

**The struggle against political corruption in Brazil:
Citizens' participation and the role of NGOs in São Paulo since
2000.**



Lanzirotti Benedetta (s2295881)

Master's thesis in Latin American Studies

Specialization in Public Policies

Leiden University

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. P. Silva

Leiden, July 2019

Content

Introduction

Chapter 1

Political corruption: The effects and the impact on citizens' participation

1.1 Political corruption and citizenry

1.2 The fight against corruption: analysis on citizens' participation

1.3 New actors within the civil society: the NGOs and their role in the fight against corruption

Chapter 2

Culture of corruption and latest democracies in Brazil

2.1 Lula's age: corruption, institutional innovation and civil society's involvement

2.2 Dilma Rousseff's government and Lula's heritage

2.3 Corruption scandal and the reaction of civil society during the crisis in 2013

Chapter 3

NGO's in São Paulo, new initiatives and project to prevent and fight corruption

3.1 Acting on the local level: Associação Amarribo Brasil

3.2 Acting on the national level: Transparencia Brasil and Instituto Não Aceito a Corrupção

3.3 Acting on the international level: Transparency International Brazil

Conclusion

References

Annex 1

Introduction

The following research is aimed to analyse and understand the evolution of the struggle against corruption in Brazil since 2000 and the impact that these new initiatives have on the society. Indeed, it is starting from 2000 that in Brazil, especially in São Paulo, the biggest metropolis in the country, there is a proliferation of non-governmental organizations, most of the organizations being aimed to improving the life of Brazilian population facing several sensible matters as human rights, environmental control and especially fight and prevention of corruption.

The subject of the research will be focused on the political corruption, the perpetuation of illegal acts from public actors and political representant, to have a private gain from it.

The fight against political corruption in a country like Brazil is not a recent phenomenon. Indeed, the political life of the country has long time been characterized by the will of change from a government to the next one, change that could happen only by eradicating corruption among the political sphere.

Despite the will of change and the actual shifts of regimes, presidents, political parties and representant, during the years political corruption has not stopped to affect the political life of the country. The corruption being perpetuated during the years brought several negative consequences in the country both within the country and in its economic and social relations with other countries. For instance, the perpetuation of corruptive behaviour brought damages in the relationship between the State and the citizens but also it heavily affected the country conferring to it a negative image on the international context.

The research will first analyse the theories related to the issue that will be faced, as corruption, political corruption and civil society. This will include the relation state/citizens and the development of the non-governmental organization as a defined actor of the civil society that brings actual change through their initiatives. In this first section the concepts relevant to the study will be analysed from different points of view to have a clear idea over the academic debate around each concept faced. To do so, many of the most important authors studying these concepts will be analysed such as, Nye, Ackermann, Richardson, Meiel and Hobbrook concerning the understanding of the concept of corruption and its relation to politics. In addition to this, authors such as Teixeira, Avritzer Heidenheimer and Johnston will be studied regarding the concept of citizens' participation, its organization and its benefits. Finally, authors such as Borj and Carr will be important to fully understand the subject of civil society its history and its evolution.

Following this first section, the subject of the research will be contextualized in the country and its historical evolution. The phenomenon of corruption being present in Brazil since the colonial time, the research will be focused on the most recent context,

starting from 2000. This for better understanding of the important dynamics created in the last two decades in Brazil that will enlighten many of the resolutions taken by the citizens or the organizations to encourage a big change within the population.

Finally, the last section will be dedicated to the analysis of the interviews realized in São Paulo with some of the most important and active NGOs in Brazil aimed to fight and prevent corruption in politics. In this section attention will be dedicated to the initiatives developed by these organization and the role that citizens play in it.

By analysing the subjects listed above, passing from one section to another, the research will aim to understand what are the new initiatives developed by these organizations.

By doing that, the research will understand why these initiatives have been implemented in the last decades and how citizens are involved and encouraged to participate focusing on the action of the NGOs and their different ways to promote participation.

When analysing the different initiatives involving citizens' participation and the different projects developed by the NGOs the research will point out the benefits that comes out from this collaboration assuming that, through the participation, citizens should have a more active role in the society.

Once citizens' participation been improves, the benefits of these collaboration will be pointed out, this can be translated into the access to clearer information about laws and regulations in Brazil as well as the different ways to act and to react when facing a corruptive behaviour.

To do so, the research will pay attention to the creation and the path of each organization, comparing their action between each other and their level of action, since the organizations will be differentiated not only by their initiatives but also from their degree of activity.

To complete this research, the information have been collected under the form of semi-structured interviews, carried on from November to January 2018/2019 in the state of São Paulo in Brazil, especially in the city of São Paulo, were most of the organizations have their headquarters but also in the city of Ribeirão Bonito. Thanks to these interviews and to the participation of the members of the organization, first-hand information have been collected that were of extreme utility to have a clear view on the issue and to complete the research.

Moreover, an analysis of different sources has been realized in the library of the University of São Paulo (USP) and of the Fundação Getulio Vargas. Thanks to this analysis it was possible to understand and have a look on the situation in Brazil right now understanding Brazilian legislation and the changes that have been made during the years to improve the fight against political corruption.

The realization of this research was of extreme importance for several reasons: first of all the phenomenon of corruption is present and impacts different countries sometimes at

the highest level, jeopardizing the creation of a healthy life in all aspects, from politics to economic and social contexts. Then, it is useful to understand the current political situation in Brazil that comes as a consequence of the corruptive scandals that affected the previous government and finally to underline the struggle of the civil society against this type of behaviour.

For all these reasons, a research on the new methods developed by independent actors is useful to understand the efforts made to eradicate this issue that will eventually lead the country to the creation of a more equal and rightful society.

Chapter 1

Political corruption: The effects and the impact on citizens' participation

The main purpose of this chapter will be to analyse and understand the complex relation between the fight against political corruption and the role that the citizens of a country can play in this process. To do so, it is first necessary to understand what the concept of corruption relating to the political sphere means and what is its impact on the society. After that the consequences of the presence of political corruption in a country will be analysed, considering not only the impact on economy but also and mostly its effect on the political world, human development and the relation between the political actors and the citizens they represent. Thanks to that it is possible to understand people's reaction when experiencing corruption, their will to react or not and the way in which this can be done. Finally, the analysis will be brought on non-governmental organizations, that aims to canalise citizens' action to experience a real change in the society.

1.1 Political corruption and citizenry

Corruption is a concept that can create controversy when coming to its definition. The concept indeed is very wide and can be related to various fields of study, for this reason the academic debate has been trying for a long time to find a definition to this concept that would describe it in the most neutral way, trying to go beyond the negative connotation that has often been associated with the term corruption.

Besides the different definitions that have been proposed during the years according to the context to which the term was referring to, this research will mainly be focused on the concept of corruption related to the political sphere of a country and involving political actors.

The study of the concept is of extreme importance since, through the analysis of the relation between corruption and politics, it is possible to understand several dynamics present in nowadays societies. For instance, some of the concept that emerged lately will be relevant such as disenchantment toward democracy, the social and economic development of the country, as well as the legitimacy of the political class currently ruling the country.

One of the most common definition describes political corruption as an illegal act committed by public actors involved in the process of decision making of a country, to get a personal reward (Aktan 2015, Richardson 2012, Meier and Holbrook 1992). It is easy to understand that a corruptive act committed by a public representant, chosen by citizens during the electoral process, can create great tensions in the relations between the citizens and the government and increase the unsatisfaction for the representant elected. This kind of dynamics bring negative consequences for the country and the citizens that can feel alienated from their own country and political representants.

The perpetuation of such behaviour may bring extremely important consequences in the country and contribute to the reshaping of the relation between citizens and the State that can result in loss of trust, loss of supporters and even big protest and demonstration organized by citizens.

The concept of corruption being wide present in numerous countries, it can be difficult to be analysed as a whole phenomenon with the same characteristics everywhere. Despite the differences that every country presents because of its historical and cultural development, that can affect the evolution and the development of corruption, it is noticed that acting corruptively within the political sphere can highly damage the economic and political development of a country, this being emphasised in recent democracies. (Von Alemann 2004) Clearly, corruption can undermine not only the life conditions of citizens but also discredit the image of the country internationally.

After acknowledging the concept of corruption and the fact that it can and most of the times it is related to politics as well as the impact that this kind of behaviour could have in nowadays society, it is necessary to understand how and in what measure this phenomenon may affect the development of a country and especially the evolution of its civil society.

When coming to the consequences that political corruption could inflict to the society, the thoughts and ideas of the academics are even more in contrast, different posture have been developed during the years considering the possible positive and negative consequences that corruptive practices could bring to the society.

As a premise, it is important to state that almost every country experience or have experienced corruptive practices even if in different ways. Although the fact that every country can experience similar corruptive behaviour, the way in which such behaviours impact the society differs largely according to a country's historical and cultural heritage as well as political and economic context and it is necessary to take these factors into account in order to get a global understanding of the phenomenon.

