Leiden University

A New Understanding of Submission and Women's Place in the Salvation Narrative: Female Religious Experiences in Lucy Hutchinson's *Order and Disorder* & Aemilia Lanyer's *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*

Machteld van Dongen

S1528092

MA Thesis English Literature and Culture

1st Reader: Lotte Fikkers

2nd Reader: Nadine Akkerman

1 July 2020

Introduction

In the second half of the twentieth century, the growth of feminism sparked interest in women's writing and its history. Thanks to the rise of feminism, Early Modern works of women like Aemilia Lanyer's *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*(1611) and Lucy Hutchinson's *Order and Disorder* (1679) resurfaced and regained significance. After C.A. Moore had assumed that the author of *Order and Disorder* was a man and A.L. Rowse had wrongfully presented Lanyer as Shakespeare's dark lady, a new trend of feminist literary research emerged in the field of Early Modern writing. Pioneering scholars like Barbara Lewalski and Elaine Beilin focused in particular on Lanyer and Hutchinson's proto-feminist stances. Although they acknowledged the religious influences of Hutchinson and Lanyer's work, they favoured researching feminism by concentrating on the text's potential to reveal "Early Modern female consciousness" (Trill 68). This feminist approach and interest in women' writing shaped the analysis of Hutchinson and Lanyer's text into a decidedly feminist study. As a result, the topic of proto-feminism in this field of Early Modern female literary research started to overshadow the religious content. When searching for extensive religious research on the works of these women, it appears that the present literary research mostly focuses on the feminist part of their religious writings. Scholars like Suzanne Trill and Michael Schoenfeldt concluded that the more substantial part of research examines and defends the 'female' in feminine religious experience (Trill 68). They also argue that religion in feminine religious experience is just as important (Trill 73). By merely acknowledging the religious content but not examining it, Schoenfeldt argues that "religion[,] the period's most intense efforts to legitimate social and sexual distinctions" (209), is left out. The research on the subject of female religious experience, therefore, needs to find its balance between the proto-feminist stance and its religious context.

Accordingly, the works of women like Lanyer and Hutchinson ask for additional research focussing on the religious aspects of the texts themselves. For, "the current focus on

feminism limits both Lanyer's [and Hutchinson's] text and our understanding of it" (Trill 68). As such, this thesis is a revisitation and exploration of the religious experiences of Aemilia Lanyer in her work *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* and Lucy Hutchinson in her work *Order and Disorder* and the religious experiences they ascribe to their female characters, which have been underexposed by modern literary criticism so far.

The introductory chapter of this thesis displays how Hutchinson's and Lanyer's religious experiences were coloured by the changing religious landscape of the seventeenth century. From the moment the Reformation set foot on English soil, it caused many heated political and religious conflicts. Because the religious affiliations of the successive Catholic and Protestant kings and queens continually changed, the English people needed to reassess their commitment towards the monarchy as well as their personal stances towards Christianity. Moreover, they had to decide whether they adhered to Catholic or Protestant doctrines and beliefs. From a religious point of view, the Reformation in England also changed Christianity itself from a mainly collective religion to personalised religious experiences. This change opened doors to non-discriminatory individual religious understandings. Like men, women now had the same religious responsibilities to search for God; they had to ask for their own personal forgiveness, and they were entitled to their own personal relationship with Christ. Accordingly, they had to reshape their relationship with God and acquire a new understanding of religious submission to their husbands. For, women could no longer rely on the religious practices of their husband, which ensured that their religious experiences could change.

The second and third chapter address how Hutchinson and Lanyer insert their own personal religious views and experiences in their works *Order and Disorder* and *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* and highlight their personal relationships with religion, the Reformation and Christ. Hutchinson is adamant to acquire more knowledge of God throughout her life, and she sees it as her calling from God to educate other women on how to experience God. She explains

the difference between religious subordination to God and subjection to men and shows through her personal experiences with guilt, grace and gratitude how women can accept their subordination to Christ. Furthermore, Hutchinson urges her audience to find their purpose and God-given talents to advance God's Kingdom here on earth. Lanyer's religious experiences, however, have been framed by her feminist convictions, financial struggles and social ambitions. At the same time, when looking at her religious message to her devotees, Lanyer conveys the importance of equality and harmony amidst religious quarrels. Lanyer herself experienced the unequally distributed guilt on women imposed by a society focussing on Eve's mistake in the garden. She sees it as her calling to bring a new understanding of submission and to accommodate the distribution of guilt, for it were men and not women who have condemned and crucified their Savior. Therefore, she displays the need for God's grace for both men and women, which is readily available to all. To encourage other women in their quest for a personal relationship with God, Lanyer uses several passages of the Bible that focus on the importance of women and their purpose within the redemption narrative of Christ.

Finally, this thesis seeks to underpin the critical notion that every religious experience is unique and should be considered as such. Bernard Spilka, whose field of expertise is in the psychology of religion, examines individual religious experiences in content as well as in language. Spilka highlights the uniqueness of the personal, religious experience in content (328), and at the same time he asserts that "persons possessing a religious language will use it to describe various experiences (...) based on the language with which they are familiar" (Spilka 328). Hence, people with similar backgrounds and religious upbringing will describe their religious experiences with commensurate terminology (328). Therefore, although the religious experiences of Hutchinson and Lanyer are comparable in their use of religious vocabulary, their religious experiences cannot be generalised. As such, this thesis ultimately demonstrates that by writing and publishing their personal religious experiences, Lucy Hutchinson and

Aemilia Lanyer seek to guide their female readers to a new understanding of submission leading to a personal responsibility for their soul's salvation. Both Hutchinson and Lanyer present the way to salvation according the Reformed notions of guilt, grace, and gratitude.

Chapter 1 Reformation, Refutation, and Research

The historical context of *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* and *Order and Disorder* is quite a turbulent one. The late sixteenth and seventeenth century are times of religious and political unrest. On the one hand, politics influenced religion. On the other hand, religion influenced politics. In addition, both religion and politics influenced the English people. Therefore, this chapter examines how both politics and the changed religious landscape influenced and inspired Lanyer and Hutchinson to write their works. First, this chapter demonstrates the effects of the Reformation in England on the monarchy, which results in un unstable religious scene influencing the religious identity of the public. Secondly, this chapter displays the new, revolutionary view of the Reformation on women and their religious experience as the religious landscape changes from a collective Christianity to an individual religious experience. Thirdly, this chapter displays the changing perspective of contemporary male authors on individual religious experience and their ensuing struggles with writing about the female character and their religious experience. Lastly, I will briefly look at the existing research on Lanyer's and Hutchinson's work in order to frame my own research.

1.1 Reformation England: A Historical Context

England in the era of Lanyer and Hutchinson had just undergone several religious and political changes. In times of the English Reformation, the births, throne ascensions and deaths of new Kings and Queens in the English royal household invoked many riots, schisms and conspiracies concerning the religious debate. Indeed, in these days, politics and religious change were very closely connected. Even today, many scholars still struggle with the debate whether the English Reformation is to be "understood as a transformation imposed from above, by authority, or as a movement conveyed upwards by popular pressure for religious emancipation" (Collinson 249-250).

King Henry VIII was often seen as the instigator of the English Reformation; however, "Henry's break with Rome was not theological but personal and political" (Lindberg 301). His sudden change from a devout Catholic defender of the faith to a Reformed Supreme Head of Church was determined by Henry's conflict with the pope on the personal matters of divorce as well as Henry's unease with the authority of church over state. Due to these personal conflicts with the pope, who would not approve of Henry's divorce from Catharine of Aragorn for the preeminent reason of not giving him a son, Henry felt the need to break with Rome. His consequent excommunication by the pope inspired Henry to introduce himself as "the only Supreme Head on earth of the Church of England" (Bray 114) thus positing "the authority of state of church" (Lindberg 302) and countering the authority of the Roman Church.

Although Henry's conversion to the Anglican church was a mere political move as he denounced the pope but not his Catholic tendencies, Henry's actions "had encouraged growth of a powerful evangelical party" (Pettegree 253) within the government. This resulted in a quick move of the evangelical, or Reformed party, to establish their supremacy upon Henry's death which was necessitated by the youth of Henry's son, the new King Edward VI (253). He came to the throne at the age of nine, but because he was always sickly, his Reformed advisors reigned in his place. Under Edward, or more accurately his advisors (Lindberg 306), Protestantism took firm root on the English soil.

However, all this work was undone when Edward died and the Catholic Mary, Henry's first-born daughter from his marriage with Catherine of Aragon, ascended the throne. This is precisely what the Protestant Reformers fear for, and they tried "to exclude Mary from succession on the grounds that she was illegitimate as the daughter of Catharine" (Lindberg 308). Instead of Mary, "they propose[d] Lady Jane Grey, the Protestant grandniece of Henry VIII" (308). The English loyalty to the Tudor throne proved stronger. Mary's Catholic views were implemented, and her battle against the Protestant movement of her father and half-

brother prevailed: "English Protestantism was reduced once again to a persecuted remnant" (Pettegree 253). However, "ironically, Mary's overwhelming concern for the Roman Catholic faith served to strengthen the Protestant Cause" (308). She married Philip of Spain, "identifying Catholicism to that unpopular foreign power" (308) and by persecuting Protestant leaders, she created an army of martyrs. These measures reached their climax in the public burning of Cranmer, a popular, beloved leader of the English Reformation as Archbishop of Canterbury. As a result, many if not most of the Protestant nobility fled England and "this period of exile gave rise to a theologically literate and highly motivated Fifth Column that was merely awaiting an opportunity to put their ideas into practice" (A. McGrath 190). This group of protestants had the time to formulate their ideas during their exile.

This opportunity put their ideas into practice arose quite soon, when upon Mary's death, Elizabeth, the daughter of Henry and the protestant Anne Boleyn, was tasked to reign the country. Although quite cautious about the distribution of her own personal religious ideologies and convictions, quite soon Elizabeth put in place "measures to establish a Settlement of Religion which would eventually lead to the creation of a more explicitly Protestant State Church" (A. McGrath 190). It is under her reign that the ideas of Luther and Calvin, Knox and Zwingli were distributed quite expeditiously. Moreover, "by 1560 more than half of the nobility was Protestant and with the nobility much of the nation" (Collinson 256). Due to the effective evangelising of the Protestants, many Englishmen converted to Protestantism.

These continuously changing political circumstances and the personal religious convictions of these kings and queens have influenced authors like John Milton, John Bunyan, Aemilia Lanyer, and Lucy Hutchinson to establish their own convictions towards religion and religious experience. Before the upcoming of the Reformation, the medieval Church aspired a Christian society which was regulated and systematised. Whereas now, in times of the Reformation, every individual is urged to pick a side. The people need to rethink their personal

stances towards Christianity, Catholicism and Reformation. Lindberg notices that "the people of the sixteenth century found it exceedingly difficult to live with alternate and competing commitments" (352). He notes that this "problem of pluralism - religious, social, and cultural," (352) introduced by the Reformation confuses the common Early Modern man and woman.

1.2 Reformation England: a Personalised Christianity and its View on Women

The alternating and competing commitments between Catholicism and devout Protestantism confuses the common Englishman and women in every aspect of their lives. Politically, their devotion to the King or Queen sometimes no longer aligned their religious convictions – they could be persecuted for being a Protestant by the first Queen and exiled for being a Catholic by the next Queen. For women, especially, these changes had substantial ramifications, as they caused their place within the family and society to become more autonomous. First, under the rule of the Catholic Church, women were not heard nor seen as equal companions. They were commonly described as "deceptive, irrational, stupid, and lazy. They were a cross to be borne, a devil on a man's back" (Crapuchettes 91). Furthermore, women were perceived as sub-human: "In all these characterisations of a woman's nature it was her patent lack of the male's ability to reason which made her in some sense sub-human when contrasted with her male counterpart" (Charlton). Charlton goes on to illustrate the almost animal-like need of men to reproduce and their sole occupation with it concerning their wives: "I desire me to have a woman to be my wife that shall have no more tongue to answer me to a question than yea or nay; or to have more wit than to distinguish her husband's bed from another man's" (Charlton). As a result, women more or less acquiesced in their inferior place.

Subsequent, the Reformation shed new light on the place of women in religion and society. The teachings of the Reformation underlined the need for an individual, personal relationship with God. Therefore, religious experience, in theory, became non-discriminatory

and open to everyone, including women. Indeed, the Reformation emphasised the need for a personal conviction towards Christianity in its doctrines rather than religion being a "transformation imposed from above, by authority" (Collinson 249). The common Englishman could no longer rely on class or money to obtain a place in purgatory or heaven; instead, within this new Reformed doctrine, a personal relationship with God was the sole ground for salvation. Lindberg summarises this Reformed theology in terms of the watchwords sola fide, sola gratia, sola scriptura: "justification by grace alone through faith alone" (Lindberg 67). He argues that this "Reformation doctrine of justification broke the mould of medieval ecclesiology and theology" (67) and is "almost without parallel in the history of Christendom" (Brecht 132). Crapuchettes, a modern-day Reformed woman, influencer and author herself, aptly clarifies these watchwords of the Reformed Theology into modern-day English for her followers as follows:

> Foundational for all of them was the authority of the Bible alone instead of the pope, and justification by faith, the doctrine that salvation was through the cross alone and not through good works (...). For centuries, the Catholic Church had been sending people to nuns, monks, saints, and Mary to intercede for them with Jesus. Suddenly, they were told they could pray directly to the Father and that He would delight in them. What's more, because they were saved through Christ they could live righteously (...) because they were done through Christ[.] (Crapuchettes 88-89)

This switch from collective Christianity to a personal relationship with God would be a steppingstone for every man and woman believing in God. This personal relationship with God would mean a personal religious experience for both men and women. The Reformation created

a new space for women in which they were autonomous; they were entitled to their own personal religious experiences in their relationship with God.

