



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The impact of economic aid institutions on human security in Rwanda
Wijngaarden, Tijmen van

Citation

Wijngaarden, T. van. (2022). *The impact of economic aid institutions on human security in Rwanda*.

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [License to inclusion and publication of a Bachelor or Master thesis in the Leiden University Student Repository](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3309407>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

The impact of economic aid institutions on human security in Rwanda

30th of May 2022

Bachelor Thesis

By Tijmen van Wijngaarden (s2500736)

Universiteit Leiden – BSc Politicologie: International Relations and Organisations

BAP: Inclusiveness, State-building and Peace-building

Supervisor: Dr. Arlinda Rrustemi

Second Reader: Dr. Wouter Veenendaal

Word Count: 7761

Contents

Introduction.....	3
Theoretical Framework.....	5
Methodology.....	7
Analysis: The World Bank.....	10
Analysis: USAID.....	15
Analysis – The Global Fund.....	19
Conclusion & Discussion.....	23
Appendix A: Results Tables.....	26
List of References.....	29

Introduction

From 1 October 1990 until 18 July 1994, a civil war took place in Rwanda. Long-running disputes between the Hutu and Tutsi groups within Rwanda were slowly rising since the revolution that occurred between 1959 and 1962, where the Tutsi monarchy was overthrown in favor of a Hutu-led republic, forcing many Tutsi people to flee to neighboring countries. In Uganda, a group of Tutsi refugees formed the Rwandan Patriotic Force (RPF), and on 1 October 1990, the RPF invaded Rwanda, starting the civil war. Towards the end of the war, after the signing of a peace treaty, a group of Hutu extremists organized a militia group with the intention of committing genocide against the Tutsi people. Between 7 April and 15 July, this genocide was committed, killing an estimated 500 thousand to one million people in the span of 100 days (Guichaoua 2020, pp. 125-128). The RPF quickly resumed the war during the genocide, capturing the capital Kigali on 4 July, officially ending the war.

The impact of the war was devastating. In addition to the hundreds of thousands of victims of genocide, the civil war caused three million people to seek refuge in nearby countries. Infrastructure, property, and livestock were destroyed on a mass scale and a high number of rape incidents caused the spread of HIV/AIDS throughout the country in addition to the trauma that rape survivors and survivors of other violent acts endure. The infant mortality rate rose from 87 per thousand before the war to 137 per thousand during and shortly after the war. (Lopez & Wodon, 2005, p. 587). Additionally, the consequences of the economic degradation that occurred during the civil war have been devastating for the country. Lopez & Wodon (2005) estimate that the GDP per capita of Rwanda would have been 25-30 per cent higher if the genocide would have never occurred (p. 598).

Rwanda has received much development assistance since the civil war. According to the World Bank, the country received ~200 million USD in official development assistance (ODA) per year throughout the 1980s. It gradually increased leading up to and during the civil war, reaching a peak of 711 million USD in 1994. ODA sharply decreased immediately after the civil war, but has been increasing ever since, reaching a total of 1.191 billion USD in ODA in 2019. Abbot & Rwirahira (2012) stated that in 2012, Rwanda was the fifth most aid-dependent country in the world (p. 13).

Human security is a theoretical framework that centers the safety, wellness, and fulfillment of people and communities at its core. Human security scholars argue that all attempts at improving security should feature human safety as the end goal of security instead of using humans as a method of reaching security. Alkire (2002) provides a definition of human security that encompasses these ideas: “The objective of human security is to safeguard the vital core of all human lives from critical pervasive threats, in a way that is consistent with long-term human fulfillment” (p. 2). Human security is a broad framework, encompassing vital needs of human survival to aspects less essential to survival but still important to human safety, such as democratic participation. Alkire’s (2002) definition provides five aspects of the framework. These are “safeguarding”, “the vital core”, “all human lives” “critical pervasive threats”, and “long-term human fulfillment” (p. 2). Human security is relevant to Rwanda because the genocide and its consequences have done great damage to life experiences in Rwanda. To solve these problems, a morals-based approach is needed.

The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) argues that the purpose of official development assistance (ODA) is to promote the economic development and welfare of developing nations. It should follow, then, that ODA has a positive impact on human security in Rwanda as developmental aid can have a large impact on all five aspects of the human security framework. To research whether this is an accurate statement, a research question has been formed. The research question of this analysis is “*to what extent do economic aid structures have a positive impact on human security in post-conflict Rwanda?*”. The analysis will focus on the three largest sources of official development aid in Rwanda. These are the World Bank, USAID, and The Global Fund, who have lent or granted Rwanda 355 million, 134.8 million, and 94.25 million USD respectively (U.S. Department of State, 2021). The programs of each organization will be thoroughly analyzed to understand what economic impact their aid has on each of the five aspects of human security. This will be followed by a discussion to better understand the impact of economic aid on human security as a whole.

Theoretical Framework

The impact of economic aid structures

This research paper aims to understand the relationship between human security in Rwanda and economic aid structures. While previous scholarship has not investigated this specific relationship, other research that is relevant to this study has been conducted. Scholars such as Ahmed (2004) argue that human security in developing countries is threatened by globalization and the growing role of international economic institutions. Global free-trade regimes serve the interest of developed states by extracting wealth from developing states as they are pressured to sell raw materials and cheap labor. Developing countries have less access to capital, technology, transportation, and markets, so their role in the global economy is to fuel the growing wealth in developed states (pp. 117-118). Economic aid structures such as the World Bank and IMF assist in this process by imposing structural adjustment policies which push developing states to participate in global markets, forcing those states to sell what they have a competitive advantage in. On the domestic scale, this massively benefits people who are involved in export while marginalizing everyone else, causing a growth in domestic economic inequality (pp. 119-120).