While analysing the effects and consequences of corruption, the focus can be brought in both economic and political context.

Most of the authors focused their analysis on the economic consequences and during their analysis they were brought to a wide range of conclusions from which very different ideas emerged. On the one hand, one stream of authors highlighted the negative effects of corruption, explaining that it has a harmful impact especially in the economic development and growth of a country. This is due to the perpetuation of illegal acts that brings political actors to waste resources, neglecting investments in important fields as education and cultural development. (Amundsen 1999) On the other hand, several authors have considered the possible benefits that a country could reap from the perpetuation of corruptive actions. Such authors stated that from an economic perspective, corruption can sometimes be considered as positive for the economic growth, depending on the historical path of the country, in this case corruption may

facilitate the economic exchanges between different parts and lead to a more dynamic economy (Nye 1967).

It is easier to perceive and measure the effects and consequences of corruption studied from an economic perspective and thanks to that reach a conclusion. On the contrary, when it comes to political and social outcomes, the analysis becomes more complex mostly because the consequences of such behaviour are not always explicit nor measurable.

Although the analysis gets more complex when applied to the political context, few authors have tried to analyse the phenomenon from this perspective and elaborated a cost/ benefit analysis that applies to the political context.

As Nye affirms: "corruption can be beneficial to political development by contributing to the solution of three major problems involved: economic development, national integration and governmental capacity". (Nye 1967:419) From this perspective, corruption can influence positively the country not only in economic matters but also creating a close relationship between actors implicated in the government and citizens.

Another argument explaining the possible benefits of corruption on a political level is given by Becquart Leclercq who states that "corruption guarantees certain zones of freedom and of free movement in the face of the totalitarian tendencies inherent in states and political parties [...] Political corruption has another important function, to redistribute public resources by parallel means accessible to groups that would otherwise be excluded" (Becquart-Leclercq 1989:193) This concept is useful to understand not only the close relation that corruptive practices could generate between state and citizens but also that the political history of a country the shifts in government can change the results and the consequences of corruption and, in this case, could be a way to react against an unwilling government.

During the analysis, not only positive aspects have been underlined when analysing the relations between corruption and political development. On the contrary, a negative correlation from these two factors have been frequently recognized through the analysis of several authors that see corruption as an illegal act perpetuated by the government that harms the possibility of reaching a fair and equal society.

While analysing the possible consequences of corruption, both positive and negative, the subjects that at the end are affected the most are the citizens. It is then extremely important to analyse the citizens' view and perception of corruptive practices to understand why such practices are being accepted or reproduced in some countries or condemned in others.

When corruption is perpetuated in democratic governments citizens who do not approve the existence of this kind of behaviour can react in different ways, but in general, two trends have been developed: first, citizens lose trust in their government, are affected by a disenchantment of democratic government and show their disagreement through the

voluntary abstentionism during the electoral process, this process being the principal instrument for a citizen to express their ideas.

The other possible reaction, more proactive, is the engagement of the citizens aimed to eradicate such practices from the country's tradition and react against their government.

This behaviour can be expressed in different ways such as contestations, demonstrations or strikes, driven by the citizens, organised or not, and aimed to reach the development of a more equal society within their country. This kind of citizens participation has gained in strength and effectiveness in the last years, both in its organisation and in the impact that it has on the country.

The next paragraph will indeed be focused on citizens participation and will try to give a clear view of its reasons, its development and the possible means of action that can be used.

1.2 The fight against corruption: analysis on citizens' participation

As stated previously, the relation between the State and its citizens is of main importance for the welfare of a country and during the years its plural dynamics have been reported and analysed.

Since the waves of democracy started to influence and bring changes in the political system of almost every country in the world, even if in different times and context, a central attention has been paid on the citizens and their role in the new system. (Markof 2015)

In this context most of the country developed a representative system that brought a swift into the role of citizens that passed from being an external actor far from any decisional process to being involved in the political sphere, by accessing information and choosing the representant with whom they share ideological views and values.

The concept of citizens' participation itself can be understood and interpreted in different ways, but in general the term refers to the act of taking part in a process, a public activity or collective actions. (Teixeira 1997) Not only the concept has different implications but also the way in which citizens can participate changes accordingly. Indeed, the action can be organized, promoted by an organization or coming from an independent initiative, and it can claim changes that would benefit a part of the society or the society as a whole. The citizens' action then raise when the State and the political representants cannot satisfy the citizens' expectations and because of that the citizens, disappointed, turn themselves as real actors of the society and bring changes into their own reality. (Teixeira 1997)

When contextualising this definition into a country with a democratic system, the participation of citizens becomes of extremely importance and with a great capacity of influence. (Van Deth 2001:4),

That is why, after being adopted, the democratic system has not stopped to be improved in an institutional and social perspective. One of the main consequences that democracy

brought is the fact that citizens could access information about policies and political decisions. The fact to have citizens informed about the political life of their country led first to a differentiation of political institutions that could reach out on citizens' needs and then to a will from the citizens to be active part of the country and reach a good and equal development of it. Moreover, in this optic the idea that integrating citizens into public affairs could benefit the State started to spread, mostly because the support that citizens could bring to the government enables a prosper development and legitimize the government itself and its decisions. (Avritzer 2017)

Moreover, the exchange of information has benefited citizens' involvement in the country's political life and led to see participation not only as a mean to protest against the government, as it was in the past years, but as a real tool to mediate people's need and government will, helping both parts to communicate, solve conflicts and find solution of common interest (Wengert 1976)

Certainly, this long process brought many authors to analyse and understand the citizens' participations, its instruments and limits.

Indeed, after stating the extremely importance of citizens' action in a country, it is necessary to understand on the one side how citizens participation can undermine political corruption and on the other side if this participation on the contrary can be affected by the corruptive practices led by actors involved into the government. The presence and the eventually condemns of a corruptive act depends mostly on the people's perception, authors as Heidenheimer have explained this concept by emphasising the fact that the actors that may define a political act as corrupt are the citizens and the political elites it is then the citizens' judgement that could condemn an illegal action and react against it. (Heidenheimer and Johnston 2011)

The identification by citizens of corruptive practices within their government can produce effects as loss in political trust and disenchantment toward democracy, these feelings kept spreading within people and can be found in several countries nowadays, Christina Eder and Alexia Katsanidou proposed a definition for such behaviours that can be defined as: "a growing distance between the people and their politicians, that voters feel unrepresented, unheard and increasingly frustrated, even alienated." (Eder et al. 2015:83)

If on the one hand, the presence of corruption over public affairs can affect negatively citizens and discourage their participation, on the other hand it can on the contrary encourage citizens to express their dissatisfaction and contest the current government.

Citizens engagement to defend their rights is a way of protest that arise in fragmented democracies, nowadays this kind of action has become a tool for citizens through which they can bring changes in the society.

Indeed, this kind of action grew constantly, citizens improved their involvement and new actors started to support citizens and tried to give an organisational frame to citizens' action.

It is now clear that citizens may have a big impact on a country and when participating and taking actions, by themselves or through an organised and wider group, the consequences may be of high importance. All these factors led to a new analysis of the society represented by a term that englobes different actors taking actions at different levels, the civil society and especially its new understanding.

1.3 New actors within the civil society: the NGOs and their role in the fight against corruption

The concept of civil society is not as recent as we can imagine, indeed it emerged in the 19th century and it was aimed precisely to understand the society and its changes through the analysis of the development of new actors.

A first definition of this concept was given by Alexis de Tocqueville who, during his study in the United States in the 19th century, defined the civil society as an actor mediating the relation between the State and the citizens. (Borj et al. 2010:19).

Since then, the concept of civil society has been object of controversies in the academic world due to its changing nature, the debate was mainly focused on the different actors present in the civil society and the role they play in it. The main actors identified are the state, the political parties but also a more recent actor that gained in importance: the non-governmental associations.

The reason why it is important to analyse and understand the role of civil society as an actor is because its limits are often unclear. Indeed, in the last years, the development of a new actor, more independent and well organised, brought to confusion when referring to civil society.

The NGOs, as per Non-Governmental Organizations, are independent organization aimed to defend common interests of a society and to reach the development of fair, equal and healthy country. (Carr 2011)

When analysing NGOs, it is licit to question if whether they keep their status of independent from the state, the political parties and from the other actors present in the civil society.

The academic world is indeed divided on this subject, on the one side NGOs are seen as completely independent because of the causes they fight for and because they don't claim any personal reward for their actions, while on the other side their fast changing nature is questioning their independence and start to associate these organizations with the government or with other private actors. (Kitsing 2009)

Since their development, the non-governmental organization haven't stop to improve their capacity of action. They have become a key actor while analysing the civil society, these organisations should be different from the other actors because they do not

represent a specific part of the population but they should aim to improve the society by carrying universal values such as transparency, ecology, education and fight for human rights. (Borj et al. 2010: 13)

As Kaldor underlines: "There is, today, a proliferation of language used to describe the non-state actors in global politics: social movements, NGOs and NPOs, advocacy networks, civil society organizations, public policy or epistemic networks, to name but a few. (Kaldor 2003)

Once explained the development of this new actor and its task of representing and defending common interests, it is important to understand the role of this actor in the fight against corruption.

