# A Comparative Critical Stylistic Analysis of Racial Othering: An Analysis of H.P. Lovecraft's "Call of Cthulhu," "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" and Alan Moore's The Courtyard, Neonomicon and Providence

El Masoudi, Hamza

## Citation

# A Comparative Critical Stylistic Analysis of Racial Othering:

An Analysis of  H.P. Lovecraft's "Call of Cthulhu," "The Shadow Over Innsmouth"

and Alan Moore's *The Courtyard, Neonomicon* and *Providence*

**Name:** Hamza El Masoudi

**Student Number:** S1311824

**First Reader:** Dr. E.J. van Leeuwen

**Second Reader:** Dr. M.S. Newton

**Specialisation:** English Literature and Culture

**Academic Year:** 2021 - 2022

**Table of Contents**

# 1    Introduction

This thesis explores the stylistic representation of otherness in relation to race in the works of H.P. Lovecraft and Alan Moore's adaptations of the American Horror author. It does so by forming a critical framework based on the theories in critical stylistics by Lesley Jeffries, to formulate a replicable methodology for the analysis of adaptations of Lovecraft's influential works. This framework is applied with the aim to compare and contrast the key stylistic features present in two of Lovecraft's seminal works, "The Call of Cthulhu" (1928) and "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" (1936) with Alan Moore's trilogy of graphic novels: *The Courtyard* (2003)*, Neonomicon* (2010) and *Providence* (2015-2017), which adapt core aspects of Lovecraft's Cosmic Horror. The overall aim is to determine to what degree Lovecraft's stylistic choices in representing otherness influenced the ideological expression of (racial) otherness in Moore's adaptations. Jeffries model is combined with scholarship on graphic novel analysis to show how Lovecraft's literary style is adapted to the visual medium of the graphic novel. This combination of textual and visual tools enable a comprehensive analysis of the stylistic choices in graphic novels which may convey an ideological expression. In this thesis I aim to answer the following research questions:

1. How are Lovecraft's ideological ideas on race and their implications reflected and communicated in the style of "The Call of Cthulhu" and "The Shadow Over Innsmouth, and what role do issues of race and racial othering play in understanding Lovecraft's depictions of monstrous horrors?

2. How have Lovecraft's ideological views on race and racial othering informed his stylistic choices in his two seminal works: "The Call of Cthulhu" and "The Shadow over Innsmouth?

3. How do the modern adaptations of Alan Moore: *The Courtyard, Neonomicon,* and *Providence* deal with the themes and stylistic choices of racism and racial othering when adapting the works to the graphic novel medium?

This introduction will present a brief account of Lovecraft's life and will outline the racism which permeated his society and infused most of the author's public and private life. Further, it will present an overview of Alan Moore's work in graphic novels, and his attitudes and methods in writing his canonical works. Next, the introduction will discuss where Lovecraft's use of othering falls within the greater tradition of Gothic fiction. Finally, it will present the linguistic foundation on which the critical stylistic analysis of racial othering in chapter four is built.

Chapter two establishes the theoretical framework and introduces critical stylistics as an analytical tool for uncovering ideological subtexts in popular fiction. The chapter introduces the relevant stylistic tools with which this thesis aims to analyse Lovecraft and Moore's works. Each tool serves to analyse a different stylistic choice. Their relevance and application are explored to justify their part in the analysis. In addition, specific tools for analysing style in graphic novels are outlined and discussed. These tools help to analyse the visual and unique elements of the graphic novel medium, which would otherwise go overlooked.

Chapter three explores the corpus discussed within this thesis, providing a brief overview of the plot and major themes of the stories. Furthermore, it will analyse the works relevancy to the themes of racial othering and the connection between Lovecraft's works and Moore's adaptation. Finally, the chapter outlines the methodology by which the analysis is performed and justifies these choices based on established methodological practices.

Chapter four analyses Lovecraft's "The Call of Cthulhu," "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" and Moore's *The Courtyard, Neonomicon* and *Providence* against the theoretical

framework outlined in chapter two. Further, analysis of both sets of works are compared with each other, exploring the similarities and differences in the stylistic representation of racial othering.

Chapter five, the conclusion, outlines the findings and discusses the results produced by the analysis. These are further explored within a broader context of relations between the Gothic genre, monstrosity and othering in both literary fiction and graphic novels. Furthermore, it will reiterate the key conclusions drawn from the analysis, discuss the findings and critically reflect on the results.

## 1.1    H.P. Lovecraft: Racism in Cosmic Horror

Howard Phillips Lovecraft lived from 1890 until his passing in 1937. Lovecraft was an author, journalist, editor and wrote over 100,000 letters throughout his life. He is most known for his works that culminated into what is now known as the Cthulhu mythos. A series of stories which together form an interconnected universe filled with horrific alien creatures, cosmic deities, a grimoire called the *Necronomicon*, and forbidden magical rituals performed by humans who attempt to connect with the so-called Old Ones. Lovecraft's work inspired many authors who drew upon his mythos and literary philosophy resulting in a subgenre now known as Lovecraftian horror. His works have been adapted into creative endeavours across a wide array of media, and have gone on to inspire authors, artists, musicians, and filmmakers to this day (Smith 11), including the seminal graphic novelist Alan Moore.

Lovecraft's literary endeavours consist primarily of short stories submitted to various magazines, most notably *Weird Tales.* These magazines were often considered low-brow and cheap – pulp magazines so to speak – which made it difficult for Lovecraft to reach a broader audience. However, through these publications, Lovecraft amassed a niche readership which allowed him to continue his work as an author of weird fiction, slowly amassing more

popularity. China Miéville explains that weird fiction's distinguishing characteristics is that its narrative reveals previously unnoticed and sometimes distant horrors and pulls them into the everyday lives of its characters (511). Lovecraft's Cthulhu Mythos encapsulates this idea, as its stories present indescribable horrors that dominate the attention of the narrative by its intrusion of the ordinary New England characters' world, instilling them with unspeakable fears. Lovecraft's weird fiction is also unique as most of it focuses on "Atmosphere, not action" (Lovecraft, *Weird Fiction*). The plot becomes secondary to the monstrous others Lovecraft introduces to the reader; tableaux like episodes function as nearly static scenes through which Lovecraft can slowly reveal the hidden horrors in his constructed worlds (Miéville 512). Lovecraft's horrors are unique precisely because they are presented as already existing and being among us. The true horror lies in recognising and acknowledging their existence (Wilson 52), and their complete disregard for humanity.

However, today it is hard to read Lovecraft's carefully crafted horror tales, and even more so his collection of letters, magazine articles and poems, without noticing the recurring theme of white supremacy, racism, and bigotry. Lovecraft's submissions to various magazines brought him in contact with weird fiction publishers, authors and readers with whom he exchanged numerous letters. In these letters, Lovecraft writes extensively on his ideas on fiction or his personal interests in for instance science and folklore. However, these letters also reveal Lovecraft's views on race and his hatred for (and fear of) miscegenation. Lovecraft was heavily invested in the idea of lineage and race. So much so that he outlines in detail the supremacy of the Teuton race and expresses his fear of its degradation and eventual disappearance at the hands of Black or Jewish people (Lovecraft et al. 186). Lovecraft's attitudes often went beyond what would have been common in his time, and it is in particular during his stay in New York that his attitudes towards other races radicalised (Houellebecq et al. 76). In one letter Lovecraft writes:

> I find it hard to conceive of anything more utterly and ultimately loathesome… The organic things – Italo-Semitico-Mongoloid – inhabiting that awful cesspool could not by any stretch of the imagination be call'd human. They were monstrous and nebulous adumbrations of the pithecanthropoid and amoebal; vaguely moulded from some stinking viscous slime of earth's corruption. (*Letters* 333)

In this letter, Lovecraft dismisses groups of people as non-human, and equates them to something monstrous. In a letter to Maurice W. Moe, Lovecraft described New York's Chinatown as "a bastard mess of stewing mongrel flesh without intellect" (*Letters* 181). These attitudes towards minority communities informed much of Lovecraft's literary expression, perhaps most explicitly in "The Horror at Red Hook" (1925), a detective story which Joshi describes as "nothing but a shriek of rage and loathing at the 'foreigners' who have taken New York away from the white people…" (220).

Lovecraft's poems were often more explicit and direct in their racism than his other literary works. In Lovecraft's "On the Creation of Niggers," Gods having just created both man and beast, require something in between to bridge the two. As a result they decide to create black people: A beast they wrought, in semi-human figure, / Filled it with vice, and called the thing a NIGGER" (Lovecraft, "Creation" 95). Here Lovecraft explicitly states a characterization of black people in which they are less than human. However, Lovecraft did not only hate black people, but also feared the threat they posed to white people, and the consequences of their emancipation. In his own magazine, Lovecraft argues for "[t]he natural and scientifically just sentiment which keeps the African black from contaminating the Caucasian population of the United States…and the Northern people must occasionally be reminded of the danger which they incur in admitting him too freely to the privileges of society and government" (Lovecraft, *Conservative* 45). In his poem "De Triumpho Naturae: The Triumph of Nature over Northern Ignorance" (1905), Lovecraft chastises the northern

American states for their liberation of black slaves and suggests that by doing so they ensured their demise. Lovecraft dedicated the poem to William Benjamin Smith. Smith was a contemporary author to Lovecraft, who suggested that black people's inherent physical and psychological inferiority would undoubtedly result in their disappearance after their liberation (Joshi 55). This was a preferred outcome for Lovecraft, rather than the destruction of white American culture and traditions due to race mixing, which Lovecraft normally warns of (Evans 109). Unsurprisingly, many of Lovecraft's most significant stories revolve around the encounters with monstrous others by white Anglo Saxon Protestant men. Encounters so horrifying that his protagonists want to erase their memories of them. The unfamiliar and atypical alien creatures are viewed as an existential threat as any involvement with them could spell the potential demise of the white race: "We live on a placid island of ignorance in the midst of black seas of infinity, and it was not meant that we should voyage far…" and if we do "we shall either go mad from the revelation or flee from the deadly light into the peace and safety of a new dark age" (Lovecraft, "Cthulhu" 124). The dividing line between the racial other and the monstrous other further disappears when non-white characters in Lovecraft's works must contest for the position of the dangerous other. Lovecraft creates a combination of these two categories with similar dangers. "In Lovecraft's strange fusion of race and monstrosity, however, the ability to pass refers not only to passing for white, but to pass for human" (Avery 75) This is represented in the monsters from "The Shadow Over Innsmouth," where the narrator's own monstrous lineage is only later discovered.