Other scholars argue that economic aid structures do have a positive impact on development in developing countries. Bearce & Tirone (2010) argue that economic aid has promoted economic growth in recipient national countries, but only in the post-Cold War era because there were less strategic benefits for Western countries to send aid (p. 848). This meant that aid could be freed from tight conditionality agreements that hindered economies from growing. If their theory is correct, then it should follow that the aid that Rwanda received after the genocide has been successful in growing the Rwandan economy. Furthermore, Gervais (2003) argues that economic aid structures (specifically, development projects funded by the Canadian International Development Agency and implemented by Canadian NGOs) have been effective in combating gender-based violence in post-conflict Rwanda. The civil war resulted in much physical violence, trauma, and increased responsibility for women. A previous study found that 80 per cent of female victims of violence showed signs of trauma, and 66 per cent of them were HIV-positive (pp. 303-304). With help from official development assistance, violence

against women has diminished significantly since 1994 because the justice system has become better at tackling these issues, women have been able to lift themselves out of extreme poverty, and democratic institutions have become better at eliminating discrimination (p. 311). While these developments are good, violence against women within family units has not been changed much. Additionally, while there has been a reduction in violence against women, the Rwandan civil war caused a large spike in violence, so Gervais' research is not conclusive on whether economic aid structures caused this decrease, or if the decrease was caused by the end of the civil war.

Human security

There have been many scholars and researchers writing about the topic of human security, what it entails, and how to best achieve it. Alkire (2002) describes it as a goal, and its objective is "to safeguard the vital core of all human lives from critical pervasive threats, in a way that is consistent with long-term human fulfillment" (p. 2). Within this objective, there are five vital aspects. Firstly, human security is about safeguarding human lives from events and phenomena that are beyond their control: Conflict, natural disasters, disease, national policies, terrorism, pollution, and many other examples. Human security seeks to promote overt and institutional safety. Actors need to prepare for all kinds of different threats to minimize damage and human loss. For example, governments could implement early warning signs to mitigate the effects of famine (pp. 2-3). Secondly, there is a vital core of human life that should be protected. These pertain to survival, livelihood, and basic dignity. The author purposefully refrains from defining what these include because this is an important value judgement that needs to be made by communities and people in charge of security for those communities (p. 3). Thirdly, human security pertains all people. Human security spans the entire world, irrespective of physical and cultural borders. The well-being of people is the end goal of development, not a means to another end. Security policy must be reoriented to put humans first (pp. 3-4). Fourthly, it is important that actors can identify, locate, assess, and prepare for critical and pervasive threats. These threats can be of any kind, can threaten lives directly or indirectly, and can be sudden or obvious. No matter what, threats that threaten human life must be dealt with as quickly as possible (p. 4). Fifthly, human fulfillment is vital to human security. Methods that seek to keep people secure must not undermine their ability to achieve their goals and live a happy life (p. 4).

Methodology

Case selection

The analysis will focus on the country of Rwanda and the country's relationship with the World Bank, USAID, and The Global Fund. Rwanda has been chosen as the subject of analysis because previous research has indicated that economic aid structures (mainly the World Bank and IMF) had negative impacts on security in pre-conflict Rwanda. Rothe, Mullins, & Sandstrom (2008-09) argue that economic aid institutions such as the World Bank and IMF have had a negative influence on the Rwandan economy by plummeting the value of its exports, which was a major cause of the civil war. To have their loans repaid, the IMF and World Bank began to push governments to produce and export coffee, saying that the world economy could handle a large increase in coffee without tanking the prices. The price of coffee collapsed which caused Rwanda's economy to tank (pp 75-76). Its government budget decreased by 40% and its GDP per capita growth declined from 0.4% in 1981-1986 to -5.5% in 1987-1991. Economic collapse continued as the World Bank and IMF pushed to implement economic policy that continually failed. The economic collapse was seen by Hutu extremists as a Tutsi government ruining the country (p. 79). Overall, IMF- and World Bank- imposed financial policy had harmful consequences in Rwanda, threatening security in the country. Because this research focused on pre-conflict Rwanda, it is important to study post-conflict Rwanda to see if a similar phenomenon is occurring.

The World Bank, USAID, and The Global Fund have been chosen as the institutions to study because they are the three largest contributors of aid to Rwanda. Out of the 1.191 billion USD that Rwanda receives, the World Bank supplies 355 million, USAID 134.8 million, and The Global Fund 94.25 million, accounting for nearly half of all economic aid supplied to the country (U.S. Department of State, 2021). Because they are the biggest contributors, it follows that their contributions should also have the biggest impact on human security.

