



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

Transformation of the Greek Prostitution Market: Causes of the rise of Human Trafficking in Greece during the 1990s

PAPADIAMANTI, ZOI van

Citation

PAPADIAMANTI, Z. O. I. van. (2023). *Transformation of the Greek Prostitution Market: Causes of the rise of Human Trafficking in Greece during the 1990s*.

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [License to inclusion and publication of a Bachelor or Master Thesis, 2023](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/3638923>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

**MA History – Cities, Migration and Global Interdependence
Academic Year 2022-2023**

***Transformation of the Greek Prostitution Market:
Causes of the rise of Human Trafficking in Greece
during the 1990s***

Papdiamanti Zoi

Supervisor: Dr Marion Pluskota

Second Reader: Dr. Marlou Schrover

MA Thesis

“This Scientific paper was supported by the Onassis Foundation –
Scholarship ID: O ZS 002-1/2022-2022”.

Word Count: 24.158

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments.....	3
Introduction.....	4
Methodology.....	7
Chapter I: Transformation of the Greek prostitution market.....	9
Chapter II: Causes of human trafficking.....	17
Part I: Factors that enabled human trafficking to flourish in the former Soviet Union.....	18
Part II: Greece as a recipient and transit country of human trafficking.....	22
Chapter III: Legal Framework regarding Prostitution, Immigration and Trafficking in Greece.....	27
Law 1193/1981; Protection and regulation against sexually transmitted diseases and related issues.....	27
Law 2734/1999; Regarding persons engaging in sex for monetary gain.....	29
Law 1975/1991; Aliens, refugees, residence permits and other provisions.....	32
Law 2910/2001; Foreigners: entrance, residency and other provisions.....	33
Law 4090/1960; Issues of imprisonment, prisoners and other provisions.....	34
Law 3064/2002; Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim.....	34
Conclusion.....	37
Appendix.....	39
Law 1193/1981; Protection and regulation against sexually transmitted diseases and related issues.....	39
Law 2734/1999; Regarding persons engaging in sex for monetary gain.....	40
Law 1975/1991; Aliens, refugees, residence permits and other provisions.....	43
Law 2910/2001; Foreigners: entrance, residency and other provisions.....	44
Law 4090/1960; Issues of imprisonment, prisoners and other provisions.....	46
Law 3064/2002; Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim.....	46
Bibliography.....	48

Acknowledgments

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor Marion Pluskota, for her constant guidance and support this year. Her comments and constructive critique of my ideas and approach to the research subject were invaluable in completing it.

I would also like to thank my scholarship foundation. I gratefully acknowledge the funding of the Onassis Foundation. Thanks to them, I was able to study at Leiden University and experience this fascinating journey. I would like to thank Katerina Magkel, the representative with whom I communicated throughout the year and who fully supported me.

This master thesis would be incomplete without the contribution of Athina Kastelanou and Nikoletta Iliou. The first agreed to share with me her experiences regarding her active years in prostitution during the 1990s. The latter is the rescue manager of the non-profit organisation A21, who gave me a detailed account of their organisation's contribution to the fight against human trafficking in Greece. I thank them both wholeheartedly.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family and friends for their unlimited support and encouragement this year.

Introduction

The political and social changes caused by the fall of the Soviet Union and the collapse of Communism in Europe were accompanied by increased human trafficking for sexual exploitation in the continent. Women from the former Soviet Union were recruited by illusive means, trafficked to other European countries, and forced into prostitution. Since the 1990s, Mediterranean countries, such as Italy, Turkey, Cyprus, and Greece, have been significant transit and destination countries for sex trafficking.¹ This paper delves into the deeper causes of the rise of human trafficking in Greece and the transformation of the relatively small-scaled prostitution market into a vast sex industry which operated under the rules and regulations of the traffickers.

Human trafficking has long been associated with the sex industry. Sex-industry describes the activities connected to the voluntary offer of sexual services and products, such as prostitution, pornography and telephone sex services, in exchange for money or material compensation.² In recent scholarship, the term is preferred to prostitution, as it acknowledges the exchange of sexual services as a profession.³ On the other hand, “prostitution” not only includes sexual services such as exotic dancing and pornography but is also connected to immorality. Prostitution in Greece experienced a remarkable transformation during the 1990s from a relatively moderate prostitution market to a proper sex industry. The constant influx of migrant forced prostitutes dominated the prostitution market and dethroned the Greek prostitutes, whose numbers substantially declined but did not disappear entirely.⁴ Moreover, the profit from human trafficking altered the prostitution market and helped it expand in terms of numbers, services and locations. Human trafficking is still a challenging problem for the country, as seen in the case of trafficking and forced prostitution of a young Greek girl by a policeman in the neighbourhood of Ilioupoli, Athens, in 2021.⁵

The paper aims to examine the deeper roots of human trafficking while taking as a case study Greece. The rise of human trafficking, as a broader consequence of a general increase in organised crime, was presented by the police authorities and the contemporary Greek media as an imported phenomenon connected to the severe influx of migrants from the former socialist countries.⁶ However, human trafficking did not appear suddenly in the country. As early as in the 1980s, women from Thailand, Eritrea, Sri Lanka and the Philippines were forced to settle and work as prostitutes in Greece.⁷ Therefore, to research which conditions allowed human trafficking to rise significantly during the 1990s, a valid question to answer is, “Why did human trafficking flourish in Greece between the 1990s until the early 2000s?”

¹ Hughes, Donna M., “Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation”, International Organisation for Migration, 2002, page 28.

² Gerassi, Lara, “From Exploitation to Industry: Definitions, Risks, and Consequences of Domestic Sexual Exploitation and Sex Work Among Women and Girls,” *Journal Of Human Behavior In The Social Environment* vol. 25,6 (2015), page 593.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Lazos, Grigorios, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, Athens, Kastanioti, 2001, page 123.

⁵ “A 19-year-old girl was detained and traded by a police officer”, *Athens News*, 12/06/2021, <https://en.rua.gr/2021/07/12/a-19-year-old-girl-was-detained-and-traded-by-a-police-officer/>.

⁶ Antonopoulos, Georgios “Are the “Others” Coming? Evidence on ‘alien conspiracy’ from three illegal markets in Greece”, *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 52, 2009, page 478 and page 489, Papanicolaou, Georgios, “The Sex Industry, Human Trafficking and the Global Prohibition Regime: A cautionary tale from Greece”, *Trends in Organized Crime*, 11(4), 2008, page 384.

⁷ Lazaridis, G., “Trafficking and Prostitution: The Growing Exploitation of Migrant Women in Greece,” *European Journal of Women’s Studies*, 8(1), 2001, page 80.

It is crucial to highlight that Greece experienced a second transformation regarding its population during that period. A traditionally emigration country accepted a large number of documented and undocumented migrants.⁸ The Greek economy had been stabilised, and many Greeks paused their emigration or returned to their mother country. On the other hand, the significant consequences of the collapse of communism compelled many people from the former Soviet Union to seek better employment opportunities and, subsequently, better living conditions abroad. This immigration influx found Greece unprepared in terms of legislation and infrastructure. The rise of trafficking occurred during the 1990s and was accompanied and connected by the newspapers of the time with the large immigration wave of labour migrants to the country.⁹

Prostitution in Greece remains generally understudied, especially the relationship between human trafficking and prostitution. While the role of the prostitute has been extensively studied, what scholarship lacks is studies regarding the part of the trafficker and trafficking networks and the importance of the client. Human trafficking operates as a free market, where the demand determines the supply. Therefore, demand is a driving force for the survival of human trafficking. However, since trafficking networks are well-established and based on corruption and the legislation does not penalise the clients, there is little evidence regarding their actions.

Regarding Greece, Grigorios Lazos has been engaged in prostitution issues nationally in his two-volume book “Prostitution and International Human Trafficking in Modern Greece”. After collaborating with the Hellenic Police and interviewing active prostitutes of the time, he published a detailed research regarding the transformation of the prostitution market. In the first volume, titled “The Prostitute” («Η Εκδιδόμενη»), he gives a detailed report of the conditions of human trafficking during the 1980s and the 1990s. He analyses how and to what extent the prostitution market transformed. The second volume, which is called “The Client” («Ο Πελάτης»), refers to the role of the client and how vital his funding was for human trafficking to rise and expand. He does not delve into the ethical issues which derive from engaging in prostitution but rather focuses on the social class, the money spent and how the client supported the prostitution of human trafficking.

Gabriella Lazaridis has been engaged with prostitution topics in Greece. Her work “Trafficking and Prostitution: The growing exploitation of Migrant Women in Greece” sheds light on the recent increase of human trafficking in women from Central and Eastern Europe and their engagement in the sex industry. Using qualitative methods to conduct her research, she interviewed fourteen professionals working for the Greek immigration authorities, police, government, and academics. Moreover, she conducted nine interviews with NGO representatives and eighteen biographical interviews with migrant women who settled in the country at the beginning of the 1990s. The women were heterogeneous regarding age, religion, ethnicity and educational background.¹⁰ She concludes that the sex industry had indeed been transformed in the 1990s. More concretely, what she calls “traditional prostitution” transformed into a modernised system due to the influx of multinational migrant women, part of which were trafficked for forced prostitution.¹¹ According to Lazaridis, the new system is characterised by extreme violence and excessive

⁸ Muñoz de Bustillo and Antón, ‘From sending to host societies: immigration in Greece, Ireland and Spain in the 21st century’, *Industrial Relations Journal*, 41:6, 2010, page 563.

⁹ See further: Dora Antoniou, «Στη μεθόριο ανθεί το οργανωμένο έγκλημα», *Kathimerini*, 06/02/2002, Xatzidis Kostas «Έκθεση-σοκ για το οργανωμένο έγκλημα στην Ελλάδα», *Ta Nea*, 04/12/1999.

¹⁰ Lazaridis, “Trafficking and Prostitution”, page 73.

¹¹ *Ibid*, page 91.

exploitation.¹² These women have no connections with the country; they probably did not even know the language, which made their chances of escape even fewer.

Scholarship on prostitution has been closely linked to the regulation policies of states, particularly in the context of a significant debate surrounding its abolition. The discourse on the abolition of prostitution has attracted considerable attention within academic circles. On one side of this debate, we find the proponents of the new abolitionist movement and radical feminists who assert the need to abolish prostitution. They view prostitution as a form of slavery and a manifestation of male domination.¹³ Within this framework, prostitutes are perceived as passive individuals, helpless victims of male dominance, and are believed to engage in prostitution solely under coercion. This perspective denies women's self-determination over their sexuality while associating male sexuality with violence and control.¹⁴ According to this theory, human trafficking can be reduced and even eradicated if prostitution is abolished. However, they do not talk about the economics behind sex industries, and they primarily focus on female prostitution, neglecting male and queer sex workers¹⁵.

On the opposing side, some advocates argue for regulating prostitution as a recognised profession, contending that it can be a conscious choice for women.¹⁶ They assert that prostitution should be subject to state regulation to ensure the safety and security of sex workers. This perspective acknowledges women's sexuality and autonomy in their choices, including their decisions to engage in the sex industry. Additionally, this discourse rejects the assumption that every woman who migrates for this purpose is automatically a victim of human trafficking.¹⁷ This ongoing debate has led to varying policies on prostitution in different countries. For instance, Sweden has adopted the abolitionist model, which focuses on criminalising the buyers of sex rather than the sex workers themselves. In contrast, countries like Germany and the Netherlands have chosen to regulate prostitution as a legitimate profession.

In Greece, legislation regarding prostitution coincides with the German and Dutch models. Despite that, prostitution is not considered a proper profession, resulting in restrictions for the prostitutes to forming a Union or claim professional rights. The authorities conceive it as an activity someone can profit from, not a profession. This argument and its consequences are analysed further in the third chapter.

Finally, regarding the structure of the thesis, the paper will be divided into three chapters. The first chapter gives a detailed account of how the prostitution market was before the 1990s and how it transformed. The second chapter has two parts and regards the causes of the rise of human trafficking in the former Soviet Union and the case of Greece. At last, the third chapter gives a historical overview of the most relevant Greek legislation and discusses its effectiveness.

¹² Lazaridis, "Trafficking and Prostitution" page 88.

¹³ Outshoorn, Joyce, "The Political Debates on Prostitution and Trafficking of Women." *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society*, 12, 2005, page 145.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Ibid, page 145.

¹⁷ Ibid, page 147.

Methodology

Regarding the methodology, I will use quantitative and qualitative data. The Hellenic Police has released the annual arrests of traffickers and the number of trafficked victims from 2003 until today. However, the data from the police face two significant problems. Firstly, there are no data prior to 2003. There was no separate antitrafficking law before 2003 in the Greek legal framework. Consequently, the Hellenic Police could not classify their findings and their arrests. After the enforcement of law 3064 in 2002 regarding “Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim”, the data they collected from their arrests were released. Secondly, since the law about trafficking refers to all forms of trafficking, the data do not distinguish between victims of forced prostitution, domestic and agricultural labour and beggary. Hence, there is no way to distinguish which were victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation and which were of labour exploitation. The annual reports for organised crime of 2004 and 2005 will also be examined. The reports reveal all the forms of organised crime in the country and information regarding organised criminal groups and networks. Even though they highlight that the primary goal of the Police was to attack the structure of the criminal groups, they do not reveal their strategies or ways of action, resulting in inconsistencies in the number of arrests that will be analysed in the paper.

The results of the population census conducted by the Hellenic Statistical Authority (ELSTAT) regarding the foreigners who settled in Greece in 2011, will be used. These data concern the documented migrants who entered the country legally, so we can assume that the number of documented and undocumented migrants is greater. Estimations regarding the number of undocumented migrants are difficult to be made. However, the results of the population census indicate that for Greek standards, the influx of migrants was without precedent.

As for the qualitative data, various newspaper articles will be used to investigate the contemporary sentiments regarding the rise of human trafficking, to provide testimonies from victims or people involved in human trafficking or provide background information. The collection of the newspapers is diverse in terms of the political background of each newspaper and includes Greek and international media. All of the newspapers engage in politics, economics and international affairs. “To Vima” followed a centre-left approach and supported the centre-left party P.A.S.O.K. At the same time, “Ta Nea” had a centre-right approach and covered the operation of the centre-right party of New Democracy. Additionally, “Rizospastis” was the official newspaper of the Greek Communist Party (Κομμουνιστικό Κόμμα Ελλάδος). At the same time, “Indymedia” was an independent media project that embraced anti-authoritarian, anti-capitalist, and anti-globalisation perspectives. Regarding the international media, “BBC News” supported impartial journalism, while “The Moscow Times”, which emerged in 1992, kept an independent perspective.

Even though contemporary media is a valuable source, its most significant disadvantage is the lack of digitalised archives. Since the research was held in The Netherlands, visiting the Greek archives was not possible, resulting in fewer available articles.

Moreover, a video of a respected reporter, Dimitris Markos, who used to work on the Greek channel “SKAI”, is also vital to the research. The reportage concerned the sanitary conditions of the brothels in Athens. With his crew, he visited brothels in the centre of Athens to cover the medical condition of the prostitutes. “SKAI” is a

private television channel which, during the 1990s, kept a relatively centre-winged stance. However, access to the archives of the television station is not possible. Therefore, the video was derived from “YouTube”.

Furthermore, I conducted a biographical interview with a sex worker who was active during the 1990s, Athina Kastelanou. She described how the sex industry was from the perception of a sex worker. What is interesting from the interview was that she revealed how the prostitution market operated and what the relationship was between the Greeks and the migrant prostitutes. For instance, Ms Kastelanou claims there were very few migrant prostitutes in the 1990s compared to the next decade. She estimates that Greek prostitutes were close to 80% of the total number of prostitutes, while the migrant only 20%. However, Lazos’ research reveals that the migrant prostitutes outnumbered the Greek prostitutes relatively early in the decade. Taking into consideration Lazos’ analysis regarding the Greek prostitution market, Ms Kastelanou’s inconsistency can be explained since the Greek and the migrant prostitutes practised their services in different places.