Thus, this personal view on salvation, in theory, means that religious experience is non-discriminatory. Like men, women needed to experience this "justification by grace alone through faith alone" as well. John Calvin (1509-1564), one of the first and most influential reformers, argues for certain equality in gender regarding the need for salvation because of mankind's sinful state in his commentary on Genesis 1 and 1 Corinthians 11. In his commentary on Genesis 1, Calvin states the equality of men and women "For both sexes were created in the image of God" (Calvin 7). In his commentary on 1 Corinthians 11, Calvin notes that the apostle Paul elaborates on this equality by stating that man is created in the image of God and that the woman is created in the image of man. Consecutively, Paul, it seems, would argue for a female likeness of God in the second degree. However, Calvin comments on this notion that Paul differentiates between, on the one hand, a spiritual likeness of God which is undoubtedly equal, and, on the other hand, a "conjugal order" which requires authority and is therefore not equal. Calvin stated that "Paul exhorts women no less than men to be formed anew, according to that image. The image, however, of which he is now speaking, relates to the order of marriage, and hence it belongs to the present life and is not connected with conscience" (7). Thomson paraphrases this idea of Calvin and exemplifies: "on the one hand, there are 'spiritual and eternal concerns' and, on the other hand, there are the concerns of the 'present life' or of the political and domestic order'" (132). End the paragraph with a concluding sentence.

In light of Calvin's explanation, this spiritual equality should influence the political and domestic order as such that both husband and wife are submitted to one another in an equal manner. Just like Calvin, Luther elaborates on this spiritual equality of women as well as on their equality within the domestic order. For, Luther "sought to redefine what his society thought appropriate for male and female behaviour" (Lindberg 361). According to Luther, the

problem lies in the "culture's gender presupposition concerning males" (Lindberg 361). Together with his fellow Lutherans, Luther is concerned with redefining "their culture's understanding of male gender from uncontrollable impulse to social responsibility, including efforts to curtail spousal abuse" (361). The role of the woman is redefined to be an equal completion and counterpart of the man:

> Thus we are: I a man, you a woman, just as God made us, to be honoured and respected as Godly work. Man has no right to despise or scoff at woman's body or character, nor has woman any right to denigrate man. Rather each should honor the appearance and body of the other as a divine good work, an achievement that is pleasing even to God Himself[.] (Brundage 560)

In conclusion, both men and women experienced difficulty adjusting to the changing religious landscape. However, when the Reformation takes firm root on the English soil, the place of women in society changes quite drastically in particular. Instead of an intermediary like the church or their husband, women are now called to search for their own individual, personal religious experience with Christ. They are called to revise their views on submission to Christ and have to carry personal responsibility for the salvation of their souls. As a result, women start to write about their personal religious experiences, and it becomes a topic of conversation among women in the seventeenth-century society of England.

1.3 Reformation England: Contemporary Male Authors on Female Religious Experience

It is important to note that this change of religiopolitical situation means that the role and nature of women and their relationship with men is reassessed; however, such a change takes time

which we see mirrored in the literature. Female authors still had to compete against the perceptions of male authors on religious experience, and male authors struggled to portray female religious experiences. The character Eve in John Milton in his work *Paradise Lost* (1667) is a good example of the struggle of women against male presumptions. *Paradise Lost* depicts Milton's struggle to portray Eve as representative of women within the religious debate. On the one hand, he needs to depict Eve as a fully-fledged, three-dimensional character with sufficient lines to engage the audience. On the other hand, Milton also wants to define her role as a woman in line with his own biblical perceptions. He describes the relationship between Adam and Eve as different based on their gender despite both bearing a "god-like" resemblance: "though both not equal, as their sex not equal seemed" (Milton 4.296). Adam was created for knowledge and Eve for beauty: "for contemplation he and valor formed, / for softness she and sweet attractive grace" (4. 297-298). Milton drives this distinction further and underlines the contemporary debate of the early Reformation whether man and woman are equal in their relationship to God. He argues that Adam has a more intellectual and vivid relationship with God, whereas Eve would experience God through the senses or dreams. This way, it seems that Adam has a closer connection to God, more on the same level, than Eve has. In line with Reformed theology, Milton does acknowledge the blame of the fall to be on both Adam and Eve, however, the distinction between gender and a relationship with God and religious experience remains present.

John Bunyan, a contemporary of Milton and another representative of Reformed theology, depicts a more significant change regarding a personalised female religious experience. In Bunyan's work *The Pilgrim's Progress* (1678) both part I and II, he strives to represent that personalised religious experience for both man and woman. In part I, Bunyan describes Christian's journey to salvation. In part II, he portrays Christiana's road to Christ. In comparison to Milton, Bunyan creates a greater podium and focal point for women in the later

Reformation. On the one hand, Christiana's status as the feminine heroine in The Pilgrim's Progress II is "authorised by Pauline injunctions to be chaste, silent, and obedient (English Standard Version 1 Timothy 2:11, Titus 2:5) and operates within the assumptions that underlie the defining phrase 'the weaker vessel' (ESV 1 Peter 3:7)" (Swaim 391). On the other hand, Bunyan introduces a broader definition of a woman's place within these assumptions and biblical grounds. He supplements the Pauline, new testament views of women with the old testament, more positive views. Bunyan uses characters as Gaius, the innkeeper to underline the balance between the new and the old testament and display a more significant role of women within the kingdom of God:

> I will now speak on behalf of Women, to take away their Reproach. For as Death and Curse came into the world by a Woman, so also did Life and Health; God sent forth his Son, made of a Woman. (...) I read not that ever any man did give unto Christ so much as one Groat, but the women followed him, and ministered to him of their Substance. 'Twas a Woman that washed his Feet with Tears and a Woman that anointed his Body to the Burial. They were women that wept when he was going to the cross; and Women that followed him from the Cross, and that sat by his Sepulcher when he was buried. They were Women that was first with him at his Resurrection morn, and Women that brought Tidings first to his Disciples that he was risen from the Dead[.] (Bunyan 261)

Bunyan makes Gaius stress the importance of Women in God's kingdom in such a verbose mode to underline that "Women therefore are highly favoured, and show by these things that

they are sharers with us in the Grace of Life" (Bunyan 261). Through Gaius' eyes, the reader sees women as equal in the narrative of redemption.

Because of the change of religiopolitical situation in England and the consequent reassessment of the role and nature of women and their relationship with men, male authors have struggled to portray the female religious experience. Bunyan paints a slightly brighter picture of women in his works and Milton tries to encompass the role of a woman in all its beauty in *Paradise Lost*. Neither of them treat women as men's spiritual equals, and as a result female authors still struggle to defeat presumptions. Indeed, such a change takes time which we see mirrored in the literature.

1.4 Research on (Reformed) Religion in Lucy Hutchinson's *Order and Disorder* and Aemilia Lanyer's *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*

Given the canonical status of male authors like Bunyan and Milton, the male perspective has thus far been the dominant narrative on the religious experience of women. Understandably then, most early feminist critics were concerned with "challenging the terms in which Lanyer [and, Hutchinson to a degree] had been read" (Trill 68) and underlined these women's text's "perceived feminism" (68). Trill notices that "while commenting on the text's religious subject matter, the critical consensus has so far suggested that Lanyer [in this case] appropriated religious discourses in order to disseminate her proto-feminist ideas" (68). However, feminist critics have become "increasingly sensitive to differences between women" (68) which ties in with the Reformed view on a personalised relationship with God. Trill goes on to summarise the research of scholars who have shown interest in the religion of works like Lanyer's and Hutchinson's and quotes scholars like Lewalski. For instance, Lewalski notes that it would be unwise to see religion as "a thin veneer for a subversive feminist statement" (Of God and Good Women 207) and opts for fusing the feminist and the religious (Of God and Good Women

207). However, Trill discloses that Lewalski's "primary focus remained on female relations both within the text and outside it" (Trill 69).

To conclude, there has been a lot of debate on how feminist, or Protestant for that instance, Lanyer was. The focus, however, has mostly been on the terminology of feminism and Protestantism rather than the actual text and textual references itself. Trill, therefore, opts: "what difference does it make if we suspend "disbelief" and read *Salve Deus* as a profession of faith rather than feminist propaganda?" (Trill 72). In "The Gender of Religious Devotion: Aemilia Lanyer and John Donne", Michael Schoenfeldt does this by placing Lanyer, a woman, in comparison to Donne, a man, and focussing mainly on the devotional element in both texts. In doing so, Schoenfeldt views the text for one of its religious subjects, devotion, which in both the male and female case "transgress the precepts of the society it inhabits" (Schoenfeldt 212) and focuses on the individual experience.

However, in almost all cases, religion is seen as a means to an end - the means to pursue female equality or to express feminist convictions rather than a pure profession of faith (Trill 75). Taking this hypothesis further, the question arises whether works like Milton should then also be seen as mere political work, its references to religion merely being a means to convey his political convictions. Or whether Donne's sincerity in his religious works as a Protestant all of sudden should be doubted because of his dubious past. Evidently, these questions are overstated, but in this light, with suspended disbelief, I want to examine the professions of faith by Aemilia Lanyer and Lucy Hutchinson. Therefore, in the next two chapters, I will focus on the religious references, devotions, and the personal religious experiences of Lucy Hutchinson in *Order and Disorder* and Aemilia Lanyer in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* in order to portray and compare their unique, female religious experiences as Early Modern women.

Chapter 2 Lucy Hutchinson and *Order and Disorder*

In her work *Order and Disorder,* Lucy Hutchinson writes to inspire her female readers to submit to God and His calling which, according to her, is the ultimate, transcendent purpose of humankind here on earth. She writes about her personal religious experience and the religious experience of her characters as an example of an actively practiced faith and submission to a personal relationship with God. In doing so, Hutchinson displays her readiness for personal religious subordination as a woman as "her religious affiliations dictate[s] wifely inferiority and submission" (Shook 180). This readiness for subordination proves to be quite difficult for feminist critics in their research. However, Hutchinson's work shows that she guides her readers to a new interpretation of submission. She differentiates between submission to God and His calling and to the contemporary understanding and interpretation of submission to men. This chapter displays how Hutchinson guides her female readers to a total religious submission to Christ which leads them to a new understanding of their own responsibility regarding their soul's salvation.

According to Hutchinson, submission to Christ and His salvation is the Biblical way for women to dispose of the guilt and insecurity: "The third vertue (...) is submission to the will of God (...) which is chiefely exercisd in a patient quieting of the heart under all administrations of Providence" (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 129). Hutchinson uses Eve as her prime example to show her readers how they can rid themselves from guilt, like Eve, and experience pure grace and joy again. For, Hutchinson argues, humankind was created for this prelapsarian order. However, Hutchinson observes that women have lost their personal religious experience because of male dominance in religion (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 6) which results in a lack of responsibility regarding their salvation. In *Order and Disorder*, Hutchinson explains that a doctrine of submission to men should not be superordinate to anyone's personal relationship with God and their calling. For, like men, women are created with a purpose and zeal to work

in His Kingdom. Furthermore, in *Order and Disorder*, she conveys that women are not just "the kink in the works of a patrilineal descent system" (Schwartz 84), but are created in equal perfection in the prelapsarian world. However, due to the fall, a new hierarchy has been put into place. Hutchinson underlines that in this postlapsarian world, subordination and purpose for women do not rule each other out (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 129). She argues that women should submit themselves to Christ and the authority placed above them. his authority, either the government or their husbands, cannot obstruct women from pursuing their purpose here on earth.

Hutchinson's view on women and their purpose within Christianity still is quite progressive in the seventeenth century day and age of patriarchy. As shown in the first chapter of this thesis, despite the more progressive stance of the Reformation regarding women and their individual relationship with Christ, some authors still see Christianity first and foremost as a male-dominated narrative from which they derive authority. For example, Milton's work, as shown in the first chapter, differentiates between male and female religious experience and authority. Hutchinson's work is in that sense not only a reaction towards Milton's work and ideals but furthermore "it is a sophisticated political rethinking of tenets of patriarchal theory" in Early Modern England (Miller 342). Summarising, in her work *Order and Disorder*, Hutchinson motivates women to accept their subordination to Christ's plan which, according to her, means a readiness to work in God's Kingdom here on earth. She activates women to focus on their identity in Christ rather than focussing on their submission to their husbands.
Therefore, this chapter will display Hutchinson's personal religious experience from a young age in greater detail through her autobiography, which has influenced her work *Order and Disorder*. She gives examples from her own faith and religious experience to encourage others to do better: "my ignorance in principles was a greate occasion of my wavering, and therefore (...) lay a foundation of sound knowledge, for the building of a holy practise" (6). Secondly,

this chapter portrays how Hutchinson embraces religious subordination in order to activate other women to pursue their purpose in Christ and how she chooses to omit the Pauline instruction of women's submission to their husbands. Thirdly, this chapter portrays Hutchinson's Eve and her religious experience in her prelapsarian state, which is peaceful and orderly. Hutchinson portrays this religious experience as an inspiration and goal for her readers. Fourthly, this chapter shows Hutchinson's Eve and her postlapsarian religious experience as an example for women's place in redemption. Hutchinson portrays Eve's religious experience of guilt, grace, and gratitude as an example to her readers in *Order and Disorder*. Eve's religious experiences prove to be very similar to Hutchinson's experiences on guilt, grace and gratitude in *On the Principles of the Christian Religion, Addressed to her Daughter; and On Theology.*

2.1 Lucy Hutchinson's Early Life and Religious Inspiration

Lucy Hutchinson, nee Apsley, born in January 1620 and deceased in October 1681, is known as a prolific Early Modern female writer. She has an impressive list of works on her credit including: a bibliography for her husband called *Memoirs of the Life of Colonel Hutchinson*, published posthumously in 1806, in which she includes a small autobiography; 23 poems in the manuscript 'Elegies'; the epic *Order and Disorder* which arguably makes her the first female epic writer; and she wrote *On the Principles of Religion ... and on Theology* as a letter to her daughter. Many of her writings are influenced by the politics of her husband and her own religious convictions. In her autobiography, Hutchinson describes the influence of her parents' upbringing and the inspiration of a Reformed England which have all formed Lucy to write *Order and Disorder* as a call upon women to leave their passivity and actively pursue their goal of working in the Kingdom of God here on earth. Norbrook underlines the link between *the Memoirs* containing Lucy's autobiography and *Order and Disorder* when he states that "*The Memoirs* (...) are of interest not only in their own right but as the ideological

underpinnings of her *Order and Disorder*" (Norbrook “Introduction” 141). In addition, *On the Principles of Religion and On Theology* provide great insight into Hutchinson's personal beliefs, experiences and ideologies as well. As she describes in *the Memoirs*, Hutchinson sees it as her duty to use these talents of writing to glorify God amongst all people and educate them accordingly:

> Herein I meete with so many speciall indulgences as require a distinct consideration, they being all of them to be regarded as talents intrusted to my emproovement for God's glory. The parents by whom I received my life, the places where I began and continued it, the time when I was brought forth to be a wittnesse of God's wonderfull workings in the earth, the rank that was given me in my generation, and the advantages I receiv'd in my person, each of them carries allong with it many mercies which are above my utterance, and as they give me infinite cause of glorifying God's goodnesse, so I cannot reflect on them without deepe humiliation for the small emproovement I have made of so rich a stock; which that I may yet by God's grace better employ. (Hutchinson *Memoirs* 2)

Hutchinson is inspired by her mother to convey her personal religious experience in order to motivate others to search for God.