Method of analysis

This analysis will use a qualitative approach. Due to the exploratory nature of the research question, the study aims to understand the effect that economic aid structures have on

human security in post-conflict Rwanda. Qualitative content analysis (QCA) has been selected as the form of analysis for this study. It is defined as “a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns,” and it is suitable for classifying large amounts of textual data, can be used to analyze explicit and implicit communication, and helps provide knowledge and understanding of a given phenomenon based on a text (Hsieh & Shannon 2005, p. 1278). Due to these reasons, QCA is a suitable method of analysis for the study. As explained in the *case selection* section of the theoretical framework, the economic aid structures that will be focused on are the World Bank, USAID, and The Global Fund. To see what effects these institutions have on human security, their mission statements, objectives, and reports will be analyzed using QCA. The codes will be aligned with the five aspects of human security as outlined by Alkire (2002); safeguarding, the vital core, all human lives, critical pervasive threats, and long-term human fulfillment. Coding will be done in three phases: Open coding, axial coding, and selective coding. In open coding, the texts will be read and coded along the lines of all the codes. During axial coding, the codes will be categorized along the five aspects of human security. During selective coding, the codes will be analyzed to see whether they represent a positive, neutral, or negative development within their aspects. Finally, a discussion will be had to synthesize the developments in human security across the institutions to see what the overall effect of them has been. The codes and their categories can be found in Table 1: Codes per category. Certain codes mention “threats.” Whenever a code mentions threats, they refer to the main threats present in Rwanda. These are the threat of economic breakdown, disease (HIV/AIDS and COVID-19), extreme poverty, violent conflict, and climate change. Fulfillment and flourishing refer to the ability and opportunity for people to develop skills and abilities beyond those necessary for the satisfaction of basic needs. This is mainly done through school education but can also be done through the training of vocational skills.

Table 1: Codes per category

Categories	Safeguarding	Vital core	All human lives	Critical pervasive Threats	Human fulfillment
Codes	Protection from fatal threats, institutionalized protection, prevention of new threats, respect for human beings.	Defining rights and freedoms, basic needs (food, water, shelter, basic health), basic dignity.	gender, ethnic groups, religion, race, people-centered approach, discrimination, class.	identification of threats, preparation for threats.	freedom, democratic participation, realizing values, long-term good, fulfillment and flourishing.

Analysis: The World Bank

To understand what influence The World Bank has on human security in Rwanda, an analysis has been made of section III of The World Bank's Country Partnership Framework for the Republic of Rwanda FY21-FY26. This section gives an overview and outline of the Partnership Framework and shows the plans on how to implement the framework in the fiscal period of 2021-2026. Analyzing this section will help understand how The World Bank's goals, motivations, and methods align with human security. This chapter will present the analysis of the codes. Results can be found in Table 2: The World Bank Coding Results, in Appendix A.

Safeguarding

The World Bank is progressing aspects of safeguarding in Rwanda well by protecting people from fatal threats and by supporting state institutions. The main threats that The World Bank focuses on are COVID-19 and HIV/AIDS. The World Bank's strategy to protect people from COVID-19 is to quickly invest in and strengthen the national health system so that it can accommodate the influx of additional patients who are becoming hospitalized due to COVID-19. These investments would focus on strengthening case detection and infection tracing, improving care capacity, raising public awareness, and bolstering logistics and coordination. While this investment is meant to protect Rwandans from COVID-19, healthcare professionals can use these improvements to fight against other diseases, most notably HIV/AIDS. In this sense, this act of protection from fatal threats is also a form of protection through institutions.

When it comes to institutionalized protection, improvements in infrastructure were one of the largest topics as well-maintained roads and critical social services can help government institutions act quickly and effectively in the event of a threat. Additionally, the COVID-19 pandemic caused the Rwandan government to approve an Economic Recovery Plan, which will support people and families most affected financially by the pandemic. The World Bank plans also include an Early Childhood Development Program to assist government institutions in providing care for young children by increasing their coordination, oversight capacities and enhancing its effectiveness. Supporting Rwandan institutions like these will help the Rwandan government become less dependent on aid. Negatively, The World Bank has no plans on helping

Rwanda identify future threats. This is important to human security because states need to be aware of what threats are rising so that they can be properly prepared (Alkire 2002, p. 2). Overall, The World Bank's goals and methods regarding safeguarding align decently well with human security.

Vital core

When it comes to the vital core, The World Bank is putting a lot of effort into making basic life necessities accessible. The World Bank has many plans to provide these necessities to the Rwandan people. The basic need of shelter appeared the most throughout the report. They were all related to funding the development of affordable housing projects and the expansion of electricity grids across the country. The World Bank's housing plans seem effective. The development of housing is mainly focused on Kigali, which is currently suffering from a major housing shortage. Additionally, more than half of all new houses in Kigali need to cater to the affordable housing segment of the market to satisfy the demand for housing in the city. When it comes to electricity, large improvements are planned. Electricity in Rwanda is expensive, unreliable, and inaccessible. The World Bank aims to collaborate with the Rwandan government and other development partners to create a universal energy access program so that all Rwandans have electricity access by 2024.

The basic need that showed up the second-most was food. The World Bank's plans regarding food also overlap with their health plans because most food-related plans are associated with child nutrition. These plans involve investing in "high-impact interventions" such as micronutrient supplements, de-worming, and fortification to provide healthy food and promote healthy childhood growth. Such programs will be aimed at the poorest households in Rwanda, ensuring that all children can eat healthily. Other food-related programs involved the strengthening of agriculture and the agribusiness sector, increasing harvest yields. The health-related plans that were not related to food had strong ties to fighting gender inequality. Anemia is a common condition amongst Rwandan women and access to pre-natal care and childbirth care is uncommon, so The World Bank's plans to fight anemia and provide access to pre-natal and childbirth care have a positive impact on health and gender equality in Rwanda. Water was

mentioned little, and the only plan involved with clean drinking water was in the context of Rwanda's capital city, Kigali. There is a water supply shortage in Kigali that The World Bank aims to tackle by building water treatment plants, pumping stations, and storage reservoirs.