Additionally, an interview with Nikoletta Iliou, the rescue manager of the non-profit and non-governmental organisation “A21” in Athens, revealed chronic problems and weaknesses of the anti-trafficking policy of the state. However, since the organisation was founded in 2008 in Thessaloniki, its data reflect the development of human trafficking in the 2000s.

Lastly, the legal framework regarding prostitution, immigration policies and human trafficking will also be considered. Even though these are three different phenomena, they are closely related. It is crucial to study the legislation, as traffickers take advantage of loopholes or inconsistencies in the laws to establish themselves or avoid imprisonment.

Chapter I: Transformation of the Greek prostitution market

In September of 1998, the left-wing musician Panagiotis Vichos published an article in the newspaper "New Perspective" («Νέα Πολιτική») about his experience on the island of Santorini in that same summer, where he was staying for professional reasons. He reported a well-established trafficking network on the island, supported by the police, which forced underage girls and women to work in prostitution. The majority of the women came from countries of the former Soviet Union to work on the island as dancers and prostitutes. They all stayed in the same building, known as "Villa Argiri,"¹⁸ confined and locked up to keep them from escaping.

The accounts Vichos managed to write down and publish are reminiscent of those of many immigrant women trafficked to Greece, under the misconception that they would work as dancers and then finding themselves forced into prostitution. They wanted to leave and return to their country of origin, but they could not gain their freedom unless someone bought them in order to free them. Vichos publicly accused the police Chief of the island of ignoring the victims' call for help and protection and, more importantly, being involved in the trafficking network himself. Vichos claimed that everyone on the island knew what was going on in the "Villa Argiri", and that there were women who were being sexually exploited. Still, the leaders of the network, police Chief included, were so well-established that no one dared to talk. The police Chief then sued Vichos and the newspaper editor for slander. In the following years, while the trial was still going on, the Department for Cybercrime invaded his house after an accusation that he was involved in child pornography. The left¹⁹ saw this as an attempt to terrorise and muzzle Vichos. The verdict found Vichos non-guilty, and this enhanced the left's claims.

Vichos' report was one of the first eponymous accusations which was made at the end 1990s. As early as the mid-1970s, organised crime appeared in the country, only to expand in the 1980s and flourish in the 1990s. Greek newspapers at the end of the 1990s wrote that organised crime had been underestimated by the state and the public of the country and by then had already taken many forms, such as human smuggling, drug dealing, contraband, gun smuggling, and of course, human trafficking for sexual exploitation.²⁰ Until the 1980s, only the Turkish border from Evros was used by the organised crime networks, and thus, in the remaining land borders, there was no powerful police supervision. However, due to the political developments in the Balkan peninsula, organised criminal organisations took advantage of the uncovered Albanian, Bulgarian and North Macedonian (former Yugoslavian) borders.

Human trafficking networks operated as catalysts for the change in Greece's prostitution market. In essence, because of the influx of migrant forced prostitutes, the

¹⁸ The name was taken by the owner of the building Argiri, who was an important figure in the island's criminal activities.

¹⁹ As we see from sites such as "Indymedia Athens" and "To Mov". The first is an online journal by activists, in Greece, is often called as "the known site of the antiestablishment world". The second is a feminist online newspaper.

See further; <https://athens.indymedia.org/post/73088/>, Sissi Vovou, «Παναγιώτης Βήχος: Προτοστάτησε στον αγώνα εναντίον του τράφικινγκ», *To Mov*, 4/12/2013, <https://tomov.gr/2013/12/04/panagiotis-vichos-protostatise-ston-agona-enantion-trafikink/>, Sissi Vovou, «Όταν εγκληματεί η Υπηρεσία Δίωξης Ηλεκτρονικού Εγκλήματος», *To Mov*, 20/02/16, <https://tomov.gr/2016/02/20/otan-egklimatei-ypiresia-dioxis-ilektronikoy-egklimatos/>

²⁰ Dora Antoniou, «Στη μεθόριο ανθεί το οργανωμένο έγκλημα», *KATHIMERINI*, 6/02/2002, <https://www.kathimerini.gr/society/110523/sti-methorio-anthei-to-organomeno-egklima/>

necessary conditions appeared for the creation of a vast sex industry. While prostitution so far had been demographically and spatially contained in the big cities, human trafficking networks created a new reality with the expansion in territory and services.²¹ They first started timidly in the 1980s, only to flourish in the 1990s.

Human trafficking for sexual exploitation did not appear in Greece suddenly. During the 1980s, there was a relatively small, not deterrent demand for foreign prostitutes by the clients, which foreboded the growth of sex trafficking in the 1990s. The pimps and the Greek prostitutes failed to cover the demand, and the trafficking networks of the next decade came to fill the gap.²² Prostitution, from a simple exchange of sexual services for money between individuals, transformed into a large industry, with more services, because of the trafficking networks which constantly supplied the prostitution market with new women, new products. It was the profit of the trafficking that gave prostitution in Greece the characteristics of an extensive sex industry. Indeed, a sex industry of the extent of millions of euros, reaching 600 million euros annually according to the newspaper “*To Vima*”.²³

Until the 1980s, the prostitution market in Greece was staffed primarily by Greek prostitutes.²⁴ There were some pimp networks, but they could not control the whole market, and there were many independent prostitutes as well. There were also some migrant prostitutes who were not forced into prostitution by trafficking networks. The “old/traditional” prostitution had brothels as its core. Most brothels were illegal due to the strict legal restrictions.²⁵ However, they could still provide a safe environment for the prostitutes in terms of sexual and financial exploitation of sex workers. The Greek prostitutes had the liberty and space to defend themselves and even refuse services since they had connections with other prostitutes and social networks in Greece. Moreover, most of the transactions were happening between the two independent faces of the intercourse, the customer²⁶ and the prostitute, leaving other intercessors out of the transaction.

Old prostitution addressed to the lower social and economic classes to find customers, as well as to teenage boys looking for their first sexual experience and people with disabilities, while it was limited to urban centres.²⁷ We could say that it was the bare minimum of what they could offer. A central point of how old prostitution worked was that the customers only cared about their sexual relief. Prostitution was not connected with fun and pleasure. Brothels and streets were the primary locations for practicing prostitution. Since these places could be easily controlled by the pimp networks and other prostitutes and were regulated by the state, they offered only sexual intercourse to the customer and nothing else.

²¹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 577.

²² *Ibid*, page 120.

²³ Tsarouhas K., “600.000.000Ευρώ ο τζίρος της πορνείας», *To Vima*, 24.11.2008 (this is the date of updating the newspapers’ archive, not the date the article was published. The date the article was published is not mentioned. However, it has to be after 2002, since the article counts the profit of prostitution in euros and Greece entered euro in 2002. Furthermore, it has to be before the 2008, since the evidence they give refer to the years until 2000 and are based on Lazos’ research. <https://www.tovima.gr/2008/11/24/archive/600-000-000-eyrw-o-tziros-tis-porneias/>

²⁴ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 224. Lazaridis “Trafficking and Prostitution”, page 91.

²⁵ The restrictions which made the operation of the brothels semi-legal or illegal will be examined on “Chapter III: Legal Framework regarding Prostitution, Immigration and Trafficking in Greece”.

²⁶ The term “customer” will be used for the clients of legal – or semi-legal, but not forced prostitution, while the term “client” will be used for the clients of forced prostitution.

²⁷ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 577.

This scene started to change in 1975, particularly during the 1980s when trafficking networks imported women from the Philippines, Thailand and Poland to work.²⁸ These networks disappeared at the end of the decade, each for its own reasons. There was demand for new prostitutes and a qualitative change of the prostitution image, that the old prostitutes could not, but mainly did not want to provide.²⁹

New clients and old clients with different tastes were trapped in the narrative of the beautiful and exotic migrant woman. The Greek women tried to comply with the new demands, but they focused on the increase of the places of prostitution in an attempt to increase their earnings³⁰ and not on the change or enrichment of services. Their bland and calm reaction to the new demands had two significant consequences for Greek prostitution. Firstly, not having realised the importance and expansion of trafficking networks, they kept a modest position which prevented Greek prostitution from growing and expanding but allowed it to be continued. Greek prostitutes refused to comply with their customers' demands since no one could impose on them the violence the forced prostitutes experienced. They had social standing in Greece and a place in the prostitution market. Greek prostitutes were few in number, and they knew each other. According to Athina Kastelanou, in order to find a place to practise prostitution on the streets, someone needs to know a prostitute or more working there. She joined street prostitution because she had met prostitutes working there while working at the brothel. Having connections with each other created an umbrella of solidarity and support.

This is a significant difference with forced prostitutes. The success of the trafficking networks comes from the prostitutes' lack of social standing in the country, their confusion and fear. On the contrary Greek prostitutes were well aware of their situation and the ease of denying services. Migrant prostitutes are generally considered more vulnerable in exploitation and willing or forced to provide more services with less money.³¹

Additionally, they left room for traffickers to import women and place them in bars, massage salons, and other businesses, which only seemingly did not engage in prostitution. Since there was demand for new services but no one to provide them, the traffickers had a new exploitative market in front of them. In essence, Greek prostitutes did not compete with the migrant prostitutes simply because they refused to take part in the type of prostitution the traffickers established in the country.

At the end of the 1980s, the trafficking networks of the decade fell. The scarce supply of migrant prostitutes, competition among the trafficking networks and local pimp networks, as well as the effective interference of the police-which mainly contributed to the regulation of trafficking rather than its disappearance, led to the trafficking networks dying. Local pimp networks did not disappear but gradually declined. Moreover, a substantial difference between the 1980s and the 1990s was the profile of forced prostitutes. The Polish and Thai women arrived in Greece legally because of an agreement among the states, which promoted women to work in hospitals and domestic labour. Consequently, they had connections in Greece and could not be manipulated that easily. Additionally, at the end of the decade, the trafficking networks decided to move these prostitutes to other countries where they could make an even larger profit.³²

²⁸ Lazaridis, 'Trafficking and Prostitution', page 80.

²⁹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 120.

³⁰ Ibid, page 121-122.

³¹ Pheterson, Gail, *A Vindication of the Rights of Whores*, Seattle, WA: Seal Press, 1989, page 242.

³² See further: Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 184-207.

The majority of the trafficking victims arrived in Greece by what the United Nation, according to the Palermo Protocol, defined as trafficking:

(a) "Trafficking in persons" shall mean the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs;

(b) The consent of a victim of trafficking in persons to the intended exploitation set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article shall be irrelevant where any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) have been used;³³

(c) The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered "trafficking in persons" even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in subparagraph (a) of this article;

(d) "Child" shall mean any person under eighteen years of age.³⁴

Women and underaged girls were trafficked in Greece from Albania, Azerbaijan, Bulgaria, Georgia, former Yugoslavia, Estonia, Kazakhstan, Latvia, Belarus, Lithuania, Moldavia, Uzbekistan, Ukraine, Poland, Russia, Romania and Slovenia. The women were lied to about what employment was available, and when they realised they were being trafficked, it was too late to escape. When they arrived, they were in a state of debt bondage.³⁵ The traffickers forced them to work in prostitution to pay them back for the money they gave to buy them. Extreme violence and intimidation were used to keep them from escaping. The newspaper "Ta Nea" published three stories of trafficked women; two of them gained their freedom, and one tried to commit suicide, all reporting the illusive means used to bring them to Greece and the violence they experienced during their confinement by the traffickers.³⁶

In numbers during the 1990s, old, non-forced prostitutes remained steady at under five thousand, according to Lazos' research. However, the number of forced prostitutes fluctuated. At the beginning of the decade, forced prostitutes were about two thousand, rapidly increasing, and by 1993 rose by 87%, meaning that they had reached approximately eight thousand prostitutes. From 1993 until 1996, forced prostitutes increased by eleven thousand, reaching the twenty thousand mark in 1996 and reaching their top in 1997 with 21.750. In the following years until 2000, the numbers fluctuated. In 1998 there were 19.700 forced prostitutes nationally, increasing again in 1999 to 20.300 and finally dropping to 19.400 in 2000.

The numbers can be explained if we take into account the three stages of prostitution in that decade. The first two years of forced prostitution was still

³³ Hellenic police, as well, considers victims, people who knew that they were going to engage in prostitution, however they were deceived regarding the living conditions, their earnings etc.

³⁴ 'UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION AGAINST TRANSNATIONAL ORGANIZED CRIME AND THE PROTOCOLS THERETO', United Nations, New York, 2004, page 42-43. Greece signed the Protocol on December 2000.

³⁵ Hughes, Donna M., "The "Natasha" Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women", *Journal of International Affairs* (New York) 53, no. 2 (2000), page 12.

³⁶ Vradelis Stelios, Kantouris Kostas, «20.000 γυναίκες θύματα της πορνείας», *Ta Nea*, 10/06/2004, <https://www.tanea.gr/2004/07/10/greece/20-000-gynaikes-thymata-tis-porneias/>

settling.³⁷ Traffickers were still networking with the businessmen and had to keep a low profile, afraid of the police's intervention. For the next four years, from 1993 until 1996, prostitution flourished in the large urban centres.³⁸ This was the time that prostitution in Greece took the form of the sex industry. Forced prostitutes rose significantly, overthrowing the Greek prostitutes. Traffickers constantly provided migrant women in the country, and clients constantly funded that influx. Based on the client's money, traffickers expanded their mechanisms. New facilities and services started appearing, and some money was used to bribe state officials. Lastly, the period 1997-2000 signified the expansion into rural areas.³⁹ The trafficking networks during the previous years observed a potential fullness of prostitution in urban centres and expanded to villages and small towns. As seen above, the number of prostitutes was relatively stable, without large fluctuations.

Prostitution in the countryside did not appear for the first time in the 1990s, but it was relatively rare before. The newspaper "To Vima" published an article about a bar in a Greek rural area which accommodated forced prostitutes.⁴⁰ They noted that in that bar, Greek prostitutes would come and go before the 1990s. They would not stay there for an extended period of time, afraid of the social stigma and then would continue to their next destination. Prostitution in Greek society is considered to be a "necessary evil" intertwined with immorality. Indeed, Ms Kastelanou revealed that she never revealed to her family what she was doing for a living, as she was afraid of their reaction. The ephemeral character of the prostitutes staying in those bars secured that they would not be identified and labelled as "whores" by the community.

That pattern was old, though. By then, only foreign women would work from the age of fifteen until twenty-five years old. Most of the girls were bought in Thessaloniki, which had turned into a significant centre of trafficking, according to the owner of the bar. The prettier the girl or the woman was, the more expensive she was. When a client entered the bar, the girls had to approach him and offer their services. The client then would choose any prostitute he wanted and could hire her for a few hours or even one day. Bars like this were typical in the Greek countryside.⁴¹

Statistics provided by the Hellenic Police show that the trafficking networks' action continued in the 2000s.⁴² The reports of the annual arrests of traffickers and the number of victims that were found do not mention information regarding the ages and gender, or the purpose of their trafficking in Greece, only ethnicity. In 2003, 284 traffickers were arrested in total. The vast majority of them were Greeks (166), and the Russians followed with 30 people. They also arrested twenty-two Albanians, twenty Romanians and twelve Ukrainians (12). However, the number of victims they found was significantly lower. Overall, they found ninety-three women: fourteen Ukrainians, ten Moldovans and five Romanians.

In 2004 the Hellenic Police released more detailed information on human trafficking for sexual or financial exploitation. Thus, in 2004 the number of traffickers

³⁷ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 226-227.

³⁸ Ibid, page 228-230.

³⁹ Ibid, page 230-234.

⁴⁰ D, « Η πορνεία των απαλών ούχων », *To Vima*, 24/11/2008.

<https://www.tovima.gr/2008/11/24/culture/i-porneia-twn-apalwn-onyxwn/>

⁴¹ Ibid, See note 23; this date refers to the date of uploading in their archive. The article must have been published originally before 2002, as the writer refers to drachmes and not euros.