In showing her personal religious experience and the influence it has on her daily life, Hutchinson hopes to inspire others to follow Christ. Hutchinson has seen this herself in the life of her parents. She writes of herself as greatly influenced by her upbringing and religious education of her parents who were "both of them pious and vertuous in their owne conversation,

and carefull instructors of my youth, not only by precept but example" (*Memoirs* 2). She voices her parents' life as an example to her and her children to bring faith into practice. Hutchinson brings up that her parents display the epitome of a good union: "never did any two better agree in magnanimity and bounty then he and my mother, who seem'd to be acted by the same soule" (14). Their marriage and upbringing of their children have shown Hutchinson the importance of active faith as they both taught their children, both boys and girls, to practise what they preach. As an example, Hutchinson mentions her mother who had freedom and "libertie", unlike many other contemporary women, in receiving and managing her own money: "a noble allowance for 300l. a yeare for her owne private expense" (14) and she "lay'd most of it out in pious and charitable uses" (14). Hutchinson's mother used her money in order to further experiments and knowledge to "helpe such poore people as were not able to seeke to phisitians" (14). With the knowledge and skills she gained, she took care of many ill prisoners and comforted them. She took care of and provided these prisoners with "all necessaries" (14). Hutchinson underlines that her mother "was not only to these, but to all the other prisoners that came into the Tower, as a mother" (14).

Hutchinson notes that her mother was very concerned with teaching all her children about this active faith and work in the Kingdom of God which furthered her personal faith: "The care of the worship and service of God, both in her soule and her house, and the education of her children, was her principall care" (Hutchinson *Memoirs* 15). Hutchinson's mother educated her children in the doctrines of Reformation from a young age and was a living example of what she preached. Hutchinson comments that "her mother was a constant frequenter of weekeday lectures, and a greate lover and encourager of good ministers, and most dilligent in her private reading and devotions" (15). Her mothers' good practice comes from a foundation of knowledge provided by the Church as well as private reading. She is

Hutchinson's role model in terms of submission and responsibility for personal religious experience and education, and Hutchinson wants to pass this on to the next generation.

2.2 Lucy Hutchinson's Ambiguous Submission

In the image of her parents, Hutchinson feels the obligation to continue the education of the puritan gospel to her daughter and her readers in *Order and Disorder*, and to exemplify how she practices her faith accordingly with servitude and humility: "It pleased God that thro' the good instructions of my mother (...) I was convinced that the knowledge of God was the most excellent study, and accordingly applied myselfe to it, and to practise as I was taught" (*Memoirs* 17). When looking at her life, Lucy Hutchinson was indeed a "woman who exemplified the humility and affection that defined the Puritan ideal of a devoted wife" (Portfield 201). However, this is precisely where feminist critics nowadays encounter difficulties: Hutchinson seems to promote, or at least endorse female submission and inferiority, yet at the same time she takes on a rather prominent position for herself by entering her texts into the public sphere. Hutchinson seems to ignore the call to be submissive as she seems to teach and assume authority over men in conflict with her puritan beliefs. For instance, her religious writings *On the Principles of Religion and On Theology* could be seen as focussing on a broader public, thus assuming authority over men as they do teach about religious and political convictions. Furthermore, her work *Order and Disorder*, Miller remarks, is much more than just a personal or private comment in relation to Genesis and Milton's *Paradise Lost*, "it is a sophisticated political rethinking of tenets of patriarchal theory" (Miller 342). The question rises whether Hutchinson contradicts herself as she seems to teach submissiveness and at the same undermines subordination to the patriarchy and Pauline injunctions.

Hutchinson answers this question in the letter, *On the Principles of Religion*, to her daughter where she notices that the notion of submission through time has acquired another,

rather unbiblical interpretation. Submissiveness had been equalled to the silencing of women which, according to Lanyer, is not what the Bible argues. Firstly, when reading the Bible, the reader should focus on the Christ's example of subordination to God in His suffering on Mount Olive just before His crucifixion: "Let the cup passe from me (...) uttered with submission as appears in the next words: Neverthelesse, not my will but thy will be done" (128). Hutchinson shows that Christ humbled himself under His almost unbearable calling to carry the sins of the world and to save humanity. In this image, secondly, Chirst's followers are called to live accordingly which means a Christian needs to assume similar submissiveness towards God: "The third vertue (...) is submission to the will of God (...) which is chiefely exercisd in a patient quieting of the heart under all administrations of Providence" (*On the Principles* 129)". This submission to God, "if it were as it ought to be, would cutt of all discontent att aniething that befalls us, this (...) made Paul learne content in every condition" (*On the Principles* 129). As a result of submissiveness to God in the example of Christ, His followers will submit themselves to each other in order to serve, help and uplift each other. Hutchinson argues that all strive for the same goal and when all our wills are "made subiect to Gods, there remains no smart in aniething that we suffer (...) the more patient our sufferance is, the more glorious our crowne will be" (131). Submission, therefore, in Christ's image, does not come from a place of assumed authority based on gender, but rather it comes from a place of humility and servitude.

In writing *Order and Disorder*, Hutchinson shows that submissiveness does not equal silencing of the female gender, for this interpretation of submissiveness has had the result of keeping women from practising the faith. Instead, Hutchinson shows that *Order and Disorder* is written to serve her readers by educating them on their place and purpose within the Kingdom of God. Therefore, although seemingly contrasting but not mutually exclusive, Hutchinson's *Order and Disorder* assumes authority to serve and motivate women to accept their

subordination to Christ and His plan, but also work or use their God-given talents to advance God's Kingdom here on earth.

2.3 Lucy Hutchinson's *Order and Disorder*: Prelapsarian Equality and Postlapsarian Experience

The first five cantos of Lucy Hutchinson's biblical epic *Order and Disorder*: or, the World Made and Undone's were published anonymously in 1679. Norbrook describes that the poem was ascribed to Sir Allan Apsley, Lucy Hutchinson's brother by the Antiquarian Anthony Wood (Norbrook xii). However, a "large amount of internal and external evidence" invalidates this theory. For, *Order and Disorder*'s "political and theological outlook matches Hutchinson's precisely" (xiii) and "is strikingly close in theme and style" (xiii) to Hutchinson's 'Elegy'. Although C.A. Moore, in his essay 'Miltoniana' also assumes male authorship of the still unattributed *Order and Disorder* in 1927, as he is still clouded by his assumptions that only men produce this work. And therefore, quite ironically, his views on the text are still very much concerned with the religious content. Precisely because Moore does not know that the author is female, Moore reads the text purely for its religious context, and he does not yet focus on questions of female authority or proto-feminist stances. He states that on the religious matter he has "no doubt [that] many Puritans agreed heartily with the author of *Order and Disorder* in exalting orthodoxy above the art of poetry" (Moore 324). In reaction to Milton "Order and Disorder forces the biblical story back into the narrow channel of literalism which Milton had allowed it to overflow" (323) for "he appears to have revised Milton quite independently of all direct inspiration except from his Bible" (323) and "while removing Milton's mythology, he also eradicated all theological heresies" (323). In line with Moore's findings, Elizabeth Scott-Baumann comments on the content of *Order and Disorder* that Hutchinson underlines the importance of 'Sola Scriptura' as "she refers only to Biblical passages" (185). In addition, Scott

notes that Hutchinson, quite possibly, in rebuke to Milton's vivid imagination concerning the Genesis-story comments: "circumstances that we cannot know [...] we will not dare t' invent" (Order and Disorder 4.43-45). Hutchinson chooses to stay close to the Bible, and she does not leave much room for the imagination or interpretation as she continuously refers to Bible verses as the source of her text.

Throughout *Order and Disorder*, Hutchinson's describes her personal religious experience as well as the religious experiences of her characters as an example to her readers. She distinct between the prelapsarian and postlapsarian state of Adam and Eve. They were created in equality, harmony and order. However, due to the fall, Adam and Eve need to find their way back to God and each other. Hutchinson uses Eve to exemplify the journey back to God and her husband in which she goes through the acknowledgement of guilt for the fall, the experience of receiving grace through the promise of Christ's salvation, and the experiencing of gratitude. Through this journey, Hutchinson takes the readers by the hand and motivates them to search for God and their purpose within God's kingdom.

In the first canto of *Order and Disorder*, Hutchinson introduces her epic with the invocation to the Muse to describe her total dependency in her literal and spiritual works upon God and His Word. In doing so, Hutchinson communicates to the reader that it does not matter whether the author is male or female because the words she uses to write her work are not merely her own words, but they are taken from the Bible. Therefore, the reader is to expect an invocation true to Hutchinson's Reformed conviction on the doctrine of 'Sola Scriptura': she states that the "revelation God gives of himself and his operations in his Word" (Order and Disorder 3) compared to the "defective traditions" of "human wit and wisdom" and their "corrupted nature" brings her to "never to search after any knowledge of him and his productions, but what he himself hath given forth" (3). Her invocation, therefore, will be true to God's "substantial Word" (1.99) in which she chooses to follow Du Barta's Muse, which

"keepes the middle Region" (De Saluste DWW 1.1.136). In contrast to Milton's Muse who aims to soar "with no middle flight" (Milton 1.14), Hutchinson wants to bring Gods Word to attention.

In the beginning of her book, through the invocation of her Muse, Hutchinson sets the tone for her personal religious experiences as she shares her inadequacy and need of salvation and perfection as the prime example of postlapsarian disorder. She starts her work by describing her incompetence to accurately display God's "wisdom, goodness, might, and glory" (Order and Disorder 1.19). She requests enlightenment through her Muse, the Trinity - "three distinctly thus in one divine" (1.103) and asks the Trinity to "give utterance and music to my voice" (1.36). Hutchinson ascribes her need for enlightenment to "the world's first Chaos in my [her] mind" (1.24). As the world's first Chaos was brought to order by the Holy Spirit, only through help from this "Power by whom the world was made" (1.27) both her "soul in her imperfect strugglings [will be] aid[ed]" (1.28) and her work will be perfected:

> Herein the Father is the principal,
> Whose sacred counsels are th'original
> Of every act; producèd by the Son
> By' the Spirit wrought up to perfection[.] (1. 109-1.112)

Hutchinson draws upon the deeper meaning of this invocation. She remarks that her work, her soul, and her mind are fallible and in need of freeing and perfecting. Her soul and mind like all "Mankind (...) rebels" (1.11) and needs to be steered away from chaos and disorder. She underlines that all Mankind needs to be guided towards "universal harmony" (1.7), "joint obedience" (1.8) and "Performing that to which they were designed / With ready inclination" (1.9-10). Out of the same "Power by whom the world was made" she expects her salvation: "and cannot be from the dark prison freed / Except that Power by whom the world was made" (1.26-27). With this invocation, Hutchinson shows that she knows of her own vulnerability and

inadequacy. Yet, at the same time, she gives herself a prominent place as she knows that God will perfect her weaknesses: "As he in whom the rest perfection had" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 3.27). In her vocation, Hutchinson displays vulnerability and great strength as she knows that her Muse is the Almighty God that saves humanity.

Hutchinson summarises her invocation by setting boundaries to the imagination which presumably is in reference to Milton's embellished version of the Genesis-narrative:

> let's waive Platonic dreams
> Of worlds made in Idea, fitter themes
> For poets' fancies than the reverent view
> Of contemplation fixed on what is true
> And only certain, kept upon record
> In the Creator's own revealèd Word
> Which, when it taught us how our world was made
> Wrapped up th'invisible in mystic shade (1.173-180)

Hutchinson does not ask her Muse for supernatural knowledge on what she does not know in the Genesis narrative. Instead, she wants her narrative to be founded upon the Bible alone. She notes that "What dark Eternity hath kept concealed / From mortals' apprehensions / (...) It were presumptuous folly to inquire. / Let not my thoughts beyond their bounds aspire" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 1.38-42). It is essential to her that the Bible and God's draw attention rather than her imagination. Moore comments that "no doubt many Puritans agreed heartily with the author of *Order and Disorder* in exalting orthodoxy above the Art of Poetry" (Moore 323) and "it forces the biblical story back into the narrow channel of Literalism which Milton had allowed it to overflow" (Moore 323). By setting these boundaries for the imagination and

rendering herself fallible but wholly dependent upon God's Power and Word, she shows the reader that she is concerned with conveying the Biblical narrative, which she sees as the truth.