Indeed, more than being active on issues as environment or human rights, the NGOs can be considered as one of the most influent actors in the fight against corruption,

A main reason of the success of NGOs' initiative must be found in the participation of people. The possibility of citizens to access information and be aware of the corruptive practices perpetuated in their country brought as a consequence the will to bring a change in their country, NGOs then give citizens the possibility of participating by taking part in actions organized by NGOs, always in a voluntary way. (Holloway 2010)

It is interesting though to consider the relationship between citizens and NGOs when relating to political corruption. Citizens can benefit from NGOs initiative because they are often aimed to reach and create information by requiring transparency and by exercising a control in the state activities, and on the other side citizens can often be a tool for NGOs that require changes by creating a form of social pressure.

In this context it is extremely important that such organizations take actions affecting the governance of a country but preserving their independent status that allow them to be efficient when taking actions.

During the years, NGOs involved in the fight against corruption have grown up in number but also improved and renewed their way of actions. Thanks to the participation of citizens within the organizations NGOs have given a structure to their actions, Carr listed the activity of NGOs fighting corruption and grouped them into:

" (1) raising awareness; (2) stakeholder engagement; (3) research; and (4) advocacy and monitoring." (Carr 2011:622) Most of these categories are aimed to spreading information among people and, thanks to that, promoting a form of control by the citizens and more transparency within the political sphere.

In the next chapter, the analysis will explore the development of corruptive practices from an historical perspective, contextualised in the Brazilian territory, following the waves of military dictatorship and the swifts to democracy, as well as the changes introduced by the democratic government on the issue of corruption and the integration of citizens as a tool to fight against it.

Chapter 2

Culture of corruption and latest democracies in Brazil

When studying the concept of corruption related to a country like Brazil, it can be difficult to contextualize the phenomenon since its beginning, due to the fact that corruptive behaviour can be found in Brazil already during the colonial time and it has been then perpetuated until today in almost every governmental transitions from military dictatorships to the latest democracies. (Fleischer 1996).

Certainly, Brazil is not the only country facing and fighting corruption, as it is a practice that be found in almost every country in the world, at different levels and of different impact. Being corruptive practices common to different countries, many authors mainly starting from 1990, focused their searches on the presence of corruption in different countries and started questioning its causes. Many of the analysis realized found a connection between economic matters, such as low level of development and unequal distribution of wellness among the society, as one of the causes for the high presence of corruption. Also, the political life of a country can determinate the presence of corruption, often unstable democracies, as well as poor institutionalization of anti-corruptive practices can be linked to the increase or the perpetuating of corruption (He 2016).

Although many of the academic work reported the economic and political situations as two factors that can be explicative for the perpetuation of corruption in a country, other works underlined the importance of the country's culture to have impact on corruptive behaviours, both to perpetuate it or to fight against it. To analyse the culture of a country and understand its possible relation to corruption it means to consider more specific aspects such as the composition of the population, the relationship that citizens have with their government and also among themselves. In this context, trust and education play a main role for the development or the eradication of corruption in a country. (Fischer et al. 2014)

In the specific context of Brazil, it is necessary to take into account the cultural aspect to propose an additional explanation to the issue. The population in the country has always been very numerous and very mixed, due to the European influence at first and to the several waves of migrations then.

When the institutionalization process started the first leaders adopted patrimonialism view of the state. This means that the governor has strong decisional power and the control over the society, that leads to a lack in distinction between public and private sphere and consequently a poor distinction between public or private gain

Also, the particular composition of Brazilian population can be considered as a second reason for corruptive practices to be perpetuated. Indeed, Brazilians could not recognize themselves as united, but their citizenry was on the contrary very fragmented, because of this many behavioural practices were adapted to the circumstances and created the so-called "jeitinho brasileiro" (Brazilian way).

According to this behaviour Brazilians make a difference and consequently act different whether they face an individual or a person, to be clearer according to Barlach people act differently whether if they consider the person they are interacting with as an individual, so within a standardized behaviour following the rules, or a person, with more empathy and acting in function of the circumstances. Fischer also explains this behaviour as being a translation of the corruption present into the political sphere to the public one, impacting the relationship that citizens have between each other (Fischer et al. 2014)

Another significant explanation of the perpetuation of corruptive practices resides in the fact that Brazil has a long experience in impunity of such corruptive behaviours, the fact that public actors who commit crimes related to corruption, has an impact on culture of justice and when such acts remain unpunished it encourages the perpetuation of corruptive behaviour and almost legitimize it.

Considering the presence of corruptive practices in almost every period of the history of Brazil, this analysis will focus on the most recent period, starting with the analysis of the government of the president Luis Inacio Lula da Silva, from now on Lula, stressing its politics and innovation in the fight against corruption as well as its relationship with civil society and the process of institutionalisation of it. Then the focus will be brought to the government of Dilma Rousseff, successor of Lula candidate from the same party, the Workers' Party (Partido dos Trabalhadores in Portuguese) and the change in its approach to the society and the institutions, to reach the last part of her second mandate in which big popular mobilization and protests arose from the civil society and brought ultimately a process of impeachment and the organization of new elections.

2.1 Lula's age: corruption, institutional innovation and civil society's involvement.

In October 2002 Luiz Inacio Lula da Silva, also known as Lula, was elected in 2002 as president of Brazil succeeding Fernando Enrique Cardoso (Anderson 2011). Both the country and his party, the Workers' Party, (Partido dos Trabalhadores in Portuguese), had big expectation on this new shift that view the candidate triumph with a significant score (Flynn 2005)

The reasons of this expectations are several, first of all it was not the first time that he run for elections, on the contrary he had already run for the past 2 elections but was defeated both times. Lula presented himself to the country as the candidate arose from the people, he belongs to the lower class of Brazil, he was born in one of the poorest regions and moved to São Paulo to work. His excellent rhetoric and his personal charisma reached the population that decided to vote for him during elections in 2002. At the time, his speech was focused on what were the most important issues of Brazil at the time, reduction of poverty especially extreme poverty, eradication of corruption within the political system and improvement on the economic development of the country. Thanks to this, Lula obtained support not only from the poorest part of the country or his party but also from

a big part of the Brazilian middle and higher classes, thanks also to the big coalition formed that included (Anderson 2011).

Despite the promises for big changes and the high hope from the population, the government of Lula would soon be considered as very contradictory in all aspects including the fight against corruption but also the measures taken to improve the national economy, the institutionalization of the citizens' participation and the reduction of high poverty.

Concerning the fight against corruption, Lula's discourse aimed to improve transparency and accountability of the political representant but also the improvement of the institutions already existing by empowering it with more control over the finances used by the government. In this sense, he acted on the already existing organ whose aim was to apply internal control on public administration, when created this organ's original name was Corregedoria Geral da Uniao, during Lula's government the name of the organ change to Controladoria Geral da União (CGU). This change of name was underlined as a will to improve the internal control that was at the time very fragmented and inefficient, the first president of the CGU under Lula's government stressed this concept by emphasising that the change of name gave a taste of what the government purpose was, that is to associate control activities to democratic principles, that will result in the good manage of public funds and more transparency. (Loureiro et al. 2012)

The name was not the only feature that changed, indeed in 2003 several public national contests were organized to improve the workforce of the organ and subsequently its efficiency. Moreover, the collaboration between the CGU and the federal police was enhanced, this brought a deeper collaboration in investigations with the will to reduce impunity. (Hage 2010)

Moreover, also according to Hage, the government created in 2014 a portal dedicated to improving transparency and fight corruption. The Portal da Transparencia was indeed aimed to enable every citizen to access information about public expenses by consulting public reports in a more accessible and less technical language. (Hage 2010).

Finally, another important consequences of this changes needs to be mentioned, which is that improving control and access to information would have as a consequence an improvement of the media and the possibility to access in a deeper way the government's decisions and organization to develop a real investigative journalism, that would end up playing a main role in the discover of many corruptive scandals until today.

Although these first measures taken by the government were widely successful among the Brazilian population and gave a taste of a big change in the fight and the condemnation of corruptive practices, the government would soon faces some of the most important corruptive scandals of the Brazilian history and would hence lose the popularity gained during the elections and its first steps.

Indeed in 2004 a series of corruptive behaviour carried by actors within the government were discovered. The scandal began in 2005 as Flynn explains:

“The state-owned postal service, Correios when the magazine *Veja* revealed the presence of corruption within a state. Two men secretly filmed Mauricio Marinho, head of the Department of Contracts and Administration, receiving a ‘payment’ (propina) of R\$3 000 00 in cash. Marinho’s superior, as Director of the Postal Administration, was a former federal deputy from Bahia for the Partido Trabalhista Brasileiro (PTB), Brazilian Labour Party, and, on the accompanying tape, Marinho revealed links with the PTB, naming people involved. The most prominent of these, which immediately provoked an uproar, was Roberto Jefferson, federal deputy from Rio de Janeiro, national president of the and, as such, a prominent member of Lula’s government PTB coalition” (Flynn 2005).