⁴² See: Hellenic Police, Annual Reports of Organised Crime of 2004 & 2005. Statistics for Human Trafficking: 2003 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2003/> , 2004 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2004/> , 2005 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2005/>.

they arrested stayed approximately the same; they arrested only four more people than the previous year. Again, the majority of the traffickers were Greek reaching 207; the Albanians were twenty-two, and the Russians ten. As for the trafficked people, the number almost doubled (181). Russians prevailed, as there were fifty people found. There were also forty-one Romanians, twenty-one Ukrainians, ten Moldovans and Bulgarians and nine Albanians. In 2004 the total number of arrested traffickers was 288, while 240 of them were members of organised crime organisations, and the others were independent traffickers.

According to the police's annual report in 2004, there were more arrests of traffickers due to the police's effort to investigate and effectively hurt the structure of the network and not individual persons. Due to the Police's hesitation to reveal information regarding its mechanisms and strategies, it is difficult to conclude the reason for the difference between the arrests of traffickers and their victims. Additionally, in 2004 the number of victims found increased since the Police investigated cases of human trafficking in relation to the labour market and for their financial exploitation, while the previous year, the cases were exclusively for sexual exploitation.

The trafficking networks seem to collaborate and exchange information to ensure the successful transfer of their victims to Greece. The foreign networks are responsible for recruitment and transfer. They use advertisements in travel and employment agencies in their place of origin, claiming that there is a job opportunity waiting for them in Greece. Marriage with Greek men and cheap tourism in the country are also used as illusive means to bring them into the country. When the victims arrive, they realise that they have been deceived. Nevertheless, escape is not an option since, in most cases, the traffickers withhold their travel documents. At the same time, they are being physically and psychologically harassed and threatened with their lives. While the foreign traffickers are responsible for their transfer to Greece, the Greek ones find the clients and promote the women in the country. As mentioned in the following paragraphs, locations of practice have been developed, and new types of advertisements were introduced, such as on the Internet and in newspapers. The introduction of these new methods of finding customers seems to have been accepted by Greek prostitutes since Ms Kastelanou used them extensively in the 2000s. Lastly, the police reports reveal the poor sanitary conditions the victims are forced to live in and the lack of medical care, with many of them suffering from STDs and being forced into drug use to evoke their sexual arousal.

Lastly, in 2005 Hellenic Police provided an analytical chart of the trafficked victims. The total number reached 137, while 104 of them were women. Russians and Romanians are still high, twenty-eight and twenty-one accordingly, followed by twelve Ukrainians and eight Bulgarians. Finally, the arrested traffickers were 202, 133 being Greeks, twenty-eight Romanians, thirteen Albanians and three Russians. We can conclude that these networks did not disappear at the beginning of the millennial but continued their business. The criminal groups had not differentiated from the previous years in terms of operation. They used the same recruitment and violent methods to keep their victims contained.

What is reported for the first time in the police reports is the involvement of these criminal groups in other fields of illegal activity. They engaged in migrant smuggling and forgery to deceive the authorities. They used either totally false travel and identity documents or counterfeit existing documents. It must be highlighted that in 2004 and 2005, most victims entered Greece legally, with valid documents and authorised places of entry. Immigration to Greece became more accessible in the

1990s for reasons that will be analysed in the next chapter. Shortly, the change in migration policies, the economic stability of the country and the demand for labour, and at the same time the issue of dependent work permits enabled immigrants to enter the country. According to the population census of 2011 of the Hellenic Statistical Authority (ELSTAT), a total of 23,861 people with a foreign nationality between the ages of 20-39 settled in Greece, and the majority of them declared work as the reason for settlement – 47.7% between the ages of 20-29 and 55.6% between the ages of 30-39. For instance, the majority of people from Albania, Romania, Bulgaria, and Georgia entered Greece for work.⁴³

The main places of settlement for the new prostitution were bars and nightclubs.⁴⁴ They combined the friendly and fun environment with prostitution services. The places were small, and few prostitutes worked there. Massage salons were also used but not broadly.⁴⁵ The Greek prostitutes dominated the streets, there were forced prostitutes, but fewer in number.⁴⁶ The police, though, took action against street prostitution during that period, which was illegal anyway. On the other hand, the brothels were the core of old prostitution.⁴⁷ Greek prostitutes continued working there, but migrant prostitutes were added as well. The TV channel SKAI and the reporter Dimitris Marcou investigated the conditions of the brothels during the 1990s.⁴⁸ Since most of the brothels were illegal, the owners were very suspicious of him and, in many cases, refused to talk to him or to allow the prostitutes to talk. At first, everyone claimed that the prostitutes working in their brothels were Greek and worked legally. However, soon it was made clear that there were many foreign prostitutes working in brothels too, without clarifying whether they were legal. Lastly, forced prostitution was found in apartments and hotels.⁴⁹ Greek prostitutes also practised there but mainly as a secondary place of practice. The Police's action against street prostitution forced many Greek prostitutes to house their services in apartments and hotels. Nevertheless, the traffickers were the ones to solidify this type of prostitution.

As the trafficked victims were not homogenous in terms of ethnicity, age, and language, neither were the trafficking networks. There were the Russian, Ukrainian, Bulgarian, Albanian and the most moderate Polish trafficking network. They imported women and underaged boys and girls from their own and their neighbour countries. According to the newspaper "Ta Nea", the rise of human trafficking was part of a greater rise of organised crime. According to the police report regarding organised crime in 1998, these criminal organisations are small, concrete groups with clear leaders who collaborate to exchange information. Russians, Albanians, Bulgarians, Romanians, and Greeks prevailed in organised crime, making it clear that these networks were not limited to one illegal activity but engaged in more.⁵⁰

Along with the prostitution services and places of practice, an essential element that changed in this decade was the profile of the clients. The old clients came from the middle classes and were concentrated in the big cities, as the

⁴³ Ελληνική Στατιστική Αρχή, Απογραφή Πληθυσμού-Κατοικιών 2011, «Στατιστικά Αποτελέσματα για το λόγο εγκατάστασης στην Ελλάδα των μεταναστών από χώρες εξωτερικού (με ελληνική ή ξένη υπηκοότητα)», 5/12/2014.

⁴⁴ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 262-268.

⁴⁵ Ibid, page 268-270.

⁴⁶ Ibid, page 270-276.

⁴⁷ Ibid, page 277-281.

⁴⁸ Dimitris Marcou, SKAI, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NpJbgeAgUZM>

⁴⁹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 281-291.

⁵⁰ Chatzidis Kostas, «Εκθεση-σοκ για το οργανωμένο έγκλημα στην Ελλάδα», *Ta Nea*, 04/12/1999. <https://www.tanea.gr/1999/12/04/greece/ekthesi-sok-gia-to-organwmeno-egklima-stin-ellada/>

prostitution market was also prevailing in urban centers. Occasionally people from rural areas would visit big cities and engage with prostitutes. However, new prostitution, meaning the introduction of new and more expensive services and the expansion into rural areas, was addressed to a different clientele.⁵¹ Clients of forced prostitution were part of the middle and upper social and economic classes. There were luxury services, such as call girls, that attracted richer clients, but there were also regular services available to people from lower economic classes. In the second stage of the new prostitution, traffickers realised that prostitution in big cities would soon reach its fullness, therefore, expanded to rural areas.⁵² The clients funded that expansion and continued funding. There was a great demand for foreign women, as the prostitutes stayed steadily higher in number than the clients. Competition in cities was higher, and prices were pressured to lower. Since the continuous influx of migrant prostitutes was possible, there would not be a gap in the cities, meaning that their expansion to the countryside was more than feasible. Moreover, the absence of the prostitution market in the previous decades sealed the expansion in a whole new, unexploited market. This expansion could bring more significant profit with low risk of getting arrested due to the low mobility of the countryside.

Overall, the transition from old to new prostitution meant the expansion and transformation of prostitution in Greece into a large sex industry. The sex industry provided new and more services while it expanded in territory. The clients were a central part of this new type of prostitution. They demanded new foreign prostitutes; a different ethnic type of Greek women and the traffickers were able to provide the migrant prostitutes in abundance. In essence, the constant provision of forced prostitutes meant two things. Firstly, the traffickers could renew the forced prostitutes and replace the older ones with younger ones. On the other hand, the constant provision of sex workers kept the market and the prices stable, which worked in favour of the expansion of the market, as the number of clients increased compared to the customers of old prostitution. The expansion in locations of practice and in the rural areas made prostitution available to more people, who, under old prostitution, would have to travel to big cities. Additionally, bars and nightclubs, and other forms of the new prostitution connected prostitution to pleasure. The clients' role in the expansion of the industry will be analysed in the next chapter. However, it is essential to highlight that such expansion would not have been possible without the clients' funding.⁵³

Further research is needed to address the aspects of what Lazos and Lazaridis have labeled as "old/traditional" prostitution, as their portrayal at times reinforces stereotypical notions. Lazos, for example, tends to downplay the violence endured by Greek prostitutes while portraying them as independent individuals who often resisted the commands of pimps. Moreover, he oversimplifies the dynamics between clients and prostitutes by presenting clear hierarchical structures, despite the absence of such delineations in the prostitution market. Another aspect that warrants further investigation is Lazos' depiction of clients. When discussing the old form of prostitution, he primarily focuses on middle-class clients and young boys seeking their initial sexual encounters. It is imperative to explore the influence of prostitutes on the upper classes and determine whether there were already luxurious and expensive services available prior to the 1990s. However, it is undeniable that Lazos' research represents the most comprehensive study on prostitution during the 1990s to date, serving as a reference for numerous scholars in their own research.

⁵¹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 490-492.

⁵² *Ibid*, page 490-491.

⁵³ *Ibid*.

Chapter II: Causes of human trafficking

This chapter delves into the causes of the rise of human trafficking in the case of Greece. The chapter is divided into two parts. The first part focuses on the causes of human trafficking in the origin countries, while the second part focuses on Greece as a recipient country. The rise of human trafficking in Greece happens simultaneously with the country's mass migratory wave. During these years, Greece turned from a traditional emigration country to an immigration country, as the economic situation had been stabilised, and job opportunities were offered to immigrants. Other Mediterranean countries, such as Spain, experienced the same transformation.⁵⁴ It is important to highlight what the connection was between the migration waves to the country and the increase in human trafficking, and how human trafficking and organised crime were viewed. Organised crime was presented by the media of the time as a new, imported phenomenon that was introduced to the country because of the immigration influx. In particular, the Albanian migrants had been stereotyped as potential criminals.⁵⁵ However, it is crucial to highlight that organised crime in Greece existed before the 1990s. Still, the political changes of the decade and the collaboration with other transnational organised criminal groups prompted organised crime to thrive in the country.

The first part focuses on the causes of human trafficking in the sending countries. Why human trafficking flourished in the states of the former Soviet Union? Poverty, high unemployment rates and poor living standards are often considered causes of human trafficking.⁵⁶ They are considered factors that lead women to leave their country and look for better opportunities abroad. Moreover, they add a sense of vulnerability to the migrant. The discourse claims that since the living conditions deteriorate in the place of origin, the migrants have no choice but to move abroad. They are considered to be so desperate to leave that they would take advantage of the first opportunity they could find and end up being deceived by the traffickers.

This approach, however, only explains why there is a human workforce in need and how the traffickers can recruit so many victims, meaning migrants that were recruited by illusive means, transferred to another country and forced into prostitution. They were either deceived about the type of their employment or knew they would be absorbed in prostitution but were deceived about the living conditions or their earnings.⁵⁷ It does not explain why trafficking networks exist or why from the mid-1980s until today, there is no substantial decline in human trafficking for sexual exploitation. Additionally, it does not explain why many victims return to their countries of origin or want to return. Since the living standards are so poor, why would they dream of returning? Conversely, it implies that human trafficking can flourish in every country with poor living standards, which is not the case.

In human trafficking, we find three major roles, the prostitute/victim, the traffickers (either organised trafficking networks or individuals) and the clients. However, in scholarship, the traffickers and the clients have long been neglected. While the prostitute's motives, emotions or even the consequences of their experience have been studied, we still have little information regarding the traffickers and the

⁵⁴ Further reading; Muñoz De Bustillo and Antón, 'From Sending to Host Societies'.

⁵⁵ Siadima, M, (2001), 'Immigration in Greece during the 1990s: An Overview', MA in Mediterranean Studies Dissertation Paper, King's College, London, page 18.

⁵⁶ Hughes, "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", page 7.

⁵⁷ Human trafficking for sexual exploitation can occur nationally as well. However, this paper deals with the trafficking of migrant women in Greece.

client.⁵⁸ By manifesting that poverty and dire living conditions cause trafficking, the attention again turns to the prostitute and not the traffickers or the clients who support and fund human trafficking. In other words, by solely attributing trafficking to poverty and poor living conditions, the focus is shifted away from those responsible for organising and supporting the trafficking networks.

Of course, the above factors influence a woman's choice to migrate, but the victims are being deceived and are getting engaged in prostitution by illusive means; they do not make the conscious decision to go to a new country and provide sex services. On the contrary, the pre-existing and well-established trafficking networks take advantage of the victim's financial and social insecurity in the place of origin. Consequently, poverty, unemployment rates etc., are being analysed in this paper as complimentary factors that do not cause human trafficking but contribute to its continuation.⁵⁹ Since attributing trafficking solely to these socioeconomic factors oversimplifies the issue and fails to explain the existence of trafficking networks, the first part is focused on the fact of organised criminal groups in the places of origin, the presence of solid patriarchal attitudes and lastly, on other complementary factors, which create the conditions that make individuals susceptible to exploitation.

The second part of the discussion focuses on Greece and the key factors that made it a transit and destination country for sex trafficking. The geographical position of Greece, situated at the crossroads of Europe, Asia, and Africa, played a crucial role in establishing it as a strategic location for human trafficking and migrant smuggling routes. Additionally, the supposed sudden rise of organised crime in Greece during that time further contributed to the continuation of human trafficking. In contrast, the constant demand for foreign prostitutes in Greece served as a significant pull factor for the trafficking networks. The presence of clients willing to pay for sexual services created a lucrative market that fuelled the demand for forced prostitutes, increasing trafficking activities. By highlighting these factors—the geographical position of Greece, the rise of organised crime, and the need for foreign prostitutes—it becomes evident how these elements collectively enabled Greece to become both a destination and transit country for sex trafficking.

Part I: Factors that enabled human trafficking to flourish in the former Soviet Union

The collapse of communism in Europe during the 1990s had profound effects on political and social stability, creating a shifting landscape that impacted the presence of organised crime. Even though organised crime groups were present before the fall and had taken advantage of the insufficiencies of the state, the transition from a closed communist economy to a free capitalistic market enabled the pre-existed criminal groups to evolve and establish themselves.

Organised crime does not limit itself to human trafficking for sexual exploitation or domestic and agricultural labour and has taken lots of forms, such as money laundering, weapons etc. However, sex trafficking is the most profitable business, while during the 1990s, it was not that risky.⁶⁰ In the case that prostitution is legal, semi-legal or at least tolerated in the destination country, trafficking networks

⁵⁸ Oguzhan Omer Demir & James O. Finckenuer (2010) Victims of Sex Trafficking in Turkey: Characteristics, Motivations, and Dynamics, *Women & Criminal Justice*, 20:1-2, page 59.

