien's world is directed towards reconciliation and harmony, working past the strife. Seeing Tolkien this way holds two key advantages. Firstly, it does not minimise the importance of racist depictions in Tolkien's fiction or letters and provides a frame within which to see these issues as problematic,

[122] Stuart Hall. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora," *Framework: The Journal of Cinema and Media*, no.36, (1989): 222.

but also as something that needs to be worked through. Secondly, it allows us as readers to take from Tolkien a message wholly opposite from that which the white supremacists prescribe.

As Fimi argues, Tolkien is a unique author in terms of the time period within which he wrote. During his lifetime, England underwent incredible social change and a change in attitude regarding race. Tolkien was born in the late 1890's, a time of distinct racist attitudes and of full-blown 'Orientalist' rhetoric. As Edward Said comments about the cultural effects of the British colonial project, it is a "library or archive of information"[123] that allowed the British subject to "see Orientals as a phenomenon possessing regular characteristics".[124] These characteristics, he argues, formed the moral basis for white supremacy and colonialist attitudes. He characterises this knowledge as creating the notion of 'the other' as embodying "radical difference".[125] It is within this belief structure, and notions of race that Tolkien had his formative years and began to work on his fantasy world. A representative example of how this belief structure influenced Tolkien personally is from a debate during his time at King Edwards' VI school, where he is quoted as saying "He declared that to believe that so great a genius arose in such circumstances commits us to the belief that a fair-haired european infant could have a wooly-haired prognathous Papuan parent".[126] Tolkien here is clearly using the orientalist rhetoric that his formative years were mired in. From this structure of belief and rhetoric, Tolkien derives terms and phrases that are indicative of a colonialist political epistemology.

By Tolkien's later life England had drastically changed demographics, particularly in the post-war period. The body of knowledge that Tolkien was immersed in had (in part) given way to a more multi-cultural Britain. Some key examples of this were the British Nationality Act

[123] Edward Said. *Orientalism.* (London: Penguin Modern Classics, 2003), 41.

[124] *Ibid,* 42.
[125] *Ibid,* 42.
[126] J.R.R. Tolkien, *as quoted in* Fimi, "Revisiting race in Tolkien's Legendarium".

of 1948, which introduced a rapid increase of minority populations from across the Commonwealth. It is within this setting that Tolkien finished *The Lord of the Rings*, a story that began nearly 30 years before. In positioning Tolkien between these two different time periods, it is easy to see him as occupying both chapters of English history. This authorial liminality, as Fimi argues, gives rise to the tonal and thematic inconsistency of Tolkien's approaches to race.[127] Such inconsistency is rooted in the peculiar mixture of Victorian anthropology, Tolkien's medieval sources and ideas about race that emerged throughout the 1940's and 1950's.

Tolkien is an author caught between two times and modes of thinking, and his fiction also expresses this division. In the same text where orientalist stereotypes are used to describe the civilisations to the East of Middle-earth, there are also moments of great racial reconciliation. The next sections shall therefore unpack how Tolkien's fiction echoes both the difficulties and triumphs of this changing England in his fiction, and how the process of societal change relates to presentations of race in Tolkien's Legendarium.

Meetings, empathy and experience

Throughout Tolkien's fiction, especially within *The Lord of the Rings*, characters regularly shift attitudes and beliefs based on encounters with societies that are different to their own. One such example of shifting boundaries and attitudes in the triumphant love of Beren and Lúthien, as examined in the previous chapter. There are yet more examples however, within *The Lord of the Rings*, that indicate a concern with overcoming difference.

Empathy is a recurring theme throughout *The Lord of the Rings*, and particularly empathy with 'the other'. Tolkien's concern with empathy is exemplified succinctly when Sam encounters the dead Haradrim just after his meeting with Faramir. The Haradrim are

[127] Fimi, "Revisiting Race in Tolkien's Legendarium".

particularly contentious aspect of Tolkien's fiction, as outlined previously. They seem to reproduce racist stereotypes of 'Eastern peoples', and alongside this, they are associated with the antagonist, Sauron, further enhancing the optics towards a 'West vs the rest' clash within *The Lord of the Rings.* However, when first encountering the death of one such man, emphasis is drawn by Tolkien to the need for empathy towards him. Upon encountering the dead man, Tolkien narrates Sam as follows:

> It was Sam's first view of a battle of Men against Men, and he did not like it much. He was glad that he could not see the dead face. He wondered what the man's name was and where he came from; and if he was really evil of heart, or what lies or threats had led him on the long march from his home; and if he would not really rather have stayed there in peace [128]

There are numerous elements within this paragraph that challenge the belief that Tolkien reproduces racist ideologies within his fiction and de-humanises those who come from the East. Firstly, the capitalisation of "Man" draws attention to their equality of standing with the Men of Gondor. There is no racially deterministic hierarchy at play here that diminishes the life of the Haradrim man. Moreover, what is constructed by Tolkien here is a process of 'de-otherisation', wherein an uncomplicated enemy is re-considered as human. Sam asks himself if he was truly evil and if he searches for peace just as he does. This process of de-otherisation is repeated throughout various episodes of *The Lord of the Rings*.

Gimli and Sam's meeting with Galadriel is another such example in *The Lord of the Rings* of an encounter with 'the other'. Galadriel is constructed in such a way that many stereotypes and notions about her are abound throughout the different cultures of Middle-earth. As evidenced in the words of Éomer, whereupon he says of the Lady Galadriel "there is a Lady of the Golden Wood, as the old tales tell! Few escaper her nets they say….you also are net-

[128] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 661.

weavers and sorcerers maybe".[129] Herein, Éomer is filtering his interaction through what Stuart Hall would call a prism of belief,[130] much as orientalist knowledge saturated British culture. Éomer, from his cultural upbringing and the stories which he heard, holds a stereotyped belief about the Lady Galadriel. In positioning the discussion in this way, Tolkien reveals important architectures of 'otherisation' within his world. We are also invited to assume that Éomer is not alone in holding these beliefs. His attitude is situated in a network of knowledge about Galadriel the reader knows to be false: Éomer's knowledge is based upon apocryphal tales. He believes Galadriel to be wicked and predatory. On the other hand, the Fellowship's experience is based on a direct encounter with Galadriel, one that is emotionally charged and deeply affecting for them.

Direct experience and empathy are also incredibly important in discussing the ways in which Galadriel is conceived by the Fellowship. In this episode, Gimli's transformation demonstrates the importance Tolkien gives first-hand experience of those that are 'otherised'. Upon arriving at Lothlórien, Celeborn scolds the Dwarvern kingdoms for rousing the ancient Balrog, saying "had I known the Dwarves had stirred up that ancient evil…I would have forbidden you to pass the Northern borders, you and all that went with you".[131] He was willing to withhold aid to the Fellowship based on their encounter with the Balrog, and his natural hostility to the Dwarves. Galadriel interrupts him immediately following this and elicits empathy from Celeborn in saying "Do not repent of your welcome to the Dwarf. If our folk had been exiled long and far from Lothlórien, who of the Galadhrim…would pass night and not wish to look upon their ancient home".[132] Galadriel here empathises with Gimli, and in doing so engenders empathy in Celeborn. After her speech, Tolkien writes "At length Celeborn

[129] *Ibid,* 438.
[130] Stuart Hall, *as quoted by* Lawrence Grossberg, *Cultural Studies in the Future Tense. (*Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2010), 16.
[131] Tolkien, *Fellowship*, 356.
[132] *Ibid,* 356.

spoke again. 'I did not know that your plight was so evil…Let Gimli forget my harsh words: I spoke in the trouble of my heart".[133] Within this extract, the commensuration of strife between peoples is explored. In shifting Celeborn's grievance into an Elven cultural frame, he reconsiders his hostility. Celeborn's grievance is one small example in Tolkien's fiction of how stereotypes and attitudes are changed by first-hand experience and empathic interactions.

This empathy that Galadriel shows towards Gimli leads to true character development and a shift of attitude in Gimli's character. Upon first arriving into Lothlórien, Gimli is wary, tense and suspicious when asked to wear a blindfold through the paths. Gimli here is otherised and singled out because of his identity. He is described as having "a hand on the haft of his axe"[134] and the situation escalates before defusal by Aragorn. Gimli's initial attitude contrasts starkly with the Fellowship's departure from Lothlórien, wherein Gimli says of Galadriel's gift of three hairs "it shall be set in imperishable crystal to be…a pledge of good will between the mountain and the Wood until the end of days".[135] Within this section, and Galadriel's empathy for Gimli and defence of him, the culture and hostility between the dwarves and elves goes someway to being eroded, although it is only done so between two individuals. Tolkien here emphasises the power of empathy in overcoming difference and engendering peace. In doing so, Tolkien constructs a historical development of Tolkien's peoples, as animosity and tension transform into friendship. The trajectory of development here is clear, where empathy and understanding towards the 'other' prevail, so too do the forces of good.