With the perpetuation of the investigation on this scandal a wider corruptive system was discovered that involved illegal transfer of money from the government to buy votes in the congress (Pereira 2008) One of the most implied actor was Jefferson that “described an elaborate congressional vote-buying scheme in which officials laundered fake loans from state-owned banks through publicity agencies to then buy the votes of legislators.” (Michener and Pereira 2016)

As can be understood, the scandal had a huge impact, both on the social level as citizens were shocked by the size of the scandal and by the involvement of the actors who were fighting for a more transparent country, but also at the level of the party itself which ended up highly fragmented and was left by several members.

Despite this scandal, Lula himself remained untouched by the accusation continued ruling even though he had lost the trust that people had in its government and in its promises for the future but still managed to be re-elected on his second mandate in 2006.

Besides the contradictory approach adopted regarding the issue of corruption, another matter that was faced in a controversial way was the implementation of the citizens’ participation within the government and its influence in the decision making.

The issue of the citizens’ participation in public affairs and decision was already present in the new Constitution elaborated in 1988, thanks to that the country saw the development of participative initiatives as the Council of public policies and of national conferences dedicated to public debate. (Moroni 2005)

Lula presented his position as seeking for a more organized centralization that would leave more space to federal entities and citizens participation, through organized debates and when relevant decision making. For this reason, he aimed to institutionalize citizens’ participation. Abers et al. define this type of participation as an interaction between citizens characterized by exchange of dialogues oriented and mediated by the citizens themselves, thanks to that the three main participatory initiatives were improved by Lula’s government, these are the national conferences, the councils of public policies and the participatory budgets. (Abers et al. 2014)

If on the one side the spaces and occasions for citizens to confront themselves in the main policies of the country was encouraged and many had the chance to participate, get informed and express their belief, on the other side the representation of the society was very unequal despite Lula's will to include all parts of the population and had feeble impact on the decision making processes. (Moroni 2005)

After analysing these two aspects of Lula's government, it is clearer that contradiction within the government brought controversy on the support given by the citizens, who was more than halved during the second electoral run but also within the party and the coalition first established, seeing many important political actors resigning.

After the two mandates that Lula served as president, the PT presented for the next election in 2010 a new candidate, already known to the political sphere for managing the Energy Department in Lula's government, the new candidate was Dilma Rousseff that was then elected and took office as the new president of Brazil as per January 2011.

2.2 Dilma Rousseff's government and Lula's heritage

During Lula's last term, reference to possible future candidates for what would be the next election were frequent, when he then communicated his choice of Dilma Rousseff to represent the Worker's Party and the intention to keep on with the reforms that were put in place by Lula himself.

In this section the analysis will be focused on the shift in government from Lula to Dilma's first mandate in 2010, as well as the heritage of Lula's policies during the new government and the eventual differences that can be found between the two governments, concerning both corruption and the relation with the civil society.

It is clear that it was not an easy task to carry on Lula's heritage, his political project and vision of the country with a candidate that differentiated in several aspect from Lula. Indeed, when he announces Dilma Rousseff as the candidate of the Worker's Party and subsequently as his successor, the last months of his mandate were dedicated to smooth the transition. To do so, Lula described in many occasion the new candidate as "Mãe do povo" (Mother of the people), indeed by giving her this epithet he wanted to present her as a caring woman that by becoming president of Brazil would have cared about its people as well as the country itself. (Pires 2010)

This type of reference can be found in several speeches given by Lula in the last months of its mandate, as Teresinha Maria de Carvalho Cruz Pires (2010) points out in her analysis over the construction of the political image of Dilma Rousseff, with the final objective to understand whether Dilma was a candidate that should have represented the party or if it was just a continuation of Lula's government and the "lulismo".

The author analyses the last months of Lula's presidency and the interview he released during this time, indeed as per the announcement of Dilma as next presidential candidates his speech changed, if before Dilma was described as a rational actor and hardworking after announcing her to be his succeder in the next election, after that she

started to being define as the mother of Brazil, because of her gender, and as an actor that would take care of Brazil. In interview he released to the Brazilian newspaper Extra, he defines her as:

“The most qualified person to lead Brazil. She coordinates the main development programmes in Brazil [...] Dilma Rousseff was militant for the left in the 70s, was arrested, tortured and today she is a competent woman. She does not have shame for her past and for this I think that she is more than qualified to give continuity and improve what we are doing today.” (LULA apud KAMEL, 2009, p. 248, grifos nossos).¹

By analysing some of Lula’s speeches it is easy to understand that she was presented as the candidate that would pursue the project started by Lula aimed to the same issues such as eradication of extreme poverty and economic and social development and this is understandable by analysing the words of Dilma on the last day of her campaign where, while referring to her project for the new government she says:

“I will pursue the project of Lula, but with heart and soul of a woman. Not to repeat but progress. For me, women have a great capacity to care and at the same time to stimulate. Men can also be thoughtful, but it is different from a woman. [...]”

Do you know a mother that, if she was given money wouldn’t use it to improve the wellbeing of her children? Isn’t it hard? In Brazil one of the most important pending tasks is the restoration of the ties. Improving the economic situation is not enough, it is necessary to reinstate the family too, because this is the key to improve education and fight criminality” (Matos 2010 quoted by Pires 2010)².

What can be understood from the words of both Lula and Dilma is that with the eventual election of Dilma, that would be a re-election for the PT, the new government will continue the path already started in the two previous mandate, and supposedly improve social policies.

After the electoral campaign, Dilma Rousseff won the election and became the new president of Brazil, and the first woman president, after defeating her adversary even if with a very close result, 51% for Rousseff and 49% for Marina Silva from the Brazilian Socialist Party, PSB. (Magalhaes et al. 2010)

Until now, Dilma was only known to Brazilians because of Lula and her participation in the former governments, but when her first mandate started, she tried to gain popularity among Brazilians, mainly emphasising the fight against corruption. Indeed, she adopted a zero tolerance on corruption even inside her own cabinet,

She renewed the cabinet by not giving access to the same actors that were in Lula’s cabinet, and directly removing the ones that were suspected of bribe or other similar allegations , in this way she not only gained the nickname of ‘faxina’ (housecleaning) but

¹ Personal translation from Portuguese

² Personal translation from Portuguese

also became popular among citizens for her clean governance and her repulsion toward corruption (Balan 2014).

Thanks to that Dilma became soon more popular in Brazil, not only for her transparency as mentioned before but also for improving impunity, which is a huge issue in Brazil especially when concerning members of the government responsible for corruptive acts. In this sense, she pursued the trial for the Mensalão scandal exploded during Lula government, providing her support and affirming the change of the justice system in Brazil which showed an improvement in its action. (Balan 2014)

Moreover, Dilma also contributed to the elaboration and the improvement of several laws, aimed specifically to fight and prevent political corruption and corruption in general but also improve transparency within the government and assure more accountability and then a good relation between the governors and the citizens.

Two of these are the 'Lei da Ficha Limpa' and the 'Lei de acesso à informação' (Queiroz Barbosa 2014).

The first one to be approved was a complementary law called Lei da Ficha Limpa, in English translated as Clean Record Act, was approved in 2010 and was aimed to make ineligible any candidate who has been condemned for illicit acts, especially the ones aimed at personal enrichment that arms public properties. (Queiroz Barbosa 2014).

The second one, 'Lei de acesso à informação pública', translated literally as public access to information law', was adopted in 2011 and state that every information elaborated or collected by the government during the State administration is of public nature, if not of restricted access because of legal issues. (Jardim 2012)

This law was one of the most important since it enables citizens but also non-governmental organizations, or other member of the political sphere, to have access to almost every document collected by the government, in almost every area, including investigations and condemnations.

Although it is clear that this was a great tool to improve transparency within the government and to empower citizens by providing clear information, this law had its weaknesses. Indeed, when a citizen wants to have access to any document, he must provide an official request with his data and wait for the approval of its request (Jardim 2012)

In a country like Brazil this can become an issue since by requesting information namely it is possible to encounter unequal treatment between citizens, depending of their status (e.g. journalist, researcher, etc..) but also it can fall into slow bureaucratic organization that would result in an important delay between the time of the request and the time of the obtainment of the information.

Despite the innovations in the prevention of corruption listed above, the second term of the president Dilma Rousseff would be characterized by big turmoils in Brazil causing a deep crisis both at the political and social level. Indeed in 2013 one of the biggest corruptive scandal in Brazil was discovered, touching many actors of the government, from the workers' party but also from other parties of the same coalition, including the former president Lula.