⁵⁹ Hughes, "The "Natasha" Trade", page 19.

do not face a significant danger of getting arrested, as it will be further analysed in the next chapter regarding the Greek legal framework about prostitution, immigration and human trafficking. In Russia organised crime groups controlled the largest part of the prostitution market and domestic and international trafficking, while there were also organised markets to sell women as brides in Western countries such as Norway.⁶¹ St. Petersburg and Yekaterinburg were famous as centres of organised criminal groups that were operating prostitution rings.⁶² These groups recruited their victims through false advertisements in employment, tourist and modelling agencies and looked for individuals who would be easily persuaded and reluctant to escape. For instance, they looked for individuals who did not speak the language in the destination country, so they could not form connections there. Smuggling of people is also a profitable activity for criminal groups, and there are circumstances in which smuggling and human trafficking overlap.⁶³

Organised crime had a tradition in the Soviet Union. Due to the closed nature of the economy, the state acted as the sole supplier of goods and services, with no competition. The state was responsible for regulating the supply of available goods and prices. However, in many Soviet countries, organised criminal groups had created black markets to provide the people with goods or services the state could not offer in time or in sufficient quantity.⁶⁴ Thus, organised crime was not new and did not appear suddenly after the collapse of the Union. Additionally, they were newly independent states that lacked fundamental regulation against organised crime. Hence police authorities could not deter the creation of the organised criminal groups and did not stop their expansion either.

The transition from state-owned services to privatisation happened quickly and without a proper plan. Additionally, the states had no experience in privatisation, and the West did not provide any help with the transformation of the market.⁶⁵ The criminal groups took advantage of this transformation to legalise their assets and expand their operation. In Russia, the distribution of wealth, property and resources was not equal and favoured the criminal groups to control the Russian economy. Privatisation was under the surveillance of the Russian elite, which favoured the criminal groups so that they kept their privileges.

Many members of those criminal groups had ties to the KGB and other agencies, meaning they had connections with the state or judicial officials. Moreover, the administrative structure of the Soviet Union was problematic. It suffered from long insufficiencies and poor staffing and organisation.⁶⁶ Corruption and bribery became pervasive, allowing criminal networks to exploit and manipulate the system to their advantage. In Romania, after the fall of Ceausescu, people hoped that in an open democratic system, corruption in state institutions would limit. However, soon their hopes proved futile as corruption and clientelism continued.⁶⁷ Bulgaria is another major export of forced prostitutes, with tradition in clan-based criminal groups.⁶⁸

⁶⁰ Morokvasic, Mirjana. “‘Settled in Mobility’: Engendering Post-Wall Migration in Europe.” *Feminist Review*, no. 77 (2004), page 18.

⁶¹ Hughes, “Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation”, page 18.

⁶² *Ibid*, page 20 and page 28.

⁶³ *Ibid*, page 39 and page 50.

⁶⁴ Hughes, “The Natasha trade”, page 630.

⁶⁵ Hughes, “Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation, page 14.

⁶⁶ Galeotti, Mark, *Russian and Post-Soviet Organized Crime*, Aldershot [etc.]: Ashgate/Dartmouth, 2002, page 49

⁶⁷ Massino, Jill, *Ambiguous Transitions: Gender, the State, and Everyday Life in Socialist and Postsocialist Romania*, New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2019, page 366.

During the 1990s, Lithuania experienced a dramatic increase in organised criminal groups. From 1991 to 1993, approximately a hundred groups were operating nationally, and a part of them had international connections.⁶⁹ Using violence and widespread terror, Lithuanian criminal organisations took control of the privatisation procedure of the economy. Even the police and judicial authorities were unable to fight them.⁷⁰ The black market, bribes and cooperation with officials were not new. The early 1990s allowed the organised criminal groups to gain power and establish themselves. They started to lose power after the mid-1990s when Lithuania's economy stabilised.⁷¹

The role of organised criminal groups is very important in trafficking. The transformation of the economy allowed them to legalise their assets and operation, but most importantly, to expand their services. The networks were involved in prostitution before the collapse of communism. However, after the 1990s, they gained strength and expanded their services internationally. Moreover, they harmed the national economies and delayed their development by denying companies to participate in the privatisation process or by causing their bankruptcy.⁷²

The political and economic transition from communism to the free market affected profoundly and, most of all, the women of the former Soviet Union. During the Cold War, the Union's first goal was to achieve industrialisation; they needed women's labour to achieve it. Education was equally provided to men and women, resulting in many highly educated women who were absorbed in the labour market.⁷³ Women were obligated by the Party to work. To support them, there were founded child support programmes, childcare and welfare services and after school activities were provided by the state to benefit working women.⁷⁴ With the collapse of the Union, all those services were abruptly discontinued, while women were the first to get fired and thrust into the informal sector to make ends meet.⁷⁵ In their effort to find employment, they encountered discrimination in the job market. They claimed that age, sex and appearance played an essential role in their search for employment. Women experienced massive unemployment and were left to stay at home, taking care of the children.

Sexual harassment, domestic violence, rapes and femicides were also prevailing, leaving women in a state of insecurity for their future.⁷⁶ While patriarchal attitudes had not disappeared during the Soviet era, they were constrained due to the party's need for women's labour. According to an article in *Moscow Times*, women, not surprisingly, were absent from the political sphere, as in 1997, there were no women mayors or governors, while only 1.4 per cent of the federal ministers and deputy ministers were women.⁷⁷ The article reports an extreme lack of statistical evidence regarding the cases of rape and domestic violence in Russia. From 1995 to

⁶⁸ Petrunov, Georgi, "Human Trafficking in Eastern Europe: The Case of Bulgaria". *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 653(1), page 178.

⁶⁹ Gutauskas et al., 'Changing Typology of Organised Crime in a Post-Socialist Lithuania (the Late 1980s–Early 2000s)', *Global Crime*, 6:2, page 201.

⁷⁰ Ibid, page 202.

⁷¹ Ibid, page 210.

⁷² Galeotti, *Russian and Post-Soviet Organized Crime*, page 49.

⁷³ Hughes, "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", page 8.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

⁷⁵ Badea Caramello, Iulia, "A Case Study of Sex Trafficking in Romania" (2013). Master's Thesis, University of San Francisco, Paper 41, page 19.

⁷⁶ Hughes, "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", page 11.

⁷⁷ Martina, Vandenberg, "The Invisible Woman", *The Moscow Times*, 1997

<https://www.themoscowtimes.com/archive/the-invisible-woman>

1996, there was a decline in the number of rapes nationally, which was attributed by the government to the effective crime-fighting policy. However, the decline contradicts the steady calls the crisis centres accept (it is estimated that they accepted four hundred calls per month).

The reappearance of these attitudes had a detrimental impact on the social standing of women, leading to two significant consequences. Firstly, many women wanted to leave their countries and look for better opportunities abroad, away from violence and harassment. Secondly, it underestimated the gravity of trafficking and its profound effects on its victim. Patriarchal attitudes serve as a fundamental root cause of trafficking, as they reduce victims to mere objects, disregarding their emotional well-being and inherent rights. Besides, trafficking for sexual exploitation has two major sides; supply and demand. Without demand, there is no supply. The demand is being formed by clients who do not consider the rights of the sex worker necessary, and they replicate this mistreatment.

In Albania, for instance, oppressive patriarchal attitudes led many women to migrate. In Albanian society, women had two main choices to make for their lives: either get married or transform into a man. It was common for women to swear virginity and renounce their femininity. *Virgjinesha* (“sworn virgin”) is the woman who chooses to discard their feminine characteristics and adopt life as a man. She has to stay unmarried and abstain from sexual intercourse.⁷⁸ The choice is made either because the woman does not want to marry the man she is about to marry or in case there are no other male descendants to continue the family name. In patriarchal societies like the Albanian or the Greek, to some extent, the family name continues only by the male descendants as they get to keep their last name and pass it on to their children. On the other hand, the women were obliged to take the last name of their husbands and join their families.

The sworn virgins would take the role of the man protector. They would change their appearance and adopt a male name and pronouns, but as an exchange for turning into a man, she would have to forget her sexuality. Nevertheless, the women’s choices in Albania were limited, and many women decided to migrate. Even if this decision is conscious for some of them or even if “none of them had regrets”⁷⁹, denying femininity to obtain the privileges of a man is problematic and very restrictive for Albanian women. Moreover, it is not a step towards sex equality since the tradition does not allow an unmarried woman to live by herself. Instead, she must either take the male protector role or obey him.

Patriarchal attitudes focus on women’s inferiority and objectification. The connection with human trafficking comes at that point. By manifesting that women do not deserve the same treatment as men, it dehumanises them and culturally normalises human trafficking and violence towards them.

As seen above, the collapse of communism in Europe brought great political, social and economic insecurity. Women were the first to lose their jobs and the first to experience the restrictions brought about by the abolition of the public welfare system. They experienced deskilling. Since education was equally offered to men and women, many women from the former Soviet Union were educated and, to an extent,

⁷⁸ Kara, Siddharth, *Sex Trafficking : Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, Columbia University Press, New York, 2017, page 130.

⁷⁹ “Girls dressed as boys, from Albania to Afghanistan”, *To Mov*, 21/09/2014, <https://tomov.gr/en/2014/09/21/koritsia-poy-ntynontai-agoria-tin-alvania-os-to/> (“This article has been adapted from Jenny Nordberg’s forthcoming book *The Underground Girls of Kabul: In Search of a Hidden Resistance in Afghanistan*.”)

skilled workforce. However, during privatisation, they lost their jobs and ended up being overqualified for the few available positions. Privatisation sank whole neighbourhoods into poverty. Factories were often based in rural areas and attracted workers from that area. When those factories closed, the whole area experienced sudden unemployment. The gap between the richest and poorest regions grew.⁸⁰

At the same time, the Western, phenomenally rich way of life seemed like the Promised Land. People in Eastern Europe were bombarded by images of wealth in the United States and Western Europe.⁸¹ Those images contradicted the economic deterioration of the newly independent states. Many people were left without employment, without social welfare and health care systems and thought that in the West, they would not have the same experiences.

The poor living conditions dramatically affected the decision of the individual to migrate. They are what scholars call push factors for migration. However, when it comes to human trafficking, they are only complementary causes. They are conditions that motivated the victim to look for better opportunities abroad and nothing more. Human trafficking has deeper routes and must be investigated in relation to the traffickers and the clients, but not to the victims.

In summary, the collapse of communism in Europe led to political and social instabilities that affected the presence of organised crime. The transition to a free-market economy allowed pre-existing criminal groups to expand their activities, including sex trafficking, which proved highly profitable during the 1990s. Additionally, by highlighting the role of patriarchal attitudes in human trafficking, we can understand how it devalues and dehumanises victims, treating them merely as commodities to be exploited. Lastly, other factors related to the poor living conditions contribute to human trafficking.

Part II: Greece as a recipient and transit country of human trafficking

Greece, in the 1990s, entered a period of immigration without precedent. Prior to this period, Greece had been known for exporting migrants to developed countries in the West. From 1890 to 1914, nearly a sixth of Greece's population settled in the United States and Egypt, and from the 1950s to 1973, 1.2 million people left Greece to seek opportunities in countries such as France, Belgium, and Germany.⁸² However, the international oil crisis and the end of the Junta in 1974 paused Greek emigration.⁸³

Greek immigrants often sought better job opportunities abroad to accumulate wealth and remit money back to stabilise the Greek economy. Additionally, they aimed to acquire skills that could contribute to the development of Greek industries. With the end of the dictatorship and the subsequent economic stability, many Greeks began to return home. Meanwhile, the social and political developments in the Balkans were connected with Greece's transition from emigration to immigration

⁸⁰ Hughes, "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", page 9.

⁸¹ Ibid, page 7.

⁸² Muñoz De Bustillo and Antón, 'From Sending to Host Societies', page 567.

⁸³ Siadima, 'IMMIGRATION IN GREECE DURING THE 1990'S: AN OVERVIEW', page 4.

country.⁸⁴ This massive, without precedent, influx of migrants severely impacted Greece's labour market.

By the turn of the century, Greece's economic situation had stabilised and could offer labour market opportunities for migrants. However, these opportunities were low-paid primarily and low-status jobs that the Greek youth did not want to take, as they considered them demeaning. The improvement in living standards and educational level among the native youth in Greece contributed to their reluctance to accept low-paid or low-status jobs. As the country's economic situation stabilised and educational opportunities expanded, Greek youth demanded higher-paid and more prestigious positions that covered their qualifications.⁸⁵ Since these jobs in the informal sector continued to exist, but they were no available workforce, a gap was created that the migrants came to fill. This demand was focused on specific economic activities, mainly in the primary and secondary, such as construction, catering, and the agricultural sector. Regarding female migrants, they were absorbed into domestic services.⁸⁶ As we have seen, many female migrants were absorbed by the prostitution market due to human trafficking. However, they represent a small fraction of the overall women who settled in Greece from other countries during that period. Higher salaries than the ones in their place of origin remained a strong motivation for labour migrants to settle in the country, even though compared to the natives, they were low-paid workers.⁸⁷

The collapse of the Soviet Union and communism in the Balkans brought changes in border control policies. Greece, due to its geographical position, had numerous possible entry points which were challenging to control. It has an extensive coastline and large land borders with Albania, North Macedonia, Bulgaria and Turkey. According to an article in Kathimerini, the land borders, apart from the borders with Turkey, were well-guarded by the neighbouring countries, relieving Greece of the need to control them.⁸⁸ However, that proved insufficient as with the political reality of the 1990s, the borders were left unguarded for the undocumented migrants to enter the country and for organised criminal groups to expand their business from the northern borders.

Lastly, a final factor that contributed to the influx of migrants is the existence of trafficking and smuggling networks.⁸⁹ These networks had connections in the country of origin and the country of destination and assisted undocumented migrants in illegally entering the country of destination. Since the state did not control the migration waves but mainly operated according to the shortages of the informal sector, smuggling networks were essential for the influx of migrants.⁹⁰ The lack of border control facilitated their operation, as we saw above, and the corruption of the control authorities, as seen later in this chapter. Consequently, a large part of the migrants who entered Greece is challenging to record since they entered the country undocumented and were later absorbed by the informal sector.

⁸⁴ Triandafyllidou, Anna and Michaela Maroufou. "Immigration towards Greece at the Eve of the 21st Century. A Critical Assessment.", Hellenic Foundation for European and Foreign Policy (ELIAMEP), Athens, (2009), page 11.

⁸⁵ Siadima, 'IMMIGRATION IN GREECE DURING THE 1990'S: AN OVERVIEW', page 7.

⁸⁶ Papanicolaou, 'The Sex Industry, Human Trafficking and the Global Prohibition Regime', page 402.

⁸⁷ Muñoz De Bustillo and Antón, 'From Sending to Host Societies', page 574.

⁸⁸ Antoniou Dora, «Στη μεθόριο ανθεί το οργανωμένο έγκλημα».

⁸⁹ Siadima, 'IMMIGRATION IN GREECE DURING THE 1990'S: AN OVERVIEW', page 8-9 and page 21.

⁹⁰ Ibid, page 9.

It is crucial to understand that Greece had a long tradition of emigration. Still, immigration to the country was new, and the state was unprepared to absorb the migrants, even if there was labour demand in the informal sector. The legislation regarding immigration was poor. In the next chapter, we will delve deeper into the examination of this framework and the insufficiencies that the reformation of 1991 attempted to address, as well as the change of the immigration policies of 2001.

Organised crime made its appearance suddenly in Greek newspapers in the 1990s. Soon it was connected with the social and political changes in the Balkans and the massive influx of migrants to the country. The organised crime groups were diverse. There were small groups with fragile structures that could easily be dismantled by the police controls, and others, larger groups with solid structures and connections in Greece and the Balkans.⁹¹ The existence of organised crime in the country was inseparably connected to human trafficking for sexual exploitation, as migrant smuggling and trafficking were the most common and highly profitable activities. For instance, in 2004, the Greek police reported forty-six cases of migrant smuggling, thirty-nine cases of human trafficking (either for sexual or economic exploitation), and twenty-eight cases of drug trafficking, while all the other activities were depicted in less than 15 cases each. It is apparent that human trafficking and smuggling could not have happened with the success it had if it had not been for other services the organised groups offered. According to the police reports of organised crime for 2004 and 2005, the crimes of human trafficking and smuggling were associated with secondary offences such as the use of drugs, illegal confinement, undocumented migration, forgeries, abductions, and thefts. We can conclude that these networks were well-established since their services expanded to other crimes too.