Nevertheless, there are still many apologists when it comes to Lovecraft's attitudes towards race. Some consider him a product of his time or will provide readings that are palatable for modern readers. Saler describes "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" as a story where the narrator "accepts his hybrid nature and the hybrid community from which he came" (151). In addition, Saler claims that, in his later life, Lovecraft shifted his negativity

from race to culture: "[h]is writings from this period reflect a far greater tolerance for difference than he had shown previously" (151). However, as Shershow & Michaelsen explain, these arguments merely attempt to replace race with culture, without addressing the underlying concepts prevalent throughout Lovecraft's work (18-19). According to Eil, it was exactly "…this sense that he's alone, that he's surrounded by enemies and everything is hostile to him" (n.p.) that make Lovecraft's stories so evocative. In many ways Lovecraft was describing his lived experience, and despite whatever moral objections readers may have, denying that would "…destroy the stories" (Eil n.p.).

Lovecraft's similar treatment of racial and monstrous others is essential to this analysis of Lovecraft's work, and the analysis of the works and adaptations that have been influenced by him. Claverie explains "[f]or anti-racist and liberal fans, Lovecraft's racism is a problem; for many fans, it is something to ignore, because Lovecraft was a 'man of his time'; but for white supremacist fans, it is the attraction" (80). However, Claverie goes on to argue that any attitude unwilling to condemn Lovecraft's racism risks becoming indistinguishable from modern white nationalist sentiments. These defend Lovecraft based on agreeable principles such as free speech, or by claiming he was amongst like-minded people in his time. However, this thinking fails to recognise the potential harm that lies in normalising the racist subtext in Lovecraft's works, and the threat that lies in its reproduction in the many modern adaptations and works inspired by Lovecraft's influential bibliography. "Despite the increasing discussion of Lovecraft's racism in fan and literary circles," Claverie says, "fictional responses to Lovecraft that even obliquely address his racism, let alone critique it, are rare" (87). This thesis uses a critical stylistic analysis to research the degree to which Lovecraft's racism and racial othering survives Alan Moore's adaptation process.

1.2      Alan Moore: Adapting Lovecraft

Alan Moore is an English author best known for his work in comics and graphic novels. His work has helped legitimise the medium as worthy of scholarly attention, and "the formation of comics studies as an academic field" (Ayres 1). Moore's stories often speak to the underlying ideological aspects of a genre. His exploration of superhero-comics resulted in an examination of the ideological underpinnings of the genre through critically acclaimed comics such as *Watchmen* (1986–1987) and *V for Vendetta* (1982). Although *V for Vendetta* does not fit the superhero genre entirely, it possesses the revisionist innovations typical of Moore's comics. Superhero comics depicted primarily morally unambiguous costumed heroes who use their superhuman powers to fight for ideals such as truth and justice. This theme was made particularly popular with the introduction of characters like Superman and Captain America, who helped define what readers could expect from superhero comics (Ramagnoli and Pagnucci 116). However *Watchmen's* heroes do not fit this archetype at all. Its heroes are flawed, morally ambiguous and often deeply troubled by their position and experiences in life. Much like the stories about the superhero Captain America, *Watchmen* is firmly set within a historical context where its heroes are placed within historical conflicts. Captain America is shown to participate in a version of America's war against Nazis, Communism, or Middle Eastern terrorism. However, unlike Captain America, *Watchmen's* heroes affect these types of conflicts to such a degree where it reshapes its entire world. In doing so, the graphic novel forces the reader to reconsider what a superhero is, and what a world inhabited by them would look like (Thouret 2-3).

It is this revisionist attitude that Moore brings to his graphic novel adaptations of Lovecraft's stories. Moore's adaptations do not shy away from the more objectionable elements of Lovecraft's work. Moore is willing to make explicit some of the more uncomfortable topics such as sex, which Lovecraft mostly expressed through euphemism.

However, Moore has also been criticised for the racist and sexist elements in many of his works. Singer explains that Moore's attempts at critiquing these racist and misogynistic elements by expressing them explicitly, runs the risk of indulging in them, and might thus be worthy of re-examination (124).

Graphic novels are almost always a work of collaboration. Usually, the work of at least both an author for the narrative and dialogue, and multiple artists for the graphical elements. However, Parkin stresses that for Moore the collaboration is less of an "exchange of ideas," but one where he is deeply involved in determining the visual elements of each page (125). Moore's notes regularly contained comments on the perspectives in which the art was supposed to be drawn, and the positioning and looks of objects and characters. Frequently, they would include "historical notes, commentaries, and descriptions of the possible sounds and smells one might have found on the scene" (Di Liddo 32). These can greatly influence the tone of a work, or even under what genre it might fall.

Alan Moore's tendency to examine the ideological underpinnings of the superhero genre, as he has done in *Watchmen* and *V for Vendetta*, makes him ideal for a comparative critical stylistic analysis. This could make Lovecraft's more unique and overt racist stylistic choices less likely to survive the adaptation process, as they are likely to be discarded or transformed by Moore's close examination. However, the stylistic aspects of Lovecraft's work that do survive the adaptation process are thus made more meaningful. Should that include any of the more overt racist stylistic aspects, it could indicate that they are inextricably linked to the narrative Lovecraft is telling. The analysis will further examine the visual elements of the graphic novels as an analogue for some of Lovecraft's stylistic choices in representing his monsters and humans. These images are drawn by separate visual artists who may take inspiration from other works. However, Moore's close involvement with the visual elements in the graphic novels makes a comparative analysis possible. His comments

helped tie the visuals to Lovecraft's style and narrative technique, a style and narrative built on the foundations laid by earlier works of Gothic fiction.

1.3     Race and Othering in Gothic Fiction

What is now considered Gothic fiction first bloomed at the end of the eighteenth century, taking its inspiration from German and British Dark Romanticism as well as works of tragic drama. Significantly, Ruth Bienstock Anolik points out that the Gothic genre was concerned with otherness and racial monstrosity form the outset (2), from Charlotte Dacre's *Zofloya* (1806) to classics like Bram Stoker's *Dracula* (1897). Currently, there is no doubt about the significance of what is now considered Gothic fiction to the exploration of racial othering in Anglo-American culture, and the lasting impact it has had on modern and post-modern notions of othering within western culture (Hogle 1-3; Anolik 3). Gothic fiction distinguishes itself by its tendency to investigate limits and push towards the extremes to make its point (Weinstock 2). However, much traditional Gothic fiction still reinforces a prescribed cultural morality onto these extremes. This provides readers with an opportunity to indulge in these taboos, while still being able to return to a sense of moral normalcy, as the monstrous other is defeated. While Gothic literature had its inception on the continent and the British Isles, its influence could soon be felt in America.

However, American authors did not share the same history with their European counterparts. Themes of remote dungeons and old European castles were replaced with caves and the American wilderness. Allan Lloyd-Smith explains that American Gothic writers adopted more than just the Europeans' style and imagery; they also inherited from their fellow writers across the Atlantic an anxiety about Enlightenment rationalism (65). Edgar Allan Poe's "The Murders in the Rue Morgue" (1841), is not only a seminal text of detective fiction; it is also a Gothic story that posits the question of how can one truly know something.

Sargent explains "the conventional notion of motive…can no longer be called upon to provide a satisfactory explanation of the mystery" (170). Poe's use of a non-human perpetrator further emphasises the tension between the supernatural and scientific that the text attempts to confront. This speaks to a common theme of the American Gothic, exploring the limits of rational thought often despite good intentions. Many characters in American Gothic run the risk of madness, or perversity, in the face of new ideas – as in Charles Brockden Brown's *Wieland* (1799) – when unable to resist the corrupting power of these ideas and unable to hold on to traditional American (puritan) ideology (Lloyd-Smith 65). Such Gothic writing, as expressed Hawthorne's story of scientific hubris, "Rappaccini's Daughter" (1844), follows the "Gothicized religious rhetoric of the North American Puritans" of the eighteenth century, which warned of eternal damnation and a God ready to punish anyone who transgressed too far (Weinstock 6).

Another way Gothic fiction incorporates this idea of perversity is by the inclusion of other species, aberrations or monsters as threats to human integrity, as in Stevenson's *Jekyll and Hyde* (1886), or Wells's *The Island of Doctor Moreau* (1896). This prompts the reader to think and question their own humanity and what differentiates themselves from the other. This other can take shape and exist in many different forms, but as fears of ghosts and monsters are explained through rational thought, these fears took shape in social and racial others (Anolik 2). These racial and social others become as monstrous as their supernatural predecessors to fulfil the same role of source of these anxieties. This allows fears of miscegenation to express itself in the hybrid monsters described in Lovecraft's "The Shadow Over Innsmouth."

In *Powers of Horror: an Essay on Abjection*, Julia Kristeva explains how identity is often fluid, and that fluidity is what generates terror: "[i]t is thus not lack of cleanliness or health that causes abjection but what disturbs identity, system, order. What does not respect

borders, positions, rules" (4). In Gothic fictions preoccupied with hybrid creatures and miscegenation, it is this breaking down of borders between what is good and bad and the risk of these two things becoming indistinguishable that is such a source of terror. People that crossed that border were marked as deviants. Edwards explains that this border had to be carefully watched as "[n]ineteenth-century racial theories were significant in that they justified slavery within a nation that proclaimed the equality of all men" (7). Authors such as Edgar Allan Poe used mixed-race characters to "both recognize and respond to the ongoing instability of the master-slave dynamic" (Edwards 4). For instance, in *The Narrative of Arthur Gordon Pym of Nantucket* (1838), Poe uses the African presence in his novel as an other against which ideals of whiteness, freedom and individuality can be painted. In *Frankenstein; or, the Modern Prometheus* (1818), Mary Shelley tells the story of a creature created by doctor Victor Frankenstein using pieces of various corpses, and even, it is suggested, parts of animals, as Victor visits slaughter houses during his experiments. Upon its creation, the creature flees and travels the world looking for acceptance, but is repeatedly rejected by society. His appearance and status as something inhuman are enough to consider him as other. The creature's description as larger and more powerful than his maker maps onto typical descriptions of black men, according to H.L. Malchow. When the creature asks Frankenstein for a bride, he first agrees. However the doctor feared what a race of their offspring might do, making his racial fear explicit in the novel. In retribution, the creature promises to murder Frankenstein's wife, and later on he does so. Malchow explains that her murder "seems almost certainly to draw, consciously or otherwise, upon the classic threat of the black male" (112).