There was no discussion about defining rights and freedoms. This is interesting because Alkire (2002) argues that defining what rights and freedoms belong to the vital core is an essential part of human security. This is a process that needs to happen to effectively protect people and the social dynamics that they care about (p. 3). While this is important, The World Bank still makes a major positive impact on providing vital necessities to people in Rwanda.

All human lives

The World Bank is broadening the impact of security by working towards gender equality, fighting discrimination and class inequality, and by having a people-centered approach. The World Bank focuses on improving the status of women in Rwanda by providing access to prenatal care and medical professionals during childbirth and by combating anemia (as mentioned in the "vital core" subsection). Secondly, there is a focus on including women in decision-making positions and economic empowerment.

The World Bank also has a people-centered approach to economy-building. This is important to human security because the safety and well-being of people should be the goal of economy-building, not the means (Alkire, 2002, pp. 3-4). A core component of economic development in Rwanda in The World Bank's plans is the development of Rwanda's population into an effective and productive community. The World Bank attempts to reduce class inequality by reducing the wealth gap, creating economic opportunities for impoverished people, and focusing public investments towards the poor. Additionally, The World Bank is working towards creating an inclusive economy, ensuring that everyone will have access to work. This shows that The World Bank's plans for economic development have all people in mind, creating security for all who live in Rwanda.

The World Bank did not discuss plans regarding tensions between ethnic groups, race, or religion in their report. From this, it can be concluded that the organization does not see these cleavages as threats to security and development in Rwanda. It is surprising to see that The

World Bank has no discussion regarding ethnic groups because ethnic conflict was a major security threat. While these topics are absent, The World Bank is making security and development accessible to as many Rwandans as possible, showing good progress in this aspect of human security.

Critical pervasive threats

Regarding this aspect of human security, The World Bank shows great progress in preparing Rwanda for threats but is not focused on helping the country identify future threats. Climate was the main threat that The World Bank wants to prepare for. Climate change is creating new threats that people across the world must prepare for. The World Bank focuses on Rwanda's agriculture, the protection of urban landscapes from natural disasters, and the reduction of carbon emissions. Plans related to preparation for disease were focused mainly on COVID-19, with one code also being related to HIV/AIDS. All discussion of disease also had an economic factor because the COVID-19 pandemic threatens the stability of Rwanda's economy. The World Bank wants to create protection measures for small and medium enterprises in Rwanda to cushion the economic impact of the pandemic. Natural disasters were discussed as well, but little and vaguely as The World Bank simply stated that they want to improve disaster management. This might be in reference to climate disasters, but it is unclear. Conflict appeared negatively because The World Bank stated that they do not consider Rwanda a fragile situation and they do not target reduction in conflict, fragility, and violence. Contrasting from their efforts in preparing for threats, The World Bank does little to help Rwanda help identify future threats. The organization set up an institution to help find barriers that prevent the reduction of stunted growth among young children, in addition to supporting the Rwandan government in conducting research into nutrition.

Long-term human fulfillment

The World Bank is showing progress in this aspect of human security by helping people receive an education or skills training and by helping build sustainable infrastructure. The organization is mainly focused on improving primary education and the ability for Rwandans to learn vocational skills. These kinds of education will help people grow up mentally and

emotionally, and they will be able to pursue their own goals through education and vocational skills. The World Bank aims to strengthen the quality of primary education through the teaching workforce. One negative aspect to these plans is that the COVID-19 pandemic forced schools to close, causing many children miss education for a long period of time. Remote education through mass broadcasting tools has been put into effect but it does not reach all students. When it comes to long-term good, The World Bank wants to create climate-compatible and sustainable urban infrastructure in cities throughout Rwanda. This plan should help cities be safer to live in and more climate friendly. The World Bank did not discuss anything about freedom, democratic participation, or helping Rwandans realize human rights and values. This shows that The World Bank does not prioritize the improvement of political and social freedoms within Rwanda, nor does the organization link its methods and goals to Rwanda's community values.

Analysis: USAID

The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) is an agency of the United States' government, responsible for administering foreign aid and development assistance. An analysis has been made of the "Our Work" section and its subsections on USAID's website about Rwanda. This section gives an overview and outline of their goals and methods. Analyzing it will help understand USAID's impact on human security in Rwanda. Results can be found in Table 3: USAID Coding Results, in Appendix A.

Safeguarding

When it comes to safeguarding, USAID's plans make Rwanda safer but there are missing elements and some plans do not seem effective. Most plans regarding combating fatal threats are related to HIV/AIDS and malaria but there is no mention of combating the COVID-19 pandemic. The subjects of analysis were all last updated on April 13th, 2022, two years into the pandemic. Doing nothing to combat the pandemic is a major oversight by USAID. Secondly, USAID's plans to prevent the spread of malaria are likely to have unforeseen consequences. USAID plans make liberal use of insecticides, saying that in 2017, an estimated 320,000 homes had been sprayed with insecticide. While malaria is a dangerous disease, this heavy use of insect poison might have an adverse effect on the health of the people who live in homes that have been treated by it, and the insecticides could also be environmental pollutants. This could be an unforeseen new threat to human safety. USAID's plans on helping Rwanda institutionalize security seem effective. They aim to improve rule of law and administrative justice, as well as the healthcare sector through the capacity-building of service providers, improving logistics, and decentralizing the health sector. USAID is not focused on helping Rwanda prevent new threats. Overall, USAID shows good progress regarding institutionalization of security and middling progress in fighting fatal threats.