The majority of organised criminal groups operating in Greece were small and susceptible to collapse due to their lack of powerful or strict structures.⁹² However, exceptions existed, with certain groups unaffected by external factors such as police controls. These groups collided with the trafficking networks prevalent during that period, as mentioned in the previous chapter. Albanian organised groups were primarily involved in drugs, thefts, and robberies, while Turkish, Iraqi, Chinese, and Pakistani groups were implicated in migrant smuggling. Bulgarian groups specialised in forgery and misrepresentation, Ukrainians and Russians in cigarette smuggling, and Romanians in human trafficking. However, collaborations between these groups were common and were not limited to a single type of crime. Police reports indicated extensive use of violence in human trafficking and migrant smuggling cases. The physical and psychological abuse suffered by women trapped in forced prostitution often drove them to commit suicide, as they saw no other way of escaping their traffickers' abuse.⁹³

The main areas of action were the large cities. The groups mainly operated in Attica, Athens and Thessaloniki, while they travelled in the countryside only if needed.⁹⁴ In the meantime, urbanisation was thriving in Greece. Many people moved to the cities as they sought better job opportunities and economic growth. The concentration of people in the urban areas created an environment where organised crime could thrive. The mobility of the urban centres helped the organised criminal groups establish themselves as they could operate secretly and discreetly. The frequent moving of people for their daily activities, such as work, school etc., as well

⁹¹ Police report for organised crime 2004/2005.

⁹² Ibid.

⁹³ Vardelis Stelios, Kontouris Kostas, «20.000 γυναίκες θύματα της πορνείας».

⁹⁴ Police reports for organised crime 2004/2005.

as the concentration of more and more people, was a fertile environment for the rise of trafficking since they would go unnoticed.

Organised criminal groups thrived due to corruption in the Greek authorities and the state. As seen in the case of Panagiotis Vichos in the previous chapter, there were many cases where criminals approached or bribed people who worked in public services and even government officials. According to the police reports, judicial and police officials, along with tax and custom officials, helped or tolerated the criminal groups' financial exchanges. Additionally, public, municipal and bank employers were involved in cases of forgery regarding the legalisation of undocumented migrants. Newspapers have reported that police officers "protect" bars and nightclubs, and concerning human trafficking, the trials take five to six years to be completed, which results in the women leaving the country and the trial stopping.⁹⁵ The traffickers were seldom imprisoned.

Corruption is a complex issue that is challenging to measure accurately in terms of numbers or statistics. However, indicative of the corruption situation of the public sector in the former Soviet Union, the Balkans and Greece are the results of the Transparency International survey from 1996 until the 2000s.⁹⁶ There are no available data for all the countries from the start; however, throughout this period, corruption increased in Greece. In 1996 it was ranked in the 25th place, but by the end of the century, it dropped to 35th. Russia, Romania, Ukraine, Bulgaria and Romania were steadily kept among the most corrupt countries, ranked between 37th and 87th. Other countries such as Belarus, Lithuania, Moldova and Albania also scored high in corruption levels. All these countries were sending countries for human trafficking and had well-established criminal groups connected to the public sector.

A last factor that contributed to the rise of human trafficking in Greece is no other than the client. The client had the power to define the prostitution market and, in the case of Greece, fueled its transformation into a vast sex industry operating under the rules of the free market. There is not much evidence regarding the role of the client since the legislation does not apply to them, while the scholarship lacks studies on the traffickers and the clients, whereas the prostitute has been the centre of research.

There is an undeniable change in the taste of the client; however, there is no evidence of why. During the 1990s, tastes had changed. The Mediterranean beauty the Greek prostitutes could offer was not sufficient anymore. Additionally, the idea of the obedient and friendly woman from the Third World wasn't enough either. Clients demanded the exotic beauty of white, blond European women.⁹⁷ Tastes also change regarding the quality of prostitution. Clients demanded expansion in location (rural areas) and new sites of operation (bars, nightclubs etc.).

Along with the increase of forced prostitutes, as seen in the first chapter, the number of clients inclined significantly from 1990 until the 2000s.⁹⁸ This steady increase in the number of frequent clients indicates a demand for more and more prostitutes. Nevertheless, the clients were not a homogenous group in terms of the

⁹⁵ D, «Η πορνεία των απαλών ονύχων», Skrivanos Takis, «Οι δρόμοι του trafficking», *To Mov*, 26/11/2012, <https://tomov.gr/2012/11/26/oi-dromoi-trafficking/>, Daniel Howden, "Greek sex-industry uncovered", BBC, 2001, <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/1724057.stm>

⁹⁶ Transparency International, CORRUPTION PERCEPTIONS INDEX for the years 1996-2000, https://www.transparency.org/en/cpi/2021?gclid=CjwKCAjwyeujBhA5EiwA5WD7_WBY_D3Td2a7WcAW5t-e-58KATO3VvLA9X0Vu3-oh0GTaMpDSdzwhhoCvCgQAvD_BwE.

⁹⁷ Lazaridis, 'Trafficking and Prostitution', page 81.

⁹⁸ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, pages 504-505.

frequency they turned into prostitutes. A part of them were migrants or tourists who occasionally enjoyed prostitution. Some clients did not turn into prostitution often or regularly. They visited the forced prostitutes once and later stopped, or they refrained from prostitution for a few years and engaged in it again at a later time. In terms of frequency clients Lazos has classified them into three basic categories.⁹⁹ Some clients organised their everyday life around prostitution. They engaged daily or frequently, and they considered prostitution an integral part of their lives. The second category refers to the frequent client, who turned to prostitution every now and then. Lastly, the third group, the non-frequent clients, would engage in prostitution a few times in their lives.

The reasons behind the changing preferences of clients and their interest in forced prostitutes over free women remain unknown. What is also missing from the scholarship is to study whether those clients were aware that they were addressing to women forced into prostitution. The current research supports that most of the clients knew about the condition of the prostitutes. Firstly, there were dealing with the trafficker or the pimp and not directly with the prostitute. They only communicated with the prostitute during the designated appointments made by the traffickers. This should alert the clients, as it is a significant difference from legal prostitution, under which they contact the prostitutes themselves. The financial transactions were also made between the client and the trafficker, not between the client and the individual prostitute, as was happening in the old prostitution. It is also unclear whether clients were aware of the living conditions of the prostitutes. In some other cases, as in the case of Vichos,¹⁰⁰ it seems that people in small, rural areas were aware of trafficking networks. It seems impossible that the clients were not informed of the living conditions of the prostitutes in the case of Santorini, for example. In particular, the frequent clients probably were aware of their contribution to forced prostitution due to the consistency of their visits. However, it is inevitable that there would be no supply in a free market environment, without demand, let alone the expansion and transformation described in the previous chapter.

In conclusion, the push and pull factors are not enough to explain the rise of human trafficking for sexual exploitation in the last decade of the 20th century. In the countries of origin, well-established organised criminal groups and patriarchal attitudes are the deeper factors of human trafficking. The traffickers, in order to make their profit climbed over and took advantage of women looking for better opportunities. Additionally, the idea that women are inferior and well deserve their fate supports and culturally legalises the traffickers' actions. Other factors, such as poverty, inadequate living conditions etc., are complementary factors that help the traffickers to sustain their operation, but they are not the actual cause of human trafficking. At the turn of the century, Greece was left to face new migration waves while unprepared for them. Corruption and the high profit the criminal groups could make out of human trafficking transformed Greece into a transit and destination country, while the clients supported the transformation.

⁹⁹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, pages 511-512.

¹⁰⁰ The case of the musician who reported a trafficking network in Santorini, see further in the first chapter.

Chapter III: Legal Framework regarding Prostitution, Immigration and Trafficking in Greece

The 1990s marked a significant period in Greece's history with the emergence of a growing problem—human trafficking for sexual exploitation. The rise of human trafficking became evident to the Greek public and called for an amendment of the legal framework. The examination of the legislation of the recipient country is crucial for understanding trafficking. The lack of clarity in legislation allows traffickers to establish themselves.

The insufficiency of the legal framework derives from Greece's old-fashioned laws before the 1990s and the quick and sometimes poor introduction of new laws. As this chapter explores the insufficiency of the legal framework during that time, it is crucial to delve into the legislative landscape that shaped the response to trafficking, prostitution, and immigration, as they are inextricably connected. Understanding the penal legal framework and its limitations becomes paramount in comprehending the challenges faced in combating human trafficking within the context of Greece. The chapter will examine the laws of 1981 and 1999 regarding prostitution, the laws of 1991 and 2001 regarding immigration and the laws of 1960 and 2001 regarding human trafficking as a penalty.

Law 1193/1981; Protection and regulation against sexually transmitted diseases and related issues

Prostitution in Greece has always been legal, however regulation regarding it has been approached in the name of public health¹⁰¹ In 1981, the Greek state tried to regulate it in the name of public health and in the light of sexually transmitted diseases. The law of 1981 considers prostitution as one of the main reasons for the transmission of diseases and tries to regulate it to protect public health, therefore regular mandatory testing had been enforced, as well as the registration of prostitutes in the public health system. According to the law, the main instruments for the regulation of prostitution were the doctors, while the central mechanism regarding the enforcement of the law was the police.¹⁰² In essence, prostitution was not seen as a profession but rather as a social relationship, which had to be controlled by the police in the name of public health. Most of the law concerns the transmission of diseases, the fight against them, and other related medical field issues.

Article six of the second chapter, with the title “Characterising the women as paid prostitutes”,¹⁰³ states that a woman needs to be at least twenty-one years old¹⁰⁴ and must register at the nearest police station and apply for a professional license. When her license is approved, she is to be labelled as “charachtirismenh”¹⁰⁵ meaning that she will be characterised as a prostitute. As for the health standards, she must undergo medical examinations twice a week and report the results on her medical card. If she carries any sexually transmitted diseases, she is obliged to undergo

¹⁰¹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 74.

¹⁰² Ibid.

¹⁰³ «Χαρακτηρισμός γυναικών ως εκδιδομένων επ' αμοιβή».

¹⁰⁴ While the age one becomes an adult in Greece is eighteen.

¹⁰⁵ «Χαρακτηρισμένη».

treatment, which the state could provide for free, or if she wishes, she could go to a private doctor.

Article nine of the second chapter, titled “Establishing of women in prostitution for remuneration”, regulates the place of work of the prostitutes. Public brothels were already abolished in 1960 and were replaced by private ones.¹⁰⁶ According to the law, only a licensed prostitute could obtain a license to open a brothel. To obtain a license for a private brothel, the prostitute needs to apply to the nearest police station and appear before a three-member committee consisting of a doctor, a police officer and a social service worker. However, each police station was entitled to issue only twelve permits, which had to be renewed every two years.

More than one prostitute working in a brothel is prohibited, according to the tenth article, titled “Prohibition of professional group association.” Additionally, only one brothel could operate in every building. The denial of the concentration of many prostitutes in one building aims at their restriction from creating team partnerships. Moreover, the staff of the brothel cannot be male, and the women had to be over fifty years old to avoid two prostitutes settling in the same brothel. According to article fourteen of the third chapter, in case of violation of any of the above, the license for the brothel can be revoked, as well as in the case that the operation “brings problems to the everyday life of the residents”.¹⁰⁷ Lastly, if the prostitutes do not comply with articles six, seven and ten, they face imprisonment for up to three months, without the option of paying a fine instead of jail time. They face the same penalty if they provoke by sexual gestures in public places.

Law 1193 is problematic in many ways. Firstly, from the above-mentioned, we conclude that the law is gender biased, as it assumes that only women sell sexual services and only men buy them.¹⁰⁸ Even if the title of the second act refers to persons engaging in sex in exchange for money, the very first article of the section refers to “women”, excluding the possibility for men to work in the sex industry too. Moreover, it forbids men from working in brothels, even as helping staff.

The labelling of prostitutes (“characterismos”) leads to further cultural stigmatisation and marginalisation of the workers.¹⁰⁹ Prostitution was not conceived as a profession from a cultural point of view but rather as a way for women to make money. The legal framework by labelling these women as prostitutes while enforcing severe restrictions and presenting them as the cause of STDs contributes to the transmission of this idea. As a result, labelling the sex workers as prostitutes but not officially recognising them as professionals equals a moral loss.¹¹⁰

Another strict regulation, which shows the perception of prostitution from the state as a primary reason for the transmission of STDs, is the frequent and mandatory medical testing. Even if the sex workers were infected during a sexual interaction, one visit to the next does not give enough time for the disease to manifest itself. It forbids employing men or women under the age of fifty in a brothel, the aim being to avoid two prostitutes getting settled in a house under the pretence that one is working as a maid for the other. In practice, however, this is common. The fact that no more than

¹⁰⁶ Papanicolaou, ‘The Sex Industry, Human Trafficking and the Global Prohibition Regime’, page 383.

¹⁰⁷ «... προκαλεί ζητήματα εις τον καθημερινόν βίον αυτών (περιοίκων)»

¹⁰⁸ Lazaridis, ‘Trafficking and Prostitution’, page 78.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid, page 77

¹¹⁰ Ibid, Ira Emke – Pouloupoulos, ‘Trafficking in women and Children: Greece, a country of destination and transit’, Institute for the Study of the Greek Economy (IMEO) Greek Society of Demographic Studies (ΕΔΗΜ), 2001, page 64.

twelve brothels are allowed to operate within the area of the jurisdiction of a police station and more than one brothel cannot operate in a block of flats drove many women into the streets since they could not obtain a license, or they could not afford the operation of the brothel.¹¹¹

Additionally, the law reinforces the marginalisation of prostitutes since it creates a regime of ghettos. The rise of the ghetto of Metaxourgeio, the street Phillis and the neighbouring areas of Athens after 1982 and during the 1990s resulted in the downgrade of the areas, the decline of rents for houses but the increase in the rent of the brothels. A large part of the parliament highlighted this reality while at the same time proposing the transfer of the brothels outside the city, where the prostitutes would be invisible. They claimed that prostitution would disrupt everyday life in the big cities.¹¹²

Article fourteen regarding the penalties is also problematic. Not only does it not allow prostitutes to pay a fine instead of serving their prison sentence and demands their confinement for three months – knowing that physical confinement means loss of revenue - but it is also biased against them. It specifically mentions that prostitutes may provoke the public through gestures. However, officially they would not have to look for clients in public since they can obtain their licence to open a private brothel.

In conclusion, law 1193 was a gender-biased law, which did not recognise prostitution as a profession, but rather as an activity someone can make money off and as a social relationship that needed to be regulated. The criteria for obtaining the professional licence were strict, and it did not mention the case of foreigners, as a distinction between Greek and non-Greeks was not made. Lastly, the criteria for the brothel license were also very strict, leading many women to practice their work on the street. It stigmatised the prostitute without giving her any security and inferred that the prostitutes “provoke”. Additionally, since the legislation does not state what those gestures are, it could lead to the arbitrary arrest of the prostitute. The Greek state tolerated prostitution and tried to control it, not acknowledge it as a legitimate profession.

Law 2734/1999; Regarding persons engaging in sex for monetary gain

The transformation of the sex industry in Greece and the influx of immigrants forced out the “traditional” prostitution,¹¹³ which made it crucial for the legislation to be modernised; hence law 2734 was introduced. Law 2734 has a few weak points, which will be analysed. The most crucial weak point, however, is the focus on the prostitution of brothels, without taking into consideration the many new services that the well-established forced prostitution of the 1990s had introduced.

According to the first article, “Certificate of the practice of the profession for remuneration of prostitutes”, the persons engaging in sex for money- regardless of their sex- must have a professional license to practice their profession legally. They

¹¹¹ Ira Emke – Pouloupoulos, ‘Trafficking in women and Children: Greece, a country of destination and transit’, page 78

¹¹² Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 76.