Further, in Bram Stoker's *Dracula* (1897), readers are presented with a narrative of reverse colonisation. The vampire is a foreign outsider with the distinct ability to turn the English into more of its own kind. The othered and primitive outsiders are viewed as a threat

that may rise up and conquer the civilised world (Arata 631). Anolik explains that what makes *Dracula* so effective is its ability to function as a reflection of the anxieties the reader brings to it. The figure of a vampire can function as an emblem of various racial (Jewish, Irish or African American) or class anxieties (4). The effectiveness of othering thus does not depend on pinning the other onto an existing anxiety. Some figures allow for existing anxieties to map onto the writing.

These characters showcase some of the various forms othering may take in Gothic literature. Gothic fiction's unique way of giving a voice to anxieties on race and racial conflict has tied its texts to the racist ideologies prevalent during their writing. Edwards explains: "I see the American Gothic as intimately tied to the history of racial conflict in the United States" (xvii). This thesis aims to investigate through a critical stylistic comparative analysis whether those forms of racial othering remain tied to adaptations of those works.

1.4     Stylistic Analysis

Stylistics bridges the gap between literary and linguistic analysis. This form of analysis aims to be objective, replicable, and scientific in its attempt to demonstrate direct relationships between  a writer's stylistic choices and the meaning readers take away from them. Style is a necessary choice for authors, and in the linguistic sense there cannot be a lack of style (Jeffries, *Textual Meaning* 3-4). This thesis will critically explore what stylistic choices H.P. Lovecraft made when he wrote his influential works to create that sense of racial otherness and emphasise physical and psychological deviancy of the racial other. Also, this thesis will explore to which degree key aspects of Lovecraft's style are retained in Alan Moore's graphic novel adaptations, despite the different medium and modernisation. This thesis will answer these questions by analysing the stylistic representation of racial othering in two seminal short stories by H.P. Lovecraft: "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" and "The Call of Cthulhu,"

as well as key parts of Alan Moore's trilogy of graphic-novel adaptations, which build on Lovecraft's mythos: *The Courtyard* , *Neonomicon* and *Providence*. Stylistic choices do not need to be the conscious choices of the author, nor do they have to be overt representations of their ideology. As it is in the case of adaptations, stylistic analysis may aim to uncover merely what the author managed to convey to their readers, regardless of whether they personally identify with these ideologies. Should the result of this analysis provide sufficient evidence for Lovecraft's racist ideologies having been adapted into the style of Alan Moore's writing, it should not at all serve as a reflection of Moore's personal opinions on race or speak to any intentionality towards spreading those ideas. However, it may provide sufficient evidence for a requirement of a stylistic awareness in the adaptation process.

**2      Theoretical Framework**

2.1 Critical Stylistics

Stylistics has established itself as a multi-disciplinary field managing to combine and bridge

linguistic fields in an effective and meaningful way (Sorlin 10). Critical stylistics focuses on

"uncovering the ideologies of texts" and analyses the stylistic choices authors made to

convey that meaning (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 6). Whether those choices were made

intentionally and to convince the reader or not. Language may carry explicit or implicit forms

of an ideology.

> (1) [Examples of explicit/implicit rhetoric]
>
>> a.   I hate young people
>>
>> b.   Young people are always causing trouble

Jeffries explains "we are most interested in the less obvious ideological encoding, *because* it

is more insidious" (8). It presents the risk that such ideas might become naturalised and part

of a community's ideology. However, it is important to recognize that no moral claim is

made in analysing that ideology. Critical stylistics merely measures the way that ideology is

expressed in a given text. The primary goal remains to present an unbiased, scientific, and

reproducible analysis. Jeffries founded her framework of critical stylistic analysis based on

Halliday's meta-functions of language, renaming them as "textual, ideational and

interpersonal" (2015, 469).  She uses aspects of different fields of stylistics to establish her

own methodology of analysis.

The interpersonal meta-function covers the features most closely associated with

pragmatics. This covers most patterns observed in conversation analysis. A few examples

relevant to the analysis in this paper are implicatures, politeness and impoliteness. The textual

meta-function maps on to Halliday's linguistic meta-function. This covers the linguistic

structures within a text including syntax, semantics, morphology, phonology and phonetics. Finally, the ideational meta-function, which stands at the centre of critical stylistic analysis. It represents the way a linguistic system creates structures. These structures work to convey a certain ideology. It shows what a text is doing in creating its ideational world.

The stylistic analysis of othering discussed in this thesis is based on the model outlined by Jeffries in her book *Critical Stylistics: The Power of English* (2009). This model consists of ten tools of analysis, which are relevant to a varying degree when it comes to the purposes of this research. I will be concentrating my analysis on the following seven: (1) naming and describing, (2) representing actions/events/states, (3) equating and contrasting, (4) implying and assuming, (5) negating, (6) hypothesising, and (7) representing time, space, and society. These critical stylistic tools each contribute to better understanding the way an author incorporates aspects of an ideology into their work. These tools are not meant to provide us with a full overview of all ideological meaning derivable from a text but will provide us with the necessary framework to analyse Lovecraft's stylistic choices with which he incorporated racial othering into his work.

2.1.1 Naming & Describing

Naming and describing aims to uncover the way in which a text chooses to name anything within its world. A character can be named in ideologically insignificant ways:

(2) [Examples of naming & describing]

a. Robert Freeman

b. My father

However, not all examples of naming are going to be relevant to a critical stylistic analysis. An author may choose to make a more bias driven choice:

(3) [Examples of naming & describing]

    a.  The bad painter

    b.  The beast of a man

For the purpose of analysing a text on its naming & describing practices, it is important to outline which parts of the sentence are relevant for analysis. Most commonly a sentence will consist of a noun phrase and a verb phrase which work together to form a sentence. A noun phrase stands representative of an entity which it names, often the subject or object to the verb of a sentence. This includes the modifiers, generally these are adjectives, that help shape the noun phrase.

There are three main ways in which naming & describing can express ideological meaning. 1) The choice of a noun: the selection of any noun over another represents a choice in referent and should be treated as a possible expression of an ideological thought process. This can be expressed through the use of slang words or divergent spelling to refer to certain regional, dialectical or racial differences, which may "become the source of discrimination or prejudice" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 20). 2) The use of pejoratives to evoke negative connotations. A particularly relevant example is the use of racial slurs to refer to racial others. 3) Noun modification: there are a wide variety of syntactic and morphological options at the disposal of an author in writing a noun phrase. This can simply be accomplished through the inclusion of modifiers.

(4) [Example of noun modification]

    a.  The dishonest man

However, Jeffries explains that "the main ideological importance of noun phrases is that they are able to 'package up' ideas or information which are not fundamentally about entities but which are really a description of a process, event or action" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 20).

This forces the reader to presuppose everything the author incorporates into the noun phrase, and prevents them from being able to contest or question it.

> (5) [Example of noun modification]
>
>> a.   The baby murdering doctor who works at that clinic (has found a new job).

Nominalization: The final technique describes the process of turning verbs into a noun (phrase). The main way this assists in presenting an ideology is how it helps obfuscate the actor in a sentence and possibly shields them from blame or association with a negative effect.

> (6) [Example of nominalization]
>
>> a.   The doctor administered the wrong dosage, which led to the patient's untimely death.
>>
>> b.   The administering of the wrong dosage led to the patient's untimely death.

The naming and describing choices used by Lovecraft informs us of the different ways in which he colours our perception of different characters. Lovecraft's and Moore's uses of pejoratives and slurs are explicit examples of this, but more subtle descriptors may have made itself into Moore's adaptations.

### 2.1.2 Representing Actions/Events/States

While 2.1.1 focused on the properties of noun phrases and actors, 2.1.2 will focus on the choices in verbs. This analysis tool seeks a comprehensive understanding of actions, events and states. Since Halliday's model of transitivity focuses primarily on the implication of verb choices, Jeffries opts for the implementation of Simpson's model. This model divides verbs into four types of processes: (1) Material action processes, (2) Verbalization processes, (3) Mental cognition processes, (4) Relational processes (Simpson 82-85). Below each process is explained in detail with accompanying examples.

*Material action processes:*

These processes consist of three subcategories: intention, supervention and event. Each is outlined below followed by an example:

**Intention** describes an action by a conscious actor, who intentionally performs the action. (7) The lawyer reads the book.

**Supervention** describes an action by a conscious actor, who unintentionally performs the action. (8) The lawyer lost his keys.

**Event** describes an action by an inanimate actor. A human factor is either missing, or heavily downplayed. (9) The pen fell on the floor. However, also (10) The uprising by the rebels caused the government many challenges.


*Verbalization processes:*

These describe actions which make use of language. This includes verbs such as (11) said and (12) told. However, it also includes verbs such as (13) reported (14) assured.


*Mental cognition processes:*

These describe the actions occurring within the actor. These can be divided into three categories. Mental cognition: (15) thinking, knowing, etc. Mental reaction: (16) hating, liking, etc. Mental perception: (17) hearing, seeing, etc.


*Relational processes:*

These represent "the static or stable relationships between carriers and attributes, rather than any changes or dynamic actions" (Jeffries, 2009, 43). These too are divided into three

categories. Intensive relational processes: (18) to be. Possessive relational processes: (19) to have. Circumstantial relational processes: (20) verbs of movement and the verb to be.

The purpose of the transitivity model is that it is able to analyse how a text presents its world. This can showcase ideological biases through the representation of actions, events or states. Presenting an event using the material action process with intention, turns it into an action consciously performed by an actor. This actor is thus provided agency over an event, in favour of any other participants in that event.

(21) [Example of the possible ideological implications]

a. Harry extracts Pete from the danger zone, and flies him to a safe place. Pete is grateful to have been rescued.

In example (21), by making Harry the sole actor in this sentence, he is provided an important role that prioritises his actions and agency over the situation. Pete's agency and participation is diminished as a result. This tool helps identify which characters Lovecraft deems important enough to make the actors in his story, rather than the other which are relegated to more passive roles in each narrative.

2.1.3 Equating and contrasting

One way in which an author may create their world is by comparing and contrasting. The choice to equate or contrast two things is one that stems from an ideological perception of what it equates or contrasts things with. Jeffries outlines eleven linguistic triggers for equating and contrasting. This list is not exhaustive, as new ways develop constantly, but for the purposes of this thesis they should be more than sufficient.