Vital core

When it comes to ensuring access to basic needs, USAID shows great progress with all basic needs except for shelter. Food-related plans involved improving crop yields, food security programs, and improving nutrition. Health-related plans involved improving reproductive health services, newborn and child health, providing emotional support services for people and children living with HIV/AIDS, and improving hygiene practices. Water-related plans involved providing clean water to everyone in Rwanda. There were no plans involving shelter, defining rights and freedoms, or basic dignity.

These plans show that USAID does a good job of improving human security in Rwanda when it comes to basic needs but lacks in other aspects. The large number of plans about basic needs is good because these plans involve the most vital of elements needed for survival. On a negative note, USAID fails at defining what the important rights and freedoms in Rwanda are. This task is an important one, as those rights and freedoms determine what aspects of life are most important to a country and its communities. Failing to define important rights and freedoms thus limits USAID in its job of improving human security. Additionally, the lack of discussion regarding dignity is worrying because a part of human security is a respect and dignity that is given by governments and international organizations to people. It is not enough for people to be safer; they must also be happy and be treated with respect.

The codes in this category show the linkages between security threats. For example, in the case of public health, improving access to reproductive health services is a benefit to human security by itself but it also helps protect people from HIV/AIDS by increasing access to condoms and medication such as PrEP. Similarly, improving hygiene leads to increased health but also helps prevent the spread of infectious diseases such as COVID-19.

All human lives

USAID's impact on this aspect of human security is mediocre. While they show to be lessening ethnic tensions in Rwanda and working towards gender equality, USAID does not have a people-centered approach, nor did they have any discussion surrounding class inequality and discrimination. When it comes to having a people-centered approach, USAID barely reach this

target. Human security argues that economic development and security should be an instrument towards human development and human rights. In USAID's perspective, this is the other way around. USAID spends much more time elaborating on how to achieve economic growth and an increase in productivity and output but does not put this in the context of human beings. So, while USAID does have plans to provide stable employment and improving the skills of the Rwandan workforce, their approach is not in line with human security. Additionally, the absence of any discussion surrounding class or discrimination indicates that USAID's goals and methods do not account for any disparity in wealth between different groups in Rwanda or universal accessibility of the economy and social services. It is important for human security to include plans on reducing wealth inequality, as economic development without it will leave some people behind, lessening economic security for those people. This is especially the case for people who have more difficulty finding employment, such as people with disabilities. Economic development is not good enough if it does not positively affect all human lives. The discussion of ethnic tension does signal a positive development. Maintaining moments of reconciliation for communities is vital for societal healing, ensuring that the future of Rwanda will be inclusive towards Hutu and Tutsi people. Additionally, USAID helping women understand their rights and freedoms is helping to create gender equality.

Critical pervasive threats

The "Preparation for threats" code appeared positively once, in the context of preparing agricultural programs to adapt to climate shocks. The "identification of threats" code did not appear. The lack of codes in this category shows two things. Firstly, it shows that USAID's goals are more focused on combating the problems that already exist in Rwanda. Secondly, the lack of codes shows that USAID's goals barely include preparing Rwanda for future threats such as climate change, economic crashes, or violent conflict. By comparing this category of codes to the "safeguarding" category, both the difference in the number of codes and the variation of contexts that the codes appeared in shows that both statements are true. The one code that did appear was a general statement and the source did not explain what methods USAID will use and what scope their preparation has. The lack of preparation for threats by USAID is dangerous for human security. Actors must be as ready as they can be for threats to reduce harm done to humans, their

communities, and the core activities and functions that those communities have. While combating current threats is important, preparation for threats is critical to reduce the human cost of future threats. The absence of the “identification of threats” code is also worrying. To properly prepare for future threats, plans and institutions must be in place to discover and determine what threats the future can hold. While it is impossible to know exactly what will happen, having experts analyze current affairs can help policy that affects the future, hopefully reducing the human cost of future threats.

Long-term human fulfillment

USAID shows to improve the long-term fulfillment of Rwandans through a variety of methods. Firstly, the organization aims to improve early education through the training of teachers and introduction of language acquisition skills, by training Rwandans to work in the agricultural sector, and through providing adolescents with opportunities for work experience and skill acquisition. Education and skill acquisition is an important aspect of human security because it allows people to learn about a wide variety of topics, allowing people to choose their own paths in life. This leads to an increase in the fulfillment that people have in their life because they will have a greater say in their life. USAID’s dedication to providing education and skills training thus helps Rwandans feel fulfilled. Similarly, democratic participation is an important aspect of human fulfillment because it allows people to have a greater say in the decisions of their government. USAID does show an intention to improve democratic participation but their explanation is shallow. It could be improved by adding further details on what strategies they employ. USAID is also working to increase Rwandans’ awareness of the human rights that they have. This helps Rwandans become more politically active because they will have a greater understanding of what life they deserve. USAID does not have any plans to improve political freedom. Political freedom is vital to democracy and democratic participation, but it is not mentioned in their report. Overall, USAID’s plans to improve human fulfillment seem to be effective but need to be expanded more to include political freedom.