After the first two cantos of the introduction of her 'Heav'nly Muse' and the beginning of creation, Hutchinson introduces the creation of humankind as the perfect example of prelapsarian peace and order.

> Now was the glorious universe complete
> And everything in beauteous order set,
> When God, about to make the king of all,
> Did in himself a sacred council call (...)
> Thus was the noblest creature the last made,
> As he in whom the rest perfection had[.] (3.1-4, 26-27)

This "noblest creature (...) in whom the rest perfection had" (3.26-27) is distinctly different from the rest of creation: "Whereas all other creatures clothèd were / (...) Only a fair smooth skin o'er man was drawn" (3.39-40) and "as other have a down-bent countenance, / He only doth his head to heaven advance" (3.45-46). Hutchinson describes that in this noblest creature "both parts of the great world were joined, / Earth in his members, Heaven in his mind" (3.27-28) and is uniquely created with a voice (3.53), expressions and emotions "of the mind" (3.55), "Fancy and Invention" (3.66), "new Imagination" (3.68) and "Majesty and Grace" (3.69). Here, Hutchinson mostly focusses on the qualities and character traits of humankind in general.

Only in line 131, Hutchinson discloses the name of this creature as Adam and not until line 238 Hutchinson specifies why God created Adam first as "the only one of his whole kind" (Order and Disorder 3.232) waiting to be perfected by Eve. Line 238 is also the place where Hutchinson introduces the notion of a created couple. Because the gender of Adam is still

insignificant in the first 238 lines, the appearance of Adam which she describes so vividly can be read as the portrait of humankind as a species in general. In contrast to Milton, who mainly focuses on describing Eve's appearance as she was created for beauty and just shortly addresses Adam's power, authority and intellect represented in his appearance, Hutchinson chooses not to describe Eve's appearance in the first place. Scott-Bauman notes: "it is significant that she [Hutchinson] does not apply the same language to Eve. She lavishes the sensuous Petrarchan imagery of secular love poetry on the male not female figure" (180). Furthermore, according to Scott-Baumann, because Hutchinson's Eve is not described physically, she is more closely connected to the spiritual:

> She is even more connected to God through the shared nakedness of her body and His Word. The repetition of "naked beauty" "naked too" and "nakedness" connects Eve as humankind with God (...) Hutchinson refers to biblical passages whose language encourages a reading of Eve as a positive symbol of the true Church rather than focusing on her own sin, 'all things naked and open unto his eyes'" [.] (182)

Because Hutchinson does not expound upon Eve's appearance, we assume that Eve, created to be an equal to Adam, outwardly looks similar to him.

God creates Eve to be Adam's "associate" (3.303) as there is no equal in all other creatures and the angels in terms of appearance and character: "'tis only like desires like things unite: / in union likeness only feeds delight" (3.263-264). Norbrook adds that Hutchinson's account of mankind's creation, therefore, should be read in light of the treatise to her daughter where Hutchinson "deploys aspects of each version"(Norbook *Order and Disorder* xlv) of the

Genesis-narrative. The tensions between the two emphases can be found within Genesis 1.27 in the shift from 'him' to 'them'" (Norbook *Order and Disorder* xlv). In the treatise to her daughter, Hutchinson "inverts the order of the shift from singular to plural (...) and implies that 'him' from now on applies to both sexes (as was indeed the case in Hebrew: Adam was the common name of man & woman)" (xlv) which might also apply to *Order and Disorder*. In this treatise, Hutchinson writes to her daughter that "God created man, male and female, in his own image and likenesse (...)" (On the principle 28). Hutchinson focusses on the creation of both Adam and Eve and stresses their equal perfection for they are both created in God's image and they complement one another.

Although Hutchinson is "committed to following the details of the Genesis narrative" (Norbrook *Order and Disorder* xlv), her prelapsarian Adam and Eve, against expectations, do not "support the idea of women's inferiority and subordination" (Sommerville 25). Their creation signals equality, order and harmony. Although the conventional reading of the second account of creation in Genesis invites readers to interpret inferiority because of the order of creation, Hutchinson disputes this notion. Rather than focussing on just one account of the creation in Genesis 2, she vies for a more nuanced and ordered representation of both biblical accounts of creation. Moon underlines Hutchinson's point that in showing us two different accounts "God wants to make an emphatic point about his creation" (Moon 245). For, Hutchinson argues, God created order out of chaos and harmony where there was lack thereof. Unlike the rest of his creation, He made Adam experience the lack of an equal companion to underline that only in order and harmony his creation is perfect: "God could at first have made a human pair, / But it was his will to let man see / The need and sweetness of society" (Order and Disorder 3.238-240). Moon paraphrases this as follows:

> In this manner, Hutchinson places man's need for an equal mate, for woman, at the core of God's creative order. Moreover, this union is

> seen as a union in both physical and spiritual senses: "Man like himself needs an associate, / Who doth both soul and sense participate" (3.303-4). Such an interpretation gives the creation of Eve new importance and dignity. No other creature's existence seems so imperative to perfect God's creation, and therefore without Eve God's creation would not be "good" [.] (Moon 246-247)

Therefore, Hutchinson also introduces the first account of creation in Genesis 1 and underlines that here God does not make a distinction between the sexes.

> Then God said, "Let us make man in our image, after our likeness. And let them have dominion over the fish of the sea and over the birds of the heavens and over the livestock and over all the earth and over every creeping thing that creeps on the earth". So God created man in his own image, in the image of God he created him; male and female he created them. And God blessed them. And God said to them, "Be fruitful and multiply and fill the earth and subdue it, and have dominion over the fish of the sea and over the birds of the heavens and over every living thing that moves on the earth". (ESV Genesis 1.26-28)

The Biblical narrative of Genesis 1 includes both male and female, and God addresses both of them in his speech which signals equality.

Therefore, Hutchinson chooses to interpret the creation story in its essence of perfection - male and female relations were made in perfect and equal harmony as displayed in Genesis 1:26-28. Indeed, both male and female are addressed by God, and both receive dominion over

the earth. She incorporates this in her own work when she modifies the second account of creation, as described in Genesis 2, and adds the notion of equality, as described in Genesis 1: "When marriage male and female doth combine, / Children in one flesh shall two parents join" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 3.415-16). Likewise, in *Order and Disorder*, God addresses both Adam and Eve and gives them both dominion over His Creation. Furthermore, Hutchinson omits the supposed hierarchy of man and woman in her prelapsarian world, but she underlines the importance of an equal, complementary union in Adam's speech: "thou art my better self, my flesh, my bone. We, late of one made two, again in one / Shall reunite, and with the frequent birth / Of our joint issue, people the vast earth" (3. 405-408). Throughout his speech, Adam does not cite or hint to "any of Paul's censures of women", but rather "he re-emphasises the union of man and woman" (Norbrook xlvii). Here Hutchinson stresses that women are not created with a sense of subservience but are created in an equal union.

2.4 Lucy Hutchinson and Postlapsarion Eve: Religious Experience compared

However, the fall changes the ground principles of the relationship between Adam and Eve. Adam and Eve experience new feelings of guilt, betrayal and knowledge of what is evil. It is quite interesting for us as readers to examine how Hutchison shapes Eve in these struggles and her religious experience and how Eve transitions from a prelapsarian order to a postlapsarian disorder. Because Hutchinson herself lives in the same postlapsarian disorder and struggles with the same feelings of guilt and betrayal, it is interesting to compare postlapsarian Eve's religious experiences to Hutchinson's own religious experiences. In Hutchinson's work *On the Principles of the Christian Religion*, she communicates to her female readers the importance of knowledge of God, His Work, and their postlapsarian state.

In *On the Principles of Religion,* Hutchinson introduces the Heidelberg Catechism as an aid to elaborate on the importance of knowledge. Although every religious experience is

different, the Heidelberg Catechism acknowledges a similarity in the mutual experiences of guilt, grace, and gratitude: "firste, howe great my sinne and wretchednesse is. The seconde, by what meanes I may bee deliuered from my sinne. The thirde is, what thanks I owe unto my Lorde God for my deliuerance" (The Catechisme 2). Hutchinson weaves in the notions of guilt over her sin and wretchedness, grace and salvation from her sin and gratitude for her salvation in *Order and Disorder*. The experiences described in *Order and Disorder* and *On the Principles of the Christian Religion* are founded upon her personal religious experiences. By displaying her personal experiences with guilt, grace and gratitude, Hutchinson leads her female reader to a personal responsibility for their soul's salvation.

2.4.1 A Religious Experience of Guilt

Eve firstly starts to experience guilt when she realises her sin severed the bonds with God and changed her relationship with Adam. The experience of guilt stems from Eve's pride, aspiring to be like God with the illusion that her newly acquired knowledge of good and evil will bring her more happiness. However, from the moment of the fall, she realises what she has done and what her mistakes will cost her and Adam: Eve no longer experiences the love and presence of God like she used to feel it - instead of love: "so were our parents filled with guilt and fear" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 4.329-330). In their fall, the order is disrupted and "their late sweet calm did now forever cease (...) / Within, without, disordered in the storm, / The colour fades and tremblings change the form / (...) No pleasant smiles, appear in their sad face, / they see themselves fooled, cheated, and betrayed" (4.231-245). Even when they look at each other, their guilt is visible as they are ashamed for each other's nakedness. Their relationship has changed and is no longer pure and glorious (4.247).

Like Eve, Hutchinson also experiences guilt for her sin. However, Hutchinson states that only through acquiring knowledge of who God is, she knows that she has sinned and needs

salvation. She states that the more knowledge she has of God, the more His light clarifies the weaknesses in herself (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 3). God gives this knowledge through reading the Bible. She wants to "lay a foundation of sound knowledge, for the building of a holy practise" (6). She explains that this knowledge is the force behind reconciliation: "That faith is a firme and certeine knowledge of the good will of God towards us, which, founded upon the promise of free grace in Christ, is revealed to our understandings, and seald in our hearts by the Holy Spirit" (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 61). To know of Christ and His Sacrifice is what will save humankind: "But the principall act of saving faith is receiving and resting upon Christ alone for iustification, sanctification, and eternall life, by vertue of the covenant of grace" (81). In contrast with Milton's statement that only men attain religious experience through knowledge, Hutchinson hereby proves the contrary. She states that in this light of Godly knowledge, by studying the Bible, she sees her "folly, sin, iniquity, impurity; his power discovers our weaknesse, his fullnesse our emptinesse and vanity and nothingnesse, which wee neither discerne nor believe, till wee come to see him" (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 3). It is as if God opened her eyes to what is lacking in her life and what she needs in order to bring harmony in the chaos of her sin. Hutchinson takes her reader by the hand and urges them to seek God like she did, in order to ask Him for His saving grace.

2.4.2 A Religious Experience of Grace

Secondly, following guilt, Eve experiences grace. The result of Adam and Eve's sin should have been wrath, terror and eternal damnation. However, what was expected did not come: "But God then in his rich grace did delay / These dismal terrors till the last great day" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 4. 323-324). Hutchinson continues to describe the struggle within the soul between knowledge and emotions. On the one hand, Adam and Eve felt the urge to flee from wrath as they now knew about their sins and consequent punishment. Indeed,

if we only read the lines of Adam and Eve's perception after the fall, the situation seems hopeless: "the poor mortals from his anger fled / (...) the sense of wrath from the feared power drives / (...) Souls flying God into despair next fall / Thence into hate, till black Hell close up all" (4.326-332). However, Adam and Eve's perspective is interlaced with God's perception and gifts of delay, grace, love and mercy. Therefore, on the other hand, God pulls them back to His presence where they experience that "Mercy still doth fainting souls revive / And in its kind embraces keeps alive / A gentler fire than what it lately felt" (4.345-348). Surmounting all knowledge and expectations, the soul finds that "sweet Mercy meet them on the way" (4.333). Hutchinson continues: "Thus had not God come in, mankind had died / Without repair; yet came he first to chide" (4.379-380).

In her *On the Principles of the Christian Religion*, Hutchinson knows no bound in mentioning the subject of grace - she points to it 70 times. This underlines the importance of the matter to Hutchinson herself. She points out what effect this grace has in her daily life - it is the source of her humility and subservience to others. In *Order and Disorder*, she paints the picture of Christ who is prepared to die for his Bride, the image of the Church, in order to save her. Indeed, Hutchinson points out that in His life and death, Christ fulfilled what none of us could do: live a completely sinless, holy life in full obedience to God. By doing so, Christ restored order and regained paradise; He earned eternal life for the world: "I and my death, I and my life are thine" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 3.478). She mentions that God gave his beloved Son so that the world would once again know love and light; so that in Him "Henceforth no longer two but one we are. / Thou dost my merit, life, grace, glory share: / As my victorious triumphs are all thine, / So are thy injuries and sufferings all mine, / Which I for thee will vanquish as my own, / and give thee rest in the celestial throne" (3. 486-492). In this example and image of Christ's humility and sacrifice, Hutchinson also wants to be obedient and humble towards fellow contemporaries and her husband. She even extends the metaphor

to all humankind throughout time: humility is "the puritan ideal of selfhood" (Porterfield 202). Hutchinson shows her readers that grace changes the perspective and understanding of subservience. Women are not called to subservience because of their gender, but rather every Christian is called to subservience as a result of received grace. Because she has been pardoned for her sin, she wants to spread the light of a serving Christ to others, by serving others herself.