Contrasting triggers:

1. Negated opposition: A not B

2. Transitional opposition: Turn A into B

3. Comparative opposition: More A than B

4. Concessive opposition: Despite A, B

5. Replacive opposition: A instead of B

6. Explicit opposition: A in contrast with B

7. Parallelism: He liked A. She liked B

8. Contrastives: A, but B

Equivalence triggers:

1. Intensive relational equivalence: A is/seems/became/appears B

2. Appositional equivalence: A, B, C etc.

3. Metaphorical equivalence: A is like B

These triggers establish relationships of contrast or equivalence which may be ideologically loaded. Jeffries explains that "One of the most important things a text can do, locally, is to create sense relations such as synonymy or antonymy between lexical items" (Jeffries, *Textual Construction* 102). Not only will the sense relation have impact on the interpretation of that text, but that sense relation may continue to have impact outside the text if it is repeated, such as in Moore's adaptation.


2.1.4 Implying and Assuming

Implying and assuming refers to the ability of the English language to convey ideology in an effective manner through implicature and presupposition. "What speakers/writers assume or imply is powerful, then, because these ideologies are *not* structured into the main proposition of the utterance/sentence, and are therefore less susceptible to scrutiny or questioning" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 93). Jeffries outlines two main types of presuppositions: existential and logical presuppositions. Existential presuppositions function by assuming a shared understanding. When using a determiner: (22) the table, demonstrative: (23) that chair,

or a possessive form: (24) your father, the assumption is that the reader is aware of the presupposed referents. These presuppositions are important but "they may also be innocent in ideological terms" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 95).

While some degree of shared understanding of words, context and ideology is necessary for communication to take place, some triggers create presuppositions and implicature which may expose readers to an ideology they will accept but might not consciously agree with. Logical presupposition is a fair bit harder to identify and consist of an "enormous number of verbs which can cause logical presuppositions to arise" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 96).

1. Change of State verbs presuppose an earlier state

    a. He stopped eating meat

2. Factive verbs are followed by a presupposed clausal complement. Some English factive verbs are: realise, understand, regret, discover, know. The clausal complement most often starts with the word: that.

    a. I understand that they were right

3. Cleft sentences change what information takes primary focus within a sentence. A part of its construction is by presupposing the relative clause.

    a. It was the dog who knocked over the vase

4. Iterative words presuppose a previous or later occurrence of an event. Words such as again and any more, or some verbs which start with the prefix re- such as redo and revisit.

    a. He lied to me again

5. Some comparative structures can also presuppose the basis of the entire comparison. If the presupposition does not hold up under scrutiny, the comparison falls apart.

a. Steven is as ugly as a cow

The presupposition is that cows are ugly. However, not all comparisons are

dependent on its target.

b. Steven is taller than a cow

The actual height of a cow, whether it is considered tall or short, is relevant for the

comparison but the comparison is not dependent on its assessment.

Jeffries bases her model of implicatures on Paul Grice's. In his article titled "Logic and

Conversation," Paul Grice outlines the four maxims on which he establishes his theory of

implicature (28). Any deviation from these maxims is a text's attempt at implicature.

1. Maxim of quantity: Provide exactly the necessary amount of information for the

situation.

2. Maxim of quality: Do not tell lies, or anything for which you do not have sufficient

evidence.

3. Maxim of relation: Only provide relevant information for the situation.

4. Maxim of manner: Concise and specific.

Implicature is naturally hidden, which make its ideological effects difficult to question. When

reading Lovecraft's works, the reader may be able to consciously accept the proposed surface

meaning, but is unwittingly accepting an implied criticism of the other.


2.1.5 Negating

Negating is a tool through which authors construct a potentially non-existent world for their

audience. Jeffries uses negating to mean a complex concept which presents the possibility of

an occurrence by denying it. This creates a hypothetical possibility of that occurrence which

may enter in the reader's mind.

(25) [Example of Negating]

a. Abdul did not eat the last cookie

Jeffries explains that it is the "pragmatic force of negation" which makes the reader aware of a scenario where Abdul has eaten the last cookie, and may make us think of what that would mean for Abdul, or the context in which this would have occurred (*Critical Stylistics* 106). Negation is realised through the use of four types of triggers, outlined by Jeffries (*Critical Stylistics* 107-110).

1. Syntactically. Through the inclusion of the negative particle: not, to the (dummy) auxiliary verb.

2. Lexically. Some verbs contain a semantic component which inserts negation into a sentence.

   a. Nouns such as lack and absence

   b. Verbs such as omit and refuse

   c. Adjectives such as absent and scarce

3. Pronouns. The pronouns no one, nobody, nothing, etc. are able to insert negation into a sentence.

4. Morphologically. Usually through a prefix, many adjectives possess negation. Incomplete, anti-social, undecided.

An author can often by merely mentioning an outcome or situation that does not exist, elicit an emotional reaction. "One of the most powerful effects that language can have is to strike fear into the heart of the reader/hearer to make them act or think in particular ways" (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 111). Through negation, authors like Lovecraft are able to tap into the imagination of their readers and elicit fear of the other without providing any evidence of that fear being justified.

2.1.6 Hypothesising

Section 2.1.5 discussed the ideological influence of presenting scenarios which are not part of reality as presented in the author's world. However, in this part we will critically explore the hypothetical situations that modality helps authors create. Jeffries encapsulates all forms of modality under this label of hypothesising, and uses Simpson' model for modality to establish her tool for analysis. Simpson's model comprises of the following auxiliary verbs: will, would, shall, should, may, might, can, could, must, ought, dare and need. These all possess at least one significant modal meaning.

1. The epistemic meaning, which is an expression of (un)certainty.

    a. He might kill him

2.  The deontic meaning which is an expression of obligation

    a. He should run away

3. The boulomaic meaning which is an expression of desire

    a. I wish I could see you again

However, modal verbs do not need to stand on their own, but can combine together with:

1. lexical verbs such as think or hope

    a. I think he might kill him

2. Modal verbs such as probably or definitely

    a. He should probably run away

3. Modal adjectives such as certain or forbidden

    a. I am certain he should buy that coat

4. Conditional sentence structure: if…, then…

    a. If he reads that book, then he might learn something

In his model of modal grammar of point of view in narrative fiction, Simpson makes a distinction between "category-A narratives and category-B narratives" (50). Category-A

narratives are simply those in which a character that takes part in the story narrates the story in the first person. Category-B narratives are always a third person narrative voice, by "…an invisible, 'disembodied', nonparticipating narrator" (Simpson 51). This narrator type can be subdivided into two types. The narratorial mode, which takes its position outside of the consciousness of any participating characters within the story. The reflector mode, which is narrated from within the consciousness of a participant in the story. Each of these narrator modes are then further categorised by their type of modality:

1. Positive modality – deontic and boulomaic modality

2. Negative modality – epistemic and perception modality

3. Neutral – an absence of any narratorial modality

Hypothesising is a relatively direct method of injecting your ideology into a text. Unlike some of the other tools discussed so far, this one is less likely to go unnoticed but rather asks for attention to itself. The persuasive power in hypothesising lies with its ability to evoke an evaluation of opinion. The reader could be prompted to think of what could be or what should be. This could lead to them gaining respect and acknowledgement for these ideas in the process (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 123-125). Even if the author or narrator in a story is honest about their doubts or the unlikelihood of the hypothesis being true, it is still likely they will be believed by the reader. Lovecraft's ideology may be reflected in the hypotheses of the white Anglo Saxon men that typically narrate his work. Hypotheses which need not be intentionally manipulative, but are nevertheless influencing the reader.


2.1.7 Representing Time, Space and Society

This tool of analysis aims to examine the way in which authors construct their world with regard to spatial, temporal and social dimensions. Much  research has already gone towards uncovering the implications of text world building. Jeffries relies on a deixis model. A deixis

model is typified by its consideration for the semantic implications of linguistic items under different contexts. Contexts which are shaped by representations of time, space and society. English divides this deictic expressions into four categories:

1. Place
   a. Adverbs such as here or there
   b. Demonstratives such as this or those
   c. Adverbial phrases such as on your right, further up the road
2. Time
   a. Verb tenses like walk and walked
   b. Adverbs such as then and now
   c. Demonstratives such as this and those
   d. Time adverbials such as tomorrow and next
3. Person
   a. All personal pronouns such as I and you
4. Social
   a. Titles such as Doctor or Lord
   b. Address forms such as first names or nicknames.

The most important ideological effect of deixis is the author's ability to place the reader at the centre of their text world and make them understand the context of all that is happening without having to fill in all the gaps in knowledge. The reader will automatically fill those in themselves. Most ideologically laden texts will try to convince its reader that their text world is a representation of the actual world we live in. This might aid in absorbing the reader into the deixis of a narrative. Long exposure to a specific deixis combined with a reader's exposure to the ideological viewpoints of the author, could alter the viewpoints of the reader (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 157). When the narrative of Lovecraft's stories is tracked through

the eyes of his narrator or main character, it becomes coloured by his ideological viewpoints on who he portrays as the other. While at the same time, the text is "trying to convince their readers/hearers that they are representing the Actual World", leaving them with a sense that the ideology of the text maps onto reality (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 156).

2.2 Stylistic analysis of Graphic novels

In their chapter titled "Stylistics and Comics," Forceville, El Refaie and Meesters, consider the stylistic analysis of graphic novels, and outline the specific considerations necessary for performing a stylistic analysis on a comic or graphic novel (485-499). They present five features unique to comics or uniquely employed by comics worth consideration when performing a stylistic analysis. While these features have their own individual function on the comic page, they also function as stylistic choices which carry ideological decisions with them in their employment. In my final analysis of Alan Moore's graphic novel adaptations, it is important to recognise the difference in medium between them and their source material. This analysis must recognise that it is very probable that some of Lovecraft's stylistic choices may have been adapted into the visual aspect of the graphic novel medium.