2.3 Corruption scandal and the reaction of civil society during the crisis in 2013

During the month of June of 2013, demonstrations led by civil society started to arise in Brazil. At first, citizens started demonstrating in Porto Alegre, because of the increase of the ticket's price for public transport, after this, the demonstrations escalated quickly and became a translation for the general dissatisfaction that citizens had with the government but also within the coalition in power.

The demonstrations were soon going to spread all over the country due also to the heavy repression operated by the federal police in the first nonviolent demonstrations.

Later in June 2013, demonstrations started to arise also in São Paulo, the biggest metropolitan area of Brazil, citizens dissatisfied with the government but also organized groups and minorities started to claim for changes and joining the street demonstrations. Soon a real campaign began on the social networks inciting citizens from every layer of the population to join the demonstration, the movement became plural and revendications concerned public administration, dissatisfaction with the Workers' Party and the government, transparency and corruption. (Pinto 2017)

The first organized movement that mobilized its supporter was the Movimento Passe Livre (MPL), this movement was affirming itself as a horizontal, apolitical and non-partisan movement. (Scherer-Warren 2014)

Very soon the demonstration became wide spread leading to mass demonstrations in the country involving a big number of citizens as Purdy points out: "On June 17, 2013, more than 2 million Brazilians took to the streets in more than 400 cities in militant rallies and marches against transit fare hikes, poor-quality education and health care services, and the immense public investment in "mega-events" such as the 2014 World Cup and the 2016 Olympics" (Purdy 15:2017)

The size of the demonstrations, the reaction of the government and the extreme repression perpetuated by the federal police led to a loss of popularity not only for the Workers' Party but also for the president Dilma.

In this climate of social unrest and political crisis, an additional event was going to destabilize the already feeble equilibrium of the country, indeed in March 2014, a big investigation led by the federal police started, which was aimed to investigate and condemn illegal acts such as money laundering and appropriation of illicit funds committed by not only the biggest national firms such as Petrobras, but also a various political actors on power at the time. (Cioccaro 2015)

With the development of the investigation, the police found an extremely big net that connected numerous politicians not only from the Workers' Party but also from the other parties of the majority's coalition and the biggest Brazilian private enterprises.

The scandal had an enormous impact on the civil society that was already perturbed by the demonstrations and the lack of trust in the government, after the explosion of this

scandal in the media, Brazilian citizens felt betrayed by their governors who few years before conquered a leading position thanks to the will to eradicate this kind of behaviour from the federal government.

Moreover since the beginning of the investigation led by the federal police and the public ministry of Brazil in 2014, until 2017, more than 47 phases of investigation were developed within the operation, these phases involved private and public firms, high-ranking officials, politicians, businessmen, financial operators and drug traffickers, concerning in total more than 20 countries (Salamanca et al. 2018).

The fact that the investigation became an international matter had impact on the Brazilian economy, politic and social development, leading to an incredible crisis concerning almost every sector of the country and leading citizens to demand for the impeachment of the president Dilma. Some of the opposition parties were supporting these requests demanding the immediate impeachment of the president Dilma and the organization of new election.

After these requests, the president Dilma Rousseff will be impeached and Michel Temer, her vice president, will replace her and take her place until the organization of new elections in 2018.

During the new elections a candidate that completely breaks with the succession of the two previous mandates was presented, this candidate represented the right and extreme right wing of Brazilian political sphere, Jair Bolsonaro, an ex- military officer that thanks to the campaign made on social media and the dissatisfaction with the previous administrations performed a good election and became the new president of Brazil.

After having analysed the shifts of governments in the last decades in Brazil, the next chapter will be dedicated to understand the creation and the evolution of the non-governmental organizations focused on the fight against corruption and the role that they play in the civil society, being considered as real actors of change in the country.

Chapter 3

NGO's in São Paulo, new initiatives and project to prevent and fight corruption

As seen before, corruption is a phenomenon widespread also in nowadays societies, to eradicate this practice it is necessary to innovate institutions already existing and create new points of meeting with the citizens. This has several benefits for a country, first of all by participating people can express their opinions on what are the most important issue that the population is facing and propose ideas to solve them but also create a point of mediation between the governors and the citizens, improving transparency in the government and advocacy from the political actors. Moreover, the government that allows and regulate this kind of participative initiatives can benefit from it as well, since it can give an outcome of the population's satisfaction with the government, and allow more legitimacy to it.

Despite the participation being an useful tool to fight against corruption, countries like Brazil have focused for long time on this kind of participation and have improved it during the years. This improvement do not always resulted in the eradication or reduction of corruption but on the contrary corruptive scandals have increased until the discover of the last big corruptive scandal: the Lava Jato investigation. This investigation shocked not only Brazilian citizens but also the international sphere because of the involvement of several countries and firms as well as the enormous amount of money illegally exchanged.

Nevertheless, citizens' participation remains an important factor in the fight against corruption and also it allows citizens to have access to more information about the country. For these reasons, mainly starting from 2000, São Paulo the biggest metropole in Brazil, witnessed the proliferation of several NGOs most of them aimed to prevent and fight corruption by promoting people's engagement and by developing innovative programs that can empower citizens' action.

This chapter will be dedicated to the analysis of four different NGOs, all present in the city or the state of São Paulo, that from years develop initiatives to relate citizens' action to the fight against corruption with as final aim, to eradicate this issue from Brazilian society.

The NGOs chosen act at different levels and with different tools, but have all the same purposes in common, that is prevent corruption, improve transparency and reduce the diffusion of misinformation.

The first organization analysed acts at a local level, in the small town of Ribeirão Bonito in the state of São Paulo and aim the local population and other small organizations that act at local level. After that two other organization that act at a national level will be analysed: the organization Transparencia Brasil and the Instituto Não Aceito a Corrupção. Finally, the last organization that will be studied is the Brazilian chapter of the German

organization Transparency International, this organization has a more international impact.

The analysis will have as main tool the interviews collected in São Paulo and the handbooks provided from these organizations containing all the innovations regarding the fight against corruption developed in the last few years.

Thanks to the help provided by the presidents and the member of these associations, an analysis on the most advanced anti corruptive methods will present the evolution of the Brazilian society and the will of change coming from a bottom up approach.

3.1 Acting on the local level: Associação Amarribo Brasil

The association was founded in 2000 In the city of Ribeirão Bonito in the State of São Paulo, the city counts approximately 12.000 inhabitants and the size of the association reflects the population and counts right now 6 fixed member responsible for the different tasks of the organization.

Despite its small size, the organization Amarribo Brasil is well known in the country and regularly participates with the big projects that include the most influent NGOs in terms of corruption, this is because they organized a big operation who obtained a lot of visibility from the country. This operation started in ... and ended up with the arrest of the prefeito of Ribeirao Preto, accused of distortion of money and use of illicit funds and then condemned thanks to the materials provided by the organization. In this process citizens had an important role as well since the organization was only able to have the police investigate him only thanks to the witnesses and denounces brought by the citizens.

Starting from that moment, the association gained in visibility at national level, but was also revalued at local level thanks to its impact and his concrete actions.

The action taken by this organization can be of great impact, as the director, Lorival Verrillo, affirm himself: "to act at local level is very important because the action taken in the city reflects in the state and then at federal level, while often trying to act at the national level can be difficult because of the structural organization of Brazil." (Lorival Verillo, interviewed on 20/12/2918) The directors underlines the fact that the association is apolitical and nonpartisan, it only concerns a group of people that want to employ their time to eradicate corruption, with gaining in return nothing else than reduction on corruptive behaviour.

The association keep developing new initiatives for the coming years, in which its operation will be focused on the trainee of other small organizations with the same scope, to improve their action, their impact and especially their relationship with citizens as explained by the operation director Lizete Verillo. Lizete is responsible for this sector of the operation and new projects and she underlines that is extremely important to maintain a relation with the citizens, in this sense the association help with collection of information but also with the collection of denounces that once collected, will be

processed to the police by the association itself so that citizens can act anonymously and do not have to fear consequences.

The action of the association is especially focused on the traineeship of other small organizations that involves, as explained, direction on the organizational process, including how to formalize an NGO, how to relate with the local population but also an entire chapter dedicated to access to public information, the creation and entertainment of communicational spaces such as blogs and websites but also how to proceed when citizens want to proceed denouncing any illegal act. (Lizete Verillo interviewed on 07/01/2019).

Moreover a big space is dedicated to the difficulties that can be found when acting on a local level, since often, small city have small population and in this context it can be easy to find friends or relatives within the political council or occupying a public post, this can obviously lead to a conflict of interest between the will to denounce and the seek for justice on the one side and the impact in the community especially the people we relate to on the other.