The significance of this friendship is borne out further in the text. The pattern repeats itself when Gimli responds to Éomer's false beliefs about Galadriel. Gimli argues back at Éomer's accusation of sorcery and trapping, saying "let Gimli the Dwarf Gloin's son warn you

[133] *Ibid,* 356.
[134] Tolkien, *Fellowship,* 346.
[135] *Ibid,* 376.

against foolish words. You speak evil of that which is fair beyond the reach of your thought".[136] Just as Galadriel defended Gimli, now Gimli does the same for her, against the prejudice of Éomer. Moreover, Gimli's defence is effective. Éomer later says "pardon my rash words concerning the Lady of the Wood. I spoke only as do all men in my land, and I would gladly learn better".[137] There is much here that shows a reflects the anxieties of 1950's England and its demographic changes. Éomer speaks humbly of his own prejudice against Galadriel and expresses an open-mindedness to expanding his mind about the nature of Galadriel. Much as Tolkien, in continuing to use words such as "mongoloid", found himself outpaced by the course of history, so too does Éomer. He says later in his exchange with Gimli "The world is all grown strange. Elf and Dwarf in company walk…and folk speak to the Lady of the Wood and yet live".[138] Éomer here very much echoes a 1950's sensibility in England, he articulates the sense of the world changing at a rate that is difficult to keep pace with. Éomer exhibits what De Genova would term an "epistemic crisis",[139] a state where old networks of knowledge no longer apply to a changing world.

Éomer is however not allowed to easily morally exonerate himself of his closed mindedness by a plea to ignorance. Tolkien uses the figure of leadership in Aragorn to morally rebuke Elmer's sentiments. Aragorn states "Good and ill have not changed since yesteryear; nor are they one thing among Elves and Dwarves and another among men. It is a man's part to discern them, as much in the Golden Wood as in his own house".[140] Aragorn here speaks as a unifier, challenging the amorality of Éomer's knowledge structure. He draws a clear equivocation between empathy and understanding towards the 'other' and virtuous moral

[136] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 432.
[137] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 436.
[138] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 434.
[139] "Europe/Crisis: New Keywords of "the Crisis" in and of "Europe"", *Near Futures Online,* ed. Nicholas De Genova and Martina Tazzioli, accessed 28 October, 2019, http://nearfuturesonline.org/europecrisis-new-keywords-of-crisis-in-and-of-europe/.

[140]Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 438.

attitudes. Éomer replies "True indeed",[141] signifying his change of attitude and Aragorn's moral victory. The Lady of the Golden Wood example is applicable to any groups that would be traditionally 'otherised' in the primary world. Tolkien is therefore appealing to a sense of empathy those deemed 'other'. Aragorn's ethical rebuke here becomes emblematic of the moral messaging of Tolkien's fiction: to overcome difference and prejudice. The changes that Middle-earth undergoes are difficult to comprehend for many of its characters. The changing epistemologies of Middle-earth parallel the seismic cultural shifts experienced by Tolkien: a Late Victorian writing in 1950's England. But harmony between races here is indubitably associated with the forces of 'good' and positive progress; directly contrasting with the damning assessments of Yatt and Shapiro.

Éomer is not the only instance of an epistemic crisis in Tolkien's Legendarium. Treebeard, having never seen a hobbit before, finds his notions of the world, and its boundaries, de-stcrabilised by the appearance of Merry and Pippin. Upon meeting them, he says "what are you, I wonder?... You do not seem to come in the old lists that I learned when I was young, but that was a long, long time ago, and they may have made new lists".[142] The language that Treebeard uses here, of a list and order of being, reflects Tolkien's own liminal upbringing and how old structures of knowledge do not reflect the reality of the present. Yet, he does not meet this challenge with hostility. Instead, Treebeard opts to expand the song with which he frames his world. The song Treebeard sings is as follows:

Learn now the lore of Living Creatures!
First name the four, the free peoples:
Eldest of all, the Elf-children;
Dwarf the delver, dark are his houses;
Ent the earthborn, old as mountains;

[141] *Ibid*, 438.
[142] Tolkien, *The Two Towers*, 464.