2.2.1 Pages, panels and the gutter

Analysing the cover page is an important first step in the process of interpreting comics. Cover art in comics is specifically designed to call back to some familiar notions of previously read work, or to distinguish itself from competing works in the comic space (Yus 2). Pages are usually divided into a layout of various panels. Panels are typically supposed to be read in a specific order, with some exceptions allowing for a free reading. Panels are generally arranged in a grid, but depending on the genre and country of origin they are shaped or read differently. Some pages may be devoid of any panels, often depicting an

important or emblematic scene. Choices in panel shape and size can carry specific meaning, indicating a specific type of scene such as a dream or hallucination (Forceville et al. 487). The gutter is typically a solid colour but may contain scene setting graphics such as smoke. Not everything that occurs in a comic is shown on a panel. A man might get in a cab on one panel and arrive at his destination in the next. The implication is that the travel happened in the gutter between them (McCloud 71). This might lead to unintentional presupposition, but is generally avoided by effective use of the panels. Finally, the last panel on a page or of a serialised comic can be extremely powerful. Groensteen et al. explain how the last panel can simply end a scene or more importantly create suspense and invite the reader to imagine desired or feared outcomes (29).

### 2.2.2 Body types, postures and facial expressions

The physical attributes as depicted on a comic page can tell us many things about the way the author wishes to present the character. Within the comic medium there are typical ways of drawing certain types of characters, which each artist attempts to make their own, but will still have specific features in common (Forceville et al. 488). Recognisability plays a large role when it comes to these decisions. Through the combination of tropes and recognisable props and clothing, an author creates the identity for its characters in such a way to make them immediately identifiable and filled with meaning of what role they play within the overall story. Body postures can help signal emotional states and attitudes. Hand and arm positions are especially telling. Drawn on a page, these allow characters to animate and gesture much more accurately than with other parts of their body (Baetens 147). However, "for the correct assessment of mental states, facial expressions are possibly even more crucial" (Forceville et al. 488). These are often heavily exaggerated versions of their real life counterparts.

2.2.3 Framing and angles

Comics artists will use whatever means at their disposal to make you side with a specific character. One such trick is having the reader follow a particular character through the story. Time within the story passes at the pace that the character experiences it. Furthermore, the reader is only shown areas that character inhabits at that point in time. This creates an invested connection between reader and character.

Another trick for creating closeness or distance is through the use of angles. Forceville et al. explain that each angle invokes a different feeling to the reader.

1. Eye contact between character and reader suggest the character is demanding something

2. A long shot is impersonal and distant towards the reader

3. A close up however, is intimate and personal.

4. A low shot makes the character appear powerful

5. An eye level shot, suggests equality between character and reader

6. A profile view suggest detachment from the reader

7. A full profile view creates the most involvement between reader and character.

Sequential panels might also show different shots of a character or scene from different angles. While they are in fact shots of the same scene, they often focus on different aspects of it, or frame it such that it elicits different readings, something Hescher calls ocularization (137-141). As the changes in angle also change the position of the observer, it can across panels create an effect which changes the framing of the scene.

2.2.4 Speech and thought balloons

What is said or thought is generally expressed through speech and thought balloons. Narratorial text often appears in blocks at the tops or bottoms of panels. Forceville et al. outlines these five primary deviating markers:

1. Form: The standard form of a speech and thought balloon for any given comic may be different, but this is generally considered unimportant. Deviation from that standard, however, can be very meaningful for the interpretation of its contents. Spiky edges are often associated with anger or with technologically conveyed information.

2. Colour: typically, balloons are white with black text. However, comics may employ the use of colour to indicate specific emotions or emphasise certain aspect of the balloon

3. Deviant fonts: Deviant fonts are always relevant to the interpretation of a balloon. Bold letters may be emphasised, while smaller fonts perhaps suggest whispering.

4. Standalone non-letter marks: such as question mark or exclamation mark. These balloons are not verbal, but do convey a meaning to the reader.

5. Tails: These point out the speaker of this specific balloon.

2.2.5 Pictograms and pictorial runes

Comics often contain different kinds of pictograms. These have standalone meanings, independent from the comics page it is used on. Pictorial runes, however, signify a "limited number of items, with a fairly specific appearance and a more or less fixed meaning" (Forceville et al. 492). These pictorial runes are employed in a wide variety of ways. They are used to show movement through for example: speed lines and movement lines. Another way they are used is to show emotion or a mental state through for example: a twirl which denotes dizziness.

## 3      Methodology

This chapter will provide an overview of the corpus and the basis on which it was selected.

This section will provide the necessary information required for the analysis of the works

written by H.P. Lovecraft and Alan Moore. Furthermore, it will outline the process by which

these works have been analysed and how the analysis resulted in the conclusion.

### 3.1 Corpus selection

This research concerns itself with the stylistic features of othering as expressed by H.P.

Lovecraft. The two works selected are chosen based on their relevance as representation of

his ideological expression on racial othering and their cultural relevance as part of

Lovecraft's literary legacy. Kneale explains how Lovecraft uses two metaphors to underpin

the major themes in his stories: "the first relates to metaphors of invasion and contamination,

the second to metaphors of transmission" (113). Invasion and contamination take the form of

spatial contact. Otherworldly beings influencing and infecting people to their own ends as

shown in "The Call of Cthulhu." While transmission refers to Lovecraft's concern with

degradation through, crossbreeding and miscegenation as shown in "The Shadow Over

Innsmouth."

### 3.1.1 "The Call of Cthulhu": Cosmic Corruption of the Other

"The Call of Cthulhu'' serves as the foundation of the Cthulhu mythos, which has been

Lovecraft's most pervasive influence on modern adaptations of his work (Poole 124). It

concerns itself with a wide pantheon of ancient deities called the old ones who wield

immeasurable power, one of which is called Cthulhu. These deities now lie dormant in other

dimensions, while their worshippers, through means of black magic, forbidden rituals and

human sacrifice attempt to grant them access to our world.

In the narrative, Cthulhu's call affects people all around the world. These are primarily cult members of non-white or mixed backgrounds. For the most part white people are exempt from the influence the call has on people. This way Lovecraft establishes a delineation between the familiar and safe, and the dangerous monsters and its allies. However, there are certain exceptions, specific types of people such as poets, artists or "sensitive men" whom Lovecraft views as less resistant to outside influence and thus suffer from the same dreams and obsessions as their non-white counterparts ("Cthulhu" 272). Much like previously discussed on Bram Stoker's *Dracula*, the threat lies in the other's ability to corrupt and influence society to the point of reverse colonisation. "The Call of Cthulhu" describes the fear of an uprising by those who Lovecraft deems to be of lower class and of an inferior race:

> The time would be easy to know, for then mankind would have become as the Great
>
> Old Ones; free and wild and beyond good and evil, with laws and morals thrown aside
>
> and all men shouting and killing and reveling in joy. Then the liberated Old Ones
>
> would teach them new ways to shout and kill and revel and enjoy themselves, and all
>
> the earth would flame with a holocaust of ecstasy and freedom. ("Cthulhu" 265)

The result of this would be a perceived social and moral decline. In many ways this goes beyond personal prejudices against individuals and reflects a fear of the shifting power structures and values of the society around him.

3.1.2 "The Shadow Over Innsmouth": an Allegorical Depiction of Miscegenation

"The Shadow Over Innsmouth" covers Lovecraft's more individualised fears of the other. One where the other is something that can be inherited and corrupt the self, in addition to the whole of society. Poole explains:

> Lovecraft usually pictured these rituals being performed … in foreign locations or
>
> American seaport cities with a population heavy with the immigrants the author

himself personally detested. His heroes, on the other hand, tend to be bookish,

bespectacled Anglo-Saxons of Puritan descent. (124-125)

The narrator in "The Shadow over Innsmouth" fits this description as he travels to a decrepit seaport called Innsmouth. Here he learns the people have been cross breeding with amphibian deep ones creating hybrid offspring. These hybrids slowly transform into deep ones as they get older and move to ancient cities to live among them. Olmstead escapes the town, and learns he too is a hybrid deep one. His uncle had previously researched his ancestry in the area, and subsequently killed himself. Unable to do so as well, Olmstead decides to embrace his fate and join the deep ones in their underwater city.

Lovecraft's fiction is fundamentally based on some common anxieties White Americans believed in: "...the horror of 'degenerate' foreigners" (Poole 125). However, for Lovecraft that fear especially took shape when these groups started to mix, with often monstrous results. However, as often is the case with Lovecraft, he projected this fear onto otherworldly beings. These beings are a degraded and evil version of what they previously were, and a result of interbreeding between species. The deep ones have thus become an allegory for the dehumanisation of the other, which remains prevalent in "his portrayal of non-males, non-whites, and non-Protestants" (McConeghy 5). However, Lovecraft makes no distinction between undesirable others, and the hybrid monsters in his works: "Human beings, at least of a 'degenerate type,' are some of Lovecraft's greatest monsters" (Poole 125). Interbreeding results in degradation whether that is between different species or races.

### 3.1.3 Alan Moore: A Reimagined Adaptation of Lovecraft's Horror

Alan Moore's trilogy of Lovecraft adaptations can be traced back to a prose story originally written in 1994 (Ayres 147). In 2003, it was published as a two issue comic series called *The Courtyard*. Later followed by its sequels *Neonomicon* in 2010 and *Providence* in 2015. *The Courtyard* tells the story of Aldo Sax, a racist FBI agent in the year 2004 who sets out to investigate a series of murders connected to a new drug called Aklo. Sax follows his leads and learns that Aklo does not refer to a new drug, but rather an occult language. Upon hearing the language, Sax experiences traumatising visions of other dimensions and cosmic creatures. These visions drive him to murder his neighbour in the same way the killers he was investigating have.

*Neonomicon* follows two FBI agents, Brears and Lamper, as they connect Sax's case from *The Courtyard* to a sex cult. They go undercover and infiltrate the cult; however, they are soon discovered. Lamper is killed, and Brears is locked with an aquatic creature who rapes and impregnates her. Confirming her pregnancy, the creature lets her go. When visiting Sax, Brears learns that she is pregnant with Cthulhu.

*Providence* concludes the trilogy by expanding on the story of *Neonomicon,* serving as both a prequel and sequel. The story mainly follows Robert Black, a gay Jewish reporter and aspiring author in the year 1919. Black travels from New York to New England searching for signs of an occult conspiracy he aims to uncover. He ends up meeting H.P. Lovecraft himself and loans him his journal filled with his experiences and ideas. Lovecraft becomes inspired by what he learns from Black's journal. Black realises he was set on this path to inspire Lovecraft as part of an occult conspiracy to bring about the apocalypse. The graphic novel then moves through time, showing many of Lovecraft's stories taking place, and people's fascination with them growing. In the end, we return to *Neonomicon's* agent Brears giving birth to Cthulhu and setting off the apocalypse.