¹¹³ Lazaridis, ‘Trafficking and Prostitution’, page 91. By “traditional”, she refers to the old prostitution, in which the vast majority of the active prostitutes were Greeks.

must be over eighteen years old, unmarried, divorced, or widowed. Regarding public health, they must not carry STDs or suffer from any mental condition. Moreover, they must not have been convicted of murder, sexual abuse of minors, pimping or trafficking, or violating any guns and drugs laws. In the case that they are foreigners, they need to show their legal documents. Lastly, they have to undergo medical testing every fifteen days and not twice a week, as was the case with law 1193.

An important point, almost impossible to be met, of this law is article three, titled “Establishment of prostituted persons for remuneration”, regarding the operation of private brothels. The prostitutes have to obtain a license of settlement. If the brothel is situated in a residential block of flats, they need to have the residents’ permission unless the regulation of the building forbids it. Every municipality and community has the right to decide how many permits will be issued. The criteria depend on the population, on “special local conditions and needs”¹¹⁴, on the existence of military camps, ports and industrial units or other mercantile activities. Moreover, they cannot settle in listed or traditional buildings. The brothels have to be 200 meters away from schools, churches, kindergartens, tutoring institutions, hospitals, athletic centers, boarding schools, hotels above three stars, libraries and philanthropic institutions, as well as squares and playgrounds. The municipal council can make the above restrictions even stricter.

According to article four, titled “Prohibition of professional group association”, the owner of a brothel can allow to use their brothel up to two licensed prostitutes, with the permission of the building’s owner and only if they use the brothel at different hours. Once again, the group partnership of prostitutes is not legitimate. They cannot hire helping staff unless they are over fifty years old, and they have a permit from the municipality.

Prostitutes face imprisonment for up to two years and a fine if they violate the above-mentioned regulations. The penalty of three months’ imprisonment for soliciting remains, but the wording has been altered, however without substantial changes.

Overall, the new legislation seems more inclusive and modernised than the former. Prostitutes can obtain their license once they become adults and includes foreigners, which is proof of the transformation of the sex industry. However, there are still crucial points that make prostitution semi-legal in reality. First, the fact that prostitutes have to be unmarried implies that prostitution is a sin not allowed in an honest and virtuous romantic relationship. Even though the law refers to “persons” who engage in sex and not “women”, female prostitution seems to be in the spotlight since the third article regarding the licenses of settlement makes a special note of military camps, ports and places of industrial and mercantile activities, areas where female prostitution is connected to as there are traditionally men equipped fields. In particular, in military camps and ports, as in Greece, military service is mandatory only for men over eighteen.

Lastly, the requirements for the operation of brothels are way too strict and almost impossible to be met. Even in Athens, the largest city in Greece, overpopulation makes it impossible for a brothel to keep 200 meters from the above-mentioned buildings to avoid the ghettos. The strict regulations, for example, that brothels have to be far away from schools, in fear that prostitution will corrupt the youth, or that they cannot operate in listed buildings, in fear that the brothels will make the city “uglier”, instead of protecting prostitutes and creating a safe environment, where they can practice their profession, pushes them to the streets.

¹¹⁴ «... ιδιαίτερες τοπικές συνθήκες και ανάγκες...»

Ms Kastelanou, a prostitute I interviewed, who was active during the 1990s, said she preferred working in the streets to a brothel. The main reason was that she could keep all her earnings. She had no electricity bill or other service costs and worked for herself, so she did not have to give part of her profits to the brothel owner. However, she did say that the streets were not a safe environment. There was plenty of time when she experienced attacks by passers-by, who would throw yoghurts or citrus fruit at her or call her names. Moreover, practising prostitution in the streets is illegal even if the prostitute is licensed. As a result, she was arrested and kept overnight multiple times, resulting in losing money. The next day she would go to trial and pay the fine. She also reported that during the presidency of P.A.S.O.K. when the state needed more money, arrests without a valid reason and controls were more often.¹¹⁵ In addition to her claims, without a reasonable cause, interrogations and harassment of suspicious women were a common phenomenon, in particular with the rise of prostitution in bars, hotels etc.¹¹⁶

Nevertheless, the law was voted after a decade of the substantial rise of human trafficking for sexual exploitation and the dethronement of traditional/old/ voluntary prostitution by a new prostitution regime of migrant forced prostitutes. Yet, the law does not refer to traffickers or clients or regulate them, while the antitrafficking law was introduced a few years later in 2002. If we also take into consideration what was said before about the difficulty of the restrictions to be enforced, the law might look complete, but it does not respond to the reality of Greece at the end of the 1990s. It continues to leave the prostitutes on the sidelines without giving them the opportunity to react to the new legislation, while it permits traffickers and clients to continue their acts. This argument was explicitly mentioned in the discussions inside the parliament regarding the legislation. The members of the parliament acknowledged the existence of forced prostitution and the weakness of the new legislation to regulate it. The law does not refer to the bars with illegal rooms of prostitution in the back or random prostitution buildings in rural areas far from residential spaces. They highlighted that the new law cannot cover that.

However, the main problem is that prostitution is not conceived as a proper profession, but instead as an “activity”.¹¹⁷ As the parliamentary representative of the Communist party, Apostolos Tasoulas, firmly claims that prostitution is everyone’s right. Still, the choice is connected to poverty, unemployment, lack of education, disappointment regarding the living standards, and a decline in moral values but it cannot be a conscious choice for a person. The Greek state deliberately connects prostitution with the rise of criminality, as they claim that other illegal activities flourish in areas with a large accumulation of brothels, such as drug dealing. Overall, the discussion in the parliament was focused once again on the moral decline of the values in Greece that pushes the youth into prostitution, the rise and the regulation of STDs and the distances among the brothels.¹¹⁸

The discussion in the parliament brought to light chronic stereotypical and old-fashioned ideas regarding prostitution, focusing on a general moral decline and the need for the protection of public health from prostitutes. Prostitution is not considered a profession but an activity resulting in strict regulations regulating only brothel operations. The restrictions of the settlement are almost impossible to be met,

¹¹⁵ During the 1990s P.A.S.O.K was elected from 1993 until 1996 and from 1996 until 2004.

¹¹⁶ Papanicolaou, ‘The Sex Industry, Human Trafficking and the Global Prohibition Regime’, page 383.

¹¹⁷ Πρακτικά Βουλής, Σύνοδος Γ’, Συνεδρίαση Ι’, 13/07/1999, page 283.

¹¹⁸ The parliament member Fotis Kouvelis strongly argued that the brothels have to be 300 afar from each other to avoid the ghettos. He seemed oblivious to the fact that the restrictions regarding the brothels were already difficult to enforce. His argument looming even less legal brothels and more prostitutes in the streets. (Πρακτικά Βουλής, Σύνοδος Γ’, Συνεδρίαση Ι’, 13/07/1999, page 288).

but they also refer to only one of the forms of prostitution at that time. Additionally, prostitutes lack professional rights; such as the denial of professional team partnerships and by extension, they are refrained from arrogating better working standards.

Law 2734 did not reflect the needs of prostitution at that time. It was oblivious to the transformation of the prostitution market into a vast sex industry. It did not refer to forced prostitutes, the traffickers or the clients, making their regulation impossible. Additionally, it reproduced the stigmatisation and marginalisation of prostitutes. The fact that the law made prostitution semi-legal since the restrictions were so strict that even licensed prostitutes had to provide their services illegally. At the same time, it left a large window of illegal prostitution activities that helped trafficking continue without decline. The traffickers took advantage of those grey areas to establish themselves.

Law 1975/1991; Aliens, refugees, residence permits and other provisions

Regulation concerning immigration in Greece was outdated as the previous law was established in the 1920s. Before the 1980s, Greece was a country of emigration rather than immigration; thus, there was no reason for amended legislation. Greece “remains ill-prepared with no clear, comprehensive immigration policy, law and infrastructure.”¹¹⁹

The Greek state considers foreigners those with no Greek nationality or stateless persons («ανιθαγενής»). On the other hand, people who live in Greece and have more than one nationality, one of which is Greek, are considered citizens. The law covers three types of entrance to the country, i. how to enter the country permanently, ii. temporarily and iii. transit and exceptional cases of entry (e.g., cruise trips). According to the fifth article, they create special policing forces for the fight against illegal migration on land, onshore and sea borders.

The third chapter discusses the entry of foreigners into the country. The articles ten, “Unwanted foreigners – responsibilities of the transporters”, and eleven “, List of the unwanted foreigners”, the legislator regulates the “unwanted” foreigners, meaning any foreigner denied entry. The “unwanted” foreigners have to leave the country immediately; otherwise, they will face deportation. Residency permits for employment can be renewed annually for a five-year period. After the end of this period, the foreigners need to return to their place of origin, or else they will be deported. If they wish to extend their period of residency in the country, they need to apply to the police station, and their residence can be extended for another two years. If they complete fifteen years of legal residency in the country, they receive a residency permit for an undefined time. Moreover, permission to work is given by the Ministry of Employment for a limited time, from a particular employer and for a specific type of occupation. Lastly, regarding deportations, if the foreigners are imprisoned, violate any restriction from the above, or present a risk to public health, they will be deported within twenty-four hours.

¹¹⁹ Sitaropoulos, Nikolaos, *Immigration Law and Management in Greece: Towards an Exodus from Underdevelopment and a Comprehensive Immigration Policy*, SSRN Electronic Journal, 2002, page 1.

This law was an effort from the Greek state to control the mass influx of undocumented migrants, but it turned out to be deficient.¹²⁰ The opportunities for legally entering and settling in Greece and the odds of being given a permanent residency permit were severely restricted. Foreign worker admission was entirely dependent on an employer's request, to which temporary annual work and residency licenses were attached. The necessary procedures, however, were incredibly time-consuming and bureaucratic in character and costly for the migrants and their employers¹²¹. Moreover, in order to obtain permanent residency, they would have to be in the country for fifteen years and contribute to the social insurance system, which is very restrictive. The provisions of article five addressing the installation of undocumented immigration police units around mainland Greece and the sea borders also made clear the Greek state's intention to prevent immigration.¹²²

Law 2910/2001; Foreigners: entrance, residency and other provisions

Law 2910/2001 is an undeniably more detailed legislation compared to immigration law 1975/1991, as it is evident from the number of articles and sections. The law describes other circumstances, when an immigrant can enter Greece; education, dependent employment, seasonal occupation, independent financial activity, family reunification, and other reasons (e.g., athletes, company members, circuses).

A significant advantage of this law was the transfer of the responsibility for dealing with immigration issues to the Ministry of Internal Affairs instead of the Ministry of Public Order, which means from the Greek police to regional administrative organs.¹²³ The new law established a regulation system regarding immigration that relies on the promotion of documented immigration by setting annual quotas for legal entrance, residence, and work of immigrants. It also included severe penalties for offences relating to people trafficking and smuggling while not abandoning - and in some cases even strengthening - immigration control policy measures. The minimum legal residency requirement for obtaining citizenship was changed from fifteen to ten years, and it was eliminated for wives of Greek citizens who were also residents of Greece and had children with them.

The permit is to be renewed annually and applies for one year. After six consecutive years, the permit will be renewed for two years and after ten years of legal residency in the country, they can apply for a permanent permit.

A disadvantage of this law relates to the permit for dependent employment. The fifth chapter regulates the "Entry and Stay of foreigners for providing dependent work". A commission issues an annual report on the vacancies in Greece. After taking into consideration "the interest of the national economy, the offer for labour for citizens and foreigners and demand", an annual list for the residency permits for foreigners is formulated. However, the criteria regarding the national economy are not mentioned. Moreover, the index takes into consideration the ethnicity, the type and duration of the employment. Still, it does not explain to what extent and how the nationality of the person plays an important role.

¹²⁰ Sitaropoulos, Nikolaos, *Immigration Law and Management in Greece*", page 10.

¹²¹ Ibid, page 15.

¹²² Ibid, page 11.

¹²³ Ibid, page 21.

Law 4090/1960; Issues of imprisonment, prisoners and other provisions

Law 4090 is a bill to amend the penal code and regulates numerous crimes, among them pimping of underaged persons, taking advantage of a prostitute and trafficking. There was no separate antitrafficking regulation, but trafficking was incorporated into the law regarding pimping of underaged persons or aiding their prostitution, provided no other more serious crime has been committed, will face imprisonment from nine months up to three years, including a fine.

According to the eighth article titled “Human Trafficking”, the trafficker will face imprisonment from one to three years if they hire, push or even agree to force underaged females into prostitution, if they are forced by physical violence, illusive means, or by overuse of power or any other coercive means adult females to prostitution. Additionally, if they keep the victims in a brothel without consent and force them into prostitution.

The law is not detailed; it does not specify the “illusive means”, making the court procedure difficult since the victim might not be able to prove their confinement or mistreatment. Another problematic point of the legislation is that it refers only to women and girls, as victims of trafficking, excluding adult men and underaged boys from potential victims. Lastly, a crucial critique of the law relates to the misconception that human trafficking relates only to the sex industry and not to the labour market in general. As a result, the law does not help in domestic or seasonal labour cases, which is very common in Greece due to its agricultural sector.

Law 3064/2002; Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim

Article eight, by the title “Trafficking in human beings” of the first part, regards traffickers the people who “with use of violence, threat or by any other coercive means or with the enforcement or abuse of power hires, transfers inside or outside the state, keeps without their consent, foments, gives with or without exchange to a third person, or receives a person in order for him or for a third person to sexually exploit the person faces imprisonment of ten years and a fine of ten to fifty thousand euro”. Trafficking is considered a felony. Moreover, the same penalty applies to the person who takes advantage of the vulnerability of the victim with promises, presents, payments and other benefits. Lastly, the client who is aware that the prostitute is being trafficked faces imprisonment of six months.

To help the victims of trafficking, there was the 233 Presidential Decree in 2003. According to the first article regarding the identification of the victims, victims are considered persons, natives or foreigners, whose physical health, personal or sexual freedom has been violated or have faced danger against their lives. According to the second article regarding the protection and aid of the victims, security is being reassured as long as the victim faces threats for their life and support as long as the services of escort deem it necessary. Article twelve of the second part of law

3064/2002 regulates that the victim is entitled to shelter, diet, medical and psychological care, as well as a lawyer and a translator for as long as necessary.

After the vote of law 3064, other regulations came to complete the legal framework against human trafficking. The legal framework is considered solid and complete; however, the difficulty comes in its enforcement. Vardelis Stelios and Kantouris Kostas, in their article in “TA NEA” newspaper, report the lack of available hostelling for the victims of trafficking. In 2004 there were no shelters for trafficking victims in the large city of Thessaloniki, with the victims obliged to stay in hotels and later move to Ioannina if an available spot arose.¹²⁴

The existence of a legislative regulation is the first step against trafficking, however, Nikoletta Iliou, the manager of the A21 rescue department, reports the poor enforcement of the law at present. Ms Iliou confirmed that the existence of a very strict regulation with many articles has the opposite of the desired results; for example, the framework around prostitution, instead of protecting the prostitutes, forces them onto the streets. Regarding the brothels, she explained that even if the brothel is legal, that does not mean that the prostitutes who work there are legal or are there voluntarily. According to their statistical data from the 400 legal brothels in Athens – present time- only fifteen are by all means legal, “a tragic rate,” as she points out. According to Nikoletta, despite the fact that there are requirements for legal prostitution and while the legal “armoury” against trafficking is considered to be complete, the enforcement of the legislation is inadequate. According to the legislation regarding assistance to trafficked victims, she states that they are either ineffective or are not being enforced; that is when their organisation fills the gap. Talking about the public shelters for the victims, she states that the vacancies are limited, and the living conditions are unsuitable. The provision of psychological help is not sufficient, as the appointments of doctors are limited and rare. In essence, the intervention of A21 is to reassure and protect the victims’ human rights since the states’ policy does not.