Man the mortal, master of horses:[143]

Upon hearing the song, Merry remarks that Hobbits "always seem to have got left out of the old songs",[144] hence why Treebeard has no point of reference for them. Edward Said makes similar remarks about English literary culture, that orientalist knowledge was "produced by novelists, poets, translators" that either speak for (or neglect to mention at all) margnialised peoples.[145] The Hobbits are excluded from the song, yet Pippin inserts a new line to the song, suggesting "Half-grown Hobbits, the hole-dwellers…put us in amongst the four, next to Man".[146] In doing so, the Hobbits expand Treebeard's social epistemology, and place themselves amongst the many other peoples of Middle-earth. Tolkien's attitude here is demonstrated: those deemed other must be allowed to tell their story and to include themselves in the cultural frameworks that are used. Tolkien embeds a message here that the same expansion should take place in England's cultural frameworks as stories and songs fail to reflect reality.

Yet, despite the seeming ease with which these examples of otherisation are overcome, Tolkien does not always offer such easy solutions to the strife between peoples. There are longstanding, violent divisions between societies that require resolution. These resolutions are offered in the ending of *The Lord of the Rings,* and specifically in the focus on the future that King Elessar (Aragorn) ushers in, that Tolkien's attitudes on race appear in their fullest expression.

[143] *Ibid,* 463.
[144] *Ibid,* 463.
[145] Said, *Orientalism,* 40.
[146] Tolkien, *The Two Towers,* 464.

The world goes ever on…

With the historical style that Tolkien creates in his fiction being so important to his vast backcloth, it is equally important, when considering the topic of race, to understand how Tolkien perceives, and constructs, the implied future of Middle-earth. Mosihn Hamid wrote of the ways in which the primary world changes, "we are all migrants through time".[147] The world shifts and changes around us, and our personalities and attitudes shift alongside it. The dynamic quality of our own world is equally true of Tolkien's Middle-earth and the characters that inhabit it. The implied future of Middle-earth, and how Tolkien projects its changes after *The Lord of the Rings* concludes, is where Tolkien's views upon race are most clearly articulated. The implied future of Middle-earth is presented through the kingship of Aragorn. Aragorn is constructed as a symbol of renewal and healing. In choosing the name Elessar, Tolkien imbues Aragorn with a distinct set of qualities. Elessar translates from Sindarin to "the renewer",[148] and under his rule renewal is exactly what takes place. Through the instincts of empathy and moral certitude expressed with Éomer, Aragorn heals the divides and conflicts that characterise the Third Age, and the problematic racial attitudes that pervade it.

Under Aragorn's leadership, there is the fullest expression of racial harmonisation, which he expresses this empathy which he earlier encourages Éomer to consider. At the end of *The Return of the King* Tolkien writes "And the King pardoned the Easterlings and sent them away free, and he made peace with the peoples of Harad and gave to them all the lands around Lake Nurnen to be their own".[149] In his act of pardoning, rather than vengeance for their alliance with Sauron (alongside giving them their own land) Aragorn is a figure of leadership who seeks not only peace, but co-existence.

[147] Mosihn Hamid, *Exit West*, (London: Hamish Hamiltion, 2017), 220.
[148] Tolkien, *Return of the King*, 863.
[149] *Ibid*, 968.

Tolkien's valourisation of Aragorn's moral leadership, and its racial inclusivity, challenges the narrative that Yatt and others of Tolkien's detractors point to as evidence of a white supremacist message. In an opposite state to being defeated and removed from the story (and by extension the history of Middle-earth), the Haradrim and Easterlings are instead shown empathy, and moreover, given lands by Aragorn. This pattern repeats itself with Ghân-buri-Ghân and the Drúedain (Dunland men),[150] previously servants of Saruman and serving with him (see chapter two), but now given peace and protection by Aragorn, ending centuries of strife. In giving these concluding glimpses into the state of the world in the Fourth Age, Tolkien's message is clear; the 'good' is associated with harmonisation and forgiveness, the 'ill' with division and bellicosity. The way that Tolkien deems indicative of progress and the triumph of good is in this co-existence, not in extermination or suppression. Moreover, these terms are not conditional. Aragorn does not demand a cultural change or shift from these peoples, nor does he seek to dominate them. He seeks only peaceful co-existence, and co-existence is presented by Tolkien as unquestionably an aspect of the triumph of good over evil.