2.4.3 A Religious Experience of Gratitude

Lastly, Hutchinson describes how Eve experiences gratitude. At first glance, Eve's experience of gratitude is not as evident as her experience of grace. However, throughout the lines, Hutchinson depicts a growing joy and fondness of Eve's soul in this saving grace. She explains how sinners in the restored relationship with God once again can rely on His trusting and giving cares. To have known the terror of living without God urges Adam and Eve to seek a life in pursuance of full obedience. Although Adam and Eve know that they will fail again, the knowledge that God promises to return restores their trust: "Then Love that was forsaking them before / Returns with a more flaming strong desire of the sweet joys from which it did retire / (...) While thus this love with holy ardour burns, / The bleeding sinner to his God returns" (Hutchinson *Order and Disorder* 4. 336-342). Hutchinson here underlines that a return to God means a return to joy and order.

Hutchinson explains to her daughter in *On the Principles* of the Christian Religion that she answers God daily grace with gratitude, joy and thankfulness. She highlights that through God's saving grace, they both should approach God with with "ioy and thankfullness for all, even the least manifestations of his good pleasure towards us" (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 24). Indeed, God has given them many blessings, but above all they "blesse God for the clearer Gospell light that now wee have" (64). She underlines that women should "receive it [the gospel of grace] with ioy and yield obedience to it as children of light, to whom as the Lord hath given

more clearnesse, so he expects more spiritualitie, and more thankfullnesse" (Hutchinson *On the Principles* 54). This thankfulness results in a new, active spiritual life which focusses on God and the reader's purpose in His kingdom.

In response to Christ's grace, Christians are called "to love him with all our heart, with all our soule, with all our strength, and all our mind" (93). Hutchinson explains: "To love him with all our minds, includes the duty of studijing the knowledge of him" (93) and "To love God with all our strengths includes (…) [a] Zeale for his glory [which] is a fervency in the love of God, and a holy fiercenesse in his service" (95). In this image, women are called to the same duties as men. Like men, women are called to, therefore, take responsibility for their own salvation and spiritual lives through submission to God and their duty in His kingdom.

2.5 Chapter Conclusion

For Hutchinson, religious experience is first and foremost a personal conviction of submission to an individual relationship with God - which results in glorification of Jesus and serving Him together with other Christians. She urges women to search for this individual relationship. In *On the Principles* of the Christian Religion, Hutchinson uses her own life and religious experience to exemplify the benefits of such a life. Hutchinson's early life and upbringing of her parents has shed new light on the interpretation of submission. Hutchinson shows that her notion of Biblical submission does not equal the silencing of the female gender and does not come from authority. Instead, submission comes from a place of humility and servitude towards God and others. Following her mother's image, Hutchinson responds to her calling to submit to God and to actively practise her faith. In writing *Order and Disorder*, she aims to motivate her children and her readers to do like her. She puts her own religious experience, as well as the religious experiences of her characters as an example on how she acquired this new understanding of submission which opened her eyes to the responsibility she has for her own

soul's salvation. She shows other women that she could no longer rely on the Church or on her husband's religious experiences but that everyone is called to know God.

By splitting her work into a prelapsarian order and postlapsarian disorder, Hutchinson shows the reader that they, together with Adam and Eve, were intentionally created for a sinless life filled with harmony, peace, equality. However, the fall and disobedience to God disconnected Adam and Eve from this order, and as a result, they had to find their way back to God. Hutchinson displays that Eve experienced the stages of guilt, grace and gratitude to regain her peace and order with God. She explains that through these experiences, like Eve and herself, her female reader can also find their way back this peace and order. As a result, through the individual relationship with God, women will be freed from their guilt by the grace of Jesus, and they will live a life of thankfulness, gratitude and joy as a result. As such, this chapter demonstrates that by writing and publishing her personal religious experiences, Lucy Hutchinson seeks to guide her female readers to a new understanding of submission leading to personal responsibility for their soul's salvation through experiences of guilt, grace, and gratitude.

Chapter 3 Aemilia Lanyer and *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*

Aemilia Lanyer's personal religious experience in her work *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* (1611) and the religious experience of her characters display another unique perspective and outlook on the Reformation and its politics. *Salve Deus*, published in the same year as the authorised King James Version of the Bible, compiles of a series of poems which contain a curious mix of proto-feminist and religious stances. Both Hutchinson and Lanyer rewrite the Biblical narrative with an emphasis on the female presence; however, Lanyer seems to go one step further with her work. In *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* Lanyer seems to mould Reformed theology into an apology for the entire female gender. Whereas Hutchinson is concerned with finding a new understanding of submission fitting her religious conviction, Lanyer addresses the submission by focussing the attention on equality in religious experience between the sexes. According to Lanyer, the present understanding of submission keeps her female readers away from finding their place within the salvation narrative. Therefore, by publishing her personal experiences, Lanyer takes a fierce stance against imposed patriarchy as it was often argued in the name of the Bible. In addition, in its socio-historical context, Lanyer's work also stands out as her book is uniquely dedicated and addressed to only women: "The most complete works contain nine dedicatory poems, a prose dedication to the Countess of Cumberland, and a prose epistle 'To the Virtuous reader'" (Lewalski "Rewriting Patriarchy" 98). Although patronage was not unheard of at the time, Lanyer choice of addressing only women patrons is unprecedented.

Comparing Hutchinson's ideas on submission to Lanyer's ideas on equality, both authors want to ultimately motivate their readers to take on responsibility for their personal religious welfare. Not unlike Hutchinson, Lanyer too presents a new understanding of submission through which she aims to bring equality and peace amidst the religious quarrels. From what is known about her personal life, Lanyer experienced a certain inferiority in terms of both social rank and gender roles and in her work *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* Lanyer

determines to try and rectify the existing patriarchal society founded upon supposed Biblical grounds. According to Lanyer, the Bible calls for "harmony and equality to men" (Barnstone 149), and she provides the examples of the fall and Christ's suffering as an ultimate case to make her point. Ultimately, in Lanyer's work and personal religious experience, Christ and His Bride are the "model for harmonious exchange between women and men" (151). This is what the entire Church, all Christians, should strive for: a common subjection to God and each other.

Therefore, in Lanyer's case, “faith does not preclude feminism; rather, her feminism is facilitated by her faith” (Trill 76). In Lanyer's work, more so than Hutchinson's, scholars like Suzanne Trill and Michael Schoenfeldt have remarked that research nowadays mainly focusses on a feminist interpretation: "the influence of both feminism and new historicism [which] has, unfortunately, had the result of distracting attention from religion" (Trill 73). And although "the divine is acknowledged as the source of Lanyer's literary authority, the religious dimensions of her text remain relatively unexamined" (Trill 72). Schoenfeldt marks this preference of feminism over religious discourse as an unfortunate development, for "religion is at once the site of the period's most intense efforts to legitimate social and sexual distinctions" (Schoenfeldt 209). Therefore religious discourse should preferably be the starting point of research rather than an afterthought or "cover for her subversive critique of patriarchy" (Trill 72; L. McGrath 228). For, "the vision of the common subjection of all humans before God could begin to undo the very hierarchies of class and gender that appeared to be sanctioned by the conventionally masculine and monarchical God" (Schoenfeldt 209). Concerning Lanyer, Schoenfeldt states that she uses "the language of religious devotion to demarcate territory dividing the inwardness that devotion demands from the conduct that Renaissance Christianity enjoins" (209). A balanced reading of Lanyer's *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*, therefore, is called for in order to depict Lanyer's religious motivations to write her text accurately.

This chapter displays how, firstly, Lanyer's early life, her financial problems, social ambitions motivated her to search for patronage in order to write *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*. Secondly, her Judeo-Christian influences have formed her unique view on submission as presented in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* in which she advocates for equality based on the Bible. Thirdly, in her dedicatory poems, Lanyer speaks from her own personal religious experience - she addresses her patrons and underlines the importance of inner beauty and superiority through Christ rather than outward beauty and earthly riches. She compares her patrons to Christ's Bride and urges them to adorn their soul, their inner beauty which will bring them heavenly richness. Lastly, Lanyer displays her religious experience and conviction through the depiction of Christ in *Christ's Passion* and the character Eve in *Eve's Apologie*. Like Hutchinson's Eve in Order and Disorder, Lanyer's Eve encounters similar religious experiences of guilt, grace, and gratitude. As such, this chapter demonstrates that by writing and publishing her personal religious experiences, Aemilia Lanyer seeks to guide her female readers to a new understanding of common subjection to God and religious equality between the sexes leading to a personal responsibility for their soul's salvation. Lanyer presents the way to salvation in line with the Reformed notions of guilt, grace, and gratitude.

3.1 Aemilia Lanyer - Patrons & Ambitions

Aemilia Lanyer, née Bassano (b.1569-d.1645), is known to us as "an intelligent, attractive, strong-minded woman whose life on the fringes of Elizabethan and Jacobean court society gave her some opportunity (...) but whose ambitions outstripped her social class and financial resources" (Woods, "Introduction" xv). Woods here perfectly summarises Lanyer's commitment throughout her challenging life as a poet and writer. Regarding her career as a writer, Lanyer may have even been "the first Englishwoman to publish a full edition of poems

to claim for herself a professional poetic voice" (Woods, "Introduction" xv). She rises above her social ranks and requests patronage from prominent protestant women.

From an early age, Lanyer "had access to aristocratic circles" (Black 529) and throughout her life, she aspired an aristocratic lifestyle. Lanyer "was probably educated along with the young ladies of the court, likely in classical literature and rhetoric" (Black 529) and "at some point she was educated in the household of Susan Bertie, the Dowager Duchess of Kent" (Woods, "Aemilia Lanyer, *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*" 125). Her parents passed away when Lanyer was 18 and from that point on she needed to provide for herself and is left with "a small living consistent with her parents' lives among the minor gentry" (125). Unhappy with her current financial situation, Lanyer knew to work her way up the social ladder. She used her father's connections at court to "elevate her fortune" (Woods "Aemilia Lanyer, *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*" 125). According to the account of astrologer Simon Forman, here, she met Lord Chamberlain Henry Carey (Sage et al. 377) to whom she became intimately acquainted in the future - Aemilia became Carey's mistress.

Lanyer comments on her ameliorated financial situation in one of her conversations with Simon Foreman stating that "he [Henry Carey] was generous to her" (Stevenson and Davidson 101). She mentions that she "was maintained in great pomp, had forty pounds a year of her own, and was wealthy in money and jewels" (101). However, her luck turns when Lanyer becomes "pregnant by him in 1592 she (...) [is] hastily married to Captain Alfonso Lanyer" and loses her financial stability (Shattock 253). In order to live up to Aemilia's former status and grant her the title of Lady, Alfonso tries to achieve greater financial stability through the attempt at soldiering and thus hopes to be knighted. However, to Aemilia's greatest disappointment, this attempt rendered unsuccessful (126). In 1604, the couple's income stabilised somewhat after he applied for a "patent from King James, granting him the income from weighing hay and grain" (Stevenson and Davidson 101). Nevertheless, despite Alfonso's

attempts, the couple struggles to maintain financial stability which "led Lanyer to publish her one volume of poems, *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* ('Hail God King of the Jews') in 1611" (Stevenson and Davidson 101). In order to make money from her writing, Lanyer needed to procure patronage.

Indeed, because Lanyer's ambitions outstripped her social class and financial resources" ("Introduction" xv), Lanyer needed to procure patronage in order to publish her work. Procuring patronage was the norm for authors at the time if they wanted some kind of financial security. Both men and women needed connections in order to publish their works and the people "who were not aristocratic (...) who did not carry the fragile carapace of privilege and tradition, the entry intro print forum required a different series of negotiations" (360). Furthermore, Lanyer's work stands out as there is "no comparable work of sustained and exclusive dedications" ("Introduction" xxxii) as the prefatory poems which Lanyer fully dedicated to "women patrons" ("Introduction" xxxii). Coiro notes that "for any woman, the risk of leaving the private world of manuscript circulation and entering the print market were high" (Coiro 360). Lanyer casts her net wide to procure female patronage as Su Fang Ng states, but she needs to be "careful to observe court-politics for the shifting alliances of female friendship and in some cases of outright rivalry" (Ng 436). In sum, she needs to write favourably about the women in her book in order to receive financial aids. Thus, "Lanyer has the difficult and unpleasant task of getting people to loosen their purse-strings" (435). As Lanyer was dependent upon these women, her patrons, her "writing personality to some degree was] (...) generated by the resentments and needs that these service relationships created" (Coiro 366). Coiro describes Lanyer's writing as "self-fashioning, and socially self-conscious" (434), and indeed Lanyer needed them to uphold her financially in publishing her work. As a result, Lanyer needs to balance writing favourably about these women, while at the same time she needs to stay true to her personal convictions and softly guide them to a new understanding of her beliefs.

3.2 What We Know of Aemilia Lanyer's Religious Conviction

When searching for Lanyer's religious convictions that motivated her to write *Salve Deus*, *Christ's Passion* stands out: "for an Englishwoman to write authoritatively on so sacred a subject [as *Christ's Passion*] is unusual in itself, but for her to revise fifteen hundred years of traditional commentary in the process is unheard of" (Norbrook "Introduction" xxxiv). Lanyer revises the essential elements of Christian theology and forms it into a "uniquely woman-centred" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxiv) account of the gospel. However, when studying her work in its religious context, it is very clearly not just a "cover for her subversive critique of patriarchy" (Trill 72; L. McGrath 228). But rather, Lanyer uses her religious knowledge to rectify religious convictions that do not coincide with fundamental Christian theology: "the vision of the common subjection of all humans before God could begin to undo the very hierarchies of class and gender that appeared to be sanctioned by the conventionally masculine and monarchical God" (Schoenfeldt 209). And additionally, Lanyer inspires and persuades her patrons and readers to pursue their individual calling in Christ. In doing so, Lanyer uses "the language of religious devotion to demarcate territory dividing the inwardness that devotion demands from the conduct that Renaissance Christianity enjoins" (Schoenfeldt 209). In contrast to Hutchinson, Lanyer's motivation to write *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* does not evidently stem from her protestant upbringing. Instead, her conviction to guide her patrons and female readers to an active Christian lifestyle comprises of her experiences as mentioned earlier with class and gender hierarchy at court, her pressing financial needs, and her connections to prominent protestant women.