What makes Moore's works so relevant for a comparative analysis is how interwoven the narratives are with Lovecraft's own stories. Lovecraft himself was a strong proponent of this practice and the Cthulhu mythos lends itself well to collaboration. "Lovecraft's openness to other writers' work with his concepts speaks to the acts of creative borrowing and revision that are fundamental to Moore's comics work" (Ayres 149). Moore's comic trilogy could not have existed in the form that it does, without having taken so much inspiration from Lovecraft's work. Ayres explains that part of Moore's trilogy is reconciling that creative relationship and wrestling with the more objectionable elements inherited from the original texts: "[t]his cycle of horror comics draws out the ideological subtexts of Lovecraft's fiction" (Ayres 149). In *The Courtyard,* Sax's racism maps onto that of Lovecraft, while *Neonomicon* goes on to examine the sexual undertones and misogyny of Lovecraftian horror (Ayres 150). However, for the purposes of this thesis it is not enough to establish that Moore has wrestled with these subjects when adapting his comics. A closer critical stylistic analysis will uncover whether the writing in Moore's comic trilogy has been affected by Lovecraft's personal beliefs on race.

3.2 Methodological Process

This thesis will use the critical stylistic tools outlined in the theoretical framework to detect and analyse the stylistic choices made by H.P. Lovecraft in his seminal works "The Call of Cthulhu," and "The Shadow Over Innsmouth." These choices will be compared with a similar analysis of Alan Moore's trilogy of Graphic Novels: *Providence, The Courtyard,* and *Neonomicon.* Finally, the effects of both author's use of these stylistic tools will be explored and outlined, and compared to critically explore their similarities and differences.

In *The Routledge Handbook of Stylistics,* Jeffries outlines some challenges when it comes to performing a qualitative critical stylistic analysis, as performed in this thesis. Mainly, many of the analysis tools will produce numerous results which would make a

meaningful analysis difficult and time-consuming. However, this is solved by making a selection through identifying strong representative examples and examining these thoroughly (Jeffries, "Interpretation" 418). In addition, Jeffries recommends limiting which analysis tools are employed. Some tools are more relevant in the manner in which they function, and examining the manner in which they work together is generally more relevant than merely adding more tools ("Interpretation" 418). For a comprehensive process, the analysis was performed by following these steps:

1. Selecting extracts from the works of H.P. Lovecraft that put forward an ideology of othering.

2. Uncovering the linguistic meaning using the previously outlined critical framework. This part of the analysis provides an account of the detected stylistic markers and the structure of each extract and how it delivers a specific ideology.

3. Figuring the ideational meaning. Each extract is analysed for its textual meaning and considered in the context of its narrative.

4. Comparing and contrasting the stylistic choices made by Lovecraft, with extracts of those made by Alan Moore.

**4        Critical Analysis of H.P. Lovecraft's and Alan Moore's Cosmic Horror Style**

In this section, the results of this research will be discussed, and organised based on each relevant stylistic feature. Rather than going through the whole novels' worth of examples, this section will present examples that showcase H.P. Lovecraft's unique employment of these stylistic markers. Furthermore, these same stylistic markers are then compared and contrasted with an analysis of key parts of Alan Moore's trilogy of graphic novels. In addition, this analysis will provide certain analogues unique to the comic medium for the stylistic markers originally employed by Lovecraft.

4.1 Naming & Describing

Some of the more obvious ways in which Lovecraft uses naming to generate a sense of other, is by using racial epithets and foregrounding a character's race through his choice of noun: "…after having been jostled by a nautical-looking negro…" (Lovecraft, "Cthulhu" 247). Here, the racial identity of the character has no direct relevance to the context of the story, but helps to colour the perception of the reader due to the character's association with a physical altercation. In both "The Call of Cthulhu" and "The Shadow over Innsmouth," Lovecraft frequently refers to people of non-white ethnicity by their racial background to foreground this characteristic in association with some negative act or situation. When explaining the strange nature of the hybrid inhabitants of Innsmouth, Lovecraft does so again in terms of race to establish their otherness: "You've probably heard about the Salem man that came home with a Chinese wife, and maybe you know there's still a bunch of Fiji Islanders somewhere around Cape Cod" ("Innsmouth" 766). Referencing ethnicity and racial background is Lovecraft's foremost method of stylistically othering characters.

Alan Moore does this in a similar manner. Some of the very first words spoken in *The Courtyard* read: "See all them lights boy? Them's nigger-stars. Make a wish," as people celebrate a fictitious holiday named after the religious black leader Louis Farrakhan. Further,

a little bit later "I can hear the spear-chuckers partying from under the Harlem dome even

from here…" (*Courtyard*). Sax voices this frustration with the locals he is there to aid. Most

of them are of a white ethnic background, although "The neighbourhood flack-dealer" is

clearly a black man, dressed in a do-rag, hoodie and baggy jeans (*Courtyard*), a style of

clothes closely associated with black minority groups in America. The character is drawn

with a larger nose and outlined lips typical of caricatures of black characters, further

distinguishing him from the other characters in the street. Nevertheless, Sax characterises the

neighbourhood and the troubled nature of it clearly in racial terms: "I'm running on blacktime

here, and blacktime's not good for me, pension-wise" (*Courtyard).* Moore creates a clear

delineation between the reader's point of view, and the local others with which Sax is forced

to deal with. Furthermore, the black character is only ever viewed from far away and above,

creating further distance and thus a sense of othering between the reader and the inhabitants

of the troubled neighbourhood Sax has come to investigate (Forceville et al. 488). This is in

contrast to the schizophrenic neighbour, whom Sax finds annoying, but is described

sympathetically, framed on eye level and hunched over. This framing helps to elicit empathy

and closeness from the reader.

Moore's treatment of the few black characters in *The Courtyar*d, mimic Lovecraft's in

the manner in which they are named and described. The racial identity of these characters are

foregrounded, even when they bare little or no relevance to the scene or setting. Both authors

establish these characters' otherness in racial terms, inserting a racist ideological meaning

into their texts.

4.2 Representing Actions/Events/States

Transitivity combined with naming can quickly frame a situation such that the other holds no meaningful position in the sentence. We need only look at the first example in this chapter:

> The professor had been stricken whilst returning from the Newport boat; falling suddenly, as witnesses said, after having been jostled by a nautical-looking negro who had come from one of the queer dark courts on the precipitous hillside which formed a short cut from the waterfront to the deceased's home in Williams Street. ("Cthulhu" 247)

The nautical-looking person is provided no agency over the situation and is merely there to facilitate the narrative of the victim. This is typical of the racial and monstrous others in Lovecraft's works. The story is told and perceived from the perspective of the narrator, and the thoughts of the various others are merely guessed at. The few times readers learn new information directly from other characters, is when they align themselves with the main characters, and are not written to be othered. Information from those whom Lovecraft ideologically deems inferior is rarely provided by that character, but rather collected or retold through characters Lovecraft is more sympathetic towards: "What the police did extract, came mainly from an immensely aged mestizo named Castro who claimed to have sailed to strange ports and talked with undying leaders of the cult in the mountains of China" ("Cthulhu" 264). Jeffries explains that such lack of agency over words or actions is emblematic of an attempt to downplay or minimise the role of that character: "[i]t is the dominance of certain transitivity choices over others which is at issue" (*Critical Stylistics* 40-41). Castro performed some form of a verbalization process by telling the police of his knowledge. However, in his writing, Lovecraft relegates his role to that of a relational process in which he merely serves to carry attributes for the police, who are allowed to be the actors. His first known attribute is again his ethnic background, and then only in the

subordinate clause are we presented with Castro's contributions to the narrative.

Moore's treatment of the other in terms of transitivity differs from Lovecraft's. Moore regularly provides the other agency over their situation. In *Neonomicon*, the fish creature rarely speaks, except in a to the reader incomprehensible language. However, the monster is for the most part able to carry out his own actions and able to make his own choices. For several panels the comic even takes the perspective of the monster, looking onto Brears, the protagonist in that scene. In addition, several panels are dedicated to showing close ups of various states and facial expressions of the creature, providing the reader with a sense of familiarity with the monster. The creature is slowly revealed through back shots that take his perspective and build onto the next scene. While readers have spent most of the comic with Brears, the introduction of the creature has shifted their perspective dramatically. During the subsequent rape scene, the reader frequently shifts between panels from the creatures perspective, to some wider shots that frame them together. No longer is it merely a monstrous other, but now it is a character who dictates the scene, often still in horrifying ways (*Neonomicon*).

In addition, *Neonomicon* also brings back Johnny Carcosa, who is portrayed in an orientalist manner with a yellow veil covering his face, and a lisp that defines his manner of speech further othering the already different looking man. His speech is immediately recognizable and jarring to read because of this. However, his actions in this comic also fail to follow the deemphasized transitivity of Lovecraft's writing. Carcosa often dictates the scenes in which he is featured and is granted agency over his circumstances by Moore. In Brears dream-like sequence, he provides her with the necessary information and is able to take charge when he wants to. "Come let me kith you" (*Neonomicon*). These stylistic choices deviate from Lovecraft's when it comes to the othering of these characters. Moore's others possess far greater agency over the role they occupy in the narrative. While they are still

presented as monstrous or antagonistic to the protagonists, Moore manages to humanise his others by framing them in ways that allow them to take agency over a scene or set of panels. While Lovecraft relegates his other to distant tools used to tell the main characters' stories.

## 4.3 Equating and Contrasting

One of Lovecraft's frequently employed methods of othering is to compare the monstrous and unimaginable to something he views as a real-world equivalent. Most commonly for Lovecraft is to use replacive opposition to compare the other with animals. The inhabitants in Innsmouth made noises which "…swelled to a bestial babel of croaking, baying and barking without the least suggestion of human speech" ("Innsmouth" 819). Lovecraft's comparison here evokes the sense that the hybrid inhabitants of Innsmouth should be granted no more consideration than other violent animals. Lovecraft states clearly the contrast with human speech, making sure that it is not an option. Lovecraft does so again, in "The Call of Cthulhu," comparing the sounds the voodoo cult members make in terms of their animalistic qualities: "There are vocal qualities peculiar to men, and vocal qualities peculiar to beasts; and it is terrible to hear the one when the source should yield the other" ("Cthulhu" 262). Lovecraft's use of replacive opposition helps evoke in the mind of the reader the contrast in sounds, and creates a sense relation between the other and the animalistic.