Their action focused on the traineeship of other NGO was a project developed during the path of the association, this project is of big impact in Brazil as the president of the association state:

“in Brazil there are 5564 municipalities, 200 of which have more than 200.000 inhabitants, 300 of them have between 50 and 100 thousand inhabitants, and all the rest have less than fifty thousand inhabitants. The average then is between ten and fifteen thousand inhabitants, that is why our action is that important and of a big impact, because of the importance of having NGOs that can recognize and fight corruption even at the smallest scale, in small municipalities, including for example small villages close by Amazonia that sometimes do not even have internet access, in this way they see a solution since there is someone that listens to them and try to give them the best advice.” (Lorival Verillo, interviewed on 20/12/2018)

The NGO is very dedicated to its project, with the conviction that acting on such a small scale can slowly have an impact on the national level and bring big changes in the country. The association has also a section dedicated to the control of the good application of the law, as will be explained by Jose Chizzotti, lawyer and responsible for the legal matters of the organization. Indeed as he explains:

“in Brazil we have various laws dedicated to the fight against corruption and to the prevention of it, our laws are among the best and most developed in the world also excellent compared to the ones in Europe, despite this the problem of corruption still remains of extreme importance in Brazil, this is because there is a culture of impunity, that is to say very often, public actors and political representants who are caught acting corruptively are rarely condemned and if

they are they are release shortly after.” (Jose Chizzotti, interviewed on 07/01/2019)

The interviewed in this case refers to the laws treated before, the access to information law and the clean report one. These laws are extremely helpful but as explained citizens sometimes can have difficulties in understanding the operation of these law and what are their exact in front of the government. For this reason, the organization has published an handbook in which they not only explain the history and actions of the association, but in which it is also explained to the readers how to use these laws, to better understand them but also to know better the institutions in charge of transparency controls, denounces and investigations.

After analysing the association in all its aspects it is clearer to understand the reason of the existence of the association, aimed at improving fight and prevention of corruption in small municipalities, that constitutes the majority of the cities in Brazil, through spreading information, training other associations and participating on the big events and participatory conferences representing the fight against corruption in Brazil together with other well-known NGO acting for the same purpose.

The next section will be dedicated to the analysis of two NGOs, both acting on a larger scale, that is the national level, but with different initiatives and different impact on the society.

3.2 Acting on the national level: Transparencia Brasil and the Instituto Não Aceito a Corrupção.

Both these organizations act at a national level, by promoting transparency within the government and projects aimed to improve citizens participation and help them face corruptive behaviour and denounce it.

The first association is called Transparencia Brasil, at the beginning when it was funded in 2000 the organization was meant to represent the Brazilian chapter of the well-known organization Transparency International. A few years later, in 2006, the members of the organization had different perspective on the action of the association and decided then to split it, as explained by the executive director of the organization, Manoel Galdino.

Indeed according to him, the organization as it is now do not aim to mobilize citizens in big movements as it has happened in the last years with the big demonstrations taking place in Brazil, but on the contrary the organization is focused on spreading information and sensitise citizens to the theme of corruption. For the organization the social control lead by the citizens is one of the most powerful tool that citizens have to fight against corruption, as Galdino explains: the projects aimed to improve social control and education are at the heart of the association also concerning the access to information, the organization helps citizens who want to know more about the status of public works, to demand and access information from public institution. (M.Galdino interviewed on 05/12/2018)

The organization counts 6 members in total and do not dispose of a legal section for this reason it is not possible for them to receive reports and complaints by the citizens, they encourage citizens to act and refer directly to the public ministry.

The second organization also act on the national level but it's very different from the last one, the organization's name is Instituto Não Aceito a Corrupção and it is quite recent, since it was founded in 2015 by Roberto Livianu, that now is the president of the organization, after a campaign aimed to inform citizens of the damages that corruption can cause in the everyday life and in the life of the country in general. The big success of the campaign brought the president to start formalizing the organization in 2014 and since then he focused all the work on four main points, scientific researches, public policies, information and mobilization of the civil society.

Concerning the researches in the educational field, it is very difficult to have access to funds to realize this kind of research, especially because we focus the subject of our searches on the corruption especially the political one that involves municipalities in Brazil and their relation with the State and the control institutions existing. Despite this the institute have already realized some searches that brought as a result the condemnation from the national council of justice (R. Livianu interviewed on 12/01/2019). As Livianu and his colleague explain, they have other research project, especially focused on the municipalities, indeed most of the municipalities in Brazil, that are the most affected by corruption, do not have a control organ associated to it, the institute then wants to analyse which one are not provided by a form of control, and the events that happened in these municipalities that concerns the reproduction of corruptive behaviour.

Livianu insists on the steps that should be taken by the government especially in the legislative field since: "it is not compulsory to have a control in each of the municipalities, there is a bill to improve this situation but it does not go any further". Often, it's the mayor himself that slows down the institutionalization of a control organ within the municipality and this, according to the purpose of the organization is a primary matter.

Concerning the mobilization of the society, this is also very important for the institute, mainly because the members of the organization realize that to get results it is not sufficient to bring change in the political sphere, on the contrary these change won't have big impact if the society does not mobilize and act at the same time. To explain this Livianu gives the example of Italy, in which there has been the development of the Mani Pulite (literally clean hands) operation, very similar investigation operation concerning the political representant accused of corruptive behaviour, very similar to the Lava Jato operation, that brought to the Italian political sphere big and important changes but that very soon became of small impact since the civil society was not involved in this change. For this reason, every initiatives of the institute seek for social approval, and always ask for the support of citizens through the collect of signatures or the creation of dialogue spaces before to proceed with an action.

When touching the issue of social mobilization, it is impossible to not go back to June 2013 since a series of events took place of national impact that resulted in big changes for the country. In particular political parties lost the trust of citizens and failed in their mission, the citizens 'woke up' and decided to go to the street to demonstrate against the injustices caused by the politicians during the last years. Once this process started many social movements were in the field and tried to canalize the demonstrations by giving speech to citizens and by proposing others way of action.

These movements turned the space of demonstration very fast into political spaces and ended up proposing their candidate in the next elections, for this reason the last election in Brazil was very important, because many of the candidates were issued by the citizens and took part into the big demonstration. Despite this and the election of a candidate that completely breaks with the path of the Worker's party as well as his predecessor, there are still people at the government who are or were involved in corruptive practices in the past, but a change and an renovation of the government is undeniable, state Livianu that also stresses the fact that: the institute is non-partisan organization aimed to smartly fight corruption and wants to enlighten citizens and to empower them" (R.Livianu interviewed on 12/01/2019).

Despite being a non-partisan organization, the institute still believes on the importance of having a sane partisan system that can represent every citizen in the country, for this reason the institute, worried about the degradation of the partisan life in Brazil, developed a project called pacto de integridade, (integrity pact in English), this project promotes trustworthiness in the public decisions processes and creating a healthy environment for investment. In the same sense, also the Ficha Limpa law, sanctioned by president Lula deserve merit because it is an efficient mean to fight corruption and improve transparency despite the scepticism when approved.

Among the projects of the institute, a great importance is allowed to the development of innovative methods to create new ways to prevent and fight against corruption.

During the last years the institute has organized few competitions reaching the university students that compete among them to win the transparency prize, an idea of the organization itself to encourage young student to study deeper the phenomenon of corruption and idealize new solution to it. Juliana Radulov, a collaborator that dedicate her work to the institute is responsible for the organization of these competition and explain that:

"Through the development of this kind of project, the idea is to enhance the creativity of students that study the Brazilian legislation and find the weakest point and try to improve it". After explaining a bit the functioning of this contest she proudly talks about the results they obtained, "sometimes students may see the problem under another perspective and propose innovative and bright ideas that are then considered by many of the NGOs whose aim is to fight corruption, and sometimes this kind of participation project ends up becoming a law bill" (J. Radulov interviewed on 12/01/2019).

Besides this project, a second big initiatives has been developed by the institute, this initiatives include the publication of a complete handbook in which the organization propose forty-eight new way to fight or prevent corruption, on this initiatives, that ended up involving several organization and many citizens, the president says:

“among the various project realized, one of the biggest is the publication of the book entitled 48 visoes sobre a corrupção, that includes forty-eight different points of view through which it is possible to fight against corruption. This is a moment of change for the entire country, we must profit from this shift and try to inform citizens about what they can do to prevent this kind of behaviour but also give new ideas to prevent any kind of corruption in the future. The society now pays more attention and condemn more this behaviour that is why we truly believe that a change right now is possible” (R. Livianu interviewed on 12/01/2019).

The book cited several times during the interview is a truly revolutionary handbook that propose initiatives to fight corruption, including facing corruption in sport, relations state/corporate, the role of the media especially journalism and investigative journalism (Livianu et al. 2015).

Finally the members of the institute share other initiatives that have already been put in place, for instance they explained their initiative of last year consisting in the creation of a gameplay in which the members of the association gave lecture about corruptive behaviours and ways to prevent corruption and after make the participant pass small tests to evaluate the clarity of their explanations.

To sum up, the organization is very active, they propose several participative initiatives that include citizens' participation, that seeks for innovation within the study of the concept of corruption itself as well as stimulate citizens to recognize and fight corruption in any way.