Analysis – The Global Fund

The Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (simply known as The Global Fund) is an international organization that aims to attract and invest resources to end the HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, and malaria epidemics across the world. It was founded in 2002 and invests 4 billion USD a year globally to fight these diseases. The document that has been used for this analysis is “Fight For What Counts. Investment Case, Seventh Replenishment 2022”. This document outlines the goals and methods that The Global Fund will use from 2022 until 2026. Unlike the documents used for the analysis of The World Bank and USAID, this document is not focused on Rwanda because it outlines The Global Fund’s global strategy. The organization does not have a document pertaining to Rwanda specifically, so this is the best alternative. The goals and methods of The Global Fund are relevant to this research because it is the third largest source of international economic aid in Rwanda, as the country suffers from many cases in all three diseases (U.S. Department of State, 2019). Results can be found in Table 4: The Global Fund Coding Results, in Appendix A.

Safeguarding

When it comes to safeguarding, The Global Fund shows great signs of progress. Safeguarding, according to Alkire (2002), is about creating responsive and preventative institutions that protect people from events beyond their control (p. 2). In this sense, The Global Fund shows that they are reaching this goal effectively. Their focus is to protect people from HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, and malaria, and they excel in it. They have set clear and achievable goals, explain what methods they will use to achieve those goals, and show accomplishments from previous endeavors that prove that their methods are effective. An addition in this report that stands out, especially in comparison to the other organizations, is that The Global Fund includes critiques of their previous goals and methods. While these sections have been coded as negative developments because they show the weaknesses of The Global Fund, the inclusion of self-critique shows that the organization is willing and trying to learn and improve. Another aspect of the document that shows progress with safeguarding is the development of protective institutions. The COVID-19 pandemic has negatively affected The Global Fund’s ability to combat other diseases, but the pandemic has forced states to invest heavily in healthcare

institutions over the last two years. Now that these are in place, combating HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, and malaria will become easier because the investments made for the COVID-19 pandemic can be used to fight other diseases.

Vital core

The role of the Vital core is to ensure that all people have access to the most important and necessary aspects of human life (Alkire 2002, p. 3). When it comes to this aspect of human security, The Global Fund shows a little progress. The Global Fund does not have any plans to help improve food, water, or shelter security, nor does it mention the importance of basic dignity. Therefore, it has a neutral impact on these aspects of the Vital Core. The basic health code came up twice, both times alongside the “protection from fatal threats” code. This shows an interesting link between combating disease epidemics and the development of healthcare systems. When state and international actors combat disease, they create positive developments for healthcare systems overall. This is a similar phenomenon as the one described in the *safeguarding* subsection, but the main difference is that in this context the combating of disease epidemics creates a better overall healthcare system rather than a system that is better at only fighting disease epidemics. For example, the fighting of epidemics has caused The Global Fund to push for cheaper medicine prices over the world to prevent pre-existing health issues from becoming a larger problem while the organization is fighting epidemics.

All human lives

According to Alkire (2002), “all human lives” is an aspect of human security because every person and community is deserving of protection, no matter their background, gender, class, religion, or any other feature (pp. 3-4). When it comes to this aspect of human security, The Global Fund progresses well. The organization has a strong focus on a people-centered approach, consistently shows willingness to help all peoples in its goals to eradicate disease, and its analyses include dimensions of gender. The Global Fund’s goals are focused on the eradication of the disease and their primary motivation for doing so is simply to increase the welfare of people across the world. Their reports heavily focus on the experiences of people

across the world that help them accomplish their goals. These experiences are used to develop and enhance the methods that The Global Fund uses. The people featured in the report are also highly diverse, showing the range of people that The Global Fund works with. This is important because a diverse group will be better at creating effective methods that apply to as broad a range of people as possible and reaching marginalized communities to help them combat disease. Additionally, the analysis of The Global Fund includes dimensions of gender. For example, their methods for preventing HIV/AIDS from spreading is to perform extra HIV/AIDS tests on women to detect whether they have it, as pregnant women can transmit the disease to fetuses they carry. Another example is that The Global Fund attempts to create greater access to healthcare for women because women in some parts of the world have greater difficulty getting healthcare compared to men. These dimensions of the analysis help fight disease while also creating a fairer world.

Critical pervasive threats

This aspect of human security is important because actors must not only try to fight threats, but also create systems to identify future threats and plans to prepare for those threats to minimize harm done to people (Alkire 2002, p. 4). The Global Fund shows good progress in this aspect of human security. The main threats that The Global Fund currently prepares for are the increasing resistance of tuberculosis against medication, and the development of new diseases and mutations of current diseases due to climate change. These are both important topics, so the inclusion of The Global Fund's plans on these topics shows that the organization is preparing for the future. The main form of helping countries to identify threats is through disease outbreak reporting of COVID-19. As discussed in the "Safeguarding" subsection, COVID-19 has radically changed the way in which diseases must be combated, so helping countries to identify when and where COVID-19 outbreaks are going to occur will help them fight disease more effectively.