The organisation seems to do the state’s work again, as they have a twenty-four-hour telephone line, where citizens and victims can call. Citizens report their suspicions of sexual exploitation, forced labour and vagrancy. Then A21, according to the report’s severity and processing, reports the incident to the department against human trafficking. However, the victims’ calls are crucial, as they provide enough evidence about the conditions of detainment and can help find other victims as well. On the one hand, the operation of A21 in Greece is crucial for the fight against trafficking. However, Nikoletta calls for the need for a multidisciplinary and interstate strategy.

As seen in this chapter, the Greek legislation left Greece unprotected against human trafficking. It was one of those countries where the lack of precise and robust regulation regarding prostitution, immigration and human trafficking contributed to the rise of trafficking for sexual or financial exploitation. Traffickers took advantage of the loopholes, the lack of clarity or even the lack of legislation (as the law against trafficking was introduced in 2002, after a long decade of human trafficking, and the revised regulation for prostitution of 1999 was insufficient and did not refer to the traffickers). This can create a breeding ground for human trafficking as traffickers exploit gaps in the regulatory framework, take advantage of lax enforcement measures, and exploit their victims without having to face severe consequences.

¹²⁴ Vardelis Stelios, Kantouris Kostas, « 20.000 γυναίκες θύματα της πορνείας».

Conclusion

Human trafficking rose substantially in Greece during the 1990s. The mass arrival of trafficked women from the former Soviet Union and the Balkans dominated the Greek prostitution market and transformed its structure. Scholarship regarding prostitution in Greece is limited and mostly focuses on the transformation of the prostitution market. This paper approaches for the first time the deeper causes of the rise of human trafficking in Greece, while taking into consideration the former Soviet Union and the Balkans as sending countries and Greece as a destination country.

The paper's findings confirm that there was indeed a transformation of the market, as many Lazos, Lazaridis and Papanicolaou claim. However, the paper claims that the prostitution market not only transformed but in essence, it changed its form completely due to the rise of human trafficking. Prostitution before the 1990s was small-scaled and mostly limited to the urban centers and involved mostly Greek individuals, who were willingly engaging in sexual services in exchange for compensation, the appearance of human trafficking networks and the constant provision of women forced into prostitution altered its nature.

These women were recruited through deceptive means in their countries of origin and were trafficked in Greece. Upon their arrival, they were trapped in debt bondage and coerced to work in prostitution to repay their traffickers. The traffickers controlled them with the excessive use of physical and psychological violence.¹²⁵ What is interesting but needs further research by the scholarship is the impact of the demand side on human trafficking. Greek prostitution kept its clients, as indicated by the interview with Athina Kastelnaou and the statistical data regarding Greek prostitution during the 1990s, but new clients were introduced. They requested exotic women and the expansion of the prostitution market in terms of services and locations. Their funding and the importance of the trafficking networks made the development possible. The prostitution market changed completely and grew into a vast sex industry with more services offered, clients, and locations of practice. The Greek sex industry was based on the sexual exploitation of migrant women by their clients and the financial exploitation by the trafficking networks.

The rise of human trafficking was connected to the profound political and social changes in the Balkans. The transition from a closed communist market, controlled by the state, to a free capitalistic market happened quickly, and the organised criminal groups rushed to take advantage of the privatisation process. While before the collapse of the USSR, their role was somewhat contained in providing the people with services and products the state could not offer in sufficient amounts, after the collapse, they took advantage of the corruption and the financial insecurity to enhance their presence.¹²⁶ Additionally, patriarchal attitudes rose again after the USSR culturally normalised human trafficking. The objectification of women's sexuality and emotions were underestimated, creating a context in which human trafficking does not insult the prostitute's identity. While often in scholarship, unfavourable living conditions such as low living standards, high unemployment and poverty are considered causes of trafficking, this paper's finding indicated that they should be regarded as complementary factors rather than sole causes.¹²⁷ The research's focus should be on the role of the trafficker and their economic motivations, as well as on the client, who shapes the demand. Otherwise, placing excessive focus on the

¹²⁵ Lazaridis, "Trafficking and Prostitution", page 88.

¹²⁶ Galeotti, *Russian and Post-Soviet Organized Crime*, page 49.

¹²⁷ Hughes, "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", page 5.

vulnerability of prostitutes may lead to further regulations that curtail their rights under the guise of protection.

Regarding Greece as a transit and destination country for trafficked prostitutes, the significant rise of organised crime, the corruption at state level, the geographical position of the country and the effective demand and the insufficiency of the legal framework played provided the conditions for human trafficking to rise. The current research confirmed that organised crime did not appear suddenly in Greece, but the decade's social and political changes helped it flourish and make it more evident. Additionally, Greece was a famous destination country due to short travel distances and the lightly protected borders.¹²⁸ Even though there is little evidence regarding the role of the client, there was a substantial increase in the number of clients of forced prostitution, indicating a change in the clients' taste. They were seeking exotic women with no resemblance to the Mediterranean type of women.

Finally, during the 1990s, the Greek state changed or introduced new legislation regarding prostitution, immigration policies and human trafficking. Even though the regulations had weak points, the main problem was that they were out of time and space. They did not reflect the needs of the time. After a decade of significant rise of human trafficking, the legislation neglected it.¹²⁹

This paper shed light to the causes of the rise of human trafficking in Greece during the 1990s, however there are more questions to be answered. Further research should delve into the operations and motivations of trafficking networks, as well as clients' role and financial contributions in perpetuating forced prostitution, as this paper could not delve into due to the lack of available sources. Understanding the structure and activities of trafficking networks and exploring the motivations of clients can provide valuable insights for combating human trafficking effectively.

¹²⁸ Lazaridis, 'Trafficking and Prostitution', page 92.

¹²⁹ Lazos, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, page 82-83.

Appendix

Law 1193/1981; Protection and regulation against sexually transmitted diseases and related issues

CHAPTER II: On prostituted persons.

Article 6: “Characterising the women as paid prostitutes”

1. Any woman intending to be issued for remuneration must be at least 21 years of age and submit a relevant declaration to the Police Authority. It is characterised as issued for remuneration, by decision of the Prefect, on the proposal of the Police Authority.
2. The women referred to in the preceding paragraph shall be provided by the health services with a health booklet.

Article 7: “Medical check-ups on persons prostituted for remuneration”

1. Women who are classified as prostitutes for remuneration are obliged to appear twice a week for medical examination at the local Health Services of the Prefectures, according to the day and time specified by them. The result of each medical examination shall be recorded on the health booklet.

Article 9: “Establishing of women in prostitution for remuneration”

1. The terms, conditions and, in general, prohibitions and restrictions on the establishment or change of residence referred to in Article 6 para. 1 mentioned women, as well as the obligations of the tenants of rooms, apartments and other related premises, are determined by joint decisions of the Ministers of Social Services and Public Order, published in the Government Gazette.
2. For the establishment of a woman prostituted, an installation permit shall be issued by the relevant Police Director or Gendarmerie Commander with the agreement of a three-member Committee set up by the decision of the Prefect and consisting of an officer of the City or Gendarmerie Police, a doctor and a social worker or visiting sister, civil servants. taking into account the conditions and restrictions laid down in paragraph 1 of this Article.
3. No more than (12) twelve licenses may be granted in the area of a Police Station for the establishment of women for a period exceeding two years. After their expiry, they shall be renewed after a further investigation of the conditions for granting them

Article 10: “Prohibition of professional group association”

1. The operation of houses for the exercise of a professional group cooperative in any form, name or title shall be prohibited.
2. It shall be prohibited to issue a second installation permit in the same apartment building or building.

3. The recruitment of domestic staff by the associated women shall be prohibited without the authorisation of the Committee referred to in paragraph 3. 2 of Article 9. Authorisation shall not be granted in respect of the recruitment of males of any age or females under 50 years of age.

CHAPTER III : Penal provisions.

Article 14

1. A woman prostituted for remuneration shall be punished with imprisonment for up to three (3) months if she violates the provisions of para. 1 of Articles 6 and 7 and Article 10 laid down obligations and prohibitions.

2. A person prostituted for remuneration shall be punished with imprisonment for up to three (3) months if, in public places, he harasses the public or provokes it through improper postures or movements in sexual connotation.

Law 2734/1999; Regarding persons engaging in sex for monetary gain

Article 1: “Certificate of practice of the profession for remuneration of prostitutes”

1. A person issued for remuneration shall be required to hold a practising certificate. This certificate shall be issued, at his request, by the prefect of his place of residence, provided that the following conditions are met by that person:

- a. Has reached the age of 18.
- b. Being unmarried or widowed or divorced.
- c. Does not suffer from a sexually transmitted or other infectious disease. These diseases are determined by decision of the Minister of Health and Welfare.
- d. Does not suffer from any form of mental illness and is not a drug user.
- e. He has not been convicted. even with a final decision; for intentional homicide (Article 299 of the Penal Code). Seduction of children (Article 339 of the Penal Code), facilitation of debauchery of others (Article 348 of the Penal Code), pimping (Article 349 of the Penal Code), trafficking in human beings (Article 350 of the Penal Code), robbery (Article 380 of the Penal Code) and extortion (Article 385 of the Penal Code), as well as for violation of the provisions of the laws on weapons and drugs.

2. The issue of the above certificate to a person of foreign nationality also presupposes his/her legal stay in the country.

3. The practising certificate is valid for a period of three (3) years and the area of the relevant Prefectural Government. This certificate shall be renewed for an equal period, provided that the conditions laid down in the preceding paragraph continue to be fulfilled. For persons of foreign nationality, this certificate is valid for the duration of their legal stay in the country if it is less than three years.

4. A joint decision of the Ministers of the Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization and Health and Welfare, issued within three (3) months from the

publication of this law, determine the procedure for issuing, revoking, and renewing the above certificate, the required supporting documents and any other relevant detail.

5. Persons holding the aforementioned certificate must be issued with a health booklet under the care of the competent Health Service of the relevant Prefectural Government.

Article 2: “Medical check-up”

1. Persons holding the certificate provided for in the previous article are obliged, every fifteen (15) days, to undergo a medical examination under the care of the health services of the Prefectural Authorities. The result of each medical examination shall be recorded in the health booklet.

Article 3: “Establishment of persons prostituted for remuneration”

1. A person who holds a practising certificate to be issued for remuneration shall be required to obtain a licence for the establishment and use of the building in which he will carry out the above activity, provided that he has the written consent of the owner of the building in question if it is an apartment building. The consent of all its co-owners and tenants is required unless its regulation prohibits the exercise of the activity in question. The above consent of the owner and the co-owners and tenants is valid until the expiration of the installation and use license, even if these persons change, and is not revoked. It is forbidden to lease or grant the use of the building for the above purpose to a person who does not hold the aforementioned certificate. The buildings in which this activity is carried out may not be used as dwellings. The license is personal, valid for two (2) years and renewed for an equal period under the same terms and conditions of its initial grant. During the period of validity of this authorisation, the same person may not be granted a second authorisation for the same purpose.

2. The above permission is granted by the relevant mayor or president of a community after the agreement of a committee, which is formed by decision of the prefect and consists of the prosecutor of the first instance of the place where the property is located, as chairman, the director of the Health Directorate of the Prefectural Government, as rapporteur, the director of the Police Directorate or Security Directorates or their legal deputies, as well as by a prefectural and a municipal or community councillor, as the case may be, appointed with their alternates by the respective prefectural, municipal or community council. By the same decision, an employee of the Hygiene Directorate of the Prefectural Government is appointed as Secretary of the Committee. The President and Members of the Commission shall be paid an allowance, the amount of which shall be determined by a joint decision of the Ministers of Finance and Health and Welfare.

3. Municipalities shall determine, by decision, the number of such permits which may be granted in their region on the basis of specific local conditions and needs, relating in particular to their population and composition, the existence of military camps, ports and industrial units, and the development of commercial or other activities requiring employment or transit of persons from other areas. Upon the first application of this law, the above decision is issued within three (3) months from its entry into force. They may also designate areas within which such permits may not be granted.

4. It is not allowed to install paid prostitutes in listed or traditional buildings, as well as in areas that are not of primary use and do not meet the terms of the General Building Regulation. Also, installation is not allowed in buildings that are less than 200 meters away from churches, schools, kindergartens, language schools, kindergartens, hospitals, youth centres, sports centres, boarding schools, libraries and charitable institutions, as well as from squares and playgrounds. By decision of the municipal or community council, the abovementioned distances may be increased, and other buildings in which the establishment of paid prostitutes is not permitted, as well as the distances between buildings in which such persons may settle, may be determined.

5. By decision of the Ministers of the Interior, Public Administration and Decentralization and Public Order, issued within three (3) months from the publication of the present, the supporting documents and the procedure for issuing the license referred to in paragraph 1 of this article, the information that must be contained in this license, as well as the obligations of their holders are determined. The same decision may also lay down more specific conditions to be met by the establishments in which paid prostitutes are established and the opening hours within which such persons shall carry out their activity.

Article 4

“Prohibition of a professional group association”

1. The use of buildings for the exercise of a professional group association in any form, name or title shall be prohibited.
2. The holder of a licence for the establishment and use of a building may, following a written declaration to the competent police authority, authorise its use to a maximum of two more persons issued for remuneration who hold a practising certificate, provided that there is written consent to this effect owner of the building, which is attached to the above statement and with the restriction that each will use it at different times. Neither the holder of the above installation and use permit nor the other persons who use the same building, according to the above, are not allowed to carry out this activity in other buildings.
3. The granting of a second permit in the same building or apartment building is prohibited.
4. The recruitment of domestic staff by holders of installation and use permits is prohibited without the permission of the competent prefect. The permit is granted only to women over fifty-five (55) years of age, provided they also meet the requirements of subparagraphs c', d and e of para. 1 of Article 1 and is valid for three (3) years. The procedure for issuing, revoking and renewing this permit, the required supporting documents and any other relevant details shall be determined by the joint ministerial decision provided for in para. 4 of Article 1. The provision of para. Article 5 of the same Article shall also apply to such persons, who shall be required to undergo a medical examination every six months. For the rest, the provisions of Article 2 shall apply.

Article 5: Criminal sanctions

1. With imprisonment of two (2) years shall be punished Anyone who:

a. Is issued with remuneration without holding a certificate of practising a profession or without undergoing the relevant checks of para. 1 of Article 2.

b. Is installed in a building without being provided with the permit provided for in para. 1 of Article 3 or issued for remuneration in a dwelling, in violation of the provisions of para. 1 and 2 of Article 4.

c. Allows work to another paid prostitute without having complied with the conditions of para. 2 of Article 4.

d. Recruits or works as servants. In violation of the provisions of para. 4 of Article 4.

e. Does not undergo the treatment provided for in para. Article 3 of Article 2 p discontinues this before the disease is cured.

f. It rents or grants the use of a dwelling to a person who does not hold a practising certificate or an establishment permit, or the place needs to meet the requirements of paragraph 4 of Article 3.

2. A person who is prostituted for remuneration and who has carnal connivance knowing that he suffers from a sexually transmitted or other infectious disease shall be punished with imprisonment for up to one (1) year unless the act is punished more severely by another provision.

3. The penalty referred to in the preceding paragraph shall be imposed on anyone who negotiates or mediates with a view to directing clientele to prostituted persons for remuneration unless the act is punished more severely by another provision.

4. Anyone who publicly harasses the public, causing it in carnal association with obscene postures, phrases or movements, is punished with imprisonment of up to three (3) months.

Law 1975/1991; Aliens, refugees, residence permits and other provisions

CHAPTER II

Article 5 : Anti-clandestine immigration teams

1. By the decision of the Minister of Public Order, special police teams are set up with the task of combating illegal immigration along the land borders of the country.

2. By joint decision of the Ministers of Finance, Public Order and Merchant Marine, joint surveillance teams of the coastal areas and maritime borders of the country are established to combat illegal immigration and other illegal activities/

3. Similar decisions, which are also countersigned by the Minister of National Defence and are not published in the Government Gazette, regulate, as appropriate, the issues of composition, staffing, administration, headquarters, organisational affiliation and care, local and operational competence and any matter related to the mission and operation of the above teams.