Conclusion

In examining the history of Middle-earth, and its future, Tolkien's attitude towards race, whilst sometimes framed in deeply problematic Victorian stereotypes, are positive and reconciliatory. Just as Tolkien seems to have been caught between the shifting of time periods and cultures, so too are his fictional societies. In their handling of poly-lingual interactions, diversity and coming together as the beginning of a renewed Fourth Age, Tolkien finds the space to both include (and morally denounce) otherisation induced conflict and stereotyping. In doing so, he also provides a roadmap to overcoming it and clearly incorporating this as part of a hopeful future for Middle-earth and its ever changing societies. Examining key moments of his fiction

[150] *Ibid*, 968.

and using them as evidence of a racist worldview misses the other, equally important, elements of Tolkien's writing that provide messages of unity. Namely, the implied future of Middle-earth and the association of conquering racist attitudes with the forces of good.

CONCLUSION

Throughout this thesis I have shown, with representative examples throughout Tolkien's fiction, that Tolkien is concerned with imbuing his fantasy cultures with the same depth and inner consistency of real world societies. Understanding migration and encounters with the 'Other' in Tolkien's fiction, as well as Tolkien's own cultural setting whilst he was writing, enriches the ways that critics understand Tolkien's world-building.

In chapter one, I showed that an Anglo-Saxon memory of migration is reflected in Tolkien's fiction. Just as the Anglo-Saxon authors included a tangible memory of their cultural past, so too do the Elves that exile themselves from Valinor. This memory of the past, that is so important to the tone and style of Tolkien's known main sources, finds its way into his Legendarium. Memories of migration add complexity to the vast backcloths of his fiction and the ways in which his fictional societies interact with one another. In utilising migration, and the cultural myths it produces, Tolkien foregrounds his work as a dynamic one, with peoples and societies that alter and develop with the progression of the history of Middle-earth.

This progression is not just limited to the act of migration. As I argued in the second chapter, the interplay between cultures and peoples, as fraught as it may be in many cases, is equally propulsive and creative in the construction of the world of Middle-earth. Inter-marriage creates syncretic and interwoven societies, and culturally liminal characters, that are key in the production of a world that feels tangibly real. Aragorn is a key example of one such liminal character, and perhaps the most crucial to understanding the themes that such cultural analysis of Tolkien's work unearths. The transgression and relationships that take place between cultures is also productive in Tolkien's world-building. Language operates as a signifier of difference and political bonds between peoples. The peoples of Middle-earth are influenced by encounters with the other and with different languages. The different settings that the reader

and the Fellowship visit are given unique tones and aesthetics based upon their divergent histories.

Finally, I have shown that this line of analysis also has implications for depictions of race in Tolkien's fiction. Many critics attempt exoneration and reinterpretation of problematic passages, but few provide an applicable framework to effectively engage with the theme of race. In my third chapter, I attempted to show that in presenting a dynamic world; a world in the midst of a transitional change for many of its societies, Tolkien expresses his views on race. Far from lauding the triumph of an uber-Aryan Fellowship over so-called lesser races, Tolkien shows within his fiction the challenges of historical liminality. The epistemic crises of 1950's England are reproduced in *The Lord of the Rings*, and Tolkien both articulates the difficulty that these crises present, but also, portrayed a clear moral imperative to overcome them. Many of the characters in *The Lord of the Rings* show attitudes and beliefs equivocal to those in Tolkien's England (including some of the language he himself uses).

However, as I have shown, the piece of the puzzle most important to understanding Tolkien's perspective is not to look at snapshots of his fiction and generalise them into evidence of possible racist beliefs. Rather, it is important to look at the implied future and developmental trajectory of Tolkien's world, and to unpack and examine the integral parts of what Tolkien considers to be the triumph of good. In doing this, it is demonstrable that Tolkien sees the harmony and empathy between races as integral to a better world, and in doing so, he calls upon his readers to follow the moral example his characters set. He calls for this regardless of how disorienting a changing world can be, even for himself. To argue otherwise, much as white-supremacist readers do, is to be on the wrong side of history, whether it be in Middle-earth or the real world.