Long-term human fulfillment

This aspect of human security is important because the prevention and protection from threats is not enough to create human lives worth living. People must also be free to follow the

path they set for themselves and be happy (Alkire 2002, p. 4). The Global Fund makes slight progress in this aspect of human security. While the organization is not focused on developing human fulfillment, their actions have some consequences in this aspect. Firstly, The Global Fund trains people across the world to help them fight disease within their own communities. This helps achieve fulfillment because people who want to pursue a career in medical care are given opportunities to do so by The Global Fund. The organization also helps create long-term good in countries when it comes to creating sustainable energy. In order to make the creation of medicine more efficient, The Global Fund pushes for environmentally friendly forms of energy production such as solar or wind power. The effect that The Global Fund has on human fulfillment through its mission of combating disease shows how interrelated the different aspects of human security are. Protecting people from fatal threats helps those protecting others find what they want to do with their time, leading to more fulfilling lives.

Conclusion & Discussion

This research has shown that economic aid institutions have a positive impact on human security in Rwanda. While these institutions focus on some aspects of human security more than others, it is evident that the safety, wellbeing, and fulfillment of people and their communities is the goal of security for the institutions in this research. This is a clear improvement when compared to their goals of the 20th century, when economic development was their main emphasis (Rothe, Mullins, & Sandstrom, 2008-09, pp. 75-76). The findings of this research fall in line with previous research which argued that international organizations have become better at creating sustainable development and tackling human security issues the end of the Cold War (Gervais, 2003, pp. 303-304) (Bearce & Tirone, 2010, p. 848).

Some aspects of human security are developed better than others and within each aspect there are codes that are much more frequent than others. The safeguarding aspect of human security is developing well, although most of the focus of aid institutions is placed on protecting people and building up state institutions that can protect people. There is no emphasis placed on preventing new threats. There is also no emphasis on including respect for human beings while fighting fatal threats but because the main threats in Rwanda are disease and environmental ones instead of violent conflict, it makes sense that basic respect is not emphasized. The fight is against environmental factors, not other human beings.

The vital core aspect of human security is developed well by The World Bank and USAID while The Global Fund does not focus on it. There is a heavy focus from all institutions on health and The World Bank and USAID also focus on food and water. Additionally, shelter is developed by The World Bank. The vital core of human life is protected well by these institutions, fighting to make sure that Rwandans can survive. These institutions also focus heavily on ensuring that all peoples are protected and safe as there is a strong emphasis on gender equality, a people-centered approach, and fighting economic and social discrimination. From the research, it can also be seen that these institutions place little emphasis on religion and race.

The three institutions place a heavy focus on preparing Rwanda for known threats such as climate and the repercussions of pandemics and epidemics but place little emphasis on developing state institutions that can identify threats. Doing so makes states more dependent on

international institutions for safety. The institutions also place a heavy emphasis on education and training for children and young adults, helping them achieve a brighter future for themselves and their communities. There is a small focus on helping states become more environmentally friendly, but there is no emphasis on increasing democratic participation and freedoms in Rwanda, nor is there much emphasis on helping Rwandans identify and realize community values and human rights.

While there is a long road ahead for Rwanda's economic and political development, The World Bank, The Global Fund, and USAID all show that they are placing humans at the front of security and development. Human security is progressing well, causing all Rwandans to live better, healthier, and more fulfilled lives.

Limitations

During the research process, one limitation appeared. Two topics came up in the documents of The World Bank: Public transport and internet access. These are aspects of life that would improve human security greatly by physically and digitally providing people with access to information and services, but they did not fit in well with Alkire's (2002) framework of human security. Access to the internet is especially important as the world is becoming increasingly digitalized. Because these topics did not fit in well with the theoretical framework used in the research, they were not coded. It is important to note, however, that internet access and public transportation are becoming more important aspects of human life, so future frameworks on human security should include them as well.

Policy implications

The research shows what policy economic aid institutions emphasize. While human security is developing well in Rwanda, there are certain aspects that need to be discussed more, and that policy needs to target. As of now, the three institutions covered in the research place little emphasis on preventing new threats from forming. This works in tandem with the lack of policy that focuses on building up institutions that can identify current and future threats within states. If states lack the capacity to identify future threats, they have no chance of preventing those threats (Alkire, 2002, p. 2). Therefore, an important addition to the plans of economic aid

institutions is the creation and support of state-controlled institutions that can identify future threats.

Another point of focus that should be included by economic aid institutions is increasing democratic participation and political freedom. Rwandans have little political rights and civil liberties. Opposition candidates are often impeded by local authorities while the government hold mandatory “solidarity camps” where RPF speakers skew political discussions in favor of President Kagame. It is also difficult for people to organize themselves politically, as the Rwandan Governance Board can practically deny any group from becoming an official political party. (Freedom House, 2021). Democracy and self-determinations are an important part of human security, so institutions could greatly develop human security by pushing for democratization in Rwanda.

Future research

Many other research projects can be derived from this research. Future research could focus on other cases to understand the influence of economic aid institutions on human security in other countries. These kinds of studies will bring new discussions to development studies and will provide further insights into this and similar research. Another type of research project that can be conducted is an analysis of the impact of economic aid institutions on human security in Rwanda that focuses on the implementation of plans. Future research could focus on how these institutions implement their plans and what kind of influence implementation has on human security. This could be researched through interviews with the local population to see how they experience the influence of economic aid institutions.