Moore's equating and contrasting takes less subtle forms. Due to the visual nature of the comic medium, many of the comparisons are not described or verbalised by the characters, but rather shown through horrific displays of mutilated bodies and crazed facial expressions throughout Moore's entire trilogy. However, Moore in some instances does so in similar ways to Lovecraft. As Brears wakes up from her drugged state, not fully realising her situation she says to a cult member, "Oh christ. Gordon. You killed Gordon. A-and then there was that guy…" when she replies "Oh, come on. It's not a guy. You know it's not a guy. You hear that beautiful? She thinks you're a guy" (*Neonomicon*), speaking to the out-of-the panel

aquatic creature that had been raping Brears. As of that point in the comic, the reader has only seen glimpses of the creature. His otherness has not been fully established yet: but Moore uses the replacive opposition to establish the creature's monstrosity. This becomes fully clear as the creature is fully revealed, and the animalistic features are displayed for the reader to see. During the rape scene, the reader is presented extreme close ups of Brears horrific facial expressions. Brears' large eyes, wide mouth and wild hair signal to the reader the horrific nature of the scene and the appropriate human reaction. The aquatic creature, as actor in the scene, is framed primarily in various grey limbs glowing in brownish and reddish colour emphasising its monstrosity (Hescher 63). The few panels that do show its face, show a calm indifferent creature in contrast to the wild and panicked Brears. In the aftermath of this, the observer sits next to a close up of the creature with Brears in a distant, dark corner. As the monster walks closer to her for more sexual gratification, his facial expression and grunting is played off as comical. The colouring shifts and the brown and red lines that marked his body previously have mostly faded, humanising the character. While Lovecraft's works focus on establishing stark contrasts with the others in his stories, Moore is able on occasion to blur that line. Due to graphic novels being a visual medium, Moore's other takes shape in more explicit terms. The monster in *Neonomicon*, with no real dialogue, is able to be othered fully in one scene and humanised in another through graphical stylistic choices. Lovecraft's writing does not provide his monsters a similar treatment.

4.4 Implying and Assuming

Othering is represented in many of the implications written into Lovecraft's works. Most notably, Lovecraft's recurring theme of comparing the monstrous other to either people of non-white or mixed ethnicity. The ideological implication of which is that they bear some resemblance or share traits which makes their comparison justified: "I s'pose you know…

what a lot our New England ships used to have to do with queer ports in Africa, Asia, the South Seas, and everywhere else, and what queer kinds of people they sometimes brought back with 'em" ("Innsmouth" 766). This explanation for the strange appearance of the inhabitants of Innsmouth only works if the reader accepts that people from those continents could stand in for the narrator's monstrous descriptions.

Moore uses a similar comparative structure to imply the social status and background of the killer in *The Courtyard*: "I just wish these people clean up their own shit once in a while" (*Courtyard*). Here Sax is frustrated with his job having to investigate local killings in a neighbourhood he views as foreign to him. Through Sax, Moore implies the killer must be part of this group Sax considers as other. The danger of the suggested implications are that racial others are assumed responsible for negative situations in which they have no part, or to possess negative attributes the reader would not normally ascribe to them. While within the context of a narrative the author may have envisioned this to be the case, the reader is forced to go along with this due to the authority of the author.

4.5 Negating

Negating allows the author to implant possible realities in the mind of the reader. This allows Lovecraft to make realities in which his ideology is represented seem more plausible and real. "Just what foreign blood was in him I could not even guess. His oddities certainly did not look Asiatic, Polynesian, Levantine, or negroid, yet I could see why the people found him alien" ("Innsmouth" 773). Even when the narrator recognizes that the otherness cannot be attributed to some ethnic difference, their inclusion in their assessment suggests that the monstrous otherness of the hybrid creatures could have been explained by one of those ethnic backgrounds.

Moore uses negating similarly to propose hypothetical situations that are earlier shown to be true. In the final car drive towards Arkham the group theorises,

> I don't think either of them knew it. Black met Lovecraft in 1919, just before
> Lovecraft's most productive year. Lovecraft went on to write his stories, and they
> somehow came to permeate most western culture. That's what's most inexplicable. I
> mean, why didn't anybody notice how unlikely that was? (*Providence)*

Here, Moore accurately summarises Black's interaction with Lovecraft in the story of *Providence,* by negating the claim that that is what happened. However, Moore's use of negating does not put forward an ideological theory nor does it attempt to suggest a new interpretation of the narrative. Rather it reaffirms what the reader has come to understand. While Moore uses similar forms of negating to convey information, there is no case to be made for an ideological transference in this stylistic tool. Lovecraft's excerpt is especially notable because it incorporates racial othering into a situation where it holds no other function than to frame the monsters in a racial light.

## 4.6 Hypothesising

Both "The Call of Cthulhu" and "The Shadow over Innsmouth" are stories written as category A narratives in which the narrator participates in the story. Furthermore, both stories are written in the reflector mode, creating stories in which the narrator is an active participant who represents the author's ideology through expressions of modality. Lovecraft's narrators tend to use negative modality to describe their surroundings. Negative modality is characterised by its use of epistemic modality to express either certainty or uncertainty about a situation, and perception modality to express truth and certainty. This is reflected in Lovecraft's frequent use of the modal verb must, to put forward thoughts the narrator deems factual: "…and although there must have been nearly a hundred mongrel celebrants in the throng…" ("Cthulhu" 263). Hypothesising can be a fairly explicit injection of ideology into

the text. In most instances, Lovecraft favours stylistic features which convey his ideology in more subtle ways. However, in some cases the narrator will explicitly voice his views. When trying to understand the origins of the inhabitants of Innsmouth, the narrator suggests: "I myself would have thought of biological degeneration rather than alienage" ("Innsmouth" 773). Here, the narrator's evaluation of what type of racial other best explains the origins of the monstrous other, suggests strongly to the reader the parallels Lovecraft believes to exist between the two.

Moore's verbal hypothesising mostly takes shape in conditional sentence structures. The comic trilogy does not have any examples of this representing an ideological undertone, but the reader is nevertheless tempted to believe the hypothesis as presented by Moore: "Well, yes, if your mind were altering and you weren't aware of it, that would be unspeakable" (*Providence).* However, Moore prefers to showcase possibilities through hypothetical panels, of which its accuracy is left for debate. These usually depict perceptions from the viewpoint of characters, who may or may not be trustworthy. However, due to the visual nature of the graphic novel, these hypotheses are often quickly confirmed or denied in subsequent panels, or by other characters. In *Neonomicon*, Brears hypothesises that her encounter with Carcosa was a dream, but she is quickly corrected by Sax who confirms she actually met him. While Lovecraft's writing uses hypothesising to express ideological perceptions, Moore's use of hypothesising is limited to a few instances that carry no ideological meaning from Lovecraft's works.

4.7 Representing Time, Space and Society

The most important effect, relevant to this stylistic feature is the ability of the author to create a deictic centre, which causes the reader to view the narrative from that point of view (Jeffries, *Critical Stylistics* 156). Even if the fictional world does not entirely map onto the real world, the author still aims to convince the reader of this. This helps to sell the

ideological underpinnings of their text. Firstly, Lovecraft's use of first-person narrative technique forces the reader to shift his viewpoint to that of the narrator. This forces the reader to join the narrator in their othering. This also applies when Lovecraft gives characters a voice to speak, as he only ever does so when they align themselves with his ideological viewpoints: "But the real thing behind the way folks feel is simply race prejudice – and I don't say I'm blaming those that hold it. I hate those Innsmouth folks myself, and I wouldn't care to go to their town" ("Innsmouth" 766). Here the reader is tempted to accept the prejudice as a natural part of the world, and at least somewhat justified. Some lines from "The Shadow Over Innsmouth" might not directly convey any ideological subtext but help deictically pin the full narrative into a believable world that maps onto the real world:

> Some of the stories would make you laugh—about old Captain Marsh driving
> bargains with the devil and bringing imps out of hell to live in Innsmouth, or about
> some kind of devil-worship and awful sacrifices in some place near the wharves that
> people stumbled on around 1845 or thereabouts—but I come from Panton, Vermont,
> and that kind of story don't go down with me. ("Innsmouth" 765)

In this excerpt the narrator toys with the unlikelihood of the rumours surrounding Innsmouth. Lovecraft subtly plants the idea of the goings-on in Innsmouth in the reader's mind by negating the possibility of these rumours. In addition, Lovecraft incorporates a date and location which further ground the narrative giving the reader a sense of time and place.

Moore's narration is represented in square blocks. In *The Courtyard,* they intimately describe Sax's thoughts and decision-making process. The reader is invited, therefore, to view the comic through his eyes. Sax is also Moore's most overtly racist character in the trilogy and expresses these thoughts consistently. The resulting effect is that many of the racist perceptions Sax shares on the inhabitants of the neighbourhood he is investigating are then taken as fact. Sax's description of the building and neighbourhood he has come to work

from further others the minority community and paints them as disgusting: "Our rooming

house has a shared bathroom. This morning, when I went to shave, there was shit in the wash-

basin" (*The Courtyard*). This sentiment is further supported by Moore's close up depiction of

Sax's description, which takes up half the page. Furthermore, Moore's use of characters with

real life counterparts such as H.P. Lovecraft, and Lovecraft scholar S.T. Joshi, in *Providence*,

grounds the work in reality, while simultaneously creating a meta narrative on the

Lovecraftian horror stories. This grants credibility to the overall narrative of the story, and

suggests to the reader that the incorporated ideological viewpoint maps onto reality.

**5     Conclusion**

The analysis in chapter four shows that the seven critical stylistic tools uncover the ideological underpinnings of Lovecraft's works. Lovecraft's choice of stylistic devices foreground racial and ethnic elements and reveal the incorporation of his racist ideologies as expressed through the theme of othering prevalent throughout his works. However, not all of these stylistic features are adopted by Alan Moore in his adaptation of Lovecraft's works. Moore's careful dealings with the source material, prevents some of the racist ideologies being uncritically transferred into his work. The naming practices contain the most glaring example of racist stylistic features, which made its way through the adaptation process. Not only does Moore use similar or worse epithets to refer to non-white characters, Sax as a racist character expresses many of the racial otherings typical of Lovecraft's writing. However, Moore grants the othered characters more agency and opportunity to establish themselves as more than just analogues of racist stereotypes. In analysing the representations of actions, events and states, Moore shows he is willing to give othered characters the opportunity to act and communicate on their own behalf. Something contrary to Lovecraft's style. Lovecraft manages to convey an animalistic regard for the othered characters in his work, by subtly equating their characteristics to various beasts. Moore, in part due to the medium in which he works, is less subtle in his comparisons. Horrific imagery shows the cruel and inhuman aspects of the monstrous other that are the subject of Moore's trilogy. Each creature is drawn in detail with ample opportunity for the reader to carefully observe them. Lovecraft's view on race is presented through the implications he proposes on the connectedness between monstrous creatures and their possible origin in foreign countries. Moore uses similar implicature to connect the horrific murders in *The Courtyard,* to the object of Sax's racist viewpoints, the underprivileged community he views as other and inferior to him. Furthermore, even when race is decidedly not a contributing factor in the cause of the

occurrence of monstrous others, Lovecraft manages to include it in his description. Lovecraft explicitly negates the role of race, and in doing so suggests to the reader the possibility of its relevance. While Moore may use negating in a similar manner, to present possible relevant aspects of the narrative, they lack all forms of Lovecraft's ideology on race and othering.