Indeed, looking back at Lanyer's upbringing, these Protestant convictions are not that straightforward and self-evident. For, the speculations of religious influences in her early life range from Judaism and Protestantism to the Protestant deemed occult practises of astrology (Chapman 1258). The supposed influence of Judaism comes from Lanyer's father, Baptista

Bassano, who is an Italian court musician of, presumably, Jewish origin (Sage 377). He travelled from Venice to England and was recruited and offered permanent stay and work at the court as a court musician. He made music in the courts of Edward VI and Elizabeth. Whereas there is little evidence to support the Jewish ancestry of the Bassano's, the records of the Anglican Church show that Baptista Bassano and Margaret Johnson "baptised "Emilia Baptist" on 27 January 1569 in the Church of St. Botolph's Bishopsgate, just outside the city wall of London" (Woods, Lanyer: A Renaissance Poet 3). Here at this Church, "at least three of his [Baptista's] children were baptised, and two of them were buried, as he and his wife were" (Woods, Lanyer: A Renaissance Poet 5).

Moreover, Woods underlines that "more likely than a Jewish origin is the possibility that Baptista and Margaret were radical Protestant partisans" (Woods, Lanyer: A Renaissance Poet 7). Baptista Bassano would have been introduced to Reformed Protestantism through his connections at the court of Edward I and Elizabeth I (Sage 377). As explained in the first chapter of this thesis, both these Edwardian and Elizabethan courts were known for their Protestant stances. In addition, Lanyer's mother would have introduced the Italian Baptiste to the Protestant side of Christianity. For, Lanyer's mother "was an Englishwoman with ties to families associated with the Reformation wing of the English Church, notably the Vaughan family, which included Anne Vaughan Lock, who translated John Calvin and wrote a series of religious sonnets published in 1560" (Woods "Lanyer, Aemilia").

Her father's connections with the court provides Lanyer with the opportunity of higher education: "she was educated in the household of Susan Bertie, the Dowager Duchess of Kent" (Woods, "Aemilia Lanyer, *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*" 125). Lanyer's stay and education at the "pious Protestant household" (Sage 377) of Susan Bertie, Dowager Countess of Kent, might have also encouraged her to take on Protestant convictions. Lanyer hints to this in her dedication to Susan where she states that Susan was "the noble guide of my ungover n'd dayes"

(Lanyer 18.2) whose "noble Virtues do incite/ My pen" (20.45-46). Susan is the daughter of "a Protestant heroine, Catherine Brandon Bertie, the Dowager Duchess of Suffolk" (Woods "Aemilia Lanyer, *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*" 125). Catherine Brandon belonged to a courageous group of women who helped further the Reformation in England. Not only did Catherine Brandon retain good educators for her children as she retained the reformer Thomas Wilson as tutor to her sons, and employed Hugh Latimer as her chaplain" (Parry 119), but together with her daughter she also furthered the Reformation through patronage. These women had to sustain the Reformed publishing without help from the Church or moderately religious aristocracy: "Some of the most powerful women in the land proved to be [these] invaluable patronesses" among which Catherine Brandon and her daughter Susie. Their interests and goals for publication were very clear from the start: to help further the Reformation in England. This Reformed education and zeal for the Reformation would have almost certainly reached Lanyer during her stay at the Duchess of Suffolk's estate.

Her parents pass on when Lanyer is still at a young age, and therefore their religious influence might not be as prominently presented in her work. Lanyer mentions in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*, although probably somewhat overdrawn because of her quest for patronage, that her education at Susie Brandon Bertie's household as well as her stay with Margaret Clifford, the Countess of Cumberland, has been most influential regarding her Reformed education and motivation to write *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*. In her poem 'The Description of Cooke-ham', Lanyer remembers her stay, albeit a brief stay, with the Cliffords as "where I first obtain'd Grace from that Grace where perfit Grace remain'd" (Lanyer 130 l.1). Lanyer attributes "her own religious conversion to the Protestant faith to the time that she spent with the Countess of Cumberland" (Cavill 146). The Countess, Margaret, although 'just' a dowager countess is described in her dedications with the titles of a Queen. Lanyer portrays Margaret Clifford as an example for all women to follow in her works. She underlines that rather than

the earthly things, the spiritual, everlasting treasures are of Margaret's greatest concern. In Lanyer's work, Margaret is not primarily concerned with or cares for the "vaine delights" (DiPasquale 113) which "court life affords" (113), but Lanyer describes her as a woman striving to "serve a Heav'nly King" (Lanyer 58 l.170). Lanyer uses her devotional language to convey both spiritual greatness. It simultaneously strikes upon the nerve that even the great "from the Court to the Countrie art retir'd" (Lanyer 58 l.161): rather than enjoying the joys and gifts of the world, Lanyer writes that Clifford keeps her eyes focused on Christ, "the glorious Sunne / Of th'all-creating Providence" (Lanyer 52 l. 25) and is, as well as many others, "eager to advance the cause of the Reformation in Europe" (DiPasquale 113).

Even so, Lanyer mentions in "The Description of Cooke-ham" that her stay here has inspired her to write: "And where the Muses gave their full consent, / I should have powre the virtuous to content: / Where princely Palace will'd me to indite, / The sacred Storie of the Soules delight" (Lanyer 130 l.3-6). Of course, "the Countess of Cumberland plays a major role in both *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* itself and 'The Description of Cooke-ham' as the model Christian woman and reader" (Silcox 375). However, we should keep in mind that Lanyer is tied to the opinions of her patrons and their money to fund her cause. Coiro describes Lanyer's dependency upon these women and their opinions as "the chains of obligation, need, love and sometimes even humiliation which bind her to the women above her" (Coiro 373). Coiro states that we, as readers of Lanyer's praise, "should be moved by sisterhood, but we should not be blind to the rich chains" (373).

In summary, Lanyer's life and the many religious experiences paint a colourful picture of diversity. When reading *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*, it is helpful to keep in mind this diversity in her religious experiences whilst also recognising and honouring Lanyer's account of conversion. Lanyer's devotional language in her *Salve Deus* "brings into vivid focus the basic elements of Christian theology, which Lanyer's version assumes throughout" (Woods,

"Introduction" xxxvi). Nevertheless, she takes the liberty to reform the story into "a richly imagined version of the most central events of the Christian faith" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxvi) in order to convey equality and purpose: "the vision of the common subjection of all humans before God [which] could begin to undo the very hierarchies of class and gender that appeared to be sanctioned by the conventionally masculine and monarchical God" (Schoenfeldt 209). Schoenfeldt summarises precisely what motivated Lanyer to write such a "uniquely woman-centered" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxiv) account of the gospel: she undoes the hierarchies of gender by explaining her vision on the universal subjection of all Christians, male and female, to God.

.

3.3 Aemilia Lanyer's *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*: Women's Place in Redemption - the Dedicatory Poems

By preceding the central poem with her dedicatory poems, Lanyer sets the scene for what the reader is to expect when reading the revised Biblical narrative. In these dedicatory poems, Lanyer praises her own work and underlines the purpose of it for each dedicatee as well as her female readers. Her dedicatory poems are an introduction to what Lanyer wants to convey in her main poem in which she guides her patrons and female readers to a new understanding of submission and religious equality. Indeed in each dedicatory poem, Lanyer underlines her understanding of common, male and female, subjection to God and the consequent importance of religious equality – namely, personal responsibility for their soul's salvation. Throughout these introductory poems, Lanyer uses the image of Christ and His Bride as the epitome of subjection and equality.

The first poem is addressed to "the Queenes most Excellent Majestie", Queen Anne of Denmark, in which Lanyer underlines the importance of humility before God. Lanyer writes this poem as a remembrance to Queen Elizabeth but dedicates it to Queen Anne as she was a

"patron of writers and musicians" (Woods The Poems of 3). Lanyer praises Queen Anne in the first seven stanzas and compares her characteristics to the pagan gods which Anne by far ascends: "If now they strived for the golden Ball, Paris would give it you before them all" (Lanyer 3.11-12). In these seven stanzas, Lanyer places Queen Anne high "upon your Throane" (4.27) "reflecting light to all those glorious stars" (4.26). Furthermore, Lanyer humbles herself before her by describing herself with words like "meannesse" (4.27), "rude unpollisht" (l. 35). However, although she describes herself as most unworthy and the mirror that she holds up before the Queen is but "dym steele" (5.41), it is "full of spotlesse truth" (5.41). Here, Lanyer refers to God's truth that she passes on.

Although Anne ascends the pagan gods, Lanyer will reveal to her that there is a higher "Majestie" who is a mightier "Monarch both of heav'n and earth, / He that all Nations of the world controls" (5.44-45). This revelation should inspire Anne to submit and humble herself before a greater King. Lanyer shows Queen Anne that despite excellence and superiority in human terms, there is One who is even higher and more worthy of praise. This King does not boast but "tooke our flesh in base and meanest bearth / Whose daies were spent in poverty and sorrow / And yet all Kings their wealth of him do borrow" (5.46-48). Lanyer prompts Anne to seek for God for He "who dying, all th'Infernall powers orecame, / That we with him t'Eternitie might rise" (7.87-88). If this is true, that through Christ there is salvation for all, Lanyer urges her to view Eve in her book as her example of redemption, for why then "are poore Women blam'd, / Or by more faultie Men so much defam'd?" (6.77-78).

In the third dedicatory poem, Lanyer addresses "all virtuous Ladies in generall" (Lanyer 12) and calls them to action in order to help them remember their responsibility in God's plan of redemption and its reward. In this particular dedication, Lanyer uses the imagery from the book of Revelations in the Bible of Christ and His Bride as the "model for harmonious exchange between women and men" (Barnstone 151). As His Bride, all Christians should

subject themselves to Christ and serve and honour Him like He has honoured them by His redemption work on the cross. In this dedicatory poem, Lanyer emphasises that the image of Christ and His Bride is a model for all her readers, men and women, to submit themselves to each other and serve each other as Christ served them.

Lanyer continues the comparison of Christ and His Bride by commenting on her patrons and readers calling to live the life of a virtuous Bride. She prompts her ladies: "Put on your wedding garments every one, / The Bridegroom stayes to entertaine you all" (Lanyer 12.8-9). She points out that in God's divine plan, there is a significant role for women. For, all Christians who believe in their salvation by Christ will become His Bride when He returns. Lanyer instructs these women how to prepare for their calling as the Bride of Christ. She shows these women their "inner beauty of the soul" which is to be preferred to "all worldly pleasures" and outward beauty(13.24). In the first five stanzas of this dedication, Lanyer uses the word "Virtue" every time to underline that virtue is their beauty before the Bridegroom; for, "she [Virtue] alone / Can leade you right that you can never fall" (12.10-11). Therefore, Lanyer urges her reader to prepare herself in time for Christ's return and to make sure she know that she is part of these virtuous ladies; "let all your roabes be purple scarlet white, / those perfit colours purest Virtue wore" (12.15-16). These colours are in celebration of *Christ's Passion* (Woods The Poems of 12) where He shed His blood as a ransom to buy the freedom of His Bride: "whose godly labours doe avoyd the baite / Of worldly pleasures, living alwaies free / From sword, from violence, and from ill report, / To these nine Worthies all faire mindes resort" (Lanyer 13.32-35). Lanyer encourages her readers to "Let no dimme shadowes your cleare eyes beguile" (14.40). Instead, they should "Behold" (Lanyer 14.43) Christ in whom "all honour, wealth, and beautie's wonne: by whose perfection you appeare more faire" (14.50-51). And when He returns to collect His Bride, the "Annoynt" (14.36), they will receive their "greatest hoord" (14.53) of "heav'nly riches" (14.53): "Beeing immortal, subject to no death: / But in the

eie of heaven so highly placed, / That others by your virtues may be graced" (15.68-70). Lanyer writes of the rewards that will follow this subjection to God and each other. According to Lanyer, this subjection to Christ and each other leads to salvation through God's grace resulting in eternal gratitude.

In these two dedications, Lanyer underlined earthly titles or powers do not give that superiority. Moreover, in Christ's work of redemption, everyone is created equal and all will be highly placed when He returns. In her dedication to Ladie Susan, where she was educated in her youth, Lanyer indicates that Susan's influence made her aware of these virtues. Together with the influence of Ladie Susan, Lanyer writes in her dedication to Ladie Margaret that her work is "the mirrour of your [Ladie Margaret's] most worthy mind (...) to be a light unto those that come after, desiring to tread in the narrow path of virtue, that leads the way to heaven" (Lanyer 35). Concluding her dedicatory introduction, Lanyer, lastly, addresses "the Vertuous Reader" in which she explains that she has written her work "to make knowne to the world, that all women are not to be blamed" (48), not by other women, not by "evill disposed men" (48) for when they do they dishonour "Christ his Apostles and prophets" (48). For, God himself "gave power to wise and virtuous women, to bring down their pride and arrogance" (49). Lanyer gives many examples of women who were powerful and wise in the Bible, and many women who "indured most cruel martyrdome for their faith in Jesus Christ" (50). In conclusion, in these dedicatory poems, Lanyer prepares her readers for a unique account of the gospel in which she emphasises her idea of common subjection and highlights women's responsibility in the redemption story. She uses the examples of the fall and Christ's suffering as an ultimate case to make her point.