Appendix A: Results Tables

Table 2: The World Bank Coding Results			
Category	Code	Number of positive codes	Number of negative codes
Safeguarding	Protection from fatal threats	3	0
	Institutionalized Protection	2	0
	Respect for human beings	0	0
	Prevention of new threats	0	0
Vital core	Basic needs (food)	5	1
	Basic needs (water)	1	0
	Basic needs (shelter)	7	0
	Basic needs (health)	3	0
	Basic dignity	0	0
All human lives	Gender	6	0
	Ethnic groups	0	0
	Religion	0	0
	Race	0	0
	People-centered approach	4	0
	Discrimination	4	0
	Class	3	0
Critical pervasive threats	Identification of threats	1	0
	Preparation for threats	11	1
Long-term human fulfillment	Freedom	0	0
	Democratic participation	0	0
	Realizing values	0	0
	Long-term good	1	0
	Fulfillment and flourishing	7	1

Table 3: USAID Coding Results

Category	Code	Number of positive codes	Number of negative codes
Safeguarding	Protection from fatal threats	4	0
	Institutionalized Protection	5	0
	Respect for human beings	0	0
	Prevention of new threats	0	0
Vital core	Basic needs (food)	5	0
	Basic needs (water)	2	0
	Basic needs (shelter)	0	0
	Basic needs (health)	5	0
	Basic dignity	0	0
All human lives	Gender	1	0
	Ethnic groups	2	0
	Religion	0	0
	Race	0	0
	People-centered approach	2	0
	Discrimination	0	0
	Class	0	0
Critical pervasive threats	Identification of threats	0	0
	Preparation for threats	1	0
Long-term human fulfillment	Freedom	0	0
	Democratic participation	1	0
	Realizing values	2	0
	Long-term good	0	0
	Fulfillment and flourishing	6	0

Table 4: The Global Fund Coding Results			
Category	Code	Number of positive codes	Number of negative codes
Safeguarding	Protection from fatal threats	12	2
	Institutionalized Protection	4	0
	Respect for human beings	0	0
	Prevention of new threats	0	0
Vital core	Basic needs (food)	0	0
	Basic needs (water)	0	0
	Basic needs (shelter)	0	0
	Basic needs (health)	2	0
	Basic dignity	0	0
All human lives	Gender	4	0
	Ethnic groups	0	0
	Religion	0	0
	Race	0	0
	People-centered approach	7	0
	Discrimination	6	0
	Class	1	0
Critical pervasive threats	Identification of threats	1	0
	Preparation for threats	6	0
Human fulfillment	Freedom	0	0
	Democratic participation	0	0
	Realizing values	0	0
	Long-term good	1	0
	Fulfillment and flourishing	1	0

List of References

- Abbott, P., Rwirahira, J. (2012). Aid Effectiveness in Rwanda: Who Benefits? *Institute of Policy Analysis and Research – Rwanda*. 1-104.
- Alkire, S. (2002). A Conceptual Framework for Human Security. *Centre for Research on Inequality, Human Security and Ethnicity, CRISE*. 1-52.
- Bearce, D. H., Tirone, D. C. (2010). Foreign Aid Effectiveness and the Strategic Goals of Donor Governments. *The Journal of Politics* 72(3). 837-851.
- Freedom House (2022). Freedom In the World: Rwanda 2021. Retrieved from <https://freedomhouse.org/country/rwanda/freedom-world/2021>
- Gervais, M. (2003). Human security and reconstruction efforts in Rwanda: Impact on the lives of women. *Development in Practice* 13(5). 301-314.
- The Global Fund. (2022). *Fight For What Counts. Investment Case, Seventh Replenishment 2022*.
- Guichaoua, A. (2020). Counting the Rwandan Victims of War and Genocide: Concluding Reflections. *Journal of Genocide Research*, 22(1). 125-141.
- Hsieh, H. F., & Shannon, S. E. (2005). Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qualitative Health Research*, 15(9), 1277–1288.
- Lopez, H., & Wodon, Q. (2005). The Economic Impact of Armed Conflict in Rwanda. *Journal of African Economies*, 14(4). 586-602.
- OECD Library. *Official Development Assistance (ODA)*. Retrieved from https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/official-development-assistance-oda/indicator-group/english_5136f9ba-en#:~:text=DATA-

[.Official%20development%20assistance%20\(ODA\)%20is%20defined%20as%20govern-ment%20aid%20designed,for%20military%20purposes%20are%20excluded.](#)

Rothe, D. L., Mullins, C. W., Sandstrom, K. (2008-2009). The Rwandan Genocide: International Finance Policies and Human Rights. *Social Justice* 35(3). 66-86.

USAID. (2022). Agriculture and Food Security. Retrieved from <https://www.usaid.gov/rwanda/agriculture-and-food-security>

USAID. (2022). Democracy, Human Rights, and Governance. Retrieved from <https://www.usaid.gov/rwanda/democracy-human-rights-and-governance>

USAID. (2022). Economic Growth and Trade. Retrieved from <https://www.usaid.gov/rwanda/economic-growth-and-trade>

USAID. (2022). Education. Retrieved from <https://www.usaid.gov/rwanda/education>

USAID. (2022). Global Health. Retrieved from <https://www.usaid.gov/rwanda/global-health>

U.S. Department of State. (2021). *U.S. Foreigns Assistance By Country* [Data file]. Retrieved from. <https://foreignassistance.gov/cd/rwanda/2019/obligations/1>

The World Bank. (2020). “III. World Bank Group Partnership.” In *Country Partnership Framework For the Republic of Rwanda, FY21-FY26*.

The World Bank. (2022). *Net official development assistance and official aid received* [Data file]. Retrieved from <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/DT.ODA.ALLD.CD?end=2019&locations=RW&start=1981>