The next and last section will be dedicated to the study of an organization very well known worldwide, that act on a more international level differentiating its action from the ones analysed before.

3.3 Acting on the international level: Transparency International in Brazil

After the first introduction of Transparency International in 2005 in São Paulo, as mentioned before, the organization was then split and the chapter of transparency international did not go any further. It's not until 2015 that the association is organized a second time and since then only the informative section has been developed, the association is bonded to the headquarters in Berlin, as they understand that Brazil is an important country and a strategic point to not have a point of representation there.

The person interviewed that was speaking for and represented the organization is Ana Luiza Aranha, director of the research centre of Transparency International Brazil. The interviewed first explains the structure of the organization that comprehends three parts: the administrative one, the centre of anticorruption analysis, that includes researches on

political corruption and the centre of anticorruption support that is being developed this year (A. Aranha, interviewed on 18/12/18).

This is not yet the complete structure of the association as she explains, since a standardized transparency international organization also includes a juridical and legal section that provides legal assistance to citizens in need.

Despite being a recent organization, this year they carried a big campaign in almost every state in Brazil, involving many other organizations as well as the citizens' participation as she explains:

“This year we developed an advocacy campaign, creating new methods against corruption, we spent more than one year developing this campaign and the idea is to change the legislation to fight against corruption especially within politics. The national campaign we carried out was aimed in particular to mobilize citizens, to make them access information and debate about it, debate about the new methods we developed. Moreover we invited several candidates, since this campaign took place right before the last elections, to participate to our campaign showing transparency and compromise themselves with the new methods we proposed” (A. Aranha, interviewed on 18/12/18).

Thanks to their initiatives and the development of this campaign, citizens could not only be more informed about the steps that were being taken to improve fight against corruption but also see and hear candidates from different parties and political ideologies facing one of the most important issue of the country and compromising themselves as real supporter of the new methods developed by the organization.

Also, several initiatives encourage the direct help of citizens indeed:

“ The organization understand the importance of the action of citizens, many times we collected signatures not to generate a law bill but only to create social pressure and as a consequence to gain national and international visibility, that for example ended up unifying 15 different states and the organization present in those state creating a big net of organizations aimed to fight corruption.” (A. Aranha interviewed on 18/12/18).

Unfortunately, as explained before, the organization does not have yet a section dedicated to the reception of complaints by the citizens, this is because the organization need the legal department that can support citizens who come to complain and help them process these complain to the right institution and work together to create and verify the follow up of these complaints as well as the action of the institution itself.

But some steps have already been taken since the organization receives many requests by citizens that want to complaint or report a corruptive behaviour often realized by a public officer, and the organization help them guiding and advising on the steps that have to be taken. In this sense, the interviewed underlines the main importance of knowing the existence and the function of the lei de acesso a informação, since it is a very powerful tool that citizens have that allows them to have control on most of the documents produced by the federal institution.

Despite the benefits that citizens can get from this law, sometimes it can be very slow to obtain an information from the moment in which one submits the request to access a document, lasting from months to years to receive an answer from the institution.

An additional problem regarding this law is that every request submitted should report all the personal data of the requester and sometimes this constitutes a problem since the requester could be a regular citizen or a journalist investigating something or ultimately a member of a municipality witnessing irregularities and seeking for truth.

For this reason Aranha share the creation of a forum in which anyone can propose to ask access to information with their data and then share the information collected with the other members in order to guarantee the safety of the requesters but also to guarantee a complete information.

Finally, the interviews focus on the campaign carried by Transparency International called 'unidos contra à corrupção':

"The campaign originally started in São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro, with the support of Transparency International and the Fundação Getulio Vargas in both cities. The project aims to get international actions, analyse what has already been done and what has to be changed. It soon became very popular and obtained the support of more than 300 organization, among them the most important Brazilian organization fighting against corruption. After that the project was open to citizens and several platforms were open in which citizens could discuss between them, exchange information and points of view. Almost one thousand citizens took part to the initiatives and started commenting super specifically on different methods proposed. This was very unusual for us since it is not very common for citizens to understand juridical language or to understand the degree of action of the new initiatives" (A. Aranha, interviewed on 18/12/18).

This part of the interview indeed shows how the situation has changed in Brazil, because of the perpetuating corruptive scandals citizens have started to get informed and their will to participate to eradicate corruption especially in politics, has increased enormously during the years until today.

Concerning the new methods proposed, they are all collected in a manual in which different organizations and citizens themselves have participated in the elaboration of this new methods and in the proposal of new ideas:

"There are different degrees of maturity in the methods proposed, some of them exist already but have been renewed and reformed, some of them are of easy application as for example integrate the anti-corruption discourse in the schools, educating students to recognize a corruptive behaviour and stop it from the beginning. Regarding this subject another non-governmental organization has collaborated with us and developed a project in the secondary schools explaining what is corruption, which behaviours can be considered as corruptive, what are the small corruptions that we face in the everyday life and then proposed creative solutions realizing videos, sketch and other material on the topic faced during the project" (A. Aranha, interviewed on 18/12/18).

The manual is a very complex project realized with the help of different figures that at the end proposes 70 new initiatives to fight corruption, most of them within the political

sphere, and more than 370 amendment propositions regarding law already existing and citizens life and participation.

At this moment Brazil is completely polarized, the theme of corruption is scaring everyone because of its big size that concerns almost everyone at the government, the project starts from the need to get closer to people and make them realize that the fight against corruption is apolitical and non-partisan phenomenon.

“The right wing of the country is angry because of the mistakes committed by the previous leftist government and seek for change denigrating human rights, and on the other side the left wing of the country is unsatisfied because of the mistakes committed by their previous representant that they have supported themselves. It is not easy to try to unify the population and stand in the middle of these two ‘factions’ and try to make them communicate between each other.” (A. Aranha interviewed on 18/12/18).

After talking about this new project developed by Transparency International a more practical view of the fight against corruption can be found, thanks especially to the continuous will to integrate citizens in every initiative and share with them information and ideas to reach the implementation of the solution proposed by both parts in order to improve the transparency within the government and institutions in the country.

Analysing four different associations and their structure and evolution during the time as well as the different actions developed since their creation helps understanding in what measure citizens participate at different levels, which differs whether if the association act on a local, national and international level. Despite the level of action, in every analysis and from each interview what strike the attention is the fact that all the initiatives of these organization are aimed to raise awareness among the population.

In most of the interviews indeed the spreading of information and the involvement of the citizens in all new projects is the most important objective, since it is thanks to this awareness of the population, their will to change not only the practice used until now in the country but also their own behaviour translating it to the entire society and truly changing it.

Conclusion

As stated at the beginning and reminded several times during the development of the research, the aim of this work was to understand the concept of corruption and its impact to the society.

On this purpose, the first chapter had presented all the concept that would have been necessary to realize this research not only thanks to the deeper knowledge that they can furnish on the matter but also and mostly because by mobilizing those concept, it has been possible to develop the theories and the hypothesis that would be necessary to the realization of this research.

Indeed, the question around which the research was developed is to understand what are the new methods developed by the non-governmental organization fighting corruption in Brazil approximately starting from 2000, and how this new measures includes citizens, assuming that the higher the participation of the citizens in the initiatives developed by these associations, the most these initiatives would result as being of big help in the fight against political corruption. To find a confirmation to this research hypothesis it was necessary to take into account variables such as access to information, improvement of the education especially in matters of corruption and the providing of assistance to citizens that want to act but need support from the organizations.

Indeed, after the analysis of the interviews realized it was possible to relate the subjects emerged to the theories presented by the authors during the years. For instance, the negative consequences associated with the perpetuation of corruptive behaviour that end up into disenchantment or big demonstrations against the government resulted as extremely pertinent in the Brazilian context. Moreover, the analysis pointed out that citizens participation and institutional innovation are two positive factor for a healthier development of the country, these concept has already emerged by the analysis of the works of Avritzer that stated the positive correlation between institutional innovation, citizens' participation and sane democracies.

Finally, the analysis of the several works studying the creation of the NGOs and the evolution of their role in the society were necessary to carry the interviews with the members of these organizations. Indeed, being the NGOs a relative new actors present in the society, it is necessary to understand their status in relation to the government and their action in the society to truly understand their final purpose.

Despite the differences that every association presents, they are all focused on the mediation of the state/ citizens relations since most of them act as being in the middle of this to parts and facilitating citizens to relate with the federal level.

Moreover, a big help is provided by the organizations in the issue of education and information, as many of the interviewed stated many of their initiatives comprehends the participation of schools and university, but also outside from the scholastic context, in which private citizens can get in touch with the associations to have more information about their rights and possibility to act.

The most useful help that came out from this study is the fact that many of these organizations have a special section dedicated to legal matters, in a country like Brazil this is very important since it can be very difficult to understand the legislation and follow up with all the modifications applied to these laws during the years, and the organizations help them by facilitating this task.