3.4 Aemilia Lanyer's *Salve Deus* Rex Judaeorum: Women's Place in Redemption – *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*

In the central poem of *Salve Deus*, *Christ's Passion*, Lanyer is mainly concerned with accommodating the distribution of guilt, for it were men and not women who have condemned and crucified their Saviour. Bowen remarks that it is Lanyer's brilliant innovation to see that the two central events of Christianity are linked by gender; if Eve's acceptance of the apple has meant that all women are indicted in the fall, then guilt for the crucifixion should indict all men" (278). Here, Lanyer acknowledges the unequally distributed guilt on women imposed by a society that focusses on Eve's mistake in the garden. However, she ends her pleading by displaying God's grace that is readily available to all. This poem, again, starts with dedications to her patrons - 33 stanzas in total. Following these dedicatory poems, Lanyer includes "a preamble of the author before the Passion" (Lanyer 62). Here she explains her desire to write about "His [Christ's] Death and Passion, / And thee to reade, the blessed Soules delight" (Lanyer 63.271-272). Following, Lanyer invokes her Muse to guide her through the delicate subjects she is about to address.

Like Hutchinson, Lanyer acknowledges her dependency upon the Holy Spirit and displays her personal experience of humbling herself before God. As is customary to the conventions of the invocation to the muse, ("it was usual for the lower born poet to acknowledge ritual unworthiness in speaking to social superiors" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxiii)), Lanyer acknowledges her weaknesses: "But to present this pure unspotted Lambe, / I must confesse, I farre unworthy am" (Lanyer 65.319-320). However, she makes "no excuse" (62.267) for her writing: "But yet in Weaker thou doest seeme to be / In Sexe, or Sence, the more his Glory shines" (63. 289-290). Like Hutchinson and Milton, Lanyer invokes her "lowely Muse" (62.265) and asks that "his most holy Spirit shall give me Light" (64.302) and will "illuminate my Spirit" (65.321). So that in this "Matter farre beyond my barren skill"

(64.313), he will "vouchsafe to guide my Hand and Quill" (65.324). Woods notes that Lanyer's ability to write "depends on grace given by God through his most holy Spirit" (Woods The Poems of 64). Comparing to Hutchinson, Lanyer too knows her dependency upon God's grace and spirit.

Following her invocation and preamble of the author, Lanyer formally starts her Passion at Mount Olives in which she addresses humankind's pride and contrasts this to Christ's humility. She motivates her readers to adopt a similar approach to submission and humility as Christ displayed. In the next 52 stanzas, through the entire Passion, she compares the "Worldling's" (Lanyer 80.675) pride and foolishness to Jesus' humble obedience and unsurpassable love. She portrays Christ as an example of humility, obedience and love and underlines the grace and forgiveness which He gives freely despite mankind's foolish acts:

> Loe here thy great Humility was found,
> Beeing King of Heaven, and Monarch of the Earth,
> Yet well content to have thy Glory drowned,
> By beeing counted of so meane a berth;
> Grace, Love, and Mercy did so much abound,
> Thou entertaindst the Crosse, even to the death:
> And nam'dst thy selfe, the sonee of Man to be,
> To purge our pride by thy Humilitie (Lanyer 72. 473-480)

Lanyer here refers to "our pride" (72.480) which is purged "by thy Humilitie" (72.480). She contrasts God's love and compassion to us "wretched Worldlings made of dust and earth, / Whose hard' ned hearts, with pride and mallice swell" (80.675-676). For Christ, "in midst of bloody sweat, and dying breath, / He had compassion on these tyrants fell: / And purchast them

a place in Heav'n for ever, / When they his Soule and Body sought to sever" (Lanyer 80.677-680). Lanyer underlines Christ's compassion to his enemies and guides her female readers to have similar compassion to the men that suppress them.

When Lanyer arrives at Judas' betrayal and Caiaphas' and Pontius Pilates' judgement of Jesus, her tone changes as she starts to rebuke the male gender who were responsible for Christ's crucifixion. Up until this point, "the version of the Passion Lanyer describes follows closely Matthew 26:30-28:10" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxvi) and she does not mention a difference or distinction between men and women in this redemption story. This redemption story focuses on Christ's saving grace "who for our sinnes must die, / to set us free" (Lanyer 81.704) which is "al true Christians joy" (80.661). However, when Lanyer arrives at Christ's betrayal and judgement, she starts to point out the many faults of men who crucified Christ. According to the speaker, these men should concern themselves with their own judgment and accordingly should humble them before God and not feel superior to women. Lynette McGrath notes that "Lanier finds male culture notably deficient in ways that she documents by men's response to women and to the Saviour with whom women are closely connected; men dishonoured Christ as they continued to dishonour women" (McGrath 335). For Judas' kiss brought Christ into the hands of Sinners and the Jewish, religious leaders condemned Him and ordered His death. Their unjust "zeale, Lawes and Religion" (Lanyer 75.548) through which they try to "free themselves from blame" (75.547) condemns them as "sinnes ugly mists, so blinded had their eyes (...) / these were those fooles that thought themselves so wise, / The Jewish wolves, that did our Saviour bite" (81.681-684). Lastly, Pilate condemns Jesus to death while he washes his hands in innocence. He does not "heare the words of thy [his] most worthy wife, / Who sends to thee, to beg her Saviours life" (84.751-752) for it "is Peoples threat' nings, which he so much feares, / That he to Caesar could not be a friend, / Unlesse he sent sweet

Jesus to his end" (91.918-920). Pilates chooses not to listen and submit to Christ which results in Christ's death.

Which brings Lanyer to *Eve's Apologie,* or an apology for the entire female gender presented by Pilate's wife: "But surely Adam can not be excusde, / Her fault though great, yet hee was most too blame / What Weaknesse offered, Strength might have refusde" (Lanyer 85.777-779). In her supposed "weaknesse", as was often stressed in patriarchal society, Eve would not have known and could not have foreseen the consequence of her actions: "for had she knowne, of what we were bereav'd, / To his request she had not condiscended" (84. 771-772). If indeed this weakness of the female sexe is real, then Adam would be more to blame: "If any Evill did in her remaine / Beeing made of him, he was the ground of all" (Lanyer 86 ll. 809-810). For, Adam is the flesh and dust from which she is created, and Adam was present when "from Gods mouth [he] receiv'd that strait command" (85.787) "Being Lord of all, the greater was his shame: / Although the Serpents craft had her abuse, Gods holy word ought all his actions frame" (85.780-782).

Furthermore, Lanyer convinces her readers that it is almost incomprehensible that men "boast of Knowledge", which they took "From Eve's faire hand, as from a learned Booke" (86.807-808). Indeed, Eve in her lack of knowledge and intellect would not have realised her mistakes; however, Pilate, as the representative of men, will make this judgement to condemn Jesus knowingly and in full power. Humankind will once again deny Christ and His perfect Kingship, yet in a graver form for we reject Him in full knowledge: "He basely used, blasphemed, scorn'd and curst, / Our heavenly King to death for us they sent" (Lanyer 91 ll. 941-942).

In stating again that Christ died "for us" (91.942), Lanyer finishes her Apologie by underlining the equality in salvation: this King is still sent to death, and thus He prepared salvation for both Pilate and all men and Pilate's wife and all women. This statement signifies

that Lanyer does not wish to make any distinction between salvation and superiority of man nor woman. Bowen remarks that "it is Lanyer's brilliant innovation to see that the two central events of Christianity are linked by gender; if Eve's acceptance of the apple has meant that all women are indicted in the fall, then guilt for the crucifixion should indict all men" (Bowen 278). Indeed, as Lanyer followed the footsteps of the Bible, she shows a glimpse in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* of Colossians 3 which states that there is no difference in gender, occupation or heritage in Christ in which all are: "renewed in knowledge in the image of its Creator. Here there is no Gentile or Jew, circumcised or uncircumcised, barbarian, Scythian, slave or free, but Christ is all and is in all" (ESV Col. 3.10-11).

3.4.1 A Religious Experience of Guilt and Grace

Finally, although every religious experience is different, as Spilka has noted, the devotional language of Hutchinson and Lanyer is quite similar: "persons possessing a religious language will use it to describe various experiences (...) based on the language with which they are familiar" (Spilka 328). Lanyer too guides her reader to salvation through the notions of guilt, grace and gratitude. As I have explained in Hutchinson's chapter, she uses the Heidelberg Catechism which acknowledges a similarity between Christians in the personal religious experiences of guilt, grace, and gratitude: "firste, howe great my sinne and wretchednesse is. The seconde, by what meanes I may bee deliuered from my sinne. The thirde is, what thanks I owe unto my Lorde God for my deliuerance" (The Catechisme 2). Hutchinson wrote of this experience of guilt, grace, and gratitude, which can be read in Eve's religious experience as well. Lanyer, although she does not use the same references to the Catechisme, mentions "sinne" and "guilt" a total of 53 times and speaks about "grace" and "saluation" 86 times in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*.

In contrast to Hutchinson, Lanyer's description of guilt and grace does not encompass a journey of her characters' religious experience through guilt, grace and gratitude. Lanyer interlaces her entire account of *Christ's Passion* and *Eve's Apologie* with the distribution of guilt. She links the two central events of Christianity by gender and explains to the reader that "if Eve's acceptance of the apple has meant that all women are indicted in the fall, then guilt for the crucifixion should indict all men" (Bowen 278). In addition to the already present guilt for Eve's fall on behalf of the female gender, Lanyer engages the potential male reader and makes them too feel ashamed of their gender's action. She, therefore, assumes both men and women to experience guilt which would motivate them to search for Christ and his salvation from this guilt. In terms of grace, Lanyer does not mention a difference or distinction between men and women in the redemption story. Her redemption story focuses on Christ's saving grace "who for our sinnes must die, / to set us free" (Lanyer 81.704) which is "al true Christians joy" (80.661). Lanyer shows that both men and women are sinners and need the same Christ to be relieved from their sin and guilt.

3.4.2 A Religious Experience of Gratitude

The gratitude or joy plays a significant role in the finale of her Passion - Christ's resurrection. In Christ's resurrection, Lanyer refers to the image of Christ and his Bride again as she also did in the dedicatory poems; however, now she adds a detailed description of the Bridegroom who will be His Bride's greatest joy: "For he is rizen from Death t'Eternall Life / And now those pretious oyntments he desires / Are brought unto him, by his faithfull Wife / The holy Church" (Lanyer 106.1289-1292). Lanyer, in contrast to Hutchinson and Milton, chooses not to focus on Adam or Eve's beauty or the beauty of Christ's Bride, but she focuses on Christ's work that will make humankind perfect again as they were before the fall: "His pretious blood is that which must redeem; / those well may make us lovely in his sight, / But cannot save without his

powrefull might" (Lanyer 107.1302-1304). In addition, she focusses on the appearance of the Bridegroom in which Christians should find their ultimate joy: "that appeares so faire, / So sweet, so lovely in his Spouses sight" (Lanyer 107.1305-1306). Lanyer describes Him with the words of Song of Salomon 3:4:

> That unto Snowe we may his face compare,
> His cheekes like skarlet, and his eyes so bright
> As purest Doves that in the rivers are,
> Washed with milke, to give the more delight;
> His head is likened to the finest gold,
> His curled lockes so beauteous to behold[.] (Lanyer 107.1307-1312)

The Bridegroom's face is white as a symbol of purity or innocence, and the scarlet refers to His bloodshed on the cross. His head is like the finest gold, and His curled hair is "beauteous to behold" (107.1312), which contrasts Milton's description of Eve's hair. Eve's curls in Milton's account are "coupled with the serpentine associations" (Newman 112) of her "wanton ringlets [which] wav'd / As the Vine curls her tendrils" (Milton IV 306-307) which is to be "an adumbration of the part Eve will play in the drama of the fall" (Newman 112). Through this Bridegroom, the fall is undone and now:

> With Majestie and Honour is He clad,
> And deck'd with lights as with a garment faire;
> He joyes the Meeke, and makes the Mightie sad,
> Pulls downe the Prowd, and doth the Humble reare:
> Who sees this Bridegroome, never can be sad;

> None lives that can his wondrous workes declare:
> Yea, looke how farre the East is from the West,
> So farre he sets our sinnes that have transgrest. (Lanyer 54.73-80)

This Bridegroom is the "Sonne of righteousnesse, that gives true joyes" (Lanyer 120.1623) to whom all women should pledge their loyalty and they should remember their equal worth in Him: There is neither male nor female, for ye are all one in Christ Jesus (ESV Galatians 3:28).

3.5 Chapter Conclusion

In conclusion to this chapter, in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*, Aemilia Lanyer guides her female readers to a new understanding of universal subjection to God and religious equality between the sexes. Lanyer's main aim with *Salve Deus* is for her to write a "uniquely woman-centered" (Woods, "Introduction" xxxiv) account of the gospel that undoes the hierarchies of gender by explaining her vision on the common subjection of all Christians, male and female, to God (Schoenfeldt 209). She proves her point by stating that if the guilt for Eve's fall indicts the entire female gender, Christ's crucifixion indicts the entire male gender. Therefore, in response to the idea that men are superior, Lanyer concludes that "all have sinned and fall short of the glory of God" (ESV Romans 3.23). Therefore, all should subject to God and ask for his mercy. This way, Lanyer leads her female readers to a newfound responsibility for their own personal religious experience of salvation. As explained in the first Chapter, Lanyer draws on the ideas of the Reformation that emphasised the need for a personal conviction towards Christianity in its doctrines rather than religion being a "transformation imposed from above, by authority" (Collinson 249). The common Englishman and woman could no longer rely on class or money to obtain a place in purgatory or heaven; instead, within this new Reformed doctrine, a personal relationship with God was the sole ground for salvation.