Given the scope of this thesis, its analysis of Tolkien's world has not been entirely exhaustive and there are many more avenues of inquiry that can yet be examined. For example,

full-throated post-colonial analysis of Tolkien's work into the ways he constructs his societies so as to comment on the ethics of empire could be greatly revealing. Moreover, further analysis of the languages he constructs, with a socio-linguistic focus, could also yield productive conclusions about how these languages interplay with real world beliefs and ideologies. A final suggestion could be the examination of Hobbits and their journey throughout the world of Middle-earth; how their own society is presented by Tolkien and how, as an isolated body of people from the wider world, they learn and grow from their interactions with the different peoples of Middle-earth.

Here it can be concluded, that in the creation of a dynamic, changing world, Tolkien constructs societies with a complexity and depth that mirror real world societies. The ways in which these societies develop shows that Tolkien had a deep concern for the construction of historicity in his work, as Middle-earth's cultural and racial boundaries are at constant odds with the stories Tolkien tells. In examining the processes of change in Tolkien's historicity, and not simply individual snapshots, Tolkien scholars can learn much about the way Tolkien perceived, and commented upon, the real world in his fiction.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary sources

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *Beowulf: A Translation and commentary together with Sellic Spell*. Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins, 2014.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *Beren and Lúthien.* Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins. 2018.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *The Fall of Gondolin*. Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins, 2018.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Fellowship of the Ring.* London: Harper Collins, 2005.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *The Return of the King.* London: Harper Collins, 2005.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Silmarillion.* London: Harper Collins, 2006.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Two Towers.* London: Harper Collins, 2005.

Secondary sources

Ann-Reid, Robin. "Race in Tolkien Studies: A Bibliographic Essay". In *Tolkien and Alterity*. Edited by Christopher Vaccaro, Yvette Kisor and Bonnie Wheeler, 33-74. Cham: Palgrave MacMillan, 2017.

Anzaldua, Gloria. "How to Tame a Wild Tongue?". In *Borderlands/La Frontera.* San Francisco: Aunt Lute Books. 2007.

Bede. "Bede's Ecclesiastical History of England". Translated by A.M Sellar. *The Project Gutenberg*. Last modified 17 December, 2011. http://www.gutenberg.org/files/38326/38326-h/38326-h.html.

Brittanicus. "Tolkien: The Master of Middle-earth." *Counter-currents* (blog). Last modified 7 August, 2011. https://www.counter-currents.com/2010/08/tolkien-master-of-middle-earth/.

Carmen Fought. "Language and Ethnicity". In *The Cambridge Handbook of Socioloinguistics*. Edited by Mesthrie Rajend, 238-258. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015.

Dawson, Deidre. "Language and Alterity in Tolkien and Levinas". In *Tolkien and Alterity*. Edited by Christopher Vaccaro, Yvette Kisor and Bonnie Wheeler, 182-203. Cham: Palgrave MacMillan, 2017.

Donovan, Leslie. "*The Wanderer."* In *JRR Tolkien Encyclopaedia: Scholarship and Critical Assessment*. Edited by Michael C. D. Drout. 691. New York: Routledge, 2007.

Drout, Michael D. C. and Hilary Wynne. "Tom Shippey's *J. R. R. Tolkien: Author of the Century* and a Look back at Tolkien Criticism since 1982." *Envoi* 9, no. 2 (Fall 2000): 101–167.

Drout, Michael D. C. "A Mythology for Anglo-Saxon England." In *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth.* Edited by Jane Chance, 229-247. Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky, 2004.

Drout, Michael D. C. "Tolkien's Creation of the Impression of Depth." *Tolkien Studies* 11 (2014): 167-211.

"Europe/Crisis: New Keywords of "the Crisis" in and of "Europe"." *Near Futures Online*. Edited by Nicholas and Martina Tazzioli. Accessed 28 October, 2019. http://nearfuturesonline.org/europecrisis-new-keywords-of-crisis-in-and-of-europe/.

Fimi, Dmitra. "Revisiting Race in Tolkien's Legendarium: Constructing Cultures and Ideologies in an Imaginary World." *Dimitra Fimi* (Blog). Last modified 2 December, 2018.http://dimitrafimi.com/2018/12/02/revisiting-race-in-tolkiens-legendarium-constructing-cultures-and-ideologies-in-an-imaginary-world/.