After this consideration, the fact that these organizations provide a big help to the population and by their initiatives sensitise and change the way to think and act of citizens can be considered as a true help in the fight against corruption since it is from the citizens that most of the times the real change will begin, especially in a country like Brazil where laws were elaborated and many anti-corruption organs were institutionalized but still saw small progress in the fight against corruption.

Despite the positive relation between action of non-governmental organization and improvement on the prevention and fight against corruption, this research finds several limits that need to be improved especially concerning the direct participation of citizens.

Indeed, most of the initiatives see the participation of citizens in an indirect way, passing through web portal, websites, online apps and social media, while a direct contact with the association and the organization of common space in which the organization can meet the citizens is often neglected.

On this subject, it could have been very useful to hear the voice of citizens that participated to the initiatives developed by the organization and hear from their perspective a feedback on the different initiatives to help also the organizations improving their action and their relationship with citizens.

For this reason, it is also necessary to expand the research and take into account more associations, including for example the ones issued as a consequence of social movements that have then been institutionalized and have a direct relations with the citizens.

Name of the interviewed	Position of the interviewed	Subject treated during the interview	Place and date	Duration of the interview
Manoel Galdino	Executive director of the organization Transparencia Brasil	Structure and history of the organization, functions and evolutions	São Paulo, 05/12/18	00:47:32
Ana Luisa Aranha	Director of the research centre of the organization Transparency International Brazil	Structure and history of the organization, functions, evolutions and new projects	São Paulo, 18/12/18	00:42:55
Lorival Verillo	President of the organization Amarribo Brasil	History of the organization, actions and evolution	São Paulo, 20/12/18	00:54:40
Jose Chizzotti	Vice president of the organization Amarribo Brasil	Actions and explanation of the Brazilian legislation	Ribeirão Bonito, 07/01/19	00:41:09
Lizete Verillo	Counselor of the organization Amarribo Brasil	Trainees and education on corruption and related matters	Ribeirão Bonito, 07/01/19	00:37:20
Roberto Livianu	President of the organization Instituto Nao Aceito a Corrupção	History of the organization, Brazilian legislation and involvement of citizens	São Paulo, 12/01/19	00:51:00
Juliana Radulov	Collaborator in the organization Instituto Nao Aceito a Corrupção	New projects of the organization and challenged faced	São Paulo, 12/01/19	00:24:41

Michael Freitas Mohallem	Professor of human rights, coordinator of the “centro de Justiça e sociedade (CJUS) in the Getulio Vargas association	The concept of corruption in the academic world, information on the brazilian legislation	São Paulo, 20/01/19	00:52:04
-----------------------------	---	--	------------------------	----------

References

- Abers, R., Serafim, L., & Tatagiba, L. (2014). Repertórios de interação Estado-sociedade em um Estado heterogêneo: a experiência na era Lula. *Dados-Revista de Ciências Sociais*, 57(2), 325-357
- Aktan, C. C. (2015) Political Corruption: An Introductory on Terminology and Typology, *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanity Studies*, 7(1).
- Anderson, P. (2011). O Brasil de Lula. *Novos estudos CEBRAP*, (91), 23-52.
- Amundsen, I. (1999). Political corruption: An introduction to the issues. *Working Paper - Chr. Michelsen Institute*, (7), 1-32.
- Avritzer, L. (2017). *The two faces of institutional innovation: promises and limits of democratic participation in Latin America*. Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Balán, M. (2014). Surviving Corruption in Brazil: Lula's and Dilma's Success Despite Corruption Allegations, and Its Consequences. *Journal of Politics in Latin America*, 6(3), 67-93.
- Barboza, E. Q. (2014). Corruzione E Impunità in Brasile (Corruption and Impunity in Brazil). *Nuove AutoNomie*, (3).
- Barlach, L. (2013). O jeitinho brasileiro: traço da identidade nacional?. *Revista Gestão & Políticas Públicas*, 3(2).
- Becquart-Leclerq. 1989. Paradoxes of Political Corruption: A French View. In *Political Corruption: A Handbook*, eds. Arnold J. Heidenheimer, Victor T. LeVine, and Michael Johnston. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction
- Borj B, Ippolito-O'Donnell G, Delamaza G, Mayorga F, Panfichi A y Alvarado M, (2010), Usos, abusos e desafios da sociedade civil na América Latina, *Centro para la apertura y el Desarrollo en America Latina*, Buenos Aires, 1-160
- Carr, I., & Outhwaite, O. (2011). The role of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in combating corruption: Theory and practice. *Suffolk UL Rev.*, 44, 615.
- Cioccarì, D. (2015). Operação Lava Jato: escândalo, agendamento e enquadramento. *Revista Alterjor*, 12(2), 58-78.
- Eder, C., Mochmann, I. C., & Quandt, M. (2014). *Political trust and disenchantment with politics: International perspectives*. Brill.
- Fischer, R., Ferreira, M. C., Milfont, T., & Pilati, R. (2014). Culture of corruption? The effects of priming corruption images in a high corruption context. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 45(10), 1594-1605.
- Fleischer, D. (1996). Political corruption in Brazil. *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 25(4), 297-321
- Flynn, P. (2005). Brazil and Lula, 2005: crisis, corruption and change in political perspective. *Third World Quarterly*, 26(8), 1221-1267.
- Hage, J. (2010). O governo Lula e o combate a corrupção. *Editores Fundação Perseu Abramo, São Paulo*.
- He, N. (2016). Rethinking the Causes of Corruption: Perceived Corruption, Measurement Bias, and Cultural Illusion. *Chinese Political Science Review*, 1(2), 268-302.

- Heidenheimer, A. J., & Johnston, M. (Eds.). (2011). *Political corruption: Concepts and contexts* (Vol. 1). Transaction Publishers.
- Holloway, R. (1997). NGOs losing the moral high ground: corruption and misrepresentation. *Discourse*, 1(2), 9-12.
- Jardim, J. M. (2013). A Lei de Acesso à Informação Pública: dimensões político-informacionais.
- Kaldor, M. (2003). Civil society and accountability. *Journal of Human Development*, 4(1), 5-27.
- Kitsing, M. (2003). Behind corruption: from NGOs to the civil society. *EUMAP, Is Civil Society a Cause or Cure for Corruption in Central*.
- Loureiro, M. R., Abrucio, F. L., Olivieri, C., & Teixeira, M. A. C. (2012). Do controle interno ao controle social: a múltipla atuação da CGU na democracia brasileira. *Cadernos Gestão Pública e Cidadania*, 17(60).
- Magalhães, A. M., Silva, M. E. A. D., & Dias, F. D. M. (2015). Eleição de Dilma ou segunda reeleição de Lula? Uma análise espacial do pleito de 2010. *Opinião Pública*, 21(3), 535-573.
- Markoff, J. (2015). *Waves of democracy: Social movements and political change*. Routledge.
- Meier, K. J., & Holbrook, T. M. (1992). "I Seen My Opportunities and I Took'Em:" Political Corruption in the American States. *The Journal of Politics*, 54(1), 135-155.
- Michener, G., & Pereira, C. (2016). A Great Leap Forward for Democracy and the Rule of Law? Brazil's Mensalao Trial. *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 48(3), 477-507.
- Moroni, J. A. (2005). O direito à participação no Governo Lula. *Saúde em debate*, 29(71), 284-304.
- Nye, J. S. (1967). Corruption and Political Development: A Cost-Benefit Analysis. *Source: The American Political Science Review*, 61(2), 417-427.
- Pinto, C. R. J. (2017). A trajetória discursiva das manifestações de rua no Brasil (2013-2015). *Lua Nova*, (100), 119-155.
- Pires, T. M. D. C. C. (2011). A construção da imagem política de Dilma Rousseff como mãe do povo brasileiro.
- Purdy, S. (2017). Brazil's June days of 2013: mass protest, class, and the left. *Latin American Perspectives*, 0094582X17699905.
- Richardson, L. (2012). POLITICAL CORRUPTION AND IT'S EFFECTS ON CIVIC INVOLVEMENT.
- Salamanca, L. J. G., Salcedo-Albarán, E., & Fernández, G. M. (2018). Macroestructuras de corrupción: el caso lava jato. *Rivista di Studi e Ricerche sulla criminalità organizzata*, 4(1), 99-131.
- Scherer-Warren, I. (2014). Manifestações de rua no Brasil 2013: encontros e desencontros na política. *Caderno CRH*, 27(71), 417-429.
- Teixeira, E. C. (2006). As dimensões da participação cidadã. *Caderno CRH*, 10(26).

- Van Deth, J. W. (2001, April). Studying political participation: Towards a theory of everything. In *joint sessions of workshops of the European consortium for political research, Grenoble* (pp. 6-11).
- Von Alemann, U. (2004). The unknown depths of political theory: The case for a multidimensional concept of corruption. In *Law & Social Change*, 42. Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Wengert, N. (1976). Citizen participation: practice in search of a theory. *Nat. Resources J.*, 16, 23.