Consequently, Lanyer displays the protestant notions of grace and gratitude which are available to all who submit to God: "but God shows his love for us in that while we were still sinners, Christ died for us" (ESV Romans 5:8). In the image of Christ's sacrifice, men and women should live their Christian lives in humility and submission to each other. She hereby rectifies the religious suppression of the female gender by the existing patriarchal society, and she rewrites *Christ's Passion* as such so that it will both humble and uplift men and women. By focussing on Christ's return and stressing the analogy of the Church as Christ's Bride, Lanyer underlines the equality between the sexes as well as the purpose and place of both men and women within the narrative of Christianity.

4. Conclusion

With suspended disbelief as opted by Trill, in this thesis, I have examined and revisited Hutchinson and Lanyer's professions of faith. I have attempted to look at their works from a religious angle and interpret their motivations to write their texts accordingly. In conclusion, both Lucy Hutchinson in *Order and Disorder* and Aemilia Lanyer in *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum* produced a new Genesis narrative with emphasis on the female presence. In rewriting the Genesis narrative with such an emphasis, they acknowledged the religious suppression of the female gender by the existing patriarchal society and addressed the need for a revival in personal religious experiences for women. To achieve that, they wrote about their own personal religious experiences and the religious experiences of their characters as an example for other women. Both Lucy Hutchinson and Aemilia Lanyer have felt this calling to guide their female readers to a new understanding of submission leading to a personal responsibility for their soul's salvation.

Hutchinson and Lanyer have similarly interpreted submission to be a total, personal subjection to God. In *Order and Disorder,* Hutchinson shows that the notion of Biblical submission does not equal the silencing of the female gender and does not come from a place of authority. Instead, submission comes from a place of humility and servitude towards God and others. In *Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum,* Lanyer brings down patriarchal hierarchies as she calls her readers to a common subjection to God. In both Hutchinson and Lanyer's accounts, there is no difference between men and women experiencing God's grace. Lanyer underlines that both men and women have sinned and that both men and women can receive God's grace. She uses the image of Christ as the Bridegroom and the Church as His Bride as the epitome of submission to one another. As Christ sacrificed himself for the Church, the Church should submit to Him an each other in return. Hutchinson confirms that submission to Christ results in a servitude towards others and an actively practiced faith.

Furthermore, Hutchinson and Lanyer both describe the personal responsibility for women's religious welfare. As described in the first chapter of this thesis on the Reformation, the religious landscape changed from a collective Christianity to an individual religious experience. As a result of this individualisation of faith, women are called to a personal, religious relationship with Christ. in *Order and Disorder* and in *On the Principles of Religion,* Hutchinson depicts how both she and her character Eve experienced salvation and transitioning from guilt into grace, and from grace into gratitude. In contrast, Lanyer interlaces the experiences of guilt, grace, and gratitude throughout her narrative. She engages the reader by showing that both men and women are subject to sin and need God's grace. As a result, she depicts the reward of subjecting to God: as His Bride, the Church lives a joyful eternal life in His presence. At last, indeed, this thesis this thesis demonstrates that by writing and publishing their personal religious experiences, Lucy Hutchinson and Aemilia Lanyer guide their female readers to a new understanding of submission leading to a personal responsibility for their soul's salvation. Both Hutchinson and Lanyer present the way to salvation according the Reformed notions of guilt, grace, and gratitude.

5. Bibliography

Barnstone, Aliki. “Women and the Garden: Andrew Marvell, Emilia Lanier, and Emily Dickinson”. *Men by Women*, vol. 2, Holmes & Meier , 1981. Women & Literature.

Black, Joseph, et al., editors. “Aemilia Lanyer.” *The Broadview Anthology of British Literature:One-Volume Compact Edition: The Medieval Period through the Twenty First Century*,Broadview Press, 2015, pp. 529–535.

Bowen, Barbara. “Aemilia Lanyer and the Invention of White Womenhood”. *Maids and Mistresses,Cousins and Queens: Women's Alliances in Early Modern England*, edited by Susan Freyeand Karen Robertson, Oxford University Press, 1999, pp. 274–303.

Bray, Gerald, editor. *Documents of the English Reformation*. Fortress Press, 1994.

Brecht, Martin. “Luther’s Reformation”. *Luther’s Reformation*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 1995. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004391680_006 Web.

Brundage, James A. *Law, Sex and Christian Society in Medieval Europe*. University of Chicago Press, 2009.

Bunyan, John. *The Pilgrim's Progress, in Two Parts*. Edited by Thomas Scott, L.A. Tyler, 1829.

Calvin, John. “Commentary on Corinthians - Volume 1”. *Christian Classics Ethereal Library*, 1 June 2005, www.ccel.org/ccel/calvin/calcom39.xviii.i.html.

Cavill, Paul. *The Christian Tradition in English Literature*. Zondervan Academic, 2009.

Chapman, Alison A. “Marking Time: Astrology, Almanacs, and English Protestantism”. *Renaissance Quarterly*, vol. 60, no. 4, 2007, pp. 1257–1290. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1353/ren.2007.0466.

Charlton, Kenneth. *Women, Religion and Education in Early Modern England*. Routledge, 2014.

Coiro, Ann Baynes. “Writing in Service: Sexual Politics and Class Position in the Poetry of Aemilia Lanyer and Ben Johnson”. *Criticism: A Quarterly for Literature and the Arts*, vol. 35, Wayne State University Press, 1993, pp. 357–376.

Collinson, Patrick. “The Late Medieval Church and Its Reformation”. *The Oxford History of Christianity*, edited by John McManners, Oxford University Press, 2002, pp. 243–276.

Crapuchettes, Elise. *Popes and Feminists: How the Reformation Frees Women from Feminism*. Canon Press, 2017.

De Saluste, Guilauma, and Sieur Du Bartas. *The Divine Weeks and Works ... Translated by Joshua Sylvester*. Edited by Susan Snyder, Oxford University Press, 1979.

DiPasquale, Theresa M. *Refiguring the Sacred Feminine: the Poems of John Donne, Aemilia Lanyer, and John Milton*. Duquesne University Press, 2008.

English Standard Version Bible. London: Crossway, 2010.

Hutchinson, Lucy. *Memoirs of the Life of Colonel Hutchinson*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2010. Web.

--- *On the Principles of the Christian Religion, Addressed to her Daughter; and On Theology.* London, 1817.

--- *Order and Disorder*. Edited by David Norbrook, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2001.

Lanyer, Aemilia. *The Poems of Aemilia Lanyer: Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*. Edited by Susanne Woods, Oxford University Press, 1993.

Lewalski, Barbara K. “Re-Writing Patriarchy and Patronage: Margaret Clifford, Anne Clifford, and Aemilia Lanyer”. *The Yearbook of English Studies*, vol. 21, 1991, pp. 87–106. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/3508481.

Lewalski, Barbara Kiefer, and Margaret P. Hannay. *Of God and Good Women: the Poems of Aemilia Lanyer*. Kent State University Press, 1985.

Lindberg, Carter. *The European Reformations*. 2nd ed., Wiley-Blackwell, 2010.

McGrath, Alister E. *Christian History: an Introduction*. Wiley-Blackwell, 2013.

McGrath, Lynette. "'Let Us Have Our Libertie Againe': Amelia Lanier's 17th-Century Feminist Voice". *Women's Studies*, vol. 20, Gordon and Breach, Science Publishers SA, 1992, pp. 331–348.

Miller, Shannon. "Maternity, Marriage, and Contract: Lucy Hutchinson's Response to Patriarchal Theory in 'Order and Disorder'." *Studies in Philology*, vol. 102, no. 3, 2005, pp. 340–377. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/4174824.

Milton, John. *Paradise Lost. The Riverside Milton.* Ed. Roy Flannagan. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1998.

Moon, Hi Kyung. "From Eve to Rachel: Biblical Women in Lucy Hutchinson`s Order and Disorder" *18세기영문학 18세기영문학* vol. 10, no. 2, 2013, p. 235-265.

Moore, C. A. "Miltoniana (1679-1741)." *Modern Philology*, vol. 24, no. 3, 1927, pp. 321–339. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/433381.

Newman, Robert D. "Entanglement In Paradise: Eve's Hair and the Reader's Anxiety in 'Paradise Lost'." *Interpretations*, vol. 16, no. 1, 1985, pp. 112–115. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/43797852.

Ng, Su Fang. "Aemilia Lanyer and the Politics of Praise". *ELH*, vol. 67, no. 2, 2000, pp. 433–451.*JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/30031921.

Norbrook, David. "Introduction: Lucy Hutchinson: Theology, Gender and Translation". *The Seventeenth Century*, vol. 30, no. 2, 2015, pp. 139–162.

Norbrook, David. "Order and Disorder: The Poem and Its Contexts". O*rder and Disorder*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd, 2001, pp. Xii-lvii.

Parry, Graham. “Literary Patronage.” *The Cambridge History of Early Modern English Literature*, edited by David Loewenstein and Janel Mueller, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2003, pp. 117–140. The New Cambridge History of English Literature.

Pettegree, Andrew. “Reformation and Counter-Reformation”. *A World History of Christianity*, edited by Adrian Hastings, Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2000, pp. 238–281.

Porterfield, Amanda. “Women's Attraction to Puritanism”. *Church History*, vol. 60, no. 2, 1991, pp. 196–209. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/3167525.

Sage, Lorna, et al. *The Cambridge Guide to Women's Writing in English*. Cambridge University Press, 1999.

Schoenfeldt, Michael. “The Gender of Religious Devotion: Amelia Lanyer and John Donne”. *Religion and Culture in Renaissance England*, edited by Claire Elizabeth McEachern and Debora K. Shuger, Cambridge University Press, 1997, pp. 209–233.

Schwartz, Regina M. *The Curse of Cain: the Violent Legacy of Monotheism*. Univ. of Chicago Pr., 1997.

Scott-Baumann, Elizabeth. “Lucy Hutchinson, the Bible and *Order and Disorder*”. *The Intellectual Culture of Puritan Women*, edited by Johanna Harris and Elizabeth Scott-Baumann, vol. 17, Palgrave Macmillan, 2011, pp. 176–189.

Shook, Lauren. “‘Pious Fraud’: Genesis Matriarchs and the Typological Imagination in Lucy Hutchinson’s *Order and Disorder*”. *Modern Philology*, vol. 112, no. 1, 2014, pp. 179–204. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/676447.

Shattock, Joanne. *The Oxford Guide to British Women Writers*. Oxford University Press, 1993.

Silcox, Mary. “Aemilia Lanyer, Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum (1611)”. *Reading Early Modern Women: An Anthology of Texts in Manuscript and Print, 1550-1700*, edited by Helen Ostovich and Elizabeth Sauer, Routledge, 2004, pp. 374–375.

Sommerville, Margaret R. *Sex and Subjection: Attitudes to Women in Early Modern Society*. London: Arnold, 1995.

Spilka, Bernard, and Greg Schmidt. “General Attribution Theory for the Psychology of Religion: The Influence of Event-Character on Attributions to God”. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, vol. 22, no. 4, 1983, pp. 326–339. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/1385771.

Stevenson, Jane, and Peter Davidson. “Aemilia Lanyer”. *Early Modern Women Poets (1520-1700)*, Oxford University Press, 2001, pp. 100–101.

Swaim, Kathleen M. “Mercy and the Feminine Heroic in the Second Part of Pilgrim's Progress”. *Studies in English Literature, 1500-1900*, vol. 30, no. 3, 1990, pp. 387–409. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/450703.

Thompson, John L. “Creata Ad Imaginem Dei, Licet Secundo Gradu: Woman as the Image of God According to John Calvin”. *The Harvard Theological Review*, vol. 81, no. 2, 1988, pp. 125–143. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/1509550.

The Catechisme, or Manner How to Instruct and Teach Children and Others in the Christian Faith Appointed to Bee Read in All the Lands and Dominions of the Late Right and Mightie Prince, Frederike, Countie Palatine of the Rhein, One of the Electors of the Holy Empire, and Duke in Bauier. Printed by Henrie Middleton, for Iohn Harison, 1578.

Trill, Suzanne. “Feminism versus Religion: Towards a Re-Reading of Aemilia Lanyer's ‘Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum’”. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance Et Réforme*, vol. 25, no. 4, 2001, pp. 67–80. *JSTOR*, www.jstor.org/stable/43445387.

Wilcher, Robert. "'Adventurous Song' or 'Presumptuous Folly': The Problem of 'Utterance' in John Milton's Paradise Lost and Lucy Hutchinson's Order and Disorder." *The Seventeenth Century*, vol. 21, no. 2, 2006, pp. 304–314., doi:https://doi.org/10.1080/0268117X.2006.10555579.

Woods, Susanne. "Aemilia Lanyer, Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum". *A Companion to Early Modern Women's Writing*, edited by Anita Pacheco, Blackwell Publishing, 2002, pp. 125–135.

---"Introduction." *The Poems of Aemilia Lanyer: Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum*, Oxford University Press, 1993, p. Xv-xlii.

--- *Lanyer: A Renaissance Woman Poet*, Oxford University Press, 1999.

--- "Lanyer, Aemilia". The Oxford Encyclopedia of British Literature. : Oxford University Press, January 01, 2006. Oxford Reference. <http://www.oxfordreference.com.ezproxy.leidenuniv.nl:2048/view/10.1093/acref/9780195169218.001.0001/acref-9780195169218-e-0260>.

Woods, Susanne, (ed). *The Poems of Aemilia Lanyer: Salve Deus Rex Judaeorum,* Oxford University Press, 1993.