Fimi, Dmitri and Higgins, Andrew. Introduction to *A Secret Vice: Tolkien on Invented Languages*, J.R.R. Tolkien. London: Harper Collins 2016.

Gehl, Robert. "Something is stirring in the East: Racial Identity, Confronting the "Other" and Miscegenation in *Othello* and *The Lord of the Rings*." In, *Tolkien and Shakespeare: Essays on Shared Themes and Language.* Edited by Janet Brennan-Croft, 251-267. Jefferson, NC: Macfarland & Company Inc. 2007.

Grossberg, Lawrence. *Cultural Studies in the Future Tense.* Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2010.

Hall, Stuart. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." *Framework: The Journal of Cinema and Media,* No.36 (1989), 222-237.

Hamid, Mosihn. *Exit West*. London: Hamish Hamiltion, 2017.

Holmes, John R. "Oaths and Oath Breaking." In *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth*. Edited by Jane Chance, 249-262. Kentucky: University Press of Kentucky, 2004.

Howe, Nicholas. *Migration and Mythmaking in Anglo-Saxon England.* New Haven: Yale University Press, 1989.

Lavinsky, David. "Tolkien's Old English Exodus and the Problematics of Allegory." *Neophilologus* 101, no. 2 (2017): 305-19.

Lee, Stuart D. "J.R.R. Tolkien and The Wanderer : From Edition to Application." *Tolkien Studies* 6 (2009): 189-211.

Mendlesohn, Farah, *Rhetorics of Fantasy.* Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 2008.

Rogers, Hope. "No Triumph Without Loss: Problems of intercultural Marriage in Tolkien's Works." *Tolkien Studies* (10), 2013, 69-87.

Rushdie, Salman. "Arms and the men and Hobbits". *The Guardian*. Last modified January 4 2003. https://www.theguardian.com/books/2003/jan/04/film.salmanrushdie.

Said, Edward. *Orientalism.* London: Penguin Modern Classics, 2003.

Shippey, Tom. *The Road to Middle-earth: How Tolkien Created a New Mythology.* Revised and expanded edition. London: Harper Collins, 2012.

Shippey, Tom. “Why Source criticism?” In *Tolkien and the Study of his Sources.* Edited by Jason Fisher, 10-17. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc. 2010.

Strauubhar, Sandra Bailif . “Myth, Late Roman History, and Multiculturalism in Tolkien’s Middle-earth” in *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth: A Reader*. Edited by Jane Chance 101–117. Lexington, Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky, 2004.

The Times. “Did Tolkien have a Racist Message?”. *The Sunday Times.* Last modified 22 December, 2002. https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/did-tolkien-have-a-racist-message-fng6ptt385x.

The Wanderer in *The Anglo-Saxon World*. Edited and translated by Kevin Crossley-Holland. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009.

Hall, Stuart, and Ghazoul, Ferial. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." *Alif: Journal of Comparative Poetics*, no. 32 (2012): 257.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *The Letters of JRR Tolkien*. Edited by Humphrey Carpenter with the assistance of Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins, 2006.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *The Peoples of Middle Earth.* Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins, 1997.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Lost Road and Other Writings.* Edited by Christopher Tolkien. London: Harper Collins. 2019

Tolkien, J.R.R. *The Old English “Exodus”.* Edited and compiled by Joan Turville-Petre. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1981.

Tolkien, J.R.R.. *Tree and Leaf.* London: Harper Collins. 2001.

Tolkien, J.R.R. *Unfinished Tales*. London: Harper Collins. 2003.

Wulfstan. *Sermo Lupi Ad Anglos*. Translated by Dorothy Whitlock, 2nd ed. London: Muthean, 1952.

Yatt, John. “Wraiths and Race.” *The Guardian*. Last modified 2 December, 2002. https://www.theguardian.com/books/2002/dec/02/jrrtolkien.lordoftherings

Young, Helen. “Review of *The Body in Tolkien’s Legendarium*.” In *Journal of Tolkien Research* 1, no. 1 (2014). http://scholar.valpo.edu/journaloftolkienresearch/vol1/iss1/5/.

Zimmer, Mary E. “Creating and re-creating worlds with words.” In *Tolkien and the Invention of Myth.* Edited by Jane Chance 249-262. Kentucky, University Press of Kentucky, 2004.