CHAPTER III: GENERAL CONDITIONS OF ENTRY AND RESIDENCE OF FOREIGNERS

Article 10: Unwanted Foreigners – Carriers' responsibilities

An alien who is refused entry into the country must depart without delay. Otherwise he shall be immediately returned to the country of origin or to a third country where entry may be authorised, at the responsibility and expense of himself or the carrier, who shall also be obliged to pay any other necessary expenses required until his departure, To the above pages, When they refuse to fulfil these obligations, a fine of one hundred thousand (100,000) to one million (1,000,000) drachmas is imposed by the decision of the relevant perfect for each person transported. By the same decision, the means of transport used are detained and returned to them after the fulfilment of the above obligations and the payment of the fine imposed or the presentation of a letter of guarantee from a recognised bank covering the amount of their above obligations.

Article 11: List of undesirable aliens

1. The competent department of the Ministry of Public Order shall draw up and maintain a list of undesirable aliens. The criteria and procedure for registering and removing foreigners from this list are determined by a joint decision of the Ministers of Foreign Affairs, Justice and Public Order.
2. A foreigner on Greek territory, after being registered on the list of undesirables, is obliged to leave the country within a time limit set each time by the Minister of Public Order.

Law 2910/2001; Foreigners: entrance, residency and other provisions

CHAPTER V: ENTRY AND STAY OF FOREIGNERS FOR THE PROVISION OF EMPLOYMENT

Article 19: Granting of a work permit

1. Is it allowed for foreigners to enter Greece for employment with: employment relationship with a specific employer and for a specific type of employment, if he is granted a work permit by the Prefect.
3. Foreign Employment Agencies call with announcements which may be published in local media, interested foreigners to apply for work in Greece. On the basis of these requests, they draw up lists of names foreigners wishing to work as employees in Greece and send to OAED and the employment services of the Prefectural Authorities.
4. The employer to recruit staff under a contract of dependent labour applies to the competent labour service of the Prefectural Self-Government.

5. If the posts applied for are not filled by nationals, or foreigners legally residing in Greece, OAED may approve the filling of these posts by non-resident foreigners in Greece. If OAED approves the filling of these positions by the Abroad, the employer chooses from the nominal lists that provided for in paragraph 3 of this article, aliens who interested and applies to the prefect for a permit working on them.

6. The application shall be accompanied by the following documents:

a. A certificate from the employer that he will hire the specific aliens and that they bear their subsistence costs until obtain a residence permit or, if they are refused a permit, until depart the country,

b. A letter of guarantee from a bank of an amount at least equal to the Quarterly earnings of an unskilled worker to cover expenses three-month subsistence of the alien in Greece and an amount covering the costs of refoulement or deportation to the country of origin.

"In the case of the recruitment of fishermen and workers employed in the Agricultural Economy the letter of guarantee corresponds to the monthly remuneration of the unskilled worker."

7.a. The work permit shall be issued by the relevant prefect if it refers to a speciality included in the Joint Ministerial Decision referred to in point (b) of paragraph 2 of this article. The work permit is granted after the opinion of the police authority of the prefecture on matters concerning the public order and security of the country.

b. The holder of the work permit may work in another prefecture of the same or a different region with the fulfilment of the conditions of paragraph 10 of article 19 of Law 2910/2001 (Government Gazette 91 A), as added by paragraph 2 of article 33 of this law and provided that, in addition, it is a speciality, which is provided for in the above Joint Ministerial Decision and has not been covered by another national or foreign worker."

8. The work permit shall be granted for a period of up to one year and it may be renewed each time for a period of up to one year. A prerequisite for renewal is the existence of an employment contract and the fulfilment of tax and insurance obligations on the part of the alien. The alien wishing renewal must, before the expiration of the work permit, to apply to the prefect for renewal with the relevant supporting documents. "If the employment contract is drawn up for a shorter period of one year, the work permit, at the time of its initial grant, will be administered for one year. (After six years, the work permit is valid for two years). After from a total ten-year stay in Greece may be granted a permit employment of indefinite duration."

9. The prefect shall forward the work permit to the Greek consulate to obtain an entry visa and notify to the Aliens Service and immigration.

10. a. The issue of a work permit by the competent department of the Prefectural Government shall be valid within the duration of the permit in any prefecture of the country under the following conditions:

I. The initial employment relationship has been terminated, and the reason for its termination has been announced.

II. The foreigner has concluded a new employment contract with an employer in another prefecture.

III. The permit has been validated by the Service of the relevant Prefectural Administration of the place where the alien will work and for a period equal to that remaining.

Law 4090/1960; Issues of imprisonment, prisoners and other provisions

Article 7: Exploitation of prostitutes

A person who is wholly or partly fed by a woman in prostitution and who exploits such immoral gains shall be punished with imprisonment from months to three years.

Article 8: Trafficking

1. Whoever overcomes alienation of debauchery:

(a) recruits or entices, even with his consent, a female minor for prostitution.

(b) by force, deception, threats, imposition or abuse of power or any other coercive means hires or lures a female adult for prostitution.

(c) by the same means, a female shall be retained against his will in a brothel or forced to surrender to prostitution, punishable by imprisonment for one year to three years and by a fine if there is no more serious offence ;

2. The above condition of imprisonment shall be increased to five years if the offence was committed contrary to Article 349 para. 2 pts. c' person

3. These penalties shall also be imposed if the individual acts constituting the constituent elements of the above offences have been committed in different territories.

Law 3064/2002; Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim

Article 8: Article 351 of the Criminal Code is replaced by the following:

"Article 351. Human Trafficking

1. Whoever by the use of force, threat or other coercive means or the imposition or abuse of power recruits, transfers or promotes within or outside the territory, detains, harbors, delivers with or without consideration to another or receives from another person with a view to carrying out his or her sexual exploitation himself or another shall be punished with imprisonment of up to ten years and a fine of ten thousand to fifty thousand euros.

2. The penalty of the previous paragraph shall punish the liable if, in order to achieve the same objective, he obtains the consent of a person by the use of fraudulent means

or lures him by exploiting his vulnerable position by promises, gifts, payments or other benefits.

3. Whoever knowingly acts lewdly with a person in the circumstances described in paragraphs 1 and 2 shall be punished with imprisonment of at least six months.

4. The offender shall be punished with imprisonment of at least ten years and a fine of fifty thousand to one hundred thousand euros in accordance with the preceding paragraphs if the act:

(a) is directed against a minor or is connected with the mental weakness or deafness of the injured person.

(b) was committed by one of the persons referred to in point (c) of paragraph 2 of Article 349.

(c) is connected with the unlawful entry, stay or exit of the injured person from the country.

(d) is committed professionally.

(e) is committed by an official who, in the exercise of his service or in his capacity as such, commits or participates in any way in the act; or

(f) has resulted in grievous bodily injury to the injured person.

5. If any of the acts referred to in the first and second paragraphs resulted in the death of the injured person, life imprisonment shall be imposed.6.The sexual exploitation referred to in the preceding paragraphs shall consist of the undertaking out of profiteering of any lewd act, or the use for profit of the body, voice or image of a person for real or pretend undertaking of such an act or for the provision of work or services intended for sexual arousal."

Bibliography

Primary Sources:

- Chatzidis Kostas, «Εκθεση-σοκ για το οργανωμένο έγκλημα στην Ελλάδα», *Ta Nea*, 04/12/1999 <https://www.tanea.gr/1999/12/04/greece/ekthesi-sok-gia-to-organwmeno-egklima-stin-ellada/>
- Daniel Howden, “Greek sex-industry uncovered”, *BBC*, 2001, <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/europe/1724057.stm>
- D, « Η πορνεία των απαλών ονύχων », *To Vima*, 24/11/2008. <https://www.tovima.gr/2008/11/24/culture/i-porneia-twn-apalwn-onyxwn/>
- Dimitris Marcou, SKAI, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NpJbgeAgUZM>
- Dora Antoniou, «Στη μεθόριο ανθεί το οργανωμένο έγκλημα», *KATHIMERINI*, 6/02/2002, <https://www.kathimerini.gr/society/110523/sti-methorio-anthei-to-organomeno-egklima/>
- Girls dressed as boys, from Albania to Afghanistan”, *To Mon*, 21/09/2014, <https://tomov.gr/en/2014/09/21/koritsia-poy-ntynontai-agoria-tin-alvania-os-to/> (“This article has been adapted from Jenny Nordberg ’s forthcoming book *The Underground Girls of Kabul: In Search of a Hidden Resistance in Afghanistan.*.)
- Martina, Vandenberg, “The Invisible Woman”, *The Moscow Times*, 1997 <https://www.themoscowtimes.com/archive/the-invisible-woman>
- Sissi Vovou, «Παναγιώτης Βήχος: Πρωτοστάτησε στον αγώνα εναντίον του τράφικινγκ», *To Mon*, 4/12/2013, <https://tomov.gr/2013/12/04/panagiotis-vichos-protostatise-ston-agona-enantion-trafikink/>
- Sissi Vovou, « Όταν εγκληματεί η Υπηρεσία Δίωξης Ηλεκτρονικού Εγκλήματος», *To Mon*, 20/02/16, <https://tomov.gr/2016/02/20/otan-egklimatei-ypiresia-dioxis-ilektronikoy-egklimatou/>
- Skrivanos Takis, «Οι δρόμοι του trafficking», *To Mon*, 26/11/2012, <https://tomov.gr/2012/11/26/oi-dromoi-trafficking/> .
- Tsarouhas K., “600.000.000Ευρώ ο τζίρος της πορνείας», *To Vima*, 24.11.2008 <https://www.tovima.gr/2008/11/24/archive/600-000-000-eyrw-o-tziros-tis-porneias/>
- «ΣΤΟ ΚΕΝΟ ΟΙ ΠΡΟΣΠΑΘΕΙΑ ΤΡΟΜΟΚΡΑΤΗΣΗΣ ΤΟΥ ΠΑΝΑΓΙΩΤΗ ΒΗΧΟΥ», Athens Indymedia, 2003, <https://athens.indymedia.org/post/73088/>
- Hellenic Police, Annual Reports of Organised Crime of 2004 & 2005.
- Statistics of the Hellenic Police about Human Trafficking: 2003 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2003/> , 2004 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2004/>, 2005 <https://www.astynomia.gr/2008/02/14/statistika-stoicheia-eborias-anthropon-etous-2005/>
- Transparency International, CORRUPTION PERCEPTIONS INDEX for the years 1996-2000, https://www.transparency.org/en/cpi/2021?gclid=CjwKCAjwyeujBhA5EiwA5WD7_WBY_D3Td2a7WcAW5t-e-58KATO3VvLA9X0Vu3-oh0GTaMpDSdzwhhoCvCgQAvD_BwE.
- Ελληνική Στατιστική Αρχή, Απογραφή Πληθυσμού-Κατοικιών 2011, «Στατιστικά Αποτελέσματα για το λόγο εγκατάστασης στην Ελλάδα των μεταναστών από χώρες εξωτερικού (με ελληνική ή ξένη υπηκοότητα)», 5/12/2014.

- Law 1193/1981; Protection and regulation against sexually transmitted diseases and related issues
- Law 2734/1999; Regarding persons engaging in sex for monetary gain
- Law 1975/1991; Aliens, refugees, residence permits and other provisions
- Law 2910/2001; Foreigners: entrance, residency and other provisions
- Law 4090/1960; Issues of imprisonment, prisoners and other provisions
- Law 3064/2002; Trafficking, pornography -sexual abuse of minors- pimping, help to the victim
- Πρακτικά Βουλής, Σύνοδος Γ', Συνεδρίαση Ι', 13/07/1999.
- Furthermore I conducted two interviews with Athina Kastelanou, active prostitute during the 1990s and Nikoletta Iliou, rescue manager of A21.

Secondary Literature:

- Antonopoulos, Georgios A., "Are the "Others" Coming?" Evidence on 'alien conspiracy' from three illegal markets in Greece", *Crime, Law and Social Change*, 52, p.475-93, 2009.
- Aurelijus Gutauskas, Arunas Juska , Peter Johnstone & Richard Pozzuto (2004) Changing Typology of Organised Crime in a Post-Socialist Lithuania (the Late 1980s–Early 2000s), *Global Crime*, 6, no. 2, 201-221, DOI: 10.1080/17440570500096775.
- Badea Caramello, Iulia, "A Case Study of Sex Trafficking in Romania," (2013), Master's Theses, University of San Francisco, Paper 41
- Galeotti, Mark, *Russian and Post-Soviet Organized Crime*, Aldershot [etc.]: Ashgate/Dartmouth, 2002.
- Gerassi, Lara, "From Exploitation to Industry: Definitions, Risks, and Consequences of Domestic Sexual Exploitation and Sex Work Among Women and Girls," *Journal Of Human Behavior In The Social Environment*, 25:6, 2015: 591-605. DOI:10.1080/10911359.2014.991055
- Hughes, Donna M. "The "Natasha" Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women," *Journal of International Affairs (New York)* 53, no. 2 (2000): 625–51.
- Hughes, Donna M., "Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation", International Organisation for Migration, 2002.
- Ira Emke – Pouloupoulos, "Trafficking in women and Children: Greece, a country of destination and transit", Institute for the Study of the Greek Economy (IMEO) Greek Society of Demographic Studies (ΕΔΗΜ), 2001.
- Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, Columbia University Press, New York, 2017.

- Lazaridis, G., Trafficking and Prostitution: The Growing Exploitation of Migrant Women in Greece, *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 8(1), 2001, 67-102. <https://doi.org/10.1177/135050680100800105>
- Lazos Grigorios, *Πορνεία και Διεθνική Σωματεμπορία στη Σύγχρονη Ελλάδα*, Kastanioti, Athens, 2001, page 123.
- Massino, Jill, *Ambiguous Transitions: Gender, the State, and Everyday Life in Socialist and Post socialist Romania*, New York, Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2019, <https://doi-org.ezproxy.leidenuniv.nl/10.1515/9781785335990>.
- Morokvasic, Mirjana, “‘Settled in Mobility’: Engendering Post-Wall Migration in Europe.” *Feminist Review*, no. 77 (2004): 7–25. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1395897>.
- Muñoz de Bustillo and Antón, ‘From sending to host societies: immigration in Greece, Ireland and Spain in the 21st century’, *Industrial Relations Journal*, 41:6, 2010.
- Oguzhan Omer Demir & James O. Finckenaer, “Victims of Sex Trafficking in Turkey: Characteristics, Motivations, and Dynamics”, *Women & Criminal Justice*, 20:1-2 (2010), 57-88
- Outshoorn, Joyce, “The Political Debates on Prostitution and Trafficking of Women.” *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society* 12 (2005): 141 - 155.
- Papanicolaou Gerorgios, "The Sex Industry, Human Trafficking and the Global Prohibition Regime: A cautionary tale from Greece", *Trends in Organized Crime*, 11, no 4 (2008): 379-409.
- Petrunov, Georgi, “Human Trafficking in Eastern Europe: The Case of Bulgaria”, *The ANNALS of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 653(1), 162–182. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716214521556>
- Pheterson, Gail, *A Vindication of the Rights of Whores*, Seattle, WA: Seal Press, 1989.
- Síadíma, M. (2001), ‘Immigration in Greece during the 1990s: An Overview’, MA in Mediterranean Studies Dissertation Paper, King’s College, London.
- Sitaropoulos, Nikolaos, *Immigration Law and Management in Greece: Towards an Exodus from Underdevelopment and a Comprehensive Immigration Policy*, SSRN Electronic Journal, 2002.
- Triandafyllidou, Anna and Michaela Marouf, “Immigration towards Greece at the Eve of the 21st Century. A Critical Assessment.” Hellenic Foundation for European and Foreign Policy (ELIAMEP), Athens, (2009).
- UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION AGAINST TRANSNATIONAL ORGANIZED CRIME AND THE PROTOCOLS THERETO’, United Nations, New York, 2004.