Hypothesising functions similarly for Lovecraft and Moore. While Lovecraft may use epistemic modality to convincingly state his desired ideological conclusion, Moore at most uses conditional sentences to convey hypothetical scenarios without much ideological influence from Lovecraft on othering. Finally, the deictic elements help ground both narratives, but also their ideological underpinning. Similarly to Lovecraft's works, Moore's first person narrative in *The Courtyard* gives a convincing perspective on the racist viewpoints of his characters. Through the inclusion of dates, and place names, and even the inclusion of recognisable characters with real life equivalents, make the stories read as analogous to our own world.

The concept of racial othering entails a set of convictions which need to be analysed through a critical lens. As such, this study finds that by applying critical stylistic tools, some of the questions surrounding the ideological foundation of texts can be answered. The analysis in this thesis goes beyond merely identifying possible sources of ideologically motivated choices, but aims to establish a replicable tool for analysing the ideology of Lovecraft's works and the various adaptations across all media.

After analysing the works of Lovecraft it has become clear that his stylistic choices work together to incorporate an ideological subtext to his works. All seven stylistic tools collaborate to formulate a stylistic guide to Lovecraft's ideological underpinnings. However, these stylistic choices are not fully incorporated in Alan Moore's adaptations. Moore's journey in writing this trilogy of graphic novels resulted in a first part which heavily borrowed from Lovecraft's ideologically loaded stylistic choices. However, as Moore

continued, he managed to deviate and break free from many of the stylistic elements that incorporate the ideological subtext of Lovecraft's works. This resulted in a set of works which manages to recognise and sometimes even subvert the stylistic choices made by Lovecraft in telling his tales of cosmic horror.

  The stylistic tools applied frequently did not fully map onto instances of ideological expressions from either author, and proved to be rigid in its analytical process leaving some aspects of both sets of work unanalysed. Further research could be done on broadening the stylistic model used in this thesis, and improving the applicability of the model to features of Gothic Fiction and ideas of racial othering.

**Works Cited**

Anolik, Ruth Bienstock. "Introduction: The Dark Unknown." *The Gothic Other: Racial and Social Constructions in the Literary Imagination*, by Ruth Bienstock Anolik and Douglas L. Howard, McFarland & Company, 2004, pp. 1–14.

Arata, S.D. "The Occidental Tourist: "Dracula" and the Anxiety of Reverse Colonization." *Victorian Studies*, vol. 33, no. 4, Summer 1990, pp. 621-645.

Avery, Katherine, "(In)Human Anatomies: Constructions of Whiteness and Otherness in the Fiction of H.P. Lovecraft" (2019). *Undergraduate Honors Theses.* William & Mary. Paper 1329. https://scholarworks.wm.edu/honorstheses/1329, accessed 24 July 2022.

Baetens, Jan. "Revealing Traces A New Theory of Graphic Enunciation." *The Language of Comics: Word and Image*, by Robin Varnum, University Press of Mississippi, 2010, pp. 145–155.

Claverie, Ezra. "Lovecraft Fandom(s): Racism, Denial, and White Nationalism." *Intensities: The Journal of Cult Media*, 2013, pp. 80–110.

Di Liddo, Annalisa. *Alan Moore Comics as Performance, Fiction as Scalpel*. University Press of Mississippi, 2009.

Edwards, Justin D. *Gothic Passages: Racial Ambiguity and the American Gothic*. University of Iowa Press, 2013.

Eil, Philip. "The Unlikely Reanimation of H.P. Lovecraft." *The Atlantic*, 20 Aug. 2015, www.theatlantic.com/entertainment/archive/2015/08/hp-lovecraft-125/401471/?utmsource=copy-link&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=share, accessed 24 July 2022.

Evans, Timothy H. "A Last Defense against the Dark: Folklore, Horror, and the Uses of Tradition in the Works of H. P. Lovecraft." *Journal of Folklore Research: An*

*International Journal of Folklore and Ethnomusicology*, vol. 42, no. 1, 2005, pp. 99–135.

Fiedler, Leslie A., and Charles B. Harris. *Love and Death in the American Novel*. Dalkey Archive Press, 2003.

Forceville, Charles, et al. "Stylistics and Comics." *The Routledge Handbook of Stylistics*, edited by Michael Burke, Routledge, 2014, pp. 485-499.

Grice, Herbert Paul. *Studies in the Way of Words*. Harvard University Press, 1991.

Groensteen, Thierry, et al. *The System of Comics*. University Press of Mississippi, 2018.

Hescher, Achim. *Reading Graphic Novels*. De Gruyter, 2016.

Hogle, E J., editor. *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction*. Cambridge University Press, 2002.

Houellebecq, Michel, et al. *H.P. Lovecraft: Against the World, against Life*. Cernunnos, 2019.

Jeffries, Lesley. *Critical Stylistics: the Power of English*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Jeffries, Lesley. *Textual Construction of the Female Body: a Critical Discourse Approach*. Springer, 2007.

Jeffries, Lesley. "Textual Meaning and Its Place in a Theory of Language." *Topics in Linguistics*, vol. 15, no. 1, 2015, n.p.

Jeffries, Lesley. "Interpretation." *The Cambridge Handbook of Stylistics*, edited by Peter Stockwell and Sara Whiteley, Cambridge University Press, 2015, pp. 467–484.

Joshi, S. T. *A Dreamer and a Visionary H. P. Lovecraft in His Time*. Liverpool University Press, 2001.

Kristeva, Julia. "Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection." *SubStance*, translated by Leon S. Roudiez, vol. 13, no. 3/4, 1984, p. 140.

Lloyd-Smith, Allan. *American Gothic Fiction: An Introduction*. Continuum, 2005.

Lovecraft, H. P. "Notes on Writing Weird Fiction." *Miscellaneous Writings*, edited by S. T.

      Joshi, Arkham House Publishers, 1995.

Lovecraft, H. P. "On The Creation of Niggers." *Lovecraft: A Biography*, by De Camp Lyon

      Sprague, New English Library, 1975, p. 95.

Lovecraft, H. P. *Selected Letters I*. Edited by August Derleth and Donald Wandrei,

      Arkham House, 1964.

Lovecraft, H. P. "The Call of Cthulhu." *The New Annotated H.P. Lovecraft*, edited by Leslie

      S. Klinger, Liveright, 2014.

Lovecraft, H. P. *The Conservative The Complete Issues 1915-1923*. Arktos Media Ltd., 2013.

Lovecraft, H. P., et al. *Letters to Rheinhart Kleiner*. Hippocampus Press, 2005.

Malchow, H.L. "Frankenstein's Monster and Images of Race in Nineteenth-Century Britain."

      *Past & Present,* no. 139, 1993, pp. 90-130.

McCloud, Scott. *Understanding Comics: the Invisible Art*. Harper Perennial, 2010.

Miéville, China. "Weird Fiction." *The Routledge Companion to Science Fiction*, edited By

      Mark Bould, Andrew Butler, Adam Roberts, Sherryl Vint Routledge, 2009, pp. 510-

      515.

Miller, Ann. *Reading Bande dessinée: Critical Approaches to French-Language Comic Strip*.

      Intellect Books, 2007.

Moore, Alan. *The Courtyard*. Avatar Press, 2009.

Moore, Alan. *Neonomicon*. Avatar Press, 2021.

Moore, Alan. *Providence*. Avatar Press, 2017.

Moreland, Sean. *New Directions in Supernatural Horror Literature: the Critical Influence of*

      *H. P. Lovecraft*. Springer, 2018.

Parkin, Lance. *Magic Words: The Extraordinary Life of Alan Moore*. Aurum Press, 2014.

Price, Robert M. *The Innsmouth Cycle: The Taint of the Deep Ones*. Chaosium, Inc., 2006.

Romagnoli, Alex S., and Gian S. Pagnucci. *Enter the Superheroes: American Values, Culture, and the Canon of Superhero Literature*. The Scarecrow Press, 2013.

Saler, Michael T. *As If: Modern Enchantment and the Literary Prehistory of Virtual Reality*. Oxford University Press, 2012.

Sargent, Neil. "Between the Rational and the Marvellous: Edgar Allan Poe and the Counter-Enlightenment Origins of the Modern Detective Story." *Intersections of Law and Culture*, 2012, pp. 170–191.

Shershow, Scott Cutler, and Scott Michaelsen. *The Love of Ruins: Letters on Lovecraft*. State University of New York Press, 2017.

Simpson, Paul. *Language, Ideology and Point of View*. Routledge, 1993.

Singer, Marc. *Breaking the Frames: Populism and Prestige in Comics Studies*. University of Texas Press, 2019.

Smith, Don G. *H.P. Lovecraft in Popular Culture: the Works and Their Adaptations in Film, Television, Comics, Music, and Games*. McFarland & Co., 2006.

Sorlin, Sandrine. "The 'Indisciplinarity' of Stylistics." *Topics in Linguistics*, vol. 14, no. 1, 2014, pp. 9–15.

Thouret, Clotilde. "Traveling Possible Words in Graphic Narratives: The Example of Watchmen (Alan Moore and Dave Gibbons)." *Neohelicon*, vol. 40, no. 2, 2013, pp. 461–474.

Wilson, Eric. *The Republic of Cthulhu: Lovecraft, The Weird Tale, and Conspiracy Theory*. Punctum Books, 2016.

Yus, Francisco. "Inferring from Comics: A Multi-Stage Account." *Quaderns de Filologia. Estudis de Comunicació*, vol. 3, 2006, pp. 1-27.